

RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON
MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 73 5 APRIL 2013 PAGES 7773 TO 7848

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg
P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037
Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335
E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za
Web Address: <http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278>



<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7773</p> <p>1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 5 APRIL 2013] 2 [09:33] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. 3 You're still under oath, National Commissioner. Mr Mpofo. 4 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR MPOFU (CONTD.): 5 Thank you Chairperson. General, because we have a limited 6 amount of time today what I propose to do is to just finish 7 with the topic that we were dealing then I'll go slightly 8 back to tidy up some of the issues we dealt with yesterday. 9 Just so that we can put those to bed but when we come back 10 we deal with other matters and then if we time I'll deal 11 with one or two short topics before - Now but what I need 12 to do - oh and before we part I'll then give you a kind of 13 outline of where I will go with you towards the end of my 14 cross-examination so that during the break you can apply 15 your mind to some of the issues. Right, now going back to 16 the - what I'm going to do is I'm just going to ask that 17 you look at screen. There'll be a series of photos which 18 are going to be shown which may require a warning, 19 Chairperson. It's not going to be long and then I'll ask 20 you or rather I'll premise some of my questions on those 21 photos. 22 CHAIRPERSON: I was warned that certain 23 video clips are going to be shown which will show pictures 24 of people who were killed in the events of the 16th August 25 and if there are members of the family or persons close to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7775</p> <p>1 MR MPOFU: Yes okay thank you. Okay next 2 one. Okay next one. Okay next one, next one. Next one. 3 Ja on this one, General, if you just notice specifically 4 the fact that the - and this was already admitted by 5 Captain Mohlaki, that the picture at the bottom seems to 6 have been taken during daylight and the other one in the 7 evening. Okay next one. Next one. Okay again here you'll 8 see the picture at the bottom of daylight, clearly in 9 daylight and the other one in the evening. Okay that's 10 fine. That's fine. Next one. Another daylight and 11 evening contrast. Next one, next one. Ja and this one in 12 particular which is an evening photo, if you can just 13 observe the, I think the panga with the yellow handle, next 14 to hand of the person, okay next slide. And that one which 15 is picture 271 is probably the clearest of what I want to 16 illustrate. Where you see the daylight photos at the 17 bottom 270 and 271 and the evening photo above the two 18 photos, you look at daylight photos without the panga and 19 the evening photo with the panga. Okay, alright I think 20 the image that we have now illustrates more clearly the 21 general point. It was made in more detail by Mr Madlanga 22 but I don't want to redo that because it was already done 23 for the Commission. Okay, thank you very much. 24 CHAIRPERSON: For the sake of the record 25 and those in the immediate future and possibly the more</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7774</p> <p>1 those people in the auditorium they may find that looking 2 at the pictures causes them distress and unhappiness. In 3 the second status I'm going to ask that those clips not be 4 shown until two minutes have elapsed after what I have just 5 said is translated so that those people who wish to leave 6 the auditorium while those clips are being shown will have 7 an opportunity to do so. 8 MR MPOFU: Yes and Chairperson and 9 Commissioners these photographs are Exhibit K or form part 10 of Exhibit K but that's the reference ja. 11 CHAIRPERSON: I said they relate to the 12 16th so I take it that's correct because they don't relate 13 to the 13th or any other day. 14 MR MPOFU: The 16th and scene two thank 15 you Chairperson. Okay Ja. I can't see it myself but 16 insofar as you are able to see, are you able to see, I can 17 see we are both challenged. Are you able to see this 18 photograph, General? 19 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I see an image, not 20 detail. 21 MR MPOFU: Okay not detail. Alright in 22 any event you don't have see the detail. Okay you can play 23 the next one. Okay that's picture 245 at the bottom, if 24 you can concentrate on that one. Okay next one. 25 GENERAL PHIYEGA: This is better.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7776</p> <p>1 distant future who read the transcripts of these 2 proceedings it might be helpful to say what - give the 3 photograph numbers. I'm not sure that we've seen all these 4 but if I'm assured that we have I accept the assurance but 5 in any event perhaps you could give the photo numbers so 6 people who, as they read the record will know what exactly 7 you've shown. 8 MR MPOFU: Okay. Chairperson, yes. For 9 the purposes of this part of the record I will use only 10 this image. So I'll define what it is and then I'll give 11 references of the other relevant photos 12 CHAIRPERSON: What you showed were a 13 number of bodies, each identified by letter, what we saw 14 first was a picture, it looked like a piece of paper on a 15 body with a letter written on it and that was followed by a 16 picture, two pictures essentially. One taken I think by 17 Warrant Officer Henderson during the day which showed that 18 the weapons, if there were any, had been removed and the 19 subsequent picture we saw was a picture taken at night 20 that's to say subsequently when the weapons had been either 21 put back or had been put there, it may be a debate exactly 22 what happened, but that's what we saw so if we could just 23 run through the pictures and just record what bodies there 24 were I think is probably the easier way to do it and what 25 the photograph numbers are then the record will be</p>

Page 7777

1 complete.

2 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

3 Alright and I'll give more detail again on the last ones

4 because as I said I'm using that to illustrate. Okay can

5 you start again, start it quickly.

6 CHAIRPERSON: The first one is J, body J,

7 also a body I.

8 MR MPOFU: I and J yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON: I and J.

10 MR MPOFU: Yes .

11 CHAIRPERSON: And then we see, the

12 daylight picture is 245.

13 MR MPOFU: 245 ja. Those are the only

14 ones that have picture numbers.

15 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

16 MR MPOFU: Yes. Okay move on. And then

17 okay that one has no number, Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON: It's because they're night

19 time pictures. The next one is 268 and the two pictures,

20 the two daytime pictures are 244 and 268.

21 MR MPOFU: That's correct, Chairperson.

22 Next one.

23 CHAIRPERSON: Then we have body K which

24 also is described as body 11.

25 MR MPOFU: And the next picture will be

Page 7778

1 248, I think that's still body K, Chairperson.

2 CHAIRPERSON: Yes I see, yes alright. 248

3 is a daytime picture.

4 MR MPOFU: That's correct, next one.

5 CHAIRPERSON: The next one is body N,

6 otherwise known as body Four.

7 MR MPOFU: An evening picture.

8 CHAIRPERSON: Yes and there are two

9 daylight pictures 230, that's 230 and 231.

10 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. Next

11 one.

12 CHAIRPERSON: Then we have body O,

13 otherwise known as body 30, night time picture first and

14 then -

15 MR MPOFU: Yes next one.

16 CHAIRPERSON: The two daylight pictures

17 278 and 279 and above them the night time picture again.

18 MR MPOFU: Thank you, thank you, Chair.

19 Next one.

20 CHAIRPERSON: Then body M otherwise known

21 as body 13, that's the one where the hand of the deceased

22 is actually on what is described as a yellow handled panga.

23 MR MPOFU: Correct.

24 CHAIRPERSON: That's the night time

25 picture. The daytime pictures below are 270 and 271.

Page 7779

1 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, thank

2 you very much. I'm indebted to the Chairperson. Now,

3 General, effectively the picture, sorry I didn't mean to -

4 the theory, let me put it that way that is being perceived

5 by these pictures is that as the Chairperson summarised,

6 the daylight pictures of the same body would not have

7 weapons and the evening pictures do have weapons and there

8 can only be two explanations. One is the one that we

9 contend for which is that the weapons were planted there on

10 the bodies but obviously another possibility which is that

11 they were removed at some stage and replaced which as I

12 understand is what SAPS - is the theory that SAPS is

13 contending for. So are we together so far?

14 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.

15 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Now as I

16 understand it the report and you'll correct me if I'm

17 wrong, in essence says that at scene two at some stage in

18 order to facilitate the work of the paramedics the weapons

19 were removed and at a later stage they were replaced. I'm

20 obviously cutting some of the detail but that's the essence

21 of the report. Would you agree with that?

22 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes, I do.

23 MR MPOFU: Now before I deal with the

24 criticisms of the report I want maybe you and I just to

25 agree on the following issues. That unless there is a

Page 7780

1 plausible explanation for what we have seen it would

2 represent an unlawful and highly irregular interference

3 with a murder scene, absent an acceptable explanation.

4 Would you at least go along with that? I think even myself

5 as not a policeman would be able to make that statement.

6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I would go along with

7 that.

8 MR MPOFU: Thank you and that issue which

9 you and I have agreed on is what caused the local and

10 international uproar about the possibility of tampering

11 with evidence. Would you agree?

12 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I haven't followed

13 that, the international uproar, but I know that it is

14 something that also made me request the investigation.

15 MR MPOFU: Correct. Yes of course and

16 you don't have to agree with this one but if that is so at

17 least it gives us room, let me put it that way, to argue

18 which we will, that that activity, absent a plausible

19 explanation would amount to an admission of guilt because

20 innocent people don't usually interfere with the evidence.

21 GENERAL PHIYEGA: You've already answered

22 for me, I would not agree.

23 MR MPOFU: Yes. And that it would also

24 at the very least open the way for us also to argue that at

25 least as far as scene two is concerned is where these

Page 7781

1 pictures were taken, that the defence, of such defence was
 2 an after thought in a sense that only after the people
 3 would have been killed would someone have thought oh well
 4 we have to make it look like we were defending ourselves by
 5 placing weapons but it would at the very least open the way
 6 for us to argue that absent a plausible explanation.
 7 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I would also not agree
 8 with that.
 9 MR MPOFU: Yes. Okay. Now -
 10 CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner, do
 11 you say you wouldn't agree with that? He's putting it on
 12 the basis of absence a plausible explanation and there are
 13 two possibilities. One is a policeman came along and he
 14 said look here this is a serious matter, the paramedics are
 15 dealing with the wounded, it's dangerous to expect them to
 16 work among weapons because people could attack them. So
 17 I'll take them away, I'll remember carefully where they are
 18 and when it's all over I'll put them back and providing he
 19 did that, provided we can rely on the fact that he
 20 remembered correctly where they were and put them back in
 21 the same place there's no problem. That's what Mr Mpofo
 22 calls a plausible explanation but absent a plausible
 23 explanation if that isn't the case then it's a
 24 contamination of the murder scene and the question will
 25 arise why is the murder scene contaminated. Now I take it

Page 7782

1 there are two possibilities, the one is it was done with
 2 evil intent, to create a false case against the people.
 3 The other is just monumental inefficiency. Would you agree
 4 with that? It's either absent a plausible explanation,
 5 it's either monumental inefficiency and stupidity on the
 6 one hand or if it's more sinister it's an attempt to create
 7 a false impression, adverse to the protestors and obviously
 8 favourable to the police, I take it that must be right
 9 surely?
 10 [09:53] GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think, Judge, what
 11 we, the issue that we're discussing, fortunately we're not
 12 starting with, it's not a leading supposition because there
 13 is work, there is reports, there is information and I'm
 14 actually responding based on the information that is, if it
 15 was a Greenfield's matter maybe I could deal with that
 16 supposition in the manner that you are putting. But now
 17 I'm saying I have assistant to look into matters, there are
 18 some facts before me. So on the basis of that I would not
 19 agree.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Okay. I'm not sure whether
 21 it's as easy as that. But you had people looking into it,
 22 recommended there. They spoke to the participants and they
 23 got an explanation.
 24 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: Now the participants aren't

Page 7783

1 likely to say we did it deliberately to create a false
 2 impression, they won't say that to your investigator, will
 3 they? Then even, and I say, we're inefficient, we, they
 4 will have to say we remembered where they were taken from,
 5 we took them away and we put them back in the same place,
 6 isn't that so? So the correctness or otherwise of the
 7 results of your investigation well in this case you did,
 8 depends upon the credibility of the people who were
 9 interviewed, is that correct?
 10 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I do agree with that.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Ja.
 12 GENERAL PHIYEGA: And also some of the
 13 expert information that we received and the people who were
 14 doing the examination, because the statements that I saw in
 15 this report that I received from the commission has got all
 16 these statements, has got expert information, has got
 17 information of the paramedics and I'm saying it's not an
 18 area where we are just supposing. There is information and
 19 on the basis of that I am saying there is possibility or
 20 non possibility, it's a judgment issue.
 21 MR MPOFU: Yes, just so that we are
 22 clear. When you refer to experts evidence you're referring
 23 to the fact that some of the medical personnel says that,
 24 in terms of their conventions and all that, they then
 25 prefer to work with injured people when there are arms

Page 7784

1 around, which is understandable. Is that what you are
 2 referring to?
 3 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes there is a report
 4 from the doctor, she doesn't talk about preferences, she
 5 talks about convention.
 6 MR MPOFU: Yes. Yes okay. That, we may
 7 just get that out of the way. I accept that, I accept the
 8 conventions and I think they make sense as I say even to a
 9 lay person. But I'm going to argue that that is not the
 10 reason why the arms were removed, so it's just that you
 11 understand where I'm going with this.
 12 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I accept your argument
 13 but I also, that's why I'm saying, I gave you the response
 14 that I gave you.
 15 MR MPOFU: Ja.
 16 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Based on the body of
 17 the information that is before me to, so I also have others
 18 position.
 19 MR MPOFU: Ja and one of the reasons why
 20 I'm going to demonstrate to you that there's no causal
 21 connection, as we lawyers call it, between those
 22 conventions and the removal of the arms is the, is the fact
 23 that, to show that there's no connection between the two
 24 is, and you can take my word on this, because I don't want
 25 to have to play the videos. Is that the removal of arms

1 from the scene happened, we see it at least on some of the
2 videos that were played which you might have seen. It
3 happened at scene 1 almost immediately after the people had
4 been shot and long before any paramedics were on the scene.
5 Can you just accept that?

6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I can only say you need
7 to give me your facts to that to say when you say they were
8 removed long before the paramedics come, when did the
9 paramedics arrive and when did K9 arrive. It's very
10 important for us to look at those facts.

11 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, do you wish to
12 say something?

13 MR SEMENYA SC: Well, Chair, fortunately
14 the witness is doubling up s me as well. There is no video
15 material showing us at what point the paramedics arrives
16 and at what point at scene 1 those weapons are removed.

17 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofo, there's substance
18 in that point. Mr Mpofo, may I ask you where we're getting
19 with this cross-examination. The witness wasn't there, the
20 witness commissioned a report, she received. You're
21 questioning her about the report, she, I think indicates
22 that she accepts the report. Well that doesn't bind us, we
23 are in as good of a position, with respect, that she is to
24 decide what the fact of the matter were. So I don't want
25 to stop you unduly but I mean you had not helped taking us

1 very much further forward at this point. There are two
2 other points to be borne in mind. The one is that, unless
3 it's suggested the police brought the weapons and planted
4 them afterwards which I take it is not suggested, we have
5 to accept that all those weapons were there and were in the
6 possession of some at least of the strikers. The only
7 relevance would be, I take it, that a particular striker
8 might, on your version, be falsely incriminated as the
9 possessor of a dangerous weapon if in fact a weapon was put
10 in his hands and in fact he didn't have a weapon at the
11 time. But if he didn't have it somebody else did. So I
12 understand the relevance of the point in relation to
13 individual strikers that weapons were in their hands,
14 either before and they weren't removed and replaced again
15 in the same place afterwards or, if they didn't have
16 weapons at all and they were put there afterwards, that the
17 only relevance of the point as I see it.

18 We also have a slide 252 that I want to ask Mr
19 Semenya about, it looks to me like a daytime slide, in
20 other words, and I'd be interested to know whether that was
21 one of Warrant Officer Hendrickson's slides because if it
22 was it does indicate a scene in the day time where there
23 were weapons at koppie 3 in the close vicinity of deceased
24 protestors, but again the fact it would be borne in mind
25 when one assesses this whole question. But at this stage

1 its certainly open to be argued at the end if the evidence,
2 if there's evidential basis for it, that the removal of the
3 weapons and their replacement was possibly not as it should
4 have been because weapons may be put in the hands of people
5 who weren't holding weapons before hand and the other
6 question of course is circumstances in which this removal
7 or replacement was revealed or communicated to the evidence
8 leaders, that would be another aspect of evidence and basis
9 for argument. But I think we mustn't spend to much time on
10 an issue with this witness because with all due deference
11 and respect to her she can't throw very much light on this,
12 herself. Commissioner Hemraj pointed out to me that, this
13 is almost a response to what Mr Semenya said. There is a
14 video showing the police removing a firearm from the scene
15 pretty soon after the events.

16 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, there is and
17 that's, let me start with Mr Semenya's objection. If I'm
18 forced to play that video I will, not now because it's not
19 ready, but I would have thought that Mr Semenya has seen
20 the videos of the police immediately, when we are dealing
21 with Magidiwana's evidence for example, you'll remember his
22 evidence about the removal of the stick, we've seen all
23 that and there's no suggestion at that stage that, that the
24 paramedics were there. But even if there was remember,
25 Chair, that Captain Mohlaki testified that he arrived there

1 and when he arrived the pile was already there and there
2 were certainly no paramedics at that stage. So that's
3 evidence that has been led in this commission, which as I
4 say I can go and dig it up on the record or play the videos
5 I would have thought those are issues that side.

6 CHAIRPERSON: Very well, but my main
7 concern was and the most profit to be derived putting a
8 detailed list of questions to this witness about it because
9 she can't throw any light herself on it, that's my main
10 point. But Mr Semenya had another point which you are
11 dealing partly with.

12 MR MPOFU: Yes I just wanted a ruling on
13 the objection first and then I can deal with your concerns,
14 Chair.

15 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair the paramedics,
16 there is the other side of the evidence which is that those
17 who were moving, immediately after the shooting happened
18 from forward holding area 1 were told amongst them the
19 paramedics to go to scene 1. Now I don't know whether they
20 arrived subsequent to Mr Mohlaki, I say it is not evident
21 from the videos and when Captain Mohlaki's talking about
22 paramedics I don't know whether he's referring to the
23 external ones as opposed to those who were at the forward
24 holding area 1.

25 MR MPOFU: Okay. Chairperson, can I deal

Page 7789

1 with that objection in a, by rephrasing the question.
 2 Okay, General, you've heard the debate between myself and
 3 my learned friend, Mr Semenya and in order to save time I'm
 4 going to ask it along the following lines. Assume that I
 5 will be able to demonstrate to Mr Semenya and to the
 6 commission that by the time the weapons were removed and
 7 put into a pile the paramedics had not arrived and that the
 8 arms, those arms were actually removed almost immediately
 9 after the shooting. Would, if that is so, would you accept
 10 that they would at least as far as that removal is
 11 concerned at scene 1 there would be no connection between
 12 the removal of those arms and whatever the paramedics said
 13 about the conventions because they were not there.
 14 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I would not agree until
 15 I see those facts. I can't say yes to a thing I haven't
 16 seen.
 17 MR MPOFU: I accept, of course you can't.
 18 That's why I'm saying and I know this has been a problem
 19 throughout your testimony. When I'm saying assume that
 20 this is a fact, you can be sure that if later I can't find
 21 that fact the commissioners will ignore whatever followed
 22 that statement, okay. You can be sure about that. So I'm
 23 saying to you assume that I will be able to show that by
 24 the time the arms were removed at scene 1 and the pile of
 25 arms was put on the side that that was done A, almost

Page 7790

1 immediately after the shooting and B, before the paramedics
 2 arrived. Something that I'm going to show. If that, sorry
 3 please. Now if that assumption is correct, if it's not
 4 correct then we don't have to waste time on it, but if it
 5 is correct would you agree with the simple proposition that
 6 there would be no connection therefore between that removal
 7 of the arms at scene 1 and whatever the paramedics may or
 8 may not have said about the conventions?
 9 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Let me say I don't
 10 agree and then I'll deal with other issues when you, where
 11 you want us to be.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya has turned his
 13 light on, he wants to say something.
 14 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, surely those
 15 conventions are predicated on making the area safe. I
 16 can't for the life of me understand how a police operation
 17 could be there with people injured and weapons lying around
 18 only for them to wait until paramedics arrive so that that
 19 convention can trigger in.
 20 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Mr Mpofu, it
 21 doesn't appear from these videos when the paramedics
 22 arrive, how do you propose to show when, exactly when it
 23 was that they did arrive in relation to the removing of the
 24 weapons that you say are shown on the video? How are you
 25 going to show that?

Page 7791

1 MR MPOFU: I've just said, Commissioner,
 2 that Captain Mohlaki gave evidence before this commission
 3 that he arrived at about 4 o'clock and I asked him the
 4 question when you arrived there was the pile of arms
 5 already there and he said yes and he also testified that
 6 subsequently the paramedics arrived or at least at that
 7 stage they had no arrived. So that's concrete evidence,
 8 let alone on the video then and so on.
 9 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Is that what you're
 10 relying on to show -
 11 MR MPOFU: Well for the concrete evidence
 12 that I'm just saying the video evidence as you correctly,
 13 is scant. So I'm relying on that to but I'm relying more
 14 on the concrete evidence of Captain Mohlaki. But the video
 15 evidence I'll also rely on and profile this shows the
 16 people literally shooting and moving in and taking the
 17 arms.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: So, Mr Mpofu, I think that
 19 you must give serious consideration of what I am now going
 20 to put to you, key witness in this whole matter is Warrant
 21 Officer Breedt. His statement is annexure A to the reports
 22 that was prepared. He will presumably have to be called in
 23 this regard.
 24 MR MPOFU: Yes, I'm going to deal with
 25 him, Chairperson.

Page 7792

1 CHAIRPERSON: And the, he was the one, I
 2 think he's part of the K9 group, so he actually had a dog
 3 with him.
 4 MR MPOFU: From Vereeniging.
 5 CHAIRPERSON: Which he says that's why he
 6 couldn't keep notes because, make notes because he had to
 7 keep his dog under control.
 8 MR MPOFU: Yes.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: And he does say, he doesn't
 10 say, this is para 7 of his statement, he doesn't say when
 11 precisely he removed the weapons, he does say that he then
 12 put them back and in paragraph 10 he says that he puts them
 13 back as well as he could remember.
 14 MR MPOFU: Yes.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: And he says he didn't make
 16 notes because he had to keep his dog under control and he
 17 says he may have made a mistake with the correct or precise
 18 place, position of the weapon, he could also have made the
 19 mistake in relation to the exact weapon that he put down.
 20 MR MPOFU: Yes in one case he says he
 21 put, he put less than what he found.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: We don't have to debate all
 23 that now. The point you're making to a very large extent
 24 depends upon how accurate he was, he already admits that he
 25 may well have not been accurate but, so I'm not quite sure

Page 7793

1 how much advantage we're going to derive from a detailed
 2 cross-examination on this point with this witness whose
 3 answers are going to be hearsay in any event. But I'm not
 4 going to stop you at this stage but I just indicated to you
 5 that I would be, prefer evidence that we can use later with
 6 profits rather than evidence that we can't, it sounds to me
 7 that we're going to get.

8 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, I think, if
 9 I may, Chairperson, if I may, before I repeat the question
 10 for the witness. I just want to make one thing clear. I'm
 11 actually, this is the last question before I move to the
 12 area that the Chairperson has gotten into. Because the
 13 real issue with this particular witness is not so much
 14 accept what the Chairperson is saying, is not so much what
 15 this one or that one says, it is, what I'm going to take
 16 issue with, with this witness is the fact that she has
 17 accepted this report. So I'm going, I'm not there yet.

18 CHAIRPERSON: No, no I accept that.

19 MR MPOFU: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON: But even if she accepts the
 21 report we don't have to accept it. Her acceptance isn't
 22 binding on us.

23 MR MPOFU: No.

24 CHAIRPERSON: We're in a, the same boat
 25 that she is.

Page 7794

1 [10:13] MR MPOFU: Chairperson, it's her as a
 2 National Commissioner, I'm testing the National
 3 Commissioner of this country who has instituted a
 4 particular report into serious allegations as to whether it
 5 is proper or improper for her to accept a particular
 6 report. That's the one. The secondary question of what
 7 the Commission will do with it.

8 CHAIRPERSON: That's a matter you can
 9 deal later.

10 MR MPOFU: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON: Let's just hear your
 12 question again so that if Mr Semenya persists in his
 13 objection, he'd have an opportunity to object and I then
 14 have to make a ruling.

15 MR MPOFU: Yes. And this is what I
 16 wanted to clarify, Chair, before Mr Semenya decides whether
 17 he persists or not. This is what I wanted to - on the
 18 issue, and I think at least between myself and the
 19 chairperson there's one point that has been missed. The
 20 only reason I'm questioning this witness about what
 21 happened at scene 1, when we all know that the report deals
 22 with scene 2, is to make the following simple point, that
 23 the removal of the weapons at scene 1 could not have had
 24 anything to do with whatever the paramedics had asked for,
 25 and therefore if the removal at scene 1 is unconnected to

Page 7795

1 the paramedics, then there's no connection between the
 2 conventions or whatever the paramedics have said or asked
 3 for in the removal. I'm just making that simple point, if
 4 I'm correct on - and maybe let me rephrase the question.

5 CHAIRPERSON: It's almost like an
 6 argument point but anyway if you're going to ask one
 7 question and you stick to that promise -

8 MR MPOFU: Ja, I promise.

9 CHAIRPERSON: Then subject to what Mr
 10 Semenya says I'll let you ask the question.

11 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, might I just read
 12 to us what appears on page 669 of the record, because Mr
 13 Mpofo says the only concrete evidence is his reliance on
 14 what Captain Mohlaki says, to a question against line 6,
 15 the Chairperson asks, "Had the shooting happened yet,
 16 shooting happened yet?" Captain Mohlaki, "Ja, when we
 17 arrived there I think the scene was still active, because
 18 the police, with the movement of the police officials and
 19 the paramedics at the scene." So the record reads.

20 At page 840 what my learned colleague Mpofo is
 21 asking. Against line 5 says Mr Mpofo, "In fact, that must
 22 be so, because as you say some of the injured people had
 23 not yet been attended to?" Captain Mohlaki, "At scene 1,
 24 that's correct, Sir." Mr Mpofo, "And were the injured
 25 people, at least some of them, attended to in your

Page 7796

1 presence?" Captain Mohlaki, "That's correct, Sir."

2 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, honestly I don't
 3 want to be drawn into this, because whether this refers to
 4 scene 1 or scene 2 or the arrival or the treatment and so
 5 on, are matters that we can deal with. I was avoiding all
 6 this by saying to the witness, if it can be shown that the
 7 removal of the weapons at scene 1 happened before the
 8 paramedics had anything to do with that scene - of course,
 9 if I've explained to the witness, if it cannot be shown and
 10 we can debate this with my learned friend later, then
 11 whatever I'm going to ask is -

12 CHAIRPERSON: - is the case. How do you
 13 propose to show? Is there a witness you're going to lead,
 14 or are there video clips which show that, in which case,
 15 will you be able to give us a reference to them?

16 MR MPOFU: Well, there are video clips
 17 which have already been shown, which, as I said earlier, to
 18 save time, because I don't have them at hand right now, I
 19 would present. If I fail to do so, as I say, then the
 20 question will fall away.

21 CHAIRPERSON: But you know you're putting
 22 a hypothetical question to the witness -

23 MR MPOFU: Ja.

24 CHAIRPERSON: And if the witness,
 25 whatever answer the witness gives, will depend upon whether

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7797</p> <p>1 firstly, the hypothesis is correct –</p> <p>2 MR MPOFU: Of course.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: And secondly, is her</p> <p>4 response to the hypothesis going to help us to make</p> <p>5 findings at the end of the day?</p> <p>6 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, it will make</p> <p>7 you accept or not accept the fact that the report that she</p> <p>8 has accepted, as National Commissioner, has got the flaws</p> <p>9 that I'm about to point out, one of which is the one we're</p> <p>10 exploring now.</p> <p>11 CHAIRPERSON: I understood you relying on</p> <p>12 Captain Mohlaki's evidence, and the passages that Mr</p> <p>13 Semenya has read appear to indicate that Mr Mohlaki doesn't</p> <p>14 say what you said he said.</p> <p>15 MR MPOFU: No, Chairperson, I'll just</p> <p>16 move on to the next point. I was just I think –</p> <p>17 CHAIRPERSON: I don't want to hamper you</p> <p>18 from making a point –</p> <p>19 MR MPOFU: Well, Chairperson, I rely on</p> <p>20 videos, I've said, I rely also on Captain Mohlaki, if one</p> <p>21 of them happens to be debatable, I am not in a position now</p> <p>22 to play the videos or to deal with whether Mr Mohlaki's</p> <p>23 references were to scene 1 or scene 2 and all that, and</p> <p>24 that's why I'm putting it as a proposition. If indeed that</p> <p>25 proposition is wrong, then we would, in two minutes, be out</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7799</p> <p>1 we accept what the paramedics are alleged to have said, it</p> <p>2 relates to injured persons and does not include the dead</p> <p>3 people who were shown in the pictures.</p> <p>4 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, that's also not</p> <p>5 correct. Breed refers to the dead people as well.</p> <p>6 MR MPOFU: Well, if that is so, then it</p> <p>7 makes the matter even worse, because Breed spoke about 84 –</p> <p>8 not Breed, 84 injured people and we know that on that scene</p> <p>9 another 14 people died. So that means almost about a 100.</p> <p>10 Actually 18 people died there, but four died in hospital.</p> <p>11 That means about 102 people, and I'm putting this to you.</p> <p>12 We will argue that the chances of arms from a 102 people</p> <p>13 which have been removed, and replaced in the dark are –</p> <p>14 makes that exercise of the replacement of those arms,</p> <p>15 something that you should not have -</p> <p>16 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure it was pitch</p> <p>17 dark, I think there were searchlights and things on the</p> <p>18 scene, were there not?</p> <p>19 MR MPOFU: No, I didn't say pitch dark.</p> <p>20 CHAIRPERSON: Sure, I know you didn't,</p> <p>21 but you said in the dark, which could be the expression –</p> <p>22 MR MPOFU: Ja, skemer. Paragraph 9, "Ek</p> <p>23 weet nie presies watter tyd nie, maar dit was ongeveer</p> <p>24 18h15 en dit was after skemer, het 'n swart man wie in</p> <p>25 privaat klere geklee was, my op die toneel genader. Ek ken</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7798</p> <p>1 of this point and whatever I'm going to ask will be</p> <p>2 superfluous.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: The problem that I have, if</p> <p>4 we're putting a hypothesis as to what Mr Mohlaki said,</p> <p>5 which Mr Semenya has already shown is not correct, that is</p> <p>6 my difficulty.</p> <p>7 MR MPOFU: Alright, well that doesn't</p> <p>8 deal with the videos, but I'll move on. Thank you, Chair.</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: I suggest you move on, I</p> <p>10 also suggest to you that if you are later able to show from</p> <p>11 the videos that the points you made is correct, you will be</p> <p>12 able to argue, and very forcibly in support of the argument</p> <p>13 that wish now to put to the witness, so I suggest you move</p> <p>14 on.</p> <p>15 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chair. You have</p> <p>16 already been referred to, and let me make this clear again,</p> <p>17 what I'm dealing with now, is that you, as National</p> <p>18 Commissioner, in accepting this report did not conform with</p> <p>19 your duties to decisively deal with a serious matter of</p> <p>20 alleged interference with the scene.</p> <p>21 GENERAL PHIYEGA: That, Advocate, sounds</p> <p>22 like a conclusion, and I appreciate to be taken into what</p> <p>23 brings you there.</p> <p>24 MR MPOFU: Okay, yes. Well, the first</p> <p>25 one is one that I canvassed with you yesterday that even if</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7800</p> <p>1 nie die person nie. Ek twyfel of ek kon hom sal herken.</p> <p>2 Ek het aangesien dat hy 'n lid van die polisie se fotografe</p> <p>3 by die plaaslike sentraal," and so on. All that – all that</p> <p>4 suggests the following, that Breed says it was dark –</p> <p>5 already dark and he saw some private person in clothing</p> <p>6 that he assumes is a member of LCRC, and that person told</p> <p>7 him, op versoek, whatever versoek is –</p> <p>8 MR MAHLANGU: Request.</p> <p>9 MR MPOFU: Requested him to place the</p> <p>10 weapons, "min or meer waar ek dit vanaf verskuif of</p> <p>11 verwyder het." And this is the kind of thing that you</p> <p>12 accepted as an explanation for the tampering, is it?</p> <p>13 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think, Adv Mpofu,</p> <p>14 what you are giving me is a judgment –</p> <p>15 MR MPOFU: Yes.</p> <p>16 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Of my judgement and I</p> <p>17 would like to say you have right to make that judgment, but</p> <p>18 I still believe the judgment I made, based on the facts of</p> <p>19 accepting this report, in my opinion it's rational.</p> <p>20 MR MPOFU: Okay. And he says – Breed</p> <p>21 further, "Ek het toe so goed soos ek kon onthou die wapens</p> <p>22 wat ek verskuif en verwyder het terug geplaas." In other</p> <p>23 words, he's saying, well as far as I could remember I put</p> <p>24 wherever I remembered – do you also accept that as a</p> <p>25 reasonable explanation of how the weapons were removed and</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7801</p> <p>1 replaced?</p> <p>2 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.</p> <p>3 MR MPOFU: And then just one more, on</p> <p>4 paragraph 13 he's talking about a spear that he removed.</p> <p>5 He says, "Ek mag miskien die spies in die verkeerde rigting</p> <p>6 geplaas het, maar dit was in 'n vertikale posisie langs die</p> <p>7 liggaam." And then on paragraph 14 he says, "Ek het,"</p> <p>8 this from another body now, "Ek het die panga en ander</p> <p>9 wapens wat daar naby gelê het opgetel en bo op die rots</p> <p>10 langs die liggaam geplaas." Then this is the highlight,</p> <p>11 "Ek het later net die panga met die geel hand - wat ek</p> <p>12 langs die liggaam gekry het terug langs die liggaam</p> <p>13 geplaas."</p> <p>14 Okay, this is the key person who seems to have</p> <p>15 done this. He is a warrant officer, he's not a senior</p> <p>16 officer. He takes instructions from some unknown person in</p> <p>17 private clothes. He puts weapons, as far as he can</p> <p>18 remember, and we are dealing with about a 100 people.</p> <p>19 Remember when he removed those weapons, he didn't know that</p> <p>20 he was going to have to replace them. It's because someone</p> <p>21 else said that he must replace them about two hours later.</p> <p>22 I mean really would you say that this adequately and</p> <p>23 satisfactorily, according to you, explains this serious</p> <p>24 matter?</p> <p>25 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Advocate, the important</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7803</p> <p>1 checked and saved this body using their expertise, and all</p> <p>2 that, and it is all those things that informs me as I read</p> <p>3 this report, and I read the diverse input to take a</p> <p>4 decision.</p> <p>5 MR MPOFU: Okay, I'm going to move away</p> <p>6 from there. All I want to say to you is that this is not</p> <p>7 at this stage so much a criticism of Breed, that will</p> <p>8 happen if and when, as the Chairperson says, he comes here.</p> <p>9 This is a criticism of you in accepting this kind of thing</p> <p>10 and now rationalising it without taking that extra step of</p> <p>11 saying, "Ja, but really, if it was dark, if this guy put it</p> <p>12 maybe next to," and so on. That's your duty, as the</p> <p>13 National Commissioner, who is facing a serious allegation</p> <p>14 which has created international and local uproar of this</p> <p>15 magnitude should not accept this kind of wishy-washy</p> <p>16 report, and that you have neglected your duty, not Breed,</p> <p>17 in telling us, as you did yesterday, that the matter is now</p> <p>18 closed. You have accepted this and life must carry on.</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: - Mr Semenya, I didn't hear</p> <p>20 - sorry, I didn't hear the National Commissioner say the</p> <p>21 matter is closed. Certainly as far as this Commission is</p> <p>22 concerned, the matter is definitely not closed, and</p> <p>23 whatever - and even though the National Commissioner may</p> <p>24 accept the correctness of the report, as I've said, that</p> <p>25 doesn't bind us. I have no doubt we'll have argument on</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7802</p> <p>1 thing is to say lives had to be saved. The paramedics were</p> <p>2 there. The paramedics are indicating in their statement,</p> <p>3 they also refer to the conventions, to say is the place</p> <p>4 safe, is it not safe, and it is in accordance with their</p> <p>5 conventions that those weapons be removed so that they can</p> <p>6 focus - the actual report also talks about focussing on</p> <p>7 saving lives. And Breed and whoever else that was there do</p> <p>8 that really to assist those paramedics to do what they're</p> <p>9 supposed to be doing. And I think that maybe it's an</p> <p>10 acknowledgement, even in some of the statements that I've</p> <p>11 read through, that - let me step back and say you talk</p> <p>12 about somebody in private clothes. Our detectives do not</p> <p>13 wear uniform, and the LCRC people were not in uniform. And</p> <p>14 I think he didn't just see it as a person not wearing</p> <p>15 uniform. He saw some authority in that, and I'm sure he</p> <p>16 will be questioned on that, that's what I read in that, and</p> <p>17 that's why understand the broader stakeholders that are</p> <p>18 participating there, and I think there's also some</p> <p>19 acknowledgement that some of the weapons could have been</p> <p>20 placed, maybe not correctly and that type of thing, but the</p> <p>21 spirit of doing that was to assist those who were there to</p> <p>22 save lives, and we as police also do not use our eyes to</p> <p>23 decide that somebody is dead. I presume the paramedics</p> <p>24 also did that type of test, because you don't just look at</p> <p>25 a body and say this is person is dead. They would have</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7804</p> <p>1 the matter. We'll keep an open mind - the three of us, on</p> <p>2 the whole matter until the very end. So it's certainly not</p> <p>3 closed as far as we're concerned, but I didn't hear her say</p> <p>4 it was closed either, but let's hear what Mr Semenya has to</p> <p>5 say.</p> <p>6 MR MPOFU: Maybe you didn't hear her,</p> <p>7 Chair, but she did say it. We can play the tape.</p> <p>8 CHAIRPERSON: - first. Maybe the</p> <p>9 commission will say she does - anyway let's anyway let's</p> <p>10 hear Mr Semenya first.</p> <p>11 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, it is precisely</p> <p>12 what the Chair raises, but also too that the witness says I</p> <p>13 think the decision which I hold to be rational. Mr Mpofu</p> <p>14 can differ. I don't know where this is taking us to. I</p> <p>15 can't see any legal predicate on which Mr Mpofu says there</p> <p>16 is a duty on the National Commissioner not to accept</p> <p>17 statements which he rationally says to her, are rational.</p> <p>18 [10:33] CHAIRPERSON: I suppose his point would</p> <p>19 be he's going to argue though at the end of the matter and</p> <p>20 he wants to give her a chance to reply. I suppose - let's</p> <p>21 see what she has to say. What do you say about this, do</p> <p>22 you regard the matter as closed National Commissioner?</p> <p>23 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Judge I have no powers</p> <p>24 to close any matter of this Commission that's number one</p> <p>25 but let me start off by saying to what Advocate Mpofu is</p>

1 saying the fact that, without being prompted, I saw a
 2 program and I commissioned people to do investigation for
 3 me. I didn't just want to rely on the statements that were
 4 sitting in there. That in itself shows the
 5 responsibilities, the seriousness with which I treated this
 6 matter, that's fact number one. The second issue is that I
 7 have looked into all these facts has been given to me and I
 8 am saying, given what I have made out of this fact I do
 9 think there is rational explanation of what has happened
 10 and indeed you know it doesn't stop anyone to judge my
 11 judgement and I would say it is your right to judge my
 12 judgement but where I'm sitting I'm saying I have had at
 13 least some insight into what has happened and in my view it
 14 is rational and my standpoint remains. And that is my
 15 input into the Commission, the judgement of the Commission
 16 remains.

17 MR MPOFU: Okay. Alright thank you.
 18 Firstly let me tell you that you are changing your
 19 evidence. On the 16th when we come back I'll play the tape
 20 for you and you'll hear that I after even apologised for
 21 asking you a double question. Are you satisfied with the
 22 report and the matter closed and you said yes and I sorry
 23 those are two questions in one. But that will be a matter
 24 - it's either I'm right or you're right. That's what you
 25 said yesterday and I will show that. Secondly, yes both

1 you and Mr Semenya are quite correct by introducing the
 2 element of rationality into it because that's exactly what
 3 I've said to you I'm going to argue that a reasonable
 4 National Commissioner in your position presented with this
 5 kind of thing would not be satisfied and say and that's
 6 what I will argue, so rationality is definitely going to be
 7 part of it and that's the only issue I'm going to argue on
 8 this.

9 CHAIRPERSON: She made the rationality
 10 point already and she answered, gave her answer to it so I
 11 think that -

12 MR MPOFU: Thank you Chairperson.

13 CHAIRPERSON: - you can now perhaps move
 14 on to another matter.

15 MR MPOFU: Yes thank you.

16 GENERAL PHIYEGA: But Judge there's
 17 something, can I say something?

18 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

19 GENERAL PHIYEGA: The question you asked
 20 that day was based on 22 and 23 of the report that I have
 21 given because the report was still saying progress with the
 22 investigation is still to be reported and I said we
 23 circulated another report. And we will be also sharing,
 24 you know, a composite report that covers everything.

25 MR MPOFU: Yes. No that was not me, that

1 was Mr Madlanga. That was Mr Madlanga and on the basis of
 2 that answer you presented us with the latest report. What
 3 I asked you, was yesterday I said is the matter now,
 4 meaning yesterday, is the matter now, are you now satisfied
 5 and is the matter now closed? But let's not quibble about
 6 such -

7 CHAIRPERSON: I find despite my efforts
 8 to close the door on this one for the moment we will
 9 revisit this probably on the 16th and we'll deal with it
 10 then with such fortitude as we can muster.

11 MR MPOFU: Okay the last point I want to
 12 deal with on this topic is whether or not you'd agree with
 13 me that - and that deals mainly with what the Chair was
 14 saying that look whether Mr X had the weapon or not, it
 15 doesn't matter you know because somebody had the weapon.
 16 Not Mr X -

17 CHAIRPERSON: It does matter, it does
 18 matter in relation to the particular person in whose hand
 19 the weapon was placed if he didn't have the weapon there
 20 before. It does matter to that extent but in the overall
 21 picture as to whether the people on the koppie had
 22 dangerous weapons it isn't necessarily so important who had
 23 what but it is a fact. You can't ignore the fact that if a
 24 weapon was put in the hand of somebody who didn't have the
 25 weapon beforehand that is contamination and tampering and

1 that's a serious matter.

2 MR MPOFU: Thank you Chairperson. Yes
 3 with that background in mind, would you accept that there's
 4 the additional and more important point given that our
 5 constitution recognises, among others, the values of ubuntu
 6 and respect and human dignity that the idea of a dead body
 7 being manipulated and placed with weapons that were not
 8 there, I'm using that theory now assuming again that
 9 there's no rational explanation, that that is something
 10 that is offensive to our culture, to the respect that is
 11 given to a dead person who after all is God's temple and
 12 more importantly to the families of those people who will
 13 see the last picture of their loved one with a panga which
 14 may not have been there?

15 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think that's a very
 16 emotionally laden statement.

17 MR MPOFU: Yes.

18 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I'd rather stick with
 19 the facts to say the weapons were removed to assist those
 20 who were there, to assist those who were injured, I'd
 21 rather remain with that.

22 MR MPOFU: Okay thank you. We'll take
 23 that then as the last word on that issue from our National
 24 Commissioner. Now the next issue is you've said that you
 25 instituted an investigation. Do you remember saying to one

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7809</p> <p>1 of my learned colleagues in relation to the Myburgh matter 2 that you referred it to IPID because you did not want to 3 investigate yourselves? Why was this serious matter of the 4 tampering report treated differently and you investigated 5 yourselves? 6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: The main reason is that 7 in this incident there was no person killing another 8 person, police killing another person. When those types of 9 issues, it's categorical it's clear, I can't even touch 10 that. If a policeman kills another person IPID must come 11 in. In this regard I wanted to understand these pictures 12 to say why are our pictures daylight ones and why are the 13 LCRC ones that we got here yellow or whatever but I wasn't 14 dealing with life being taken, I was looking at pictures. 15 And it is within my limits to do so. 16 MR MPOFU: Well I understand from that 17 answer that you are making a distinction between cases 18 where there's an allegation or a possibility 19 of a policeman having caused a death in which 20 case it gets referred to IPID or other forms of serious 21 allegations against sorry, of serious misconduct on the 22 part of the police, which according to that answer should 23 not be referred to IPID but should be investigated by 24 yourselves. 25 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I'm saying to you I saw</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7811</p> <p>1 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I have heard that. 2 MR MPOFU: Now that raises a possibility, 3 no higher than that, that sangoma was killed by a policeman 4 has that not then been referred to IPID? You didn't refer 5 it to IPID. That's not an objection. 6 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair I object - 7 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, I reprove 8 members of the audience if they laugh and the same reproof 9 has to be administered to you. Please behave yourself, 10 don't laugh when questions are asked. You may think that 11 they're ridiculous, keep your thoughts to yourself. Carry 12 on, Mr Mpfu. 13 MR SEMENYA SC: But I still make the 14 objection, Chair. I'm still making the objection. I 15 apologise for my conduct, I'm objecting to the question. 16 CHAIRPERSON: You object. 17 MR SEMENYA SC: There is no premise for 18 Mr Mpfu to say that shooting was done by a policeman. 19 CHAIRPERSON: I didn't understand him to 20 say that, repeat your question again? 21 MR MPOFU: Yes thank you, Chairperson. 22 Firstly let me remind the Commission of the question that I 23 asked. 24 CHAIRPERSON: Well that's what I asked 25 you, repeat the question.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7810</p> <p>1 pictures that are different. I had pictures that we 2 submitted to this Commission, I saw pictures that were with 3 the evidence leaders that were different from ours and I 4 wanted to understand and I asked this investigation and I 5 understand now. 6 MR MPOFU: Okay you didn't answer my 7 question but I'll ask another one. Should I also 8 understand from that answer you gave before this one that 9 you regarded the Myburgh allegations as involving a 10 policeman killing somebody? 11 GENERAL PHIYEGA: There was an allegation 12 by Myburgh that he saw - that he heard a shot and that shot 13 he saw somebody dead and he made a statement also, the 14 statement that he has made alerted to those types of 15 allegations. 16 MR MPOFU: Okay that also is not an 17 answer to my question but, Chair, just in case I get this 18 right - you know there are allegations about a sangoma was 19 killed recently with an R5. 20 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I don't know about the 21 allegation, I know about a sangoma who is dead. 22 MR MPOFU: But all I'm asking you, Madam, 23 is whether you are aware that that dead sangoma, around his 24 death there are allegations that he was killed with R5 25 which is police issue?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7812</p> <p>1 MR MPOFU: No not this one, not the one 2 that's being objected to, I have to - 3 CHAIRPERSON: I remember the question 4 before that but this question, so I can deal with the 5 objection. 6 MR MPOFU: Okay it was in view of your 7 answer then to the previous question which I'm not allowed 8 to repeat. Yes she'd heard of the allegation that the 9 person had been killed with an R5 which is police issue and 10 the question was this given that answer and given the - I 11 said the possibility, I won't place it higher than that, 12 that if the person was killed with an R5, which is police 13 issue, that they may have been killed by a policeman has 14 she referred that matter to IPID, well not she, had the 15 matter been referred to - 16 CHAIRPERSON: I don't think there's 17 anything wrong with that question, please proceed. 18 MR SEMENYA SC: It's now qualified as a 19 may. 20 CHAIRPERSON: I thought it was originally 21 but I may have been wrong whereas it's now qualified. 22 Carry on, Mr Mpfu. 23 MR MPOFU: So please answer the question. 24 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Unfortunately those 25 allegations that you're talking about I don't know, I just</p>

Page 7813

1 know that there is somebody who died, shot with an R5, a
 2 case number has been opened and it's being investigated and
 3 let me put it on record to say if there is a policeman that
 4 has shot any other person it doesn't matter where it is
 5 IPID will be involved.
 6 MR MPOFU: Okay thank you. Commissioner,
 7 just bear with me one second, Chairperson. Just in the
 8 same vein I'm just going to touch on the Myburgh case and I
 9 promise you it will be one or two questions because I don't
 10 want to spoil the good work that Mr Madlanga did on it.
 11 Well firstly on that subject would you agree that the
 12 identification or the process to identify the people
 13 involved was demonstrated by Mr Madlanga in a few minutes
 14 and Mr Madlanga is an advocate from the Transkei so he's
 15 not a detective but he was able to crack the case in a few
 16 minutes and left us with at least two people, two
 17 constables from NIU that would be the suspects.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: What exactly is the
 19 question. You put certain factual statements to the
 20 witness, what is the question -
 21 MR MPOFU: The question is what I said,
 22 which is would you agree that this - it wouldn't take much
 23 effort as was demonstrated here to narrow the suspects at
 24 least to two people as was done by Mr Madlanga.
 25 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Maybe let me enlighten

Page 7814

1 this, I'm also from the Limpopo initially.
 2 MR MPOFU: Okay then I should rely on the
 3 altitude.
 4 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think the important
 5 thing is that when IPID is investigating that would be the
 6 role of the IPID to do that, I can't interfere with their
 7 investigation.
 8 MR MPOFU: Fair enough. The real
 9 question that I wanted to ask you is this and you may
 10 not agree with me because some of it is speculative. On
 11 FFF8 and as I said I'm not going to repeat that whole
 12 exercise, okay I'll help you with it. In FFF8 Mr Madlanga
 13 had reduced this possible person who killed, as you agreed,
 14 the other person to a Constable Hallam or a Constable
 15 Thafeni, number 3 and 23.
 16 [10:53] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think you can say
 17 that either of those persons necessarily killed somebody
 18 else, but it either killed probably, or attempted to kill,
 19 because all that Myburgh says is, a shot was fired. He
 20 doesn't, he heard a shot fired - been fired. He doesn't
 21 say that someone died as a result of that. That is an
 22 inference that may be drawn. The other inference is, it
 23 may have been an attempted murder. But anyway, but it's
 24 not really material for the question you are asking, but I
 25 am just doing it for the purposes of making the record

Page 7815

1 correct.
 2 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, also for the same
 3 purposes, I must say that it's not Myburgh, it's the
 4 witness who said this involves a killing, which is why it
 5 was referred to IPID. 2) Myburgh says that the killer,
 6 alleged killer said, when he asked, "what are you doing?
 7 They deserve to die."
 8 CHAIRPERSON: Again that's consistent
 9 with an attempt to kill, but again, I assume that a
 10 policeman who attempts to kill somebody else, his case is
 11 also referred to IPID, so we don't have to spend extra time
 12 on that.
 13 MR MPOFU: I would assume so. For the
 14 sake of progress, I'll say "alleged killing." The real
 15 point is that Mr Madlanga had reduced it to a Constable
 16 Halam and a Constable Thafeni, remember that.
 17 GENERAL PHIYEGA: The matter has been
 18 dealt with, what's the question?
 19 MR MPOFU: That is the question, do you
 20 remember that?
 21 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I remember that.
 22 MR MPOFU: Ja, okay. Now, the - Halam,
 23 and maybe you can assist there, Halam doesn't sound like an
 24 African surname, does it?
 25 GENERALL PHIYEGA: I don't know.

Page 7816

1 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tokota tells there's an
 2 Adv Halam, he is a Xhosa gentleman. So I am not sure that
 3 the inference that you are seeking to draw is fact.
 4 MR MPOFU: I also know of an Adv Peter,
 5 who is a Xhosa, but that's by the way - the point I am
 6 making is that it doesn't sound -
 7 CHAIRPERSON: - investigation, thank you,
 8 Mr Mpofo.
 9 MR MPOFU: Thank you, anyway the only
 10 point I am making is that actually it's not even just
 11 about, it's not about race as such, it could have been the
 12 other one is tall, the other one is short, the other one is
 13 fat, the other one is thin, it doesn't matter. All, I am,
 14 the point I am making is that once it's been reduced to two
 15 people, it would be easy, either using their race, their
 16 height or whatever it is, to say to Myburgh, it's now
 17 between these two, and that might have jolted his memory,
 18 that's all. Would you agree? If you don't, you don't, and
 19 we'll move on.
 20 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I said that type of
 21 information is going to help IPID - referred to IPID.
 22 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, I am
 23 going to move to another topic, maybe it might be a
 24 convenient stage.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: Very well. We will take

Page 7817

1 the adjournment until 11:30 this morning.
 2 MR MPOFU: Thanks, Chair.
 3 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
 4 [11:35] CHAIRPERSON: The commission resumes.
 5 National Commissioner, you're still under oath. Mr Mpofu?
 6 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.
 7 General, now I'm going to, as I said in the morning, just
 8 step a little bit back and deal with some of the
 9 preliminary issues that – or rather complete some of the
 10 issues we dealt with yesterday which I'm sure you and I are
 11 going to agree on, at least initially. Now, what I propose
 12 to do is to outline for you – you know, there's this body
 13 of what I call the regulatory and policy framework and so
 14 on and which is a lot of documents and legislation. And
 15 what I've done is I've extracted some of what I think are
 16 the key principles and philosophies from those documents
 17 which I will be questioning you about, but I first want us
 18 to agree that those are – those can be distilled from the
 19 framework. Are we together?
 20 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I'm listening.
 21 MR MPOFU: Right. And we had started
 22 with some of this yesterday. In terms of the philosophical
 23 background of the policies and principles around crowd
 24 management which are mainly contained in FFF1, but also in
 25 other documents, you would agree with me as it is indicated

Page 7818

1 in the very first line of FF1, that those policies are
 2 deeply rooted in the socio-political changes that occurred
 3 in 1994. Agreed?
 4 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I'm working with you.
 5 MR MPOFU: Okay, I prefer instead of
 6 working with me, if you agree or not agree.
 7 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Perhaps my use of
 8 working with you is that it's a process. You are going to
 9 come to a point where you say this are this. So I am safer
 10 saying I am working with you.
 11 MR MPOFU: No, you are right, but for the
 12 sake of progress I think let's do it one by one, because
 13 then you might agree with three and the other two you
 14 don't, so let's rather do it one by one. So would you
 15 agree – okay, let me – I'll read it out. It says, the very
 16 first line of FF1, "As a result of the vast socio-political
 17 changes that have occurred in South Africa over the past
 18 few years many approaches, tactics, techniques must be
 19 developed", and so on and so on.
 20 GENERAL PHIYEGA: That helps.
 21 MR MPOFU: Okay, okay. So that's one of
 22 the principles. Oh, ja. And then another principle of the
 23 Foundation that can be distilled from this body of document
 24 is that it is steeped in the culture of fundamental rights
 25 and the constitutional principles, correct?

Page 7819

1 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Correct.
 2 MR MPOFU: And is it also correct that
 3 what it seeks to do, in a nutshell, it moves from a culture
 4 of crowd control to a culture of crowd management?
 5 GENERAL PHIYEGA: That is the spirit,
 6 yes.
 7 MR MPOFU: And would you also agree that
 8 very clearly what comes out of this and in particular even
 9 from the Act, the Regulation of Gatherings Act, is what one
 10 might call a new participatory spirit or ethos, in other
 11 words involving all stakeholders?
 12 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I would agree.
 13 MR MPOFU: And that another fundamental
 14 principle is the prevention, and I use that word advisably,
 15 the prevention of violence.
 16 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Just repeat that again.
 17 I didn't get it.
 18 MR MPOFU: Another key principle that we
 19 can distil from this body of policies and regulations is
 20 the prevention of violence.
 21 GENERAL PHIYEGA: The prevention of
 22 violence or management – or public, but I'm a little bit
 23 lost on that one, to say you prevent violence or do you
 24 manage violence what are you doing?
 25 CHAIRPERSON: Well, you try as far as you

Page 7820

1 can to ensure that there isn't violence, but that's if you
 2 can, obviously if you can't you then got to manage it, but
 3 you – but your first objective, perhaps one of the primary
 4 objectives is to prevent violence insofar as you can do so.
 5 That must be right, sorry.
 6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Okay. Let's agree and
 7 continue.
 8 MR MPOFU: Sorry?
 9 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I agree, let's
 10 continue.
 11 MR MPOFU: We are agreed? Okay. And
 12 just to assist you in total you may be hesitant, the – 2.3
 13 –
 14 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Ja, it's fine. We can
 15 continue.
 16 MR MPOFU: Page – no, well, I want to
 17 emphasise it. 2.3 says, "To accomplish the following
 18 ideals for crowd management situations", and then it says,
 19 "1. No loss of life", no loss of life. "2.3.1 No damage
 20 to property, 2.3.3 No injuries." And as the chairperson
 21 says obviously that's the goal. It doesn't mean it will
 22 always happen. Agreed?
 23 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Mm.
 24 MR MPOFU: Okay. And those are what I
 25 would call the foundational principles of the new approach.

Page 7821

1 And then to achieve this there seems to be an overemphasis,
 2 if it is possible, on communication, dialogue, accuracy of
 3 information. Do you agree?
 4 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I would agree.
 5 MR MPOFU: In fact, on that particular
 6 one at 4.2.2.5 of FFF1 it says, "The importance of constant
 7 two-way communication, negotiation and liaison among all
 8 relevant role-players cannot be overemphasised".
 9 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Okay.
 10 MR MPOFU: And then somewhere – I'm just
 11 reading random extracts – at 5.2.2 it says, "Even if
 12 problems arise the first step to solving them must still be
 13 continuous dialogue and communication". That's 5.2.2.
 14 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 15 MR MPOFU: Then 5.2.4 to 5.2.7 describes
 16 a warning and then a second warning and so on, so it's all
 17 pervasive, this need for constant communication, dialogue
 18 and information accuracy.
 19 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 20 MR MPOFU: Agreed? And then another very
 21 important principle which comes out and it comes out – this
 22 one comes out of the Constitution of the Republic. It
 23 appears in the legislation. It appears in your duties as
 24 they are outlined in the Constitution, actually as the very
 25 first one, and also from the policies, and that is the

Page 7822

1 principle of impartiality.
 2 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Correct.
 3 MR MPOFU: And that principle of
 4 impartiality you would agree means not taking sides in
 5 whatever the dispute might be there in society, but
 6 maintaining law and order and all those good things.
 7 GENERAL PHIYEGA: True.
 8 MR MPOFU: Sorry, that is true?
 9 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Hm.
 10 MR MPOFU: And another one is the
 11 promotion of tolerance on the part of the police. In fact,
 12 it goes even beyond what would be expected of tolerance, of
 13 you – not you and me because you are part of the police –
 14 but of an ordinary person in the sense that the passage
 15 that there's – even when you are being thrown with stones
 16 you must still be tolerant which could not be expected from
 17 an ordinary person. Would you agree with that?
 18 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 19 MR MPOFU: In other words it expects, it
 20 expects – let's put it this way, it expects more from a
 21 police official than it would from an ordinary citizen
 22 because I think I would complain as an ordinary citizen if
 23 someone was going to say to me, as they say in 3.3.5,
 24 "During an operation where individuals or crowds are
 25 hostile towards the police, verbal abuse, stone throwing,

Page 7823

1 etcetera should be tolerated in order to defuse the
 2 situation". So it expects more from the police. Agreed?
 3 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Hm-hm.
 4 MR MPOFU: Sorry, it doesn't record hm-
 5 hm.
 6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 7 MR MPOFU: Okay, and also that the – and
 8 we are going down to the last two or three now, very
 9 important - that these principles promote what they say is
 10 a gradualist approach from negotiation to defensive
 11 measures through to offensive measures.
 12 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 13 MR MPOFU: In that order – I'm sorry, I
 14 forgot to say that, in that order, in other words
 15 negotiation, defensive measures, offensive measures,
 16 escalating from negotiating to offensive measures. Agreed?
 17 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I note what you are
 18 saying.
 19 MR MPOFU: Okay. Ja. Alright, look,
 20 okay. When you say that I sense some reluctance, you'll
 21 forgive me. So then I'll read it out to you. At 5.2 it
 22 says, "The sub/POP policy towards crowd management will be
 23 one of a gradual build up from negotiation through to the
 24 implementation of defensive measures to the undertaking of
 25 offensive operations". Do you confirm that's the approach?

Page 7824

1 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes, I do note, it's
 2 policy.
 3 MR MPOFU: Do you agree that that is what
 4 comes out of this policy? It's one of the principles that
 5 one can extract from this policy.
 6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I have confirmed.
 7 MR MPOFU: Thank you. And lastly that
 8 this body of regulatory and policy principles prescribes
 9 the use of minimum force at various parts, or I think as
 10 you've put it, which I think is synonymous, no more force
 11 than is necessary. Would you agree with that?
 12 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 13 MR MPOFU: Right. Now, if as you have
 14 agreed I've put to those about ten of those principles and
 15 philosophies, if – and this is a big if – if it can be
 16 shown that the police breached any of these principles and
 17 philosophies that you and I have agreed on, you would agree
 18 that it would mean they have acted unlawfully or
 19 irregularly, at least against the spirit and letter of this
 20 – of the framework. Agreed?
 21 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think it would be a
 22 very difficult question to answer in a very definite cut
 23 and dry manner, because you've referred to a lot of things.
 24 And for each of those it would be helpful to take an issue,
 25 relate it to the matter, look at the circumstances around

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7825</p> <p>1 in that one, and then deal with an outcome for that. It 2 can't just be a blanket thing. I think it would be very 3 not fair for both me and you to approach it that way. 4 MR MPOFU: Okay. Okay, I'll put it even 5 more clearly or at least try to assist you. You and I have 6 agreed on ten principles that symbolise crowd management in 7 the – in democratic South Africa. 8 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes. 9 MR MPOFU: I'm saying now, you can pick 10 any one, if one, so that we don't have this blanket thing 11 about the ten, if the police have breached one of those 12 principles, would you agree that that would be acting 13 unlawfully or at the very worst against – 14 CHAIRPERSON: I don't think you can ask 15 the witness for her opinion of the law. 16 MR MPOFU: Okay. 17 CHAIRPERSON: You can ask, I suppose, 18 whether it's contrary to the spirit of the – 19 MR MPOFU: Indeed. 20 CHAIRPERSON: - or something of that 21 nature, but it's not for her to testify to what the law is, 22 and it's not appropriate for you to put questions of law to 23 her. That will be a matter for argument. 24 MR MPOFU: I accept that, Chairperson. 25 If one of those principles can be shown to have been</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7827</p> <p>1 things you have said the input from both sides, the, this 2 one has put their side and they've been evaluated and so on 3 and so on, if it is found that the police have breached one 4 of these principles then such remedial action would be in 5 order. Correct? 6 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semanya. 7 [11:55] MR SEMENYA SC: One has allowed all these 8 hypothetical questions, but if the commissioner were to 9 make a finding, what would then happen? One, the witness 10 has answered to it, but secondly surely it depends on 11 whether that finding is correct on the evidence and I don't 12 know whether we should necessarily at this point, one, make 13 a contemplation and the finding will be made, one. 14 Secondly, that it will be a finding that is consistent with 15 the evidence, thirdly, that is one that will be embraced 16 necessarily as corrective in its nature. 17 CHAIRPERSON: I thought you answered 18 yesterday, that if we were to find – there are various 19 possibilities we could find in favour of the police, 20 alternatively we could find against the police on certain 21 aspects. In that event, I think she indicated they would 22 consider, she and her colleagues, would consider our 23 findings. If they agreed with them, they would accept 24 them. If they didn't agree, they couldn't appeal. And if 25 there civil litigation thereafter, in effect based on our</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7826</p> <p>1 breached by the police, would you agree that certain steps 2 and remedial action would have to be taken? 3 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Of those ten principles 4 that you have mentioned I have said to you just in my 5 previous answer that they would need to be tested and then 6 we would – I'd make – 7 MR MPOFU: I accept that. 8 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Okay, and the one who's 9 alleging makes their own principles – their own input. And 10 in most of the instances it would be circumstances from 11 both sides, and somebody who is as neutral as the judge 12 probably will then say, looking at this debate, which way 13 is it going? And if he is fair and rational, that both 14 parties, whatever the outcome, remedies would have to be 15 looked into. 16 MR MPOFU: Yes, I think you've answered 17 the question at the end, ja. I was just going to say, yes, 18 assume all that has happened, the input, the what have you, 19 both sides, all that has happened, and then it is – but 20 you've answered, which I'll take as a yes. 21 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Advocate, I think just 22 take my answer as it is. Don't try and narrow it. I think 23 that explanation is important to me. 24 MR MPOFU: Okay, well, then I have no 25 option but to ask you the question again. If after all the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7828</p> <p>1 findings, and they thought our findings were wrong, they 2 would defend the civil litigation, I understood that to be 3 the argument. She also said she can't say at this stage 4 what she'd do, before she's seen our report, she won't know 5 whether she agrees with it, and whether there's a basis for 6 departing from it or accepting it. That was the evidence 7 she gave yesterday. I don't understand Mr Mpofu quite to 8 be dealing with that at this stage – 9 MR MPOFU: Then you understand me 10 correctly, Chair. 11 CHAIRPERSON: Perhaps you could rephrase 12 it. I mean basically your point is that if it appears, 13 after a full investigation, that the standing orders and 14 the applicable principle has not been applied, if that 15 appears, I presume you would have to accept, to the police, 16 not just because we say so, because we may be wrong. 17 Obviously we'll try not to be, but we may be, but if they 18 are satisfied that prima facie there'd been a breach of the 19 relevant prescripts, they will take some action. I think 20 that's your question, and I'd be surprised if she said they 21 wouldn't, but anyway let's see whether I'm in for a 22 surprise or not. 23 MR MPOFU: Yes, I have been surprised 24 before, Chair. 25 CHAIRPERSON: Do you understand, National</p>

Page 7829

1 Commissioner? The point is, if, after this whole exercise,
 2 all these matters have been looked at, it seems that the
 3 prescripts haven't been complied with, some of them have
 4 been complied with, and not because we say so, but because
 5 – because we could be wrong, but because you, having
 6 considered what we have to say, agree that that is so, then
 7 some remedial action would be taken. I take it that's a
 8 fair proposition to put.

9 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I thought I've answered
 10 that, Judge, but I will say the outcome positive or
 11 negative will have to be embraced. Where there are needs
 12 for remedies that will be taken care of.

13 MR MPOFU: And if individuals are found
 14 to have been responsible for those breaches, right through
 15 the chain, then there should be consequences and heads must
 16 roll, correct? Given the fact that so many lives have been
 17 lost and so on.

18 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Advocate, because of
 19 the circumstantial nature of these things, I'm comfortable
 20 in just saying relevant remedies will be looked into,
 21 because what gives me a problem, if you just - just jump in
 22 here and say heads shall roll, really it's not a fair – you
 23 start from a prejudgement, you start from a very wrong, I
 24 would say relevant remedies.

25 MR MPOFU: No, I'm happy with that.

Page 7830

1 Relevant remedies, including but not limited to the rolling
 2 of heads, where necessary.

3 GENERAL PHIYEGA: That is yours,
 4 Advocate, it's not mine, I really don't want to ascribe to
 5 that.

6 MR MPOFU: Well, as far as the police
 7 officials are concerned, at least, the law is very clear.
 8 Firstly, do you understand that what are called standing
 9 orders, the standing is just an adjective, but they are
 10 orders like any other order, they just happen to be
 11 standing orders, but they the same as saying go and pick up
 12 that thing and so on, they are orders in the police lingo,
 13 so to speak, language, sorry.

14 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Depending on what you
 15 are talking about, standing orders, they are guidelines,
 16 there are instructions, they are all those things.

17 MR MPOFU: Okay, well fortunately this
 18 thing I'm going to read to you covers both. Section 47 of
 19 the South African Police Act says, "Subject to sub-section
 20 2 a member," which includes you and all the people who
 21 report to you, "shall obey any order or instruction given
 22 to him or her by a superior or a person who is competent to
 23 do so, provided that a member shall not obey a patently
 24 unlawful order or instruction. So it doesn't matter
 25 whether it's an instruction or an order. All I'm saying is

Page 7831

1 that as far as members of SAPS are concerned, the
 2 disobedience of a standing order is covered by what I've
 3 just read, do you -

4 GENERAL PHIYEGA: You are right and being
 5 a lawyer, that's why talk about circumstantial evidence and
 6 all those issues, all those aspects are taken into account.

7 MR MPOFU: Alright. And therefore
 8 bearing now what I've read to you in mind, and going back
 9 to what we said earlier, if any member of the police is
 10 found to have breached the standing orders, then
 11 consequences should follow, including but not limited to
 12 the rolling of heads, given the magnitude of what happened
 13 here.

14 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I'll again exclude the
 15 rolling of heads –

16 MR MPOFU: Exclude?

17 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Because I don't want to
 18 talk to – I said relevant remedies, I don't want to use
 19 your words of rolling of heads. And my acceptance of what
 20 you are saying is also taking into account to say, indeed,
 21 they have to follow standing orders, but when you charge
 22 any person and have a hearing, all circumstances are taken
 23 into account. It's not just a straight line, and that's
 24 why I'm saying you, as lawyer, would understand better when
 25 you talk about circumstantial evidence.

Page 7832

1 MR MPOFU: Okay, that's good, that's good
 2 enough. So at the very least those people would be
 3 charged, and as you are trying to say now, there may or may
 4 not be found to have been guilty, but if they are would
 5 heads roll, given the magnitude of this.

6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think I've answered
 7 that question, I can't answer it further.

8 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya.

9 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the witness has
 10 repeatedly said she's not going to use that phrase, which
 11 are sound byte phrases, she says the relevant remedial
 12 interventions will follow.

13 CHAIRPERSON: Even if a member is found
 14 guilty, in a disciplinary hearing, of failing to comply
 15 with an order, be it a standing order or any other kind of
 16 order, I take it there are no compulsory or minimum
 17 sentences which are applicable, and in each case would be
 18 the appropriate penalty, if there's a conviction at a
 19 disciplinary hearing, would dependant on all the
 20 circumstances. Is that effectively what you're saying?

21 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I'm absolutely saying
 22 that, and I'm saying those remedial – relevant remedial
 23 steps would, you know, sentence or whatever, would be
 24 taken, relevant, I want to keep to that.

25 CHAIRPERSON: I think what Mr Mpofo is

Page 7833

1 saying that obviously, depending on the seriousness of the
 2 matter, if it was very serious, those steps might well
 3 include the dismissal of the appointment of the member. In
 4 other words, the member would effectively be ejected from
 5 the police service, if the case was serious enough to
 6 justify that, and I think that's just the point he's
 7 putting, and I take it you'd agree with that, because in
 8 other words, the appropriate penalty would vary from I'm
 9 presuming something like a caution all the way up to
 10 dismissal from the service. And he uses – discharge is the
 11 correct word, he uses the unhappy phrase rolling of heads,
 12 which connotes aspects of capital punishment that we turned
 13 our back on, but he's really talking about a whole range of
 14 sentences from a caution all the way up to a discharge.
 15 That must be so, and it would always depend upon a thorough
 16 consideration of all the relevant circumstances, is that
 17 correct?
 18 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Judge, I'd like to keep
 19 – you know, with all the things that you said, I'd like to
 20 – particularly that you talk of a range, being the leader
 21 that I am, I'm comfortable in just saying relevant
 22 remedial, whether it's low or high, it covers whatever else
 23 that has to be there. I'm comfortable in saying that.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: As Mr Mpofo would say, I
 25 think we can take that as a yes, albeit a qualified one.

Page 7834

1 MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you. I think that
 2 deals with the situation of the internal disciplinary
 3 issues. Now, if, as a result of such breach –
 4 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Can I just say
 5 something here?
 6 MR MPOFU: Yes, Ma'am.
 7 GENERAL PHIYEGA: You just spoke about
 8 the significance of my role and the image I portray. I
 9 don't want to be seen with look like someone who's having
 10 an axe and hacking everyone who is alive.
 11 MR MPOFU: Yes, but if there has been a
 12 due process and the hacking is justified, I'm sure you
 13 won't hesitate –
 14 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, Mr Mpofo, the point
 15 is that whole expression of rolling of heads is actually
 16 inappropriate in this context. I know you're speaking
 17 metaphorically –
 18 MR MPOFU: It's a figure of speech.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: I know it's a figure of
 20 speech, but the witness is uncomfortable with it, and I
 21 think we must respect that. Anyway, but on points of
 22 substance, I don't understand there to be a significant
 23 difference between the two of you.
 24 MR MPOFU: No, actually we are agreeing,
 25 Chairperson, and I was just saying that that deals

Page 7835

1 satisfactorily with the issue of the internal disciplinary
 2 proceedings that have been postulated by the Chairperson.
 3 Now, I'm asking you a different question, which is if, as a
 4 result of the same breaches, members are found guilty in a
 5 court of law in criminal proceedings, then those members
 6 would be discharged. Let's put it nicely, correct?
 7 CHAIRPERSON: Wouldn't it depend on what
 8 they were found guilty of? You can't – merely because they
 9 were found guilty of riding a bicycle without a light after
 10 sunset, that wouldn't mean they would be discharged, it
 11 would surely depend on the nature of the charge.
 12 MR MPOFU: Funnily enough, that is not
 13 the law, Chairperson, but the part that I've left out is if
 14 they're found guilty and they - and sentenced to a term of
 15 imprisonment without the option of fine, for whatever, then
 16 they would be discharged, correct?
 17 GENERAL PHIYEGA: In terms of the
 18 agreements that we have also, I do have the capacity to
 19 condone certain things.
 20 MR MPOFU: No, you don't. Okay, let me
 21 tell you, under Section 36.1 of the Police Act, "a member
 22 who is convicted of an offense and is sentenced to a term
 23 of imprisonment without the option of a fine shall be
 24 deemed to have been discharged from the service, with
 25 effect from the date, following the date upon such

Page 7836

1 sentence, provided that if such a term of imprisonment is
 2 wholly substandard, the member concerned shall not be
 3 deemed to have been so discharged –
 4 CHAIRPERSON: Do you understand the
 5 point? If somebody is convicted in court and given a jail
 6 sentence which is not suspended, he or she can't continue
 7 to be a member of the police service in the prison cell,
 8 and there's an automatic discharge from the imposition of
 9 the sentence. That's what this Section says.
 10 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: It doesn't appear, unless
 12 there's another section that counsel hasn't quoted, that
 13 there's a section that says that notwithstanding all of
 14 that, you can undo that by administrative - from your
 15 office.
 16 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I understand that, but
 17 I was starting from what you mentioned earlier on, to say
 18 it depends on what has happened to that person. If I'm
 19 found guilty of maybe reckless driving, and I'm charged,
 20 and I don't have those things, I can condone it, even if
 21 there's a criminal charge, there are certain things that
 22 allows me to look at the nature of the crime, and I can
 23 condone some things, but the one that you are talking about
 24 it's probably different, I was starting from where the
 25 Judge was starting and linking to what you are saying to

Page 7837

1 say, in terms of certain agreements for disciplinary, there
 2 are things that can be condoned, but the one, if the
 3 condition is like that, indeed it's the law, we'll have to
 4 go with it.

5 CHAIRPERSON: You can't be member of the
 6 police service and in the police service a prisoner at the
 7 same time? Those two things are incompatible.

8 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes, but I'm saying,
 9 Judge, and I'm found –

10 CHAIRPERSON: If you're driving and
 11 you're charged with reckless driving and you're convicted
 12 and the Magistrate sentences you to a year without
 13 suspension at all, and no fine, then I'm afraid your
 14 position as Commissioner of Police will come to an end from
 15 the time the sentence is imposed, because you can't be
 16 commissioner of police and in a cell in Pollsmoor.

17 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think you are missing
 18 my input. Can I try and put it again? The law as it
 19 stands, as he reads it, if it is true, but I'm saying if I
 20 am criminally charged and there is maybe a file given to
 21 me, some of the prescripts would say you should not have a
 22 criminal charge, but as a commissioner, I can look at that
 23 to say, oh he didn't have a fine, and what did he do?
 24 These type of things. What else? He's been a good police
 25 person. Actually there are certain provisions that I can

Page 7838

1 condone, that's all what I'm saying.

2 CHAIRPERSON: Pity, the Section doesn't
 3 deal with situation. Even if a person is given a prison
 4 sentence which is totally suspended, presumably you would
 5 have the power to do that in an appropriate case, depending
 6 on all the circumstances.

7 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I agree. I'm not
 8 arguing this section, Judge, I'm saying he asked the
 9 question, I went back to your question earlier on to say it
 10 depends on what the charge is, and I was talking to that it
 11 depends on what the charge is, and I'm talking to say some
 12 of the charges I can condone.

13 MR MPOFU: Okay, I'll move on, but do
 14 remember that I prefaced my question by saying we've now
 15 finished with the disciplinary issue that the Chair talk
 16 about, let's talk about something else, remember that?
 17 Sorry, do you remember that?

18 GENERAL PHIYEGA: That we have – we are
 19 finished with the things that I can condone.

20 [12:15] MR MPOFU: No, do you remember that I had
 21 said to preface my question after the discussion in which
 22 the Judge had participated. Let's now put that aside and
 23 deal with something else about criminal charges. Alright,
 24 now I just want to ask you about whether you agree with the
 25 approach that is favoured in, I think it's FFF13, FFF13

Page 7839

1 which is the National Planning Committee report which was
 2 that was referred to earlier by Mr Mahlanga, but I'm going
 3 to refer you to a different section. It's FFF13, page 293.
 4 For the sake of saving time, I will just read it out
 5 quickly, and if you forgive me I will jump around because
 6 it's quite a long section, so I will jump certain parts but
 7 I will tell you when I do so.

8 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sure the witness has
 9 the relevant page in front of her.

10 MR MPOFU: Yes, okay let me first say
 11 this -

12 CHAIRPERSON: The interpreter is looking
 13 for the page.

14 MR MPOFU: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON: When he has found it -

16 MR MPOFU: Yes, I just wanted to assist,
 17 Chair, in that exercise. The odd numbers –

18 CHAIRPERSON: 192 has a picture two
 19 ladies, one member of the force and a civilian I take it at
 20 the foot of the page, and the following page 393 who hasn't
 21 got a page number on it, but it's got a reference on the
 22 right hand side to an integrated approach to building
 23 safety. Have you got that page in front of you? Right,
 24 now you can carry on, Mr Mpofu.

25 MR MPOFU: Thank you, now it's a long

Page 7840

1 page which is 393, I'm going to start reading parts of, the
 2 heading an integrated approach to building safety. Then I
 3 will tell you when I jump. The second sentence there or
 4 the first one, "in discussing crime, the danger is to focus
 5 on policing as the only solution it is necessary to move
 6 from a narrow law enforcement approach to crime and safety,
 7 to identifying and resolving the root causes of crime. To
 8 achieve this, South Africa will have to mobilise state and
 9 non-state capacities at all levels which requires an
 10 integrated approach with active citizen involvement and
 11 core responsibility."

12 Then I jump to a quotation of the World Bank
 13 study that is in the next paragraph, which starts "a study
 14 by the World Bank in 2010 confirmed that quote. There has
 15 been a growing consensus amongst policy makers that
 16 violence is not simply a security issue but that it has
 17 deep social and economic roots and consequences. An
 18 effective and efficient response to violent crime requires
 19 a holistic approach to community safety that takes causes
 20 of crime into consideration and response to specific causal
 21 factors", and then I'm just jumping to the next page. The
 22 first bullet where it says, "underlying the root causes
 23 such as poverty, inequality, unemployment and a variety of
 24 temptations and motivations to engage in criminal activity
 25 should be addressed. Although research have shown the

Page 7841

1 complex relationships among these sectors, it is clear that
 2 the higher their confluence, the more motivated people are
 3 to commit criminal offences." Yes, I'm sure you can read
 4 it with your own time, but you get the gist that this seems
 5 to promote an approach that deals with root causes, rather
 6 than simply viewing something as a security matter, so to
 7 speak. Agreed?
 8 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes, I do.
 9 MR MPOFU: Now in view of that approach
 10 which you and I agree with, would you agree that this
 11 conflict that we are dealing with here, the conflict that
 12 happened in Marikana before the massacre, that it also was
 13 not uni-dimensional and as I have said to you yesterday,
 14 there is no point denying that it had a law enforcement
 15 element to it. But to view solely as a law enforcement
 16 issue, would be missing the approach that seems to be
 17 advanced by the National Planning Commission. Agreed?
 18 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, Mr Mpofu, uses
 19 very long sentences, embedded in them are words like
 20 massacre and it would be pitiful if the answer to the
 21 question is reinterpreted to say the commission agreed to
 22 the massacre component of the question.
 23 MR MPOFU: Okay, Chairperson, fair
 24 enough. Yes I know, well everyone else refers it like
 25 that, but I know in SAPS it's called the tragedy. The

Page 7842

1 tragedy.
 2 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I think in responding
 3 to you because you have read a long thing, you have gone
 4 through your documents that is future looking, that is
 5 aspirational, the preferred approach as you have put it,
 6 and I have already said in this commission that it's
 7 something we would be embracing to look as we go forward.
 8 That's one. Secondly, I just want to say the nature of our
 9 intervention you know is the end of the line thing. Events
 10 have taken place. What has gone through the pipeline,
 11 whether there hasn't been intervention by all these
 12 socioeconomic dynamics are things that are input into that
 13 pipeline. As police we are catching that thing, the
 14 violence or whatever is happening. A lot of intervention
 15 from a safety and security point of view is situational
 16 around that. Even the negotiations are not looking at
 17 whether people are being paid or whether people are being
 18 given accommodation or we are dealing with the issues. The
 19 negotiations would be with the issues that is presenting.
 20 So our view of the matter from a safety and security point
 21 of view is influenced by that because it is happening. You
 22 have to act, it is a here and now issue. So I do
 23 understand what you are saying and I agree with but I'm
 24 just saying our intervention is based on what is happening
 25 here and now. End of the pipeline.

Page 7843

1 MR MPOFU: Okay, well I'm glad that we
 2 agree. I thought we would because my reading, and correct
 3 me if I'm wrong, was that the police viewed the events, at
 4 least leading up to the 16th as at the minimum, two
 5 dimensional, as the labour dispute that is there but also
 6 as the law enforcement issue and that is why they said look
 7 we won't deal with the labour issue because we don't have
 8 the expertise, but that at least they viewed it as such. I
 9 didn't think that you would have a problem with that.
 10 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure what you are
 11 putting is correct. My understanding is, that firstly the
 12 police did negotiate and try to solve the problem by
 13 negotiation. But secondly, as far as the police attitude
 14 is concerned before this commission, I think it was clear
 15 from Mr Semanya's opening statement that the police say
 16 that they, that Lonmin are also subject to criticism and
 17 that Lonmin, there is a passage towards the end of the
 18 opening.
 19 MR MPOFU: That's exactly the point.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Where they say that, I'm
 21 trying to find it at the moment but they do say in terms
 22 that they criticised Lonmin -
 23 MR MPOFU: Yes, severely.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: For doing and not doing
 25 the, it's paragraph 58 of the statement.

Page 7844

1 MR MPOFU: Mm.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: So therefore I think what
 3 you put to the witness which ignores that aspect of the
 4 matter isn't entirely accurate but it's now 4 minutes to go
 5 before half past, I indicated to you we have to adjourn at
 6 half past, so either you can round this point off in four
 7 minutes or you can return to it on the morning of the 16th.
 8 MR MPOFU: No, Chairperson, well I think
 9 on the morning of the 16th we will have forgotten that what
 10 you have just put to me, Chairperson is not what -
 11 CHAIRPERSON: So you can make a note of
 12 it now to remind you on the morning, Mr Mpofu.
 13 MR MPOFU: Yes. Well I think it's much
 14 more efficiently dealt with right now. What you are
 15 saying, Chairperson, is exactly the point I'm making.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Okay.
 17 MR MPOFU: So I don't see the inaccuracy.
 18 I'm simply saying it's exactly because of that attitude of
 19 the police, exactly because General Mpembe said in so many
 20 words look I'm going to deal with the law enforcement
 21 issues, and I expect you people to deal with the other
 22 issues. That confirms what I'm putting to the witness,
 23 that not in the future, but already the police have taken
 24 the attitude that something like this had to be looked at
 25 in its entirety and including the law enforcement element

Page 7845

1 which we cannot deny but also the other aspects. That's
 2 all. Agreed?
 3 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I will try again
 4 because I think we are not agreeing.
 5 MR MPOFU: Oh.
 6 GENERAL PHIYEGA: I have said to you,
 7 that what I see here is an aspirational thing indeed. At
 8 the end of the pipeline, I said it's a here and now issue,
 9 what is happening now. We have an illegal march. We have
 10 people who are having work problems. There is all this
 11 commotion between police and the people. What contributes
 12 to that could have been a ten year issue, a 15 year issue
 13 and that's the problem I'm talking about. To say what you
 14 deal with as the police, is the here and now. When I get
 15 to a home and somebody's shack is beaten up, I don't know
 16 how this relationship has gone for many years. The end of
 17 the pipeline for the police is that an issue is happening,
 18 you are called to intervene. Those last days, Advocate
 19 Mpofo, could not have taken all these issues that you are
 20 talking about into account. They will form the backdrop of
 21 your thinking but your intervention as a police person is
 22 what is happening at that point in time. It's very
 23 reactive. It's not proactive at all, and maybe if I may
 24 just also say, there is very little that you can do about
 25 all those things that contributed towards that, you can

Page 7846

1 understand them but as a police person there isn't much you
 2 can do.
 3 MR MPOFU: Okay, we will deal with that
 4 issue on the 16th because you haven't answered my question,
 5 as you correctly say, maybe there is a misunderstanding.
 6 Maybe there is, maybe there isn't, we will see. Can I just
 7 ask you, because we don't have time now, whether you have
 8 read the IPID reports and statements which were taken
 9 principally from the victims and also from police
 10 officials?
 11 GENERAL PHIYEGA: No -
 12 MR MPOFU: In the course of your trying
 13 to understand this matter, sorry.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: I thought she said no, is
 15 that correct?
 16 GENERAL PHIYEGA: Yes.
 17 MR MPOFU: Sorry, I interrupted her.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: I think that is a
 19 convenient point for us to take the adjournment.
 20 MR MPOFU: No, Chair, just one please,
 21 just one more flowing from that. The reason why I'm asking
 22 that question is when we come back on the 16th I'm going to
 23 be dealing with some of the issues that comes from those
 24 statements. So if you can take advantage of the ten days
 25 that, between now and then, it's a little bit of homework,

Page 7847

1 I know you are busy. But could you kindly have a look at
 2 the IPID documentation in the period?
 3 CHAIRPERSON: You did say you would tell
 4 her things that you were dealing with next time. So she
 5 could prepare which you have now done. Of course, on the
 6 morning of the 16th as I see it, we will probably, no we
 7 won't probably, we will return to the question of your
 8 application for removal of the seat of the commission, and
 9 as far as I know, no replying affidavits have yet been
 10 filed in answer to the opposing affidavits filed by the
 11 royal family and the neighbouring municipalities but I take
 12 it that will all be done, so we will be able to deal
 13 promptly on the morning of the 16th with a resumption of the
 14 argument in respect of the proposed move.
 15 MR MPOFU: Yes. Yes, Chairperson.
 16 Chairperson, okay I'm going to ask for one indulgence which
 17 I'm not very optimistic I'm going to get, but before I do
 18 that can I just address the issue you have raised. Yes,
 19 Chairperson, at this stage the position is that on the 16th
 20 we will start with that argument and at this stage our
 21 instructions are to draft such an affidavit. However,
 22 there still remains a possibility that we might take the
 23 view that the matter can be argued on the papers as they
 24 stand, but should that be the case we will talk to the
 25 other colleagues. But the indulgence I was seeking, Chair,

Page 7848

1 please if I could just read out to the witness -
 2 CHAIRPERSON: I indicated that there were
 3 reasons why we had to stop at half 12.
 4 MR MPOFU: Yes.
 5 CHAIRPERSON: And did give ample warning
 6 of that.
 7 MR MPOFU: Yes.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: And it's now beyond half
 9 part 12. So anything you want -
 10 MR MPOFU: No, it's for the benefit of
 11 the witness not for me.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: You can give it privately
 13 to the witness between now and the 16th. We will now take
 14 the adjournment until 10 o'clock on the morning of the 16th.
 15 MR MPOFU: I will do so.
 16 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED]
 17 .
 18 .
 19 .
 20 .
 21 .
 22 .
 23 .
 24 .
 25 .

A	<p>admits 7792:24 admitted 7775:4 Adv 7800:13 7816:2,4 advanced 7841:17 advantage 7793:1 7846:24 adverse 7782:7 advisably 7819:14 advocate 7798:21 7801:25 7804:25 7813:14 7826:21 7829:18 7830:4 7845:18 affidavit 7847:21 affidavits 7847:9,10 afraid 7837:13 Africa 7818:17 7825:7 7840:8 African 7815:24 7830:19 agree 7779:21,25 7780:11,16,22 7781:7 7781:11 7782:3,19 7783:10 7789:14 7790:5,10 7807:12 7813:11,22 7814:10 7816:18 7817:11,18 7817:25 7818:6,6,13 7818:15 7819:7,12 7820:6,9 7821:3,4 7822:4,17 7824:3,11 7824:17 7825:12 7826:1 7827:24 7829:6 7833:7 7838:7 7838:24 7841:10,10 7842:23 7843:2 agreed 7780:9 7814:13 7818:3 7820:11,22 7821:20 7823:2,16 7824:14,17,20 7825:6 7827:23 7841:7,17,21 7845:2 agreeing 7834:24 7845:4 agreements 7835:18 7837:1 agrees 7828:5 albeit 7833:25 alerted 7810:14 alight 7778:2 alive 7834:10 allegation 7803:13 7809:18 7810:11,21 7812:8 allegations 7794:4 7809:21 7810:9,15,18 7810:24 7812:25 alleged 7798:20 7799:1 7815:6,14 alleging 7826:9 allowed 7812:7 7827:7 allows 7836:22 alright 7774:21 7775:19 7777:3 7798:7 7805:17 7823:19 7831:7</p>	<p>7838:23 alternatively 7827:20 altitude 7814:3 amount 7773:6 7780:19 ample 7848:5 ander 7801:8 annexure 7791:21 answer 7796:25 7806:10 7807:2 7809:17,22 7810:6,8 7810:17 7812:7,10,23 7824:22 7826:5,22 7832:7 7841:20 7847:10 answered 7780:21 7806:10 7826:16,20 7827:10,17 7829:9 7832:6 7846:4 answers 7793:3 anyway 7795:6 7804:9 7804:9 7814:23 7816:9 7828:21 7834:21 apologise 7811:15 apologised 7805:20 appeal 7827:24 appear 7790:21 7797:13 7836:11 appears 7795:12 7821:23,23 7828:12 7828:15 applicable 7828:14 7832:17 application 7847:8 applied 7828:14 apply 7773:14 appointment 7833:3 appreciate 7798:22 approach 7820:25 7823:10,25 7825:3 7838:25 7839:22 7840:2,6,10,19 7841:5,9,16 7842:5 approaches 7818:18 appropriate 7825:22 7832:18 7833:8 7838:5 APRIL 7773:1 area 7783:18 7788:18 7788:24 7790:15 7793:12 aren't 7782:25 argue 7780:17,24 7781:6 7784:9 7798:12 7799:12 7804:19 7806:3,6,7 argued 7787:1 7847:23 arguing 7838:8 argument 7784:12 7787:9 7795:6 7798:12 7803:25 7825:23 7828:3 7847:14,20 arms 7783:25 7784:10 7784:22,25 7789:8,8</p>	<p>7789:12,24,25 7790:7 7791:4,17 7799:12,14 arrival 7796:4 arrive 7785:9,9 7790:18,22,23 arrived 7787:25 7788:1 7788:20 7789:7 7790:2 7791:3,4,6,7 7795:17 arrives 7785:15 ascribe 7830:4 aside 7838:22 asked 7791:3 7794:24 7795:2 7806:19 7807:3 7810:4 7811:10,23,24 7815:6 7838:8 asking 7795:21 7805:21 7810:22 7814:24 7835:3 7846:21 asks 7795:15 aspect 7787:8 7844:3 aspects 7827:21 7831:6 7833:12 7845:1 aspirational 7842:5 7845:7 assesses 7786:25 assist 7802:8,21 7808:19,20 7815:23 7820:12 7825:5 7839:16 assistant 7782:17 assume 7789:4,19,23 7815:9,13 7826:18 assumes 7800:6 assuming 7808:8 assumption 7790:3 assurance 7776:4 assured 7776:4 attack 7781:16 attempt 7782:6 7815:9 attempted 7814:18,23 attempts 7815:10 attended 7795:23,25 attitude 7843:13 7844:18,24 audience 7811:8 auditorium 7774:1,6 August 7773:24 authority 7802:15 automatic 7836:8 avoiding 7796:5 aware 7810:23 axe 7834:10</p>	<p>background 7808:3 7817:23 Bank 7840:12,14 based 7782:14 7784:16 7800:18 7806:20 7827:25 7842:24 basically 7828:12 basis 7781:12 7782:18 7783:19 7787:2,8 7807:1 7828:5 bear 7813:7 bearing 7831:8 beaten 7845:15 bed 7773:9 behave 7811:9 believe 7800:18 benefit 7848:10 better 7774:25 7831:24 beyond 7822:12 7848:8 bicycle 7835:9 big 7824:15 bind 7785:22 7803:25 binding 7793:22 bit 7817:8 7819:22 7846:25 blanket 7825:2,10 bo 7801:9 boat 7793:24 bodies 7776:13,23 7779:10 body 7776:15 7777:6,7 7777:23,24 7778:1,5 7778:6,12,13,20,21 7779:6 7784:16 7801:8 7802:25 7803:1 7808:6 7817:12 7818:23 7819:19 7824:8 borne 7786:2,24 bottom 7774:23 7775:5 7775:8,17 breach 7828:18 7834:3 breached 7824:16 7825:11 7826:1 7827:3 7831:10 breaches 7829:14 7835:4 break 7773:14 Breed 7799:5,7,8 7800:4,20 7802:7 7803:7,16 Breidt 7791:21 brings 7798:23 broader 7802:17 brought 7786:3 build 7823:23 building 7839:22 7840:2 bullet 7840:22 busy 7847:1 byte 7832:11</p>
B	<p>B 7790:1 back 7773:8,9,15 7776:21 7781:18,20 7783:5 7792:12,13 7802:11 7805:19 7817:8 7831:8 7833:13 7838:9 7846:22 backdrop 7845:20</p>	B	C	
			<p>call 7784:21 7817:13 7819:10 7820:25 called 7791:22 7830:8</p>	

<p>7841:25 7845:18 calls 7781:22 canvassed 7798:25 can't 7787:11 7788:9 7789:15,17,20 7790:16 7793:6 7804:15 7820:2 7825:2 7828:3 7832:7 7835:8 7836:6 7837:5 7837:15 capacities 7840:9 capacity 7835:18 capital 7833:12 Captain 7775:5 7787:25 7788:21 7791:2,14 7795:14,16 7795:23 7796:1 7797:12,20 care 7829:12 carefully 7781:17 carry 7803:18 7811:11 7812:22 7839:24 case 7781:23 7782:2 7783:7 7792:20 7796:12,14 7809:20 7810:17 7813:2,8,15 7815:10 7832:17 7833:5 7838:5 7847:24 cases 7809:17 catching 7842:13 categorical 7809:9 causal 7784:20 7840:20 caused 7780:9 7809:19 causes 7774:2 7840:7 7840:19,22 7841:5 caution 7833:9,14 cell 7836:7 7837:16 certain 7773:22 7813:19 7826:1 7827:20 7835:19 7836:21 7837:1,25 7839:6 certainly 7787:1 7788:2 7803:21 7804:2 chain 7829:15 Chair 7777:17 7778:18 7785:13 7787:25 7788:14,15 7790:14 7794:16 7795:11 7798:8,15 7799:4 7804:7,11,12 7807:13 7810:17 7811:6,14 7817:2 7828:10,24 7832:9 7838:15 7839:17 7841:18 7846:20 7847:25 challenged 7774:17 chance 7804:20 chances 7799:12 changes 7818:2,17 changing 7805:18 charge 7831:21 7835:11 7836:21 7837:22 7838:10,11</p>	<p>charged 7832:3 7836:19 7837:11,20 charges 7838:12,23 checked 7803:1 circulated 7806:23 circumstances 7787:6 7824:25 7826:10 7831:22 7832:20 7833:16 7838:6 circumstantial 7829:19 7831:5,25 citizen 7822:21,22 7840:10 civil 7827:25 7828:2 civilian 7839:19 clarify 7794:16 clear 7783:22 7793:10 7798:16 7809:9 7830:7 7841:1 7843:14 clearest 7775:15 clearly 7775:8,20 7819:8 7825:5 clips 7773:23 7774:3,6 7796:14,16 close 7773:25 7786:23 7804:24 7807:8 closed 7803:18,21,22 7804:3,4,22 7805:22 7807:5 clothes 7801:17 7802:12 clothing 7800:5 colleague 7795:20 colleagues 7809:1 7827:22 7847:25 come 7773:9 7785:8 7805:19 7809:10 7818:9 7837:14 7846:22 comes 7803:8 7819:8 7821:21,21,22 7824:4 7846:23 comfortable 7829:19 7833:21,23 commission 7773:2 7775:23 7783:15 7788:3 7789:6 7791:2 7794:7 7803:21 7804:9,24 7805:15,15 7810:2 7811:22 7817:3,3,4 7841:17 7841:21 7842:6 7843:14 7847:8 7848:16 commissioned 7785:20 7805:2 commissioner 7773:3 7781:10 7787:12 7790:20 7791:1,9 7794:2,3 7797:8 7798:18 7803:13,20 7803:23 7804:16,22 7806:4 7808:24 7813:6 7817:5 7827:8 7829:1 7837:14,16,22</p>	<p>commissioners 7774:9 7789:21 commit 7841:3 Committee 7839:1 commotion 7845:11 communicated 7787:7 communication 7821:2 7821:7,13,17 community 7840:19 competent 7830:22 complain 7822:22 complete 7777:1 7817:9 complex 7841:1 complied 7829:3,4 comply 7832:14 component 7841:22 composite 7806:24 compulsory 7832:16 concentrate 7774:24 concern 7788:7 concerned 7780:25 7789:11 7803:22 7804:3 7830:7 7831:1 7836:2 7843:14 concerns 7788:13 conclusion 7798:22 concrete 7791:7,11,14 7795:13 condition 7837:3 condone 7835:19 7836:20,23 7838:1,12 7838:19 condoned 7837:2 conduct 7811:15 confirm 7823:25 confirmed 7824:6 7840:14 confirms 7844:22 conflict 7841:11,11 confluence 7841:2 conform 7798:18 connection 7784:21,23 7789:11 7790:6 7795:1 connotes 7833:12 consensus 7840:15 consequences 7829:15 7831:11 7840:17 consider 7827:22,22 consideration 7791:19 7833:16 7840:20 considered 7829:6 consistent 7815:8 7827:14 Constable 7814:14,14 7815:15,16 constables 7813:17 constant 7821:6,17 constitution 7808:5 7821:22,24 constitutional 7818:25 contained 7817:24 contaminated 7781:25 contamination 7781:24 7807:25</p>	<p>CONTD 7773:4 contemplation 7827:13 contend 7779:9 contending 7779:13 context 7834:16 continue 7820:7,10,15 7836:6 continuous 7821:13 contrary 7825:18 contrast 7775:11 contributed 7845:25 contributes 7845:11 control 7792:7,16 7819:4 convenient 7816:24 7846:19 convention 7784:5 7790:19 conventions 7783:24 7784:8,22 7789:13 7790:8,15 7795:2 7802:3,5 convicted 7835:22 7836:5 7837:11 conviction 7832:18 core 7840:11 correct 7774:12 7777:21 7778:4,23 7779:16 7780:15 7783:9 7790:3,4,5 7792:17 7795:4,24 7796:1 7797:1 7798:5 7798:11 7799:5 7806:1 7815:1 7818:25 7819:1,2 7822:2 7827:5,11 7829:16 7833:11,17 7835:6,16 7843:2,11 7846:15 corrective 7827:16 correctly 7781:20 7791:12 7802:20 7828:10 7846:5 correctness 7783:6 7803:24 couldn't 7792:6 7827:24 counsel 7836:12 country 7794:3 course 7780:15 7787:6 7789:17 7796:8 7797:2 7846:12 7847:5 court 7835:5 7836:5 covered 7831:2 covers 7806:24 7830:18 7833:22 crack 7813:15 create 7782:2,6 7783:1 created 7803:14 credibility 7783:8 crime 7836:22 7840:4,6 7840:7,18,20 criminal 7835:5 7836:21 7837:22 7838:23 7840:24</p>	<p>7841:3 criminally 7837:20 criticised 7843:22 criticism 7803:7,9 7843:16 criticisms 7779:24 cross-examination 7773:4,14 7785:19 7793:2 crowd 7817:23 7819:4 7819:4 7820:18 7823:22 7825:6 crowds 7822:24 culture 7808:10 7818:24 7819:3,4 cut 7824:22 cutting 7779:20</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">D</p> <p>daar 7801:9 damage 7820:19 danger 7840:4 dangerous 7781:15 7786:9 7807:22 dark 7799:13,17,19,21 7800:4,5 7803:11 dat 7800:2 date 7835:25,25 day 7774:13 7776:17 7786:22 7797:5 7806:20 daylight 7775:6,8,9,10 7775:16,18 7777:12 7778:9,16 7779:6 7809:12 days 7845:18 7846:24 daytime 7777:20 7778:3,25 7786:19 dead 7799:2,5 7802:23 7802:25 7808:6,11 7810:13,21,23 deal 7773:10,10 7779:23 7782:15 7788:13,25 7790:10 7791:24 7794:9 7796:5 7797:22 7798:8,19 7807:9,12 7812:4 7817:8 7825:1 7838:3,23 7843:7 7844:20,21 7845:14 7846:3 7847:12 dealing 7773:7 7781:15 7787:20 7788:11 7798:17 7801:18 7809:14 7828:8 7841:11 7842:18 7846:23 7847:4 deals 7794:21 7807:13 7834:2,25 7841:5 dealt 7773:8 7815:18 7817:10 7844:14 death 7809:19 7810:24 debatable 7797:21 debate 7776:21 7789:2 7792:22 7796:10 7826:12</p>
---	--	--	--	--

<p>deceased 7778:21 7786:23 decide 7785:24 7802:23 decides 7794:16 decision 7803:4 7804:13 decisively 7798:19 deemed 7835:24 7836:3 deep 7840:17 deeply 7818:2 defence 7781:1,1 defend 7828:2 defending 7781:4 defensive 7823:10,15 7823:24 deference 7787:10 define 7776:10 definite 7824:22 definitely 7803:22 7806:6 defuse 7823:1 deliberately 7783:1 democratic 7825:7 demonstrate 7784:20 7789:5 demonstrated 7813:13 7813:23 deny 7845:1 denying 7841:14 departing 7828:6 depend 7796:25 7833:15 7835:7,11 dependant 7832:19 depending 7830:14 7833:1 7838:5 depends 7783:8 7792:24 7827:10 7836:18 7838:10,11 derive 7793:1 derived 7788:7 described 7777:24 7778:22 describes 7821:15 deserve 7815:7 despite 7807:7 detail 7774:20,21,22 7775:21 7777:3 7779:20 detailed 7788:8 7793:1 detective 7813:15 detectives 7802:12 developed 7818:19 dialogue 7821:2,13,17 didn't 7799:19,20 7801:19 7802:14 7803:19,20 7804:3,6 7819:17 7827:24 7837:23 7843:9 die 7799:25 7800:1,2,3 7800:21 7801:5,5,6,8 7801:9,10,11,11,12 7801:12 7815:7 died 7799:9,10,10 7813:1 7814:21 differ 7804:14</p>	<p>difference 7834:23 different 7810:1,3 7835:3 7836:24 7839:3 differently 7809:4 difficult 7824:22 difficulty 7798:6 dig 7788:4 dignity 7808:6 dimensional 7843:5 discharge 7833:10,14 7836:8 discharged 7835:6,10 7835:16,24 7836:3 disciplinary 7832:14 7832:19 7834:2 7835:1 7837:1 7838:15 discussing 7782:11 7840:4 discussion 7838:21 dismissal 7833:3,10 disobedience 7831:2 dispute 7822:5 7843:5 distant 7776:1 distil 7819:19 distilled 7817:18 7818:23 distinction 7809:17 distress 7774:2 dit 7799:23,24 7800:10 7801:6 diverse 7803:3 doctor 7784:4 document 7818:23 documentation 7847:2 documents 7817:14,16 7817:25 7842:4 doesn't 7784:4 7785:22 7790:21 7792:9,10 7797:13 7798:7 7803:25 7814:20,20 7815:23 7816:6,13 7820:21 7823:4 7830:24 7836:11 7838:2 dog 7792:2,7,16 doing 7783:14 7802:9 7802:21 7814:25 7815:6 7819:24 7843:24,24 don't 7796:2,18 7797:17 7802:24 7804:14 7814:16 7815:11,25 7816:18 7816:18 7818:14 7825:10,14 7826:22 7827:11 7828:7 7830:4 7831:17,18 7834:9,22 7835:20 7836:20 door 7807:8 double 7805:21 doubling 7785:14 doubt 7803:25 draft 7847:21</p>	<p>draw 7816:3 drawn 7796:3 7814:22 driving 7836:19 7837:10,11 dry 7824:23 due 7787:10 7834:12 duties 7798:19 7821:23 duty 7803:12,16 7804:16 dynamics 7842:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <hr/> <p>earlier 7796:17 7831:9 7836:17 7838:9 7839:2 easier 7776:24 easy 7782:21 7816:15 economic 7840:17 effect 7827:25 7835:25 effective 7840:18 effectively 7779:3 7832:20 7833:4 efficient 7840:18 efficiently 7844:14 effort 7813:23 efforts 7807:7 either 7776:20 7782:4,5 7786:14 7804:4 7805:24 7814:17,18 7816:15 7844:6 ejected 7833:4 ek 7799:22,25 7800:1,1 7800:2,10,21,21,22 7801:5,7,8,11,11 elapsed 7774:4 element 7806:2 7841:15 7844:25 embedded 7841:19 embraced 7827:15 7829:11 embracing 7842:7 emotionally 7808:16 emphasise 7820:17 en 7799:24 7800:22 7801:8,9 enforcement 7840:6 7841:14,15 7843:6 7844:20,25 engage 7840:24 enlighten 7813:25 ensure 7820:1 entirely 7844:4 entirety 7844:25 escalating 7823:16 essence 7779:17,20 essentially 7776:16 etcetera 7823:1 ethos 7819:10 evaluated 7827:2 evening 7775:7,9,11,12 7775:17,19 7778:7 7779:7 event 7774:22 7776:5 7793:3 7827:21 events 7773:24 7787:15 7842:9 7843:3</p>	<p>evidence 7780:11,20 7783:22 7787:1,7,8 7787:21,22 7788:3,16 7791:2,7,11,12,14,15 7793:5,6 7795:13 7797:12 7805:19 7810:3 7827:11,15 7828:6 7831:5,25 evident 7788:20 evidential 7787:2 evil 7782:2 exact 7792:19 exactly 7776:6,21 7790:22 7806:2 7813:18 7843:19 7844:15,18,19 examination 7783:14 example 7787:21 exclude 7831:14,16 exercise 7799:14 7814:12 7829:1 7839:17 Exhibit 7774:9,10 expect 7781:15 7844:21 expected 7822:12,16 expects 7822:19,20,20 7823:2 expert 7783:13,16 expertise 7803:1 7843:8 experts 7783:22 explained 7796:9 explains 7801:23 explanation 7780:1,3 7780:19 7781:6,12,22 7781:23 7782:4,23 7800:12,25 7805:9 7808:9 7826:23 explanations 7779:8 exploring 7797:10 expression 7799:21 7834:15 extent 7792:23 7807:20 external 7788:23 extra 7803:10 7815:11 extract 7824:5 extracted 7817:15 extracts 7821:11 eyes 7802:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <hr/> <p>facie 7828:18 facilitate 7779:18 facing 7803:13 fact 7775:4 7781:19 7783:23 7784:22 7785:24 7786:9,10,24 7789:20,21 7793:16 7795:21 7797:7 7805:1,6,8 7807:23 7807:23 7816:3 7821:5 7822:11 7829:16 factors 7840:21 facts 7782:18 7785:7,10 7789:15 7800:18</p>	<p>7805:7 7808:19 factual 7813:19 fail 7796:19 failing 7832:14 fair 7814:8 7825:3 7826:13 7829:8,22 7841:23 fall 7796:20 false 7782:2,7 7783:1 falsely 7786:8 families 7808:12 family 7773:25 7847:11 far 7779:13 7780:25 7789:10 7800:23 7801:17 7803:21 7804:3 7819:25 7830:6 7831:1 7843:13 7847:9 fat 7816:13 favour 7827:19 favourable 7782:8 favoured 7838:25 FFF1 7817:24 7821:6 FFF13 7838:25,25 7839:3 FFF8 7814:11,12 FF1 7818:1,16 figure 7834:18,19 file 7837:20 filed 7847:10,10 find 7774:1 7789:20 7807:7 7827:18,19,20 7843:21 finding 7827:9,11,13 7827:14 findings 7797:5 7827:23 7828:1,1 fine 7775:10,10 7820:14 7835:15,23 7837:13,23 finish 7773:6 finished 7838:15,19 firearm 7787:14 fired 7814:19,20,20 first 7776:14 7777:6 7778:13 7788:13 7817:17 7818:1,16 7820:3 7821:12,25 7839:10 7840:4,22 firstly 7797:1 7805:18 7811:22 7813:11 7830:8 7843:11 flaws 7797:8 flowing 7846:21 focus 7802:6 7840:4 focussing 7802:6 follow 7831:11,21 7832:12 followed 7776:15 7780:12 7789:21 following 7779:25 7789:4 7794:22 7800:4 7820:17 7835:25 7839:20 foot 7839:20</p>
---	--	---	---	--

<p>force 7824:9,10 7839:19 forced 7787:18 forcibly 7798:12 forgive 7823:21 7839:5 forgot 7823:14 forgotten 7844:9 form 7774:9 7845:20 forms 7809:20 fortitude 7807:10 fortunately 7782:11 7785:13 7830:17 forward 7786:1 7788:18,23 7842:7 fotograawe 7800:2 found 7792:21 7827:3 7829:13 7831:10 7832:4,13 7835:4,8,9 7835:14 7836:19 7837:9 7839:15 Foundation 7818:23 foundational 7820:25 four 7778:6 7799:10 7844:6 framework 7817:13,19 7824:20 friend 7789:3 7796:10 front 7839:9,23 full 7828:13 fundamental 7818:24 7819:13 Funnily 7835:12 further 7786:1 7800:21 7832:7 future 7775:25 7776:1 7842:4 7844:23</p>	<p>7788:4,19 7830:11 7837:4 7842:7 7844:4 goal 7820:21 God's 7808:11 goed 7800:21 goes 7822:12 going 7773:15,16,16,18 7773:19,23 7774:3 7784:9,11,20 7789:4 7790:2,25 7791:19,24 7793:1,3,4,7,15,17 7795:6 7796:11,13 7797:4 7798:1 7801:20 7803:5 7804:19 7806:3,6,7 7813:8 7814:11 7816:21,23 7817:7,11 7818:8 7822:23 7823:8 7826:13,17 7830:18 7831:8 7832:10 7839:2 7840:1 7844:20 7846:22 7847:16,17 good 7785:23 7813:10 7822:6 7832:1,1 7837:24 gotten 7793:12 gradual 7823:23 gradualist 7823:10 Greenfield's 7782:15 group 7792:2 growing 7840:15 guidelines 7830:15 guilt 7780:19 guilty 7832:4,14 7835:4 7835:8,9,14 7836:19 guy 7803:11</p>	<p>7842:11 haven't 7789:15 7829:3 7846:4 heading 7840:2 heads 7829:15,22 7830:2 7831:12,15,19 7832:5 7833:11 7834:15 hear 7794:11 7803:19 7803:20 7804:3,4,6 7804:10 7805:20 heard 7789:2 7810:12 7811:1 7812:8 7814:20 hearing 7831:22 7832:14,19 hearsay 7793:3 height 7816:16 help 7797:4 7814:12 7816:21 helped 7785:25 helpful 7776:2 7824:24 helps 7818:20 Hemraj 7787:12 7790:20 7791:9 Henderson 7776:17 Hendrickson's 7786:21 herken 7800:1 hesitant 7820:12 hesitate 7834:13 het 7799:24 7800:2,11 7800:21,22 7801:6,7 7801:8,9,11,12 he'd 7794:13 he's 7788:22 7792:2 7800:23 7801:4,15 7833:6,13 7837:24 high 7833:22 higher 7811:3 7812:11 7841:2 highlight 7801:10 highly 7780:2 hm 7822:9 7823:4,5 Hm-hm 7823:3 hold 7804:13 holding 7787:5 7788:18 7788:24 holistic 7840:19 hom 7800:1 home 7845:15 homework 7846:25 honestly 7796:2 hospital 7799:10 hostile 7822:25 hours 7801:21 human 7808:6 hy 7800:2 hypothesis 7797:1,4 7798:4 hypothetical 7796:22 7827:8</p>	<p>identified 7776:13 identify 7813:12 identifying 7840:7 ignore 7789:21 7807:23 ignores 7844:3 illegal 7845:9 illustrate 7775:16 7777:4 illustrates 7775:20 image 7774:19 7775:20 7776:10 7834:8 immediate 7775:25 immediately 7785:3 7787:20 7788:17 7789:8 7790:1 impartiality 7822:1,4 implementation 7823:24 importance 7821:6 important 7785:10 7801:25 7807:22 7808:4 7814:4 7821:21 7823:9 7826:23 importantly 7808:12 imposed 7837:15 imposition 7836:8 impression 7782:7 7783:2 imprisonment 7835:15 7835:23 7836:1 improper 7794:5 inaccuracy 7844:17 inappropriate 7834:16 incident 7809:7 include 7799:2 7833:3 includes 7830:20 including 7830:1 7831:11 7844:25 incompatible 7837:7 incriminated 7786:8 indebted 7779:2 indicate 7786:22 7797:13 indicated 7793:4 7817:25 7827:21 7844:5 7848:2 indicates 7785:21 indicating 7802:2 individual 7786:13 individuals 7822:24 7829:13 indulgence 7847:16,25 inefficiency 7782:3,5 inefficient 7783:3 inequality 7840:23 inference 7814:22,22 7816:3 influenced 7842:21 information 7782:13 7782:14 7783:13,16 7783:17,18 7784:17 7816:21 7821:3,18 informs 7803:2 initially 7814:1 7817:11</p>	<p>injured 7783:25 7790:17 7795:22,24 7799:2,8 7808:20 injuries 7820:20 innocent 7780:20 input 7803:3 7805:15 7826:9,18 7827:1 7837:18 7842:12 insight 7805:13 insofar 7774:16 7820:4 instances 7826:10 instituted 7794:3 7808:25 instruction 7830:21,24 7830:25 instructions 7801:16 7830:16 7847:21 integrated 7839:22 7840:2,10 intent 7782:2 interested 7786:20 interfere 7780:20 7814:6 interference 7780:2 7798:20 internal 7834:2 7835:1 international 7780:10 7780:13 7803:14 interpreter 7839:12 interrupted 7846:17 intervene 7845:18 intervention 7842:9,11 7842:14,24 7845:21 interventions 7832:12 interviewed 7783:9 introducing 7806:1 investigate 7809:3 investigated 7809:4,23 7813:2 investigating 7814:5 investigation 7780:14 7783:7 7805:2 7806:22 7808:25 7810:4 7814:7 7816:7 7828:13 investigator 7783:2 involved 7813:5,13 involvement 7840:10 involves 7815:4 involving 7810:9 7819:11 IPID 7809:2,10,20,23 7811:4,5 7812:14 7813:5 7814:5,6 7815:5,11 7816:21,21 7846:8 7847:2 irregular 7780:2 irregularly 7824:19 isn't 7783:6 7793:21 7820:1 7844:4 7846:1 7846:6 issue 7780:8 7782:11 7783:20 7787:10 7793:13,16 7794:18 7805:6 7806:7 7808:23,24 7810:25</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <p>Gatherings 7819:9 geel 7801:11 geklee 7799:25 gekry 7801:12 gelê 7801:9 genader 7799:25 GENERALL 7815:25 gentleman 7816:2 geplaas 7800:22 7801:6 7801:10,13 getting 7785:18 gist 7841:4 give 7773:12 7776:2,5 7776:10 7777:3 7785:7 7791:19 7796:15 7804:20 7848:5,12 given 7805:7,8 7806:21 7808:4,11 7812:10,10 7829:16 7830:21 7831:12 7832:5 7836:5 7837:20 7838:3 7842:18 gives 7780:17 7796:25 7829:21 giving 7800:14 glad 7843:1 go 7773:7,13 7780:4,6</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <p>hacking 7834:10,12 Halam 7815:16,22,23 7816:2 half 7844:5,6 7848:3,8 Hallam 7814:14 hamper 7797:17 hand 7775:14 7778:21 7782:6 7787:5 7796:18 7801:11 7807:18,24 7839:22 handle 7775:13 handled 7778:22 hands 7786:10,13 7787:4 happen 7803:8 7820:22 7827:9 7830:10 happened 7776:22 7785:1,3 7788:17 7794:21 7795:15,16 7796:7 7805:9,13 7826:18,19 7831:12 7836:18 7841:12 happening 7842:14,21 7842:24 7845:9,17,22 happens 7797:21 happy 7829:25 hasn't 7836:12 7839:20</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <p>idea 7808:6 ideals 7820:18 identification 7813:12</p>		

7812:9,13 7824:24 7835:1 7838:15 7840:16 7841:16 7842:22 7843:6,7 7845:8,12,12,17 7846:4 7847:18 issues 7773:8,15 7779:25 7788:5 7790:10 7809:9 7817:9,10 7831:6 7834:3 7842:18,19 7844:21,22 7845:19 7846:23 it's 7782:12,21 7783:17 7783:20 7784:10 7785:9 7786:3 7787:18 7790:3 7794:1 7795:5 7800:19 7801:20 7802:9 7804:2 7814:23 7815:3,3 7816:10,11,14,16 7818:8 7820:14 7821:16 7824:1,4 7825:18,21,22 7829:22 7830:4,25 7831:23 7833:22 7834:18,19 7836:24 7837:3 7843:25 I'd 7786:20 7826:6 7828:20 7833:18,19 I'll 7790:10 7791:15 7795:10 7797:15 7798:8 7815:14 7818:15 7823:21 7825:4 7826:20 7831:14 7838:13 I'm 7782:13,17,20 7783:17 7784:9,11,13 7784:20 7787:17 7789:3,18,19,22 7790:2 7791:12,13,13 7791:24 7792:25 7793:3,10,17,17 7794:2,20 7795:3,4 7796:11 7797:9,24 7798:1,17 7799:11,16 7802:15 7803:5 7817:7,10,20 7818:4 7819:22 7821:10 7823:13 7825:9 7828:21 7829:19,25 7830:18,25 7831:24 7832:21,22 7833:8,21 7833:23 7834:12 7835:3 7836:18,19 7837:8,9,13,19 7838:1,7,8,11 I've 7791:1 7796:9 7797:20 7802:10 7803:24 7817:15,15 7824:14 7829:9 7831:2,8 7832:6 7835:13	J 7777:6,6,8,9 ja 7774:10,15 7775:3 7775:11 7777:13 7783:11 7784:15,19 7795:8,16 7796:23 7799:22 7803:11 7815:22 7818:22 7820:14 7823:19 7826:17 jail 7836:5 jolted 7816:17 judge 7782:10 7804:23 7805:10,11 7806:16 7826:11 7829:10 7833:18 7836:25 7837:9 7838:8,22 judgement 7800:16 7805:11,12,15 judgment 7783:20 7800:14,17,18 jump 7829:21 7839:5,6 7840:3,12 jumping 7840:21 justified 7834:12 justify 7833:6	koppie 7786:23 7807:21 K9 7785:9 7792:2	litigation 7827:25 7828:2 little 7817:8 7819:22 7845:24 7846:25 lives 7802:1,7,22 7829:16 local 7780:9 7803:14 long 7773:19 7785:4,8 7839:6,25 7841:19 7842:3 Lonmin 7843:16,17,22 look 7773:17 7775:18 7781:4,14 7782:17 7785:10 7802:24 7807:14 7823:19 7824:25 7834:9 7836:22 7837:22 7842:7 7843:6 7844:20 7847:1 looked 7776:14 7805:7 7826:15 7829:2,20 7844:24 looking 7774:1 7782:21 7809:14 7826:12 7839:12 7842:4,16 looks 7786:19 loss 7820:19,19 lost 7819:23 7829:17 lot 7817:14 7824:23 7842:14 loved 7808:13 low 7833:22 lying 7790:17	march 7845:9 Marikana 7841:12 massacre 7841:12,20 7841:22 material 7785:15 7814:24 matter 7781:14 7782:15 7785:24 7791:20 7794:8 7798:19 7799:7 7801:24 7803:17,21 7803:22 7804:1,2,19 7804:22,24 7805:6,22 7805:23 7806:14 7807:3,4,5,15,17,18 7807:20 7808:1 7809:1,3 7812:14,15 7813:4 7815:17 7816:13 7824:25 7825:23 7830:24 7833:2 7841:6 7842:20 7844:4 7846:13 7847:23 matters 7773:10 7782:17 7796:5 7829:2 Ma'am 7834:6 mean 7779:3 7785:25 7801:22 7820:21 7824:18 7828:12 7835:10 meaning 7807:4 means 7799:9,11 7822:4 measures 7823:11,11 7823:15,15,16,24 medical 7783:23 meer 7800:10 member 7800:6 7830:20,23 7831:9 7832:13 7833:3,4 7835:21 7836:2,7 7837:5 7839:19 members 7773:25 7811:8 7831:1 7835:4 7835:5 memory 7816:17 mentioned 7826:4 7836:17 merely 7835:8 met 7801:11 metaphorically 7834:17 min 7800:10 mind 7773:15 7786:2 7786:24 7804:1 7808:3 7831:8 mine 7830:4 minimum 7824:9 7832:16 7843:4 minutes 7774:4 7797:25 7813:13,16 7844:4,7 misconduct 7809:21 miskien 7801:5 missed 7794:19
J	K K 7774:9,10 7777:23 7778:1 keep 7792:6,7,16 7804:1 7811:11 7832:24 7833:18 ken 7799:25 key 7791:20 7801:14 7817:16 7819:18 kill 7814:18 7815:9,10 killed 7773:24 7781:3 7810:19,24 7811:3 7812:9,12,13 7814:13 7814:17,18 killer 7815:5,6 killing 7809:7,8 7810:10 7815:4,14 kills 7809:10 kind 7773:12 7800:11 7803:9,15 7806:5 7832:15 kindly 7847:1 klere 7799:25 know 7776:6 7780:13 7786:20 7788:19,22 7789:18 7794:21 7796:21 7799:8,20 7801:19 7804:14 7805:10 7806:24 7807:15 7810:18,20 7810:21 7812:25 7813:1 7815:25 7816:4 7817:12 7827:12 7828:4 7832:23 7833:19 7834:16,19 7841:24 7841:25 7842:9 7845:15 7847:1,9 known 7778:6,13,20 kon 7800:1,21	L labour 7843:5,7 laden 7808:16 ladies 7839:19 langs 7801:6,10,12,12 language 7830:13 large 7792:23 lastly 7824:7 latest 7807:2 laugh 7811:8,10 law 7822:6 7825:15,21 7825:22 7830:7 7835:5,13 7837:3,18 7840:6 7841:14,15 7843:6 7844:20,25 lawyer 7831:5,24 lawyers 7784:21 lay 7784:9 LCRC 7800:6 7802:13 7809:13 lead 7796:13 leader 7833:20 leaders 7787:8 7810:3 leading 7782:12 7843:4 learned 7789:3 7795:20 7796:10 7809:1 leave 7774:5 led 7788:3 left 7813:16 7835:13 legal 7804:15 legislation 7817:14 7821:23 letter 7776:13,15 7824:19 let's 7794:11 7804:4,9 7804:9 7818:12,14 7820:6,9 7822:20 7828:21 7835:6 7838:16,22 let's 7804:20 7807:5 levels 7840:9 liaison 7821:7 lid 7800:2 life 7790:16 7803:18 7809:14 7820:19,19 liggaam 7801:7,10,12 7801:12 light 7787:11 7788:9 7790:13 7835:9 limited 7773:5 7830:1 7831:11 limits 7809:15 Limpopo 7814:1 line 7795:14,21 7818:1 7818:16 7831:23 7842:9 lines 7789:4 lingo 7830:12 linking 7836:25 list 7788:8 listening 7817:20 literally 7791:16	M M 7778:20 maar 7799:23 7801:6 Madam 7810:22 Madlanga 7775:21 7807:1,1 7813:10,13 7813:14,24 7814:12 7815:15 mag 7801:5 Magidiwana's 7787:21 Magistrate 7837:12 magnitude 7803:15 7831:12 7832:5 Mahlanga 7839:2 MAHLANGU 7800:8 main 7788:6,9 7809:6 maintaining 7822:6 makers 7840:15 making 7790:15 7792:23 7795:3 7797:18 7809:17 7811:14 7814:25 7816:6,10,14 7844:15 man 7799:24 manage 7819:24 7820:2 management 7817:24 7819:4,22 7820:18 7823:22 7825:6 manipulated 7808:7 manner 7782:16 7824:23	

<p>missing 7837:17 7841:16 mistake 7792:17,19 misunderstanding 7846:5 Mm 7820:23 7844:1 mobilise 7840:8 Mohlaki 7775:5 7787:25 7788:20 7791:2,14 7795:14,16 7795:23 7796:1 7797:13,20 7798:4 Mohlaki's 7788:21 7797:12,22 moment 7807:8 7843:21 monumental 7782:3,5 morning 7817:1,7 7844:7,9,12 7847:6 7847:13 7848:14 motivated 7841:2 motivations 7840:24 move 7777:16 7793:11 7797:16 7798:8,9,13 7803:5 7806:13 7816:19,23 7838:13 7840:5 7847:14 movement 7795:18 moves 7819:3 moving 7788:17 7791:16 Mpembe 7844:19 MPUFO 7777:21 municipalities 7847:11 murder 7780:3 7781:24,25 7814:23 muster 7807:10 mustn't 7787:9 Myburgh 7809:1 7810:9,12 7813:8 7814:19 7815:3,5 7816:16</p>	<p>7821:17 7826:5 needs 7829:11 negative 7829:11 neglected 7803:16 negotiate 7843:12 negotiating 7823:16 negotiation 7821:7 7823:10,15,23 7843:13 negotiations 7842:16 7842:19 neighbouring 7847:11 net 7801:11 neutral 7826:11 new 7819:10 7820:25 nicely 7835:6 nie 7799:23,23 7800:1 7800:1 night 7776:19 7777:18 7778:13,17,24 NIU 7813:17 non 7783:20 non-state 7840:9 note 7823:17 7824:1 7844:11 notes 7792:6,6,16 notice 7775:3 notwithstanding 7836:13 number 7776:13 7777:17 7804:24 7805:6 7813:2 7814:15 7839:21 numbers 7776:3,5,25 7777:14 7839:17 nutshell 7819:3</p>	<p>officials 7795:18 7830:7 7846:10 oh 7773:12 7781:3 7818:22 7837:23 7845:5 okay 7774:15,21,22,23 7774:24 7775:1,1,2,2 7775:7,7,9,14,19,23 7776:8 7777:4,16,17 7781:9 7782:20 7784:6 7788:25 7789:2,22 7798:24 7800:20 7801:14 7803:5 7805:17 7807:11 7808:22 7810:6,16 7812:6 7813:6 7814:2,12 7815:22 7818:5,15,21 7818:21 7820:6,11,24 7821:9 7823:7,19,20 7825:4,4,16 7826:8 7826:24 7830:17 7832:1 7835:20 7838:13 7839:10 7841:23 7843:1 7844:16 7846:3 7847:16 once 7816:14 ones 7777:3,14 7788:23 7809:12,13 ongeveer 7799:23 onhou 7800:21 op 7799:25 7800:7 7801:9 open 7780:24 7781:5 7787:1 7804:1 opened 7813:2 opening 7843:15,18 operation 7790:16 7822:24 operations 7823:25 opgetel 7801:9 opinion 7800:19 7825:15 opportunity 7774:7 7794:13 opposed 7788:23 opposing 7847:10 optimistic 7847:17 option 7826:25 7835:15 7835:23 order 7779:18 7789:3 7822:6 7823:1,13,14 7827:5 7830:10,21,24 7830:25 7831:2 7832:15,15,16 orders 7828:13 7830:9 7830:10,11,12,15 7831:10,21 ordinary 7822:14,17,21 7822:22 originally 7812:20 outcome 7825:1 7826:14 7829:10 outline 7773:13 7817:12</p>	<p>outlined 7821:24 overall 7807:20 overemphasis 7821:1 overemphasised 7821:8 o'clock 7791:3 7848:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <hr/> <p>page 7795:12,20 7820:16 7839:3,9,13 7839:20,20,21,23 7840:1,21 paid 7842:17 panga 7775:13,18,19 7778:22 7801:8,11 7808:13 paper 7776:14 papers 7847:23 para 7792:10 paragraph 7792:12 7799:22 7801:4,7 7840:13 7843:25 paramedics 7779:18 7781:14 7783:17 7785:4,8,9,15 7787:24 7788:2,15,19 7788:22 7789:7,12 7790:1,7,18,21 7791:6 7794:24 7795:1,2,19 7796:8 7799:1 7802:1,2,8,23 part 7773:12 7774:9 7776:9 7792:2 7806:7 7809:22 7822:11,13 7835:13 7848:9 participants 7782:22 7782:25 participated 7838:22 participating 7802:18 participatory 7819:10 particular 7775:12 7786:7 7793:13 7794:4,5 7807:18 7819:8 7821:5 particularly 7833:20 parties 7826:14 partly 7788:11 parts 7824:9 7839:6 7840:1 passage 7822:14 7843:17 passages 7797:12 patently 7830:23 penalty 7832:18 7833:8 people 7773:24 7774:1 7774:5 7776:6 7780:20 7781:2,16 7782:2,21 7783:8,13 7783:25 7785:3 7787:4 7790:17 7791:16 7795:22,25 7799:3,5,8,9,10,11,12 7801:18 7802:13 7805:2 7807:21 7808:12 7813:12,16 7813:24 7816:15</p>	<p>7830:20 7832:2 7841:2 7842:17,17 7844:21 7845:10,11 perceived 7779:4 perioed 7847:2 persists 7794:12,17 person 7775:14 7784:9 7800:1,5,6 7801:14 7801:16 7802:14,25 7807:18 7808:11 7809:7,8,8,10 7812:9 7812:12 7813:4 7814:13,14 7822:14 7822:17 7830:22 7831:22 7836:18 7837:25 7838:3 7845:21 7846:1 personnel 7783:23 persons 7773:25 7799:2 7814:17 pervasive 7821:17 Peter 7816:4 philosophical 7817:22 philosophies 7817:16 7824:15,17 photo 7775:12,17,19 7776:5 photograph 7774:18 7776:3,25 photographs 7774:9 photos 7773:17,21 7775:16,18,18 7776:11 phrase 7832:10 7833:11 phrases 7832:11 pick 7825:9 7830:11 picture 7774:23 7775:5 7775:8,15 7776:14,16 7776:19,19 7777:12 7777:14,25 7778:3,7 7778:13,17,25 7779:3 7807:21 7808:13 7839:18 pictures 7773:23 7774:2 7776:16,23 7777:19,19,20 7778:9 7778:16,25 7779:5,6 7779:7 7781:1 7799:3 7809:11,12,14 7810:1 7810:1,2 piece 7776:14 pile 7788:1 7789:7,24 7791:4 pipeline 7842:10,13,25 7845:8,17 pitch 7799:16,19 pitiful 7841:20 Pity 7838:2 plaaslike 7800:3 place 7781:21 7783:5 7786:15 7792:18 7800:9 7802:3 7812:11 7842:10 placed 7802:20 7807:19 7808:7</p>
<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">N</p> <hr/> <p>n 7778:5 7799:24 7800:2 7801:6 naby 7801:9 narrow 7813:23 7826:22 7840:6 National 7773:3 7781:10 7794:2,2 7797:8 7798:17 7803:13,20,23 7804:16,22 7806:4 7808:23 7817:5 7828:25 7839:1 7841:17 nature 7825:21 7827:16 7829:19 7835:11 7836:22 7842:8 necessarily 7807:22 7814:17 7827:12,16 necessary 7824:11 7830:2 7840:5 need 7773:11 7785:6</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">O</p> <hr/> <p>O 7778:12 oath 7773:3 7817:5 obey 7830:21,23 object 7794:13 7811:6 7811:16 objected 7812:2 objecting 7811:15 objection 7787:17 7788:13 7789:1 7794:13 7811:5,14,14 7812:5 objective 7820:3 objectives 7820:4 observe 7775:13 obviously 7779:10,20 7782:7 7820:2,21 7828:17 7833:1 occurred 7818:2,17 odd 7839:17 offences 7841:3 offense 7835:22 offensive 7808:10 7823:11,15,16,25 office 7836:15 officer 7776:17 7786:21 7791:21 7801:15,16 official 7822:21</p>			

<p>placing 7781:5 Planning 7839:1 7841:17 planted 7779:9 7786:3 plausible 7780:1,18 7781:6,12,22,22 7782:4 play 7774:22 7784:25 7787:18 7788:4 7797:22 7804:7 7805:19 played 7785:2 please 7790:3 7811:9 7812:17,23 7846:20 7848:1 point 7775:21 7785:15 7785:16,18 7786:1,12 7786:17 7788:10,10 7792:23 7793:2 7794:19,22 7795:3,6 7797:9,16,18 7798:1 7804:18 7806:10 7807:11 7808:4 7815:15 7816:5,10,14 7818:9 7827:12 7828:12 7829:1 7833:6 7834:14 7836:5 7841:14 7842:15,20 7843:19 7844:6,15 7845:22 7846:19 pointed 7787:12 points 7786:2 7798:11 7834:21 police 7782:8 7786:3 7787:14,20 7790:16 7795:18,18 7802:22 7809:8,22 7810:25 7812:9,12 7822:11,13 7822:21,25 7823:2 7824:16 7825:11 7826:1 7827:3,19,20 7828:15 7830:6,12,19 7831:9 7833:5 7835:21 7836:7 7837:6,6,14,16,24 7842:13 7843:3,12,13 7843:15 7844:19,23 7845:11,14,17,21 7846:1,9 policeman 7780:5 7781:13 7809:10,19 7810:10 7811:3,18 7812:13 7813:3 7815:10 policies 7817:23 7818:1 7819:19 7821:25 policing 7840:5 policy 7817:13 7823:22 7824:2,4,5,8 7840:15 polisie 7800:2 Pollsmoor 7837:16 portray 7834:8 posisie 7801:6 position 7784:18 7785:23 7792:18</p>	<p>7797:21 7806:4 7837:14 7847:19 positive 7829:10 possession 7786:6 possessor 7786:9 possibilities 7781:13 7782:1 7827:19 possibility 7779:10 7780:10 7783:19,20 7809:18 7811:2 7812:11 7847:22 possible 7814:13 7821:2 possibly 7775:25 7787:3 postulated 7835:2 poverty 7840:23 power 7838:5 powers 7804:23 precise 7792:17 precisely 7792:11 7804:11 predicate 7804:15 predicated 7790:15 preface 7838:21 prefaced 7838:14 prefer 7783:25 7793:5 7818:5 preferences 7784:4 preferred 7842:5 prejudgement 7829:23 preliminary 7817:9 premise 7773:20 7811:17 prepare 7847:5 prepared 7791:22 prescribes 7824:8 prescripts 7828:19 7829:3 7837:21 presence 7796:1 present 7796:19 presented 7806:4 7807:2 presenting 7842:19 presies 7799:23 presumably 7791:22 7838:4 presume 7802:23 7828:15 presuming 7833:9 pretty 7787:15 prevent 7819:23 7820:4 prevention 7819:14,15 7819:20,21 previous 7812:7 7826:5 prima 7828:18 primary 7820:3 principally 7846:9 principle 7818:22 7819:14,18 7821:21 7822:1,3 7828:14 principles 7817:16,23 7818:22,25 7820:25 7823:9 7824:4,8,14 7824:16 7825:6,12,25</p>	<p>7826:3,9 7827:4 prison 7836:7 7838:3 prisoner 7837:6 privaat 7799:25 private 7800:5 7801:17 7802:12 privately 7848:12 proactive 7845:23 probably 7775:15 7776:24 7807:9 7814:18 7826:12 7836:24 7847:6,7 problem 7781:21 7789:18 7798:3 7829:21 7843:9,12 7845:13 problems 7821:12 7845:10 proceed 7812:17 proceedings 7773:1 7776:2 7835:2,5 process 7813:12 7818:8 7834:12 profile 7791:15 profit 7788:7 profits 7793:6 program 7805:2 progress 7806:21 7815:14 7818:12 promise 7795:7,8 7813:9 promote 7823:9 7841:5 promotion 7822:11 prompted 7805:1 promptly 7847:13 proper 7794:5 property 7820:20 propose 7773:6 7790:22 7796:13 7817:11 proposed 7847:14 proposition 7790:5 7797:24,25 7829:8 protestors 7782:7 7786:24 provided 7781:19 7830:23 7836:1 providing 7781:18 provisions 7837:25 public 7819:22 punishment 7833:12 purposes 7776:9 7814:25 7815:3 put 7773:9 7776:21,21 7779:4 7780:17 7781:18,20 7783:5 7786:9,16 7787:4 7789:7,25 7791:20 7792:12,19,21,21 7798:13 7800:23 7803:11 7807:24 7813:3,19 7822:20 7824:10,14 7825:4,22 7827:2 7829:8 7835:6 7837:18 7838:22 7842:5 7844:3,10</p>	<p>puts 7792:12 7801:17 putting 7781:11 7782:16 7788:7 7796:21 7797:24 7798:4 7799:11 7833:7 7843:11 7844:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Q</p> <hr/> <p>qualified 7812:18,21 7833:25 question 7781:24 7786:25 7787:6 7789:1 7791:4 7793:9 7793:11 7794:6,12 7795:4,7,10,14 7796:20,22 7805:21 7806:19 7810:7,17 7811:15,20,22,25 7812:3,4,7,10,17,23 7813:19,20,21 7814:9 7814:24 7815:18,19 7824:22 7826:17,25 7828:20 7832:7 7835:3 7838:9,9,14 7838:21 7841:21,22 7846:4,22 7847:7 questioned 7802:16 questioning 7785:21 7794:20 7817:17 questions 7773:20 7788:8 7805:23 7811:10 7813:9 7825:22 7827:8 quibble 7807:5 quickly 7777:5 7839:5 quite 7792:25 7806:1 7828:7 7839:6 quotation 7840:12 quote 7840:14 quoted 7836:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <hr/> <p>race 7816:11,15 raised 7847:18 raises 7804:12 7811:2 random 7821:11 range 7833:13,20 rational 7800:19 7804:13,17 7805:9,14 7808:9 7826:13 rationalising 7803:10 rationality 7806:2,6,9 rationaly 7804:17 reactive 7845:23 read 7776:1,6 7795:11 7797:13 7802:11,16 7803:2,3 7818:15 7823:21 7830:18 7831:3,8 7839:4 7841:3 7842:3 7846:8 7848:1 reading 7821:11 7840:1 7843:2 reads 7795:19 7837:19 ready 7787:19</p>	<p>real 7793:13 7814:8 7815:14 really 7801:22 7802:8 7803:11 7814:24 7829:22 7830:4 7833:13 reason 7784:10 7794:20 7809:6 7846:21 reasonable 7800:25 7806:3 reasons 7784:19 7848:3 received 7783:13,15 7785:20 reckless 7836:19 7837:11 recognises 7808:5 recommended 7782:22 record 7775:24 7776:6 7776:9,23,25 7788:4 7795:12,19 7813:3 7814:25 7823:4 redo 7775:22 reduced 7814:13 7815:15 7816:14 refer 7783:22 7802:3 7811:4 7839:3 reference 7774:10 7796:15 7839:21 references 7776:11 7797:23 referred 7798:16 7809:2,20,23 7811:4 7812:14,15 7815:5,11 7816:21 7824:23 7839:2 referring 7783:22 7784:2 7788:22 refers 7796:3 7799:5 7841:24 regard 7791:23 7804:22 7809:11 regarded 7810:9 Regulation 7819:9 regulations 7819:19 regulatory 7817:13 7824:8 reinterpreted 7841:21 relate 7774:11,12 7824:25 relates 7799:2 relation 7786:12 7790:23 7792:19 7807:18 7809:1 relationship 7845:16 relationships 7841:1 relevance 7786:7,12,17 relevant 7776:11 7821:8 7828:19 7829:20,24 7830:1 7831:18 7832:11,22 7832:24 7833:16,21 7839:9 reliance 7795:13 reluctance 7823:20 rely 7781:19 7791:15</p>
--	---	---	---	--

7797:19,20 7805:3 7814:2 relying 7791:10,13,13 7797:11 remain 7808:21 remains 7805:14,16 7847:22 remedial 7826:2 7827:4 7829:7 7832:11,22,22 7833:22 remedies 7826:14 7829:12,20,24 7830:1 7831:18 remember 7781:17 7787:21,24 7792:13 7800:23 7801:18,19 7808:25 7812:3 7815:16,20,21 7838:14,16,17,20 remembered 7781:20 7783:4 7800:24 remind 7811:22 7844:12 removal 7784:22,25 7787:2,6,22 7789:10 7789:12 7790:6 7794:23,25 7795:3 7796:7 7847:8 removed 7776:18 7779:11,19 7784:10 7785:8,16 7786:14 7789:6,8,24 7792:11 7799:13 7800:25 7801:4,19 7802:5 7808:19 removing 7787:14 7790:23 repeat 7793:9 7811:20 7811:25 7812:8 7814:11 7819:16 repeatedly 7832:10 rephrase 7795:4 7828:11 rephrasing 7789:1 replace 7801:20,21 replaced 7779:11,19 7786:14 7799:13 7801:1 replacement 7787:3,7 7799:14 reply 7804:20 replying 7847:9 report 7779:16,21,24 7783:15 7784:3 7785:20,21,22 7793:17,21 7794:4,6 7794:21 7797:7 7798:18 7800:19 7802:6 7803:3,16,24 7805:22 7806:20,21 7806:23,24 7807:2 7809:4 7828:4 7830:21 7839:1 reported 7806:22 reports 7782:13	7791:21 7846:8 represent 7780:2 reproof 7811:8 reprove 7811:7 Republic 7821:22 request 7780:14 7800:8 Requested 7800:9 require 7773:18 requires 7840:9,18 research 7840:25 resolving 7840:7 respect 7785:23 7787:11 7808:6,10 7834:21 7847:14 responding 7782:14 7842:2 response 7784:13 7787:13 7797:4 7840:18,20 responsibilities 7805:5 responsibility 7840:11 responsible 7829:14 result 7814:21 7818:16 7834:3 7835:4 results 7783:7 resumes 7773:2 7817:3 7817:4 resumption 7847:13 return 7844:7 7847:7 revealed 7787:7 revisit 7807:9 ridiculous 7811:11 riding 7835:9 right 7773:15 7782:8 7796:18 7800:17 7805:11,24,24 7810:18 7817:21 7818:11 7820:5 7824:13 7829:14 7831:4 7839:22,23 7844:14 rights 7818:24 rigting 7801:5 role 7814:6 7834:8 role-players 7821:8 roll 7829:16,22 7832:5 rolling 7830:1 7831:12 7831:15,19 7833:11 7834:15 room 7780:17 root 7840:7,22 7841:5 rooted 7818:2 roots 7840:17 rots 7801:9 round 7844:6 royal 7847:11 ruling 7788:12 7794:14 run 7776:23 R5 7810:19,24 7812:9 7812:12 7813:1 <hr/> S s 7785:14 safe 7790:15 7802:4,4 safer 7818:9 safety 7839:23 7840:2,6	7840:19 7842:15,20 sake 7775:24 7815:14 7818:12 7839:4 sal 7800:1 sangoma 7810:18,21,23 7811:3 SAPS 7779:12,12 7831:1 7841:25 satisfactorily 7801:23 7835:1 satisfied 7805:21 7806:5 7807:4 7828:18 save 7789:3 7796:18 7802:22 saved 7802:1 7803:1 saving 7802:7 7839:4 saw 7776:13,19,25 7783:14 7800:2 7802:15 7805:1 7809:25 7810:2,12,13 saying 7782:17 7783:17 7783:19 7784:13 7789:18,19,23 7791:12 7793:14 7796:6 7800:23 7803:11 7804:25 7805:1,8,12 7806:21 7807:14 7808:25 7809:25 7818:10 7823:18 7825:9 7829:20 7830:11,25 7831:20,24 7832:20 7832:21,22 7833:1,21 7833:23 7834:25 7836:25 7837:8,19 7838:1,8,14 7842:23 7842:24 7844:15,18 says 7779:17 7783:23 7792:5,12,15,17,20 7793:15 7795:10,13 7795:14,21 7800:4,20 7801:5,7 7803:8 7804:12,15,17 7814:19 7815:5 7818:15 7820:17,18 7820:21 7821:6,11 7823:22 7830:19 7832:11 7836:9,13 7840:22 SC 7785:13 7788:15 7790:14 7795:11 7799:4 7804:11 7811:6,13,17 7812:18 7827:7 7832:9 7841:18 scant 7791:13 scene 7774:14 7779:17 7780:3,25 7781:24,25 7785:1,3,4,16 7786:22 7787:14 7788:19 7789:11,24 7790:7 7794:21,22,23 7794:25 7795:17,19 7795:23 7796:4,4,7,8 7797:23,23 7798:20	7799:8,18 screen 7773:17 se 7800:2 searchlights 7799:17 seat 7847:8 second 7774:3 7805:6 7813:7 7821:16 7840:3 secondary 7794:6 secondly 7797:3 7805:25 7827:10,14 7842:8 7843:13 section 7830:18 7835:21 7836:9,12,13 7838:2,8 7839:3,6 sectors 7841:1 security 7840:16 7841:6 7842:15,20 see 7774:15,16,16,17 7774:17,19,22 7775:8 7775:16 7777:11 7778:2 7785:1 7786:17 7789:15 7802:14 7804:15,21 7808:13 7828:21 7844:17 7845:7 7846:6 7847:6 seeking 7816:3 7847:25 seeks 7819:3 seen 7776:3 7780:1 7785:2 7787:19,22 7789:16 7828:4 7834:9 Semenya 7785:11,13 7786:19 7787:13,19 7788:10,15 7789:3,5 7790:12,14 7794:12 7794:16 7795:10,11 7797:13 7798:5 7799:4 7803:19 7804:4,10,11 7806:1 7811:6,7,13,17 7812:18 7827:6,7 7832:8,9 7841:18 Semenya's 7787:17 7843:15 senior 7801:15 sense 7781:2 7784:8 7822:14 7823:20 sentence 7832:23 7836:1,6,9 7837:15 7838:4 7840:3 sentenced 7835:14,22 sentences 7832:17 7833:14 7837:12 7841:19 sentraal 7800:3 series 7773:17 serious 7781:14 7791:19 7794:4 7798:19 7801:23 7803:13 7808:1 7809:3,20,21 7833:2 7833:5 seriousness 7805:5 7833:1	service 7833:5,10 7835:24 7836:7 7837:6,6 severely 7843:23 shack 7845:15 sharing 7806:23 she'd 7828:4 she's 7828:4 7832:10 she'd 7812:8 shooting 7788:17 7789:9 7790:1 7791:16 7795:15,16 7811:18 short 7773:11 7816:12 shot 7785:4 7810:12,12 7813:1,4 7814:19,20 show 7773:23 7784:23 7789:23 7790:2,22,25 7791:10 7796:13,14 7798:10 7805:25 showed 7776:12,17 showing 7785:15 7787:14 shown 7773:18,23 7774:4,6 7776:7 7790:24 7796:6,9,17 7798:5 7799:3 7824:16 7825:25 7840:25 shows 7791:15 7805:4 side 7788:5,16 7789:25 7827:2 7839:22 sides 7822:4 7826:11 7826:19 7827:1 significance 7834:8 significant 7834:22 simple 7790:5 7794:22 7795:3 simply 7840:16 7841:6 7844:18 sinister 7782:6 Sir 7795:24 7796:1 sitting 7805:4,12 situation 7823:2 7834:2 7838:3 situational 7842:15 situations 7820:18 skemer 7799:22,24 slide 7775:14 7786:18 7786:19 slides 7786:21 slightly 7773:7 social 7840:17 society 7822:5 socioeconomic 7842:12 socio-political 7818:2 7818:16 solely 7841:15 solution 7840:5 solve 7843:12 solving 7821:12 somebody 7786:11 7802:12,23 7807:15 7807:24 7810:10,13 7813:1 7814:17 7815:10 7826:11
--	--	---	--	---

<p>7836:5 somebody's 7845:15 soon 7787:15 soos 7800:21 sorry 7779:3 7790:2 7803:20 7805:22 7809:21 7820:5,8 7822:8 7823:4,13 7830:13 7838:17 7846:13,17 sound 7815:23 7816:6 7832:11 sounds 7793:6 7798:21 South 7818:17 7825:7 7830:19 7840:8 speak 7830:13 7841:7 speaking 7834:16 spear 7801:4 specific 7840:20 specifically 7775:3 speculative 7814:10 speech 7834:18,20 spend 7787:9 7815:11 spies 7801:5 spirit 7802:21 7819:5 7819:10 7824:19 7825:18 spoil 7813:10 spoke 7782:22 7799:7 7834:7 stage 7779:11,17,19 7786:25 7787:23 7788:2 7791:7 7793:4 7803:7 7816:24 7828:3,8 7847:19,20 stakeholders 7802:17 7819:11 stand 7847:24 standing 7828:13 7830:8,9,11,15 7831:2,10,21 7832:15 standpoint 7805:14 stands 7837:19 start 7777:5,5 7787:17 7804:25 7829:23,23 7840:1 7847:20 started 7817:21 starting 7782:12 7836:17,24,25 starts 7840:13 state 7840:8 statement 7780:5 7789:22 7791:21 7792:10 7802:2 7808:16 7810:13,14 7843:15,25 statements 7783:14,16 7802:10 7804:17 7805:3 7813:19 7846:8,24 status 7774:3 steeped 7818:24 step 7802:11 7803:10 7817:8 7821:12 steps 7826:1 7832:23 7833:2</p>	<p>stick 7787:22 7795:7 7808:18 stone 7822:25 stones 7822:15 stop 7785:25 7793:4 7805:10 7848:3 straight 7831:23 striker 7786:7 strikers 7786:6,13 study 7840:13,13 stupidity 7782:5 subject 7795:9 7813:11 7830:19 7843:16 submitted 7810:2 subsequent 7776:19 7788:20 subsequently 7776:20 7791:6 substance 7785:17 7834:22 substandard 7836:2 sub-section 7830:19 sub/POP 7823:22 suggest 7798:9,10,13 suggested 7786:3,4 suggestion 7787:23 suggests 7800:4 summarised 7779:5 sunset 7835:10 superfluous 7798:2 superior 7830:22 support 7798:12 suppose 7804:18,20 7825:17 supposed 7802:9 supposing 7783:18 supposition 7782:12,16 sure 7776:3 7782:20 7789:20,22 7792:25 7799:16,20 7802:15 7816:2 7817:10 7834:12 7839:8 7841:3 7843:10 surely 7782:9 7790:14 7827:10 7835:11 surname 7815:24 surprise 7828:22 surprised 7828:20,23 suspects 7813:17,23 suspended 7836:6 7838:4 suspension 7837:13 swart 7799:24 symbolise 7825:6 synonymous 7824:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">T</p> <hr/> <p>tactics 7818:18 take 7774:12 7781:17 7781:25 7782:8 7784:24 7786:4,7 7793:15 7803:3 7808:22 7813:22 7816:25 7824:24 7826:20,22 7828:19 7829:7 7832:16</p>	<p>7833:7,25 7839:19 7846:19,24 7847:11 7847:22 7848:13 taken 7775:6 7776:16 7776:19 7781:1 7783:4 7798:22 7809:14 7826:2 7829:7,12 7831:6,22 7832:24 7842:10 7844:23 7845:19 7846:8 takes 7801:16 7840:19 talk 7784:4 7802:11 7831:5,18,25 7833:20 7838:15,16 7847:24 talking 7788:21 7801:4 7812:25 7830:15 7833:13 7836:23 7838:10,11 7845:13 7845:20 talks 7784:5 7802:6 tall 7816:12 tampering 7780:10 7800:12 7807:25 7809:4 tape 7804:7 7805:19 techniques 7818:18 tell 7805:18 7835:21 7839:7 7840:3 7847:3 telling 7803:17 tells 7816:1 temples 7808:11 temptations 7840:24 ten 7824:14 7825:6,11 7826:3 7845:12 7846:24 term 7835:14,22 7836:1 terms 7783:24 7817:22 7835:17 7837:1 7843:21 terug 7800:22 7801:12 test 7802:24 tested 7826:5 testified 7787:25 7791:5 testify 7825:21 testimony 7789:19 testing 7794:2 Thafeni 7814:15 7815:16 thank 7773:5 7774:14 7775:1,23 7777:2 7778:10,18,18 7779:1 7779:1,15 7780:8 7794:10 7798:8,15 7805:17 7806:12,15 7808:2,22 7811:21 7813:6 7816:7,9,22 7817:6 7824:7 7834:1 7839:25 Thanks 7817:2 that's 7784:13 7787:17 7788:2,9 7789:18 7791:7 7792:5 7794:6 7794:8 7795:24</p>	<p>7796:1 7797:24 7799:4 7802:16,17 7803:12 7815:8 7816:5,18 7818:21 7820:1,21 7821:13 7823:25 7828:20 7829:7 7831:5,23 7832:1,1 7833:6 7836:9 7838:1 theory 7779:4,12 7808:8 there'd 7828:18 there's 7784:20,23 7785:17 7787:2,23 7794:19 7795:1 7802:18 7816:1 7817:12 7822:15 7828:5 7832:18 7836:8,12,13,21 they're 7802:8 7835:14 they've 7827:2 thin 7816:13 thing 7789:15 7793:10 7800:11 7802:1,20 7803:9 7806:5 7814:5 7825:2,10 7830:12,18 7842:3,9,13 7845:7 things 7799:17 7803:2 7822:6 7824:23 7827:1 7829:19 7830:16 7833:19 7835:19 7836:20,21 7836:23 7837:2,7,24 7838:19 7842:12 7845:25 7847:4 think 7775:13,19 7776:16,24 7778:1 7780:4 7782:10 7784:8 7785:21 7787:9 7791:18 7792:2 7793:8 7794:18 7795:17 7797:16 7799:17 7800:13 7802:9,14,18 7804:13 7805:9 7806:11 7808:15 7811:10 7812:16 7814:4,16 7817:15 7818:12 7822:22 7824:9,10,21 7825:2 7825:14 7826:16,21 7826:22 7827:21 7828:19 7832:6,25 7833:6,25 7834:1,21 7837:17 7838:25 7842:2 7843:9,14 7844:2,8,13 7845:4 7846:18 thinking 7845:21 thirdly 7827:15 thorough 7833:15 thought 7781:2,3 7787:19 7788:5 7812:20 7827:17 7828:1 7829:9 7843:2 7846:14</p>	<p>thoughts 7811:11 three 7804:1 7818:13 7823:8 throw 7787:11 7788:9 throwing 7822:25 thrown 7822:15 tidy 7773:8 time 7773:6,10 7777:19 7778:13,17,24 7786:11,22 7787:9 7789:3,6,24 7790:4 7796:18 7815:11 7837:7,15 7839:4 7841:4 7845:22 7846:7 7847:4 today 7773:6 toe 7800:21 Tokota 7816:1 told 7788:18 7800:6 tolerance 7822:11,12 tolerant 7822:16 tolerated 7823:1 toneel 7799:25 topic 7773:7 7807:12 7816:23 topics 7773:11 total 7820:12 totally 7838:4 touch 7809:9 7813:8 tragedy 7841:25 7842:1 transcripts 7776:1 Transkei 7813:14 translated 7774:5 treated 7805:5 7809:4 treatment 7796:4 trigger 7790:19 true 7822:7,8 7837:19 try 7819:25 7825:5 7826:22 7828:17 7837:18 7843:12 7845:3 trying 7832:3 7843:21 7846:12 turned 7790:12 7833:12 two 7773:11 7774:4,14 7775:17 7776:16 7777:19,20 7778:8,16 7779:8,17 7780:25 7781:13 7782:1 7784:23 7786:1 7797:25 7801:21 7805:23 7813:9,16,16 7813:24 7816:14,17 7818:13 7823:8 7834:23 7837:7 7839:18 7843:4 two-way 7821:7 twyfel 7800:1 tyd 7799:23 type 7802:20,24 7816:20 7837:24 types 7809:8 7810:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">U</p> <hr/>
--	--	--	---	---

<p>ubuntu 7808:5 uncomfortable 7834:20 unconnected 7794:25 underlying 7840:22 understand 7779:12,16 7784:11 7786:12 7790:16 7802:17 7809:11,16 7810:4,5 7810:8 7811:19 7828:7,9,25 7830:8 7831:24 7834:22 7836:4,16 7842:23 7846:1,13 understandable 7784:1 understanding 7843:11 understood 7797:11 7828:2 undertaking 7823:24 undo 7836:14 unduly 7785:25 unemployment 7840:23 Unfortunately 7812:24 unhappiness 7774:2 unhappy 7833:11 uniform 7802:13,13,15 uni-dimensional 7841:13 unknown 7801:16 unlawful 7780:2 7830:24 unlawfully 7824:18 7825:13 uproar 7780:10,13 7803:14 use 7776:9 7793:5 7802:22 7818:7 7819:14 7824:9 7831:18 7832:10 uses 7833:10,11 7841:18 usually 7780:20</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">V</p> <hr/> <p>values 7808:5 van 7800:2 vanaf 7800:10 variety 7840:23 various 7824:9 7827:18 vary 7833:8 vast 7818:16 vein 7813:8 verbal 7822:25 Vereeniging 7792:4 verkeerde 7801:5 version 7786:8 verskuif 7800:10,22 versoek 7800:7,7 vertikale 7801:6 verwyder 7800:11,22 vicinity 7786:23 victims 7846:9 video 7773:23 7785:14 7787:14,18 7790:24 7791:8,12,14 7796:14 7796:16</p>	<p>videos 7784:25 7785:2 7787:20 7788:4,21 7790:21 7797:20,22 7798:8,11 view 7805:13 7812:6 7841:9,15 7842:15,20 7842:21 7847:23 viewed 7843:3,8 viewing 7841:6 violence 7819:15,20,22 7819:23,24 7820:1,4 7840:16 7842:14 violent 7840:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">W</p> <hr/> <p>waar 7800:10 wait 7790:18 want 7775:15,22 7779:24 7784:24 7785:24 7786:18 7790:11 7793:10 7796:3 7797:17 7803:6 7805:3 7807:11 7809:2 7813:10 7817:17 7820:16 7830:4 7831:17,18 7832:24 7834:9 7838:24 7842:8 7848:9 wanted 7788:12 7794:16,17 7809:11 7810:4 7814:9 7839:16 wants 7790:13 7804:20 wapens 7800:21 7801:9 warned 7773:22 warning 7773:18 7821:16,16 7848:5 warrant 7776:17 7786:21 7791:20 7801:15 wasn't 7785:19 7809:13 waste 7790:4 wat 7800:22 7801:9,11 watter 7799:23 way 7776:24 7779:4 7780:17,24 7781:5 7784:7 7816:5 7822:20 7825:3 7826:12 7833:9,14 weapon 7786:9,9,10 7792:18,19 7807:14 7807:15,19,19,24,25 weapons 7776:18,20 7779:7,7,9,18 7781:5 7781:16 7785:16 7786:3,5,13,16,23 7787:3,4,5 7789:6 7790:17,24 7792:11 7794:23 7796:7 7800:10,25 7801:17 7801:19 7802:5,19 7807:22 7808:7,19 wear 7802:13 wearing 7802:14</p>	<p>weet 7799:23 went 7838:9 weren't 7786:14 7787:5 we'll 7803:25 7804:1 7816:19 7828:17 7837:3 we're 7782:11,11 7783:3 7785:18 7793:1,7,24 7797:9 7798:4 7804:3 we've 7787:22 7838:14 we'll 7807:9 7808:22 we've 7776:3 what's 7815:18 wholly 7836:2 who's 7826:8 7834:9 wie 7799:24 wish 7774:5 7785:11 7798:13 wishy-washy 7803:15 witness 7785:14,19,20 7787:10 7788:8 7791:20 7793:2,10,13 7793:16 7794:20 7796:6,9,13,22,24,25 7798:13 7804:12 7813:20 7815:4 7825:15 7827:9 7832:9 7834:20 7839:8 7844:3,22 7848:1,11,13 won't 7828:4 7834:13 word 7784:24 7808:23 7819:14 7833:11 words 7786:20 7800:23 7819:11 7822:19 7823:14 7831:19 7833:4,8 7841:19 7844:20 work 7779:18 7781:16 7782:13 7783:25 7813:10 7845:10 working 7818:4,6,8,10 World 7840:12,14 worse 7799:7 worst 7825:13 wouldn't 7828:21 7835:7,10 wouldn't 7781:11 7813:22 wounded 7781:15 written 7776:15 wrong 7779:17 7797:25 7812:17,21 7828:1,16 7829:5,23 7843:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <hr/> <p>X 7807:14,16 Xhosa 7816:2,5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Y</p> <hr/> <p>year 7837:12 7845:12 7845:12 years 7818:18 7845:16 yellow 7775:13 7778:22</p>	<p>7809:13 yesterday 7773:8 7798:25 7803:17 7805:25 7807:3,4 7817:10,22 7827:18 7828:7 7841:13 you'd 7833:7 you'll 7787:21 7823:20 you're 7783:22 7785:20 7791:9 7795:6 7796:13,21 7817:5 7832:20 7834:16 7837:10,11 7837:11 you've 7789:2 7824:10 7824:23 7826:16,20</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">0</p> <hr/> <p>09:33 7773:2 09:53 7782:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 7785:3,16 7788:18,19 7788:24 7789:11,24 7790:7 7794:21,23,25 7795:23 7796:4,7 7797:23 7820:19 10 7792:12 7848:14 10:13 7794:1 10:33 7804:18 10:53 7814:16 100 7799:9 7801:18 102 7799:11,12 11 7777:24 11:30 7817:1 11:35 7817:4 11:55 7827:7 12 7848:3,9 12:15 7838:20 13 7778:21 7801:4 13th 7774:13 14 7799:9 7801:7 15 7845:12 16th 7773:24 7774:12 7774:14 7805:19 7807:9 7843:4 7844:7 7844:9 7846:4,22 7847:6,13,19 7848:13 7848:14 18 7799:10 18h15 7799:24 192 7839:18 1994 7818:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <hr/> <p>2 7794:22 7796:4 7797:23 7815:5 7830:20 2.3 7820:12,17 2.3.1 7820:19 2.3.3 7820:20 2010 7840:14 2013 7773:1 22 7806:20 23 7806:20 7814:15 230 7778:9,9</p>	<p>231 7778:9 244 7777:20 245 7774:23 7777:12,13 248 7778:1,2 252 7786:18 268 7777:19,20 270 7775:17 7778:25 271 7775:15,17 7778:25 278 7778:17 279 7778:17 293 7839:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <hr/> <p>3 7786:23 7814:15 3.3.5 7822:23 30 7778:13 36.1 7835:21 393 7839:20 7840:1</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <hr/> <p>4 7791:3 7844:4 4.2.2.5 7821:6 47 7830:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <hr/> <p>5 7773:1 7795:21 5.2 7823:21 5.2.2 7821:11,13 5.2.4 7821:15 5.2.7 7821:15 58 7843:25</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <hr/> <p>6 7795:14 669 7795:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <hr/> <p>7 7792:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <hr/> <p>84 7799:7,8 840 7795:20</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <hr/> <p>9 7799:22</p>
---	--	--	--	---