RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 49 15 FEBRUARY 2013 PAGES 5341 TO 5419

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037

Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335

E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za

Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



Page 5343

Page 5344

```
1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 15 FEBRUARY 2013]
2 [10:02] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. I
3 understand, Mr Mpofu, you're now ready to proceed, is that
4 correct?
5 MR MPOFU: Yes, we are. Thank you very
6 much for the indulgence.
```

7 CHAIRPERSON: Pleasure. You're still

8 under oath.

9 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes, Sir.

10 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Yes, Mr Tip,11 are you ready to proceed with your cross-examination?

12 MR TIP SC: I am, thank you, Mr Chair.

13 Mr Mabuyakhulu, we were dealing yesterday afternoon, when

we adjourned, with the last paragraph on page 1 of the

15 statement that you made to the police – Exhibit XX6. Do

16 you have it there?

17 MR MABUYAKHULU: I've got it.

18 MR TIP SC: Right, and just to ensure

19 that you're back in the picture of what we were dealing

20 with, you had said to the Commission yesterday that you

21 confirmed the first sentence of that paragraph, namely that

22 someone had come to the meeting on 11 August 2012, and had

23 reported that on the previous day, the 10th of August,

24 members of the NUM had shot members of AMCU, do you recall

25 that?

4

7

Page 5341 1 of making the statement.

2 MR TIP SC: Alright, well let's try and

move on. As I understand what you are now saying, it is perfectly possible that you in fact did make the statement

to the detective constable who came to see you on the 17th

5 to the detective constable who came to see you on the 17

6 of August – that sentence that we're discussing. Do I

7 understand it correctly?

MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.

9 MR TIP SC: Alright, And I just want to 10 underline this, because there are other reasons for us to

11 accept that this was indeed part of your statement and

12 there are two considerations I'm going to put before you

13 for any comment that you might have. The first is that in

14 the course of Friday, your counsel, Mr Mpofu, put certain

15 propositions to Mr Zokwana. Mr Mpofu and I discussed where

16 those propositions came from and he referred me to this

17 paragraph in your statement as the source for those

18 propositions, and it was clear that it was the entirety of

19 the paragraph that he was relying on. And just to add to

20 that, that was on Friday, and it was also conveyed to me

21 that it was pursuant to a consultation that you had had

22 with your legal team, including Mr Mpofu, on the Thursday

23 evening. Do you recall that?

24 MR MABUYAKHULU: I really do not

understand exactly what it is that you're putting to me.

Page 5342

1

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

22

23

24

```
1 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.
```

2 MR TIP SC: But the next sentence you

3 indicated you had not made to the policeman, who took the

statement, namely the one that is to the effect that after

5 giving that news, somebody whom you could point out if you

6 saw him, siad that you should all go to the NUM office and

ask them why they were shooting members of AMCU.

8 MR MABUYAKHULU: No.

9 MR TIP SC: I'm not certain what you mean 10 by no. Are you saying that you didn't make that sentence 11 as part of your statement, or are you saying that you did

12 make it?

MR MABUYAKHULU: I also mentioned
yesterday that there was mention of this thing. I said so
yesterday. I then said it was a decision of – as a result
of the discussions there amongst the RDOs. Some of the
people came with reports of what happened the Friday. A
decision was then later made amongst us, the RDOs. The

19 decision made was that we march to the NUM office to go and

20 ask why they were forbidding the meeting between us and the

21 employer. What I want to state, Mr Chairperson, is that

22 the reason NUM office was to go and enquire as to why they

23 were forbidding this meeting between us and the employer.

24 Whether I could have said what appears in the statement

25 here, I cannot say, because of my state of mind at the time

MR TIP SC: Well, I'll repeat it just

2 once. This paragraph that we are dealing with consists of

3 two sentences. In the course of the proceedings on Friday,

4 Mr Mpofu indicated that he relied on both sentences as

5 being the paragraph that he had used to put certain

6 propositions to Mr Zokwana. And just to highlight what it

7 is that I'm saying, there was no indication from Mr Mpofu

8 that the second sentence of this paragraph, the one we're

9 dealing with, was to be excluded from what he had relied

10 on. Are you able to comment on that?

MR MABUYAKHULU: I do not remember whether that was put to me on Friday, but let explain this. As I said, there are certain things that I know that appears in the statement - 17th, but some of these things are contradictory. I have tried to explain to this Commission what the cause of this is, and there is also proof that I was not in the correct state of mind. That is my problem, Sir.

MR TIP SC: Mr Mabuyakhulu, you've had the opportunity to consult on this, I'm just going to put the second aspect that I said I would put to you for your comment and then I'm going to move on. The second aspect is that yesterday, when your evidence was being led, Mr Mpofu drew the attention of the Commission to your complaint that certain paragraphs were not correct, and

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

```
Page 5345
                                                                                                                            Page 5347
    that you hadn't been in a good condition at the time that
                                                                    1
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                        Mr Chairperson, I don't
2
    you made the statement on the 17th of August. Do you
                                                                        remember whether I said this to him or not.
                                                                    3
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
3
    remember that?
                                                                                                    But I take it one can
4
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                     Yes.
                                                                    4
                                                                        accept that you must have done, because he wouldn't have
                                                                    5
5
           MR TIP SC:
                                                                        known you walked through the hostel and you did walk
                            And in the course of that, Mr
                                                                    6
                                                                        through hostel and that's in the statement. It does look
    Mpofu identified three aspects of the statement that
6
7
    required some correction. Do you remember that?
                                                                    7
                                                                        as if you told him, doesn't it?
8
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                     L do.
                                                                    8
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                        Yes.
9
           MR TIP SC:
                            And one of the paragraphs
                                                                    9
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    And you obviously must have
    that was not identified in that way as requiring any
                                                                    10
                                                                        told him that someone came to the meeting on the Saturday
10
    correction, is the one that we are dealing with at the
                                                                    11
                                                                        morning and talked about the AMCU members who were shot the
11
    moment.
                                                                    12
                                                                        previous day by members of NUM, because that happened and
12
13
                                                                    13
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                     I gave an explanation.
                                                                        someone did come and say that, and the policeman wasn't in
    I said this was discussed there, but it came from the
14
                                                                    14
                                                                        the meeting, so he wouldn't have known it, so you must have
    general discussion that we had there. It was mentioned.
                                                                    15
                                                                        told him that. That seems fair to assume, isn't it?
15
           MR TIP SC:
                             That you would go to the NUM
                                                                    16
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                        Possibly the policeman
16
    office because of this report that NUM members have been
                                                                        took down that which he regarded as important. I told him
17
                                                                    17
    shooting AMCU members, is that what you're saying now?
18
                                                                        guite a number of things, up to three things. He might
19
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                     No.
                                                                    19
                                                                        have written that which he regarded as being important.
20
           MR TIP SC:
                             Alright.
                                                                    20
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    I see. So, you see, what
21
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                May I intervene and ask a
                                                                    21
                                                                        puzzles me, is where would he have then got this statement.
    question, Mr Tip? You say that someone came to the meeting
22
                                                                    22
                                                                        The statement was made that members of AMCU were shot by
23
    on the Friday - that someone came to the meeting on the
                                                                    23
                                                                        members of NUM. We then see the statement that Mr Tip's
                                                                    24
24
    Saturday morning and said that the previous day, the
                                                                        been asking you about - or rather the sentence that Mr
25
    Friday, members of AMCU were shot by members of NUM. That
                                                                        Tip's been asking you about in the statement, quote, "After
                                                                                                                            Page 5348
                                                        Page 5346
     was said, is that correct?
                                                                         getting those news, a person whom I can point if I see,
1
2
            MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                       Yes, Sir.
                                                                     2
                                                                         said we all go the NUM office to hear why they are shooting
3
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  And then at the meeting it
                                                                     3
                                                                         people of AMCU."
4
    was decided that you would all go to the NUM office, we
                                                                    4
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                           Mr Chairperson, as I
5
    know that, don't we?
                                                                         have said, I have explained this on several occasions, that
6
            MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                       That's correct.
                                                                    6
                                                                         I was firstly not in the correct state of mind, there was
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                    7
7
                                   You say it was in order to
                                                                         also the problem of language that we encountered with the
                                                                    8
8
    ascertain why they had not wanted you to present your
                                                                         policemen, I have been explaining this several times.
9
                                                                    9
     demands to Lonmin, is that right?
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                      That's an explanation. Mr
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
10
                                                                    10
                                                                        Mpofu, do you want to say something?
                                       That is correct.
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Now was it also a reason
                                                                    11
                                                                                MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                   Chairperson, yes, I'll call it
11
12
    for going to the office to ask NUM people about the
                                                                    12
                                                                         assistance, Chairperson, because I'm not sure if I'm
13
    shooting? In other words, was it an additional reason -
                                                                    13
                                                                         entitled to object to a question put by the Chairperson,
    apart from talking to them about the wage demands and
                                                                    14
                                                                         but -
14
    Lonmin, was it also the idea that they would be asked about
                                                                    15
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
15
                                                                                                       No, you ask, but you can
16
     the shooting, to explain their conduct in that regard.
                                                                    16
                                                                         draw to my attention the fact that the question I'm asking
17
            MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                       There was only reason
                                                                    17
                                                                         is one that I shouldn't be asking,
18
    when we left there.
                                                                    18
                                                                                MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                   Mr Chair, in seriousness, all
19
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  I see. And tell me, when
                                                                    19
                                                                         I wanted to point out is the question the chairperson has
20
    you went to the NUM office, did you walk through the
                                                                         put now, would be fair if the witness had denied making the
21
                                                                    21
                                                                         statement. The witness has repeatedly said it's possible
22
            MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                       Yes, Sir.
                                                                         that he made the statement. Now, no that basis, I think we
23
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Now did you tell the
                                                                    23
                                                                         should accept - well, if I was Mr Tip, I would take the
24
    policeman who took the statement that you walked through
                                                                    24
                                                                         nice part that it's possible and say, well, then it means
25
    the hostel?
                                                                         possibly you did - let's say you did, and then go on. If
```

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 5351

Page 5349

he said under no circumstances did I say this, then of

course, the chairperson would say, well, the policeman who

was not there, obviously couldn't have dreamt it up, but he

said it's possible and -

5 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that it could
6 be called an objection properly so-called, even if being
7 directed at someone else's question, but of course
8 possibility is one thing, fact and probabilities are
9 another, but I've asked the questions, I've got the
10 answers, which may assist us to move further, so I don't
11 propose asking you any more questions on this point.

12 Please forgive me for having interrupted you. Please carry13 on –

14 MR TIP SC: Thank you, Mr Chair, thank you for the clarification and my thanks to Mr Mpofu also 15 16 for his guidance in how I should cross-examine. Perhaps I 17 should just say this, that I had listened very carefully 18 when the witness said that it was possible that he had made 19 the statement and then I prefaced the following - the next 20 propositions on the basis that I would wish to underline 21 the quality of what it was, and what I intend to do, and I 22 will put it now in that precise fashion is that we will, at

is overwhelmingly probable that you in fact did make the
 statement reflected – the statement reflected in the second

the end of the Commission hearing make a submission that it

1 a result of this report, several people spoke but no

2 decision was taken.

3 MR TIP SC: No decision was taken, but 4 was there any reaction?

5 MR MABUYAKHULU: Well, many people said,

6 this is just not right.

MR TIP SC: Well, let's just explore

8 that. Were people physically calm and simply saying that

 $9\,$ $\,$ this is not right and then they went on to discuss going to

10 NUM to make an enquiry about its interaction with Lonmin,

11 is that your evidence?

12 MR MABUYAKHULU: That is what happened,

13 yes.

7

MR TIP SC: Let me just ask you for a little more detail, if you can give it to us. First of

16 all, the person who came and conveyed this news, can you

17 tell us anything about him?

18 MR MABUYAKHULU: That report from him, 19 because of the number of people who were there I would not 20 even be able to identify him today.

21 MR TIP SC: You had no idea who he was 22 and whether he was one of the leaders of that group, you 23 couldn't describe him, is that right?

MR MABUYAKHULU: The truth of the matter is that in this strike we did not have leaders as such.

Page 5350

1

6

10

sentence of this paragraph to the police officer who took

2 it and that he recorded correctly what you had said to him.

3 [10:22] MR MABUYAKHULU: I understand.

4 MR TIP SC: Well, thank you, but now let 5 us look at another aspect of the paragraph and here we will

rest on the sentence which you have confirmed and that is

7 somebody came to that meeting on the morning of the 11th

8 August and said, yesterday people were - of the NUM were

9 driving around in a Quantum and firing shots at members of

10 AMCU, correct, that's what you've said?

MR MABUYAKHULU: It was mentioned that there is a Quantum, a Quantum that forcefully takes people to work. Mention was also made of the shooting, the

shooting originating from that Quantum.
 MR TIP SC: Yes, exactly and you've

repeated that the people of the NUM were also forcing people to go to work at gunpoint and that is also something that this person who came and addressed you on the 11th of

19 August conveyed to you.

20 MR MABUYAKHULU: That report was made,

21 yes.

23

1

6

11

12

13

16

17

18

25

MR TIP SC: And what was the reaction of the people in the crowd, the 3,000 plus who were at that

24 meeting, to this information?

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

MR MABUYAKHULU: No decision was made as

Page 5352 MR TIP SC: Well, Mr Mabuyakhulu, you've

2 spoken about leaders.

MR MABUYAKHULU: I said we elected people

that would talk when we arrived at the office, I did not

say these people were leaders of this strike.

MR TIP SC: So when I read in your

7 statement, the statement you've put into this commission,

8 phrases like our elected leaders, we should understand that

9 to mean something other than leaders, is that what you are

saying?

MR MABUYAKHULU: I was referring to the people that we elected to represent us, not as leaders of the strike as such.

MR TIP SC: No, that's fine. Alright, Mr
Mabuyakhulu, I want to stay with the principal topic. The

16 person who conveyed this information about NUM people

17 shooting AMCU people, that was a very important piece of

18 news, wasn't it?

19 MR MABUYAKHULU: According to the

20 reports, yes, it was important.

21 MR TIP SC: Yes, and did this person

22 indicate whether any AMCU members have been injured or even

23 killed as a result of what the NUM people were doing?

24 MR MABUYAKHULU: The report was that he

25 is injured.

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 5356

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

```
Page 5353
           MR TIP SC:
                             How many people were injured?
 1
2
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      I heard a report of 1
3
    person.
4
           MR TIP SC:
                             Did this person convey to you
5
    when and where these shooting incidents had taken place?
                                      It was on the 3rd, it was
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
6
7
    late on Friday, but this was not in clear details.
8
           MR TIP SC:
                             Now I want to go back to the
9
    question of the reaction of the people in the meeting. You
    were now told that one of your AMCU members has been
10
    injured as a result of a gunshot fired by NUM members
11
    driving around in a Quantum. Did that not produce great
12
13
     anger amongst those attending the meeting?
14
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      The situation according
15
    to me was the same as on Friday, it was difficult because
    of the numbers of people to see what the attitudes of the
16
17
    people were.
18
           MR TIP SC:
                             Were you angry?
19
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      No.
20
           MR TIP SC:
                             And the people in your
21
    vicinity at that meeting, they similarly were not angry as
22
    far as you are concerned, is that correct?
23
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      I did not notice.
24
           MR TIP SC:
                             And in the course of the
25
    debate that followed leading to the decision to go to the
                                                     Page 5354
1
```

Page 5355 peaceful manner, and the chair even said, well, it is possible but unlikely, as I was asking that guestion. I remember that specifically, so to say none of it was put to the witnesses, ja, it might not have been put in the details that were only received last week, that I concede, but I think it is putting it too high to say none of it was 6 7 put to those witnesses. 8 MR TIP SC: May I respond to that, Mr 9 Chair? 10 Yes, Mr Tip, what do you CHAIRPERSON: 11 say to that? 12 MR TIP SC: The -13 CHAIRPERSON: Before you answer can I put 14 a question to you? 15 MR TIP SC: Yes. 16 CHAIRPERSON: What answers can this 17 witness give on that point? An inference can be drawn, I 18 suppose, from the fact that what was put was rather far 19 removed from what's now being talked about, that's a matter 20 of argument, but I'm not sure what answer one can expect for this witness to give, any answer he gives is going to 21 22 take the point any further, you've got the material on 23 record now which forms the basis of an argument. I don't 24 see how you could take the matter any further by directing these questions to this witness, so it is not quite Mr

NUM office nobody got up to express anger about this report and what had apparently happened? MR MABUYAKHULU: There was according to me no change, the situation was as it was on Friday. MR TIP SC: And peaceful? MR MABUYAKHULU: Just as it was on Friday, there was no noise there. MR TIP SC: Now let me, before I go any further, point out that none of what you have said about this was put to the NUM witnesses who were present on the 10th and 11th at the NUM office and in particular not to the branch chairperson who was travelling around in that Quantum during the night of the 10th of August. MR MABUYAKHULU: Let me explain this to you, Sir, there was no explanation that came from them, there was nothing that they told us. The only thing was when we met them there were the gunshots. MR MPOFU: Sorry, Chairperson, I don't want to interrupt, but that statement is not entirely correct, that none of this was put. One of the witnesses, I can't remember now, I think it was Gekilese, because I wasn't here for the cross-examination of Setelele. I put

to him specifically that, or rather I'll paraphrase the

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

question, I said, is it possible that the confiscation of

the weapons that took place on the Friday was done in a

Mpofu's point but it -1 2 MR TIP SC: Mr Chair, I appreciate that 3 and I with respect, will not deal with the objection 4 because I'm going to move on. It was a single proposition 5 put in case there was a comment, but certainly not designed 6 to elicit any response on the fact, so the response is 7 there and I'm going to move on to something else, but 8 before I do that, just for the record because this 9 allegation of the NUM firing shots and forcing people to 10 work at gunpoint has been made, for the record and it is 11 not for comment from the witness, that those allegations 12 are categorically denied by my client, by the NUM. I'm 13 going to touch on one other aspect of the 10th and see 14 whether you can assist us at all, and that is that the NUM 15 has given evidence, it hasn't been challenged that in the 16 course of the night of the 10th they had broadcast messages 17 saying that they were opposed to the unprotected strike and 18 that they encouraged people to go to work and that they 19 assisted in many instances people who wished to go to work, 20 to get there. Did you hear anything about that? 21 MR MABUYAKHULU: I'm hearing it for the 22 first time today. 23 MR TIP SC: Alright, perhaps you can, let 24 me ask you one last question on this paragraph in your statement to the police. You fairly acknowledged that that

22

23

24

25

21

22

23

24

25

Page 5359

Page 5357 is a very important allegation that people of NUM were firing shots at members of AMCU, why did that part of the 2 3 police statement not find its way into the statement that 4 you placed before the commission? 5 MR MAHLANGU: I'm sorry, Sir, with respect, if the question could be repeated? 6 7 MR TIP SC: Yes, let me repeat it. The question is simply this and I just want to know whether 8 9 there is any comment from you, Mr Mabuyakhulu, you've 10 confirmed that the statement in the police, Exhibit XX6, 11 the statement you made to the police that members of the NUM were sent to have fired shots at members of AMCU was an 12 13 important allegation. We do not see any mention of it in 14 the statement that you submitted to the commission being 15 Exhibit BBB8. Is there any reason that you can give for that? 16 17 MR MABUYAKHULU: I will explain that 18 until I am finished, this statement, a lot is wrong in this 19 statement, Mr Chair. I even gave an example - state my 20 telephone number, it is wrong in the police statement. I 21 have also reported to this commission that when this

statement was taken down I wasn't at all right, I was in

pain, resulting in, it is the question of the reason I've

given, I cannot admit nor deny what appears in this

statement because of the reasons I've given.

MR MABUYAKHULU: I got the report of 2 about one person. 3 [10:42] MR TIP SC: Right, I am just dealing with what the police recorded. Just for the record I don't 5 really expect comment from you unless you can make it. In 6 exhibit XX2 there are two statements which have been filed 7 at pages 80 and 81 of that exhibit and these statements 8 were made to the South African Police Service by persons 9 who had been injured in consequence of gunshots fired 10 during the night of the 10th of August, if I may, Mr Chair, just read one paragraph from each of the statements and let 11 12 me tell you in advance, the purpose why I am doing this is 13 merely to clarify that these are the only recorded instances of people who were injured and it is apparent 15 from their statements that neither of them was injured by any gunshot fired by a member of the NUM. The first 16 17 complainant is at page 80 of exhibit XX2, he is Mr Mtengwane and he says, "on Friday 10 August 2012 at about 19 18:15 "I was walking towards Nkaneng, passing Wonderkop 20 stadium when one of Lonmin's security twin cab opened fire 21 at me, the cab is yellow with lights on top." And the 22 second person to make a statement, that is at page 81 of 23 exhibit XX2 is a Mr Dlomo and he says -24 CHAIRPERSON: There is a lot of Dlomo's you must just say Mr Bulelani Dlomo.

Page 5358

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR TIP SC: 1 Chair, again before I finally 2 leave this aspect of the topic, in order also to ensure 3 that the record is complete, Mr Mabuyakhulu, you'll 4 remember that in the course of the questions from my 5 learned friend, Mr Semenya, for the South African Police Service, he referred you to slide 16 in Exhibit L. 6 7 MR MABUYAKHULU: Was it the one on TV? MR TIP SC: 8 No, it is, have you got Exhibit L, otherwise I will just tell you what essentially 9 it says. 10 CHAIRPERSON: 11 The statement which reads 12 as follows, that, dealing with what happened on Friday, the 13 10th of August, and the statement is then made, the area was 14 patrolled with no concerned incidents, the next morning it 15 was reported that two employees had been shot at the Wonderkop Stadium, and then it continues, casualties, two 16 17 workers were wounded. That's the statement that was put by 18 Mr Semenya, yes. 19 MR TIP SC: Thank you, Chair. Mr Mabuyakhulu, do you recall that question being put to you 20

and your attention being drawn to the police report that

two people had been wounded during that night?

MR MABUYAKHULU:

the 10th or the 11th?

MR TIP SC:

Page 5360 MR TIP SC: Yes thank you Mr Chairperson. Bulelani Dlomo and he said the following about what occurred with him. "I only heard plus or minus 5 shots shooting from the crowd of people who were there, all from the Lonman security and I find myself on the ground and I found myself on the hospital and I was shot in the head by an unknown person." I have explained why I have drawn the attention of the commission to that, if you have any comment please make it. but otherwise we can move on. MR MABUYAKHULU: I would not be able to deny that. I only spoke of a report that I had heard, that is all.

CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tip, for the purposes of completeness it should perhaps be pointed out that the previous statement to which you referred by Mr Mutimvane, which is at page 80. The deponent there, having referred to the incident where he was shot says, at the end of the third paragraph "The other guy is was walking with was also shot" and that person is clearly not Mr Bulelani Dlomo because the time and place is different, so it would appear that if these two affidavits are correct that three people were actually shot. Two at roundabout, shortly after 18:15, by someone walking towards Nkaneng, passing Wonderkop stadium and then a third person, one Mr Dlomo, who talks about an incident which took place later on at

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

The night of the 10th.

Is it now the night of

Page 5363

Page 5361

- 19:40 and the, I am not guite sure where Mr Dlomo's
- incident took place but it must have been somewhere near 2
- 3 the Roland shaft I think. Anyway, it would appear that
- 4 this witness can't throw any light on it anyway, seeing for
- 5 the purpose of completeness you put two, I thought it only
- correct that one should actually point out that there are 6
- 7 three persons that were allegedly shot.
- 8 MR TIP SC: Thank you, Mr Chair, in
- 9 respect of the first statement that of Mr Mtengwane, it
- 10 is nevertheless apparent that this was precisely the same
- 11 incident and that it was the twin cab that was involved in
- 12 the incident.
- 13 CHAIRPERSON: Well it might be the same
- 14 vehicle but it is not necessarily the same entity.
- 15 MR TIP SC: I was merely making the
- 16 observation that Mr Mtengwane fell where he was shot from
- 17 the twin cab, from the Lonmin vehicle and that the other
- 18 version that was walking with him was also shot. One
- 19 imagines it was the same incident. It was merely to
- 20 clarify that the reference to slide 16 doesn't lead to an
- 21 inference that might have been NUM people who have fired
- 22 shots.

1

- 23 CHAIRPERSON: The other point about that
- being raised is in the logbook there is a reference to 24
- 25 another incident involving people being injured at that
 - Page 5362

2

7

- 2 on their way to work. Page 23, it is a reference - the
- 3 entry is at 20h00 on the 10th. It reads "Two workers were
- 4 assaulted near the NUM offices, Wonderkop, on their way to
- 5 work. One doesn't know and certainly this witness can't
- 6
- 7 dealt with in the affidavits on pages 80 and 81 of XX2, or
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11 help us.
- 12 MR TIP SC: No, quite right, Mr Chair,
- 13 but since that has been raised, I will just refer the
- 14
- 15
- 16 at the NUM office that they had been assaulted and the NUM
- 17
- 18 Saffi for treatment.
- 19 CHAIRPERSON:
- 20
- 21 what incident or incidents that refers and there is no
- 22
- leading his witnesses we might get some light on the point 23
- 25 responsible for it so I won't take it any further than

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- that.
 - 2 MR TIP SC: That is fully appreciated,
 - one unfortunately has to keep half an eye on the fact that
 - the press picks up reports of this kind and that they need
 - 5 to deal with a full picture. I am leaving this topic
 - 6 entirely as far as Mr Mabuyakhulu is concerned and I want
 - 7 to move on to the events of the 11th August in the vicinity
 - 8 of the NUM office now and what I wish to deal with there
 - 9 and I am going to deal with it quite briefly because
 - 10 evidence has been presented here by certain members of the
 - 11 NUM who were in the office during that period. That
 - 12 evidence hasn't been challenged and I am not going to
 - 13 debate precisely what you say took place there in great
 - 14 detail. I am going to put to you a few essential
 - propositions and you can deal with them if you would, as I
- make them. The first is that evidence is being presented
- to this commission that the march, the group of strikers of
- whom you were part, the 3000 plus people went to the NUM
- 19 office, having deliberately decided that they would do so
- 20 with hostile intent that they were intent on dealing with
- 21 the members of NUM that they found there and to either take
- 22 over the office or to burn it.
- 23 MR MABUYAKHULU: No.
- 24 MR TIP SC: And that when they arrived in
 - the vicinity of the NUM office it was the group with which

- time and that is a reference to two workers being assaulted
- help us as to whether slide 16 refers to the 2 incidents
- whether it refers to something else. But I think with
- respect we are wasting time raising this matter with this
- witness because with the best will in the world he can't
- - commission again in the interest of completeness to the
- evidence that has been presented that two persons reported
- members, in fact, saw to it that they were taken to Andrew
 - The only point I am making
- is that we don't know what this reference in slide 16, to
- point in asking this witness. Maybe when Mr Semenya starts
- 24 but I think we are wasting good time now. I am partly

- Page 5364 you - of whom you formed part that in fact advanced in an attacking manner.
- 3 MR MABUYAKHULU: No.
- 4 MR TIP SC: That stones were thrown by
- them and that they shouted and inter alia they called out,
- 6 "there are these dogs," about certain of the NUM people
 - that were outside.
- 8 MR MABUYAKHULU: I am hearing that for
- 9 the first time.
- 10 MR TIP SC: And that they continued to
- 11 advance in an attacking manner and it was only when some
- 12 gunshots were fired from the side of some of the NUM
- 13 members that they retreated. 14
 - MR MABUYAKHULU: No.
- 15 MR TIP SC: And that this group was armed with sticks, knobkerries, spears and perhaps pangas. 16
- 17 MR MABUYAKHULU: No.
- 18 MR TIP SC: We will argue that, that
- 19 version of the events should, with respect, be preferred by
- 20 the commission than the one that you have given. 21 MR MABUYAKHULU: I just want to explain
- first of all about the arms. The situation was, Mr.
- 23 Chairperson, the same as it was on Friday, the people who

went there were carrying sticks, but there were no knives,

- pangas or spears or anything. If I may also say, Mr
- Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

24

```
Page 5365
                                                                                                                             Page 5367
    Chairperson, there was about 3000 people and there was no
                                                                     1
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                         Yes.
                                                                     2
2
    way in which they could be chased by between 20 and 30
                                                                               MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   Thank you very much. In
                                                                         paragraph 2 of that statements you comment with effect
3
    people if there was any fight. We had not gone there for
                                                                         regarding the RDO salary increase demand with reference to
4
    any purposes of fighting.
                                                                     5
                                                                         the 9th of August 2012.
5
            MR TIP SC:
                             And the final proposition in
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                     6
    relation to this is that undisputed evidence has been given
                                                                                                         Yes.
6
7
                                                                     7
                                                                               MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   Thank you. Now, I'm going
    here that nobody in that crowd gave any indication or said
    anything to the effect that they had come there merely to
                                                                     8
                                                                         to ask you a few questions about facts relevant to that
8
                                                                     9
9
    speak to members of the NUM.
                                                                         issue which precede the 9th of August 2012, and if there are
10
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                    10
                                                                         any questions which you can't deal with because you were
                                      As I explained
                                                                         not involved in that, then please tell me as I go through
11
    yesterday, Mr Chairperson, as we were coming down there
                                                                    11
    these people came from across the street and what we heard
                                                                    12
                                                                         each of those questions.
12
    was the shouts Karee, and then there was a gunshot and then
                                                                    13
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
13
                                                                                                         I understand.
                                                                    14
14
    they spoke of a Bob and there was a gunshot, nobody heard
                                                                               MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   Okay. You are aware, Mr
15
    any sounds of explaining anything to those people and then
                                                                    15
                                                                         Mabuyakhulu, that on the 21st of June 2012 there was a
    we started running away.
                                                                    16
                                                                         demand made for the first time which was communicated to Mr
16
17
           MR TIP SC:
                                                                    17
                                                                         Da Costa of Lonmin for a salary increase by RDOs to
                             Mr Mabuyakhulu, I want to
18
    deal, finally with the description that you have given of
                                                                    18
                                                                         R12 500.
                                                                    19
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
19
    the assault on you after you had run away from the vicinity
                                                                                                         I do not have or I'm not
20
    of the NUM office. You have here given considerable detail
                                                                    20
                                                                         aware of the date, but I have heard about that.
21
    about what you say befell you on that occasion. It hasn't
                                                                    21
                                                                               MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   Thank you. There was -
                                                                    22
                                                                         evidence will be led to the effect that on that day, on the
22
    been possible for me to obtain full instructions in
23
    relation to what you have said and in the circumstances I
                                                                    23
                                                                         21st of June 2012, approximately 300 to 500 RDOs had marched
                                                                    24
                                                                         to Mr Da Costa's office which is in the career
24
    am neither going to confirm nor deny what you have
                                                                         administration block. Were you aware of that?
25
    described. I do though want to ask you in conclusion this,
                                                                                                                             Page 5368
                                                         Page 5366
    it seems that you didn't open an assault charge in respect
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          I have heard about that.
1
                                                                     1
2
    of that part of the incident, is that correct?
                                                                     2
                                                                                MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                    My question is slightly
3
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      I did not go and lay a
                                                                         different, Mr Mabuyakhulu. Were you aware at the time? In
4
    charge against anybody, the only statement I made was a
                                                                         other words on the 21st of June were you aware of that march
                                                                     5
5
    statement I made to the police and thereafter made a
                                                                         which had taken place to Mr Da Costa's office?
6
    statement to my representative.
                                                                     6
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          I have heard about that
7
           MR TIP SC:
                             Alright, will make
                                                                     7
                                                                         at the shaft when they had already been there.
    submissions with relation to what should be done about that
                                                                     8
                                                                                MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                    And were you aware that they
8
9
    incident to the commission in due course. Mr Chair, that
                                                                     9
                                                                         would make a demand, communicate it to Mr Da Costa for an
                                                                         increase of RBO salaries to R12 500?
10
    completes our questions.
                                                                    10
11
           MR BHAM SC:
                                Mr Commissioner, I am going
                                                                    11
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          Yes.
12
    to be about 30 to 35 minutes. Would you like me to comment
                                                                    12
                                                                                MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                    When did you first become
    now, or after the adjournment?
13
                                                                    13
                                                                         aware of the demand that would be made for R12 500?
14
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                    14
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                 The commission will take
                                                                                                          It was last year, though
15
    the tea adjournment at this stage.
                                                                    15
                                                                         I am not sure of the date or the month, but it was
           [COMMISSION ADJOURNS
                                          COMMISSION RESUMES]
                                                                         certainly last year.
16
                                                                    16
17
    [11:42] CHAIRPERSON:
                                    The commission resumes.
                                                                    17
                                                                                MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                    Last year is an incredibly
                                                                         long time. Was it around June, before June, after June?
18
    You're still under oath. You're going to cross-examine?
                                                                    18
19
           MR BHAM SC:
                                I am. Thank you, Mr
                                                                         I'm just trying to establish when you first became involved
20
    Commissioner. Mr Commissioner, just to facilitate the
                                                                    20
                                                                         or aware of that demand.
21
    cross-examination, may I ask if you could open before you
                                                                    21
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          On my side I cannot
22
    the witness' statement to his lawyers which is BBB8.
                                                                    22
                                                                         really say exactly when it was, but in the beginning when
23
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                         they - there was this talks about RBOs wanting money and so
                                 Thank you.
                                                                    23
24
           MR BHAM SC:
                                Thank you. Mr Mabuyakhulu,
                                                                    24
                                                                         on, I have heard about that.
25
    do you have that statement in front of you?
                                                                    25
                                                                                MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                    Do you know how the figure
```

Page 5371

Page 5369

of R12 500 was arrived at? How was it calculated? What

was the basis for asking for R12 500? Were you involved in 2

3 any discussions?

4 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.

5 MR BHAM SC: Can you explain to us how

the figure of R12 500 was arrived at? 6

7 MR MABUYAKHULU:

8 MR BHAM SC: Can you explain? I'm

waiting for the explanation. 9

10 MR MABUYAKHULU: The issue of money, that people were complaining or money or salary, it had started 11

a long time ago in Karee but about the R12 500 it had 12

13 started some time last year. That had started while we

14 were still under NUM. If I remember very well, in the year

2010 we had a meeting of all the RDOs. In that meeting 15

there were proposals and suggestions and which were 16

forwarded to NUM that NUM should go and request that our 17

18 salaries be raised. The reasons behind that was that we

19 were all working in Lonmin but there is a difference. The

20 system that was being used there was not the same. At

21 Karee when you work with the machine you would be alone but

22 in other places you would be having somebody who would be

23 helping you, and when it comes to the money or the salaries

24 it would be the same. And that was bothering us at Karee.

25 Why was the system different to the one that was being used

Page 5370

at Roland and Eastern? And that's how we came to bring

about that demand and we had noticed that we were not 2

3 receiving any response. Then in the year 2011 there was a

4 strike in Karee. Then from there, there was a word or

5 instruction from NUM that we should be dismissed and we

were the members of NUM. We were dismissed and rehired and 6

up to today still other people who were still at home. And

8 at Lonmin my payslip states that I was hired in 2011 but it

9 doesn't state the previous services and they were not paid

10 out. And from there when we looked into our payslip there

was no indication of any union that we belong to, and we 11

12 did not know the reason behind that. From there we then 13 sort of got out own union on the side. Doing that, that is

14

where the problem started, and that is why we've been

killed. I think now you have it clear if you wanted me to 15

give you the whole history. 16

7

19

17 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mabuyakhulu, you haven't

18 answered the question. The question as I understand it relates to where does the figure of 12 500 come from.

20 Whose idea was it? What was it based on? Can you - if you

21 don't know then it's simple. You can't tell us. But do

22 you know where that figure came from, that demand of

23 R12 500 as take home pay for RDOs?

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

24 MR MABUYAKHULU: I heard about this 12.5

25 last year and the reason behind that was that we were working one person each without an assistant, and that is

why we had asked for a raise to 12.5.

3 Mr Chairperson, just to give MR BHAM SC:

4 you an indication, I'm not going to ever ask questions

5 where I don't believe the question has been answered. I'm

6 not going to engage in a lengthy debate with the witness.

7 We'll deal with that in argument. But it's quite clear

8 that the very pointed that was asked hasn't been answered.

9 I'll take the implication further later. I don't want to

10 bog down the cross-examination by having an argument with

the witness about that. Mr Mabuyakhulu, you say you had 11

heard about the march of -

13 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt you.

What you say is valid to this extent. If it's clear the 14

witness understood the question and gave an answer that was

an avoiding answer or an evasive answer then you could

17 argue the point later, but sometimes there's a possibility

the witness didn't understand the question, in which case

19 the argument that you base, that you would seek to base it

20 upon the failure to answer the question directly may fall

flat.

21

12

22 MR BHAM SC: I take your point, and I'll

23 assess it as it goes along. Mr Mabuyakhulu, you say you

24 were aware that a meeting had occurred, or there was a

march on Mr Da Costa's office on the 21st of June 2012,

Page 5372

1 somewhere around that time.

2 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, on the record, my

learned colleague is mistaken. It's not June, it's July.

MR BHAM SC:

5 CHAIRPERSON: I think Mr Semenya's

6 correct

7 MR BHAM SC: The very first meeting was

on the 21st of June. There were then subsequent meetings in

9 July, so the first approach to Mr Da Costa is on the 21st of

June, and you'll find that in paragraph 3.2 of Mr Da 10

Costa's statement. Chronologically the first march on his 11

12 office, so he will testify, was on the 21st of June 2012.

13 There are subsequent meetings and I'll refer to them.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Do you persist in the

15 objection?

16 MR SEMENYA SC: No.

17 CHAIRPERSON: No. Objection is

18 withdrawn. You can proceed.

19 MR BHAM SC: Thank you very much. I also

got my Junes and Julys mixed up from time to time but it's

21 the 21st of June. During June 2012 there was this march of

22 between 300 and 500 RDOs on Mr Da Costa's office and I've

23 referred to that, and as I understood your testimony you

24 were aware - you weren't at the march - but you were aware

of that march.

```
Page 5373
                                                                                                                        Page 5375
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                    I have heard of that
                                                                             COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ:
                                                                                                             Mr Bham, is this
                                                                   1
2
    march when I received a report at the shaft.
                                                                      perhaps not – is the witness not perhaps referring to an
3
           MR BHAM SC:
                               And was the report a report
                                                                  3
                                                                      occasion when Mr Da Costa actually addressed a group of
4
    on the march itself or did it include a report of a meeting
                                                                      RDOs as opposed to a meeting of a couple of people? You
                                                                  5
5
    which took place between Mr Da Costa and two
                                                                      might want to just explore that.
                                                                  6
                                                                             MR BHAM SC:
    representatives of those who marched on his office?
                                                                                                 I'm going to do that and in
6
7
                                                                  7
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                    The report I received
                                                                      order to avoid any level of confusion, Commissioner, I'm
                                                                  8
                                                                      going to go through it chronologically, the different
8
    was that the RDOs had come together and they were talking
9
                                                                  9
    or discussing about money. As to when and how or where
                                                                      meetings, because you're right. There may be - we may be
10
    they went I was not sure.
                                                                  10
                                                                      talking at cross purposes but I want to go through it
           MR BHAM SC:
                                                                      chronologically.
11
                               Were you as an RDO informed
                                                                  11
    that Mr Da Costa had actually met with and engaged in
                                                                  12
12
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                   Before you do that I'd like
    discussion with two representatives of those who had
13
                                                                  13
                                                                      to ask a question. Were you at, were you at any time a
14
    marched on his office?
                                                                  14
                                                                      team leader of the RDOs or were you just an ordinary RDO?
15
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                    I'm hearing that for the
                                                                  15
                                                                             MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                       No, I was just a member,
    first time today.
16
                                                                  16
                                                                      just an ordinary member, just a follower.
17
           MR BHAM SC:
                              Okay. Were you - to the
                                                                  17
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                   Thank you.
18
    best of your knowledge was there a report back to the RDOs
                                                                  18
                                                                             MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                 You've already told us that
19
    at Lonmin on what transpired in the meeting between Mr Da
                                                                  19
                                                                      you're not aware of any report back to the RDOs and you
20
    Costa and the two representatives of the marchers?
                                                                  20
                                                                      certainly hadn't heard any such report of the meeting
21
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                  21
                                                                      between Mr Da Costa and two members or representatives of
                                    On my side the last I
    had met with Mr Da Costa which was also the first time I
                                                                  22
                                                                      the RDOs on 21 June 2012 when the demand for a salary
22
23
    was meeting with him was when he was talking about the 750.
                                                                 23
                                                                      increase for RDOs to R12 500 had first been made.
                                                                  24
24
    He was saying there is money and that would be R750.
                                                                             MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                       On my side I remember
25
           MR BHAM SC:
                              Okay, thank you. Let me
                                                                      just there was a group of five people who said that they
                                                      Page 5374
                                                                                                                        Page 5376
    just understand it. Did you actually meet with Mr Da Costa
                                                                      had been called to a parade by Mr Da Costa and they had a
1
                                                                      document with them where the issue of this money was
2
    vourself?
3
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      Yes.
                                                                  3
                                                                      stated, and that is where we took a decision to go and see
                                When did you meet with Mr Da
4
           MR BHAM SC:
                                                                  4
                                                                      Mr Da Costa.
                                                                  5
5
    Costa and where did you meet with Mr -
                                                                             MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                 Are you aware, Mr
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                  6
                                                                      Mabuyakhulu, that on the 23rd - sorry, on the 2nd of July
6
                                      At RDOs we moved from
7
    the compound to mining stone to meet with Mr Da Costa.
                                                                  7
                                                                      there were five RDO representatives, the same not
                                                                  8
8
           MR BHAM SC:
                                And when did this occur?
                                                                      accompanied by a march of any sort, but five RDO
9
                                                                  9
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                      representatives who had met with Mr Da Costa at his office?
                                      I only went once. That
                                                                  10
                                                                      Amongst the five were two of the representatives who met
    was the only meeting I have had with Mr Da Costa and that
10
                                                                  11
                                                                      with him on the 21st of June 2012.
11
    is where he raised an issue of 750.
12
    [12:02] MR BHAM SC:
                                  I understand it was - you
                                                                  12
                                                                             MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                       I would not deny or
    say you only met once. I'm trying to understand when that
13
                                                                  13
                                                                      dispute that. I can't say whether they had gone there or
    meeting occurred and where it occurred and who else was
                                                                  14
                                                                      not. I am just stating what I know.
14
15
                                                                  15
                                                                             MR BHAM SC:
    present at the meeting.
                                                                                                 I appreciate that. Were
16
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      Maybe it was around
                                                                  16
                                                                      there any report backs to the RDOs that you are aware of
17
    July. I'm not certain, but I remember it was at the mining
                                                                  17
                                                                      from people who had met with Mr Da Costa telling the RDOs
18
    store where we had met with him with the RDOs.
                                                                  18
                                                                      what was discussed between them and Mr Da Costa?
                                                                  19
19
           MR BHAM SC:
                                When you say we, can you
                                                                             MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                       I only remember the last
20
    tell me who was at that meeting? Who was present there?
                                                                      one that I had already spoken about where a document was
21
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      The RDOs from Karee.
                                                                      presented to the RDOs and a small amount of money was
22
           MR BHAM SC:
                                Can I ask you, because
                                                                      stated there and that is when a decision was then taken
                                                                  23
                                                                      that we should go and meet Mr Da Costa. That's the one I'm
23
    certainly that is not consistent with Mr Da Costa's
24
    statement, so I'm going to take you through a sequence of
                                                                  24
                                                                      calling the last one. I am not sure as to whether there
25
    the meetings he will testify to.
                                                                      had been other meetings subsequent to that or not.
```

21

22

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

3

17

18

first time?

Page 5377 MR BHAM SC: And was there any report 1 back to the RDOs that in these discussions which took place 2 3 on the 21st of June, the 2nd of July, the 23rd of July and 4 again on the 30th of July between Mr Da Costa and 5 representatives of the RDOs? The Lonmin position conveyed 6 to these representatives was that Lonmin would not and 7 could not negotiate salaries outside of the existing collective bargaining structures. 8 9 MR MABUYAKHULU: I'm hearing that for the first time today. 10 MR BHAM SC: 11 Commissioners, if I could 12 just place one thing on record flowing from what Adv Hemraj 13 had said to me earlier. From Mr Da Costa's statement is 14 does appear that on the occasion when he met the RDO representatives on the 23rd of July after that meeting he 15 16 had addressed a crowd of about 500 people where he 17 communicated that there would be an allowance, not the 18 amount, but that there would be an allowance. But the 19 question I had asked was whether there was any 20 communication of the discussions with the RDO 21 representatives and we've got the answer to that. So you 22 were never told then that there were discussions between 23 representatives of the RDOs and Mr Da Costa on various 24 occasions where Mr Da Costa explained to them why Lonmin could not engage on the R12 500 demand, having regard to 25 Page 5378 the existing collective bargaining structures? You were 1 never told of that and you're hearing about that for the 2

Page 5379 the morning shift of RDOs of the 10th of August did not go down to work? 3 MR MABUYAKHULU: Was it on the 9th or the 10th? 5 MR BHAM SC: On the morning of the 10th. MR MABUYAKHULU: 6 I'm aware. I know that 7 they did not go down to the shaft. Their agreement was 8 reached on the 9th. We had taken advantage of the holiday 9 of the 9th and the agreement was that on the 10th we would 10 go and approach the employer. MR BHAM SC: 11 And consequently they would 12 not go to work. They wouldn't go report for duty on the 10th. They would march on the employer. 14 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. 15 MR BHAM SC: So the effect of what you had decided on the 9th was that RDOs would not go to work on 17 the 10th but would march on the employer. 18 MR MABUYAKHULU: 19 MR BHAM SC: In paragraph 4 you then talk

4 MR MABUYAKHULU: If that statement comes 5 from Mr Da Costa I'm hearing of it today for the first time. 6 7 MR BHAM SC: When you deal in paragraph 2 8 of your witness statement with the meeting of 9 August 2012 9 you make reference to a discussion of the salaries of RDOs 10 which was dealt with at this meeting. You would agree with me, without any difficulty, I would imagine, that the 11 12 R12 500 salary demand did not crop up for the first time on 13 the 9th of August. It had been dealt with before that. MR MABUYAKHULU: 14 Yes. 15 MR BHAM SC: Now, if you turn the page of your witness statement, to paragraph 3, you're now dealing

19 strike. It was only agreed that we would approach the employer with a demand for a salary increase to R12 500 20 21 after deductions. In paragraph 4 you say on the 10th we gathered at Wonderkop at 08h00 and decided to go and put 22 23 our demands to the employer. Now, there's just a couple of 24 questions I'd like to ask you about that. The first is 25 this – are you aware and were you aware at the time that

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

with the 10th of August, paragraph 3 and 4. You see on the

9th at that stage it was not decided that we should go on

about the march and you say that on your arrival at LPD before you could reach the offices you were stopped by two white men and some Lonmin security. You said they wanted to know what your demands were and you then say, "Our elected leaders told them what we wanted". Can you tell me who those elected leaders were, who those people were that Page 5380 you describe as elected leaders?

MR MABUYAKHULU: There's only one that I can remember from amongst that group that was elected. That is Boye. I know him because I was working with him. MR BHAM SC: Okay. What you state in paragraph 5 is going to be factually disputed so I'd like to take you through it carefully. I understand you to say that initially after you had met with the two white men and Lonmin security they asked you what your demands were and that they went into the - they, the Lonmin people went into the Lonmin offices. I then understand you to say when they returned and they didn't have an answer that they requested you to choose five members of the group to go in and that would be to go into the Lonmin offices. Do I understand what you say in your statement correctly? MR MABUYAKHULU: No, you're making a mistake. MR BHAM SC: Can you give me the sequence of events then? Did - were there any representatives of the RDOs who went into the Lonmin offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: On the 10th we have elected five people that would be representing us in approaching the employer. Then when we arrived there

before we could reach the offices at LPD that's when we

encountered or we came across these two white men and the

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

representatives went into the office. They'll say they

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

```
Page 5381
                                                                                                                          Page 5383
     security officers of the mine. They stopped us and we
                                                                       didn't go into the office. At no stage did any of the RDO
 2
     waited and sat down and the five that we had elected went
                                                                       representatives go into the Lonmin office on that occasion.
 3
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
     ahead and met with them.
                                                                    3
                                                                                                         I understand what you're
 4
           MR BHAM SC:
                                They met with whom?
                                                                    4
                                                                       saying.
                                                                    5
 5
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      Met with the two white
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   Would you like to comment on
    men and the security officers. From there the white men
                                                                       that?
                                                                    6
 6
 7
                                                                    7
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
     then left, went into, went inside. We waited for them for
                                                                                                         No, I don't have a
                                                                   8
                                                                       comment on that.
8
     about an hour or more, I'm not sure, and after that they
 9
                                                                    9
     came back without an answer. Then from there we then took
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   And they will also say to
    a decision that we are now going to approach the employer's
                                                                   10
                                                                       you that Mr Graham StClare communicated to the RDOs that
10
                                                                   11
                                                                       the Lonmin management would not engage in negotiations or
11
     offices because we know where they are. And when we
                                                                   12
12
     arrived at the employer's offices we found the security
                                                                       discussion on wage matters outside of the collective
     officers on guard already and there was a danger tape
13
                                                                   13
                                                                       bargaining structures.
14
     cordoning off. I take it we all know the implications and
                                                                   14
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                         Then my question would
15
     understand the reason why there should be a danger tape.
                                                                   15
                                                                       be where did the papers or the documents come from that
     We respected that and we remained on the other side of the
16
                                                                       were given to us and we refused to accept them and we told
     danger tape. Then the five that we have elected went and
17
                                                                   17
                                                                       them we were not learned, we can't read.
18
     approached the security guards and spoke with them. From
                                                                   18
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   I'm not sure which papers
19
     there they together with other security officers went
                                                                   19
                                                                       you talk of, could you tell me about this?
20
     inside.
                                                                   20
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    I think he may be referring
21
           MR BHAM SC:
                                                                   21
                                                                       to the Exhibit CCC4, which is an internal communiqué -
                                Okay, that's the part I just
22
     want to get clear. When you say they spoke to the security
                                                                   22
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   I'm going to refer to that.
23
     guards did they speak to the security guards outside or did
                                                                   23
                                                                       Sorry -
                                                                   24
24
     they go into the office?
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    That document was
25
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                       apparently brought out and read to them by Mr Sinclair I
                                      They were discussing or
                                                       Page 5382
                                                                                                                          Page 5384
     talking outside there with - actually with not the security
                                                                       think, so perhaps you should clear that up, it may be that
 1
     guards but the two white men out there. The security
                                                                    2
 2
 3
     guards were just on guard. Maybe they thought we were
                                                                    3
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                  I'm going to do that. Are
                                                                       you aware that at that point in time the document which was
 4
     there to fight. I don't know.
 5
     [12:22] MR BHAM SC:
                                   - but if I understand what
                                                                       handed up yesterday by Mr Tip, CCC4, was handed out on
     you're saying now, at no stage did the five elected members
                                                                       behalf of Lonmin?
                                                                    6
 6
 7
     or leaders, as you refer to them, go into the Lonmin
                                                                    7
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                        Then who was giving it
                                                                   8
                                                                       out?
 8
     offices, am I correct in that regard?
 9
                                                                   9
           MS SOMAGACA:
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                  So you were aware of this
                                  Can you repeat the
                                                                       notice - of this document on that day?
10
     question, please?
                                                                   10
11
           MR BHAM SC:
                                Do I understand you
                                                                   11
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                        I'm not sure I
12
     correctly to say that at no stage did the five RDO elected
                                                                   12
                                                                       understand your question, but my question was the document
13
     members or leaders go into the Lonmin offices, itself?
                                                                       that was given to us, where was it coming from?
                                                                   13
14
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      You do not understand
                                                                   14
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                  I'm trying to understand
15
     me. I said that when we found the danger tape, the five
                                                                   15
                                                                       which document you're referring to. Is it the document
                                                                       which is CCC4? Could you show that to the witness, please?
16
     that we had elected had went and approached and spoke to
17
     the two white men after which the five, together with the
                                                                   17
                                                                       This is the document that was given to you yesterday. Is
18
     white men went inside the offices. And where we were
                                                                   18
                                                                       that the document you're referring to?
                                                                   19
19
     standing, it was - we were facing the office, it was just
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                        When we were there,
20
     outside the office. It was only the danger tape that was
                                                                   20
                                                                       there was a document that was presented there and we asked
21
     cordoning off and we were not standing far away.
                                                                   21
                                                                       where is this document coming from, and we were told from
22
            MR BHAM SC:
                                The reason I asked that, and
                                                                   22
                                                                       the employer, and we said, but then how can the document be
                                                                   23
23
     now I understand you correctly, is because Lonmin's
                                                                       presented that comes from the employer, whereas the
24
     witnesses will dispute your suggestion that the five RDO
                                                                   24
                                                                       employer does not know us.
```

25

MR BHAM SC:

My question is simply this,

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

question, answer it directly.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

```
Page 5385
                                                                                                                          Page 5387
    the document you say was presented to you, is it that
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                         Thank you, Chairperson.
                                                                    1
2
    document that you've just been shown, CCC4?
                                                                    2
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     - question again, Mr Bham,
                                                                    3
3
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                     You see the document
                                                                        maybe get a straight answer this time.
4
    that was presented on that day, it was never opened. We
                                                                    4
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   I've already said to you
5
                                                                    5
                                                                       that Lonmin will say that there were no representatives of
    never opened it, we never read it. When we were told
    there's a document from the employer, we didn't want to
                                                                       the RDOs who went into the office of Lonmin on that day.
                                                                    6
6
7
                                                                    7
    entertain it. We thought, because we are not learned, we
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                         Okay, I understand.
    cannot even read and if the employer did not know us or
                                                                    8
8
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   And they certainly did not
9
    know of our presence there, where was this document coming
                                                                    9
                                                                       communicate to any RDO representatives that the union had
    from then?
                                                                   10
                                                                       told them not to talk to the RDOs. They will deny that
10
11
           MR BHAM SC:
                               Do I understand you to be
                                                                   11
                                                                        they communicated to any RDO representative that they were
    saying that even though a document came out from the
                                                                        told by the union not to talk to the RDOs.
12
                                                                   12
    employer, you chose not to read it or look at it or
                                                                   13
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
13
                                                                                                         I hear you.
                                                                   14
14
    understand its contents?
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                   In paragraph 6 of your
15
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                     Are you now agreeing
                                                                   15
                                                                        statement, you talk about what occurred after the LPD
    with me that the document was from the employer?
                                                                        encounter. You say you returned to Wonderkop. You say it
16
           MR BHAM SC:
                               It's a very simple question
                                                                       was then decided that in view of the fact that the employer
17
                                                                   17
18
    I'm asking. You say a document came from -
                                                                       did not want to speak to us, we would have to stop work
19
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 He asked you a simple
                                                                   19
                                                                        until the employer was prepared to take us seriously. Now
20
    question, maybe you should give him a simple answer. Set a
                                                                   20
                                                                        even at that stage, was there any report to the RDOs of the
    good example for him and future witnesses.
                                                                   21
                                                                        discussions that were held with Mr Da Costa on the 21st of
21
22
           MR BHAM SC:
                                                                   22
                                                                       June, on the 2nd of July, on the 23rd of July and on the 30th
                               The question I'm simply
23
    asking is this, if a -
                                                                   23
                                                                       of July?
                                                                   24
24
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 His question. He says to
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                         We returned on the 10th
25
    you are you saying that the document came from the
                                                                       without having received any report, no matter how small.
                                                                                                                          Page 5388
                                                        Page 5386
    employer?
                                                                                                  Thank you. Were you aware
1
                                                                    1
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
2
           MR BHAM SC:
                                                                       on the 10th that the work stoppage was an illegal work
                                Yes.
3
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      I'm saying that, because
                                                                       stoppage?
4
    I heard you saying the employer did not know about the
                                                                    4
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                        Yes.
5
    presence of the RDOs because you said the five did not go
                                                                    5
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                  And were you informed, or to
    into the building, so now how did the employer know - how
                                                                       the best of your knowledge, was the RDOs, who were not at
6
                                                                    6
7
    could he issue the document, if he did not know about the
                                                                    7
                                                                       work, who had embarked on the work stoppage, informed that
                                                                    8
                                                                       an interdict - a court interdict had been obtained
8
    RDOs present.
9
                                                                    9
                                                                        declaring their strike illegal?
           MR BHAM SC:
                                The employer knew about the
    RDO presence, but there were no RDO representatives which
                                                                   10
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
10
                                                                                                    - the interdict was only
    went into the LPD offices, that's what I said to you.
                                                                   11
                                                                       obtained in the afternoon, is that correct?
11
                                                                   12
12
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      Did he know that the
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                  On the afternoon, yes.
                                                                   13
13
    RDOs were demanding money?
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    The meeting was in the
14
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  No, I think you must -
                                                                   14
                                                                       morning, wasn't it? So there was no interdict yet when
15
                                You must answer the
                                                                   15
                                                                       they had the meeting on -
           MR BHAM SC:
                                                                   16
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
16
    questions, Ma'am.
                                                                                                  I'm asking of it any time
17
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Give me an opportunity.
                                                                   17
                                                                       after the interdict had been granted. Maybe I have not
    I've allowed you to ask one question to clear up what I
18
                                                                   18
                                                                       been clear.
19
    thought was a misunderstanding, but your function is to
                                                                   19
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Reformulate the question,
    answer questions, not to ask them. So please remember
                                                                   20
                                                                       but I think there was an answer that the interpreter was
20
21
    that. Don't ask questions. If questions that are asked by
                                                                   21
                                                                       beginning to interpret, which we should hear.
                                                                   22
                                                                              MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                         I hear that for the
22
    Mr Bham are unclear, I will endeavour to obtain clarity for
                                                                   23
23
    you, but in the meanwhile it's perfectly clear question,
                                                                       first time today.
24
    please answer it, and don't answer it by asking another
                                                                   24
                                                                              MR BHAM SC:
                                                                                                  Thank you, I have no further
```

questions.

Page 5389

CHAIRPERSON: 1 Mr Bham, you are appearing

- 2 for Lonmin and Lonmin filed some witness statements,
- 3 including a witness statement from a Mr Debukwane, which is
- 4 ZZ3 and in which he deals with the events of - in
- 5 particular, of the Saturday, the 11th of August. Now, if
- 6 Lonmin intends to call the witness, it would only be fair,
- 7 I would imagine, for this witness to be given an
- opportunity to deal with what this witness is going to say. 8
- 9 I mean you can't call your witness later, dealing with
- 10 evidence he's given, which is conflict, to some extent,
- with his evidence, without giving him an opportunity to 11

12 deal with it.

14

15

18

1

7

13 MR BHAM SC: You're absolutely right.

Will you give me two minutes, Mr - we need not take an

adjournment, will you give me two minutes, I just want to

get it, then I'll put it to him. You're absolutely right. 16

17 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, well I'll give you -

MR BHAM SC: I'm going to get it now, and

19 I'll put it to the witness.

20 CHAIRPERSON: While you're taking

21 instructions, there's also another statement that I think

22 has been filed, which is ZZ4 by Akanyang Julius Motlagewa.

23 He also deals with those events, and I don't think it's

24 appropriate - I've said it already, really, but I'll say it

25 again, I don't think it's appropriate for Lonmin to seek to

Page 5390

lead those witnesses without their version, insofar as it

is contrary to - being put to them. 2

3 MR BHAM SC: You're absolutely right, I'm

4 going to that right now, Mr Commissioner. May I just,

5 before I put this, Mr Commissioner, just explain that these

are not witnesses we had originally intended to lead, nor 6

put statements in respect of, it was -

CHAIRPERSON: It is statements that 8

9 Lonmin filed.

10 MR BHAM SC: If I can just finish what

11 I'm about to say? It was as a result of requests made by

12 the NUM that this has come about, but having said that, I'm

13 going to read the statements so that the witness can deal

14 with it. Mr Mabuyakhulu, in paragraph 7 of your witness

15 statement – it's paragraph 7 of your witness statement, Mr

Mabuyakhulu, you state that, "On the 11th at 9h00, we met at 16

Wonderkop and we exchanged views. It was then decided that 17

18 we should approach NUM and enquire from them why they had

19 prevented the employer from engaging with us. The

20 gathering then marched to the offices of NUM. We walked to

21 the offices which are situated near the satellite police

22 station. I was in the group immediately behind the front

23 group. We certainly did not have violent intentions and

24 none were discussed." Now a witness statement has been

25 placed before you of Mr Sello Debukwane, and I'd like to refer you to that witness statement, commencing at

paragraph 7, and I'm referring it to you in order to give

you an opportunity to comment on that. It says - have you

got the statement in front of you?

MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.

6 He says, "On the morning of MR BHAM SC:

7 Sunday, 11 August 2012 at approximately 09h00, the mass

8 meeting commenced at the Wonderkop stadium." He says he

9 did not participate in the mass meeting, but his

10 instructions were to observe the mass meeting and report

11 any unrest. He says he was standing about 100 metres away

from the gathered crowd. He then says at approximately 12

13 9h30, the crowd started singing and chanting and it

14 appeared that the crowd was preparing to move to the NUM

offices. He goes on to say, "At the time, I observed that

some members of the marching crowd were carrying

17 traditional weapons, such as stick and spears." He says he

18 did, however, not observe any pangas or fire weapons. He

19 then goes on to state in paragraph 2.10, and this is an

20 important paragraph, having regard to what you stated. He

21 says, "At approximately 9h40, both Mr Julius Motlagelu and

22 I were informed by an informant that it was the intention

23 of the crowd to march down to the NUM offices and to burn

24 down the said offices. We were further informed that the

motivating factor behind the crowd's decision can be

attributed to the fact that the NUM was assisting it's

members to attend work the previous day. Now that is

3 stated in his witness statement, and I'm giving you the

opportunity to comment on that."

[12:42] Sorry, before the witness comments on that,

6 exactly the same statement is made and the same version is

7 given in paragraph 2.8 of Mr Julius Motlagelu's statement,

8 so I'm not going to repeat that, both of them were standing

9 together and both of them were informed of exactly the same

thina.

10

15

11 MR MABUYAKHULU: May I find out from you, 12

this statement, this other statement that has been read

13 besides mine, is that, which witness is that, is it the

14 witness for the mine or for NUM or for RDOs?

MR BHAM SC: Both of them are witnesses, but both of them are employed as security guards at Lonmin

17 and were employed in that capacity at that time.

18 MR MABUYAKHULU: I think as I'm seated 19 here, I'm here to respond to what I have said in my

statement and to stand by it, and I suppose the very same

21 person or witness will also come and comment on his own 22 statement, thank you.

23 MR BHAM SC: Thank you, Mr Commissioner,

I have now given the witness an opportunity to comment on

something which directly impacts on paragraph 7 of his

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 5391

Page 5392

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

	Page 5393		Page 5395
1	witness statement, you've heard the answer and we'll deal	1	MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.
2	with that further in argument. Thank you, Mr Commissioner.	2	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was there any reason
3	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, alright. Is there any	3	why this salary issue was not taken to your respective
4	other counsel or party representative, LRC, anybody else?	4	unions, that is NUM and AMCU?
5	Mr Budlender?	5	MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.
6	MR BUDLENDER SC: Your reserved your	6	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, can you tell us why
7	rights, do you want to exercise them now?	7	was it not taken to, in the first place AMCU?
8	MR BUDLENDER SC: Yes, we do, Chairman.	8	MR MABUYAKHULU: Firstly we know that
9	Mr Mojapelo will ask questions on behalf of the evidence	9	AMCU is still new at Lonmin, it had not reached the stage
10	leaders.	10	where it could be involved in salary discussions.
11	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR MOJAPELO: Good	11	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, let's go to the 10th,
12	day, Mr Mabuyakhulu.	12	you say in your statement that after, coming back from
13	MR MABUYAKHULU: Good day.	13	negotiations with the employers, you decided to embark on a
14	MR MOJAPELO: Let's start on the meeting	14	strike.
15	of the 9th of August, the meeting on the public holiday, who	15	MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.
16	organised that meeting, was it AMCU or NUM?	16	MR MOJAPELO: Was this decision to go on
17	MR MABUYAKHULU: The RDOs.	17	strike supported by all the people at the meeting?
18	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, and amongst those	18	MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.
19	RDOs were there members of NUM and AMCU?	19	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, were you aware that
20	MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.	20	NUM was communicating in the area that people should not go
21	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, and how did you know	21	on strike and go to work?
22	about the meeting, how were you invited to the meeting?	22	MR MABUYAKHULU: I'm hearing of it for
23	MR MABUYAKHULU: I heard at the shop that	23	the first time today.
24	there was going to be an RDO meeting at Wonderkop.	24	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you've never had,
25	MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you heard at the shop	25	I'll continue to the next question. How was this decision
	Page 5394		Page 5396
1	Page 5394 at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop?	1	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not
1 2	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.	2	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting?
	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at		to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it
2 3 4	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the	2 3 4	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned
2 3 4 5	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting?	2 3 4 5	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the
2 3 4 5 6	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No.	2 3 4 5 6	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now
2 3 4 5 6 7	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you	2 3 4 5 6 7	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, amongst those leaders	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, amongst those leaders were there NUM people, NUM members?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, amongst those leaders were there NUM people, NUM members? MR MABUYAKHULU: I think they were there	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, how did the RDOs, the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, amongst those leaders were there NUM people, NUM members? MR MABUYAKHULU: I think they were there because we had just elected from other places as well, we	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, how did the RDOs, the strikers in the meeting feel about the fact that NUM is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, amongst those leaders were there NUM people, NUM members? MR MABUYAKHULU: I think they were there because we had just elected from other places as well, we had mixed them, others were coming from Karee, others from	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, how did the RDOs, the strikers in the meeting feel about the fact that NUM is transporting people to work?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, amongst those leaders were there NUM people, NUM members? MR MABUYAKHULU: I think they were there because we had just elected from other places as well, we had mixed them, others were coming from Karee, others from Eastern.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, how did the RDOs, the strikers in the meeting feel about the fact that NUM is transporting people to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: Repeat, please?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	AR MABUYAKHULU: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MOJAPELO: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MABUYAKHULU: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: MR MOJAPELO: MR MABUYAKHULU: I think they were there because we had just elected from other places as well, we had mixed them, others were coming from Karee, others from Eastern. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, and then you said in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, how did the RDOs, the strikers in the meeting feel about the fact that NUM is transporting people to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: Repeat, please? MR MABUYAKHULU: Repeat, please? MR MOJAPELO: How did the strikers, the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	at your place of work, this is at the Karee shop? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, the shop stewards at your place of work at Karee, were they present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: No. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, in your statement you speak about the leaders at the meeting, how were these leaders elected? MR MABUYAKHULU: We had met as RDOs and during the meeting there we made some suggestions of the names of people who could go and represent us ahead. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, do you still remember the names of the leaders? MR MABUYAKHULU: I recall only the one, the others I don't. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, amongst those leaders were there NUM people, NUM members? MR MABUYAKHULU: I think they were there because we had just elected from other places as well, we had mixed them, others were coming from Karee, others from Eastern.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to go on strike communicated to other workers who were not present at the meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't know how it reached out to other workers, there were no names mentioned there or people giving instructions to take out the message. We only decided there as RDOs that we are now sitting down and not going to work. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, you are not aware that NUM was assisting people to go to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: I have heard of that. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, was this issue that NUM is transporting people to work ever discussed in any meeting? MR MABUYAKHULU: It just came up or it was discussed on the meeting of the 11th. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, this was the meeting before the RDOs decided to go to the NUM offices? MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, how did the RDOs, the strikers in the meeting feel about the fact that NUM is transporting people to work? MR MABUYAKHULU: Repeat, please?

```
Page 5397
                                                                                                                             Page 5399
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                MR MOJAPELO:
                                                                                                      Then after that decision,
1
                                      In my observation
    everything was the same as at the 10th, nothing had changed.
2
                                                                     2
                                                                         NUM were escorting people to work.
                                                                     3
3
           MR MOJAPELO:
                                 Was it one of the reasons
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          So I've heard.
4
    to go to the NUM offices to ask them why are they
                                                                     4
                                                                                MR MOJAPELO:
                                                                                                      Yes, starting from
5
                                                                     5
                                                                         paragraph 2.4 of this statement, Mr Debukwane says, "On the
    transporting people to work?
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                     6
                                                                         evening of the 10th of August NUM's stewards were escorting
6
                                      That was never passed or
7
    discussed.
                                                                     7
                                                                         their members from Wonderkop hostel to the Roland Shaft in
8
           MR MOJAPELO:
                                 Are you telling this
                                                                     8
                                                                         order to report for duty.
                                                                     9
9
    commission that the strikers were happy with the fact that
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          So I've read it from the
10
    NUM is opposing their own strike?
                                                                    10
                                                                         statement.
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                MR MOJAPELO:
11
                                      I never saw any people
                                                                    11
                                                                                                      Okay, and then in paragraph
    being upset or being excited, the situation was just the
                                                                    12
                                                                         5, which I've already read, he says that there was
12
                                                                         unhappiness about NUM's intervention.
13
    same.
                                                                    13
                                                                    14
14
           MR MOJAPELO:
                                 Okay, I see it is already
                                                                                MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          You see, about this
15
    after one.
                                                                    15
                                                                         statement, I've already mentioned earlier that it is very
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 It is one o'clock, what
                                                                         difficult to comment on a statement that is not yours.
16
                                                                    16
    you're suggesting is, it is an appropriate stage to take
                                                                    17
                                                                                MR MOJAPELO:
                                                                                                      Okay, let me just finish
17
18
    the lunch adjournment?
                                                                    18
                                                                         the last paragraph, then I'll give you an opportunity to
           MR MOJAPELO:
19
                                 To take the lunch
                                                                    19
                                                                         comment. And he says, "I was informed that the purpose of
20
    adjournment.
                                                                    20
                                                                         the aforesaid mass meeting was to confront and challenge
21
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 Yes, we would like to see
                                                                    21
                                                                         NUM at their offices situated close to Wonderkop Stadium as
22
    Mr Semenya and Mr Mpofu and Mr Budlender in Chambers at
                                                                    22
                                                                         the NUM was not adhering to the no work embargo."
23
    half past one, so we will adjourn the commission until two
                                                                    23
                                                                                MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                  Chair, sorry, Chairperson, I
24
    o'clock.
                                                                    24
                                                                         just want to make this remark, it's not an objection as
25
           [COMMISSION ADJOURNS
                                          COMMISSION RESUMES]
                                                                         such but it might turn out to be, I'll refrain from
                                                         Page 5398
                                                                                                                             Page 5400
    [14:06] CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                         interfering with questioning on these statements, even when
                                    The Commission resumes. Mr
1
2
    Mabuyakhulu, you are still under oath. You are still
                                                                         Mr Tip and other people use these statements, but I am not
3
    cross-examining?
                                                                         sure of the fairness, Chairperson, of putting to a witness
4
           MR MOJAPELO:
                                 Yes, Mr Chair.
                                                                         something that is not even double, but maybe triple
5
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 Mr Mojapelo, please
                                                                     5
                                                                         hearsay. What we have here is that Debukwane says that the
    proceed.
                                                                     6
                                                                         informant informed him that somebody who was talking at the
6
7
           MR MOJAPELO:
                                                                     7
                                 Yes. Mr Mabuyakhulu, on
                                                                         meeting was unhappy. I mean, it's so far removed from any
    the statement that is ZZ3, the statement of Debukwane, do
                                                                     8
8
                                                                         semblance of being evidence that is it really fair to put
                                                                     9
9
    you have it in front of you?
                                                                         it to a witness? We don't even known if Debukwane himself
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
10
                                                                    10
                                                                         is coming, but let along the informant, let alone who
                                      Yes.
           MR MOJAPELO:
                                                                         informed the informant. I mean really, where are we going
11
                                 Yes, Debukwane apparently
                                                                    11
                                                                    12
12
    is an employee of Lonmin, and paragraph 2.5, do you see
                                                                         with - can a witness be expected to account for something
                                                                    13
13
    paragraph 2.5, and 2.6? He says, "I was informed by
                                                                         said by a fourth person in the hearsay chain?
    certain informants that there was much unhappiness about
                                                                    14
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                      The witness was at the
14
                                                                    15
15
    NUM's intervention in this regard, and that a mass meeting
                                                                         meeting. He can either say that there was such a story
    had been called for the next morning on nine o'clock at the
                                                                         going around, it's not true, or he can say the story was
16
                                                                    16
17
    Wonderkop Stadium."
                                                                    17
                                                                         true. He's at the meeting, he is simply asked to comment
18
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 I think you should explain
                                                                    18
                                                                         on an allegation, admittedly a hearsay allegation, but an
19
    to him that the NUM's intervention in this regard, is
                                                                         allegation that that was the purpose of the meeting to
    explained in paragraph 2.4, otherwise he won't understand
                                                                         confront, to challenge NUM at their offices because they
20
21
    what 2.5 says.
                                                                    21
                                                                         weren't adhering to the no work embargo. I'll allow the
22
           MR MOJAPELO:
                                 Okay. Remember on the 10th,
                                                                    22
                                                                         question. But the point you made is noted, that it is
    you went to - you had a decision to strike, to stop going
                                                                    23
23
                                                                         hearsay.
24
    to work.
                                                                    24
                                                                                MR MOJAPELO:
                                                                                                      Okay, Mr Mabuyakhulu, what
25
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      Yes.
                                                                         are your comments about those allegations made by Mr
```

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

that evidence be correct?

MR MABUYAKHULU:

MR MOJAPELO:

carrying traditional weapons such as sticks and spears. If

he gives that evidence as far as spears were concerned, he

said some members of the crowd were carrying spears, will

No.

I am sure you will agree

he gives that evidence, as far as sticks is concerned, it's

quite clear from what you told us he will be correct. If

with the last part of the paragraph, he says, he did not

Page 5401 Page 5403 Debukwane? observe any pangas or fire weapons. 2 2 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. MR MABUYAKHULU: According to me, I never 3 MR MOJAPELO: 3 saw any unpleasantness or people upset or RDOs being angry Okay, and then when you approached the NUM offices and the members of NUM came out, 4 or anything, all I saw was them singing, and that is all. 5 It was all - the situation was all the same, like on the and then there was a - and then you, your crowd decided to 10th. 6 run away after you heard some shots. Is that correct? 6 7 7 MR MABUYAKHULU: It is not like that. We MR MOJAPELO: Okay, let's talk about the 8 never reached the NUM offices, up to today, I don't even 8 11th now, the 11th of August, when you went to the NUM 9 9 offices, were you carrying a weapon yourself? know where it's facing. 10 MR MABUYAKHULU: I was only carrying a 10 MR MOJAPELO: Okay, I didn't say you stick. reached, I said when you were approaching. 11 11 12 12 MR MABUYAKHULU: If it is like that, when MR MOJAPELO: Okay, what was the purpose of carrying a stick? 13 13 they fired shots, then we ran away. 14 MR MABUYAKHULU: I got used to carrying a 14 MR MOJAPELO: Okay. Did the NUM members 15 stick from way back home, you see when you are singing that 15 ask what was the purpose of your visit or your approach to song becomes more pleasant when you are carrying your own 16 the office? 16 stick. If you can see, other people were also carrying 17 MR MABUYAKHULU: No, we never talked or 17 18 tree branches, that is how pleasant the song becomes when 18 had any discussion with the NUM members. 19 19 you are carrying a stick. MR MOJAPELO: Okay, I don't have any 20 MR MOJAPELO: Were there any people 20 further questions for the witness. 21 21 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Mpofu, do carrying sharp weapons like spears? 22 MR MABUYAKHULU: No, there was a lot of 22 you have any re-examination? 23 people there but on my side, I did not even see one spear. 23 RE-EXAMINATION BY MR MPOFU: Yes, thanks, 24 MR MOJAPELO: 24 You say you were - the Chairperson, a couple of questions. Mr Mabuyakhulu, when -25 crowd there was carrying only sticks and branches? you've been questioned about the activities in Karee, of Page 5402 Page 5404 MR MABUYAKHULU: 1 Yes, that's what I saw. the RDOs, before August. Can you confirm that when you MR MOJAPELO: marched, or during those marches to Mr Da Costa, did the 2 Can I refer you back to the 3 statement of Debukwane, that is ZZ3, on paragraph 2.9 3 RDOs in Karee go as a group or did they only send the five 4 there, he states that "at that time I observed some members 4 representatives? 5 5 of the marching crowds were carrying traditional weapons MR MABUYAKHULU: On the day that I went such as sticks and spears." 6 there, we had all gone there as RDOs. 6 7 MR MABUYAKHULU: You know if I were to be 7 MR MPOFU And despite the fact that you had gone given a chance to ask a question I would, but if you - I 8 8 there as an entire group, rather than sending five 9 9 would refer you back to one statement which was read here representatives would you agree with Mr Da Costa's 10 before. You'd see that there would be some contradictions 10 description that the meeting was cordial as there was no 11 between this statement and that statement that was read 11 trouble? 12 12 before. MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. 13 MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON: I think you must answer the 13 And again on the 10th of August 14 question. The question is, it appears that Debukwane, if 14 when you wanted to go and table your demand of 12 500, is 15 he is called to give evidence, and I take it he will be, it my correct understanding that you again went as a bigger group of a couple of thousand people rather than simply 16 will say that members of the crowd, the marching crowd were

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119 RealTime Transcriptions Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

sending five people and that there was also no problem?

representatives which I suppose is true, but why did you

send some delegation, we all decided to go, so that the

employer could see and realise that we are very serious

to you that you could have simply sent your five

Yes.

Why did you prefer, it was put

It was hard for us to

MR MABUYAKHULU:

MR MABUYAKHULU:

MR MPOFU:

prefer to all go as a group?

should work as a team on the 10th, as one team?

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 5405 Page 5407 about these money matters. MR TIP SC: Mr Chair, objection to the 2 MR MPOFU: 2 Okay, now the next issue is, question. 3 3 you can accept that the evidence suggests that at a CHAIRPERSON: Oh, sorry. 4 particular point, there was some hostility or negativity 4 MR TIP SC: The basis of the objection is that there is no proper basis for this that there was an 5 towards the NUM. This was after your hospitalisation. My question is, whether before that march, you yourself 6 agreement between NUM and Lonmin that they would act as a 6 7 7 observed any hostility towards the NUM from the part of the joint security force and it appears that there is going to workers? 8 8 be some kind of suggestion that whatever Lonmin might have 9 9 [14:26] MR MABUYAKHULU: According to me NUM has done was going to be in concert with whatever the NUM never met with the workers and as far as I know we were all 10 might've done. There's no clear basis for the question in 10 11 any event. 11 free. The NUM never can commit with the workers. 12 12 MR MPOFU SC: The next issue is the - you CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bham? 13 13 were asked questions about whether - I'm sorry. We're now MR BHAM SC: I also object to the 14 question. This is re-examination. There's absolutely 14 dealing with the 11th, the meeting of the 11th in the 15 morning. According to your evidence you say in your nothing that has come out within evidence or in crossstatement there was an exchange of views and in your examination which lays any basis for this. 16 evidence you explain that to mean that people were putting 17 CHAIRPERSON: 17 What Mr Mpofu has to say in 18 different issues on the table. But you were then asked a 18 reply? 19 question I think yesterday, about whether were you able to 19 MR MPOFU SC: Chairperson, the question 20 hear everything that was said. Now, my question is this, 20 that I'm relating to were asked by Mr Tip in cross-21 accepting your evidence that there was no loud hailer and 21 examination this morning, fortunately not even yesterday, 22 that kind of tool that was used how, how did the people who 22 and it was clear that the crux of those questions he went 23 contributed to the exchange of views address the crowd? 23 through various statements which suggested - including some 24 Did they stand on some kind of podium or what? 24 of the victims' - that there was a twin cab which - who was 25 MR MABUYAKHULU: No, there was no any a Lonmin security twin cam, or twin cab, that was Page 5406 Page 5408 responsible. You remember the exchanged suggestion about type of a podium also that was used. All I remember is 1 2 that that area, there were some pipes and so but everyone the two people and the third one and so on. So the 3 was on the ground and whoever wanted to voice their views 3 question about it not arising from cross-examination falls 4 would just stand up and address the crowd. You would just 4 away. As far as Mr Tip's issue about the basis is concerned, that there's no basis for putting that proposal, 5 come forward next to those pipes but not on top of the 6 he's right but - and I chose, I use the word proposal -6 pipes. 7 MR MPOFU SC: Yes. The issue that I 7 deliberately -8 8 really wanted to come to is, accepting once again that you CHAIRPERSON: Do I understand you to 9 9 could not hear everything that was being discussed by the suggest there was an agreement? 10 10 3 000 people, were you, from where you were sitting, able MR MPOFU SC: Yes, that's - agreement, 11 to hear all the contributions made by the people who were -11 ja. 12 I almost said on the podium - who were addressing the 12 CHAIRPERSON: - a proposal by NUM. 13 gathering? 13 MR MPOFU SC: Absolutely. 14 14 CHAIRPERSON: That they and Lonmin should MR MABUYAKHULU: Some I could hear. 15 MR MPOFU SC: Now, were you aware that -15 act together. 16 I'm asking you on another topic now. There were 16 MR MPOFU SC: Absolutely, and that is on 17 suggestions made that the trouble - I'm using a neutral 17 18 18 word deliberately – the trouble that happened with the CHAIRPERSON: Now, what's that based on? 19 Quantum and all that on the 10th, I'm sorry to say with the 19 MR MPOFU SC: It's based on page 78 of 20 Quantum because that almost suggests an answer, but what extract 2 where - yes, we've dealt with this. The last 21 happened between the workers and various people and the paragraph, paragraph 4, Chairperson, it's an email from Mr Bongo to a whole lot of Lonmin people, including Etienne 22 shooting, that it may have been attributable to Lonmin 23 Hamman, Sinclair, Trollip and so on. 23 security. Now, my question is this, were you aware that 24 the NUM had proposed that Lonmin security and the NUM 24 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, Mr Tip, what do you

say about that?

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25

Page 5411

Page 5409 MR TIP SC: Yes, may I respond – first of Remember that? 1 1 all the cross-examination that related to the introduction 2 MR MABUYAKHULU: 2 Yes. 3 of the two statements concerning the, inter alia, the 3 MR MPOFU SC: And I just want to take you 4 Lonmin security twin cab were made in the context of a very 4 through to certain passages of that statement and I'll ask 5 clear purpose which I identified before I went into it, and you into whether Mr Da Costa's understanding of the 6 6 that was simply to deal with any misapprehension that might situation accords with yours. The statement at 3.18 of Da 7 7 arise from the reference by Mr Semenya to slide 16 of Costa which is 0017, Chairperson, where Mr Da Costa says 8 8 that, at the bottom, "They [meaning the RDOs] objected to exhibit L where there was a reference to two wounded, and 9 9 the purpose was to dispel any inference that might be drawn dealing with the matter in this way because, so they told 10 that perhaps those two wounded were in fact the result of 10 me, they did not want any union involvement in the matter". 11 this alleged shooting from the NUM Quantum, and it was 11 Does that accord with your understanding of the situation? 12 12 solely for that purpose. This email that we see on page 78 MS SOMAGACA: That would be in page? 13 has been dealt with previously and the very sentence that 13 MR MPOFU SC: Sorry, page 6, the top of 14 Mr Mpofu is now relying on was previously in the course of 14 page 6 of the statement, 3.18. the debate with, with respect, yourself, Mr Chairperson, 15 15 MS SOMAGACA: Okay. 16 16 that there was a particular context in relation to the MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. 17 17 protection of workers and the facilitation of the capacity MR MPOFU SC: In the next paragraph, 18 of those who wish to work to do so. And it is in that 18 3.19, Da Costa then says that your representatives went on 19 context that Mr Bongo included clause 4, security work with 19 to express a view that "trade union involvement would only 20 NUM as a team. Now, that is being extrapolated in the 20 be appropriate if the issue raised was one which affected 21 question that is now being put in re-examination in the 21 the entire workforce". Was that also in accordance with 22 specific context of the activities of the NUM personnel in 22 your understanding of the situation? 23 the Quantum. That is how the question began where the 23 MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't understand that. 24 24 hearsay evidence has been given that there were persons MR MPOFU SC: Ja, sorry, I think maybe 25 the interpretation was - even I didn't understand it. The firing, NUM persons were firing from the Quantum, and Mr Page 5410 Mpofu as I understand the question and the rationale that 1 simple question is whether one of the issues that informed 2 he has now given for it is that somehow this phrase in this the decision of the RDOs not to want union involvement was 3 email is to draw some kind of common purpose between what 4 4

Page 5412

Lonmin might've done in its vehicles and what NUM members are alleged to have done in their Quantum. And it's not an allowable proposition, with respect. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu? Perhaps you can reformulate your question to deal, to obviate any further objections, but the thrust of the question of course is the request from NUM that Lonmin security work with NUM as a key. That' the thrust of the question. Reformulate the question in a way that avoids the objection and then carry on. MR MPOFU SC: Chairperson, really, I'll just move on to something else. I think the - all I can say is that I agree with Mr Tip about what the purpose of the question was. Thanks. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, the point of course is I don't know if this witness can throw very much light on it. It is really relevant in the question of the mood of these various meetings, and that's probably been canvassed as thoroughly as it can be. MR MPOFU SC: Thank you, Chairperson. Now, Mr Mabuyakhulu, just moving to something else, you've

also been referred extensively to Mr Da Costa's statement.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

the fact that this matter only involved the RDOs and not the entire workforce, and whether the - Da Costa's understanding is the same of his or the RDOs'. 6 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes 7 MR MPOFU SC: Then if you look, jump over to 3.22 of Da Costa, he says somewhere there that, "They [once again they means RDOs] further told me that they did 10 not wish to interrupt any production at Karee". Is that 11 also in accordance with your understanding of the 12 situation? 13 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. 14 MR MPOFU SC: Then jump again to 3.27 of Da Costa where he says in the middle, Chairperson and 15 Commissioners, "I then pointed out to them that there was a 16 17 two year wage deal which was still in place and that the 18 next wage negotiations would be held towards the end of 2013" as one of the issues that presumably were impediments to your request. Did you also understand the same? 21 MR MABUYAKHULU: 22 MR MPOFU SC: Then - okay, that's enough 23 of Mr Da Costa. If you go to I think it was called -24 that's 4. There was this discussion with Mr Machepelo about the statements that will be made by Mr Debukwane and

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

```
Page 5413
                                                                                                                          Page 5415
    Julius Motsogela. And we are told that these are witnesses
                                                                        that. So the follow up question is, then how did it come?
    that are going to be called by Lonmin. If you go to
                                                                    2
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
2
                                                                                                     Alriaht.
                                                                    3
3
    paragraph 5 of Julius Motsogela's statement, the last
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          The word that was given
4
    sentence, it says, "Mr Grant Sinclair [that's one of the,
                                                                    4
                                                                        to us was that the employer says NUM said he should not
5
    Mr Grant Sinclair, one of the Lonmin bosses] advised that -
                                                                        negotiate with us or he should not talk to us. Then we
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  That should be Graham, it
6
                                                                    6
                                                                        sent them back to the employer to go and ask the employer
7
                                                                    7
    says Graham.
                                                                        then what should we do? Then the response was, let's do,
8
           MR MPOFU SC:
                                  Graham, it should be
                                                                    8
                                                                        or we can do what we see will help us.
                                                                    9
9
    Graham.
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                  Thank you.
10
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Graham.
                                                                   10
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          Then we saw it necessary
11
                                                                   11
           MR MPOFU SC:
                                  Yes.
                                                                        then to go down.
12
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  The security - very senior
                                                                   12
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                  Okay, thank you very much,
13
    security person at Lonmin.
                                                                   13
                                                                        that's good enough. Now, on the - you were also asked a
14
    [14:46] MR MPOFU:
                                 Yes, he is Graham, Graham
                                                                        question which you may not have understood, about your
    Sinclair, yes, correct. If you look at page 78 for
                                                                        involvement or otherwise in the computation of the demand
15
    example, yes. Mr Graham Sinclair advised them, that is now
                                                                        of R12 500. Now apart from - and what you gave and the
16
                                                                   16
17
    your representatives, that wage related issues should be
                                                                   17
                                                                        Chairperson decides to assist you, what you gave was your
18
    dealt with by the union representatives, not them, was that
                                                                   18
                                                                        understanding of the background and the origins of that
19
    also what was reported to you?
                                                                   19
                                                                        demand. So put that aside. The question I want to ask you
20
           MS SOMAGACA:
                                  That will be in paragraph?
                                                                   20
                                                                        is, were you as Mr Mabuyakhulu, ever involved in the
21
           MR MPOFU:
                              Paragraph 5 of ZZ4.
                                                                   21
                                                                       computation, in the calculation of the actual figure of
22
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                      I hear this for the
                                                                   22
                                                                        R12 500? In other words, that it should be R13 000, not
23
    first time.
                                                                   23
                                                                        R10 000, but specifically R12 500. Were you one of the
24
           MR MPOFU:
                              Was it never reported to you
                                                                   24
                                                                        people who came up with that figure?
                                                                   25
25
    as the group that the employer said you should bring your
                                                                               MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                                                                                          The issue or the matter
                                                        Page 5414
                                                                                                                          Page 5416
    demands through the union?
                                                                       about the 12 500 I just got it around, it was doing some
1
2
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                       rounds, and that's how I got to hear about it that there
                                That's what he says, he
3
    says he hears for the first time now. It follows what's
                                                                       were some meetings, RDOs had some meeting and then there
4
    reported earlier, so I think you mustn't cross-examine -
                                                                       was this issue of 12 500.
5
                                                                    5
           MR MPOFU:
                             Because I think the question,
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Thank you. You've said in
    I don't want to fight with the interpreter, the - I think
                                                                       your statement many times that you were feeling that the
6
    that the example that the chair spoke about as to whether
                                                                    7
7
                                                                       employer was not taking your seriously, you wanted the
                                                                    8
8
    the witness understands the question or not, maybe, I don't
                                                                       employer to talk to you, in other places you wanted the
9
                                                                    9
    know, maybe the Chair could, so that's a matter, accused of
                                                                        employer to engage, that was the words that were used. Now
10
    badgering. I am sue the Chair understands the proposition
                                                                   10
                                                                       the question really is, if the employer had talked to you
11
    I am putting. If the Chair could put the question to -
                                                                   11
                                                                       and let's assume they said that they are not going to give
12
    take it away from me.
                                                                   12
                                                                       to 12 500 but 11 000 or whatever it is. But if they had
13
                                                                   13
                                                                       engaged with you would you have down tools on the 11th?
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                Okay, if there's a danger
14
    the witness doesn't understand the question, and there may
                                                                   14
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    - from cross-examination at
15
    be an argument based upon what he said through
                                                                   15
                                                                       all? I don't remember any question in cross-examination
    misunderstanding, perhaps you better clear it up.
                                                                   16
                                                                       dealing with that matter.
16
                             To dispel that, yes. Mr
17
           MR MPOFU:
                                                                   17
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 About the 12 500?
18
    Mabuyakhulu, when - on the 10th, was one of the things that
                                                                   18
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Well, what they would have
                                                                   19
19
    were reported to you by the representatives that the
20
    management's view was that your demands for R12 500 should
                                                                   20
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 Yes, well, Mr -
21
    be tabled via the union.
                                                                   21
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    - if the employer came back
22
           MR MABUYAKHULU:
                                     It never came like that.
                                                                       with a lower offer. That wasn't, I don't think that's
23
                             Okay, how did it come?
                                                                   23
           MR MPOFU:
                                                                       covered in cross-examination.
24
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                What did -
                                                                   24
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 Okay, Chair, maybe not -
25
           MR MPOFU:
                             He said, it did not come like
                                                                   25
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    I don't propose to allow
```

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 5417 Page 5419 that in re-examination. MR MABUYAKHULU: I don't remember the 1 1 MR MPOFU: 2 Chair, I am not going to ask 2 song. There were songs, even in different groups, there 3 the question further, but the aspect of the fact that their 3 were songs. 4 real grievance was not being taken seriously, and all that, 4 CHAIRPERSON: I see. Perhaps other 5 was canvassed by Mr Bham, but I'll leave the question. witnesses can tell us what sort of songs they were. Well, CHAIRPERSON: 6 He is not persisting with 6 thank you, Mr Mabuyakhulu, you are excused from further 7 7 the question, so let's not debate it further. attendance. The Commission will adjourn, until next 8 MR MPOFU: 8 Wednesday, the 20th, at 10 o'clock, in accordance with an Thank you Chair. Mr Semenya, 9 9 for the police, played some visuals for you, which were of agreement concluded between certain of the counsel and the a group, which turned out to be a group of NUM people 10 evidence leaders in chambers. We adjourn. 10 coming back towards their office. In those visuals, did 11 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED] 11 12 12 you observe any pangas and spears? 13 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, the problem I've 13 14 got, is I think the question is abandoned, but apart from 14 that, whether he observed pangas and spears is neither here 15 15 nor there. If there are pangas and spears visible, then we 16 16 17 can see them, we don't need him to tell us that he saw 17 18 them, or didn't see them as the case may be. 18 19 MR MPOFU: Ja but maybe you can see them, 19 20 Chair, but how are they going to get onto the record if I 20 21 don't put it through the witness? 21 22 CHAIRPERSON: 22 No, if it's necessary, that 23 part of the video, well, firstly the video is already part 23 of the record, that's the first one. The second point is 24 24 if its relevant, and it forms the subject of argument, we 25 25 Page 5418 can insert that video or clip as an attachment to the 1 electronic version of the report, and we can include it in 2 3 a DVD which will be put in, for the hard copy of the report. We don't need this witness to tell us what he can 4 5 see or not see on the video. MR MPOFU: 6 Thanks, Chairperson. Mr 7 Mabuyakhulu, finally you've said again under cross-8 examination that the situation or the, ja, the situation on 9 the 11th in the morning was similar to the 10th, now and I suppose this also comes from the video, but let's get it 10 11 from you, would it be correct to say that apart from the 12 people that is described who were carrying sticks, and 13 others carrying branches of trees, did you also see people 14 who were carrying nothing? 15 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes, there were those 16 who had nothing. 17 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, 18 nothing further. 19 CHAIRPERSON: I have to ask you one question. On the 11th, when the crowd marched towards the 20 21 NUM offices, carrying stocks, according to you, they were 22 singing songs, were they? 23 MR MABUYAKHULU: Yes. 24 CHAIRPERSON: What songs were they singing? 25

A
abandoned 5417:14
able 5344:10 5351:20
5360:10 5405:19
5406:10
absolutely 5389:13,16
5390:3 5407:14
5408:13,16
accept 5343:11 5347:4
5348:23 5383:16
5405:3
accepting 5405:21
5406:8
accompanied 5376:8
accord 5411:11
accords 5411:6
account 5400:12
accused 5414:9
acknowledged 5356:25
act 5407:6 5408:15
activities 5403:25
5409:22
actual 5415:21
add 5343:19
additional 5346:13
address 5405:23 5406:4
•
addressed 5350:18 5375:3 5377:16
addressing 5406:12
addressing 5400.12 adhering 5399:22
5400:21
adjourn 5397:23
5419:7,10
adjourned 5341:14
5419:11
adjournment 5366:13
5366:15 5389:15 5397:18,20
ADJOURNS 5366:16
5397:25
administration
5367:25
admit 5357:24
admittedly 5400:18
Adv 5377:12
advance 5359:12 5364:11
advanced 5364:1
advantage 5379:8
advised 5413:5,16
affidavits 5360:21
5362:7
aforesaid 5399:20
African 5358:5 5359:8
afternoon 5341:13
5388:11,12
ago 5369:12
agree 5378:10 5402:24
5404:9 5410:16
agreed 5378:19
agreeing 5385:15
agreement 5379:7,9
5407:6 5408:9,10
5419:9

ahead 5381:3 5394:12
Akanyang 5389:22 alia 5364:5 5409:3
allegation 5356:9
5357:1,13 5400:18,18
5400:19 allegations 5356:11
5400:25
alleged 5409:11 5410:5
allegedly 5361:7 allow 5400:21 5416:25
allowable 5410:6
allowance 5377:17,18 allowed 5386:18
alright 5343:2,9
5345:20 5352:14
5356:23 5366:7 5393:3 5415:2
AMCU 5341:24 5342:7
5345:18,25 5347:11
5347:22 5348:3 5350:10 5352:17,22
5353:10 5357:2,12
5393:16,19 5395:4,7
5395:9 amount 5376:21
5377:18
Andrew 5362:17
anger 5353:13 5354:1 angry 5353:18,21
5401:3
answer 5355:13,20,21
5371:15,16,16,20 5377:21 5380:12
5381:9 5385:20
5386:15,20,24,24,25
5387:3 5388:20 5393:1 5402:13
5406:20
answered 5370:18
5371:5,8 answers 5349:10
5355:16
anybody 5366:4 5393:4
anyway 5361:3,4 apart 5346:14 5415:16
5417:14 5418:11
apparent 5359:14
5361:10 apparently 5354:2
5383:25 5398:11
appear 5360:20 5361:3 5377:14
appeared 5391:14
appearing 5389:1 appears 5342:24
5344:14 5357:24
5402:14 5407:7
appreciate 5356:2 5376:15
appreciated 5363:2
approach 5372:9
5378:19 5379:10 5381:10 5390:18
5403:15

5382:16 5403:4
approaching 5380:23 5403:11
appropriate 5389:24
5389:25 5397:17
5411:20 approximately 5367:23
5391:7,12,21
area 5358:13 5395:20
5406:2 argue 5364:18 5371:17
argument 5355:20,23
5371:7,10,19 5393:2
5414:15 5417:25 arising 5408:3
armed 5364:15
arms 5364:22 arrival 5379:20
arrival 53/9:20 arrived 5352:4 5363:24
5369:1,6 5380:23
5381:12
ascertain 5346:8 aside 5415:19
asked 5346:15 5349:9
5371:2,8 5377:19 5380:9 5382:22
5384:20 5385:19
5386:21 5400:17
5405:13,18 5407:20 5415:13
asking 5347:24,25
5348:16,17 5349:11
5355:2 5362:22 5369:2 5385:18,23
5386:24 5388:16
5406:16
aspect 5344:21,22 5350:5 5356:13
5358:2 5417:3
aspects 5345:6
assault 5365:19 5366:1 assaulted 5362:1,4,16
assess 5371:23
assist 5349:10 5356:14
5415:17 assistance 5348:12
assistant 5371:1
assisted 5356:19
assisting 5392:1 5396:9 assume 5347:15
5416:11
attachment 5418:1
attacking 5364:2,11 attend 5392:2
attendance 5419:7
attending 5353:13
attention 5344:24 5348:16 5358:21
5360:8
attitudes 5353:16
attributable 5406:22 attributed 5392:1
August 5341:22,23
5343:6 5345:2 5350:8
5350:19 5354:13 5358:13 5359:10,18
2220.12 2327.10,10

5363:7 5367:5.9 **Bulelani** 5359:25 5378:8.13.17 5379:1 5389:5 5391:7 5393:15 5399:6 5401:8 5404:1,13 avoid 5375:7 avoiding 5371:16 avoids 5410:12 aware 5367:14,20,25 5368:3,4,8,13,20 5371:24 5372:24,24 5375:19 5376:5,16 5378:25,25 5379:6 5384:4,9 5388:1 5395:19 5396:8 5406:15,23 back 5341:19 5353:8 5373:18 5375:19 5377:2 5381:9 5395:12 5401:15 5402:2,9 5415:6 5416:21 5417:11 background 5415:18 **backs** 5376:16 **badgering** 5414:10 bargaining 5377:8 5378:1 5383:13 base 5371:19,19 based 5370:20 5408:18 5408:19 5414:15 basis 5348:22 5349:20 5355:23 5369:2 5407:4,5,10,16 5408:4,5 **BBB8** 5357:15 5366:22 **befell** 5365:21 began 5409:23 **beginning** 5368:22 5388:21 behalf 5384:6 5393:9 **believe** 5371:5 belong 5370:11 best 5362:10 5373:18 5388:6 better 5414:16 **bigger** 5404:15 block 5367:25 Bob 5365:14 bog 5371:10 Bongo 5408:22 5409:19 **bosses** 5413:5 **bothering** 5369:24 **bottom** 5411:8 Boye 5380:4 **branch** 5354:12 **branches** 5401:18,25 5418:13 **briefly** 5363:9 bring 5370:1 5413:25 broadcast 5356:16 brought 5383:25 challenge 5399:20 **Budlender** 5393:5,6,8

5360:2.19 burn 5363:22 5391:23 cab 5359:20,21 5361:11 5361:17 5407:24,25 5409:4 calculated 5369:1 calculation 5415:21 **call** 5348:11 5389:6,9 called 5349:6 5364:5 5376:1 5398:16 5402:15 5412:23 5413:2 calling 5376:24 calm 5351:8 cam 5407:25 canvassed 5410:21 5417:5 can't 5354:21 5361:4 5362:5,10 5367:10 5370:21 5376:13 5383:17 5389:9 **capacity** 5392:17 5409:17 career 5367:24 carefully 5349:17 5380:7 carry 5349:12 5410:12 **carrying** 5364:24 5391:16 5401:9,10,13 5401:14,16,17,19,21 5401:25 5402:5,17,21 5418:12,13,14,21 case 5356:5 5371:18 5417:18 casualties 5358:16 categorically 5356:12 cause 5344:16 **CCC4** 5383:21 5384:5 5384:16 5385:2 certain 5342:9 5343:14 5344:5,13,25 5363:10 5364:6 5374:17 5398:14 5411:4 5419:9 certainly 5356:5 5362:5 5368:16 5374:23 5375:20 5387:8 5390:23 chain 5400:13 **chair** 5341:12 5348:18 5349:14 5355:1,9 5356:2 5357:19 5358:1,19 5359:10 5361:8 5362:12 5366:9 5372:2 5398:4 5399:23 5407:1 5414:7,9,10,11 5416:24 5417:2,8,20 Chairman 5393:8

5403:15

approached 5381:18

5397:22

building 5386:6

challenged 5356:15

5400:20

5363:12

convey 5353:4

conveyed 5343:20

chambers 5397:22
5419:10 chance 5402:8
change 5354:4
changed 5397:2
chanting 5391:13
charge 5366:1,4 chased 5365:2
choose 5380:13
chose 5385:13 5408:6
chronologically
5372:11 5375:8,11
circumstances 5349:1 5365:23
clarification 5349:15
clarify 5359:13
5361:20
clarity 5386:22
clause 5409:19 clear 5343:18 5353:7
5370:15 5371:7,14 5381:22 5384:1
5386:18,23 5388:18
5402:19 5407:10,22
5409:5 5414:16 clearly 5360:19
client 5356:12
clip 5418:1
close 5399:21
colleague 5372:3
collective 5377:8 5378:1 5383:12
come 5341:22 5347:13
5365:8 5370:19
5373:8 5383:15
5390:12 5392:21
5406:5,8 5407:15 5414:23,25 5415:1
comes 5369:23 5378:4
5384:23 5418:10
coming 5365:11
5384:13,21 5385:9 5394:21 5395:12
5394:21 5395:12 5400:10 5417:11
commenced 5391:8
commencing 5391:1
comment 5343:13
5344:10,22 5356:5,11
5357:9 5359:5 5360:9 5366:12 5367:3
5383:5,8 5391:3
5392:4,21,24 5399:16
5399:19 5400:17
comments 5392:5
5400:25
commission 5341:2,20 5344:16,24 5349:23
5352:7 5357:4,14,21
5360:8 5362:14
5363:17 5364:20
5366:9,14,16,16,17
5397:9,23,25,25
5398:1 5419:7,11 Commissioner 5366:11
5366:20,20 5375:1,7
5390:4,5 5392:23

Mar	IK
5393:2	
Commissioners	
5377:11 5412:16	C
commit 5405:11	C
common 5410:3	C
communicate 5368:9	
5387:9	C
communicated 5367:16	
5377:17 5383:10	
5387:11 5396:1	
communicating	
5395:20	
communication	
5377:20	
communiqué 5383:21	
complainant 5359:17	C
complaining 5369:11	C
complaint 5344:25	
complete 5358:3	(
completeness 5360:14 5361:5 5362:14	•
completes 5366:10	
compound 5374:7	
computation 5415:15	
5415:21	
concede 5355:5	
concerned 5353:22	
5358:14 5363:6	
5402:18,20 5408:5	(
concerning 5409:3	
concert 5407:9	
concluded 5419:9	
conclusion 5365:25	
condition 5345:1	C
conduct 5346:16	
confirm 5365:24	C
5404:1	
confirmed 5341:21	C
5350:6 5357:10	
confiscation 5354:24	C
conflict 5389:10	
confront 5399:20	
5400:20	
confusion 5375:7 consequence 5359:9	
consequently 5379:11	0
considerable 5365:20	c
considerations 5343:12	c
consistent 5374:23	•
consists 5344:2	C
constable 5343:5	•
consult 5344:20	
consultation 5343:21	
contents 5385:14	
context 5409:4,16,19	C
5409:22	
continue 5395:25	C
continued 5364:10	
continues 5358:16	C
contradictions 5402:10	
contradictory 5344:15	
contrary 5390:2	
contributed 5405:23	
contributions 5406:11	

kana Commission of Tr
5350:19 5351:16 5352:16 5377:5 copy 5418:3 cordial 5404:10 cordoning 5381:14 5382:21
correct 5341:4 5344:17 5344:25 5346:1,6,10 5348:6 5350:10 5353:22 5354:20 5360:21 5361:6 5366:2 5372:6 5382:8 5388:11 5402:19,22 5403:6 5404:15 5413:15 5418:11 correction 5345:7,11
correctly 5343:7
5350:2 5380:15
5382:12,23
Costa 5367:17 5368:9 5372:9 5373:5,12,20
5373:22 5374:1,5,7
5374:10 5375:3,21
5376:1,4,9,17,18,23
5377:4,23,24 5378:5
5387:21 5404:2 5411:7,7,18 5412:8
5412:15,23
Costa's 5367:24 5368:5
5371:25 5372:11,22
5374:23 5377:13
5404:9 5410:25
5411:5 5412:4 couldn't 5349:3
5351:23
counsel 5343:14 5393:4
5419:9
couple 5375:4 5378:23 5403:24 5404:16
course 5343:14 5344:3
5345:5 5349:2,7
5353:24 5356:16
5358:4 5366:9
5409:14 5410:9,18 court 5388:8
covered 5416:23
crop 5378:12
cross 5375:10 5407:15
5407:20 5418:7 cross-examination
5341:11 5354:22
5366:21 5371:10
5393:11 5408:3
5409:2 5416:14,15,23
cross-examine 5349:16 5366:18 5414:4
cross-examining
5398:3
crowd 5350:23 5360:4
5365:7 5377:16
5391:12,13,14,16,23
5401:25 5402:16,16 5402:21 5403:5
5405:23 5406:4
5418:20
crowds 5402:5

crowd's 5391:25 crux 5407:22	d
D	
Da 5367:17,24 5368:5,9	١.
5371:25 5372:9,10,22	d
5373:5,12,19,22	d
5374:1,4,7,10,23	
5375:3,21 5376:1,4,9	_
5376:17,18,23 5377:4	d
5377:13,23,24 5378:5	
5387:21 5404:2,9 5410:25 5411:5,6,7	d
5410:25 5411:5,6,7	
5411:18 5412:4,8,15	
5412:23	d
danger 5381:13,15,17	d
5382:15,20 5414:13	
date 5367:20 5368:15	d
day 5341:23 5345:24	
5347:12 5367:22	d
5384:10 5385:4	
5387:6 5392:2	d
5393:12,13 5404:5	d
deal 5356:3 5363:5,8,9	d
5363:15 5365:18	
5367:10 5371:7	d
5378:7 5389:8,12	d
5390:13 5393:1	d
5409:6 5410:8	
5412:17	
dealing 5341:13,19	
5344:2,9 5345:11	
5358:12 5359:3	d
5363:20 5378:16	d
5389:9 5405:14	-
5411:9 5416:16	
deals 5389:4,23	
dealt 5362:7 5378:10	d
5378:13 5408:20	u
5409:13 5413:18	d
debate 5353:25	d
5363:13 5371:6	d
5409:15 5417:7	d
Debukwane 5389:3	u
5390:25 5398:8,11	d
	d
5399:5 5400:5,9 5401:1 5402:3 14	u
5401:1 5402:3,14 5412:25	
5412:25	
decided 5346:4 5363:19 5378:18,22	J
5379:16 5387:17	d
5390:17 5395:13	d
5396:6,17 5403:5	
5404:24	
decides 5415:17	١.
decision 5342:15,18,19	d
5350:25 5351:2,3	
5353:25 5376:3,22	
5381:10 5391:25	d
5395:16,25 5398:23	d
5399:1 5412:2	d
declaring 5388:9	
deductions 5378:21	ď
delegation 5404:24	D
deliberately 5363:19	

5406:18 5408:7

```
lemand 5367:4.16
  5368:9.13.20 5370:2
  5370:22 5375:22
  5377:25 5378:12,20
  5404:14 5415:15,19
 lemanding 5386:13
 emands 5346:9,14
  5378:23 5379:23
  5380:9 5414:1,20
 lenied 5348:20
  5356:12
 eny 5357:24 5360:11
 5365:24 5376:12
  5387:10
 eponent 5360:16
 lescribe 5351:23
 5380:1
 lescribed 5365:25
 5418:12
 escription 5365:18
 5404:10
 esigned 5356:5
 lespite 5404:7
 letail 5351:15 5363:14
 5365:20
 letails 5353:7 5355:5
 letective 5343:5
 lidn't 5342:10 5366:1
 5371:18 5380:12
  5383:1 5385:6
  5403:10 5411:25
 5417:18
 lifference 5369:19
 lifferent 5360:20
 5368:3 5369:25
 5375:8 5405:18
 5419:2
 lifficult 5353:15
 5399:16
 lifficulty 5378:11
 irected 5349:7
 lirecting 5355:24
 lirectly 5371:20
 5386:25 5392:25
 liscuss 5351:9
 iscussed 5343:15
  5345:14 5376:18
  5390:24 5396:12,15
 5397:7 5406:9
 iscussing 5343:6
  5373:9 5381:25
 iscussion 5345:15
  5373:13 5378:9
  5383:12 5394:24
  5403:18 5412:24
 iscussions 5342:16
  5369:3 5377:2,20,22
 5387:21 5395:10
 lismissed 5370:5,6
 lispel 5409:9 5414:17
 lispute 5376:13
 5382:24
 lisputed 5380:6
 lomo 5359:23,25
  5360:2,19,24
Dlomo's 5359:24
```

5361:1
document 5376:2,20
5383:24 5384:4,10,12
5384:15,15,17,18,20
5384:15,15,17,18,20 5384:21,22 5385:1,2
5385:3,6,9,12,16,18
5385:25 5386:7
documents 5383:15
doesn't 5347:7 5361:20
5362:5 5370:9
5414:14
dogs 5364:6
doing 5352:23 5359:12
5370:13 5416:1
don't 5346:5 5347:1
5349:10 5354:18
5355:23 5359:4
5362:20 5370:21
5371:5,9 5382:4
5383:7 5386:21,24
5389:23,25 5394:16
5396:3 5400:9 5403:8
5403:19 5410:19
5411:23 5414:6,8
5416:15,22,25
5417:17,21 5418:4
5419:1
double 5400:4
draw 5348:16 5410:3
drawn 5355:17
5358:21 5360:7
5409:9
dreamt 5349:3
drew 5344:24
driving 5350:9 5353:12
due 5366:9
duty 5379:12 5399:8
DVD 5418:3
E
earlier 5377:13
5399:15 5414:4
Eastern 5370:1

5394:22 effect 5342:4 5365:8 5367:3,22 5379:15 either 5363:21 5400:15 **elected** 5352:3.8.12 5379:24.25 5380:1.3 5380:22 5381:2,17 5382:6,12,16 5394:9 5394:20 electronic 5418:2 **elicit** 5356:6 else's 5349:7 email 5408:21 5409:12 5410:3 **embargo** 5399:22 5400:21 embark 5395:13 embarked 5388:7 employed 5392:16,17 **employee** 5398:12 employees 5358:15 **employer** 5342:21,23 5378:20,23 5379:10

5270-12 17 5280-22
5379:13,17 5380:23 5384:22,23,24 5385:6
5385:8,13,16 5386:1
5386:4,6,9 5387:17
5387:19 5390:19
5404:25 5413:25
5415:4,6,6 5416:7,8,9
5416:10,21
employers 5395:13
employer's 5381:10,12
encounter 5387:16
encountered 5348:7
5380:25
encouraged 5356:18
endeavour 5386:22
chica voii 5360.22
engage 5371:6 5377:25
5383:11 5416:9
engaged 5373:12
5416:13
engaging 5390:19
enquire 5342:22
5390:18
enquiry 5351:10
ensure 5341:18 5358:2
entertain 5385:7
entire 5404:8 5411:21
5412:4
entirely 5354:19
5363:6
entirety 5343:18
entitled 5348:13
entity 5361:14
entry 5362:3
escorting 5399:2,6
essential 5363:14
essentially 5358:9
establish 5368:19
Etienne 5408:22
evasive 5371:16
evening 5343:23
5399:6
event 5407:11
events 5363:7 5364:19
5380:19 5389:4,23
5300.17 3307.4,23
evidence 5344:23 5351:11 5356:15
5351:11 5356:15
5362:15 5363:10,12
5363:16 5365:6
5367:22 5389:10,11
5393:9 5400:8
5402:15,18,20,22
5405:3,15,17,21
5407:15 5409:24
5419:10
exactly 5343:25
5350:15 5368:22
5392:6,9
7
examination 5407·16
examination 5407:16
5407:21 5418:8
5407:21 5418:8 example 5357:19
5407:21 5418:8
5407:21 5418:8 example 5357:19 5385:21 5413:16
5407:21 5418:8 example 5357:19 5385:21 5413:16 5414:7
5407:21 5418:8 example 5357:19 5385:21 5413:16 5414:7 exchange 5405:16,23
5407:21 5418:8 example 5357:19 5385:21 5413:16 5414:7 exchange 5405:16,23 exchanged 5390:17
5407:21 5418:8 example 5357:19 5385:21 5413:16 5414:7 exchange 5405:16,23 exchanged 5390:17 5408:1
5407:21 5418:8 example 5357:19 5385:21 5413:16 5414:7 exchange 5405:16,23 exchanged 5390:17

excluded 5344:9
excused 5419:6
exercise 5393:7
exhibit 5341:15
5357:10,15 5358:6,9
5359:6,7,17,23
5383:21 5409:8
existing 5377:7 5378:1
expect 5355:20 5359:5
expected 5400:12
explain 5344:12,15
5346:16 5354:14
5357:17 5364:21
5369:5,8 5390:5
5398:18 5405:17
explained 5348:5
5360:7 5365:10
5377:24 5398:20
explaining 5348:8
5365:15
explanation 5345:13
5348:9 5354:15
5369:9
explore 5351:7 5375:5
express 5354:1 5411:19
extensively 5410:25
extent 5371:14 5389:10
extract 5408:20
extrapolated 5409:20
eye 5363:3
\mathbf{F}

F
facilitate 5366:20
facilitation 5409:17
facing 5382:19 5403:9
fact 5343:4 5348:16
5349:8,24 5355:18
5356:6 5362:17
5363:3 5364:1
5387:17 5392:1
5396:20,24 5397:9
5404:7 5409:10
5412:3 5417:3
factor 5391:25
facts 5367:8
factually 5380:6
failure 5371:20
fair 5347:15 5348:20
5389:6 5400:8
fairly 5356:25
fairness 5400:3
fall 5371:20
falls 5408:3
far 5353:22 5355:18
5363:6 5382:21
5400:7 5402:18,20
5405:10 5408:4
fashion 5349:22
FEBRUARY 5341:1
feel 5396:20,24
feeling 5416:6
fell 5361:16
fight 5365:3 5382:4 5414:6
5414:0 fighting 5365:4
ngnung 5505.4

	3-
5370:19,22 5415:21	front 5366:25 5390:22
5415:24	5391:4 5398:9
filed 5359:6 5389:2,22	full 5363:5 5365:22
5390:9	fully 5363:2
final 5365:5	function 5386:19
finally 5358:1 5365:18	further 5349:10 5354:9
5418:7	5355:22,24 5362:25
find 5357:3 5360:5	5371:9 5388:24
5372:10 5392:11	5391:24 5393:2
fine 5352:14	5403:20 5410:8
finish 5390:10 5399:17	5412:9 5417:3,7
finished 5357:18	5418:18 5419:6
fire 5359:20 5391:18	future 5385:21
5403:1	
fired 5353:11 5357:12	G
5359:9,16 5361:21	gathered 5378:22
5364:12 5403:13	5391:12
firing 5350:9 5356:9	gathering 5390:20
5357:2 5409:25,25	5406:13
first 5341:21 5343:13	Gekilese 5354:21
5351:15 5356:22	general 5345:15
5359:16 5361:9	getting 5348:1
5363:16 5364:9,22	give 5351:15 5355:17
5367:16 5368:12,19	5355:21 5357:15
5372:7,9,11 5373:16	5370:16 5371:3
5373:22 5375:23	5380:18 5385:20
5377:10 5378:3,5,12	5386:17 5389:14,15
5378:24 5388:23	5389:17 5391:2
5395:7,23 5409:1	5399:18 5402:15
5413:23 5414:3	5416:11
5417:24	given 5356:15 5357:24
firstly 5348:6 5395:8	5357:25 5364:20
5417:23	5365:6,18,20 5383:16
five 5375:25 5376:7,8	5384:13,17 5389:7,10
5376:10 5380:13,22	5392:7,24 5402:8
5381:2,17 5382:6,12	5409:24 5410:2
5382:15,17,24 5386:5	5415:3
5404:3,8,17,20	gives 5355:21 5402:18
flat 5371:21	5402:20
flowing 5377:12	giving 5342:5 5384:7
follow 5415:1	5389:11 5392:3
followed 5353:25	5396:5
follower 5375:16	go 5342:6,19,22
following 5349:19	5345:16 5346:4
5360:2	5348:2,25 5350:17
follows 5358:12 5414:3	5353:8,25 5354:8
forbidding 5342:20,23	5356:18,19 5366:3
force 5407:7	5367:11 5369:17
forcefully 5350:12	5375:8,10 5376:3,23
forcing 5350:16 5356:9	5378:18,22 5379:1,7
forgive 5349:12	5379:10,12,12,16
formed 5364:1	5380:13,14 5381:24
forms 5355:23 5417:25	5382:7,13 5383:1,2
fortunately 5407:21	5386:5 5394:12
forward 5406:5	5395:11,16,20,21
forwarded 5369:17	5396:1,9,17 5397:4
found 5360:6 5363:21	
	5404:3,14,22,24
5381:12 5382:15	5412:23 5413:2
fourth 5400:13	5415:6,11
free 5405:11	goes 5371:23 5391:15
Friday 5342:17	5391:19
5343:14,20 5344:3,12	going 5343:12 5344:20
5345:23,25 5353:7,15	5344:22 5346:12
5354:4,7,25 5358:12	5351:9 5355:21
5359:18 5364:23	5356:4,7,13 5363:9
friend 5358·5	5363:12 14 5365:24

front 5366:25 5390:22
5391:4 5398:9
full 5363:5 5365:22
fully 5363:2
function 5386:19
further 5349:10 5354:9
5355:22,24 5362:25
5371:9 5388:24
5391:24 5393:2
5403:20 5410:8
5412:9 5417:3,7
5418:18 5419:6
future 5385:21

G athered 5378:22 5391:12 athering 5390:20 5406:13 **ekilese** 5354:21 eneral 5345:15 e**tting** 5348:1 ive 5351:15 5355:17 5355:21 5357:15 5370:16 5371:3 5380:18 5385:20 5386:17 5389:14,15 5389:17 5391:2 5399:18 5402:15 5416:11 iven 5356:15 5357:24 5357:25 5364:20 5365:6,18,20 5383:16 5384:13,17 5389:7,10 5392:7,24 5402:8 5409:24 5410:2 5415:3 ives 5355:21 5402:18 5402:20 iving 5342:5 5384:7 5389:11 5392:3 5396:5 o 5342:6,19,22 5345:16 5346:4 5348:2,25 5350:17 5353:8,25 5354:8 5356:18.19 5366:3 5367:11 5369:17 5375:8.10 5376:3.23 5378:18,22 5379:1,7 5379:10,12,12,16 5380:13,14 5381:24 5382:7,13 5383:1,2 5386:5 5394:12 5395:11,16,20,21

5363:12,14 5365:24

friend 5358:5

figure 5368:25 5369:6

5366:11,18 5367:7 5371:4,6 5374:24 5375:6,8 5380:6 5381:10 5383:22 5384:3 5389:8,18 5390:4,13 5392:8 5393:24 5396:7 5398:23 5400:11,16 5407:7,9 5413:2
5416:11 5417:2,20
good 5345:1 5362:24
5385:21 5393:11,13
5415:13
Graham 5383:10
5413:6,7,8,9,10,14,14
5413:16
Grant 5413:4,5
granted 5388:17
great 5353:12 5363:13
grievance 5417:4
ground 5360:5 5406:3
group 5351:22 5363:17
5363:25 5364:15
5375:3,25 5380:3,13
5390:22,23 5404:3,8
5404:16,22 5413:25
5417:10,10
groups 5419:2
guard 5381:13 5382:3
guards 5381:18,23,23
5382:2,3 5392:16
guidance 5349:16
gunpoint 5350:17
5356:10
gunshot 5353:11
5359:16 5365:13,14
gunshots 5354:17
5359:9 5364:12
guy 5360:18
Н
hadn't 5345:1 5375:20

hailer 5405:21 half 5363:3 5397:23 Hamman 5408:23 handed 5384:5,5 **happened** 5342:17 5347:12 5351:12 5354:2 5358:12 5406:18,21 happy 5397:9 hard 5404:23 5418:3 hasn't 5356:15 5363:12 5365:21 5371:8 haven't 5370:17 head 5360:6 hear 5348:2 5356:20 5387:13 5388:21,22 5405:20 5406:9,11,14 5413:22 5416:2 heard 5353:2 5360:3,11 5365:12,14 5367:20 5368:1,6,24 5370:24 5371:12 5373:1 5375:20 5386:4

5393:1,23,25 5396:10

5399:3 5403:6 hearing 5349:23 5356:21 5364:8 5373:15 5377:9 5378:2,5 5395:22 hears 5414:3 hearsay 5400:5,13,18 5400:23 5409:24 held 5387:21 5412:18 help 5362:6,11 5415:8 **helping** 5369:23 Hemraj 5375:1 5377:12 he's 5389:10 5400:17 5408:6 high 5355:6 highlight 5344:6 hired 5370:8 **history** 5370:16 **holiday** 5379:8 5393:15 home 5370:7,23 5401:15 hospital 5360:6 hospitalisation 5405:5 hostel 5346:21,25 5347:5,6 5399:7 hostile 5363:20 hostility 5405:4,7 hour 5381:8

<u>l</u> idea 5346:15 5351:21

5370:20 **identified** 5345:6,10 5409:5 **identify** 5351:20 illegal 5388:2,9 **imagine** 5378:11 5389:7 **imagines** 5361:19 immediately 5390:22 impacts 5392:25 impediments 5412:19 implication 5371:9 implications 5381:14 important 5347:17,19 5352:17.20 5357:1.13 5391:20 incident 5360:17.25 5361:2,11,12,19,25 5362:21 5366:2,9 incidents 5353:5 5358:14 5362:6,21 **include** 5373:4 5418:2 **included** 5409:19 **including** 5343:22 5389:3 5407:23 5408:22 increase 5367:4,17 5368:10 5375:23 5378:20 incredibly 5368:17 **indicate** 5352:22 indicated 5342:3 5344:4

indication 5344:7

5365:7 5370:11 5371:4 indulgence 5341:6 inference 5355:17 5361:21 5409:9 **informant** 5391:22 5400:6,10,11 informants 5398:14 information 5350:24 5352:16 **informed** 5373:11 5388:5,7 5391:22,24 5392:9 5398:13 5399:19 5400:6,11 5412:1 initially 5380:8 injured 5352:22,25 5353:1,11 5359:9,14 5359:15 5361:25 insert 5418:1 inside 5381:7,20 5382:18 **insofar** 5390:1 instances 5356:19 5359:14 instruction 5370:5 instructions 5365:22 5389:21 5391:10 5396:5 intend 5349:21 **intended** 5390:6 **intends** 5389:6 intent 5363:20,20 **intention** 5391:22 **intentions** 5390:23 inter 5364:5 5409:3 interaction 5351:10 **interdict** 5388:8,8,10 5388:14,17 interest 5362:14 interfering 5400:1 **internal** 5383:21 **interpret** 5388:21 interpretation 5411:25 interpreter 5388:20 5414:6 **interrupt** 5354:19 5371:13 5412:10 interrupted 5349:12 intervene 5345:21 intervention 5398:15 5398:19 5399:13 introduction 5409:2 invited 5393:22 involved 5361:11 5367:11 5368:19 5369:2 5395:10 5412:3 5415:20 involvement 5411:10 5411:19 5412:2 5415:15 **involving** 5361:25 isn't 5347:15 **issue** 5367:9 5369:10 5374:11 5376:2 5386:7 5395:3

5396:11 5405:2.12 5406:7 5408:4 5411:20 5415:25 5416:4 issues 5405:18 5412:1 5412:19 5413:17 it's 5348:21,24 5349:4 5370:21 5371:7,14 5372:3,3,20 5385:17 5386:23 5389:23,25 5390:15 5392:1 5399:24 5400:7,16 5402:18 5403:9 5408:19,21 5410:5 5417:22 I'd 5375:12 5378:24 5380:6 5390:25 I'll 5344:1 5348:11 5354:23 5371:9,22 5372:13 5389:16,17 5389:19,24 5395:25 5399:25 5400:21 5410:14 5411:4 5417:5 I'll 5399:18 I'm 5342:9 5343:12 5344:7,20,22 5348:12 5348:12,16 5349:5 5355:20 5356:4,7,12 5356:21 5357:5 5367:7,19 5368:19 5369:8 5371:4,5 5373:15 5374:13,17 5374:24 5375:6,7 5376:23 5377:9 5378:5 5379:6 5381:8 5383:18.22 5384:3.11 5384:14 5385:18.22 5386:3 5388:16 5389:18 5390:3,11,12 5391:2 5392:3,8,18 5392:19 5395:22 5405:13 5406:16,17 5406:19 5407:20 I've 5341:17 5349:9,9 5357:23,25 5372:22 5386:18 5387:4 5389:24 5399:3,9,12 5399:15 5417:13 ia 5355:4 5393:3 5408:11 5410:18 5411:24 5417:19 5418:8 joint 5407:7 Julius 5389:22 5391:21

5392:7 5413:1,3

5387:22,22,23

Julys 5372:20

jump 5412:7,14

June 5367:15,23

5368:4,18,18,18

5371:25 5372:3,8,10

July 5372:3,9 5374:17

5376:6 5377:3,3,4,15

5372:12,21,21 5375:22 5376:11 5377:3 5387:22 Junes 5372:20

<u>K</u> Karee 5365:13 5369:12

5369:21,24 5370:4 5374:21 5394:1,4,21 5403:25 5404:3 5412:10 keep 5363:3 key 5410:11 killed 5352:23 5370:15 kind 5363:4 5405:22,24 5407:8 5410:3 knew 5386:9 knives 5364:24 knobkerries 5364:16 know 5344:13 5346:5 5357:8 5362:5,20 5368:25 5370:12,21 5370:22 5376:14 5379:6,23 5380:4 5381:11,14 5382:4 5384:24 5385:8,9 5386:4,6,7,12 5393:21 5395:8 5396:3 5402:7 5403:9 5405:10 5410:19 5414:9

L

L 5358:6,9 5409:8

knowledge 5373:18

known 5347:5,14

5388:6

5400:9

language 5348:7 late 5353:7 lawyers 5366:22 lay 5366:3 lays 5407:16 lead 5361:20 5390:1,6 leader 5375:14 leaders 5351:22,25 5352:2.5.8.9.12 5379:24.25 5380:1 5382:7.13 5393:10 5394:8.9.14.17 5419:10 leading 5353:25 5362:23 learned 5358:5 5372:3 5383:17 5385:7 leave 5358:2 5417:5 **leaving** 5363:5 led 5344:23 5367:22 **left** 5346:18 5381:7 legal 5343:22 **lengthy** 5371:6 **let's** 5343:2 5348:25 5351:7 5393:14 5395:11 5401:7 5415:7 5416:11 5417:7 5418:10

level 5375:7
light 5361:4 5362:23
5410:19
lights 5359:21
listened 5349:17
little 5351:15
logbook 5361:24
long 5368:18 5369:12
Lonman 5360:5
Lonmin 5346:9,15
5351:10 5361:17
5367:17 5369:19
5370:8 5373:19
5377:5,6,24 5379:22
5380:9,10,11,14,20
5382:7,13 5383:2,11
5384:6 5387:5,6
5389:2,2,6,25 5390:9
5302:16 5305:0
5392:16 5395:9 5398:12 5406:22,24
5407:6,8,25 5408:14
5408:22 5409:4
5410:4,10 5413:2,5
5413:13
Lonmin's 5359:20
5382:23
look 5347:6 5350:5
5385:13 5412:7
5413:15
looked 5370:10
lot 5357:18 5359:24
5401:22 5408:22
loud 5405:21
lower 5416:22
LPD 5379:20 5380:24
5386:11 5387:15
LRC 5393:4
lunch 5397:18,19
<u> </u>
Machenelo 5412:24

Machepelo 5412:24 machine 5369:21 MAHLANGU 5357:5 making 5343:1 5348:20 5361:15 5362:19 5380:16 management 5383:11 management's 5414:20 manner 5355:1 5364:2 5364:11 march 5342:19 5363:17 5368:4 5371:12,25 5372:11 5372:21,24,25 5373:2 5373:4 5376:8 5379:13,17,20 5391:23 5405:6 marched 5367:23 5373:6,14 5390:20 5404:2 5418:20 marchers 5373:20 marches 5404:2 **marching** 5391:16 5402:5,16 mass 5391:7,9,10 5398:15 5399:20

5387:25 5411:9,10 5412:3 5414:9 5415:25 5416:16 matters 5383:12 5405:1 **Ma'am** 5386:16 mean 5342:9 5352:9 5389:9 5400:7,11 5405:17 **meaning** 5411:8 means 5348:24 5412:9 meet 5374:1,4,5,7 5376:23 meeting 5341:22 5342:20,23 5345:22 5345:23 5346:3 5347:10,14 5350:7,24 5353:9,13,21 5369:15 5369:15 5371:24 5372:7 5373:4,19,23 5374:10,14,15,20 5375:4,20 5377:15 5378:8,10 5388:13,15 5391:8,9,10 5393:14 5393:15,16,22,22,24 5394:5,8,11 5395:17 5396:2,13,15,16,20 5396:24 5398:15 5399:20 5400:7,15,17 5400:19 5404:10 5405:14 5416:3 meetings 5372:8,13 5374:25 5375:9 5376:25 5410:21 5416:3 member 5359:16 5375:15,16 members 5341:24,24 5342:7 5345:17,18,25 5345:25 5347:11,12 5347:22,23 5350:9 5352:22 5353:10,11 5357:2,11,12 5362:17 5363:10.21 5364:13 5365:9 5370:6 5375:21 5380:13 5382:6,13 5391:16 5392:2 5393:19 5394:18 5399:7 5402:4,16,21 5403:4 5403:14.18 5410:4 men 5379:22 5380:8,25 5381:6,6 5382:2,17 5382:18 mention 5342:14 5350:13 5357:13 mentioned 5342:13 5345:15 5350:11 5396:4 5399:15 merely 5359:13 5361:15,19 5365:8 **message** 5396:6 messages 5356:16

material 5355:22

5355:19.24 5362:9

matter 5351:24

met 5354:17 5373:12 5373:22 5374:13.18 5376:9.10.17 5377:14 5380:8 5381:3,4,5 5390:16 5394:10 5405:10 metres 5391:11 middle 5412:15 might've 5407:10 5410:4 mind 5342:25 5344:17 5348:6 mine 5381:1 5392:13 5392:14 mining 5374:7,17 minus 5360:3 minutes 5366:12 5389:14,15 misapprehension 5409:6 mistake 5380:17 mistaken 5372:3 misunderstanding 5386:19 5414:16 mixed 5372:20 5394:21 **Mojapelo** 5393:9,11,14 5393:18,21,25 5394:3 5394:7,13,17,23 5395:2,6,11,16,19,24 5396:8,11,16,19,23 5397:3,8,14,19 5398:4,5,7,11,22 5399:1,4,11,17 5400:24 5401:7,12,20 5401:24 5402:2,24 5403:3,10,14,19 moment 5345:12 money 5368:23 5369:10,11,23 5373:9 5373:24 5376:2,21 5386:13 5405:1 month 5368:15 mood 5410:20 morning 5345:24 5347:11 5350:7 5358:14 5379:1,5 5388:14 5391:6 5398:16 5405:15 5407:21 5418:9 motivating 5391:25 Motlagelu 5391:21 Motlagelu's 5392:7 Motlagewa 5389:22 Motsogela 5413:1 Motsogela's 5413:3 **move** 5343:3 5344:22 5349:10 5356:4,7 5360:9 5363:7 5391:14 5410:15 moved 5374:6 moving 5410:24 **Mpofu** 5341:3,5 5343:14,15,22 5344:4 5344:7,24 5345:6 5348:10,11,18 5349:15 5354:18

5397:22 5399:23 5403:21,23 5404:7,13 5404:19 5405:2.12 5406:7,15 5407:17,19 5408:10,13,16,19 5409:14 5410:1,7,14 5410:23 5411:3,13,17 5411:24 5412:7,14,22 5413:8,11,14,21,24 5414:5,17,23,25 5415:9,12 5416:5,17 5416:20,24 5417:2,8 5417:13,19 5418:6,17 Mpofu's 5356:1 Mtengwane 5359:18 5361:9,16 mustn't 5414:4 **Mutimvane** 5360:15 N names 5394:12,14 5396:4 near 5361:2 5362:4 5390:21 necessarily 5361:14 necessary 5415:10 5417:22 need 5363:4 5389:14 5417:17 5418:4 negativity 5405:4 negotiate 5377:7 5415:5 negotiations 5383:11 5395:13 5412:18 neither 5359:15 5365:24 5417:15 neutral 5406:17 never 5377:22 5378:2 5385:4,5,5 5395:24 5397:6,11 5401:2 5403:8,17 5405:10,11 5413:24 5414:22 nevertheless 5361:10 new 5395:9 news 5342:5 5348:1 5351:16 5352:18 nice 5348:24 **night** 5354:13 5356:16 5358:22.23.25 5359:10 nine 5398:16 Nkaneng 5359:19 5360:23 noise 5354:7 noted 5400:22 notice 5353:23 5384:10 **noticed** 5370:2 number 5347:18 5351:19 5357:20 **numbers** 5353:16 NUM's 5398:15,19 5399:6,13 nè 5394:25 0

oath 5341:8 5366:18

5398:2 **object** 5348:13 5407:13 **objected** 5411:8 objection 5349:6 5356:3 5372:15,17 5399:24 5407:1,4 5410:12 objections 5410:9 observation 5361:16 5397:1 **observe** 5391:10,18 5403:1 5417:12 **observed** 5391:15 5402:4 5405:7 5417:15 **obtain** 5365:22 5386:22 **obtained** 5388:8,11 **obviate** 5410:8 obviously 5347:9 5349:3 occasion 5365:21 5375:3 5377:14 5383:2 occasions 5348:5 5377:24 occur 5374:8 occurred 5360:3 5371:24 5374:14,14 5387:15 offer 5416:22 office 5342:6,19,22 5345:17 5346:4,12,20 5348:2 5352:4 5354:1 5354:11 5362:16 5363:8,11,19,22,25 5365:20 5367:24 5368:5 5371:25 5372:12,22 5373:6,14 5376:9 5381:24 5382:19,20,25 5383:1 5383:2 5387:6 5403:16 5417:11 officer 5350:1 officers 5381:1,6,13,19 offices 5362:4 5379:21 5380:11,14,20,24 5381:11.12 5382:8.13 5382:18 5386:11 5390:20,21 5391:15 5391:23,24 5396:17 5397:4 5399:21 5400:20 5401:9 5403:4,8 5418:21 **Oh** 5407:3 okay 5367:14 5373:17 5373:25 5380:5 5381:21 5387:7 5393:18,21,25 5394:3 5394:7,13,17,23 5395:2,6,11,19,24 5396:8,11,16,19 5397:14 5398:22 5399:11,17 5400:24 5401:7,12 5403:3,10 5403:14,19 5405:2

5411:15 5412:22

5371:4 5378:24

5414:13,23 5415:12	5417:23,23
5416:24	participate 5391:9
once 5344:2 5374:9,13	particular 5354:11
5406:8 5412:9	5389:5 5405:4
open 5366:1,21	5409:16
opened 5359:20 5385:4	partly 5362:24
5385:5	party 5393:4
opportunity 5344:20	passages 5411:4
5386:17 5389:8,11	passed 5397:6
5391:3 5392:4,24 5399:18	passing 5359:19 5360:23
opposed 5356:17	patrolled 5358:14
5375:4	patroned 3338.14 pay 5370:23
opposing 5397:10	payslip 5370:8,10
order 5346:7 5358:2	peaceful 5354:5 5355:1
5375:7 5391:2 5399:8	perfectly 5343:4
ordinary 5375:14,16	5386:23
organised 5393:16	period 5363:11
originally 5390:6	persist 5372:14
originating 5350:14	persisting 5417:6
origins 5415:18	person 5348:1 5350:18
outside 5364:7 5377:7	5351:16 5352:16,21
5381:23 5382:1,20	5353:3,4 5359:2,22
5383:12	5360:7,19,24 5371:1
overwhelmingly	5392:21 5400:13
5349:24	5413:13
o'clock 5397:16,24 5398:16 5419:8	personnel 5409:22
3398:10 3419:8	persons 5359:8 5361:7 5362:15 5409:24,25
P	phrase 5410:2
page 5341:14 5359:17	phrases 5352:8
5359:22 5360:16	physically 5351:8
5362:2 5378:15	picks 5363:4
5408:19 5409:12	picture 5341:19 5363:5
5411:12,13,14	piece 5352:17
5413:15	pipes 5406:2,5,6
pages 5359:7 5362:7	place 5353:5 5354:25
paid 5370:9	5360:20,25 5361:2
pain 5357:23	5363:13 5368:5
pangas 5364:16,25	5373:5 5377:2,12
5391:18 5403:1	5394:1,4 5395:7
5417:12,15,16	5412:17
papers 5383:15,18	placed 5357:4 5390:25
parade 5376:1 paragraph 5341:14,21	places 5369:22 5394:20 5416:8
5343:17,19 5344:2,5	played 5417:9
5344:8 5350:1,5	pleasant 5401:16,18
5356:24 5359:11	please 5349:12,12
5360:18 5367:3	5360:9 5367:11
5372:10 5378:7,16,17	5382:10 5384:16
5378:21 5379:19	5386:20,24 5396:22
5380:6 5387:14	5398:5
5390:14,15 5391:2,19	Pleasure 5341:7
5391:20 5392:7,25	plus 5350:23 5360:3
5398:12,13,20 5399:5	5363:18
5399:11,18 5402:3,25	podium 5405:24
5408:21,21 5411:17	5406:1,12
5413:3,20,21	point 5342:5 5348:1,19
paragraphs 5344:25	5349:11 5354:9 5355:17 22 5356:1
5345:9	5355:17,22 5356:1 5361:6,23 5362:19,22
paraphrase 5354:23 part 5342:11 5343:11	5361:6,23 5362:19,22
5348:24 5357:2	5384:4 5400:22
5363:18 5364:1	5405:4 5410:18
5366:2 5381:21	5417:24
5402:25 5405:7	nointed 5360:14 5371:9

```
5412:16
police 5341:15 5350:1
  5356:25 5357:3.10.11
  5357:20 5358:5,21
  5359:4,8 5366:5
  5390:21 5417:9
policeman 5342:3
  5346:24 5347:13,16
  5349:2
policemen 5348:8
position 5377:5
possibility 5349:8
  5371:17
possible 5343:4
  5348:21,24 5349:4,18
  5354:24 5355:2
  5365:22
possibly 5347:16
  5348:25
precede 5367:9
precise 5349:22
precisely 5361:10
  5363:13
prefaced 5349:19
prefer 5404:19,22
preferred 5364:19
prepared 5387:19
preparing 5391:14
presence 5385:9 5386:5
  5386:10
present 5346:8 5354:10
  5374:15,20 5386:8
  5394:4 5396:2
presented 5362:15
  5363:10,16 5376:21
  5384:20,23 5385:1,4
press 5363:4
presumably 5412:19
prevented 5390:19
previous 5341:23
  5345:24 5347:12
  5360:15 5370:9
  5392:2
previously 5409:13,14
principal 5352:15
probabilities 5349:8
probable 5349:24
probably 5410:21
problem 5344:18
  5348:7 5370:14
  5404:17 5417:13
proceed 5341:3,11
  5372:18 5398:6
proceedings 5341:1
  5344:3
produce 5353:12
production 5412:10
proof 5344:17
proper 5407:5
properly 5349:6
proposal 5408:5,6,12
proposals 5369:16
propose 5349:11
  5416:25
proposed 5406:24
proposition 5356:4
```

5414:10 propositions 5343:15 5343:16,18 5344:6 5349:20 5363:15 protection 5409:17 public 5393:15 purpose 5359:12 5361:5 5399:19 5400:19 5401:12 5403:15 5409:5,9,12 5410:3,16 **purposes** 5360:13 5365:4 5375:10 pursuant 5343:21 **put** 5343:12,14 5344:5 5344:12,20,21 5348:13,20 5349:22 5352:7 5354:10,20,22 5355:3,4,7,13,18 5356:5 5358:17,20 5361:5 5363:14 5378:22 5389:16,19 5390:2,5,7 5400:8 5404:19 5409:21 5414:11 5415:19 5417:21 5418:3 putting 5343:25 5355:6 5400:3 5405:17 5408:5 5414:11 **puzzles** 5347:21 quality 5349:21 Quantum 5350:9,12,12 5350:14 5353:12 5354:13 5406:19,20 5409:11,23,25 5410:5 **question** 5345:22 5348:13,16,19 5349:7 5353:9 5354:24 5355:2,14 5356:24 5357:6,8,23 5358:20 5368:2 5370:18,18 5371:5,15,18,20 5375:13 5377:19 5382:10 5383:14 5384:12.12.25 5385:17.20.22.24 5386:18,23,25 5387:2 5388:19 5395:25 5400:22 5402:8,14,14 5405:6,19,20 5406:23 5407:2,10,14,19 5408:3 5409:21,23 5410:1,8,9,11,12,17 5410:20 5412:1 5414:5,8,11,14 5415:1,14,19 5416:10 5416:15 5417:3,5,7 5417:14 5418:20 questioned 5403:25 questioning 5400:1 questions 5349:9,11 5355:25 5358:4

5366:10 5367:8,10,12

5365:5 5410:6

5386:16.20.21.21 5388:25 5393:9 5403:20,24 5405:13 5407:22 quite 5347:18 5355:25 5361:1 5362:12 5363:9 5371:7 5402:19 quote 5347:25 R raise 5371:2 raised 5361:24 5362:13 5369:18 5374:11 5411:20 **raising** 5362:9 ran 5403:13 rationale 5410:1 **RBO** 5368:10 **RBOs** 5368:23 **RDO** 5367:4 5373:11 5375:14 5376:7,8 5377:14,20 5382:12 5382:24 5383:1 5386:10,10 5387:9,11 5393:24 **RDOs** 5342:16,18 5367:17,23 5369:15 5370:23 5372:22 5373:8,18 5374:6,18 5374:21 5375:4,14,19 5375:22,23 5376:16 5376:17,21 5377:2,5 5377:23 5378:9 5379:1,16 5380:20 5383:10 5386:5,8,13 5387:6,10,12,20 5388:6 5392:14 5393:17,19 5394:10 5394:25 5396:6,17,19 5396:24 5401:3 5404:1,3,6 5411:8 5412:2,3,5,9 5416:3 reach 5379:21 5380:24 reached 5379:8 5395:9 5396:4 5403:8.11 **reaction** 5350:22 5351:4 5353:9 read 5352:6 5359:11 5383:17,25 5385:5,8 5385:13 5390:13 5392:12 5399:9,12 5402:9.11 reads 5358:11 5362:3 ready 5341:3,11 real 5417:4 realise 5404:25 really 5343:24 5359:5 5368:22 5389:24 5400:8,11 5406:8 5410:14,20 5416:10 reason 5342:22 5346:11,13,17 5357:15,23 5370:12

5370:25 5381:15

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

5402:25 5405:7

pointed 5360:14 5371:8

reasons 5343:10 5357:25 5369:18 5397:3 recall 5341:24 5343:23 5358:20 5394:15 received 5355:5 5373:2 5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 refering 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 referes 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14	
reasons 5343:10 5357:25 5369:18 5397:3 recall 5341:24 5343:23 5358:20 5394:15 received 5355:5 5373:2 5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:25 5394:13 5398:25 5406:1 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5406:7 repeat 5344:19:17 repeat 5344:19:17 resoved:7 repeat 5344:15:17 resoved:7 repeat 5342:18 resoved:7 repeat 5344:19:357:7 resoved:7 repeat 5342:18 resoved:7 repeat 5344:19:357:7 resoved:7 repeat 5342:18 resoved:	5382:22 5395:2
5357:25 5369:18 5397:3 recall 5341:24 5343:23 5358:20 5394:15 received 5355:5 5373:2 5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 refering 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 referes 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5368:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5410:15 5415:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:15 5359:395:39 5400:7 repeat 5344:15 5410:11 5410:11 5410:15 5411:1 5410:15 54515:19 5400:7 repeat 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5388:29 5392:8	
5397:3 recall 5341:24 5343:23 5358:20 5394:15 received 5355:5 5373:2 5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 refering 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 regarded 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 536:8 5409:16 related 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5368:2 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
recall 5341:24 5343:23 5358:20 5394:15 received 5355:5 5373:2 5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 refering 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5368:25 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5358:20 5394:15 received 5355:5 5373:2 5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 refering 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5368:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
received 5355:5 5373:2 5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarded 530:19 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5373:7 5387:25 receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 refering 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
receiving 5370:3 record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20	
record 5355:23 5356:8 5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relating 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5356:10 5358:3 5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5349:25,25 reformulate 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5359:4 5372:2 5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5377:12 5417:20,24 recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
recorded 5350:2 5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	5377:12 5/17:20 2/
5359:4,13 refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 refering 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
refer 5362:13 5372:13 5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5382:7 5383:22 5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5391:1 5402:2,9 reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
reference 5361:20,24 5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5362:1,2,20 5367:4 5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5378:9 5409:7,8 referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
referred 5343:16 5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5358:6 5360:15,16 5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	referred 53/3·16
5372:23 5410:25 referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
referring 5352:11 5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5375:2 5383:20 5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5384:15,18 5391:2 refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	5375:2 5383:20
refers 5362:6,8,21 reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
reflected 5349:25,25 reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
reformulate 5388:19 5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5410:8,11 refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
refrain 5399:25 refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
refused 5383:16 regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
regard 5346:16 5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5377:25 5382:8 5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5391:20 5398:15,19 regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
regarded 5347:17,19 regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
regarding 5367:4 rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
rehired 5370:6 related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
related 5409:2 5413:17 relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
relates 5370:19 relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
relating 5407:20 relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
relation 5365:6,23 5366:8 5409:16 relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	relating 5407:20
relevant 5367:8 5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5410:20 5417:25 relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
relied 5344:4,9 relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	5410:20 5417:25
relying 5343:19 5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5409:14 remained 5381:16 remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	relying 5343:19
remark 5399:24 remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	remained 5381:16
remember 5344:11 5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5345:3,7 5347:2 5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5354:21 5355:3 5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5358:4 5369:14 5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5374:17 5375:24 5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	5358:4 5369:14
5376:19 5380:3 5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	5374:17 5375:24
5386:20 5394:13 5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	5376:19 5380:3
5398:22 5406:1 5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	5386:20 5394:13
5408:1 5411:1 5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5416:15 5419:1 removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
removed 5355:19 5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5400:7 repeat 5344:1 5357:7 5382:9 5392:8	
5382:9 5392:8	5400:7
5382:9 5392:8	repeat 5344:1 5357:7
5396:22	5382:9 5392:8
	5396:22

repeated 5350:16
5357:6
repeatedly 5348:21 reply 5407:18
report 5345:17 5350:20
5351:1,18 5352:24
5353:2 5354:1
5358:21 5359:1 5360:11 5373:2,3,3,4
5373:7,18 5375:19,20
5376:16 5377:1
5379:12 5387:20,25
5391:10 5399:8 5418:2,4
reported 5341:23
5357:21 5358:15
5362:15 5413:19,24 5414:4,19
reports 5342:17
5352:20 5363:4
represent 5352:12
5394:12 representative 5366:6
5387:11 5393:4
representatives 5373:6
5373:13,20 5375:21
5376:7,9,10 5377:5,6
5377:15,21,23 5380:19 5382:25
5383:2 5386:10
5387:5,9 5404:4,9,21
5411:18 5413:17,18
5414:19
representing 5380:22 request 5369:17
5410:10 5412:20
requested 5380:12
requests 5390:11
required 5345:7 requiring 5345:10
reserved 5393:6
respect 5356:3 5357:6
5361:9 5362:9
5364:19 5366:1 5390:7 5409:15
5410:6
respected 5381:16
respective 5395:3
respond 5355:8 5392:19 5409:1
response 5356:6,6
5370:3 5415:7
responsible 5362:25
5408:1
rest 5350:6 result 5342:15 5351:1
5352:23 5353:11
5352:23 5353:11 5390:11 5409:10
resulting 5357:23
resumes 5341:2 5366:16,17 5397:25
5398:1
retreated 5364:13
returned 5380:12
5387:16,24
ra_avamination

ikana Commission of Ind
5403:22,23 5407:14 5409:21 5417:1 right 5341:18 5346:9 5351:6,9,23 5357:22 5359:3 5362:12 5375:9 5389:13,16 5390:3,4 5408:6
rights 5393:7 Roland 5361:3 5370:1 5399:7
roundabout 5360:22 rounds 5416:2
run 5365:19 5403:6
running 5365:16 R10 5415:23
R10 5415:25 R12 5367:18 5368:10
5368:13 5369:1,2,6
5369:12 5370:23
5375:23 5377:25
5378:12,20 5414:20
5415:16,22,23
R13 5415:22
R750 5373:24
S
Saffi 5362:18
salaries 5368:10
5369:18,23 5377:7
5378:9 5394:24
salary 5367:4,17
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8 5352:10 5356:17
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8 5352:10 5356:17 5373:24 5382:6
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8 5352:10 5356:17 5373:24 5382:6 5383:4 5385:12,25
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8 5352:10 5356:17 5373:24 5382:6 5383:4 5385:12,25 5386:3,4
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8 5352:10 5356:17 5373:24 5382:6 5383:4 5385:12,25
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8 5352:10 5356:17 5373:24 5382:6 5383:4 5385:12,25 5386:3,4 says 5358:10 5359:18
salary 5367:4,17 5369:11 5375:22 5378:12,20 5395:3,10 sat 5381:2 satellite 5390:21 Saturday 5345:24 5347:10 5389:5 saw 5342:6 5362:17 5397:11 5401:3,4 5402:1 5415:10 5417:17 saying 5342:10,11 5343:3 5344:7 5345:18 5351:8 5352:10 5356:17 5373:24 5382:6 5383:4 5385:12,25 5386:3,4 says 5358:10 5359:18 5359:23 5360:17

5409:4,19 5410:10
5413:12,13
see 5343:5 5346:19
5347:20,20,23 5348:1
5353:16 5355:24
5356:13 5357:13
5376:3 5378:17
5385:3 5397:14,21 5398:12 5399:14
5398:12 5399:14 5401:15,17,23
5402:10 5404:25
5409:12 5415:8
5417:17,18,19 5418:5
5418:5,13 5419:4
seeing 5361:4
seek 5371:19 5389:25
Sello 5390:25
semblance 5400:8
Semenya 5358:5,18
5362:22 5372:2,16
5397:22 5409:7 5417:8
Semenya's 5372:5
send 5404:3,24
sending 5404:8,17
senior 5413:12
sent 5357:12 5404:20
5415:6
sentence 5341:21
5342:2,10 5343:6
5344:8 5347:24
5350:1,6 5409:13
5413:4
sentences 5344:3,4
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelee 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelee 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22 shot 5341:24 5345:25
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22 shot 5341:24 5345:25 5347:11,22 5358:15
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22 shot 5341:24 5345:25 5347:11,22 5358:15 5360:6,17,19,22
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22 shot 5341:24 5345:25 5347:11,22 5358:15 5360:6,17,19,22 5361:7,16,18
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22 shot 5341:24 5345:25 5347:11,22 5358:15 5360:6,17,19,22 5361:7,16,18 shots 5350:9 5356:9
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22 shot 5341:24 5345:25 5347:11,22 5358:15 5360:6,17,19,22 5361:7,16,18 shots 5350:9 5356:9 5357:2,12 5360:3
sentences 5344:3,4 sequence 5374:24 5380:18 serious 5404:25 seriously 5387:19 5416:7 5417:4 seriousness 5348:18 Service 5358:6 5359:8 services 5370:9 Set 5385:20 Setelele 5354:22 shaft 5361:3 5368:7 5373:2 5379:7 5399:7 sharp 5401:21 shift 5379:1 shooting 5342:7 5345:18 5346:13,16 5348:2 5350:13,14 5352:17 5353:5 5360:4 5406:22 5409:11 shop 5393:23,25 5394:1 5394:3 shortly 5360:22 shot 5341:24 5345:25 5347:11,22 5358:15 5360:6,17,19,22 5361:7,16,18 shots 5350:9 5356:9

```
shouts 5365:13
show 5384:16
shown 5385:2
siad 5342:6
side 5364:12 5368:21
  5370:13 5373:21
  5375:24 5381:16
  5401:23
similar 5418:9
similarly 5353:21
simple 5370:21
  5385:17,19,20 5412:1
simply 5351:8 5357:8
  5384:25 5385:22
  5400:17 5404:16,20
  5409:6
Sinclair 5383:25
  5408:23 5413:4,5,15
  5413:16
singing 5391:13 5401:4
  5401:15 5418:22,25
single 5356:4
Sir 5341:9 5344:18
  5346:2,22 5354:15
  5357:5
sitting 5396:7 5406:10
situated 5390:21
  5399:21
situation 5353:14
  5354:4 5364:22
  5397:12 5401:5
  5411:6,11,22 5412:12
  5418:8,8
slide 5358:6 5361:20
  5362:6,20 5409:7
slightly 5368:2
small 5376:21 5387:25
solely 5409:12
SOMAGACA 5382:9
  5411:12,15 5413:20
somebody 5342:5
  5350:7 5369:22
  5400:6
song 5401:16,18 5419:2
songs 5418:22,24
  5419:2,3,5
sorry 5354:18 5357:5
  5371:13 5376:6
  5383:23 5392:5
  5399:23 5405:13
  5406:19 5407:3
  5411:13,24
sort 5370:13 5376:8
  5419:5
sounds 5365:15
source 5343:17
South 5358:5 5359:8
so-called 5349:6
speak 5365:9 5381:23
  5387:18 5394:8
spear 5401:23
spears 5364:16,25
  5391:17 5401:21
  5402:6,17,20,21
  5417:12,15,16
specific 5409:22
```

re-examination

5406:23,24 5407:7,25

shouted 5364:5

5399:19 5400:5

5414:2,3 5415:4

second 5344:8,21,22

5349:25 5359:22

5360:5 5379:22

5380:9 5381:1,6,12

5381:18,19,22,23

5382:1,2 5392:16

seated 5392:18

5417:24

security 5359:20

5402:25 5411:7,18

5412:8,15 5413:4,7

				Page
specifically 5354:23	5396:20,23 5397:9	tell 5346:19,23 5351:17	5360:21 5361:7	5396:21,25 5397:5
5355:3 5415:23	structures 5377:8	5358:9 5359:12		· ·
			throw 5361:4 5410:19	travelling 5354:12
spoke 5351:1 5360:11	5378:1 5383:13	5367:11 5370:21	thrown 5364:4	treatment 5362:18
5365:14 5381:18,22	subject 5417:25	5374:20 5379:24	thrust 5410:9,11	tree 5401:18
5382:16 5414:7	submission 5349:23	5383:19 5395:6	Thursday 5343:22	trees 5418:13
spoken 5352:2 5376:20	submissions 5366:8	5417:17 5418:4	time 5342:25 5345:1	tried 5344:15
stadium 5358:16	submitted 5357:14	5419:5	5356:22 5360:20	triple 5400:4
5359:20 5360:24	subsequent 5372:8,13	telling 5376:17 5397:8	5362:1,9,24 5364:9	Trollip 5408:23
5391:8 5398:17	5376:25	testify 5372:12 5374:25	5367:16 5368:3,18	trouble 5404:11
5399:21	sue 5414:10	testimony 5372:23	5369:12,13 5372:1,20	5406:17,18
stage 5366:15 5378:18	suggest 5408:9	thank 5341:5,10,12	5372:20 5373:16,22	true 5400:16,17
_	suggested 5407:23	5349:14,14 5350:4		5404:21
5382:6,12 5383:1	00	,	5375:13 5377:10	
5387:20 5395:9	suggesting 5397:17	5358:19 5360:1	5378:3,6,12,25	truth 5351:24
5397:17	suggestion 5382:24	5361:8 5366:19,23,24	5384:4 5387:3	try 5343:2
stand 5392:20 5405:24	5407:8 5408:1	5367:2,7,21 5372:19	5388:16,23 5391:15	trying 5368:19 5374:13
5406:4	suggestions 5369:16	5373:25 5375:17	5392:17 5395:23	5384:14
standing 5382:19,21	5394:11 5406:17	5387:1 5388:1,24	5402:4 5413:23	turn 5378:15 5399:25
5391:11 5392:8	suggests 5405:3	5392:22,23 5393:2	5414:3	turned 5417:10
start 5393:14	5406:20	5403:21 5410:23	times 5348:8 5416:6	TV 5358:7
started 5365:16	Sunday 5391:7	5415:9,12 5416:5	Tip 5341:10,12,18	twin 5359:20 5361:11
5369:11,13,13	supported 5395:17	5417:8 5418:17	5342:2,9 5343:2,9	5361:17 5407:24,25
5370:14 5391:13	supported 5355.17 suppose 5355:18	5419:6	5344:1,19 5345:5,9	5407:25 5409:4
		thanks 5349:15		
starting 5399:4	5392:20 5404:21		5345:16,20,22	two 5343:12 5344:3
starts 5362:22	5418:10	5403:23 5410:17	5348:23 5349:14	5358:15,16,22 5359:6
state 5342:21,25	sure 5348:12 5349:5	5418:6	5350:4,15,22 5351:3	5360:21,22 5361:5
5344:17 5348:6	5355:20 5361:1	that's 5346:6 5347:6	5351:7,14,21 5352:1	5362:1,3,15 5373:5
5357:19 5370:9	5368:15 5373:10	5348:9 5350:10	5352:6,14,21 5353:1	5373:13,20 5375:21
5380:5 5390:16	5376:24 5381:8	5352:14 5355:19	5353:4,8,18,20,24	5376:10 5379:21
5391:19	5383:18 5384:11	5358:17 5370:1	5354:5,8 5355:8,10	5380:8,25 5381:5
stated 5376:3,22	5400:3 5402:24	5376:23 5380:24	5355:12,15 5356:2,23	5382:2,17 5389:14,15
5391:20 5392:3	system 5369:20,25	5381:21 5386:11	5357:7 5358:1,8,19	5397:23 5408:2
statements 5359:6,7,11	System 22 03 .20,20	5402:1 5408:10	5358:25 5359:3	5409:3,8,10 5412:17
5359:15 5367:3	T	5410:21 5412:22,24	5360:1,13 5361:8,15	type 5406:1
5389:2 5390:7,8,13	table 5404:14 5405:18	5413:4 5414:2,9	5362:12 5363:2,24	type 3400.1
				U
5400:1,2 5407:23	tabled 5414:21	5415:13 5416:2,22	5364:4,10,15,18	-
5409:3 5412:25	take 5347:3 5348:23	5417:24	5365:5,17 5366:7	unclear 5386:22
states 5370:8 5402:4	5355:22,24 5362:25	there's 5371:17	5384:5 5400:2 5407:1	underline 5343:10
stating 5376:14	5363:21 5366:14	5378:23 5380:2	5407:4,20 5408:24	5349:20
station 5390:22	5370:23 5371:9,22	5385:6 5389:21	5409:1 5410:16	understand 5341:3
stay 5352:15	5374:24 5380:7	5407:10,14 5408:5	Tip's 5347:23,25	5343:3,7,25 5350:3
StClare 5383:10	5381:14 5387:19	5414:13	5408:4	5352:8 5367:13
stewards 5394:3	5389:14 5396:5	They'll 5382:25	today 5351:20 5356:22	5370:18 5371:18
5399:6	5397:17,19 5402:15	thing 5342:14 5349:8	5370:7 5373:16	5374:1,12,13 5380:7
stick 5391:17 5401:11	5411:3 5414:12	5354:16 5377:12	5377:10 5378:5	5380:11,14 5381:15
5401:13,15,17,19	taken 5351:2,3 5353:5	5392:10	5388:23 5395:23	5382:5,11,14,23
	5357:22 5362:17	things 5344:13,14	5403:8	
sticks 5364:16,24				5383:3 5384:12,14
5401:25 5402:6,17,18	5368:5 5376:22	5347:18,18 5414:18	told 5347:7,10,15,17	5385:11,14 5387:7
5418:12	5379:8 5395:3,7	think 5348:22 5354:21	5353:10 5354:16	5398:20 5408:8
stocks 5418:21	5417:4	5355:6 5361:3 5362:8	5375:18 5377:22	5410:1 5411:23,25
stone 5374:7	takes 5350:12	5362:24 5370:15	5378:2 5379:24	5412:20 5414:14
stones 5364:4	talk 5352:4 5379:19	5372:5 5383:20	5383:16 5384:21	understanding 5404:15
stop 5387:18 5398:23	5383:19 5387:10,12	5384:1 5386:14	5385:5 5387:10,12	5411:5,11,22 5412:5
stoppage 5388:2,3,7	5387:15 5401:7	5388:20 5389:21,23	5402:19 5411:9	5412:11 5415:18
stopped 5379:21	5415:5 5416:8	5389:25 5392:18	5412:9 5413:1	understands 5414:8,10
5381:1	talked 5347:11 5355:19	5394:19 5398:18	tool 5405:22	understood 5371:15
store 5374:18	5403:17 5416:10	5402:13 5405:19	tools 5416:13	5372:23 5415:14
story 5400:15,16	talking 5346:14 5373:8	5410:15 5411:24	top 5359:21 5406:5	undisputed 5365:6
straight 5387:3	5373:23 5375:10	5412:23 5414:4,5,6	5411:13	unfortunately 5363:3
_				
street 5365:12	5382:1 5400:6	5416:22 5417:14	topic 5352:15 5358:2	unhappiness 5398:14
strike 5351:25 5352:5	talks 5360:25 5368:23	third 5360:18,24	5363:5 5406:16	5399:13
5352:13 5356:17	tape 5381:13,15,17	5408:2	touch 5356:13	unhappy 5400:7
5370:4 5378:19	5382:15,20	thoroughly 5410:22	trade 5411:19	union 5370:11,13
5388:9 5395:14,17,21	tea 5366:15	thought 5361:5 5382:3	traditional 5391:17	5387:9,12 5411:10,19
5396:1 5397:10	team 5343:22 5375:14	5385:7 5386:19	5402:5,17	5412:2 5413:18
5398:23	5406:25,25 5409:20	thousand 5404:16	transpired 5373:19	5414:1,21
strikers 5363:17	telephone 5357:20	three 5345:6 5347:18	transporting 5396:12	unions 5395:4

15th February 2013	Ma
unknown 5360:7	5411:9
unpleasantness 5401:3	weapon 5401:9
unprotected 5356:17	weapons 5354:25
unrest 5391:11	5391:17,18 5401:21
upset 5397:12 5401:3	5402:5,17 5403:1
use 5400:2 5408:6	Wednesday 5419:8
V	week 5355:5 went 5346:20 5351:9
valid 5371:14	5363:18 5364:24
various 5377:23	5373:10 5374:9
5406:21 5407:23	
	5380:10,10,20 5381:2
5410:21	5381:7,7,17,19
vehicle 5361:14,17	5382:16,18,25
vehicles 5410:4	5386:11 5387:6
version 5361:18	5398:23 5401:8
5364:19 5390:1	5404:5,15 5407:22
5392:6 5418:2	5409:5 5411:18
vicinity 5353:21 5363:7	weren't 5372:24
5363:25 5365:19	5400:21
victims 5407:24	we'll 5371:7 5393:1
video 5417:23,23	we're 5343:6 5344:8
5418:1,5,10	5405:13
view 5387:17 5411:19	we've 5370:14 5377:21
5414:20	5408:20
views 5390:17 5405:16	what's 5355:19
5405:23 5406:3	5408:18 5414:3
violent 5390:23	white 5379:22 5380:8
visible 5417:16	5380:25 5381:5,6
visit 5403:15	5382:2,17,18
visuals 5417:9,11	wish 5349:20 5363:8
voice 5406:3	5409:18 5412:10
	wished 5356:19
\mathbf{W}	withdrawn 5372:18
wage 5346:14 5383:12	witness 5348:20,21
5412:17,18 5413:17	5349:18 5355:17,21
waited 5381:2,7	5355:25 5356:11
waiting 5369:9	5361:4 5362:5,10,22
walk 5346:20 5347:5	5366:22 5371:6,11,15
walked 5346:24 5347:5	5371:18 5375:2
5390:20	5378:8,16 5384:16
walking 5359:19	5389:2,3,6,7,8,9,19
5360:18,23 5361:18	5390:13,14,15,24
want 5342:21 5343:9	5391:1 5392:3,5,13
5348:10 5352:15	5392:14,21,24 5393:1
5353:8 5354:19	5400:3,9,12,14
5357:8 5363:6	5403:20 5410:19
5364:21 5365:17,25	5414:8,14 5417:21
5371:9 5375:5,10	5418:4
5381:22 5385:6	witnesses 5354:10,20
	5355:4,7 5362:23
5387:18 5389:15	*
5393:7 5399:24	5382:24 5385:21
5411:3,10 5412:2	5390:1,6 5392:15
5414:6 5415:19	5413:1 5419:5
wanted 5346:8 5348:19	Wonderkop 5358:16
5370:15 5379:22,24	5359:19 5360:24
5404:14 5406:3,8	5362:4 5378:22
5416:7,8	5387:16 5390:17
wanting 5368:23	5391:8 5393:24
wasn't 5347:13	5398:17 5399:7,21
5352:18 5354:22	won't 5362:25 5398:20
5 7 5 7 1 1 1 5 7 0 0 1 A	1 TRAPA 5 4 / 10 / 1 5 / 116 · 1 V

```
5362:5 5369:21
  5379:2.12.16 5387:18
  5388:2,2,7,7 5392:2
  5394:1,4 5395:21
  5396:7,9,12,21,25
  5397:5 5398:24
  5399:2,22 5400:21
  5406:25 5409:18,19
  5410:10
workers 5358:17
  5362:1,3 5396:1,4
  5405:8,10,11 5406:21
  5409:17
workforce 5411:21
  5412:4
working 5369:19
  5371:1 5380:4
world 5362:10
wouldn't 5347:4,14
  5379:12
wounded 5358:17,22
  5409:8,10
written 5347:19
wrong 5357:18,20
          X
XX2 5359:6,17,23
  5362:7
XX6 5341:15 5357:10
           Y
year 5368:14,16,17
  5369:13,14 5370:3,25
  5412:17
yellow 5359:21
yesterday 5341:13,20
  5342:14,15 5344:23
  5350:8 5365:11
  5384:5,17 5405:19
  5407:21
You'd 5402:10
you'll 5358:3 5372:10
you're 5341:3,7,19
  5343:25 5345:18
  5366:18,18 5375:9,19
  5378:2,16 5380:16
  5382:6 5383:3
  5384:15.18 5389:13
  5389:16.20 5390:3
  5397:17
you've 5344:19
  5350:10,15 5352:1,7
  5355:22 5357:9
  5375:18 5385:2
  5393:1 5395:24
  5403:25 5410:24
  5416:5 5418:7
          \mathbf{Z}
Zokwana 5343:15
  5344:6
ZZ3 5389:4 5398:8
  5402:3
ZZ4 5389:22 5413:21
           \mathbf{0}
```

```
5416:12
0017 5411:7
08h00 5378:22
09h00 5391:7
1 5341:14 5353:2
10 5359:18 5419:8
10th 5341:23 5354:11
  5354:13 5356:13,16
  5358:13,24,25
  5359:10 5362:3
  5378:17,21 5379:1,4
  5379:5,9,13,17
  5380:21 5387:24
  5388:2 5395:11
  5397:2 5398:22
  5399:6 5401:6
  5404:13 5406:19,25
  5414:18 5418:9
10:02 5341:2
10:22 5350:3
10:42 5359:3
100 5391:11
11 5341:22 5391:7
  5416:12
11th 5350:7,18 5354:11
  5358:24 5363:7
  5389:5 5390:16
  5396:15 5401:8,8
  5405:14,14 5416:13
  5418:9,20
11:42 5366:17
12 5370:19 5404:14
  5416:1,4,12,17
12.5 5370:24 5371:2
12:02 5374:12
12:22 5382:5
12:42 5392:5
14:06 5398:1
14:26 5405:9
14:46 5413:14
15 5341:1
16 5358:6 5361:20
  5362:6,20 5409:7
17th 5343:5 5344:14
  5345:2
18:15 5359:19 5360:23
19:40 5361:1
2 5362:6 5367:3 5378:7
  5408:20
2nd 5376:6 5377:3
  5387:22
2.10 5391:19
2.4 5398:20 5399:5
2.5 5398:12,13,21
2.6 5398:13
2.8 5392:7
```

```
000 5406:10 5415:22.23
                         2011 5370:3.8
                         2012 5341:22 5359:18
                           5367:5.9.15.23
                           5371:25 5372:12,21
                           5375:22 5376:11
                           5378:8 5391:7
                         2013 5341:1 5412:19
                         21 5375:22
                         21st 5367:15,23 5368:4
                           5371:25 5372:8,9,12
                           5372:21 5376:11
                           5377:3 5387:21
                         23 5362:2
                         23rd 5376:6 5377:3,15
                           5387:22
                                    3
                         3 5378:16,17 5406:10
                         3rd 5353:6
                         3,000 5350:23
                         3.18 5411:6,14
                         3.19 5411:18
                         3.2 5372:10
                         3.22 5412:8
                         3.27 5412:14
                         30 5365:2 5366:12
                         30th 5377:4 5387:22
                         300 5367:23 5372:22
                         3000 5363:18 5365:1
                         35 5366:12
                                    4
                         4 5378:17,21 5379:19
                           5408:21 5409:19
                           5412:24
                                    5
                         5 5360:3 5380:6
                           5399:12 5413:3,21
                         500 5367:18,23 5368:10
                           5368:13 5369:1,2,6
                           5369:12 5370:19,23
                           5372:22 5375:23
                           5377:16,25 5378:12
                           5378:20 5404:14
                           5414:20 5415:16,22
                           5415:23 5416:1,4,12
                           5416:17
                                    6
                         6 5387:14 5411:13,14
                                    7
                         7 5390:14.15 5391:2
                           5392:25
                         750 5373:23 5374:11
                         78 5408:19 5409:12
                           5413:15
                         80 5359:7,17 5360:16
                           5362:7
                         81 5359:7,22 5362:7
                                    9
                         9 5378:8
```

5357:22 5388:14

wasting 5362:9,24

way 5345:10 5357:3

5362:2,4 5365:2

5401:15 5410:12

5416:22

word 5370:4 5406:18

words 5346:13 5368:4

5356:10,18,19 5362:2

5415:22 5416:9

work 5350:13,17

5408:6 5415:3

2.9 5402:3

20 5365:2

20h00 5362:3

2010 5369:15

20th 5419:8

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 10

	_		- J
9h00 5390:16			
01-20 5201-12			
9h30 5391:13			
9h40 5391:21			
9th 5367:5,9 5378:13			l l
5270 10 5270 2 0 0			
5378:18 5379:3,8,9			
5379:16 5393:15			
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
			l l
		i	i