

RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON
MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 81 26 APRIL 2013 PAGES 8558 TO 8622

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg
P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037
Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335
E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za
Web Address: <http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278>



Page 8558

1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 26 APRIL 2013]
 2 [09:39] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.
 3 We're very pleased to see that Adv Mpofu is back with us,
 4 welcome back. We were very distressed to hear of the
 5 incident in which you were involved. We hope that you're
 6 on the road to a complete recovery. I take it you're not
 7 quite there yet but anyway, we're pleased to see you here
 8 today. At this stage we're going to revert to the
 9 application for a removal of the Commission to Centurion,
 10 which was argued previously but thereafter opposing
 11 affidavits were filed and I see the counsel who is here to
 12 oppose the move is with us also. So would you like to – I
 13 understand that replying affidavits have been filed, which
 14 we've been given, and I take it you will address us. I
 15 don't know whether the evidence leaders want to say
 16 something as well. Mr Chaskalson will also address us and
 17 thereafter you will have an opportunity to address us also.
 18 Yes, Mr Mpofu?
 19 MR MPOFU: Thank you very much,
 20 Chairperson. Chairperson, if I may, before dealing with
 21 the application, just address your earlier remarks and just
 22 express my gratitude and thanks to you personally and the
 23 other Commissioners, firstly, for the messages and also to
 24 the colleagues, all the colleagues here, evidence leaders
 25 and the LRC. They were the first flowers that arrived in

Page 8559

1 hospital, came from the evidence leaders and the LRC but
 2 other colleagues also sent messages directly and indirectly
 3 and really, quite an outpouring of support for the near-
 4 tragedy that happened but thank you very much, Chairperson,
 5 I really appreciate it and you giving me the opportunity
 6 maybe to use this platform to thank others who might not
 7 also be here who expressed their support and prayers, as it
 8 were. Thank you, Chair.
 9 Now – and also before, Chair, the issue as you
 10 correctly pointed out, I'm not yet fully recovered. I've
 11 been advised to take it easy, which is a difficult thing
 12 for me and the reality is that in the past seven days I've
 13 spent five of those days in the ICU in hospital, so I'm
 14 still a little bit weak but I thought because of the
 15 importance of this matter, we should dispose of this
 16 particular matter. The issue of the cross-examination is a
 17 different issue, which I will discuss with Mr Semanya and
 18 others.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: What I can say is, as you
 20 know, we have now got Major-General Annandale in the
 21 witness box and I don't propose interposing the National
 22 Commissioner in the middle of his evidence. I think he
 23 must go through to the end of his evidence and at the end
 24 of his evidence we will then see whether you're fit enough
 25 to resume your cross-examination of the National

Page 8560

1 Commissioner, otherwise we'll take the next witness.
 2 MR MPOFU: Yes. No, I certainly -
 3 CHAIRPERSON: It's important that you
 4 make a full recovery.
 5 MR MPOFU: Thank you.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: I'm quite sure that the
 7 National Commissioner won't mind having a chance to do some
 8 of her work in her office rather than sitting here for days
 9 being – not that you necessarily will be busy for days, but
 10 she'd prefer to be working in her office rather than
 11 sitting here.
 12 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, I was
 13 more thinking of next week, so that's even a better
 14 dispensation, then I can rest a bit. Thank you,
 15 Chairperson.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: I think it's fair to say
 17 that, as was the case last time, the proceedings will be
 18 transcribed and in due course I will see the Minister who
 19 will have all the documents before him, as well as the
 20 transcription of what is being said today and we will then
 21 decide whether to grant the application or refuse it.
 22 MR MPOFU: Yes. Thank you, Chairperson.
 23 Coming back to the business of the day then, it's an
 24 application for the relocation of the seat of the
 25 Commission. As you've correctly pointed out, Chairperson,

Page 8561

1 this matter was argued on the 26th of February, so I will
 2 resist the temptation to re-argue or regurgitate the matter
 3 that is already before the Commission and I won't argue it
 4 as if it's a greenfield application, as it were, firstly
 5 because those matters are on the record but secondly, also
 6 because the matter that is on the record has not been
 7 disputed in the answering affidavit or insofar as it has
 8 been dealt with, it has only been tangential. So we took
 9 the approach that the record as it stands represents what
 10 one might call the founding papers and we'll discuss the
 11 matter then on that basis. We'll therefore take that the
 12 factual matter that has not been disputed is common cause
 13 and proceed on that basis.
 14 However, Chairperson, there are matters of
 15 emphasis and cross-reference which will be made to, in some
 16 of the earlier submissions made and of course there are
 17 also new facts. Insofar as there are new facts, those new
 18 facts have been dealt with in the replying affidavit as
 19 well as, thankfully, the affidavit filed on behalf of the
 20 evidence leaders and as well as SERI. So those are the
 21 only new facts that we might dwell a little bit on. Sorry,
 22 Chairperson, I've forgotten how this works now.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sure your attorney can
 24 assist.
 25 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Chairperson, I

1 want to start by dealing with – before dealing with the
 2 merits, just emphasising one or two issues that were raised
 3 in February. One is that the foundations of this
 4 application are not so much in the physical movement of the
 5 Commission per se but can be traced back to what my learned
 6 colleague Mr Ntsebeza, who unfortunately could not be here
 7 but with whom I've discussed the matter, refers to as
 8 equality of arms and that stems from the fact that the
 9 parties, the applicant parties generally speaking are
 10 burdened with huge economic consequences and resource
 11 shortages related to the Commission, which are well known
 12 and have already been well articulated, but I just wanted
 13 to clarify this. What we are really saying is that if the
 14 daily costs of representing the people that we represent
 15 are X, because the Commission is here they become X plus Y.
 16 The X you cannot change because it will be there, whether
 17 you are in Pretoria or here, and it is really the Y, the
 18 additional costs that are caused by the mere fact of being
 19 in a particular location as opposed to another, that is the
 20 subject matter of this application.

21 And I will deal with this later when I talk about
 22 access to justice, which is really the real nub of the
 23 issue but the other issue that I wanted to re-emphasise
 24 from the last time is the fact that we made it clear even
 25 then that this application, as it were, was being brought

1 reluctantly because obviously the choice of venue of
 2 Rustenburg was meant mainly to advantage the people that we
 3 represent. There is no doubt about that, but because of
 4 this historical issue, issues around funding, they have now
 5 been placed in a situation which I earlier described as
 6 Hobson's choice, where the choices are quite stark. Do you
 7 stay near the locality and risk the consequence of losing
 8 legal representation earlier than you otherwise would have,
 9 or do you travel a longer and thereby manage to gain the
 10 legal representation, such legal representation as you are
 11 able to muster, given all the constraints that we know
 12 about.

13 And the clear choice that they have made, Chair,
 14 given those two evils, is exactly to choose the lesser of
 15 the two evils, which is to rather sacrifice some of their
 16 own time to try and meet us halfway so that we can
 17 represent them for as long as it is humanly possible under
 18 the currently difficult circumstances.

19 Then Chairperson, I'd like to deal – I'll deal
 20 with the other issues, some of them referring back as I've
 21 said but, with your permission, if I may start with dealing
 22 with what we have termed in our affidavit, points in
 23 limine, the preliminary points.

24 Now the first issue, Chairperson, is whether
 25 indeed there is opposition to the application and I preface

1 that by saying I know that this is not a court of law, one
 2 doesn't have to be formalistic and we need to examine the
 3 issues, the roots of the issues, but even with all that
 4 latitude, Chair, there must be a semblance of order, as it
 5 were.

6 What we have here is a situation where the so-
 7 called respondents have not demonstrated a sufficient
 8 interest in the matter before us. The first respondent is
 9 cited as the administrator of the Bapo Ba Mogale
 10 traditional community and we'll treat that respondent
 11 differently.

12 The other respondents can be treated similarly.
 13 They are the Bojanala Platinum District Municipality,
 14 Rustenburg Local Municipality, Madibeng Local Municipality,
 15 Moses Kotane Local Municipality. Our general submission is
 16 that all these are non-parties, to start with but with
 17 respect to the second to the fifth, their interest is not
 18 even defined. All we know just from their names is that
 19 these are local authorities but what they have to do with
 20 the issue before the Commission and the Minister is not,
 21 (a) defined in their affidavits or even sufficiently
 22 justified. In one of the instances the affidavit is signed
 23 by the municipal manager. You would expect a person like
 24 that to then attach a council resolution that entitles him
 25 or her to represent that particular council and the basis,

1 but that has not been done.

2 As far as the administrator of Bapo Ba Mogale
 3 traditional community is concerned, it is stated in the
 4 affidavit that that person has limited statutory powers to
 5 represent the premier when the premier is unable to do so
 6 and once again it is not defined in what capacity he is
 7 acting, where he obtained his mandate and to crown it all,
 8 Chairperson, you have received a letter that suggests that
 9 – I think the words that were used, that he was acting on a
 10 frolic of his own. So even that party which has some
 11 relationship with an admitted party here, seems to be
 12 wrongly – either wrongly cited or certainly hasn't shown
 13 sufficient interest. And even if one can find some kind of
 14 interest, it certainly is not one that can even begin to be
 15 weighed as against the primary parties in the Commission.

16 So when we say they don't have locus standi we
 17 mean it in the sense that conceptually one has to look at
 18 this opposition as almost a fresh application because there
 19 was an application and they've now launched opposition
 20 almost as if now nothing has happened, as it were, without
 21 even dealing with the merits of what was raised earlier.

22 Then Chairperson, we then deal with, the second
 23 preliminary point we raise is the point of acquiescence
 24 which is related to the third point, which is the lateness
 25 of the so-called opposition. And another quick throwback,

Page 8566

1 Chairperson, you will remember that on the 26th of February
 2 I said the reason that there was such a delay in bringing
 3 the application, everyone knew that it was coming and there
 4 was a delay, was exactly because we wanted to wait until
 5 such time that all the parties had bought into the issue,
 6 into the idea and they had raised whatever concerns and by
 7 the time we brought the application, as we said, those
 8 concerns had been addressed more or less, save for the
 9 issue of transportation. So it had to be safely assumed
 10 that every party here knew about the application and if
 11 they didn't for some reason, then the Chairperson certainly
 12 made it very clear at the beginning of the application that
 13 he would grant any party an opportunity to raise their
 14 voice, which was done and everybody did raise their voice
 15 and this was on the 26th of February, Chairperson.
 16 Now, let's jump more than a month later. On the
 17 28th of March, just the day before Good Friday, the
 18 Chairperson once again in open session indicated that on
 19 the 2nd we would start a bit late because the Chairperson,
 20 in terms of regulations, was going to meet with the
 21 Minister and nobody said, oh, but wait a minute
 22 Chairperson, there's some opposition which is being mounted
 23 or even contemplated.
 24 [09:59] And then the third issue, Chair, is that which
 25 has been alluded to in the affidavit, is that I had a

Page 8567

1 discussion with senior counsel representing the Bapo party.
 2 I think, I can't place the date but it must have been
 3 before the 26th. It was when we were still canvassing the
 4 views of the parties, where he had just been engaged and he
 5 wanted me to update him and he said he didn't know about
 6 this application and I – at tea time we discussed it.
 7 Coming back, he gave me his word that they would not object
 8 to the application, all he needed was clarification and
 9 therefore once that was discussed between counsel, at least
 10 we were entitled to assume that no such opposition would be
 11 forthcoming. And I took the liberty, because the senior
 12 counsel has not been attending since then, to phone him
 13 before finalising, settling the replying affidavit, just as
 14 matter of professionalism and collegiality to make sure
 15 that we are on the same wavelength about that discussion
 16 and it was so confirmed, Chairperson.
 17 So on those three grounds alone one could say
 18 that this party is, quite frankly, not entitled to –
 19 without even giving an explanation – to simply mount
 20 opposition without saying, okay, maybe we took this stance
 21 but then we changed. And Chairperson, without getting
 22 technical, I'll just read one sentence which explains the
 23 principle of acquiescence from Christie where at page 45 it
 24 says, "If delay in enforcing a right conferred by the terms
 25 of a contract has induced a reasonable belief that there is

Page 8568

1 an agreement not to enforce the right, then the enforcement
 2 has been waived by quasi mutual assent."
 3 Now, if you add that – assume there was no act of
 4 acquiescence or waiver or anything like that – the mere
 5 lateness of the opposition without an explanation or the
 6 customary asking for condonation or even a basic
 7 explanation, it just adds more fuel to that particular
 8 fire, Chairperson.
 9 Then the last point in, preliminary point, deals
 10 with what we have called the misapplication or, more
 11 appropriately, misapprehension of the applicable legal
 12 instruments and regulatory instruments, Chair. The
 13 application is premised on the law of jurisdiction which
 14 has no place in these kinds of proceedings and I'll explain
 15 that very briefly, Chairperson. You'll see in the
 16 replying, in the answering affidavit, Chairperson, that
 17 there's reference to the fact that the so-called cause of
 18 action arose in the North-West. Now, that language alone
 19 betrays a misapprehension of what we are dealing with here
 20 because there's no action, let alone a cause of any action
 21 to talk about in the present situation. All that has
 22 happened is that the President of the country has
 23 instituted a commission in terms of the Commissions Act and
 24 that Act, it's an old Act of 1947 and hence the reference
 25 to the Union as opposed to the Republic but it can be read

Page 8569

1 in, but section 2 of the Commissions Act 8 of 1947 provides
 2 that, "A commission may sit at any place in the Union" –
 3 read Republic – "for the purpose of hearing evidence or
 4 addressing or deliberating." So that's as far as the issue
 5 of jurisdiction goes. The legislature has seen it fit that
 6 whether something had happened in Cape Town, a commission
 7 could sit in Durban, to stretch the meaning as it were.
 8 And then if that was not clear, and I would
 9 submit that it is very clear, paragraph 4A of the terms of
 10 reference for this Commission has been amended to read as
 11 follows, "The seat of the Commission shall be the Civic
 12 Centre in Rustenburg but the Chairperson of the Commission
 13 may, with the concurrence of the Minister and on reasonable
 14 grounds shown, determine any other place as the seat of the
 15 Commission."
 16 In other words, Chairperson, what I'm saying is
 17 that the very foundational basis of this application is
 18 misconceived and therefore what we're saying is that just
 19 on the basis of those preliminary points, the opposition
 20 should not be entertain and the application should be,
 21 well, either granted or refused but dealt with on the basis
 22 that it was originally unopposed and it still is. But
 23 then, Chairperson, we have acknowledged that, as I've said
 24 earlier, this is a matter where the Chairperson may wish
 25 for good reasons to overlook those deficiencies as it were,

1 in the so-called opposition and may wish to entertain the
2 merits but – and we are quite happy to do that because the
3 merits themselves are even more deficient than the points
4 in limine.

5 One of the – apart from this issue of the cause
6 of action and so on, one issue that I would like us to
7 dispose of which has been dealt with in the replying, in
8 the answering affidavit, is the fact that the application
9 for relocation is seen as something to do with the lawyers
10 or benefit to the lawyers who represent the victims, as it
11 were, or the applicants and even the more startling notion
12 that such a relocation would amount to a denial of access
13 to justice to the respondents.

14 Well, starting with the issue of the lawyers, I
15 thought we had disposed of this earlier but for what it's
16 worth, let me just say this, Chairperson. This has nothing
17 to do with the lawyers per se. The lawyers are mere
18 conduits through which the litigants or rather the parties
19 themselves, the victims in this case, exercise their own
20 constitutional right to access to justice as enshrined in
21 section 34 of the Constitution. Clearly the right to
22 access to justice enshrined in that section incorporates
23 the right to legal representation and it is legal
24 representation per se, not necessarily legal representation
25 by this or that legal representative. And the irony of

1 this, Chair, is that, far from it being beneficial to the
2 lawyers, what would be beneficial to the lawyers I suppose
3 would have been simply to say, look, we've gone this far,
4 we are now withdrawing from the matter, go back to our
5 offices and do paying work and that would be – so it's the
6 non-relocation that would be beneficial to the lawyers.
7 The overburdening of the lawyers and, by extension, the
8 parties themselves simply means that that result would be
9 brought much earlier than it otherwise would have and
10 therefore their own, as I say – I want to emphasise, their
11 own access to justice would thereby be hampered. So the
12 argument about lawyers is, quite frankly, illogical and
13 preposterous, to say the least.

14 Now, fortunately with the benefit of technology
15 one has been able to follow some of the proceedings here
16 and yesterday I was watching the debate about the possible
17 future extensions of the Commission and that, Chairperson,
18 is something worth repeating. You remember, Chairperson,
19 that on the 26th of February at least there was still room
20 for speculation that, limited as it was, that there might
21 be a small chance of finishing within the allocated time,
22 namely the 31st of May. Sitting where we are now, the case
23 is even much stronger because I don't think anybody in the
24 room can even begin to believe that we will finish on that
25 day. It's quite clear that there will be another extension

1 and I heard the Chairperson's remarks in that regard and
2 there might well be even more than one extension, even if
3 the regime that was proposed by Mr Burger and others is put
4 in place. All it can do is to change the future, it won't
5 change the past. The fact of the matter is that we are
6 here now, eight months later.

7 So if we are going to be here for another eight
8 months, one can safely say that it will be well nigh
9 impossible for the legal representation to be continued.
10 And in our case, Chairperson, one must remember that we
11 started, at least our party, we started getting involved in
12 this matter literally three or four days after the
13 massacre. We've been seized with this since August of last
14 year, long before the Commission was even put in place. By
15 the time we all started here on the 1st of October we had
16 been a good two months into doing this work, including the
17 criminal cases and other related work. And it is a matter
18 of also – well, I might place it on the record, we already
19 had, I think I indicated on a previous occasion,
20 instructions to make an application to court in respect of
21 the refusal by the government to fund the victims but we
22 have prevailed on the applicants to hold back that
23 application on the basis that hopefully sanity will prevail
24 or some other solution will be found and it is in that
25 spirit that this application, among other things, the

1 suggestions that we've made earlier about simultaneous
2 interpretation and so on are meant to try and mitigate as
3 much of the damage as possible but should all those fail,
4 we will have no option but to raise this issue formally in
5 a court of law. And the basis of that will be on the
6 equality provision of the Constitution, Chair, which
7 outlaws unfair discrimination, directly or indirectly,
8 against any party on arbitrary grounds.

9 And finally, Chairperson, I'd like to just deal
10 with some of what I've called the new material. I'm sure
11 the parties that have submitted submissions will speak to
12 them but I think it – once again as with the issue of the
13 date and the potential for finalisation, the case right
14 now, as it were, for relocation has even been more
15 strengthened by what has been submitted, particularly by
16 the evidence leaders.

17 And that, in a nutshell, without traversing the
18 affidavit - the replying affidavit suggests that the state
19 alone is losing an additional half a million or more in
20 relation to, just as I've said, the aspect of the location.

21 CHAIRPERSON: This is the Y amount you
22 referred to. You said that –

23 MR MPOFU: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON: - there are certain costs
25 which will be there, wherever the Commission sits.

Page 8574

1 MR MPOFU: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON: That's X. The additional

3 costs if it is here rather than in Pretoria, that's what

4 you called Y.

5 MR MPOFU: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON: You say Y, as far as the

7 state is concerned, is half a million rand a month.

8 MR MPOFU: Minimum, yes. Thank you,

9 Chair. And I have no doubt, just reading through the

10 affidavit, that those are not all the points. There are

11 some costs that are patent that have not been included

12 there but even on the rough costs that they've put, the Y

13 effect, as it were, amounts to that much, more than half a

14 million per month. And if Mr Burger's predictions are

15 anything to go by, that means that there'd be a total of

16 about R10 million which would be lost from the taxpayers'

17 purse simply because we are here and not there, as it were.

18 Of course I'm tempted to say that money could be put into

19 better use, such as paying for the victims' legal

20 representatives –

21 [10:19] CHAIRPERSON: But you're resisting that

22 temptation, I'm sure.

23 MR MPOFU: But I will resist it, and

24 SERI, Chairperson, has also put some very concrete evidence

25 of the kind of financial burden. All I want to say about

Page 8575

1 that is they are in a similar situation as us, but whatever

2 they say you can multiply by 3 when it comes to us because

3 we have less representation, no, definitely no sources of

4 funding at the moment, and clearly having to, representing

5 more than 300 people, being the 270 arrested and more than

6 50 or so that are injured. Now of course there's an

7 overlap because some of the people are both arrested and

8 injured, but the number is well over 300, Chairperson.

9 Chairperson, just one issue which I've been

10 reminded I did not mention was the fact that even if – I'm

11 sorry, I'm just going back quickly to one of the

12 preliminary points – even if one were to accept that the

13 first respondent has some kind of standing, that standing,

14 peripheral as it may be, clearly relates to phase 2, and

15 that has been amply demonstrated by the mere fact that the

16 party that is here has not participated in phase 1, for

17 good reason, except when they informed us that some of the

18 victims were there to infest their land, as it were, and

19 I'm sure whatever issues they intend to raise, which are

20 obviously legitimate in relation to phase 2, can be raised

21 with equal force whether we are here or in Pretoria.

22 Thank you, Chairperson, and I'm reminded in a

23 collision with Lonmin that the phase 2 is an affidavit. So

24 all the issues that we are talking about, the practical

25 issues of accommodation and all that –

Page 8576

1 CHAIRPERSON: Most of phase 2 will be

2 dealt with on paper, as it were, by affidavit and documents

3 that had been made available, and the public is not aware

4 of it, a lot of work has already been done behind the

5 scenes as it were, on phase 2, and it should be much

6 shorter and should, as you say, be largely on paper with

7 perhaps a little bit of expert evidence or something of

8 that kind. That can, you point is that can as easily be

9 done there as here.

10 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, and secondly

11 that that phase, just from that definition, clearly does

12 not involve the issues we are dealing with here of

13 transport, sleeping over, and consultations with witnesses,

14 and leading evidence, cross-examination, and so on, which

15 is the stuff that consumes time, which really is the nub of

16 the issue.

17 Finally - some things never change, Chairperson,

18 sorry, so finally still comes more than once. The issue of

19 transportation needs to be mentioned as well, just as an

20 update really. We continue to engage with the parties that

21 we had mentioned. Nothing, we had said that we would do

22 this bilaterally, so I don't need to burden the record with

23 this matter, save to say that we continue to engage with

24 Lonmin, whom we sincerely still trust will at least provide

25 the bus that they are currently providing, just for a

Page 8577

1 longer distance, but our view is that the primary

2 responsibility for that issue is on the State and we will

3 engage with the State as well to maybe provide a second

4 bus, but now we are more encouraged by the fact that the

5 State might be saving more than half a million, so surely

6 the issue of hiring a bus will be in comparatively speaking

7 and still, we'll still be making a huge saving. But those

8 are discussions which I'm mentioning, Chair, simply to say

9 that that condition is still there. I don't want to debate

10 those here. We are, and I think advisably, dealing with

11 them at a bilateral level with the concerned parties.

12 So all in all then, Chairperson, we would like to

13 move that the Chairperson uses his good offices in

14 consultation with the Minister to grant the order that we

15 have asked for, which we have articulated in the affidavit,

16 and specifically to reject the opposition to the

17 application as unfounded on any one of the grounds that

18 have been articulated.

19 CHAIRPERSON: To put it in a nutshell,

20 you contend that reasonable grounds for the removal have

21 been shown by you. Is that –

22 MR MPOFU: Ja.

23 CHAIRPERSON: That's what it amounts to.

24 MR MPOFU: Exactly, Chairperson, and

25 those reasonable grounds pertaining to what we call the key

Page 8578

1 parties to the Commission, and even the silent party out
 2 there, which is the public or the taxpayers, I mean at a
 3 crude level, if there's going to be a saving to the
 4 taxpayers then that alone is something to be welcomed, but
 5 insofar as the taxpayer is also a member of the public and
 6 has an interest in the outcome of the Commission, clearly
 7 that outcome if anything will, the quality of that outcome
 8 might well be enhanced by the relocation in a sense that
 9 the representation, the quality of the representation will
 10 be much better than it would have otherwise been. Thanks,
 11 Chairperson.

12 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mpofu. Is
 13 there anyone who wishes to address the, or me really, for
 14 transmission to the Minister from the side of SERI?

15 MS MOTLOENYA: Yes, Chair. Thank you,
 16 Chair and Commissioners. For purposes of the record, my
 17 name is Adv Tholoana Motloenya, Motloenya spelt M-O-T-L-O-
 18 E-N-Y-A, and I'm instructed by the Socio-Economic Rights
 19 Institute, recited as the second applicant in this
 20 application, Chair. Chair, I represent the families of the
 21 deceased miners and Ms Lewis and myself are led by Adv
 22 Ntsebeza.

23 Chairperson, SERI as the second applicant also
 24 instructs AMCU and SERI, the families' team –

25 CHAIRPERSON: I think it's probably the

Page 8579

1 other way around; AMCU instructs SERI.

2 MS MOTLOENYA: Sorry. Sorry, it's the
 3 other way around, yes, Chairperson. I beg your pardon,
 4 Chairperson. SERI, the AMCU team, and the families' team
 5 support everything that, all the submissions that Mr Mpofu
 6 has made, and support this application for the relocation
 7 of the seat of the Commission.

8 Chair and Commissioners, Adv Ntsebeza has already
 9 made oral submissions before this Commission on the 26th of
 10 February and I do not intend to repeat those submissions
 11 that have already been made.

12 CHAIRPERSON: They don't appear to have
 13 been challenged by respondents in any way.

14 MS MOTLOENYA: Indeed.

15 CHAIRPERSON: They have made substantive
 16 points of their own, which Mr Mpofu has endeavoured to deal
 17 with, but they haven't, as I understand it, traversed the
 18 case, the points that were advanced by Mr Ntsebeza on
 19 behalf of SERI.

20 MS MOTLOENYA: Indeed, Chairperson. But
 21 first then the application has been opposed and SERI has
 22 filed a replying affidavit, Chairperson. I just wish to
 23 draw the Chairperson's attention to paragraph 6 of that
 24 affidavit specifically which starts on page 3 of the
 25 affidavit.

Page 8580

1 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I have that.

2 MS MOTLOENYA: Yes, Chairperson,
 3 paragraph 6 extends all the way to page 5 and that is where
 4 SERI's financial, current financial position is set out in
 5 the affidavit, Chairperson, and as things stand, SERI's
 6 budgetary resources will be exhausted by the end of June
 7 2013.

8 Chairperson, from those facts that have been set
 9 out in paragraph 6 I wish to make the following
 10 submissions, that if the Commission moves to Pretoria or
 11 Centurion, this will save SERI an amount of about R200 000,
 12 meaning that we can continue to participate at the
 13 Commission for another month beyond May 2013 –

14 CHAIRPERSON: It seems from paragraph 6.6
 15 that the amount is actually R239 423. Is that correct?

16 MS MOTLOENYA: I beg your pardon,
 17 Chairperson?

18 CHAIRPERSON: It seems from paragraph 6.6
 19 that the amount in question is about R239 423. How much is
 20 it per month? I know it's difficult because presumably the
 21 number of people here at any given time on the number of
 22 days vary, but approximately how much per month?

23 MS MOTLOENYA: Chairperson, I'm advised
 24 by my instructing attorney that just for accommodation it
 25 is about R100 000, excluding transport and subsistence for

Page 8581

1 us to be – I beg your pardon, Chairperson, I've just been
 2 corrected by my instructing attorney who says that it is
 3 R100 000 for the team to be in Rustenburg, which includes
 4 transport and accommodation, but it excludes counsel fees.

5 CHAIRPERSON: In other words, this is the
 6 Y factor that Mr Mpofu referred to. Counsel would
 7 presumably be paid, whether they appear in Rustenburg or in
 8 Pretoria, but the Y factor is the expenses that would not
 9 be incurred if the move were to take place.

10 MS MOTLOENYA: Indeed, Chairperson –

11 CHAIRPERSON: And that you say is about
 12 100 000 a month?

13 MS MOTLOENYA: Indeed, Chairperson.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

15 MS MOTLOENYA: That is also the Y factor
 16 of the equation. Chairperson, SERI is currently trying to
 17 secure funding from other sources and they will be also
 18 approaching the Legal Aid Board. However, the funders that
 19 have already funded SERI cannot commit to continuing to
 20 fund the legal representatives any longer, and at the same
 21 time we are faced with a situation where none of the
 22 parties know when the Commission will end. There is no
 23 undertaking that can be given to the funders as to how long
 24 we might need the funding for. Chairperson, I wish to
 25 emphasise that the later the Commission moves to Pretoria,

Page 8582

1 the less money SERI has in the Y factor.
 2 Chairperson, I lastly wish to submit that
 3 relocating the Commission to Pretoria/Centurion will mean
 4 that the AMCU and the families continue to be represented
 5 at the Commission and continue to make a contribution into
 6 assisting the Chairperson and the Commissioners to finding
 7 the truth as to what happened at Marikana in August 2012,
 8 and if the application is not successful then they face the
 9 real likelihood that they will not be able to continue to
 10 participate at the Commission beyond June 2013.
 11 I wish to submit, Chairperson, finally, that in
 12 light of the above facts that have been set out in the
 13 affidavit which has been filed on behalf of SERI, that
 14 there are reasonable grounds that have been shown for the
 15 application to be successful. I have no further
 16 submissions, thank you.
 17 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Chaskalson,
 18 I understand you're going to speak on behalf of the
 19 evidence leaders.
 20 MR CHASKALSON SC: Yes, Mr Chairperson.
 21 Mr Chairperson, in terms of section 4(a) your power
 22 together with the Minister to move the seat of the
 23 Commission is a power that must be exercised on reasonable
 24 grounds shown, and we submit that there are very definitely
 25 reasonable grounds for a move and these relate first of

Page 8583

1 all, and most importantly, to the issue of participation in
 2 the proceedings by interested parties. Then there's the
 3 issue of the saving of public expense, and finally there's
 4 the issue of convenience to the parties.
 5 If I can start briefly with participation in the
 6 proceedings by interested parties, I do not want to repeat
 7 the submissions made by my learned friends who have
 8 preceded me today. The simple point is that the ongoing
 9 additional cost – and I emphasise additional cost – of
 10 holding the proceedings in Rustenburg threatens the
 11 continued legal representation of the injured and arrested
 12 persons and the families of the victims, and possibly also
 13 AMCU.
 14 For the purposes of phase 1 of the proceedings
 15 these parties are amongst the most important parties who
 16 are here, and the value and legitimacy of any findings made
 17 in phase 1 of the Commission will be seriously compromised
 18 if the proceedings in relation to phase 1 have to take
 19 place without the full participation of the injured and
 20 arrested persons, and the families of the victims, and
 21 AMCU. Any findings and recommendations that this
 22 Commission makes in phase 1 will carry much less weight if
 23 the parties, whom I might say are among the most important
 24 parties in relation to phase 1, are not properly
 25 represented for the phase 1 proceedings.

Page 8584

1 The second ground relates to the saving of public
 2 expense and here I refer to the additional – and again I
 3 emphasise additional – accommodation, travelling, and
 4 subsistence expenses incurred by the State because the
 5 Department of Justice officials and various legal teams
 6 paid from the public purse have to travel to Rustenburg for
 7 the proceedings and have to be accommodated here while the
 8 proceedings are in session.
 9 We've addressed this issue in paragraphs 5 to 8
 10 of the affidavit of Mr Mpepu, merely to go to the bottom
 11 line.
 12 [10:39] We estimate that a move to Gauteng would
 13 ordinarily result in monthly savings of at least R300 000
 14 in public expense, and in months where the Commission sits
 15 without any breaks the saving may well exceed R500 000.
 16 Finally in relation to cost there is a point made
 17 in the answering affidavit that the local municipality has
 18 very generously provided us with this venue free of charge.
 19 That will not affect the saving that we speak of because
 20 the same offer has been made by the Centurion, or by the
 21 Tshwane Municipality in relation to facilities in
 22 Centurion. So the net monthly saving to the public purse
 23 of a move we estimate would be at least 300 000 in months
 24 where the Commission does not sit every day, and in months
 25 where the Commission does sit every day, as much as 500

Page 8585

1 000.
 2 Then there's the issue of convenience. Most of
 3 the parties are not based in the Rustenburg area. Almost
 4 all of the legal teams are based in Gauteng, so there's a
 5 substantial additional cost occasioned to parties by
 6 holding proceedings in Rustenburg. Most of the
 7 Commission's suppliers are based in Gauteng, so too are the
 8 transcribers and the audio and video consultants engaged by
 9 the Commission. Now the location of the Commission in
 10 Rustenburg has caused some difficulties in this regard from
 11 time to time in the past, and so we would expect that the
 12 efficiency of the Commission will be enhanced if it is
 13 based in Gauteng, closer to its suppliers, transcribers,
 14 and audio and video consultants.
 15 Now as Mr Mpfu has already indicated,
 16 arrangements are being made to ensure that any local
 17 residents who would want to attend proceedings in Gauteng,
 18 will be able to do so. Transport, or arrangements are
 19 being made to provide transport for this purpose.
 20 Now if I read the answering affidavit of the
 21 respondents, it seems that the principal case against a
 22 move seems to be based on the interest of local communities
 23 in Commission proceedings relating to the underlying causes
 24 of the events of the violence in August last year, and
 25 recommendations that the Commission will make that are

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 8586</p> <p>1 designed to address these underlying causes. Now these are 2 issues which will be addressed in phase 2 of the 3 Commission, not phase 1. The Commission proceedings will 4 be confined to phase 1 for the foreseeable future, and the 5 Commission is unlikely to be able to reach phase 2 for many 6 months. Phase 2 of the Commission is also likely to be a 7 much shorter duration than phase 1 because, as has already 8 been pointed out this morning, for the most part it will be 9 dealt with on affidavits.</p> <p>10 In that regard we point out that the cost and 11 convenience considerations against seating the Commission 12 in Rustenburg would not be that significant, will not be as 13 significant when it comes to phase 2, as they are for phase 14 1, and we would submit that the local access concerns 15 against a move to Gauteng really relates to phase 2. 16 They're not relevant to phase 1, and they would be better 17 revisited at the time when the commencement of phase 2 is 18 imminent. It may well be that a case could be made for the 19 return of the Commission to Rustenburg for phase 2, but 20 that's not an issue to be addressed now. For the 21 foreseeable future the Commission is dealing with phase 1 22 where costs consideration and participation concerns 23 militate strongly against remaining in Rustenburg, and 24 strongly in favour of moving to Gauteng.</p> <p>25 So we would support the application and we would</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 8588</p> <p>1 MR NTSONKOTA: Thank you, Chair. Members 2 of the Commission, you will recall that on the 26th of 3 February when Mr Mpfu moved the application on invitation 4 from the Chair for the parties to indicate their attitude 5 towards the application, my leader Mr Tip took the 6 opportunity to address the Commission, and in his address 7 on behalf of NUM he indicated that NUM does support the 8 application, and he advanced reasons therefore. I do not 9 deem it fruitful to regurgitate what Mr Tip had to say, or 10 the reasons advanced in favour of the application - these 11 are already on record – save merely to reiterate that we 12 stand by our support of the application and the reasons 13 that we advanced in support thereof.</p> <p>14 Yes, perhaps I should also just point out that 15 when one has regard to the opposing affidavit, the reasons 16 that we advanced for supporting the application have not in 17 any way been challenged, and I respectfully submit that 18 therefore they should stand.</p> <p>19 Just lastly, Chair, I respectfully submit that a 20 case has been made out when one has regard to the reasons 21 that were advanced by NUM, and those advanced by those that 22 spoke before me, and I would request that the Commission in 23 its engagement with the relevant Ministry to submit on 24 behalf of the applicants that a proper case has been made 25 out for the relief sought, Chair. Thank you, Chair.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 8587</p> <p>1 associate ourselves with the applicant's request to the 2 Chairperson to approach the Minister with a view to moving 3 the seat of the Commission to Gauteng as soon as possible.</p> <p>4 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Chaskalson. 5 Ms Kgoroadira - 6 MS KGOROEA DIRA: Yes, Chair? 7 CHAIRPERSON: Do you have submissions 8 that you wish to present – 9 MS KGOROEA DIRA: Yes. 10 CHAIRPERSON: - on behalf of your client? 11 MS KGOROEA DIRA: Yes. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Please do so. 13 MS KGOROEA DIRA: Thank you. 14 MR NTSONKOTA: Chair, just for record 15 purposes, my name is Thando Ntsonkota, spelt N-T-S-O-N-K-O- 16 T-A, on behalf of NUM, led by Mr Tip who unfortunately due 17 to prior commitments out of which he could not extricate 18 himself – 19 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry I didn't call on 20 you. I didn't realise you wanted to address me, but – 21 MR NTSONKOTA: I should have been – 22 CHAIRPERSON: - please forgive me for 23 that omission, and please before Adv Kgoroadira addresses 24 us, addresses me and then the Minister through the 25 transcript, please make your submissions.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 8589</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Do any of the 2 other parties wish to address me before I call upon Ms 3 Kgoroadira to speak on behalf of her client? Sorry, Mr 4 Bizos also raised his hand. Is that right? 5 MR BIZOS SC: Very briefly – 6 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Chabedi, shall we give 7 Mr Bizos a chance first, and then you can speak? 8 MR BIZOS SC: Very briefly, we support 9 the application, particularly for the reasons advanced on 10 behalf of the evidence leaders. I want to submit and make 11 publically known that the absence of anyone of the 12 representatives here for financial reasons may be a, if not 13 disastrous, very important factor to be taken into 14 consideration. We believe that everyone of us here is 15 making a contribution and the absence of anyone will affect 16 the public perception that may be created if in fact 17 anybody has to leave for financial reasons. The travelling 18 costs and the accommodation costs for a team to be in 19 Rustenburg are, if possible, should be avoided, and the 20 time taken to come to Rustenburg and back to Gauteng is 21 considerable, almost five hours there and back, and if that 22 wasted time can be avoided the application should succeed 23 in our submission for practically everybody's benefit. We 24 want to thank the council of Rustenburg - we have been 25 treated well, but there are overwhelming factors in favour</p>

Page 8590

1 of the move to Gauteng.

2 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bizos.

3 MS CHABEDI: Thank you, Chair, fellow

4 Commissioners. Just for the record, my surname is Chabedi,

5 C-H-A-B-E-D-I, on behalf of the DMR. I'm led in this

6 matter by Mr Cassie Badenhorst and assisted by Lerato

7 Maite, both of whom are not present today. Chair, early in

8 February –

9 CHAIRPERSON: You're appearing for DMR,

10 aren't you? The Department of Mineral Resources.

11 MS CHABEDI: That's correct, Chairperson.

12 Chair, in February when the application was first argued,

13 the DMR placed on record that we will abide the outcome of

14 this application. I would like to place it on record that

15 we have since revised that position. The DMR now supports

16 the application on the basis as set out in the affidavit

17 filed on behalf of the evidence leaders, in particular

18 paragraph 6 which sets out the cost estimates, how the

19 expenses are expended by the team while in Rustenburg.

20 Chairperson, we submit that the cost estimates apply

21 equally to the DMR team, and as Mr Chaskalson has already

22 put to the Commission, that in phase 2, although there's

23 only been one counsel and the attorney attending in phase

24 2, our team is due to expand.

25 Chair, with regard to phase 2, which those who

Page 8591

1 spoke before me have already submitted that it will be on

2 paper –

3 CHAIRPERSON: I think very largely on

4 paper. There may be some evidence.

5 MS CHABEDI: Yes, Sir.

6 CHAIRPERSON: Some oral evidence, but

7 that's something we can't be sure about at this stage to

8 what extent there will be oral evidence and who the

9 witnesses, if any, will be, but obviously the nature of the

10 monitoring that your department did will come under the

11 microscope and there may have to be some oral evidence, but

12 we won't get there yet.

13 MS CHABEDI: Indeed, Chair. However, the

14 DMR would just for the benefit of the Bapo and in their

15 reply to us, just to sound that even on paper the DMR does

16 intend to place it on record in the papers that we will

17 file, the relevance of their participation and that will be

18 addressed at the appropriate time in papers, and this is in

19 particular in relation to paragraph 7.1 of the ruling made

20 by this Commission with regard to the conduct of

21 proceedings with regard to phase 2. Even then, Chair,

22 we'll argue that the interests indicated by the request for

23 discoveries that have already been filed, that interest,

24 Chair, we'll argue at that appropriate time that it would

25 remain peripheral. I don't want to take the point any

Page 8592

1 further. I just wanted to make the submission for the

2 benefit of the Bapo in their submissions to the Commission.

3 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Again just

4 before we ask Ms Kgoroadira to speak, anyone else who

5 wishes to say anything on behalf of any of the parties? I

6 don't see any red lights. Alright, Ms Kgoroadira, your

7 chance to speak now. You can do so after we take the tea

8 adjournment. I see it's 3 minutes to 11, unless you can

9 give me the assurance you'll be finished in three minutes?

10 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes, we should be.

11 CHAIRPERSON: In three minutes?

12 MS KGOROEDIRA: In three minutes? No,

13 no, no, Chair, let's take tea.

14 CHAIRPERSON: No, I thought not. Do you

15 want to take the tea adjournment?

16 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON: Very well, we'll reassemble

18 after the tea adjournment to hear your argument.

19 MS KGOROEDIRA: Thank you, Chair.

20 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]

21 [11:18] MS KGOROEDIRA: Kgoroadira. Karabo,

22 Kgoro-e-a-dira. It's Greek.

23 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I thought I got it

24 wrong, I'm sorry, but I did try.

25 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes, you did. Thank

Page 8593

1 you. Thank you, Mr Chair, Commissioners. I'm Karabo

2 Kgoroadira. I am representing the first to the fifth

3 respondents. Yeah, looking at my colleagues I feel like

4 the wicked witch of the west who wants everybody to stay in

5 Rustenburg, but be that as it may. I would like to deal

6 with the issue of locus standi and the interests of the

7 first respondents to the fifth respondents. The

8 traditional communities have been largely defined as

9 indigenous communities by a number of institutions. One is

10 the African Charter on Human & People's Rights, commonly

11 known as the African Charter, the African Commission on

12 Human & People's Rights, referred to as the African

13 Commission, and particularly when it was mandated to

14 consider the rights of the Nigerian indigenous, traditional

15 community in relation to their participation in the mining

16 activities which took place on their land. The World

17 Business Council for Sustainable Development, article

18 drafted by the International Institute for Environment and

19 Development similarly referred to traditional communities

20 as indigenous communities. So for the purposes of this

21 application, and to deviate from referring to these

22 communities as the traditional mining communities, or

23 traditional communities, I submit that I will refer to them

24 as indigenous communities.

25 The International Institute for Environment &

Page 8594

1 Development, article on mining and minerals and sustainable
 2 development, entitled "Indigenous communities and mineral
 3 development," highlighted key principles where indigenous
 4 communities and extracting of minerals on tribal land is
 5 concerned. In the main it pointed out that the conflicts
 6 with indigenous communities related to the land property
 7 and its resources which arose with the inception of mining
 8 activities, are present not only in developing countries,
 9 but also in the developed world.

10 The connection of indigenous people with their
 11 land is almost the same worldwide. The indigenous
 12 communities do not consider land as a commodity to provide
 13 any material profit. The land for these communities has a
 14 spiritual connotation. The land for the indigenous
 15 community is the mother earth. They do not own it, but
 16 conversely the land owns them. It is therefore imperative
 17 to understand that the opposition from the indigenous
 18 communities, such as the first and fifth respondents, to
 19 this type of development in certainly understandable –

20 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry to interrupt you.
 21 There's something that I don't understand.

22 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON: I can understand how the
 24 first respondent in some way is regarded as representing
 25 the indigenous people, but I don't understand how the

Page 8595

1 second and fifth respondents, that's the local authorities,
 2 can be so regarded.

3 MS KGOROEDIRA: If Mr Chair gives me the
 4 opportunity in, as I advance my argument –

5 CHAIRPERSON: No, perhaps you should deal
 6 with this point first before you advance the rest of the
 7 argument.

8 MS KGOROEDIRA: The second respondent to
 9 the fifth respondent are the local municipalities which
 10 really govern traditional communities, or indigenous
 11 communities in the area, therefore the recommendations that
 12 will come out of the Marikana Commission will indirectly,
 13 or similarly directly, have an impact on their traditional
 14 communities in that –

15 CHAIRPERSON: Are you talking about phase
 16 1 or phase 2?

17 MS KGOROEDIRA: I'm talking about phase
 18 2.

19 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, so what do you say
 20 about the point made by Mr Chaskalson that when we reach
 21 the beginning of phase 2, the question of removal can be
 22 revisited, if necessary? That's if the application is
 23 granted.

24 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON: But the issues with which

Page 8596

1 we are presently concerned are different. The argument, he
 2 made the point the consideration as set out in the
 3 affidavit filed on behalf of your clients relate to phase 2
 4 and that it may well be important, if the application is
 5 granted, when we start on phase 2, to revisit the question
 6 of the venue, but what relevance have these points got at
 7 the present stage of the proceedings in phase 1?

8 MS KGOROEDIRA: In phase 1, granted, we
 9 are dealing with the August 9th to the 12th –

10 CHAIRPERSON: 16th.

11 MS KGOROEDIRA: To the 16th of August, I
 12 beg your pardon, and the traditional communities have also
 13 the right to attend the Commission as to listen to how the
 14 Marikana tragedy actually occurred, as well to attend, as
 15 it occurred in its area. It is also a healing process for
 16 the indigenous people as it also affected them, hence the
 17 President –

18 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, how does it
 19 affect them? I understand that all the people who died,
 20 certainly on the 16th, were what was commonly described as
 21 migrant labourers, were they not?

22 MS KGOROEDIRA: Not all. The security –

23 CHAIRPERSON: All the people, the 34 that
 24 died on the 16th.

25 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes, but the other

Page 8597

1 people that died –

2 CHAIRPERSON: But they were migrant
 3 labourers. Is that right?

4 MS KGOROEDIRA: They were? I beg your
 5 pardon, Chair?

6 CHAIRPERSON: They were what is commonly
 7 described as migrant labourers. Most of them came from
 8 Pondoland, some of them –

9 MS KGOROEDIRA: Mr Chair, I wish I could
 10 just finish my –

11 CHAIRPERSON: - one from Swaziland and
 12 one from – no, but I'll give you the opportunity to finish
 13 your argument, but it's customary for counsel to answer
 14 questions when questions are put. It normally advances the
 15 argument. To say to a judicial officer who asked a
 16 question, let me finish my argument, I don't want to answer
 17 your questions, is not customary, certainly not in the
 18 courts in which I've practised.

19 MS KGOROEDIRA: As Mr Chair pleases.

20 CHAIRPERSON: So answer my question,
 21 please.

22 MS KGOROEDIRA: The violence in the area
 23 that led to the killings regrettably of the migrant
 24 workers, was similarly in indigenous communities and the
 25 migrant workers and the housing, mining houses, as it will

Page 8598

1 be demonstrated further that it involved the indigenous
 2 people, the migrant workers, and everybody who lives in the
 3 area. Therefore, Mr Chair, if I could just continue I
 4 would then demonstrate the very same fact. Thank you.

5 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: May I just pose
 6 something to you as well? Is the opposition predicated on
 7 the desire of the communities to attend the proceedings?
 8 Because we've had but a handful of attendees on a number of
 9 occasions and frequently counsel were also not representing
 10 the community during the hearing as phase 1.

11 MS KGOROEDIRA: The people have been
 12 coming in smaller numbers ever since the application for
 13 the relocation has been made alert that if they do not
 14 participate fully in this Marikana it may be taken away
 15 from them. It is rather expensive. Most people are
 16 unemployed. Even on the mines they are unemployed.
 17 Therefore they also need transport to get here to attend,
 18 but since there has been an awareness that non-attendance
 19 would mean that they are not following the proceedings
 20 and/or, recently there has been – I think you'll agree with
 21 me – a number of Bapo Ba Mogale, Bakgatla, Bafokeng, that
 22 are actually attending this Commission. As presently even
 23 today we've got members of the communities in the gallery,
 24 therefore it is very important to these people, and there
 25 was also a lack of information as to the resources that

Page 8599

1 would be made available to them as to attending the
 2 Commission. The administrator and the other municipalities
 3 have made them aware of those certain resources that can
 4 also be available to them for them to attend the
 5 Commission, and they then had to be also educated as well
 6 as to their rights, as to how it will affect their lives,
 7 and to that extent the numbers have increased.

8 As to counsel representing the communities,
 9 similarly there's been a different mandate and a bit of
 10 confusion as to this Commission is concerned, but that has
 11 since been resolved and though counsel for, that would be
 12 myself, and I'm alone, I have to consult, if ever I'm being
 13 questioned about my attendance, I have to consult. I have
 14 to still tender to the hearing, and I'm working alone here,
 15 and I'm also not taking a fee. That is usually what would
 16 be my day fee. I am also sacrificing a lot for this
 17 community, as I have been doing for the last seven years.
 18 May I continue?

19 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

20 MS KGOROEDIRA: As I was saying, it is
 21 therefore imperative to understand that the opposition from
 22 the indigenous community such as the first respondent and
 23 the fifth respondent, to this type of development is
 24 certainly understandable because in the past the
 25 exploitation of mineral resources has provided sustainable

Page 8600

1 substantial profits only for the State, government and
 2 mining companies, who have overlooked the fact that
 3 resources were located in indigenous land. Now there's a
 4 general concern on how to create adequate instruments that
 5 will permit the mineral activities to contribute to the
 6 global transition towards sustainable development –

7 CHAIRPERSON: That's a phase 2 question –
 8 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: - if it's a question at
 10 all. Is that right?

11 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes, it is. The
 12 International Institute for Environment & Development
 13 emphasises that in the agenda 21 adopted by the UN
 14 Conference on the environment and development in Rio dated
 15 June 12, 1992, and the draft of the inter-American
 16 Declaration of the Right of Indigenous People promotes the
 17 participation of indigenous communities in policy-making
 18 process relating to resource management.

19 It further specifies the State's obligation to
 20 guarantee the participation of the indigenous communities
 21 in decisions over mineral resources. Furthermore,
 22 Convention number 169 concerning indigenous and tribal
 23 people in independent countries, adopted by the General
 24 Conference of the International Labour Organisation (ILO)
 25 Geneva, June 27, 1990, entered into force in September 5,

Page 8601

1 1991, supports the same notion – participation, full
 2 participation of indigenous communities.

3 Now in South Africa land was one of the primary
 4 means by which black South Africans were oppressed.
 5 Statutes such as –

6 CHAIRPERSON: Before you carry on, can I
 7 ask you this question? In what way do you propose or are
 8 you instructed to contribute to the issues arising in phase
 9 1? I understand the points you make relate to phase 2, to
 10 some extent, but we're busy with phase 1. In what way do
 11 you propose participating in phase 1?

12 [11:38] MS KGOROEDIRA: In phase 1, as I said
 13 before, Mr Chair, was that the phase 1, the parties can
 14 then attend the Commission –

15 CHAIRPERSON: I see. So you're not
 16 suggesting they will participate; you just say they should
 17 have the right to attend, as any member of the public can.

18 MS KGOROEDIRA: I cannot even say we may
 19 not participate –

20 CHAIRPERSON: No, but I asked you –
 21 MS KGOROEDIRA: The evidence is still –
 22 CHAIRPERSON: No, I asked you in what way
 23 you propose to participate, or are instructed to
 24 participate. You know what the issues are. You know what
 25 the evidence has been about. You know that the remaining

Page 8602

1 witnesses will come from the side of the police, from
 2 Lonmin, and Mr Mpofu may decide to call certain of his
 3 clients as well. That's all. All the other witnesses who
 4 come, no question has ever been asked of any of the
 5 witnesses so far on behalf of your clients. So in what way
 6 do you propose, or are you instructed to participate in
 7 phase 1? Let me ask you another question, so you can
 8 answer two together. Have you filed any affidavits on
 9 behalf of your clients in relation to phase 1?
 10 MS KGOROEDIRA: Participation in phase 1
 11 – my instructions are the Commission should be open for the
 12 traditional and indigenous people to also attend the
 13 Commission.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: I know that. I asked you a
 15 question. I'd be grateful if you'd answer it. You made
 16 the point about people attending, but I then asked you
 17 about participation and I asked you some specific
 18 questions, and I would like an answer.
 19 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes. I'm sorry.
 20 Inasmuch as we have not filed affidavits for phase 1, Mr
 21 chair –
 22 CHAIRPERSON: You haven't filed
 23 affidavits?
 24 MS KGOROEDIRA: No, we haven't filed
 25 affidavits. However, we still have the right to cross-

Page 8603

1 examine any witness that may raise a point that relates to
 2 anything that the parties may raise in phase 2. So if a
 3 witness comes to the stand –
 4 CHAIRPERSON: No, no –
 5 MS KGOROEDIRA: We don't have the right
 6 –
 7 CHAIRPERSON: I don't understand that.
 8 Are you suggesting that somehow in the course of phase 1 a
 9 witness comes who can throw light on something in phase 2,
 10 you'd like to ask a question here in part of phase 1?
 11 Let's take a practical example. Mr Ramaphosa, I understand
 12 may come and give evidence on phase 1. He also may be able
 13 to give evidence, either by way of affidavit or otherwise,
 14 in relation to some of the phase 2 issues because he was on
 15 the board of Lonmin. Are you suggesting that if Mr
 16 Ramaphosa comes to give evidence on phase 1, you would like
 17 to be able to jump up and ask him questions relating to
 18 phase 2? Because I can tell you if you want to do that,
 19 you won't succeed.
 20 MS KGOROEDIRA: I wouldn't necessarily
 21 jump up, Mr Chair, and just ask him a question on phase 1.
 22 He would have to have –
 23 CHAIRPERSON: - if he's giving evidence
 24 on phase 1 –
 25 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.

Page 8604

1 CHAIRPERSON: - do you propose during
 2 phase 1 to ask him questions that relate to phase 2?
 3 MS KGOROEDIRA: No.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: Alright, so where, so in
 5 what way are you going to participate in phase 1?
 6 MS KGOROEDIRA: Mr Chair, I cannot
 7 anticipate how the proceedings will go or I may find a
 8 point that relates to phase 1 that I may want to
 9 participate in on behalf of, or advise –
 10 CHAIRPERSON: You have chambers, I
 11 understand, in Johannesburg.
 12 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: So if we were to move to
 14 Centurion – I'm not saying we will, it will depend
 15 obviously on the decision the Minister and I make, but if
 16 there were to be a move to Centurion you would be able to
 17 come to Centurion to ask those questions that you may think
 18 of in relation to phase 1. Is that correct?
 19 MS KGOROEDIRA: For me, yes, but this is
 20 not about me, Mr Chair. It's about the community.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: It's a question of a way in
 22 which your clients will be able, if there's something they
 23 can think of or someone else can think of on their behalf,
 24 to participate in phase 1 the way which they vote to
 25 participate. They're not going to ask the questions

Page 8605

1 themselves anyway, are they?
 2 MS KGOROEDIRA: No, they're not.
 3 Anyway, I'll carry on. In the premise, and due to the
 4 Marikana tragedy, his Excellency, the honourable President
 5 Jacob Zuma, appointed this Commission to investigate the
 6 core conflicts inherent in the area. In the Terms of
 7 Reference honourable President Zuma mandated this
 8 Commission to investigate among other things, matters of
 9 public, national, and international concern arising out of
 10 the events of the 9th of August to the 16th of August 2012,
 11 and the role played by the relevant stakeholders, but more
 12 importantly, the purpose of this Commission is to ensure
 13 the events such as the Marikana tragedy do not reoccur in
 14 South Africa. Accordingly, the participation of the
 15 indigenous communities, mining companies, employees, is
 16 vital in order to uncover the iniquities, if any, for this
 17 Commission to make available input in the North West
 18 province as a whole. Accordingly, it is against the
 19 background that I submit that the first respondent has
 20 locus standi, and substantial interest in this Commission.
 21 Another issue is jurisdiction.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: Isn't the point taken in
 23 the opposing affidavit in relation to jurisdiction in the
 24 light of what Mr Mpofu submitted about section 2 of the
 25 Commissions Act?

Page 8606

1 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes, I'm dealing with
 2 that now.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: You persist in those
 4 arguments?
 5 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes, I am.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Is that your main argument?
 7 MS KGOROEDIRA: No, it's not my main
 8 argument, but I –
 9 CHAIRPERSON: I see. Oh well, well carry
 10 on with your argument.
 11 MS KGOROEDIRA: I will deal with that
 12 now. Jurisdiction – now the relocation of a commission and
 13 issue of jurisdiction relating thereto, issues of
 14 jurisdiction relating thereto, have not been sufficiently
 15 debated in our domestic courts.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: - because is section 2 of
 17 the Commissions Act -
 18 MS KGOROEDIRA: I am about to –
 19 CHAIRPERSON: - which says the Commission
 20 can sit anywhere in the Republic.
 21 MS KGOROEDIRA: I'm about to address
 22 that.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: I see.
 24 MS KGOROEDIRA: However, while I was
 25 reading I came across a Supreme Court of Appeal judgment in

Page 8607

1 the matter of Stopforth versus Minister of Justice &
 2 Others, 2001 (1) SA 113 (SCA). The court in this instance
 3 had to enquire whether the Promotion of National Unity and
 4 Reconciliation Act 34 of 1994 entitled the Truth and
 5 Reconciliation Commission to jurisdiction to grant amnesty
 6 of acts committed outside of South Africa.
 7 However, the interesting part of this judgment
 8 was the manner in which the court interpreted the Promotion
 9 of National Unity and Reconciliation Act where jurisdiction
 10 was concerned. In particular, Judge Olivier indicated that
 11 in analysing the jurisdiction of the amnesty committee, it
 12 is the purposive interpretation that should be given to the
 13 TRC Act. The court went further to say that, "In giving
 14 effect to this approach, one should at least look at the
 15 preamble of the act, or at the express indications in the
 16 act as to the object that has to be achieved, study various
 17 sections wherein the purpose may be found, look at what led
 18 to the enactment not to show the meaning but to show the
 19 mischief that the act was intended to deal with, and then
 20 draw logical inferences from the context of the enactment."
 21 Now section 2 of the Commissions Act 8 of 1947
 22 reads as follows. "The commission may sit at any place in
 23 the union," meaning the republic, as my learned colleague
 24 has indicated, "for the purpose of hearing evidence or
 25 addresses or deliberating," and the preamble of this act

Page 8608

1 says, "To make provisions for conferring certain powers on
 2 commissions appointed by governor-general," which would be
 3 the President in this instance, "for the purpose of
 4 investigating matters of public concern and to provide for
 5 matters incidental thereto."
 6 Section 1(b)(iii) of the Commissions Act protects
 7 any member of the commission from being insulted,
 8 disparaged or belittled, and prevents the proceedings or
 9 the findings of the commission from being prejudiced,
 10 influenced, or anticipated.
 11 Furthermore Judge Olivier, in reaching a
 12 decision, referred to the following cases. The Secretary
 13 for Inland Revenue versus Sturrock Sugar Farm (Pty)
 14 Limited, 1965 (1) SA 897 (A) at page –
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I was in that Sturrock
 16 case and the passage to which you are referring was
 17 discussed later by the SCA in a subsequent case between the
 18 Standard Bank, National Bank, and Registrar of Banking, and
 19 it was pointed out that there were some miss-citations in
 20 the passage concerned, although the purposive principle was
 21 still upheld by the court.
 22 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: But that passage that
 24 you're now relying on has to be read in the light of the
 25 criticism contained in the subsequent appellate division

Page 8609

1 case. I'm not sure it's going to help us at all in this
 2 matter.
 3 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes, my learned friend
 4 in his reply can deal with it from that angle, and it
 5 reads, Judge Thompson –
 6 CHAIRPERSON: - no point in reading a
 7 passage which – it's no good saying your learned friend
 8 will deal with it in reply. You're dealing with it now.
 9 What's the point in dealing with a passage which has been,
 10 the judgment of the appellate division which has been
 11 discredited, if I can put it that way –
 12 MS KGOROEDIRA: Okay.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: In a subsequent decision of
 14 the SCA it was pointed out that there were, there was the
 15 quotation supposedly in that passage which was shown not to
 16 be a correct quotation. No such quotation appears in the
 17 judgment cited, so it's no good saying your learned friend
 18 will deal with it in reply; you're dealing with it now. I
 19 understand the argument, which was upheld in the subsequent
 20 case, that the purposive approach applies.
 21 MS KGOROEDIRA: Yes.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: And clearly in modern
 23 jurisprudence cases have to be interpreted in the light of
 24 – I mean statutes to be interpreted in the light of the
 25 purpose sought to be achieved by –

Page 8610

1 MS KGOROEOADIRA: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON: We know that. I would

3 think that first-year law students are taught that these

4 days. So you don't have to quote slightly discredited

5 authority in support of that trite proposition, but anyway,

6 please proceed.

7 MS KGOROEOADIRA: Okay. In the premise

8 section 2 of the Commissions Act should be read with

9 section 1(b)(iii) of the Commissions Act, and the preamble

10 of the Commissions Act, they should be read together.

11 Accordingly consideration should be had to the following,

12 that the Marikana tragedy occurred in this area and all the

13 evidence necessary for the Commission to make an insightful

14 recommendation to the honourable President Jacob Zuma may

15 be adequately presented and submitted from this area. The

16 proceedings, or the evidence of the Marikana Commission may

17 not be prejudiced, influenced, or anticipated.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Will the proceedings not be

19 prejudiced if there isn't full participation from parties

20 who have to withdraw because the hundreds of thousands of

21 rand that have to be spent, obviously spent in this area,

22 which I can understand the concern of certain parties, but

23 the hundreds of thousands of rand that have to be spent in

24 this area, if these parties continue to be represented,

25 will mean that they can no longer be represented? Will

Page 8611

1 that not in fact adversely impact on the work of the

2 Commission and the quality of the answers that it gives to

3 the questions that are posed in the Terms of Reference?

4 MS KGOROEOADIRA: As it has been

5 previously indicated by my learned friend that I was not

6 opposing to the fact that there is money spent; I was not

7 opposing to the costs involved, and I will deal with that

8 after I make this point –

9 CHAIRPERSON: But by implication, if

10 you're not opposing that, then what do you say about the

11 point, which is a major point stressed by a number of the

12 counsellors who addressed me today –

13 MS KGOROEOADIRA: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON: - namely that the work of

15 the Commission will in fact be adversely affected if it has

16 to continue here in Rustenburg, for the reasons set out,

17 which are not challenged, that there is an enormous

18 financial drain on not just the State, but the parties as

19 well, and some of them tell us in all candour that if we

20 stay here in Rustenburg they will have to withdraw. Now

21 that's the point that you've got to deal with. That's the

22 major point, or certainly one of the major points advanced

23 in support of the application and you've got to deal with

24 it. So far you haven't dealt with it at all.

25 MS KGOROEOADIRA: Yes, I haven't. I was

Page 8612

1 going to deal with it after I make this point, because

2 that's an issue of costs that is being raised by most

3 parties.

4 CHAIRPERSON: No, it's not an issue of

5 costs; it's an issue of the continued effective operation

6 of the Commission –

7 MS KGOROEOADIRA: Yes.

8 [11:58] CHAIRPERSON: - in the light of the

9 assistance it will no longer, probably will no longer be

10 receiving from parties who up to now have been

11 participating and making a meaningful contribution to the

12 proceedings thus far.

13 MS KGOROEOADIRA: Yes. As I said the

14 proceedings, or the evidence of the Marikana Commission may

15 not be prejudiced, influenced, or anticipated. Therefore I

16 humbly submit to that extent that the relocation of the

17 Marikana Commission, taking into account all that which he

18 has said, relocation from Rustenburg, North West province,

19 to Pretoria, Gauteng province, would prejudice, belittle,

20 and insult the indigenous communities of the North West,

21 therefore denying the indigenous communities the access to

22 the very justice that this Marikana Commission stands to

23 achieve in addressing imbalances and inequalities that have

24 advanced over the years, which tragically led to the

25 Marikana tragedy.

Page 8613

1 Now the applicant's main contentions are in

2 relation to their ability to continue with the

3 representation due to the amount of money that's being

4 spent. I'm not opposing that. It is true, we've got good

5 advocates representing SERI, representing the families,

6 representing the evidence leaders coming here, which are

7 employed by the Department of Justice - I will deal with

8 them separately – who are making a valuable contribution to

9 this Marikana Commission, and seeing them having to leave

10 would really be tragic.

11 However, the indigenous people also need to

12 participate fully in this process. In the SERI replying

13 affidavit it is indicated that sponsorship is being sourced

14 from international, national, and private communities

15 alike. I publicly appeal that those who are sponsoring to

16 continue sponsoring, those who can sponsor to continue

17 sponsoring SERI and all the applicants that need

18 sponsorship because losing their legal representatives

19 would be prejudicial, and I also appeal to the North West

20 Bar to participate, probably on a pro bono basis, in the

21 Marikana Commission as this affects the indigenous

22 community of their area.

23 The evidence leaders are employed by the

24 Department of Justice –

25 CHAIRPERSON: Not employed; they're

Page 8614

1 briefed by the Department of Justice.
 2 MS KGOROEDIRA: They are briefed by the
 3 Department of Justice, I beg your pardon –
 4 CHAIRPERSON: They're briefed by the
 5 State Attorney on behalf of the Department of Justice.
 6 MS KGOROEDIRA: I beg your pardon. They
 7 are briefed by the State Attorney, who is instructed by the
 8 Department of Justice –
 9 CHAIRPERSON: The evidence leaders were
 10 chosen by the Commissioners themselves. We chose them,
 11 decided who would be briefed, requested the State Attorney
 12 to do the necessary. The executive played no part in
 13 deciding which advocates would appear as evidence leaders
 14 here. That's a very important point –
 15 MS KGOROEDIRA: I beg your pardon.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: - that must be stressed.
 17 MS KGOROEDIRA: I beg your pardon,
 18 Chair. The point I was trying to make was the fund that
 19 fund legal representation for the lawyers on the part of
 20 representing the evidence leaders and perhaps the operation
 21 of this Commission are sourced from the Department of
 22 Justice, and the department, or in light of the fact that
 23 the Chair has to meet with the Minister in order to
 24 reconsider, or to consider the relocation of this
 25 Commission, the department or the Minister, or those in

Page 8615

1 charge are well aware of the costs of this Commission. But
 2 even so, the Minister on the 3rd of April, having a meeting
 3 with our Chairman and our Commissioners, still wanted to
 4 hear what the indigenous people had to say, hence we were
 5 granted a hearing today.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: - the Minister, but he and
 7 I –
 8 MS KGOROEDIRA: Both parties, yes.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: - thought it was
 10 inappropriate to deal with the application while there was
 11 opposition. The points raised by the respondent had to be
 12 considered and the applicants had to get an opportunity to
 13 answer. So it would have been totally inappropriate to
 14 have done anything else.
 15 MS KGOROEDIRA: In the premise, I submit
 16 that, and I humbly – ja, I humbly submit that the
 17 relocation of the Commission would be detrimental to the
 18 traditional, or indigenous communities concerned, and that
 19 the relocation application should be dismissed.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Chaskalson,
 21 would you wish to reply, before I call on Mr Mpofu, on the
 22 interpretation point about section 2 of the act?
 23 MR CHASKALSON SC: No, Mr Chairperson, I
 24 have no reply to the submissions. I'm happy to leave it to
 25 Mr Mpofu.

Page 8616

1 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, in the light of
 2 that show of confidence from the evidence leaders, do you
 3 wish to say anything in reply?
 4 MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you, Chairperson.
 5 I'm happy to join the team of the evidence leaders, for
 6 obvious reasons. Chair, quite frankly, there's no great
 7 reason to reply. I don't think the issues have been
 8 addressed at all. Instead what we've been given are new
 9 issues not raised in the affidavit, about conventions in
 10 Nigeria and Geneva and such places.
 11 What we know, Chair, what has also not been
 12 addressed of course is the fact that the Commission is in
 13 possession of a letter that says that the traditional
 14 communities will abide by the decision, and one would have
 15 expected at the very least that the emergence of that
 16 letter would have called for a supplementary affidavit, or
 17 something of that nature. So as we are standing here, that
 18 is the situation.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: It's the suggestion that
 20 the administrator of the traditional authority was on a
 21 frolic of his own. He hasn't filed an affidavit dealing
 22 with that at all.
 23 MR MPOFU: Yes, well exactly,
 24 Chairperson, he has not filed an affidavit that says he's
 25 not on a frolic of his own, so we have to accept that he

Page 8617

1 is. Then of course the issue of the Terms of Reference,
 2 for what it's worth actually militate against the argument
 3 of the respondents. It is true that the President in
 4 promulgating, or rather in instituting the Commission
 5 referred to it having to deal with matters of public,
 6 national, and international concern. There was no mention
 7 of matters of provincial concern or whatever we've been now
 8 asked to concentrate on. So insofar as any – South Africa
 9 is a unitary state, we no longer have the homeland system,
 10 so insofar as any part of South Africa has a specific
 11 interest, it is covered in the national, in the broad
 12 national interest that the President referred to, and my
 13 learned colleague says herself that one of the objectives
 14 is that these tragic events should not reoccur in South
 15 Africa, not in the North West or in the Rustenburg area,
 16 and all those show that even if one were to take the so-
 17 called purposive interpretation, it would work against the
 18 opposition.
 19 But for what it's worth, Chair, and the Chair has
 20 correctly pointed out, the proposition that we must jump to
 21 some purposive interpretation is itself against the first
 22 principles of legal interpretation, which says that when
 23 the plain grammatical meaning of the statute is clear, one
 24 does not even have to go to the golden rule and all those
 25 things, let alone the preamble –

Page 8618

1 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure one needs to
 2 go as far as that. I didn't say that, but –
 3 MR MPOFU: Ja.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: The purposive approach must
 5 always be adopted, I would have thought, but I don't quite
 6 understand how the purposive approach –
 7 MR MPOFU: Helps us, ja.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: - enables us to cut down
 9 the clear wording of section 2.
 10 MR MPOFU: Absolutely.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: There's nothing in the
 12 preamble or in the other parts of the Commissions Act which
 13 points in that direction.
 14 MR MPOFU: Which derogates from the clear
 15 meaning, Chairperson, thank you.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, Mr Mpofo, before you
 17 carry on, I think that if he's still in the building,
 18 Major-General Annandale can be told that we won't be able
 19 to hear him today, but as long as he's back here at half
 20 past 9 – sorry, 10 o'clock on Monday. Thank you. I
 21 understand he's going, I was informed that he wished to
 22 leave at half past 12 because he had to attend a funeral,
 23 but I think in fairness I could indicate now that if he
 24 wants to go now there won't be a problem. We won't call on
 25 him between now and half past 12, but he's got to be back

Page 8619

1 here at 10 o'clock on Monday. Sorry Mr Mpofo, please
 2 proceed.
 3 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. And
 4 so insofar as one may still recall what I called the first
 5 principles, also what one calls the *lex generalis*, which is
 6 what the broader preambular issues would be, cannot
 7 overrule the *lex specifica*. In this case we have *lex summa*
 8 *specifica*, if one may coin a Latin phrase, because there
 9 are specific regulations which have been given for this
 10 particular Commission, so you go even beyond *lex specifica*.
 11 So those are just some of the first principles of
 12 interpretation.
 13 Then, Chair, for what it's worth, I just want to
 14 make this point very clear. Let's assume for argument sake
 15 that there is some peripheral interest that the traditional
 16 community concerned have; we have not been told, despite
 17 the challenge that we put in the morning, at what point
 18 does that interest supersede the interest of the direct
 19 parties in respect of which and on behalf of whom, as Mr
 20 Chaskalson put it very clearly, the Commission was put
 21 together in the first place. Those are the primary
 22 parties; there's no question about it, and therefore if
 23 there was any overriding interest that might override their
 24 own interest, then we should have been told about it, and
 25 we haven't been told of such a thing. Instead we are told

Page 8620

1 that the respondents actually do not oppose the submissions
 2 we have made in relation to escalating costs and the
 3 implications and the threat of no representation. So
 4 therefore we should have been favoured at the very least
 5 with something that says look, despite the fact that these
 6 people will be deprived of their access to justice, their
 7 right to representation, their ability to get to the truth
 8 of why their loved ones died or were injured, there is this
 9 other countervailing interest which must supersede all
 10 that, but that has not been forthcoming at all, and
 11 therefore the key issue really is this – once again
 12 assuming that there is that interest, one taking it for
 13 granted, we've also not been told why that interest may not
 14 be well represented in another location. In other words,
 15 let's assume for argument sake that one of the findings of
 16 the Commission will be that the massacre was caused because
 17 the local council of this and that place did not sit on a
 18 specific day, then what difference does that make whether
 19 that pronouncement is made in Rustenburg or in Pretoria?
 20 It will still have the same impact, or it will require the
 21 same action or non-action or whatever, wherever it is made.
 22 So if anyone is going to be insulted by
 23 deliberately continuing with a path of having the
 24 Commission at a place which clearly is going to result in
 25 their non-representation, it is the applicants and the

Page 8621

1 parties and the victims and the families of the people who
 2 died, and the other affected people who are mentioned in
 3 the Terms of Reference, as it were. Thank you,
 4 Chairperson, I just wanted to clarify those points, but
 5 quite honestly, I think as I said in my closing statement
 6 of the first round, the application as far as we're
 7 concerned should still be regarded as not being opposed.
 8 Thank you, Chairperson.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I will consider
 10 the arguments that have been addressed to us today and the
 11 papers that have been filed and what was said previously,
 12 and –
 13 MR MPOFU: Sorry, Chairperson, there's
 14 just one point. Also the invitation that was made by the
 15 Chairperson and Mr Chaskalson of revisiting the matter
 16 should the need arise in respect of phase 2 has quite
 17 frankly not been addressed at all. Thank you, Chairperson.
 18 [12:18] CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I will consider what's
 19 been said today and previously and the papers filed, and
 20 arrangements have been made for a full set of the papers to
 21 be sent to the Minister and he will also receive a
 22 transcript of what has been said today, and when he is
 23 ready to discuss the matter with me, we will meet and
 24 endeavour to ascertain whether reasonable grounds have been
 25 shown for the removal. It's quite clear, it's now 20 past

1 12 – as I said earlier, I received a message this morning
2 from Mr Semenya to the effect that General Annandale has to
3 attend a funeral this afternoon and he wanted to know
4 whether we would stop sitting at 12:30 and I said we would,
5 but there's no point in just hearing 10 minutes of
6 evidence. So as I said earlier, we will now adjourn until
7 Monday morning at 10 o'clock.

8 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED]

9 .
10 .
11 .
12 .
13 .
14 .
15 .
16 .
17 .
18 .
19 .
20 .
21 .
22 .
23 .
24 .
25 .

<p style="text-align: center;">A</p> <p>abide 8590:13 8616:14 ability 8613:2 8620:7 able 8563:11 8571:15 8582:9 8585:18 8586:5 8603:12,17 8604:16,22 8618:18 absence 8589:11,15 Absolutely 8618:10 accept 8575:12 8616:25 access 8562:22 8570:12 8570:20,22 8571:11 8586:14 8612:21 8620:6 accommodated 8584:7 accommodation 8575:25 8580:24 8581:4 8584:3 8589:18 account 8612:17 achieve 8612:23 achieved 8607:16 8609:25 acknowledged 8569:23 acquiescence 8565:23 8567:23 8568:4 act 8568:3,23,24,24 8569:1 8605:25 8606:17 8607:4,9,13 8607:15,16,19,21,25 8608:6 8610:8,9,10 8615:22 8618:12 acting 8565:7,9 action 8568:18,20,20 8570:6 8620:21 activities 8593:16 8594:8 8600:5 acts 8607:6 add 8568:3 additional 8562:18 8573:19 8574:2 8583:9,9 8584:2,3 8585:5 address 8558:14,16,17 8558:21 8578:13 8586:1 8587:20 8588:6,6 8589:2 8606:21 addressed 8566:8 8584:9 8586:2,20 8591:18 8611:12 8616:8,12 8621:10,17 addresses 8587:23,24 8607:25 addressing 8569:4 8612:23 adds 8568:7 adequate 8600:4 adequately 8610:15 adjourn 8622:6 ADJOURNED 8622:8 adjournment 8592:8 8592:15,18 ADJOURNS 8592:20 administrator 8564:9</p>	<p>8565:2 8599:2 8616:20 admitted 8565:11 adopted 8600:13,23 8618:5 Adv 8558:3 8578:17,21 8579:8 8587:23 advance 8595:4,6 advanced 8579:18 8588:8,10,13,16,21 8588:21 8589:9 8611:22 8612:24 advances 8597:14 advantage 8563:2 adversely 8611:1,15 advisably 8577:10 advise 8604:9 advised 8559:11 8580:23 advocates 8613:5 8614:13 affect 8584:19 8589:15 8596:19 8599:6 affidavit 8561:7,18,19 8563:22 8564:22 8565:4 8566:25 8567:13 8568:16 8570:8 8573:18,18 8574:10 8575:23 8576:2 8577:15 8579:22,24,25 8580:5 8582:13 8584:10,17 8585:20 8588:15 8590:16 8596:3 8603:13 8605:23 8613:13 8616:9,16,21 8616:24 affidavits 8558:11,13 8564:21 8586:9 8602:8,20,23,25 Africa 8601:3 8605:14 8607:6 8617:8,10,15 African 8593:10,11,11 8593:12 Africans 8601:4 afternoon 8622:3 agenda 8600:13 agree 8598:20 agreement 8568:1 Aid 8581:18 alert 8598:13 alike 8613:15 allocated 8571:21 alluded 8566:25 Alright 8592:6 8604:4 AMCU 8578:24 8579:1 8579:4 8582:4 8583:13,21 amended 8569:10 amnesty 8607:5,11 amount 8570:12 8573:21 8580:11,15 8580:19 8613:3 amounts 8574:13 8577:23 amply 8575:15</p>	<p>analysing 8607:11 and/or 8598:20 angle 8609:4 Annandale 8559:20 8618:18 8622:2 answer 8597:13,16,20 8602:8,15,18 8615:13 answering 8561:7 8568:16 8570:8 8584:17 8585:20 answers 8611:2 anticipate 8604:7 anticipated 8608:10 8610:17 8612:15 anybody 8571:23 8589:17 anyway 8558:7 8605:1 8605:3 8610:5 apart 8570:5 appeal 8606:25 8613:15,19 appear 8579:12 8581:7 8614:13 appearing 8590:9 appears 8609:16 appellate 8608:25 8609:10 applicable 8568:11 applicant 8562:9 8578:19,23 applicants 8570:11 8572:22 8588:24 8613:17 8615:12 8620:25 applicant's 8587:1 8613:1 application 8558:9,21 8560:21,24 8561:4 8562:4,20,25 8563:25 8565:18,19 8566:3,7 8566:10,12 8567:6,8 8568:13 8569:17,20 8570:8 8572:20,23,25 8577:17 8578:20 8579:6,21 8582:8,15 8586:25 8588:3,5,8 8588:10,12,16 8589:9 8589:22 8590:12,14 8590:16 8593:21 8595:22 8596:4 8598:12 8611:23 8615:10,19 8621:6 applies 8609:20 apply 8590:20 appointed 8605:5 8608:2 appreciate 8559:5 approach 8561:9 8587:2 8607:14 8609:20 8618:4,6 approaching 8581:18 appropriate 8591:18 8591:24 appropriately 8568:11 approximately 8580:22 April 8558:1 8615:2</p>	<p>arbitrary 8573:8 area 8585:3 8595:11 8596:15 8597:22 8598:3 8605:6 8610:12,15,21,24 8613:22 8617:15 aren't 8590:10 argue 8561:3 8591:22 8591:24 argued 8558:10 8561:1 8590:12 argument 8571:12 8592:18 8595:4,7 8596:1 8597:13,15,16 8606:6,8,10 8609:19 8617:2 8619:14 8620:15 arguments 8606:4 8621:10 arising 8601:8 8605:9 arms 8562:8 arose 8568:18 8594:7 arrangements 8585:16 8585:18 8621:20 arrested 8575:5,7 8583:11,20 arrived 8558:25 article 8593:17 8594:1 articulated 8562:12 8577:15,18 ascertain 8621:24 asked 8577:15 8597:15 8601:20,22 8602:4,14 8602:16,17 8617:8 asking 8568:6 aspect 8573:20 assent 8568:2 assist 8561:24 assistance 8612:9 assisted 8590:6 assisting 8582:6 associate 8587:1 assume 8567:10 8568:3 8619:14 8620:15 assumed 8566:9 assuming 8620:12 assurance 8592:9 attach 8564:24 attend 8585:17 8596:13 8596:14 8598:7,17 8599:4 8601:14,17 8602:12 8618:22 8622:3 attendance 8599:13 attendees 8598:8 attending 8567:12 8590:23 8598:22 8599:1 8602:16 attention 8579:23 attitude 8588:4 attorney 8561:23 8580:24 8581:2 8590:23 8614:5,7,11 audio 8585:8,14 August 8572:13 8582:7 8585:24 8596:9,11</p>	<p>8605:10,10 authorities 8564:19 8595:1 authority 8610:5 8616:20 available 8576:3 8599:1,4 8605:17 avoided 8589:19,22 aware 8576:3 8599:3 8615:1 awareness 8598:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <p>Ba 8564:9 8565:2 8598:21 back 8558:3,4 8560:23 8562:5 8563:20 8567:7 8571:4 8572:22 8575:11 8589:20,21 8618:19 8618:25 background 8605:19 Badenhorst 8590:6 Bafokeng 8598:21 Bakgatla 8598:21 Bank 8608:18,18 Banking 8608:18 Bapo 8564:9 8565:2 8567:1 8591:14 8592:2 8598:21 Bar 8613:20 based 8585:3,4,7,13,22 basis 8568:6 basis 8561:11,13 8564:25 8569:17,19 8569:21 8572:23 8573:5 8590:16 8613:20 beg 8579:3 8580:16 8581:1 8596:12 8597:4 8614:3,6,15 8614:17 beginning 8566:12 8595:21 behalf 8561:19 8579:19 8582:13,18 8587:10 8587:16 8588:7,24 8589:3,10 8590:5,17 8592:5 8596:3 8602:5 8602:9 8604:9,23 8614:5 8619:19 belief 8567:25 believe 8571:24 8589:14 belittle 8612:19 belittled 8608:8 beneficial 8571:1,2,6 benefit 8570:10 8571:14 8589:23 8591:14 8592:2 betrays 8568:19 better 8560:13 8574:19 8578:10 8586:16 beyond 8580:13 8582:10 8619:10 bilateral 8577:11</p>
--	---	---	--	--

<p>bilaterally 8576:22 bit 8559:14 8560:14 8561:21 8566:19 8576:7 8599:9 Bizos 8589:4,5,7,8 8590:2 black 8601:4 board 8581:18 8603:15 Bojanala 8564:13 bono 8613:20 bottom 8584:10 bought 8566:5 box 8559:21 breaks 8584:15 briefed 8614:1,2,4,7,11 briefly 8568:15 8583:5 8589:5,8 bringing 8566:2 broad 8617:11 broader 8619:6 brought 8562:25 8566:7 8571:9 budgetary 8580:6 building 8618:17 burden 8574:25 8576:22 burdened 8562:10 Burger 8572:3 Burger's 8574:14 bus 8576:25 8577:4,6 business 8560:23 8593:17 busy 8560:9 8601:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">C</p> <p>call 8561:10 8577:25 8587:19 8589:2 8602:2 8615:21 8618:24 called 8564:7 8568:10 8573:10 8574:4 8616:16 8617:17 8619:4 calls 8619:5 candour 8611:19 canvassing 8567:3 can't 8567:2 8591:7 capacity 8565:6 Cape 8569:6 carry 8583:22 8601:6 8605:3 8606:9 8618:17 case 8560:17 8570:19 8571:22 8572:10 8573:13 8579:18 8585:21 8586:18 8588:20,24 8608:16 8608:17 8609:1,20 8619:7 cases 8572:17 8608:12 8609:23 Cassie 8590:6 cause 8561:12 8568:17 8568:20 8570:5 caused 8562:18 8585:10 8620:16</p>	<p>causes 8585:23 8586:1 Centre 8569:12 Centurion 8558:9 8580:11 8584:20,22 8604:14,16,17 certain 8573:24 8599:3 8602:2 8608:1 8610:22 certainly 8560:2 8565:12,14 8566:11 8594:19 8596:20 8597:17 8599:24 8611:22 Chabedi 8589:6 8590:3 8590:4,11 8591:5,13 chair 8559:8,9 8563:13 8564:4 8566:24 8568:12 8571:1 8573:6 8574:9 8577:8 8578:15,16,20,20 8579:8 8587:6,14 8588:1,4,19,25,25 8590:3,7,12,25 8591:13,21,24 8592:13,19 8593:1 8595:3 8597:5,9,19 8598:3 8601:13 8602:21 8603:21 8604:6,20 8614:18,23 8616:6,11 8617:19,19 8619:13 Chairman 8615:3 Chairperson's 8572:1 8579:23 challenge 8619:17 challenged 8579:13 8588:17 8611:17 chambers 8604:10 chance 8560:7 8571:21 8589:7 8592:7 change 8562:16 8572:4 8572:5 8576:17 changed 8567:21 charge 8584:18 8615:1 Charter 8593:10,11 Chaskalson 8558:16 8582:17,20 8587:4 8590:21 8595:20 8615:20,23 8619:20 8621:15 choice 8563:1,6,13 choices 8563:6 choose 8563:14 chose 8614:10 chosen 8614:10 Christie 8567:23 circumstances 8563:18 cited 8564:9 8565:12 8609:17 Civic 8569:11 clarification 8567:8 clarify 8562:13 8621:4 clear 8562:24 8563:13 8566:12 8569:8,9 8571:25 8617:23 8618:9,14 8619:14</p>	<p>8621:25 clearly 8570:21 8575:4 8575:14 8576:11 8578:6 8609:22 8619:20 8620:24 client 8587:10 8589:3 clients 8596:3 8602:3,5 8602:9 8604:22 closer 8585:13 closing 8621:5 coin 8619:8 colleague 8562:6 8607:23 8617:13 colleagues 8558:24,24 8559:2 8593:3 collegiality 8567:14 collision 8575:23 come 8589:20 8591:10 8595:12 8602:1,4 8603:12 8604:17 comes 8575:2 8576:18 8586:13 8603:3,9,16 coming 8560:23 8566:3 8567:7 8598:12 8613:6 commencement 8586:17 Commissioner 8559:22 8560:1,7 8598:5 Commissioners 8558:23 8578:16 8579:8 8582:6 8590:4 8593:1 8614:10 8615:3 commissions 8568:23 8569:1 8605:25 8606:17 8607:21 8608:2,6 8610:8,9,10 8618:12 Commission's 8585:7 commit 8581:19 commitments 8587:17 committed 8607:6 committee 8607:11 commodity 8594:12 common 8561:12 commonly 8593:10 8596:20 8597:6 communities 8585:22 8593:8,9,19,20,22,22 8593:23,24 8594:2,4 8594:6,12,13,18 8595:10,11,14 8596:12 8597:24 8598:7,23 8599:8 8600:17,20 8601:2 8605:15 8612:20,21 8613:14 8615:18 8616:14 community 8564:10 8565:3 8593:15 8594:15 8598:10 8599:17,22 8604:20 8613:22 8619:16 companies 8600:2 8605:15</p>	<p>comparatively 8577:6 complete 8558:6 compromised 8583:17 concentrate 8617:8 conceptually 8565:17 concern 8600:4 8605:9 8608:4 8610:22 8617:6,7 concerned 8565:3 8574:7 8577:11 8594:5 8596:1 8599:10 8607:10 8608:20 8615:18 8619:16 8621:7 concerning 8600:22 concerns 8566:6,8 8586:14,22 concrete 8574:24 concurrence 8569:13 condition 8577:9 condonation 8568:6 conduct 8591:20 conduits 8570:18 Conference 8600:14,24 conferred 8567:24 conferring 8608:1 confidence 8616:2 confined 8586:4 confirmed 8567:16 conflicts 8594:5 8605:6 confusion 8599:10 connection 8594:10 connotation 8594:14 consequence 8563:7 consequences 8562:10 consider 8593:14 8594:12 8614:24 8621:9,18 considerable 8589:21 consideration 8586:22 8589:14 8596:2 8610:11 considerations 8586:11 considered 8615:12 Constitution 8570:21 8573:6 constitutional 8570:20 constraints 8563:11 consult 8599:12,13 consultants 8585:8,14 consultation 8577:14 consultations 8576:13 consumes 8576:15 contained 8608:25 contemplated 8566:23 contend 8577:20 contentions 8613:1 context 8607:20 continue 8576:20,23 8580:12 8582:4,5,9 8598:3 8599:18 8610:24 8611:16 8613:2,16,16 continued 8572:9 8583:11 8612:5 continuing 8581:19</p>	<p>8620:23 contract 8567:25 contribute 8600:5 8601:8 contribution 8582:5 8589:15 8612:11 8613:8 convenience 8583:4 8585:2 8586:11 Convention 8600:22 conventions 8616:9 conversely 8594:16 core 8605:6 correct 8580:15 8590:11 8604:18 8609:16 corrected 8581:2 correctly 8559:10 8560:25 8617:20 cost 8583:9,9 8584:16 8585:5 8586:10 8590:18,20 costs 8562:14,18 8573:24 8574:3,11,12 8586:22 8589:18,18 8611:7 8612:2,5 8615:1 8620:2 council 8564:24,25 8589:24 8593:17 8620:17 counsel 8558:11 8567:1 8567:9,12 8581:4,6 8590:23 8597:13 8598:9 8599:8,11 counsellors 8611:12 countervailing 8620:9 countries 8594:8 8600:23 country 8568:22 course 8560:18 8561:16 8574:18 8575:6 8603:8 8616:12 8617:1 court 8564:1 8572:20 8573:5 8606:25 8607:2,8,13 8608:21 courts 8597:18 8606:15 covered 8617:11 create 8600:4 created 8589:16 criminal 8572:17 criticism 8608:25 cross 8602:25 cross-examination 8559:16,25 8576:14 cross-reference 8561:15 crown 8565:7 crude 8578:3 current 8580:4 currently 8563:18 8576:25 8581:16 customary 8568:6 8597:13,17 cut 8618:8 C-H-A-B-E-D-I 8590:5</p>
--	--	---	---	---

<p style="text-align: center;">D</p> <p>daily 8562:14 damage 8573:3 date 8567:2 8573:13 dated 8600:14 day 8560:23 8566:17 8571:25 8584:24,25 8599:16 8620:18 days 8559:12,13 8560:8 8560:9 8572:12 8580:22 8610:4 deal 8562:21 8563:19 8563:19 8565:22 8573:9 8579:16 8593:5 8595:5 8606:11 8607:19 8609:4,8,18 8611:7 8611:21,23 8612:1 8613:7 8615:10 8617:5 dealing 8558:20 8562:1 8562:1 8563:21 8565:21 8568:19 8576:12 8577:10 8586:21 8596:9 8606:1 8609:8,9,18 8616:21 deals 8568:9 dealt 8561:8,18 8569:21 8570:7 8576:2 8586:9 8611:24 debate 8571:16 8577:9 debated 8606:15 deceased 8578:21 decide 8560:21 8602:2 decided 8614:11 deciding 8614:13 decision 8604:15 8608:12 8609:13 8616:14 decisions 8600:21 Declaration 8600:16 deem 8588:9 deficiencies 8569:25 deficient 8570:3 defined 8564:18,21 8565:6 8593:8 definitely 8575:3 8582:24 definition 8576:11 delay 8566:2,4 8567:24 deliberately 8620:23 deliberating 8569:4 8607:25 demonstrate 8598:4 demonstrated 8564:7 8575:15 8598:1 denial 8570:12 denying 8612:21 department 8584:5 8590:10 8591:10 8613:7,24 8614:1,3,5 8614:8,21,22,25 depend 8604:14</p>	<p>deprived 8620:6 derogates 8618:14 described 8563:5 8596:20 8597:7 designed 8586:1 desire 8598:7 despite 8619:16 8620:5 determine 8569:14 detrimental 8615:17 developed 8594:9 developing 8594:8 development 8593:17 8593:19 8594:1,2,3 8594:19 8599:23 8600:6,12,14 deviate 8593:21 didn't 8566:11 8567:5 8587:19,20 8618:2 died 8596:19,24 8597:1 8620:8 8621:2 difference 8620:18 different 8559:17 8596:1 8599:9 differently 8564:11 difficult 8559:11 8563:18 8580:20 difficulties 8585:10 direct 8619:18 direction 8618:13 directly 8559:2 8573:7 8595:13 disastrous 8589:13 discoveries 8591:23 discredited 8609:11 8610:4 discrimination 8573:7 discuss 8559:17 8561:10 8621:23 discussed 8562:7 8567:6,9 8608:17 discussion 8567:1,15 discussions 8577:8 dismissed 8615:19 disparaged 8608:8 dispensation 8560:14 dispose 8559:15 8570:7 disposed 8570:15 disputed 8561:7,12 distance 8577:1 distressed 8558:4 District 8564:13 division 8608:25 8609:10 DMR 8590:5,9,13,15 8590:21 8591:14,15 documents 8560:19 8576:2 doesn't 8564:2 doing 8572:16 8599:17 domestic 8606:15 don't 8558:15 8559:21 8565:16 8571:23 8576:22 8577:9 8579:12 8591:25 8592:6 8594:21,25 8597:16 8603:5,7</p>	<p>8610:4 8616:7 8618:5 doubt 8563:3 8574:9 draft 8600:15 drafted 8593:18 drain 8611:18 draw 8579:23 8607:20 due 8560:18 8587:16 8590:24 8605:3 8613:3 duration 8586:7 Durban 8569:7 dwell 8561:21</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <p>earlier 8558:21 8561:16 8563:5,8 8565:21 8569:24 8570:15 8571:9 8573:1 8622:1,6 early 8590:7 earth 8594:15 easily 8576:8 easy 8559:11 economic 8562:10 educated 8599:5 effect 8574:13 8607:14 8622:2 effective 8612:5 efficiency 8585:12 eight 8572:6,7 either 8565:12 8569:21 8603:13 emergence 8616:15 emphasis 8561:15 emphasise 8571:10 8581:25 8583:9 8584:3 emphasises 8600:13 emphasising 8562:2 employed 8613:7,23,25 employees 8605:15 enables 8618:8 enactment 8607:18,20 encouraged 8577:4 endeavour 8621:24 endeavoured 8579:16 enforce 8568:1 enforcement 8568:1 enforcing 8567:24 engage 8576:20,23 8577:3 engaged 8567:4 8585:8 engagement 8588:23 enhanced 8578:8 8585:12 enormous 8611:17 enquire 8607:3 enshrined 8570:20,22 ensure 8585:16 8605:12 entered 8600:25 entertain 8569:20 8570:1 entitled 8567:10,18 8594:2 8607:4 entitles 8564:24</p>	<p>environment 8593:18 8593:25 8600:12,14 equal 8575:21 equality 8562:8 8573:6 equally 8590:21 equation 8581:16 escalating 8620:2 estimate 8584:12,23 estimates 8590:18,20 events 8585:24 8605:10 8605:13 8617:14 everybody 8566:14 8593:4 8598:2 everybody's 8589:23 evidence 8558:15,24 8559:1,22,23,24 8561:20 8569:3 8573:16 8574:24 8576:7,14 8582:19 8589:10 8590:17 8591:4,6,8,11 8601:21,25 8603:12 8603:13,16,23 8607:24 8610:13,16 8612:14 8613:6,23 8614:9,13,20 8616:2 8616:5 8622:6 evils 8563:14,15 exactly 8563:14 8566:4 8577:24 8616:23 examine 8564:2 8603:1 example 8603:11 exceed 8584:15 Excellency 8605:4 excludes 8581:4 excluding 8580:25 executive 8614:12 exercise 8570:19 exercised 8582:23 exhausted 8580:6 expand 8590:24 expect 8564:23 8585:11 expected 8616:15 expended 8590:19 expense 8583:3 8584:2 8584:14 expenses 8581:8 8584:4 8590:19 expensive 8598:15 expert 8576:7 explain 8568:14 explains 8567:22 explanation 8567:19 8568:5,7 exploitation 8599:25 express 8558:22 8607:15 expressed 8559:7 extends 8580:3 extension 8571:7,25 8572:2 extensions 8571:17 extent 8591:8 8599:7 8601:10 8612:16 extracting 8594:4 extricate 8587:17</p>	<p>E-N-Y-A 8578:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <p>face 8582:8 faced 8581:21 facilities 8584:21 fact 8562:8,18,24 8568:17 8570:8 8572:5 8575:10,15 8577:4 8589:16 8598:4 8600:2 8611:1 8611:6,15 8614:22 8616:12 8620:5 factor 8581:6,8,15 8582:1 8589:13 factors 8589:25 facts 8561:17,17,18,21 8580:8 8582:12 factual 8561:12 fail 8573:3 fair 8560:16 fairness 8618:23 families 8578:20,24 8579:4 8582:4 8583:12,20 8613:5 8621:1 far 8565:2 8569:4 8571:1,3 8574:6 8602:5 8611:24 8612:12 8618:2 8621:6 Farm 8608:13 favour 8586:24 8588:10 8589:25 favoured 8620:4 February 8561:1 8562:3 8566:1,15 8571:19 8579:10 8588:3 8590:8,12 fee 8599:15,16 feel 8593:3 fees 8581:4 fellow 8590:3 fifth 8564:17 8593:2,7 8594:18 8595:1,9 8599:23 file 8591:17 filed 8558:11,13 8561:19 8579:22 8582:13 8590:17 8591:23 8596:3 8602:8,20,22,24 8616:21,24 8621:11 8621:19 finalisation 8573:13 finalising 8567:13 finally 8573:9 8576:17 8576:18 8582:11 8583:3 8584:16 financial 8574:25 8580:4,4 8589:12,17 8611:18 find 8565:13 8604:7 finding 8582:6 findings 8583:16,21 8608:9 8620:15</p>
--	---	---	---	---

<p>finish 8571:24 8597:10 8597:12,16 finished 8592:9 finishing 8571:21 fire 8568:8 first 8558:25 8563:24 8564:8 8575:13 8579:21 8582:25 8589:7 8590:12 8593:2,7 8594:18,24 8595:6 8599:22 8605:19 8617:21 8619:4,11,21 8621:6 firstly 8558:23 8561:4 first-year 8610:3 fit 8559:24 8569:5 five 8559:13 8589:21 flowers 8558:25 follow 8571:15 following 8580:9 8598:19 8608:12 8610:11 follows 8569:11 8607:22 force 8575:21 8600:25 foreseeable 8586:4,21 forgive 8587:22 forgotten 8561:22 formalistic 8564:2 formally 8573:4 forthcoming 8567:11 8620:10 fortunately 8571:14 found 8572:24 8607:17 foundational 8569:17 foundations 8562:3 founding 8561:10 four 8572:12 frankly 8567:18 8571:12 8616:6 8621:17 free 8584:18 frequently 8598:9 fresh 8565:18 Friday 8566:17 friend 8609:3,7,17 8611:5 friends 8583:7 frolic 8565:10 8616:21 8616:25 fruitful 8588:9 fuel 8568:7 full 8560:4 8583:19 8601:1 8610:19 8621:20 fully 8559:10 8598:14 8613:12 fund 8572:21 8581:20 8614:18,19 funded 8581:19 funders 8581:18,23 funding 8563:4 8575:4 8581:17,24 funeral 8618:22 8622:3 further 8582:15 8592:1 8598:1 8600:19</p>	<p>8607:13 Furthermore 8600:21 8608:11 future 8571:17 8572:4 8586:4,21</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <hr/> <p>gain 8563:9 gallery 8598:23 Gauteng 8584:12 8585:4,7,13,17 8586:15,24 8587:3 8589:20 8590:1 8612:19 general 8564:15 8600:4 8600:23 8622:2 generalis 8619:5 generally 8562:9 generously 8584:18 Geneva 8600:25 8616:10 getting 8567:21 8572:11 give 8589:6 8592:9 8597:12 8603:12,13 8603:16 given 8558:14 8563:11 8563:14 8580:21 8581:23 8607:12 8616:8 8619:9 gives 8595:3 8611:2 giving 8559:5 8567:19 8603:23 8607:13 global 8600:6 go 8559:23 8571:4 8574:15 8584:10 8604:7 8617:24 8618:2,24 8619:10 goes 8569:5 going 8558:8 8566:20 8572:7 8575:11 8578:3 8582:18 8604:5,25 8609:1 8612:1 8618:21 8620:22,24 golden 8617:24 good 8566:17 8569:25 8572:16 8575:17 8577:13 8609:7,17 8613:4 govern 8595:10 government 8572:21 8600:1 governor-general 8608:2 grammatical 8617:23 grant 8560:21 8566:13 8577:14 8607:5 granted 8569:21 8595:23 8596:5,8 8615:5 8620:13 grateful 8602:15 gratitude 8558:22 great 8616:6 Greek 8592:22 greenfield 8561:4</p>	<p>ground 8584:1 grounds 8567:17 8569:14 8573:8 8577:17,20,25 8582:14,24,25 8621:24 guarantee 8600:20</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <hr/> <p>half 8573:19 8574:7,13 8577:5 8618:19,22,25 halfway 8563:16 hampered 8571:11 hand 8589:4 handful 8598:8 happened 8559:4 8565:20 8568:22 8569:6 8582:7 happy 8570:2 8615:24 8616:5 hasn't 8565:12 8616:21 haven't 8579:17 8602:22,24 8611:24 8611:25 8619:25 healing 8596:15 hear 8558:4 8592:18 8615:4 8618:19 heard 8572:1 hearing 8569:3 8598:10 8599:14 8607:24 8615:5 8622:5 help 8609:1 Helps 8618:7 HEMRAJ 8598:5 he's 8603:23 8616:24 8618:17,19,21,25 highlighted 8594:3 hiring 8577:6 historical 8563:4 Hobson's 8563:6 hold 8572:22 holding 8583:10 8585:6 homeland 8617:9 honestly 8621:5 honourable 8605:4,7 8610:14 hope 8558:5 hopefully 8572:23 hospital 8559:1,13 hours 8589:21 houses 8597:25 housing 8597:25 huge 8562:10 8577:7 Human 8593:10,12 humanly 8563:17 humbly 8612:16 8615:16,16 hundreds 8610:20,23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <hr/> <p>ICU 8559:13 idea 8566:6 illogical 8571:12 ILO 8600:24 imbalances 8612:23</p>	<p>imminent 8586:18 impact 8595:13 8611:1 8620:20 imperative 8594:16 8599:21 implication 8611:9 implications 8620:3 importance 8559:15 important 8560:3 8583:15,23 8589:13 8596:4 8598:24 8614:14 importantly 8583:1 8605:12 impossible 8572:9 inappropriate 8615:10 8615:13 Inasmuch 8602:20 inception 8594:7 incident 8558:5 incidental 8608:5 included 8574:11 includes 8581:3 including 8572:16 incorporates 8570:22 increased 8599:7 incurred 8581:9 8584:4 independent 8600:23 indicate 8588:4 8618:23 indicated 8566:18 8572:19 8585:15 8588:7 8591:22 8607:10,24 8611:5 8613:13 indications 8607:15 indigenous 8593:9,14 8593:20,24 8594:2,3 8594:6,10,11,14,17 8594:25 8595:10 8596:16 8597:24 8598:1 8599:22 8600:3,16,17,20,22 8601:2 8602:12 8605:15 8612:20,21 8613:11,21 8615:4,18 indirectly 8559:2 8573:7 8595:12 induced 8567:25 inequalities 8612:23 inferences 8607:20 infest 8575:18 influenced 8608:10 8610:17 8612:15 information 8598:25 informed 8575:17 8618:21 inherent 8605:6 iniquities 8605:16 injured 8575:6,8 8583:11,19 8620:8 Inland 8608:13 input 8605:17 insightful 8610:13 insofar 8561:7,17 8578:5 8617:8,10</p>	<p>8619:4 instance 8607:2 8608:3 instances 8564:22 Institute 8578:19 8593:18,25 8600:12 instituted 8568:23 instituting 8617:4 institutions 8593:9 instructed 8578:18 8601:8,23 8602:6 8614:7 instructing 8580:24 8581:2 instructions 8572:20 8602:11 instructs 8578:24 8579:1 instruments 8568:12 8568:12 8600:4 insult 8612:20 insulted 8608:7 8620:22 intend 8575:19 8579:10 8591:16 intended 8607:19 interest 8564:8,17 8565:13,14 8578:6 8585:22 8591:23 8605:20 8617:11,12 8619:15,18,18,23,24 8620:9,12,13 interested 8583:2,6 interesting 8607:7 interests 8591:22 8593:6 international 8593:18 8593:25 8600:12,24 8605:9 8613:14 8617:6 interposing 8559:21 interpretation 8573:2 8607:12 8615:22 8617:17,21,22 8619:12 interpreted 8607:8 8609:23,24 interrupt 8594:20 inter-American 8600:15 investigate 8605:5,8 investigating 8608:4 invitation 8588:3 8621:14 involve 8576:12 involved 8558:5 8572:11 8598:1 8611:7 irony 8570:25 isn't 8605:22 8610:19 issue 8559:9,16,17 8562:23,23 8563:4,24 8564:20 8566:5,9,24 8569:4 8570:5,6,14 8573:4,12 8575:9 8576:16,18 8577:2,6 8583:1,3,4 8584:9</p>
---	---	---	---	---

<p>8585:2 8586:20 8593:6 8605:21 8606:13 8612:2,4,5 8617:1 8620:11 issues 8562:2 8563:4,20 8564:3,3 8575:19,24 8575:25 8576:12 8586:2 8595:25 8601:8,24 8603:14 8606:13 8616:7,9 8619:6 it's 8560:3,16,23 8561:4 8568:24 8570:15 8571:5,25 8578:25 8579:2 8580:20 8592:8,22 8597:13 8600:9 8604:20,21 8606:7 8609:1,7,17 8612:4,5 8616:19 8617:2,19 8619:13 8621:25,25 I'd 8563:19 8573:9 8602:15 I'll 8597:12 8605:3 I'm 8574:18,22 8575:10,11,19,22 8577:8 8578:18 8580:23 8587:19 8590:5 8592:24 8593:1 8594:20 8595:17 8596:18 8599:12,12,14,15 8602:19 8604:14 8606:1,21 8609:1 8613:4 8615:24 8616:5 8618:1 I've 8575:9 8581:1 8597:18</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">K</p> <p>Karabo 8592:21 8593:1 key 8577:25 8594:3 8620:11 Kgoroadira 8587:5,6 8587:9,11,13,23 8589:3 8592:4,6,10 8592:12,16,19,21,21 8592:25 8593:2 8594:22 8595:3,8,17 8595:24 8596:8,11,22 8596:25 8597:4,9,19 8597:22 8598:11 8599:20 8600:8,11 8601:12,18,21 8602:10,19,24 8603:5 8603:20,25 8604:3,6 8604:12,19 8605:2 8606:1,5,7,11,18,21 8606:24 8608:22 8609:3,12,21 8610:1 8610:7 8611:4,13,25 8612:7,13 8614:2,6 8614:15,17 8615:8,15 Kgoro-e-a-dira 8592:22 killings 8597:23 kind 8565:13 8574:25 8575:13 8576:8 kinds 8568:14 knew 8566:3,10 know 8558:15 8559:20 8563:11 8564:1,18 8567:5 8580:20 8581:22 8601:24,24 8601:25 8602:14 8610:2 8616:11 8622:3 known 8562:11 8589:11 8593:11 Kotane 8564:15</p>	<p>8570:17,17 8571:2,2 8571:6,7,12 8614:19 leader 8588:5 leaders 8558:15,24 8559:1 8561:20 8573:16 8582:19 8589:10 8590:17 8613:6,23 8614:9,13 8614:20 8616:2,5 leading 8576:14 learned 8562:5 8583:7 8607:23 8609:3,7,17 8611:5 8617:13 leave 8589:17 8613:9 8615:24 8618:22 led 8578:21 8587:16 8590:5 8597:23 8607:17 8612:24 legal 8563:8,10,10 8568:11 8570:23,23 8570:24,25 8572:9 8574:19 8581:18,20 8583:11 8584:5 8585:4 8613:18 8614:19 8617:22 legislature 8569:5 legitimacy 8583:16 legitimate 8575:20 Lerato 8590:6 lesser 8563:14 letter 8565:8 8616:13 8616:16 let's 8566:16 8592:13 8603:11 8619:14 8620:15 level 8577:11 8578:3 Lewis 8578:21 lex 8619:5,7,7,10 liberty 8567:11 light 8582:12 8603:9 8605:24 8608:24 8609:23,24 8612:8 8614:22 8616:1 lights 8592:6 likelihood 8582:9 limine 8563:23 8570:4 limited 8565:4 8571:20 8608:14 line 8584:11 listen 8596:13 literally 8572:12 litigants 8570:18 little 8559:14 8561:21 8576:7 lives 8598:2 8599:6 local 8564:14,14,15,19 8584:17 8585:16,22 8586:14 8595:1,9 8620:17 locality 8563:7 located 8600:3 location 8562:19 8573:20 8585:9 8620:14 locus 8565:16 8593:6 8605:20</p>	<p>logical 8607:20 long 8563:17 8572:14 8581:23 8618:19 longer 8563:9 8577:1 8581:20 8610:25 8612:9,9 8617:9 Lonmin 8575:23 8576:24 8602:2 8603:15 look 8565:17 8571:3 8607:14,17 8620:5 looking 8593:3 losing 8563:7 8573:19 8613:18 lost 8574:16 lot 8576:4 8599:16 loved 8620:8 LRC 8558:25 8559:1</p> <p style="text-align: center;">M</p> <p>Madibeng 8564:14 main 8594:5 8606:6,7 8613:1 Maite 8590:7 major 8611:11,22,22 Major-General 8559:20 8618:18 making 8577:7 8589:15 8612:11 8613:8 manage 8563:9 management 8600:18 manager 8564:23 mandate 8565:7 8599:9 mandated 8593:13 8605:7 manner 8607:8 March 8566:17 Marikana 8582:7 8595:12 8596:14 8598:14 8605:4,13 8610:12,16 8612:14 8612:17,22,25 8613:9 8613:21 massacre 8572:13 8620:16 material 8573:10 8594:13 matter 8559:15,16 8561:1,2,6,11,12 8562:7,20 8564:8 8567:14 8569:24 8571:4 8572:5,12,17 8576:23 8590:6 8607:1 8609:2 8621:15,23 matters 8561:5,14 8605:8 8608:4,5 8617:5,7 mean 8565:17 8578:2 8582:3 8598:19 8609:24 8610:25 meaning 8569:7 8580:12 8607:18,23 8617:23 8618:15 meaningful 8612:11 means 8571:8 8574:15</p>	<p>8601:4 meant 8563:2 8573:2 meet 8563:16 8566:20 8614:23 8621:23 meeting 8615:2 member 8578:5 8601:17 8608:7 members 8588:1 8598:23 mention 8575:10 8617:6 mentioned 8576:19,21 8621:2 mentioning 8577:8 mere 8562:18 8568:4 8570:17 8575:15 merely 8584:10 8588:11 merits 8562:2 8565:21 8570:2,3 message 8622:1 messages 8558:23 8559:2 microscope 8591:11 middle 8559:22 migrant 8596:21 8597:2,7,23,25 8598:2 militate 8586:23 8617:2 million 8573:19 8574:7 8574:14,16 8577:5 mind 8560:7 mineral 8590:10 8594:2 8599:25 8600:5,21 minerals 8594:1,4 miners 8578:21 mines 8598:16 Minimum 8574:8 mining 8593:15,22 8594:1,7 8597:25 8600:2 8605:15 Minister 8560:18 8564:20 8566:21 8569:13 8577:14 8578:14 8582:22 8587:2,24 8604:15 8607:1 8614:23,25 8615:2,6 8621:21 Ministry 8588:23 minute 8566:21 minutes 8592:8,9,11,12 8622:5 misapplication 8568:10 misapprehension 8568:11,19 mischief 8607:19 misconceived 8569:18 miss-citations 8608:19 mitigate 8573:2 modern 8609:22 Mogale 8564:9 8565:2 8598:21 moment 8575:4 Monday 8618:20</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">J</p> <p>ja 8577:22 8615:16 8618:3,7 Jacob 8605:5 8610:14 Johannesburg 8604:11 join 8616:5 Judge 8607:10 8608:11 8609:5 judgment 8606:25 8607:7 8609:10,17 judicial 8597:15 jump 8566:16 8603:17 8603:21 8617:20 June 8580:6 8582:10 8600:15,25 jurisdiction 8568:13 8569:5 8605:21,23 8606:12,13,14 8607:5 8607:9,11 jurisprudence 8609:23 justice 8562:22 8570:13,20,22 8571:11 8584:5 8607:1 8612:22 8613:7,24 8614:1,3,5 8614:8,22 8620:6 justified 8564:22</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">L</p> <p>Labour 8600:24 labourers 8596:21 8597:3,7 lack 8598:25 land 8575:18 8593:16 8594:4,6,11,12,13,14 8594:16 8600:3 8601:3 language 8568:18 largely 8576:6 8591:3 8593:8 lastly 8582:2 8588:19 late 8566:19 lateness 8565:24 8568:5 Latin 8619:8 latitude 8564:4 launched 8565:19 law 8564:1 8568:13 8573:5 8610:3 lawyers 8570:9,10,14</p>			

<p>8619:1 8622:7 money 8574:18 8582:1 8611:6 8613:3 monitoring 8591:10 month 8566:16 8574:7 8574:14 8580:13,20 8580:22 8581:12 monthly 8584:13,22 months 8572:6,8,16 8584:14,23,24 8586:6 morning 8586:8 8619:17 8622:1,7 Moses 8564:15 mother 8594:15 Motloeny 8578:15,17 8578:17 8579:2,14,20 8580:2,16,23 8581:10 8581:13,15 mount 8567:19 mounted 8566:22 move 8558:12 8577:13 8581:9 8582:22,25 8584:12,23 8585:22 8586:15 8590:1 8604:13,16 moved 8588:3 movement 8562:4 moves 8580:10 8581:25 moving 8586:24 8587:2 Mpepu 8584:10 Mpofu 8558:3,18,19 8560:2,5,12,22 8561:25 8573:23 8574:1,5,8,23 8576:10 8577:22,24 8578:12 8579:5,16 8581:6 8585:15 8588:3 8602:2 8605:24 8615:21,25 8616:1,4,23 8618:3,7 8618:10,14,16 8619:1 8619:3 8621:13 multiply 8575:2 municipal 8564:23 municipalities 8595:9 8599:2 municipality 8564:13 8564:14,14,15 8584:17,21 muster 8563:11 mutual 8568:2 M-O-T-L-O 8578:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">N</p> <p>name 8578:17 8587:15 names 8564:18 national 8559:21,25 8560:7 8605:9 8607:3 8607:9 8608:18 8613:14 8617:6,11,12 nature 8591:9 8616:17 near 8559:3 8563:7 necessarily 8560:9 8570:24 8603:20 necessary 8595:22 8610:13 8614:12</p>	<p>need 8564:2 8576:22 8581:24 8598:17 8613:11,17 8621:16 needed 8567:8 needs 8576:19 8618:1 net 8584:22 never 8576:17 new 8561:17,17,17,21 8573:10 8616:8 Nigeria 8616:10 Nigerian 8593:14 nigh 8572:8 non-action 8620:21 non-attendance 8598:18 non-parties 8564:16 non-relocation 8571:6 non-representation 8620:25 normally 8597:14 North 8605:17 8612:18 8612:20 8613:19 8617:15 North-West 8568:18 notion 8570:11 8601:1 Ntsebeza 8562:6 8578:22 8579:8,18 Ntsonkota 8587:14,15 8587:21 8588:1 nub 8562:22 8576:15 NUM 8587:16 8588:7,7 8588:21 number 8575:8 8580:21,21 8593:9 8598:8,21 8600:22 8611:11 numbers 8598:12 8599:7 nutshell 8573:17 8577:19 N-T-S-O-N-K-O 8587:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">O</p> <p>object 8567:7 8607:16 objectives 8617:13 obligation 8600:19 obtained 8565:7 obvious 8616:6 obviously 8563:1 8575:20 8591:9 8604:15 8610:21 occasion 8572:19 occasioned 8585:5 occasions 8598:9 occurred 8596:14,15 8610:12 October 8572:15 offer 8584:20 office 8560:8,10 officer 8597:15 offices 8571:5 8577:13 officials 8584:5 oh 8566:21 8606:9 okay 8567:20 8609:12 8610:7</p>	<p>old 8568:24 Olivier 8607:10 8608:11 omission 8587:23 once 8565:6 8566:18 8567:9 8573:12 8576:18 8620:11 ones 8620:8 ongoing 8583:8 open 8566:18 8602:11 operation 8612:5 8614:20 opportunity 8558:17 8559:5 8566:13 8588:6 8595:4 8597:12 8615:12 oppose 8558:12 8620:1 opposed 8562:19 8568:25 8579:21 8621:7 opposing 8558:10 8588:15 8605:23 8611:6,7,10 8613:4 opposition 8563:25 8565:18,19,25 8566:22 8567:10,20 8568:5 8569:19 8570:1 8577:16 8594:17 8598:6 8599:21 8615:11 8617:18 oppressed 8601:4 option 8573:4 oral 8579:9 8591:6,8,11 order 8564:4 8577:14 8605:16 8614:23 ordinarily 8584:13 Organisation 8600:24 originally 8569:22 outcome 8578:6,7,7 8590:13 outlaws 8573:7 outpouring 8559:3 outside 8607:6 overburdening 8571:7 overlap 8575:7 overlook 8569:25 overlooked 8600:2 override 8619:23 overriding 8619:23 overrule 8619:7 overwhelming 8589:25 owns 8594:16 o'clock 8618:20 8619:1 8622:7</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <p>page 8567:23 8579:24 8580:3 8608:14 paid 8581:7 8584:6 paper 8576:2,6 8591:2 8591:4,15 papers 8561:10 8591:16,18 8621:11 8621:19,20 paragraph 8569:9</p>	<p>8579:23 8580:3,9,14 8580:18 8590:18 8591:19 paragraphs 8584:9 pardon 8579:3 8580:16 8581:1 8596:12 8597:5 8614:3,6,15 8614:17 part 8586:8 8603:10 8607:7 8614:12,19 8617:10 participate 8580:12 8582:10 8598:14 8601:16,19,23,24 8602:6 8604:5,9,24 8604:25 8613:12,20 participated 8575:16 participating 8601:11 8612:11 participation 8583:1,5 8583:19 8586:22 8591:17 8593:15 8600:17,20 8601:1,2 8602:10,17 8605:14 8610:19 particular 8559:16 8562:19 8564:25 8568:7 8590:17 8591:19 8607:10 8619:10 particularly 8573:15 8589:9 8593:13 parties 8562:9,9 8565:15 8566:5 8567:4 8570:18 8571:8 8573:11 8576:20 8577:11 8578:1 8581:22 8583:2,4,6,15,15,23 8583:24 8585:3,5 8588:4 8589:2 8592:5 8601:13 8603:2 8610:19,22,24 8611:18 8612:3,10 8615:8 8619:19,22 8621:1 parts 8618:12 party 8565:10,11 8566:10,13 8567:1,18 8572:11 8573:8 8575:16 8578:1 passage 8608:16,20,23 8609:7,9,15 patent 8574:11 path 8620:23 paying 8571:5 8574:19 people 8562:14 8563:2 8575:5,7 8580:21 8594:10,25 8596:16 8596:19,23 8597:1 8598:2,11,15,24 8600:16,23 8602:12 8602:16 8613:11 8615:4 8620:6 8621:1 8621:2 People's 8593:10,12</p>	<p>perception 8589:16 peripheral 8575:14 8591:25 8619:15 paragraphs 8563:21 permit 8600:5 persist 8606:3 person 8564:23 8565:4 personally 8558:22 persons 8583:12,20 pertaining 8577:25 phase 8575:14,16,20,23 8576:1,5,11 8583:14 8583:17,18,22,24,25 8586:2,3,4,5,6,7,13 8586:13,15,16,17,19 8586:21 8590:22,23 8590:25 8591:21 8595:15,16,17,21 8596:3,5,7,8 8598:10 8600:7 8601:8,9,10 8601:11,12,13 8602:7 8602:9,10,20 8603:2 8603:8,9,10,12,14,16 8603:18,21,24 8604:2 8604:2,5,8,18,24 8621:16 phone 8567:12 phrase 8619:8 physical 8562:4 place 8567:2 8568:14 8569:2,14 8572:4,14 8572:18 8581:9 8583:19 8590:14 8591:16 8593:16 8607:22 8619:21 8620:17,24 placed 8563:5 8590:13 places 8616:10 plain 8617:23 platform 8559:6 Platinum 8564:13 played 8605:11 8614:12 please 8587:12,22,23 8587:25 8597:21 8610:6 8619:1 pleased 8558:3,7 pleases 8597:19 plus 8562:15 point 8565:23,23,24 8568:9,9 8576:8 8583:8 8584:16 8586:10 8588:14 8591:25 8595:6,20 8596:2 8602:16 8603:1 8604:8 8605:22 8609:6,9 8611:8,11,11,21,22 8612:1 8614:14,18 8615:22 8619:14,17 8621:14 8622:5 pointed 8559:10 8560:25 8586:8 8594:5 8608:19 8609:14 8617:20 points 8563:22,23</p>
---	--	--	---	---

8569:19 8570:3 8574:10 8575:12 8579:16,18 8596:6 8601:9 8611:22 8615:11 8618:13 8621:4 police 8602:1 policy-making 8600:17 Pondoland 8597:8 pose 8598:5 posed 8611:3 position 8580:4 8590:15 possession 8616:13 possible 8563:17 8571:16 8573:3 8587:3 8589:19 possibly 8583:12 potential 8573:13 power 8582:21,23 powers 8565:4 8608:1 practical 8575:24 8603:11 practically 8589:23 practised 8597:18 prayers 8559:7 preamble 8607:15,25 8610:9 8617:25 8618:12 preambular 8619:6 preceded 8583:8 predicated 8598:6 predictions 8574:14 preface 8563:25 prefer 8560:10 prejudice 8612:19 prejudiced 8608:9 8610:17,19 8612:15 prejudicial 8613:19 preliminary 8563:23 8565:23 8568:9 8569:19 8575:12 premier 8565:5,5 premise 8605:3 8610:7 8615:15 premised 8568:13 preposterous 8571:13 present 8568:21 8587:8 8590:7 8594:8 8596:7 presented 8610:15 presently 8596:1 8598:22 President 8568:22 8596:17 8605:4,7 8608:3 8610:14 8617:3,12 presumably 8580:20 8581:7 Pretoria 8562:17 8574:3 8575:21 8580:10 8581:8,25 8612:19 8620:19 Pretoria/Centurion 8582:3 prevail 8572:23 prevailed 8572:22	prevents 8608:8 previous 8572:19 previously 8558:10 8611:5 8621:11,19 primary 8565:15 8577:1 8601:3 8619:21 principal 8585:21 principle 8567:23 8608:20 principles 8594:3 8617:22 8619:5,11 prior 8587:17 private 8613:14 pro 8613:20 probably 8578:25 8612:9 8613:20 problem 8618:24 proceed 8561:13 8610:6 8619:2 proceedings 8558:1 8560:17 8568:14 8571:15 8583:2,6,10 8583:14,18,25 8584:7 8584:8 8585:6,17,23 8586:3 8591:21 8596:7 8598:7,19 8604:7 8608:8 8610:16,18 8612:12 8612:14 process 8596:15 8600:18 8613:12 professionalism 8567:14 profit 8594:13 profits 8600:1 promotes 8600:16 Promotion 8607:3,8 promulgating 8617:4 pronouncement 8620:19 proper 8588:24 properly 8583:24 property 8594:6 propose 8559:21 8601:7,11,23 8602:6 8604:1 proposed 8572:3 proposition 8610:5 8617:20 protects 8608:6 provide 8576:24 8577:3 8585:19 8594:12 8608:4 provided 8584:18 8599:25 provides 8569:1 providing 8576:25 province 8605:18 8612:18,19 provincial 8617:7 provision 8573:6 provisions 8608:1 Pty 8608:13 public 8576:3 8578:2,5 8583:3 8584:1,6,14	8584:22 8589:16 8601:17 8605:9 8608:4 8617:5 publically 8589:11 publicly 8613:15 purpose 8569:3 8585:19 8605:12 8607:17,24 8608:3 8609:25 purposes 8578:16 8583:14 8587:15 8593:20 purposive 8607:12 8608:20 8609:20 8617:17,21 8618:4,6 purse 8574:17 8584:6 8584:22 put 8572:3,14 8574:12 8574:18,24 8577:19 8590:22 8597:14 8609:11 8619:17,20 8619:20	8606:25 8609:6 reads 8607:22 8609:5 ready 8621:23 real 8562:22 8582:9 realise 8587:20 reality 8559:12 really 8559:3,5 8562:13 8562:17,22 8576:15 8576:20 8578:13 8586:15 8595:10 8613:10 8620:11 reason 8566:2,11 8575:17 8616:7 reasonable 8567:25 8569:13 8577:20,25 8582:14,23,25 8621:24 reasons 8569:25 8588:8 8588:10,12,15,20 8589:9,12,17 8611:16 8616:6 reassemble 8592:17 recall 8588:2 8619:4 receive 8621:21 received 8565:8 8622:1 receiving 8612:10 recited 8578:19 recommendation 8610:14 recommendations 8583:21 8585:25 8595:11 Reconciliation 8607:4 8607:5,9 reconsider 8614:24 record 8561:5,6,9 8572:18 8576:22 8578:16 8587:14 8588:11 8590:4,13,14 8591:16 recovered 8559:10 recovery 8558:6 8560:4 red 8592:6 refer 8584:2 8593:23 reference 8568:17,24 8569:10 8605:7 8611:3 8617:1 8621:3 referred 8573:22 8581:6 8593:12,19 8608:12 8617:5,12 referring 8563:20 8593:21 8608:16 refers 8562:7 refusal 8572:21 refuse 8560:21 refused 8569:21 regard 8572:1 8585:10 8586:10 8588:15,20 8590:25 8591:20,21 regarded 8594:24 8595:2 8621:7 regime 8572:3 Registrar 8608:18 regrettably 8597:23 regulations 8566:20 8619:9	regulatory 8568:12 regurgitate 8561:2 8588:9 reiterate 8588:11 reject 8577:16 relate 8582:25 8596:3 8601:9 8604:2 related 8562:11 8565:24 8572:17 8594:6 relates 8575:14 8584:1 8586:15 8603:1 8604:8 relating 8585:23 8600:18 8603:17 8606:13,14 relation 8573:20 8575:20 8583:18,24 8584:16,21 8591:19 8593:15 8602:9 8603:14 8604:18 8605:23 8613:2 8620:2 relationship 8565:11 relevance 8591:17 8596:6 relevant 8586:16 8588:23 8605:11 relief 8588:25 relocating 8582:3 relocation 8560:24 8570:9,12 8573:14 8578:8 8579:6 8598:13 8606:12 8612:16,18 8614:24 8615:17,19 reluctantly 8563:1 relying 8608:24 remain 8591:25 remaining 8586:23 8601:25 remarks 8558:21 8572:1 remember 8566:1 8571:18 8572:10 reminded 8575:10,22 removal 8558:9 8577:20 8595:21 8621:25 reoccur 8605:13 8617:14 repeat 8579:10 8583:6 repeating 8571:18 reply 8591:15 8609:4,8 8609:18 8615:21,24 8616:3,7 replying 8558:13 8561:18 8567:13 8568:16 8570:7 8573:18 8579:22 8613:12 represent 8562:14 8563:3,17 8564:25 8565:5 8570:10 8578:20 representation 8563:8
Q				
	quality 8578:7,9 8611:2 quasi 8568:2 question 8580:19 8595:21 8596:5 8597:16,20 8600:7,9 8601:7 8602:4,7,15 8603:10,21 8604:21 8619:22 questioned 8599:13 questions 8597:14,14 8597:17 8602:18 8603:17 8604:2,17,25 8611:3 quick 8565:25 quickly 8575:11 quite 8558:7 8559:3 8560:6 8563:6 8567:18 8570:2 8571:12,25 8616:6 8618:5 8621:5,16,25 quotation 8609:15,16 8609:16 quote 8610:4			
R				
	raise 8565:23 8566:13 8566:14 8573:4 8575:19 8603:1,2 raised 8562:2 8565:21 8566:6 8575:20 8589:4 8612:2 8615:11 8616:9 Ramaphosa 8603:11 8603:16 rand 8574:7 8610:21 8610:23 reach 8586:5 8595:20 reaching 8608:11 read 8567:22 8568:25 8569:3,10 8585:20 8608:24 8610:8,10 reading 8574:9			

<p>8563:10,10 8570:23 8570:24,24 8572:9 8575:3 8578:9,9 8583:11 8613:3 8614:19 8620:3,7 representative 8570:25 representatives 8574:20 8581:20 8589:12 8613:18 represented 8582:4 8583:25 8610:24,25 8620:14 representing 8562:14 8567:1 8575:4 8593:2 8594:24 8598:9 8599:8 8613:5,5,6 8614:20 represents 8561:9 republic 8568:25 8569:3 8606:20 8607:23 request 8587:1 8588:22 8591:22 requested 8614:11 require 8620:20 residents 8585:17 resist 8561:2 8574:23 resisting 8574:21 resolution 8564:24 resolved 8599:11 resource 8562:10 8600:18 resources 8580:6 8590:10 8594:7 8598:25 8599:3,25 8600:3,21 respect 8564:17 8572:20 8619:19 8621:16 respectfully 8588:17,19 respondent 8564:8,10 8575:13 8594:24 8595:8,9 8599:22,23 8605:19 8615:11 respondents 8564:7,12 8570:13 8579:13 8585:21 8593:3,7,7 8594:18 8595:1 8617:3 8620:1 responsibility 8577:2 rest 8560:14 8595:6 result 8571:8 8584:13 8620:24 resume 8559:25 resumes 8558:2 8592:20 return 8586:19 Revenue 8608:13 revert 8558:8 revised 8590:15 revisit 8596:5 revisited 8586:17 8595:22 revisiting 8621:15 re-argue 8561:2 re-emphasise 8562:23</p>	<p>right 8567:24 8568:1 8570:20,21,23 8573:13 8589:4 8596:13 8597:3 8600:10,16 8601:17 8602:25 8603:5 8620:7 rights 8578:18 8593:10 8593:12,14 8599:6 Rio 8600:14 risk 8563:7 road 8558:6 role 8605:11 room 8571:19,24 roots 8564:3 rough 8574:12 round 8621:6 rule 8617:24 ruling 8591:19 Rustenburg 8563:2 8564:14 8569:12 8581:3,7 8583:10 8584:6 8585:3,6,10 8586:12,19,23 8589:19,20,24 8590:19 8593:5 8611:16,20 8612:18 8617:15 8620:19 R10 8574:16 R100 8580:25 8581:3 R200 8580:11 R239 8580:15,19 R300 8584:13 R500 8584:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p> <p>SA 8607:2 8608:14 sacrifice 8563:15 sacrificing 8599:16 safely 8566:9 8572:8 sake 8619:14 8620:15 sanity 8572:23 save 8566:8 8576:23 8580:11 8588:11 saving 8577:5,7 8578:3 8583:3 8584:1,15,19 8584:22 savings 8584:13 saying 8562:13 8564:1 8567:20 8569:16,18 8599:20 8604:14 8609:7,17 says 8567:24 8581:2 8606:19 8608:1 8616:13,24 8617:13 8617:22 8620:5 SC 8582:20 8589:5,8 8615:23 SCA 8607:2 8608:17 8609:14 scenes 8576:5 se 8562:5 8570:17,24 seat 8560:24 8569:11 8569:14 8579:7 8582:22 8587:3 seating 8586:11</p>	<p>second 8564:17 8565:22 8577:3 8578:19,23 8584:1 8595:1,8 secondly 8561:5 8576:10 Secretary 8608:12 section 8569:1 8570:21 8570:22 8582:21 8605:24 8606:16 8607:21 8608:6 8610:8,9 8615:22 8618:9 sections 8607:17 secure 8581:17 security 8596:22 see 8558:3,7,11 8559:24 8560:18 8568:15 8592:6,8 8601:15 8606:9,23 seeing 8613:9 seen 8569:5 8570:9 seized 8572:13 semblance 8564:4 Semenya 8559:17 8622:2 senior 8567:1,11 sense 8565:17 8578:8 sent 8559:2 8621:21 sentence 8567:22 separately 8613:8 September 8600:25 SERI 8561:20 8574:24 8578:14,23,24 8579:1 8579:4,19,21 8580:11 8581:16,19 8582:1,13 8613:5,12,17 seriously 8583:17 SERI's 8580:4,5 session 8566:18 8584:8 set 8580:4,8 8582:12 8590:16 8596:2 8611:16 8621:20 sets 8590:18 settling 8567:13 seven 8559:12 8599:17 she'd 8560:10 shortages 8562:11 shorter 8576:6 8586:7 show 8607:18,18 8616:2 8617:16 shown 8565:12 8569:14 8577:21 8582:14,24 8609:15 8621:25 side 8578:14 8602:1 signed 8564:22 significant 8586:12,13 silent 8578:1 similar 8575:1 similarly 8564:12 8593:19 8595:13 8597:24 8599:9 simple 8583:8 simply 8567:19 8571:3 8571:8 8574:17 8577:8</p>	<p>simultaneous 8573:1 sincerely 8576:24 Sir 8591:5 sit 8569:2,7 8584:24,25 8606:20 8607:22 8620:17 sits 8573:25 8584:14 sitting 8560:8,11 8571:22 8622:4 situation 8563:5 8564:6 8568:21 8575:1 8581:21 8616:18 sleeping 8576:13 slightly 8610:4 small 8571:21 smaller 8598:12 Socio-Economic 8578:18 solution 8572:24 soon 8587:3 sorry 8561:21 8575:11 8576:18 8579:2,2 8587:19 8589:3 8592:24 8594:20 8596:18 8602:19 8618:16,20 8619:1 8621:13 sought 8588:25 8609:25 sound 8591:15 sourced 8613:13 8614:21 sources 8575:3 8581:17 South 8601:3,4 8605:14 8607:6 8617:8,10,14 so-called 8565:25 8568:17 8570:1 speak 8573:11 8582:18 8584:19 8589:3,7 8592:4,7 speaking 8562:9 8577:6 specific 8602:17 8617:10 8619:9 8620:18 specifica 8619:7,8,10 specifically 8577:16 8579:24 specifies 8600:19 speculation 8571:20 spelt 8578:17 8587:15 spent 8559:13 8610:21 8610:21,23 8611:6 8613:4 spirit 8572:25 spiritual 8594:14 spoke 8588:22 8591:1 sponsor 8613:16 sponsoring 8613:15,16 8613:17 sponsorship 8613:13 8613:18 stage 8558:8 8591:7 8596:7 stakeholders 8605:11 stance 8567:20</p>	<p>stand 8580:5 8588:12 8588:18 8603:3 Standard 8608:18 standi 8565:16 8593:6 8605:20 standing 8575:13,13 8616:17 stands 8561:9 8612:22 stark 8563:6 start 8562:1 8563:21 8564:16 8566:19 8583:5 8596:5 started 8572:11,11,15 starting 8570:14 startling 8570:11 starts 8579:24 state 8573:18 8574:7 8577:2,3,5 8584:4 8600:1 8611:18 8614:5,7,11 8617:9 stated 8565:3 statement 8621:5 State's 8600:19 statute 8617:23 statutes 8601:5 8609:24 statutory 8565:4 stay 8563:7 8593:4 8611:20 stems 8562:8 stop 8622:4 Stopforth 8607:1 strengthened 8573:15 stressed 8611:11 8614:16 stretch 8569:7 stronger 8571:23 strongly 8586:23,24 students 8610:3 study 8607:16 stuff 8576:15 Sturrock 8608:13,15 subject 8562:20 submission 8564:15 8589:23 8592:1 submissions 8561:16 8573:11 8579:5,9,10 8580:10 8582:16 8583:7 8587:7,25 8592:2 8615:24 8620:1 submit 8569:9 8582:2 8582:11,24 8586:14 8588:17,19,23 8589:10 8590:20 8593:23 8605:19 8612:16 8615:15,16 submitted 8573:11,15 8591:1 8605:24 8610:15 subsequent 8608:17,25 8609:13,19 subsistence 8580:25 8584:4 substantial 8585:5 8600:1 8605:20</p>
--	---	--	--	--

<p>substantive 8579:15 succeed 8589:22 8603:19 successful 8582:8,15 sufficient 8564:7 8565:13 sufficiently 8564:21 8606:14 Sugar 8608:13 suggesting 8601:16 8603:8,15 suggestion 8616:19 suggestions 8573:1 suggests 8565:8 8573:18 summa 8619:7 supersede 8619:18 8620:9 supplementary 8616:16 suppliers 8585:7,13 support 8559:3,7 8579:5,6 8586:25 8588:7,12,13 8589:8 8610:5 8611:23 supporting 8588:16 supports 8590:15 8601:1 suppose 8571:2 supposedly 8609:15 Supreme 8606:25 sure 8560:6 8561:23 8567:14 8573:10 8574:22 8575:19 8591:7 8609:1 8618:1 surely 8577:5 surname 8590:4 sustainable 8593:17 8594:1 8599:25 8600:6 Swaziland 8597:11 system 8617:9</p>	<p>technology 8571:14 tell 8603:18 8611:19 temptation 8561:2 8574:22 tempted 8574:18 tender 8599:14 termed 8563:22 terms 8566:20 8567:24 8568:23 8569:9 8582:21 8605:6 8611:3 8617:1 8621:3 Thando 8587:15 thank 8558:19 8559:4,6 8559:8 8560:5,12,14 8560:22 8561:25 8574:5,8 8575:22 8578:12,15 8581:14 8582:16,17 8587:4,13 8588:1,25 8589:1,24 8590:2,3 8592:3,19 8592:25 8593:1 8598:4 8615:20 8616:4 8618:15,20 8619:3 8621:3,8,9,17 thankfully 8561:19 thanks 8558:22 8578:10 that's 8560:13 8569:4 8574:2,3 8577:23 8586:20 8590:11 8591:7 8595:1,22 8600:7 8602:3 8611:21,21 8612:2 8613:3 8614:14 thereof 8588:13 thereto 8606:13,14 8608:5 there'd 8574:15 there's 8566:22 8568:17,20 8575:6 8578:3 8583:2,3 8585:2,4 8590:22 8594:21 8599:9 8600:3 8604:22 8616:6 8618:11 8619:22 8621:13 8622:5 they're 8586:16 8604:25 8605:2 8613:25 8614:4 they've 8565:19 8574:12 thing 8559:11 8619:25 things 8572:25 8576:17 8580:5 8605:8 8617:25 think 8559:22 8560:16 8565:9 8567:2 8571:23 8572:19 8573:12 8577:10 8578:25 8591:3 8598:20 8604:17,23 8604:23 8610:3 8616:7 8618:17,23 8621:5 thinking 8560:13</p>	<p>third 8565:24 8566:24 Tholoana 8578:17 Thompson 8609:5 thought 8559:14 8570:15 8592:14,23 8615:9 8618:5 thousands 8610:20,23 threat 8620:3 threatens 8583:10 three 8567:17 8572:12 8592:9,11,12 throw 8603:9 throwback 8565:25 time 8560:17 8562:24 8563:16 8566:5,7 8567:6 8571:21 8572:15 8576:15 8580:21 8581:21 8585:11,11 8586:17 8589:20,22 8591:18 8591:24 Tip 8587:16 8588:5,9 today 8558:8 8560:20 8583:8 8590:7 8598:23 8611:12 8615:5 8618:19 8621:10,19,22 told 8618:18 8619:16 8619:24,25,25 8620:13 total 8574:15 totally 8615:13 Town 8569:6 traced 8562:5 traditional 8564:10 8565:3 8593:8,14,19 8593:22,23 8595:10 8595:13 8596:12 8602:12 8615:18 8616:13,20 8619:15 tragedy 8559:4 8596:14 8605:4,13 8610:12 8612:25 tragic 8613:10 8617:14 tragically 8612:24 transcribed 8560:18 transcribers 8585:8,13 transcript 8587:25 8621:22 transcription 8560:20 transition 8600:6 transmission 8578:14 transport 8576:13 8580:25 8581:4 8585:18,19 8598:17 transportation 8566:9 8576:19 travel 8563:9 8584:6 travelling 8584:3 8589:17 traversed 8579:17 traversing 8573:17 TRC 8607:13 treat 8564:10 treated 8564:12 8589:25</p>	<p>tribal 8594:4 8600:22 trite 8610:5 true 8613:4 8617:3 trust 8576:24 truth 8582:7 8607:4 8620:7 try 8563:16 8573:2 8592:24 trying 8581:16 8614:18 Tshwane 8584:21 two 8562:2 8563:14,15 8572:16 8602:8 type 8594:19 8599:23 T-A 8587:16</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">U</p> <hr/> <p>UN 8600:13 unable 8565:5 underlying 8605:16 underlying 8585:23 8586:1 understand 8558:13 8579:17 8582:18 8594:17,21,23,25 8596:19 8599:21 8601:9 8603:7,11 8604:11 8609:19 8610:22 8618:6,21 understandable 8594:19 8599:24 undertaking 8581:23 unemployed 8598:16 8598:16 unfair 8573:7 unfortunately 8562:6 8587:16 unfounded 8577:17 union 8568:25 8569:2 8607:23 unitary 8617:9 Unity 8607:3,9 unopposed 8569:22 update 8567:5 8576:20 upheld 8608:21 8609:19 use 8559:6 8574:19 uses 8577:13 usually 8599:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">V</p> <hr/> <p>valuable 8613:8 value 8583:16 various 8584:5 8607:16 vary 8580:22 venue 8563:1 8584:18 8596:6 versus 8607:1 8608:13 victims 8570:10,19 8572:21 8574:19 8575:18 8583:12,20 8621:1 video 8585:8,14 view 8577:1 8587:2 views 8567:4 violence 8585:24 8597:22</p>	<p>vital 8605:16 voice 8566:14,14 vote 8604:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">W</p> <hr/> <p>wait 8566:4,21 waived 8568:2 waiver 8568:4 want 8558:15 8562:1 8571:10 8574:25 8577:9 8583:6 8585:17 8589:10,24 8591:25 8592:15 8597:16 8603:18 8604:8 8619:13 wanted 8562:12,23 8566:4 8567:5 8587:20 8592:1 8615:3 8621:4 8622:3 wants 8593:4 8618:24 wasted 8589:22 watching 8571:16 wavelength 8567:15 way 8579:1,3,13 8580:3 8588:17 8594:24 8601:7,10,22 8602:5 8603:13 8604:5,21,24 8609:11 weak 8559:14 week 8560:13 weighed 8565:15 weight 8583:22 welcome 8558:4 welcomed 8578:4 went 8607:13 west 8593:4 8605:17 8612:18,20 8613:19 8617:15 we'll 8560:1 8561:10 8561:11 8564:10 8577:7 8591:22,24 8592:17 we're 8558:3,7,8 8569:18 8601:10 8621:6 we've 8558:14 8571:3 8572:13 8573:1 8584:9 8598:8,23 8613:4 8616:8 8617:7 8620:13 what's 8609:9 8621:18 wicked 8593:4 wish 8569:24 8570:1 8579:22 8580:9 8581:24 8582:2,11 8587:8 8589:2 8597:9 8615:21 8616:3 wished 8618:21 wishes 8578:13 8592:5 witch 8593:4 withdraw 8610:20 8611:20 withdrawing 8571:4 witness 8559:21 8560:1 8603:1,3,9 witnesses 8576:13</p>
--	---	--	--	--

<p>8591:9 8602:1,3,5 won't 8561:3 8572:4 8591:12 8603:19 8618:18,24,24 word 8567:7 wording 8618:9 words 8565:9 8569:16 8581:5 8620:14 work 8560:8 8571:5 8572:16,17 8576:4 8611:1,14 8617:17 workers 8597:24,25 8598:2 working 8560:10 8599:14 works 8561:22 world 8593:16 8594:9 worldwide 8594:11 worth 8570:16 8571:18 8617:2,19 8619:13 wouldn't 8603:20 wrong 8592:24 wrongly 8565:12,12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <hr/> <p>X 8562:15,15,16 8574:2</p>	<p>8607:2 8608:14 1st 8572:15 1(b)(iii) 8608:6 8610:9 10 8618:20 8619:1 8622:5,7 10:19 8574:21 10:39 8584:12 100 8581:12 11 8592:8 11:18 8592:21 11:38 8601:12 11:58 8612:8 113 8607:2 12 8600:15 8618:22,25 8622:1 12th 8596:9 12:18 8621:18 12:30 8622:4 16th 8596:10,11,20,24 8605:10 169 8600:22 1947 8568:24 8569:1 8607:21 1965 8608:14 1990 8600:25 1991 8601:1 1992 8600:15 1994 8607:4</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <hr/> <p>4A 8569:9 4(a) 8582:21 423 8580:15,19 45 8567:23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <hr/> <p>5 8580:3 8584:9 8600:25 50 8575:6 500 8584:25</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <hr/> <p>6 8579:23 8580:3,9 8590:18 6.6 8580:14,18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <hr/> <p>7.1 8591:19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <hr/> <p>8 8569:1 8584:9 8607:21 897 8608:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <hr/> <p>9 8618:20 9th 8596:9 8605:10</p>		
<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Y</p> <hr/> <p>Y 8562:15,17 8573:21 8574:4,6,12 8581:6,8 8581:15 8582:1 Yeah 8593:3 year 8572:14 8585:24 years 8599:17 8612:24 yesterday 8571:16 you'd 8602:15 8603:10 you'll 8592:9 8598:20 you're 8558:5,6 8559:24 8574:21 8582:18 8590:9 8601:15 8608:24 8609:8,18 8611:10 you've 8560:25 8611:21,23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Z</p> <hr/> <p>Zuma 8605:5,7 8610:14</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <hr/> <p>2 8569:1 8575:14,20,23 8576:1,5 8586:2,5,6 8586:13,15,17,19 8590:22,24,25 8591:21 8595:16,18 8595:21 8596:3,5 8600:7 8601:9 8603:2 8603:9,14,18 8604:2 8605:24 8606:16 8607:21 8610:8 8615:22 8618:9 8621:16 2nd 8566:19 20 8621:25 2001 8607:2 2012 8582:7 8605:10 2013 8558:1 8580:7,13 8582:10 21 8600:13 26 8558:1 26th 8561:1 8566:1,15 8567:3 8571:19 8579:9 8588:2 27 8600:25 270 8575:5 28th 8566:17</p>			
<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">0</p> <hr/> <p>000 8580:11,25 8581:3 8581:12 8584:13,15 8584:23 8585:1 09:39 8558:2 09:59 8566:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 8575:16 8583:14,17 8583:18,22,24,25 8586:3,4,7,14,16,21 8595:16 8596:7,8 8598:10 8601:9,10,11 8601:12,13 8602:7,9 8602:10,20 8603:8,10 8603:12,16,21,24 8604:2,5,8,18,24</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <hr/> <p>3 8575:2 8579:24 8592:8 3rd 8615:2 300 8575:5,8 8584:23 31st 8571:22 34 8570:21 8596:23 8607:4</p>			