# RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

## COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

## MARIKANA

#### **BEFORE TRIBUNAL**

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

#### **HELD ON**

DAY 43 5 FEBRUARY 2013 PAGES 4615 TO 4735

#### **HELD AT**

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



#### © REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037

Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335

E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za

Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 4615 Page 4617 [PROCEEDINGS ON 5 FEBRUARY 2013] test our ingenuity. The third unnumbered page, paragraph [11:02] CHAIRPERSON: 2 2 The Commission resumes. beginning? 3 Due to unforeseeable circumstances that arose yesterday, 3 MS BARNES: Paragraph beginning "Impala" 4 it's not been possible for us to commence until now and I 4 and the word "Impala" is in bold -5 wish to apologise to everyone concerned who has been kept 5 CHAIRPERSON: "Impala executive director waiting because we didn't commence at the scheduled time. Paul Dunn says" -6 6 You're still under oath. Ms Barnes, I think you're still 7 That's correct. 7 MS BARNES: 8 cross-examining? 8 And up till where is the CHAIRPERSON: 9 9 MS BARNES: Yes, Chair, that's correct. passage you want, Ms Barnes? 10 SENZENI ZOKWANA (CONTD): Yes. 10 MS BARNES: It's that paragraph and the 11 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS BARNES (CONTD): 11 next paragraph. 12 12 Good morning, Mr Zokwana. I'd like to start this morning CHAIRPERSON: Now, the next paragraph, 13 by introducing another article, also by Carol Paton. It's 13 the one after that begins "Either way", so are both of the 14 an article that was published in the Business Day on the 14 ways, as it were, covered in the two paragraphs that you've 15 14th June 2012. drawn the witness's attention to? What will this exhibit 16 16 CHAIRPERSON: MS BARNES: Yes, that's correct. 17 17 number be, Ms Pillay? CHAIRPERSON: I see, alright. Mr 18 MS PILLAY: Chair, it should be BBB2. 18 Zokwana, when you're ready let us know and then Ms Barnes 19 CHAIRPERSON: Triple? 19 will start questioning you about it. 20 MS PILLAY: BBB2. 20 MR ZOKWANA: Do you want to go through 21 21 the whole or want to only read these two paragraphs? CHAIRPERSON: BBB2, thank you. 22 MS BARNES: Yes, the focus is simply on 22 We do have copies for MS BARNES: 23 everybody. We'll hand those out now. 23 these two paragraphs. 24 CHAIRPERSON: 24 MR ZOKWANA: You say it's an article by Fine, I'm through. 25 Ms Carol Paton -25 MS BARNES: Have you had a chance to look Page 4616 Page 4618 1 MS BARNES: Yes, it's a different at them? You'll see that the first paragraph that I've drawn your attention to is a reference to what Paul Dunn 2 article, also by Carol Paton - yes. 3 CHAIRPERSON: - published in Business Day said happened in the wage negotiations at Impala in 2011 4 on the 14th last year. 4 and it's very similar to what was contained in the Carol 5 MS BARNES: 2012. Paton articles that we looked at last week, is that CHAIRPERSON: 6 correct? Thank you, alright. Is 6 there a particular passage to which to draw the witness's 7 MR ZOKWANA: 7 Except that it is in bold in 8 attention? this new document as compared to the other document, the 9 9 only thing I can see as different. MS BARNES: Yes, there is indeed. 10 MS BARNES: That's right, the font is 10 CHAIRPERSON: It might be an idea to give him, to identify it, give him a chance to read it quickly different. If I can just read the last sentence of the 11 11 12 or slowly, whichever speed he prefers - and then you can 12 first paragraph that I've asked you to question him about it. 13 13 CHAIRPERSON: I think to be fair, Ms 14 MS BARNES: It's really on page 3 of the 14 Barnes, there are a lot of people here in the auditorium 15 article and you'll see that about halfway down the page on 15 who have come to listen and they haven't got the advantage page 3 the word "Impala" appears in bold, if you could read 16 of reading the article so I think in fairness to them you 17 that paragraph and the paragraph following that. 17 should read - it's not a long passage - I think you should 18 CHAIRPERSON: If you want to look 18 read it, let the interpreter interpret it, because 19 elsewhere in the article just to see if there's something otherwise they will be lost, they won't be able to follow 20 that is relevant for him but he will tell us what he needs, 20 the cross-examination. 21 I think, Ms Barnes. 21 MS BARNES: Alright, I'll read the 22 MS BARNES: Are you with me, Mr Zokwana? relevant paragraph into the record then. This is now in 23 relation to wage negotiations at Impala in 2011. "Impala 23 CHAIRPERSON: The reference - while I was 24 making a note - what is the passage, in particular? 24 executive director Paul Dunn says that during the talks, 25 They're unnumbered I see, the pages, but that's just to management put a proposal on the table that rock drill

14

15

20

21

22

23

1

2

4

6

7

10

11

12

13

16

17

19

22

Page 4622

Page 4619

- operators who are more skilled and who are at risk of
- resigning for better jobs, be given a higher increment. We 2
- 3 recognised that we were out of step with the rest of the
- 4 industry, both in job grading and in pay. It would have
- 5 been pre-emptive to stop them from leaving but that
- suggestion never found its way into the final agreement." 6
- 7 Then the next paragraph reads as follows, "Mr Dunn says
- it's because NUM rejected it. Sidwell Dikolwana, the NUM's 8
- 9 provincial secretary, says it was never seriously on the
- 10 table." So what is reported here, Mr Zokwana, is not that
- 11 your provincial secretary, when he was asked about this,
- 12 said that there was no proposal, but he said it was not a
- 13 serious proposal. Is that correct? Is that the

14 information you received?

15

16

17

4

MR ZOKWANA: I think we are dealing with the same article, I gave an answer, because the only difference between this one, Chairperson, and the one we

- 18 read last week is that the description of the job of
- 19 machine drillers in the first article is described as hard,
- 20 which I agree with. On the new, with bold font this time,
- 21 it regards them as skilled but I still say, as I said last
- 22 week, that there was never a proposal to deal with a
- 23 differential increase to rock drill operators and I said
- 24 the reason being that for every negotiation process, people
- 25 exchange documentation, proposals are given in writing and

- Page 4621 document, although I know there were many documents flying
- around of many people who have turned experts in these
- matters.

4 MS BARNES: Alright, now let's go back to

the events of the 11th and the 12th of August 2012. If I

6 could perhaps just refer you to your statement, to page 3 paragraph 12.

7

MR ZOKWANA: Yes?

9 MS BARNES: You'll recall that I referred 10 you to this paragraph on Friday and I asked you to explain

the reference in that paragraph to the events that had 11 occurred at the NUM office the previous day, do you 12

13 remember that?

> MR ZOKWANA: I remember that very well. MS BARNES: What you said in response to my question on Friday was that Mr Bongo had told you on the phone on the 12th August that there had been an attempt to invade the NUM offices but you'd not gotten any details, is

19 that correct?

> MR ZOKWANA: That's correct, but let me explain. The reason of his calling was not to deal with the issue of the 11th, it was to deal with the fact that a group of people were marching towards the NUM office, but he did mention that such was not the first, as the previous

24

day there had been such and we never went into detail what

Page 4620

- my information from those who led, especially the leader of 1
- that negotiation, no such was presented. 2
- 3 MS BARNES: Sir, this article is dated
  - the 14th of June 2012, as you've seen. Were you aware at
- 5 this time that it was being said, that this proposal had
- been rejected by NUM and that your provincial was saying, 6
- 7 not that there was no proposal but that such a proposal was
- 8 not seriously on the table? Were you aware of that?
- 9 MR ZOKWANA: I have responded on Friday
- to say this, that a number of articles were written. Many 10 people tend to be experts on these matters - only 11
- 12 unfortunately after the effect and if NUM chose not to
- 13 respond to each and every article that is issued. As to
- 14 your question whether I have checked with the NUM
- 15 secretary, in my view he is not saying that such a proposal
- 16 was made. He is just saying that such a proposal was never
- 17 tabled and I think what he's saying concurs with what I 18 have given a response to say when you negotiate, you don't
- 19 put things as if you are just in a conversation, you reduce
- 20 them down into paper as proposals.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- 21 MS BARNES: I'll give you another
- opportunity to answer the question. Were you aware in June 22
- 23 2012 that the allegations that appear in this article were
- 24 being made?
- 25 MR ZOKWANA: Personally I never saw this

happened the previous day.

MS BARNES: Now despite that, despite having received that information from Mr Bongo, you took no steps on the 12th to find out what in fact had happened, is

5 that correct?

> MR ZOKWANA: My answer on Friday, and I'll repeat it again, was that when I arrived on the scene on the 12th, either the late comrade Bongo or any other leaders of the branch were already in hiding and what was pressing at that time was the risk of more lives being lost, hence I spent more time with the company trying to look at measures, we can increase police presence so that no more lives were lost.

14 MS BARNES: So the answer to the question 15 is no.

MR ZOKWANA: I couldn't understand the question because I'm saying that Mr Bongo - the late comrade Bongo who could have explained, and other officers of the branch, were not on the scene as they had been compelled to run away from their lives, but from what we have raised with Bongo on the phone - he wasn't there when I arrived.

23 CHAIRPERSON: The answer to the question 24 counsel asked you is no, but you've given explanation for 25 that answer.

Page 4623 Page 4625 MR ZOKWANA: Yes. on the 12th of August, Mr Zokwana, was phone the police, is 1 But I think we can now move 2 CHAIRPERSON: 2 that correct? on. Now we know you've given a negative answer and we know 3 3 MR ZOKWANA: Yes, I said that in my view what the negative answer is based on, you can now proceed 4 4 and in terms of what I was given by the company, that only 5 to your next question, Ms Barnes. 5 the presence of the SAPS with the necessary skills in crowd 6 MS BARNES: And you also took no steps on 6 control would assist and they were telling me how 7 the 12th August to find out what your local NUM leaders' 7 frustrated they were and if you read the statement of the attitude was to the RDOs' strike, did you? 8 witness security Motlogeloa, he will tell you of their 8 9 9 CHAIRPERSON: I think his explanation is frustrations that there was no backup from the police. The going to be that they weren't there, they were already in 10 reason I called was because I was aware that if, to say 10 hiding so he couldn't - if he had been there he might've 11 11 that if nothing was done to increase the police – and I was asked them. I'm not - spending a lot of time on an issue 12 12 doing that as an NUM person, not on behalf of other unions. 13 13 that isn't going to help us. MS BARNES: I'd like us to, I'd like you 14 MS BARNES: Well, you did meet - on your 14 to tell us, sir, about those phone calls that you made on 15 own version, sir, you did meet with shop stewards on the 15 that day. You said that you phoned the office of the 12th of August, isn't that correct? provincial commissioner, is that correct? 16 16 17 MR ZOKWANA: 17 MR ZOKWANA: I tried to show you on That is in my statement, 18 Friday how different our structures are and I showed you 18 ves. 19 MS BARNES: 19 that the shop stewards are leaders who were elected at Who did you speak to? 20 their work place and the leaders who take decisions in a 20 MR ZOKWANA: Given the situation, I 21 branch will be members of the branch committee and I 21 couldn't remember who I spoke to. Whoever I spoke to did 22 [inaudible] Chairperson that on the day of my arrival none 22 not give mean answer I was happy with. 23 of the branch committee members were present and hence 23 MS BARNES: Do you know the rank of the 24 they'd gone to - they were hiding. 24 person you spoke to? 25 MS BARNES: 25 MR ZOKWANA: Now, on the 12th of August you I repeat, I could not have -Page 4624 Page 4626 had a meeting with Lonmin management, is that correct? I mean and if I could remember the rank I would be maybe 1 2 MR ZOKWANA: knowing the person. The only person I remember I spoke to Yes. 3 MS BARNES: Surely at that meeting with thereafter was the Minister of the Police. 4 Lonmin management you should've suggested that all the 4 MS BARNES: You said the response was 5 trade unions come together with Lonmin management and 5 unsatisfactory. What did this person say to you? attempt to establish the facts as to what was going on and 6 MR ZOKWANA: They didn't have enough 6 7 attempt to find a solution, surely you should've done that? 7 personnel to deal with the situation as two of their MR ZOKWANA: personnel had been to the scene, as claimed by the report 8 Sorry Chairperson, maybe if she can assist me to understand which unions are we 9 9 of the security officer. 10 MS BARNES: referring to? What level of personnel did 10 MS BARNES: 11 you think was required? 11 All the unions that might 12 have an interest in the matter. 12 MR ZOKWANA: Given the numbers of people 13 MR ZOKWANA: Let me explain that, 13 who were involved here, I mean between 2 000 and 3 000 and Chairperson. My concern was to ensure that relevant steps 14 how they were described in manner, in terms of being armed, 14 15 I thought that the security had to decide that, I'm not in 15 are taken, as I was informed that already two lives had been lost with the possibility of more being lost, if you 16 a position to determine. My training has not given me to 16 17 read the statement of the security Motlogeloa as to what 17 know if people are armed this way, you need so many. 18 was happening on the day, page 94. I was not going to be a 18 MS BARNES: You then phoned the Minister 19 shop steward of other unions. I think those unions had the 19 of Police directly, is that correct? 20 choice to prevail if they were concerned [inaudible]. With MR ZOKWANA: I was given his office and I 20 21 due respect, Chairperson, I went to represent NUM to make 21 got somebody in the office and I left a message. He came sure that what NUM can do to reduce any further carnage. I 22 back to me. 22 23 MS BARNES: What did you ask the Minister 23 was not going to say to management, where are other unions? 24 They never mandated me to raise that on their behalf. 24 of Police to do? 25 [11:22] MS BARNES: We know that what you did do 25 MR ZOKWANA: I gave him the report as

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

23

24

6

7

8

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

Page 4629

Page 4627 given to me by the company and told him that the company was frustrated, as I was as well, for the fact that there 2 3 was this situation of anarchy happening on the mine, people 4 being killed, a threat to turn down property. That's what 5 I told him. MS BARNES: How long was your call with 6 the Minister? 7 8 MR ZOKWANA: Unfortunately I didn't 9 record but I can imagine it's - I did give him enough information so that he can make his mind. 10 11 MS BARNES: Assist us, Mr Zokwana, give 12 us an estimate. 13 MR ZOKWANA: Sorry Chairperson, I don't 14 want to create a view that says 10, 20 minutes. I say I took long enough to make sure that the Minister 15 16 comprehended what the situation was. I can't even say 20, 17 30 minutes. I would not be basing that on fact, I didn't 18 observe that. 19 CHAIRPERSON: I think what she wants to 20 know is, was it a fairly short conversation or one that 21 can't be described as short but -22 MR ZOKWANA: Not short. 23 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not exactly sure where 24 she's getting with the question but I'm sure she has a 25 reason for asking it, so I'm not going to disallow the Page 4628 1 question. Was it longer than 10 minutes? 2

didn't know anything about what had happened on the 11th, is 3 that correct? 4 MR ZOKWANA: I said - again, and I repeat - that I informed the Minister of the situation as detailed 6 to me, which was mostly around the events of the 12th and I 7 was able to impress on him the need to increase police 8 presence. I didn't go into details of the 11th, as I've 9 said, I couldn't meet with the late Mr Bongo so that he 10 would give me what he gave me on the phone. The issue of 11 the 11th appeared to me on the 15th when the president of AMCU raised it at SABC. And let me say that, Chairperson, 12 your question, I didn't inform the Minister of the issues 13 14 of the 11th as that didn't form part of the briefing I 15 received. 16 MS BARNES: And we know that the SAfm interview - and we'll get to that in a moment - took place 17 18 on the 15th, Wednesday the 15th of August, is that correct? 19 MR ZOKWANA: That's correct, yes. 20 MS BARNES: So from the 12th to the 15th you took no steps to find out what had happened on the NUM, 21

at the NUM offices on Saturday the 11th, is that correct?

that on the same evening of the day I was in Marikana

confirming my concerns, one of our leaders, Mr Mabebe, was

killed that night and a number of other incidents happened,

including the murder of other leaders of NUM. So we were

including the killing of the two police by the same people.

So I did not deal with the 11th until the 15th when it was

raised to me as a question by, an observation by the leader

preoccupied in trying to find what could be done -

The reports I got were such

Page 4630

MR ZOKWANA:

anything about what had happened on the 11th because you

MR ZOKWANA: It could have been longer 3 than that. MS BARNES: 4 And what did the Minister say 5 he would do? 6 MR ZOKWANA: He said to me he will consult his structures, I mean he was referring to his 7 senior personnel and I didn't know whom he was going to 8 9 call to deal with that and I think he's in a position to 10 know whom to call when such requirements are made. 11 MS BARNES: Were you satisfied after you 12 spoke to him that action would be taken? 13 MR ZOKWANA: As a person I trusted the 14 Minister. I was aware, I was sure that having been given 15 the briefing, he will take the necessary steps. 16 MS BARNES: And the information that you 17 gave to the Minister was the information that you'd received from Lonmin about what had happened on the 12th of 18 19 August, is that correct? 20 MR ZOKWANA: I said that I got a briefing 21 from our local shop stewards as well as the management. That's the briefing I gave the Minister, but more around 22 23 the fact that two security guys have been killed and how

You didn't tell the Minister

24

25

they were killed.

MS BARNES:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

of AMCU. MS BARNES: And during the period from the 12th to the 15th August you also did not find out what your local branch's attitude was to the RDO strike, did you? MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, it would have been difficult for a person to look at such a matter when at that moment we were receiving reports as to the fact that our branch committee members were in hiding, allegations of [indistinct] of those murdered, people having been killed already. It would've been difficult for you to begin to look at what could have been the issue of as I've said that at that moment the branch committee was no longer available for anybody to enquire whether this issue you are raising was really an issue. We were concerned about more lives being lost. MS BARNES: But surely, sir, you could have phoned your branch committee members and if you had,

they would've told you what they'd said to the RDOs and you

2

9

10

Page 4631

would've established that they'd given them incorrect

advice, isn't that correct?

3 MR ZOKWANA: You can only do that, senior 4 counsel, if the branch committee was available to meet with

5 me. At the point you are referring to they were all in

hiding and their fears were not unfounded as a number of 6

7 those who were unable to run before, were killed - to

understand maybe the situation we were in as a union. 8

MS BARNES: During the period from the 12th to the 15th of August you didn't even issue a press

statement condemning the violence, did you? 11

MR ZOKWANA: 12 Our position at NUM has been

13 consistent and I've raised that in my statement. We are

14 not a union that believes that we can add to numbers by 15

embarking on violence, we are not a union that would

16 encourage families losing their next of kin just to be big 17 after that. And we have made that all clear, to say that

18 NUM is against violence, NUM is against illegal strikes,

19 NUM is for processes where issues are debated through

20 negotiations.

21 MS BARNES: Sir -

22 MR ZOKWANA: And by this I'm saying in

23 paragraph – in paragraph 1, page 84 of Mr Motlogeloa's

24 statement, the security guy, as to why were NUM - it's

25 because our local branch committee were assisting the non-

Page 4632

strikers to say, don't go on illegal strike because if you

2 do so you are going to - this shows as to what stand did

3 NUM take around the illegal strike, around all these

4 occurrences.

1

5 MS BARNES: Sir, it was a simple

question. You didn't issue a press statement during the 6

7 period from the 12th to the 15th of August condemning the

violence, did you? 8

9 MR ZOKWANA: Many statements were issued

by the union around these matters, from Impala to Lonmin. 10

That is the reason why on the 15th I went to SAfm so that 11

12 our position is put clearly for the public. If maybe that

13 can - maybe we can go and check how many statements NUM

14 made, or interviews. I don't have them with me but I know

15 that NUM stood clear that we are against violence, we are

against people being killed, we are against illegal 16

17 strikes.

18 MS BARNES: Well, I'm sure if there was

such a statement you'll show it to us, sir, we haven't seen 19

20

21 MR ZOKWANA: Unfortunately, Chairperson,

I could not pre-empt what the questions were going to be 22

but I'm saying this, that if you read my position during 23

24 the interview and the fact that our local leadership of NUM

25 knew what role they were to play in assisting those who

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 4633

were being threatened not to go to work, in assisting them

to access the work places, shows very clearly that NUM who

3 are a non-violent organisation will stand by that.

4 CHAIRPERSON: May I ask you a question at

this point? The statements issued by NUM, do you put them

6 up on a website for people to see?

7 MR ZOKWANA: Yes, we do, Chairperson, but

8 the point is that I did not prepare -

9 CHAIRPERSON: No – no, I understand. So

if there's any statement that Ms Barnes wants to see, she 10

11 or her attorneys can go to your website -

> MR ZOKWANA: She can do -

13 CHAIRPERSON: Presumably your website -

14 sorry, presumably your statements are arranged

chronologically so if they wish to study your statements at

the relevant time, they can do so and if there's something 16

17 that's material they can then raise it with you in cross-

examination. If necessary, if you've finished your

19 evidence already and they find something that's important,

20 they can have you recalled so it can be dealt with? Is

21 that so?

22 MR ZOKWANA: I'm aware that, Chairperson,

23 we had press conferences. Even on the day of the 16th NUM

24 had a press conference where our views were clearly made

and I was saying this, that if the need may be that I go

Page 4634

back and check on which days we issued - but I'm clear that

for any day our stance would've been consistent that we're

against violence, we're against people being killed, we're

against any form that would undermine the Labour Relations

5 Act of this country.

6

7

9

15

17

MS BARNES: Thank you, sir, we'll

certainly have a look at your website. Now if I can take

you to page 4, paragraph 15 of your statement. 8

MR ZOKWANA: Ves?

10 [11:42] MS BARNES: You say there that when you

left the meeting with Lonmin management on Sunday, the 12th 11

12 of August, you stayed in touch with your local NUM

13 officials for the next few days and they kept you informed

14 of the events that were taking place, is that correct?

MR ZOKWANA: That's correct, yes.

16 MS BARNES: Now I'd like to take you to

exhibit QQ2 but perhaps before I asked you about that

18 exhibit, I asked you last week -

19 MR ZOKWANA: No, sorry, give me time to

20 check QQ2. I don't have them in the chronology you may be

21 having them, because you knew what you were going to ask

22 questions as I'm sure you were clearly prepared, than I

23 would be.

> MS BARNES: I'll certainly give you an

opportunity, sir, but before I take you to the document

24

Page 4635

- itself can I just check with you that when I asked you
- last week whether you'd heard the rumour that was doing the 2
- 3 rounds that two people had been killed as a result of the
- 4 incident which took place at the NUM offices on Saturday,
- 5 the 11th of August, you said you had not heard that rumour,
- is that correct? 6
- 7 MR ZOKWANA: Where - what page -
- 8 MS BARNES: You don't need the document
- 9 to answer that question, if you could answer that question
- first and then I'll take you to the document. 10
- MR MAHLANGU: 11 If the question could be
- 12 repeated please?
- 13 MS BARNES: Last week I said to you that
- 14 a rumour started that two people had been killed as a
- result of the incident which took place at the NUM offices 15
- on Saturday, the 11th of August, you said you had not heard 16
- that rumour. I'm now talking about the period from the 12th 17
- 18 to the 15th of August.
- MR ZOKWANA: 19 As I've said, the details of
- 20 that incident were brought to me by the president of AMCU
- 21 who put it to me that we have killed the two people on the
- 22 day in question.
- 23 MS BARNES: Yes, we've established that,
- sir. We've established that you knew nothing about that 24
- 25 incident -

is. The background is that there was an incident on the

- Monday the 13th of August where, at the railway line at
- Lonmin, where there was an incident that happened between a
- group of striking workers and the police and as a result of
- that incident two policemen were killed and three strikers
- 6 were killed. Are you aware of that incident?
- 7 MR ZOKWANA: I am aware of the two police
- 8 personnel who were killed on that day.
- 9 MS BARNES: You weren't aware that three
- 10 strikers were also killed on that day in the same incident?
- CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure it's three. 11
- 12 It may be two plus a civilian.
- 13 MR ZOKWANA: Reports about murders,
- including those of the people who may have been killed, 14
  - were made but I don't have real info, what incident really
- happened. 16

21

1

8

16

- 17 MS BARNES: Yes, I know you weren't
- 18 there, I'm just drawing your attention to the incident
- 19 which you obviously became aware of subsequently, just in
- 20 an attempt to introduce this document.
  - MR ZOKWANA: Yes, I think that is
- 22 confirmed by even my statement I made during the interview
- 23 on the 15th, that two policemen have been killed and I agree
- 24 with you that other people may have been killed but I don't
  - have, in terms of how it happened.

Page 4636

- MR ZOKWANA: 1
- 2 MS BARNES: - from the 12th to the 15th.
- 3 The question is different. The question is, did you hear
- 4 the rumour that two people had been killed in that
- 5 incident?
- 6 MR ZOKWANA: We always encourage our
- local leadership, when they present issues to national 7
- leadership, to verify the information that they give us. 8
- 9 We were given the incident I have referred to, of people
- 10 killed, the two security people. I was present on the day
- [inaudible] our guys and all other murders, including that 11
- 12 of Twala and others were given because we are avoiding of
- 13 dealing with rumours because rumours in most cases can be -
- 14 cannot be based on truth, as I think this Commission
- 15 formed, how a remark can be.
- 16 MS BARNES: Yes and it would be important
- 17 to correct rumours if they were false, wouldn't it?
- 18 MR ZOKWANA: As a union we always
- 19 question and I think the approach would be that rumours can
- 20 be dangerous and people aware of them may take them as true
- 21 and make decisions and as a union we always avoid people
- 22 reporting on rumours.
- 23 MS BARNES: Alright, well let's look at
- 24 what happened. Let me take you to exhibit QQ2 and I'll
- 25 explain to you what it is because you may not know what it

- Page 4638 MS BARNES: What this document is, sir,
- it's a transcript of a conversation that took place between
- the group of striking workers and General Mpembe on Monday,
- the 13th of August.
- 5 MR ZOKWANA: Yes?
- 6 MS BARNES: If you look at page 9 of the
- 7 document -
  - MR ZOKWANA: I've got that, yes.
- 9 MS BARNES: One, this is one of the
- 10 striking workers speaking to General Mpembe and he says the
- following, "On Saturday when we came back the mine security 11
- 12 shot at us, together with the people from NUM, and killed
- 13 two of our people. That is the reason why we are carrying
- 14 these weapons. We did not fighting with anybody." Do you
- 15 see that?
- - MR ZOKWANA: I see that.
- 17 MS BARNES: And then if you go on to page
- 18 11 of the same document -
- 19 MR ZOKWANA: Yes.
- 20 MS BARNES: It says, "The person from NUM
- 21 is the one who shot at us, he killed two of our people."
- 22 Do you see that just near the top of the page?
  - MR ZOKWANA: Yes.
- 24 MS BARNES: Now did you not hear, sir,
- from your people on the ground that this was being said?

23

```
Page 4639
                                                                                                                            Page 4641
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                  That the people at NUM have
                                                                     1
                                                                               MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                    Yes.
1
                                                                     2
    killed two people from the strikers, is that the question?
                                                                               MS BARNES:
                                                                                                  And Mr Gwala says, "Now a
2
                                                                         little earlier on there was a witness who spoke to one of
3
     I'm checking, Chairperson, I want it clear before I answer.
4
            MS BARNES:
                                Yes, that this is what the
                                                                         our reporters. He says there was a march on Friday and
5
    strikers were saying, did you not hear this?
                                                                     5
                                                                         when we went past the offices of the NUM, something like
                                                                     6
                                                                         that, we were fired upon." And you then asked what
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                  Unfortunately not, I didn't
6
7
                                                                     7
                                                                         happened, do you see that?
    hear that because I had been relying, as I'm saying on page
    84, on the security personnel who are the company, the
                                                                     8
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    He did not ask, Mr Gwala
8
                                                                     9
                                                                         asked what happened and Mr Zokwana then answers, line 9 and
9
    strikers, were then intending to burn - and the reasons he
    gave are contrary to the reasons given by this striker -
                                                                    10
                                                                         following
10
    your question - I didn't hear that.
                                                                    11
                                                                               MS BARNES:
                                                                                                  Sorry yes, Mr Gwala is
11
                                                                    12
                                                                         telling you what he's heard from this caller and is asking
12
            MS BARNES:
                                If I could take you then to
13
     exhibit 002.
                                                                    13
                                                                         you what happened, do you see that?
                                                                    14
                                                                               MR ZOKWANA:
14
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                  I would request assistance
                                                                                                    Yes, I see that, yes.
    again. Some of these things I don't have. Yes, I've got
                                                                    15
                                                                               MS BARNES:
                                                                                                  And you then say that, "You
15
    that now.
                                                                         know, when people tell lies after the lives of 10 innocent
16
                                                                    17
                                                                         people" - and you then say that you think AMCU is not
17
            MS BARNES:
                                Now this is the media release
18
    statement by AMCU and on the second page of the media
                                                                    18
                                                                         telling the truth, do you see that?
    statement, in the second paragraph -
                                                                    19
                                                                               MR ZOKWANA:
19
                                                                                                    Yes.
20
            MR MAHLANGU:
                                    Page 2.
                                                                    20
                                                                               MS BARNES:
                                                                                                  But surely, Mr Zokwana, you
21
                                                                    21
                                                                         were in no position to dispute this at this time on your -
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                  Yes?
                                                                    22
22
                                                                         you have said to us that you had no details of what
            MS BARNES:
                                There's a reference to
23
                                                                    23
                                                                         happened don the 11th of August, isn't that correct?
    occurred on the NUM office -
                                                                    24
                                                                               MR ZOKWANA:
24
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                  Yes.
                                                                                                    Let me explain what I was
25
            MS BARNES:
                                - and it says "People came
                                                                         disputing on that day, Chairperson. The president of AMCU
                                                        Page 4640
                                                                                                                            Page 4642
    out of the NUM office wearing NUM T-shirts, opened fire to
1
                                                                         was making a view that these strikers or marchers were to
2
    the marchers and one workers was killed on the spot while
                                                                         march through the NUM to the stadium, then I was showing
3
    others were wounded and taken to hospital." Now did you
                                                                     3
                                                                         him that it would need for them to march past the NUM
4
    not near about this? This is on Tuesday, the 14th of
                                                                     4
                                                                         office, if you understand the location of the NUM office
                                                                     5
5
    August.
                                                                         vis-à-vis the stadium. It was the issue that we were
                                                                     6
6
           MR 70KWANA:
                                 Unfortunately I didn't catch
                                                                         dealing with.
7
    that statement of AMCU and the alleged killing of people.
                                                                     7
                                                                                MS BARNES:
                                                                                                    No, sir. This is the first
           MS BARNES:
                               So the first time you heard
                                                                     8
8
                                                                         time that you hear about this. This has not yet been
    about this was at the SAfm interview which took place on
                                                                     9
9
                                                                         mentioned in the interview. It is the very first time that
    the 15th of August?
                                                                         you ever hear about this, on your version, and you accuse
10
                                                                    10
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                         the caller and Mr Mathunjwa of telling lies but on your own
11
                                 Chairperson, I have said in
                                                                    11
12
    my - that when the late comrade Bongo called me on the 12th
                                                                    12
                                                                         version you know nothing about what happened on -
                                                                    13
13
    he did mention, but not in detail, the fact - not the first
                                                                                MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                      Chairperson -
14
    time that people have marched to NUM offices. I didn't get
                                                                    14
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                       No, he's making another
15
    details thereof up until we were at the interview with Mr
                                                                    15
                                                                         point. The point he's making, as I understand him, is to
    Xolani Gwala that I got details from the president of AMCU.
                                                                         say the allegation was they were walking past the NUM
16
                                                                    16
17
           MS BARNES:
                               If you go to exhibit LL -
                                                                    17
                                                                         offices on the way to the stadium and he says that that's
18
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Yes, the interview.
                                                                    18
                                                                         not true because you don't have to go past the NUM offices
19
           MS BARNES:
                               That's right, the transcript
                                                                    19
                                                                         to go to the stadium.
    of the interview you refer to.
                                                                    20
                                                                                MR ZOKWANA:
20
                                                                                                      Yes.
21
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 I've got that, yes.
                                                                    21
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                       Do I understand correctly?
22
           MS BARNES:
                               Now if you go to page 13 of
                                                                    22
                                                                                MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                      Yes.
                                                                    23
23
    exhibit LL you'll see that at the top of that page Mr Gwala
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                       That's his point.
24
    refers to a caller that phoned in and talked about the
                                                                    24
                                                                                MS BARNES:
                                                                                                    That allegation is made
25
    incident at the NUM office.
                                                                    25
                                                                         later. This is, in terms of time, the very first time that
```

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 4643 Page 4645 you hear of this allegation, according to you. incident at the NUM office and I put it to you that you had 2 CHAIRPERSON: no basis on which to accuse the caller and Mr Mathuniwa of That's not right either, Ms 3 Barnes, I'm sorry to interrupt you. Mr Gwala, on page 13 lying about the incident since, on your own version, you 4 from line 3, is reporting what someone who telephoned the did not have information. Would you like to comment? 5 SAfm and spoke to a reporter, had said. And what he says 5 [12:02] MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I would like 6 is this, "A little earlier on there was a witness who spoke 6 again to say that there is, I agree that the dates are 7 7 wrong. It's the 12th, but nonetheless if you read point to one of our reporters. He says there was a march on 8 number 15 on page 13, I clearly say AMCU is not telling the 8 Friday and when we went past the offices of the NUM, 9 9 something like that, we were fired upon. What happened?" truth, not the caller. I was not talking about what the 10 And that's when he takes it further. Now -10 caller was saying. I was saying that the president of AMCU at that point where he was alleging that people were 11 MR ZOKWANA: I agree, Chairperson, the 11 12 marching past the NUM offices towards the stadium - I 12 conversation was wasn't dealing with what happened, I was dealing with the 13 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt. To be 13 14 fair to Ms Barnes, I thought that that passage actually direction they were supposed to take if they would go to said in terms that they were on the way to the stadium when 15 wherever they were going, because the debate at that moment 15 they went past. It doesn't say that, so when I intervened 16 16 17 MS BARNES: 17 and told Ms Barnes that she wasn't understanding the Sir, Mr Mathunjwa hasn't said 18 answer, I was actually wrong. I withdraw what I said, so 18 it yet. It's only the caller who said it at this time and 19 please proceed with the cross-examination. 19 it's in response to Mr Gwala telling you what the caller 20 MS BARNES: Very well -20 has said that you say, "You know when people tell lies." 21 CHAIRPERSON: I made -21 Would you like to comment on that? 22 MR BURGER SC: 22 MR ZOKWANA: In fairness to the My view and my version is 23 23 witness, what is being debated here is what happened on that I was debating with Mr Mathunjwa and the issue of the 24 Friday the 10th -24 call was made by Mr Gwala. 25 25 MR ZOKWANA: MS BARNES: Yes. Sir, you earlier told us that Page 4644 Page 4646 MR BURGER SC: Not Saturday the 11th. when you spoke to Mr Bongo on Sunday the 12th he said that 1 there had been a previous attempt to invade the NUM

offices, those were your words. So for all you know, this could have happened, isn't that correct? For all you knew 5 at the time, what the caller was saying here, happened. 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24

Isn't that correct? MR ZOKWANA: I didn't have to rely on anybody telling me of the stadium and where NUM offices are. I was only dealing with the issue that you didn't need to go through, past the NUM office if your aim was marching to where he claimed they were marching. MS BARNES: If you go on in exhibit LL, sir, to page 16 -MR ZOKWANA: Yes, I've got that. MS BARNES: This is now the first time that Mr Mathunjwa refers to the incident and you can check the transcript in the break and satisfy yourself. This is the first time it's mentioned by Mr Mathunjwa and he then says, "On Friday" - on Friday, and we know that the date was wrong. He then goes on, if you go on to the next page, page 17, and he says he's received a report from the strikers and they say, "We were shot by NUM and the demands are not directed to NUM. NUM is not a company but we were surprised when they were killing us." MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I think -

MR ZOKWANA: 2 Yes -3 CHAIRPERSON: - cross-examination, if the 4 witness didn't know anything about what happened on either 5 the Friday or the Saturday and therefore it is, the 6 question asked is, how can you deny it and accuse other 7 people of telling lies. I think that's the point of the 8 question. I was aware of the fact - they're actually all 9 talking nonsense because the incident that forms the subject of the present cross-examination happened on the 10 11 Saturday, whereas at one - on a number of occasions Mr 12 Mathunjwa himself talks about it having happened on the 13 Friday and also a suggestion is that someone phoned the 14 SAfm and spoke to a reporter and spoke about something that 15 happened on the Friday. So there was a fair measure of confusion but I'm not sure that that confusion is a reason 16 17 for my disallowing Ms Barnes's question. But anyway, she's 18 heard the discussion between us and so has the witness, and 19 presumably they can all proceed, or both of them, in a 20 focused way from now on. 21 MS BARNES: Thank you, Chair. Mr 22 Zokwana, a little later in the transcript, and we'll get to 23 it, there's a debate about where the workers were marching 24 to and which direction they were coming from, but that 25 comes later. This is the first time you hear about an

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

25

Page 4647 Page 4649 MS BARNES: I haven't put the question was he? I don't think that's - were you here when Mr 1 2 MR ZOKWANA: 2 Mathunjwa was cross-examined? Chairperson, I think that 3 MR ZOKWANA: 3 this recording and the way the dates and times were No, Chairperson, I was not. 4 presented and how did it flow, would give the impression 4 CHAIRPERSON: You can ask him if he knows 5 that for first time the matter was mentioned but I put it 5 that it was put to Mr Mathunjwa but if he says he doesn't, to you, this that – I respond that the matter of the march I don't know that you can take it much further. 6 6 7 7 MS BARNES: - as I've mentioned before, I get what you're saying, that Sir, if there was evidence, it's only referred to here and I still stand by the fact 8 if you had evidence that AMCU was responsible for the 8 9 9 that in the discussion when I spoke of AMCU not telling the killing of the two security guards on Sunday the 12th of truth, I was referring to the fact that the march was 10 August, you would have given that evidence or you would 10 supposed to went past NUM offices. 11 have alerted your legal representatives to that evidence, 11 is that correct? 12 MS BARNES: The point is, sir, and I put 12 it to you again you had no basis to dispute what Mr 13 MR ZOKWANA: I never made the allegation 13 14 Mathunjwa was saying, did you? 14 in question. 15 MR ZOKWANA: My only basis is that I know 15 MS BARNES: Well, if we can go then to the area, I know the mine and when I put up to him, he 16 16 page 13 of exhibit LL. 17 17 could not dispute what I was saying. MR ZOKWANA: Yes? 18 MS BARNES: Now, Mr Mathunjwa has already 18 MS BARNES: On the bottom of page 13 you 19 given evidence in this commission of inquiry and you 19 say, "On Friday" - this is you speaking - "and those indicated that you were not present while he gave his 20 20 security guards were the people who were at the offices. 21 21 Two of the security guys killed by what I will call AMCU." evidence, is that correct? 22 22 MR ZOKWANA: But not being present is You said this on national radio, is that correct? 23 23 true but the process itself was broadcast on television. I MR ZOKWANA: Where is that? 24 24 was able to follow what was happening. MR MAHLANGU: Page 13. 25 25 MS BARNES: Good, then you will know that Yes but these pages have got MR ZOKWANA: Page 4648 Page 4650 it was not put to Mr Mathunjwa during his evidence before numbers 20, 25. 1 1 this Commission that AMCU had been responsible for the 2 MS BARNES: 2 Page 13 -3 killing of security guards on the 12th of August, correct? 3 CHAIRPERSON: In fairness I think, Ms 4 MR ZOKWANA: That was not in the Barnes, you can't just take passage by itself. I think you 5 Commission, I would not be able to answer questions because should go on to probably line 17 on page 14, so the whole I was not part of that, for the record of the Commission passage can be read in context. It does say what you said 6 6 7 7 at the top of page 14 but then he seems to qualify it a bit can show that. What I picked was only what I saw in the 8 8 snippets on the news and the news doesn't go into details. later. So in fairness to him, you've got to get the whole 9 MS BARNES: I thought you said you 9 passage. I understand the point you're making which - and watched it on TV? 10 10 I also un its relevance, but if you want to drive the point MR ZOKWANA: home you've got to put the full context to him and not sort 11 What? Chairperson, sorry, 11 12 can you repeat the question? 12 of, not just one answer. 13 MS BARNES: 13 MS BARNES: I obviously misunderstood Alright, let's read on. Are 14 your earlier answer that you watched the proceedings of the 14 you with me so far, Mr Zokwana, at the top of page 14? 15 Commission on the television. 15 MR ZOKWANA: Yes. MR ZOKWANA: 16 No, no, I said I only saw 16 MS BARNES: You then go on to say, "On 17 the Commission through the snippets of the news. 17 Friday" - no, sorry, that's Mr Gwala, "On Friday" -MS BARNES: Anyway, I can tell you, sir, MR ZOKWANA: 18 18 that what I've just indicated to you was not put to Mr 19 19 MS BARNES: Then you say, "At NUM 20 Mathunjwa in his evidence, do you agree with me? 20 offices, yes." 21 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I don't know 21 MR ZOKWANA: Yes. 22 how I would agree to that question because I was not part 22 MS BARNES: Then Mr Gwala says, "How were 23 23 they killed?" You say "They were in their cars. Guys came of the Commission as to say yes or no. 24 CHAIRPERSON: Do you suggest that - is it 24 and they stabbed them and they burned those cars and I saw 25 that he was here when Mr Mathunjwa was cross-examined, or one of those cars being pulled from the shaft and" - and

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 4651

- 1 then Mr Gwala says "And they were burnt by AMCU members."
- 2 And you then say, "I believe now, having heard to the, from
- 3 the president of AMCU that AMCU instigated the march, it is
- 4 the style they have been using before. They did this thing
- 5 in Impala, they are doing it again." Do you see that?
- 6 MR ZOKWANA: Yes, I see that, yes.
- 7 MS BARNES: You have no evidence, though,
- 8 that AMCU was responsible for these events. If you had
- 9 such evidence you would've given it to your legal
- 10 representatives, isn't that correct?
- 11 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I repeat, this
- 12 was my view based on the historical events in Impala, as
- 13 I've referred to. The point I was qualifying was saying
- 14 that in that debate, which is not appearing here, the
- 15 president of AMCU admitted the fact that they had been to
- 16 the mountain, to the koppie to be precise, to the koppie
- 17 and that their general secretary had met with the members.
- 18 Then I said, if you've been to the koppie, therefore AMCU
- 19 is better placed to understand what's happening on the
- 20 koppie but given the likeliness of what is happening in
- 21 Lonmin, what happened in Impala, I can come to a view that
- 22 therefore this may have been and I can support this,
- 23 Chairperson, by going to page, I think it's page 80, a
- 24 statement by one of the senior executives of Lonmin, Mr
- 25 Bello, in saying to the CEO that this march of AMCU which
  - Page 4652
  - I'm not the only one to conclude that AMCU was behind this
- 2 march. I never said they killed, I said that AMCU was
- 3 behind the march, not they had been killing.
- 4 MS BARNES: Sir, you said on the top of
- 5 page 14, "Two of the security guards were killed by what I
- 6 will call AMCU." You said that on national radio in the
- 7 absence of any evidence. Do you think that is responsible,
- 8 as a president of a union?

1

10

9 MR ZOKWANA: I understand that in that

meeting I was with the president of AMCU who was able to

- 11 dispute what I said and I think he did. We were in an
- 12 interview of that day and we were able therefore to put
- 13 forward our views and my view therefore was that, given
- 14 what happened in Impala, given that there's been this union
- 15 that has been in interaction with the strikers, by his own
- 16 admission I could that therefore AMCU would have known of
- 17 these developments leading to this manch
- 17 these developments leading to this march.
- 18 MS BARNES: Sir, will you retract this
- 19 statement now? Will you retract the allegation that AMCU
- 20 was responsible for the death of two security guards now?
- 21 MR TIP SC: Chair, before the witness –
- 22 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tip.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- 23 MR TIP SC: Before the witness answers
- 24 that particular question, this is based on the two lines at
- 25 the top of page 14. Regard must be had to the phrase

- "organised march" and -
- 2 CHAIRPERSON: When Ms Barnes read the
- 3 passage she actually stopped before the end of the line.
- Perhaps it would be helpful if I read the whole thing out
- 5 and then you can go on with your and those in the
- 6 auditorium would understand the debate between us. What Mr
- 7 Zokwana said is this, Mr Gwala says initially, "What
- 8 happened, tell me the truth?" And he says, this is because
- 9 he says AMCU is not telling the truth. "The fact is, the
- 10 security guys of management were requested by NUM to go and
- 11 guard our offices after the meeting was held in the
- 12 stadium." Mr Gwala, "On Friday?" Mr Zokwana, "On Friday.
- 13 And those security guys were the people who were at the
- 14 offices. Two of the security guys were killed by what I
- 15 will call AMCU and organised march." Mr Gwala then
- 16 interrupts, "On Friday?" Mr Zokwana, "At NUM offices,
- 17 yes." Mr Gwala, "How were they killed?" Mr Zokwana, "they
- 18 were in their cars, guys came, they stabbed them, they
- were in their cars, guys came, they stabbed them, they
- 19 burnt those cars. I saw one of the cars being pulled to
- 20 the shaft." And Mr Gwala then says, "And they were burnt
- 21 by AMCU members." Mr Zokwana says this, "I I believe
- 22 now, having heard to the, from the president of AMCU, that
- 23 AMCU instigated this march. It is the style they've been
- 24 using before. They did this thing in Impala, they are
  - 5 doing it again." And then Mr Mathunjwa then deals with

Page 4654

- 1 that. So that's the full passage on which this cross-
- 2 examination is based.
- 3 MR TIP SC: Yes.
  - CHAIRPERSON: Do you wish to now what
  - exactly is the point you want to make?
- 6 MR TIP SC: Well, the point
  - CHAIRPERSON: I read that out, so those
- 8 in the audience can follow what, the point you're going to
- 9 make.

4

7

10

17

20

23

- MR TIP SC: There is, with respect,
- 11 differences between a proposition that has a full stop at
- 12 the end of AMCU and that one that has regard to it being an
- 13 organised march or AMCU instigated march, which it quite
- 14 clearly, from the context, states.
- 15 CHAIRPERSON: Well, Ms Barnes, what do
- 16 you say? Sorry, have you -
  - MR TIP SC: Yes. Thank you, Chair.
- 18 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Barnes, what do you say
- 19 about that point?
  - MS BARNES: Well, the whole passage has
- 21 now been read. Perhaps I can I can reformulate my
- 22 guestion to the witness.
  - CHAIRPERSON: Yes.
- 24 MS BARNES: Will you retract any
- 5 allegation that AMCU was responsible for the act, any acts

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

of violence that have been referred to on those particular 2 davs?

3 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I would like to 4 say this, that it was a view I held, informed by that

- 5 meeting, by AMCU that they have been in interaction with
- the strikers on Monday. I never accused AMCU of killing. 6
- 7 I said AMCU could have known of this march since they are
- part of those interactions. I don't know if it's what I 8
- 9 should - I should withdraw, because I was saying this, that
- it is the same carbon paper of what happened in Impala 10
- where strikers will be called, five Madoda, but immediately 11
- 12 the strike ends AMCU will be the union with - to come
- 13 forward. I [inaudible] withdraw that, Chairperson.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Zokwana, I hope Ms 15 Barnes will not be offended if I try to put her point to you. If she is, if she doesn't want me to, I won't but can 16

17 I try and put the point clearly?

18 MS BARNES: Please, Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON: The point being made to you

20 is this, there was a march, you say it was organised by

- 21 AMCU. The march was on the Friday. The security guards
- 22 were killed by people on the Sunday. Now you, it's clear
- 23 from the passage that was read that you believed that the
- 24 people who killed the security guards were AMCU people.
- 25 You base that belief, you base that belief on two things,
  - Page 4656
  - as I understand it. Firstly, the statement that the march
- on the Friday had been instigated by AMCU and secondly the 2
- 3 fact that it was, as you put it, the style they'd been
- 4 using before - they did this thing in Impala, they're doing
- 5 it again. So you inferred that because this is what had
- happened at Impala and your understanding was it had been 6
- 7 done by AMCU people at Impala, you thought this was now a
- 8 repetition of the same kind of conduct at Lonmin, again by
- 9 AMCU people. Now, it's clear from what's been put that
- 10 this was your inference. You didn't have direct knowledge
- 11 that that was so, it was an inference you were drawing and
- 12 I think what Ms Barnes wants you to deal with is, in view
- 13 of the fact that it was an inference and you had no solid
- 14 evidence to back it up, are you now prepared to withdraw
- 15 the statement you made of what you believed because there
- 16 isn't any evidence, direct evidence which supports what
- 17 you've said? Is that your question, Ms Barnes? If I've
- 18 got it wrong, please correct me.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- 19 MS BARNES: That's correct, thank you,
- 20 Chair.

1

- 21 [12:22] MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, if I'm obliged,
- but I would like to put this, that if that is the view I 22
- 23 held I was not the only one who held that view as I've
- 24 shown that one of the executives of Lonmin have that view,
- 25 based on the fact that the scenario - and on that day in

Page 4657

- question the president of AMCU admitted to the fact that
- AMCU had been to the mountain and, Chairperson, I never
- said AMCU killed, I said AMCU was behind the march, but
- again, Chairperson, it's of the discussion because if you
- go to page 14 you look on the same sentence, it's
- 6 unfinished - to be able to look what I was saying beyond
- 7 that because the [inaudible] is that their recording was
- 8 poor [inaudible]. The only leader of union who has been to
- 9 the koppie, by evidence of the AMCU president, was the AMCU
- president and I was saying you said you were interacting
- 11 with these workers, you would have known what they were 12 planning to do. I only linked, Chairperson, AMCU only with
- 13 the march, not with the murders.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Zokwana, that's not 15 strictly accurate. Let me put again to you the point that

- Ms Barnes is making. At the foot of page 13 you say,
- "Those security guys were the people who were at the 17
- offices. Two of the security guys" now listen very
- 19 carefully to the following words - "Two of the security guys were killed by what I will call AMCU and organised
- march" it's true that the sentence wasn't finished, but 21
- 22 as far as the sentence had gone you had said two of the
- 23 security guards were killed by what I will AMCU and
- 24 organised march. So there was a statement, admittedly
  - incomplete, but there was a statement that the security men

Page 4658

- were killed by people you called AMCU people. That's the
- statement that Ms Barnes is asking you about. So Ms
- Barnes, do you want to ask something further about it
- 4 before the witness gets a chance to answer?
- 5 MS BARNES: I'd like to give the witness

6

7 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I would not

find it difficult to say this, that I cannot produce that

- 9 evidence but I believe when this process is concluded the
- 10 world will know who was behind the march. It was not NUM.
- 11 I cannot prove to say it was AMCU but I - Chairperson, I'm
- 12 not the only person who held the view that this process
- 13 smacks of AMCU footprints as informed by incidents of
- 14 Impala. For the sake, Chairperson, I would like to say if
- 15 what I said on that day doesn't sit well with AMCU that I
- 16 said they were behind the march, because at present I can't
- 17 prove that I withdraw that statement.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Zokwana, it's not as simple as that. There are actually two days and two

incidents that we're busy with. The one is the march on

21 the Friday, the second is the killing of the security men actually on the Sunday. There was confusion in the radio

23 programme.

> MR ZOKWANA: Yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON: And I think Ms Barnes is

24

18

25

Page 4659

- concentrating on the Sunday and presumably, although it's
- 2 not for me to put words in her mouth, presumably she will,
- 3 may say never mind what happened on the Friday, it may well
- 4 have been an AMCU march on the Friday but I'm interested in
- 5 the Sunday and she's really trying to get you to withdraw
- what you said. I know you believe what you said but that's 6
- 7 a different question. She's trying to get you to withdraw
- what you said about what happened on the Sunday. Am I 8
- 9 correct. Ms Barnes?
- 10 MS BARNES: That's correct, Chair.
- 11 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I will - I
- repeat to say this that, one, I am not the only person who 12
- held the view at that time and that, and the dates were 13
- messed up. I was not accusing AMCU of having killed. I 14
- 15 was accusing AMCU of having instigated the march that led in the deaths. 16
- 17 CHAIRPERSON: Perhaps easier -
- 18 MR ZOKWANA: - reason, Chairperson, I
- 19 withdraw any view that may say that I accused AMCU of
- 20 organising marches that led to the two deaths.
- 21 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, we're not busy with
- 22 the march, we're busy with the killing on the Sunday but it
- 23 seems what you now say may well solve the problem because I
- 24 understand you to say you weren't intending to accuse them
- 25 of being responsible for the killing on the Sunday. If
  - Page 4660
- what you said, it sounded like that, I take it it wasn't -1
- 2 you now say that wasn't what you intended, so you have no
- 3 difficulty withdrawing the -
- 4 MR ZOKWANA: I'm withdrawing, Chairperson
- 5

7

- CHAIRPERSON: If the suggestion is, if 6
  - that's the way it came out, that's not what you intended
- 8 and you're sorry and you withdraw it. Is that, would that
- 9 be fair?
- 10 MR ZOKWANA: Yes because -
- 11 CHAIRPERSON: Or am I putting words in
- 12 your mouth that you're not happy with?
- 13 MR ZOKWANA: Because, Chairperson, I want
- to say, Chairperson, the senior counsel put words to say I 14
- 15 accuse AMCU of killing.
- 16 CHAIRPERSON: She's not senior counsel
- 17 yet, but I'm sure she won't mind your [inaudible]
- 18 anticipate -
- 19 MR ZOKWANA: Alright, the counsel seems
- 20 to think that I accused AMCU of murder. I agree,
- 21 Chairperson, and I put the point that says this strike,
- given what the president of AMCU has said during the 22
- 23 interview, in my view and my past knowledge of how this
- 24 organisation organises things, the march was organised at
- 25 their behest and I'm saying I withdraw because I'm only

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- Page 4661
- saying this, that I don't say AMCU killed, I said AMCU
- 2 organised the march that led to the killing. And I
- 3 withdraw that, Chairperson - hoping that when the
- 4 Commission process, the truth will be clear as to who was
- 5 behind those marches because in my history, Chairperson, of
- 6 leading workers, workers don't sleep and dream what to do
- 7 the following day, they are guided.
  - MS BARNES: Sir, you also have no
- 9 evidence that AMCU organised the march, do you?
- 10 CHAIRPERSON: He's already said that,
- he's already withdrawn that. He withdrew that statement 11
- 12 about Friday – you've been trying to get him to withdraw
- 13 the statement about the Sunday, which I think he's just
- about done so it may well be that you've achieved what you
- set out to achieve and you can move on to the next point
- but if there's something else that you want to make in 16
- 17 relation to this incident, I won't stop you.
  - MR BURGER SC: Chair, may I just add -
- 19 because there was a reference to one of the officials of
- 20 Lonmin in this context – may I just add the following. The
- 21 people who can tell us as to AMCU's involvement would
- 22 presumably be the senior officials of AMCU at Lonmin.
- 23 They've been identified, they in fact went to the koppie on
- 24 the 12th and spoke to the people. We've recently been
  - informed that AMCU does not intend to call them.

Page 4662

- CHAIRPERSON: 1 Inferences may have to be drawn against them because of their failure to call those
- 3
- witnesses or alternatively, if it's necessary, we may well 4
- have to call them ourselves. We have the power to do so
- 5 and if it's necessary we won't hesitate to use that power
- 6 but perhaps Ms Barnes can continue in the meanwhile.
- 7 MS BARNES: Mr Zokwana, at this stage
- 8 now, at the stage of the SAfm interview on the 15th of
- 9 August, you know two things. You know, one, that there was
- 10 an incident at the NUM offices where, as Mr Bongo put it,
- there was an attempt to invade the office. You know that 11
- 12 and the second thing you know is that it is alleged that
- 13 people were killed, is that correct?
- 14
  - MR ZOKWANA: We have gone there,
- 15 Chairperson, when Mr Xolani was quoting what he had from a
- caller, is that there had been but the only contention 16
- 17 was the fact that what route was the march supposed to
- 18 take.
- 19 CHAIRPERSON: I must tell you on my
- 20 reading of the transcript, it may be wrong but on my
- 21 reading of the transcript he appears to have known about
- the march. He thought he knew who instigated it and he 23 knew about the killing of the security guards on the
- 24 Sunday. I couldn't find a passage - I did spend some time
- looking for it which indicates that he knew at that stage

22

8

10

11

12

15

18

19

20

21

3

6

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

Page 4663 already that it was alleged that marching strikers had been 2 killed on the Saturday, but if there is a passage which

I've missed I'd be grateful if you'd bring it to my 3

attention, I couldn't see it. Then maybe you're talking 4

5 past each other at this stage.

6 MS BARNES: Perhaps you can go to page 7

17, sir, of the transcript. There it's Mr Mathunjwa

8 speaking, it's from line 7 and Mr Mathunjwa is reporting

9 what he's heard from the striking workers and he says,

"They say" - because there's inverted commas, do you see 10

11 that, the last sentence in that paragraph - "We were shot

by NUM and the demands were not directed to NUM, NUM is not 12

a company but we were surprised when they are killing us." 13

14 You'd heard that, is that correct?

15 MR ZOKWANA: This is what Mr Mathunjwa

said, yes. 16

17 So presumably at this stage MS BARNES: 18 you would've investigated the matter and established the

19 facts and issued a statement, is that correct?

20 CHAIRPERSON: I don't understand the

21 question, Ms Barnes. It appears from what he's now saying

22 that he heard it for the first time, the allegation that

23 people had been killed at the NUM office - which we now

24 know to be untrue - but he appears to be saying that from

25 the lips of Mr Mathunjwa at the SABC studios on the morning

Page 4664

of the 15th. So are you asking him about the possibility of

further investigations and a statement to be issued after 2

3 that?

1

4 MS BARNES: That's correct, but perhaps

5 if I can summarise up to now. You have information from Mr

Bongo, but no detail. You have a caller alleging that they 6

were fired upon and you have Mr Mathunjwa saying he'd heard 7

from the workers that "NUM is killing us." That's the 8

9 information you have at this stage, is that correct?

10 CHAIRPERSON: This stage being?

11 MS BARNES: 15th of August.

12 CHAIRPERSON: In the radio studio on the

13 morning of the 15th of August.

14 MS BARNES: That's correct.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

15 MR ZOKWANA: Maybe let me try to detail

to you, counsel - Chairperson, I'm sorry about - I've

17 withdrawn that already.

18 CHAIRPERSON: It's fine if you call her

19 junior counsel.

20 MR ZOKWANA: Alright. Chairperson,

21 Chairperson, if the counsel should understand what was

happening that day and the call that was made by the 22

23 caller, it was for both of us to go to the mine, make sure

24 that we talk to the strikers. At that moment what was key

25 was to do what we could to stop further deaths and also, Page 4665

Rustenburg

Chairperson, I only heard about these alleged deaths from

2 the mouth of Mr Mathunjwa and when I left that studio to

the mine, we were going there to ensure that we play any

role we could in defusing the situation.

MS BARNES: I understand all of that, Mr

6 Zokwana, but surely - given the information you now had

7 about this incident that occurred sometime over the weekend

at the NUM offices, you would have conducted an

9 investigation to find out what happened, correct?

MR ZOKWANA: You want to check if we checked after, or soon after I heard - you mean in the morning of that Friday I was supposed to have left the studios to Marikana to verify that, or do you want to know

14 whether NUM did check to verify these killings?

MS BARNES: Sometime after the 15th, with some sense of urgency presumably, NUM would have conducted

17 an investigation into this, isn't this correct?

> MR ZOKWANA: Thanks, Chairperson. One of the reasons why NUM made a submission and presented witnesses was to clarify this Commission as to what our information is. NUM did verify that there was no truth to

22 the fact that there were two people who were killed on the

23 day in question.

24 MS BARNES: You knew, Mr Zokwana, that the strikers on the koppie were saying this. Wasn't it

Page 4666

could, what had actually happened?

MR ZOKWANA: I don't want to come to conclude that the counsel is supposing that I would have gone to the koppie knowing that I would be killed but let me answer the question, Chairperson, that at that moment it was clear that any leader of NUM who would approach the

important for you to find out at that stage, as soon as you

7 koppie would be really asking to be killed, as it had been

shown that a number had been killed before. And I've said

10 that between NUM and the strikers there was no interaction

at all.

MS BARNES: No, sir, I'm not talking about you going to the koppie. I'm not suggesting that at all. What I'm saying is that you know there are NUM members on the koppie, it's a volatile situation and they are saying that NUM have shot at their members and killed them. Do you not take steps to find out whether that is correct or not?

MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, in trying to answer the question, you know, is that if we were able to link as the reasons why NUM was not able to address those

21 22 workers, the only reason given by the strikers to the

23 security personnel as to why they're marching to NUM was

24 because NUM was assisting people to go back to work against

25 the decision of the strikers. There's no mention in that

Page 4670

Page 4667

- 1 statement of the security personnel who were interacting
- 2 with them as to why they were burning the NUM offices. I
- 3 can't understand then as to where do we get this view that
- 4 says there was another reason why the strikers were willing
- 5 to burn or to do harm to NUM. The second thing is that,
- 6 Chairperson, we have shown that none of our local officials
- 7 or leaders could interact with the strikers at that point.
- 8 I don't know how then was I going to be able to verify the
- 9 reason why because the reason they didn't want NUM is
- 10 because NUM, as per the statement I have read, is that it
- 11 has assisted and abetted those who wanted to go back to

12 work against their decision.

13

14

15

16

1

MS BARNES: If you had investigated you would have found that there was an incident where shots were fired by NUM members and that two strikers were injured – not killed but injured. Do you agree with me?

- 17 [12:42] MR ZOKWANA: Again Chairperson, I'm
- 18 saying this that there are different versions that it seems
- 19 were given by the strikers. One version is consistent in
- 20 the statement of Mr Motlogeloa, is that on the day when
- 21 they marched, if you read point number 5 of his statement,
- 22 the reason they marched is because they were angry. They
- 23 were going to burn the NUM office because NUM has assisted
- 24 the strikers, the non-strikers to go back to work.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON: You're not actually

Demonstrated very like to present 2

- were answering something different. So let her put the next question and I will see where you're answering it. Ms
- 3 Barnes, would you like to proceed?

4 MS BARNES: Well, let me put this to you,

5 Mr Zokwana, that up until this Commission started, we had6 no statement from NUM setting out the correct position in

7 relation to what had happened on the 11th, isn't that

8 correct?

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

19

20

21

22

MR ZOKWANA: I think that, Chairperson, with due respect to the question, all statements were made during this Commission and the reason the Commission was appointed was to collect such information. I don't know to

which structure were we supposed to give that statement.

CHAIRPERSON: The point seems to be that you hadn't issued a statement. They will argue later on that that somehow is a point against you. Your side will presumably argue it takes the case no further, for the reason you gave, and we will then have to look at it to see if there's anything in the point either way. But I would have thought, Ms Barnes, if you'll forgive me, that you've got all the juice that you can possibly get out of this particular lemon, you might like to pick up another one.

23 MS BARNES: Mr Zokwana, at the meeting 24 that you held at the offices of Lonmin on the 15th of

August, the meeting at which General Mpembe spoke to you,

Page 4668

- answering the question at the moment and I'm concerned that
- 2 an enormous amount of time is being spent on an issue which
- 3 may, in the last analysis, not prove terribly helpful to
- 4 us. It seems the question has then lost its answer but
- 5 it's a matter for argument later, but let me put to you
- 6 what I understand Ms Barnes's point to be. I'd be grateful
- 7 if you'd answer it because then we save a lot of time.
- 8 What Ms Barnes says to you, if you had in investigated this
- 9 allegation about what happened on the Saturday, you would
- 10 have discovered a couple of things. You would have
- 11 discovered, one, that people were marching to the NUM
- 12 office not on their way, of course, to the stadium –
- 13 MR ZOKWANA: Yes.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

14 CHAIRPERSON: - but coming directly to 15 the NUM office. You would've discovered that shots w

the NUM office. You would've discovered that shots were

16 fired by NUM people and you would've discovered that two

17 people were not killed but two people were injured. What

- 18 in fact has happened, as we know, and that's what your
- 19 legal team have done, they've investigated what happened
- and they've presented evidence as part of NUM's case as to what happened. Now, what Ms Barnes is busy with is if, at
- 22 the time, you had made the investigation that has now been
- 23 made by your legal team, you would've discovered those
- 24 three facts that I put to you. And that's the springboard
- 25 from which she is proposing to ask the next question. You

he indicated to you not only that there were NUM members

- 2 that were on the koppie, which you already knew, but that
- 3 NUM members were part of the leadership of the strike on
  - the koppie, is that correct?
- 5 MR ZOKWANA: Yes, correct.
- 6 MS BARNES: Now surely what you could
- 7 have done and should have done is find out who those people
- 8  $\,$  were and attempt to meet with them privately, isn't that
- 9 correct?

10 MR ZOKWANA: I think that without maybe

11 trying to - because I was present when Gcilitshana was

12 being questioned – Dali Mpofu made a statement, the fact

13 that those workers were [indistinct] and I'm sure he raised

14 that from a background of what he has done in

15 investigating. In any said situation, Ms Barnes, once you

16 call a section of strikers, your aim is to break them and

17 there's no way they would allow that to happen - but the

18 situation, it's not even possible for any leader of NUM to

19 come near the koppie.

20 MS BARNES: I'm not saying, Mr Zokwana, 21 that you should have walked up to the koppie. I'm saying

22 you should have found out the names of the NUM people that

23 were leaders of the strike and you should have made an

24 attempt to meet with them privately.

25 MR ZOKWANA: I would like again to say

Page 4671

- this, that General Mpembe made it clear to us that an
- 2 urgent action was needed and we were to do things as per
- 3 his own dictates. It was not for NUM to decide maybe to
- 4 call for a meeting of our own stewards. It was for all
- 5 leaders who were there to meet with all the leaders of the
- strikers. 6
- 7 MS BARNES: Did you establish the names
- of the people that were NUM members that were leading the 8
- 9 strike?
- 10 MR ZOKWANA: I repeat again, I didn't,
- for one reason I could only do that if I was having 11
- 12 access to the local leadership who know those workers. NUM
- 13 was at a situation where the people who were supposed to
- 14 assist with that information were in hiding and the urgency
- 15 we were having then was to ensure that the sooner we
- 16 address the strikers, before it was dark, could have meant
- 17 that to go around and demanding who was leading, not
- 18 leading the strike, would have taken more time.
- 19
  - MS BARNES: Now, when General Mpembe
- 20 asked you if you would go and address the strikers on the
- 21 koppie, you agreed to do so. Correct?
- 22 MR ZOKWANA: In my own statement,
- 23 Chairperson, I have thought to say when I arrived at the
- offices and this proposal was made, there was an objection 24
- 25 from our local stewards to allow me to the koppie, giving
  - Page 4672
- reasons. That was the reason why we had to go for a caucus 1
- and after caucusing we agreed that going to the koppie and 2
- doing everything we could to prevent any situation that may 3
- 4 prevail later.

7

- 5 MS BARNES: Yes, it was a difficult
- situation but you were nevertheless prepared to go and try 6
  - to do everything that you could and -
- 8 MR ZOKWANA: The reason, Chairperson, we
- 9 agreed in the morning during the interview under LLB - LL,
- sorry was because we were made aware, not only by the 10
- callers, that the only thing we could do as leaders is to 11
- 12 ensure that we persuade the strikers to disarm and desist
- 13 from using violence.
- 14 MS BARNES: Yes, Mr Zokwana, we agree at
- 15 least that this approach was very important and I put it to
  - you and I'm sure you'll agree with me that in order to have
- 17 the best chance of persuading the people to go back to work
- 18 you had to try, try to do two things. One, try to win
- 19 their trust and, two, try to give them a way out - in other
- 20 words a way of dealing with their grievances. You'd agree
- 21 with that?
- 22 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, let me say it
- is true, before you can address people to stop whatever 23
- 24 they're doing they must, they should trust you that you are
- 25 with them, but I'm sure this Commission has been shown

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 4673

- videos that detailed what the other party was doing, the 2
  - party who represent Ms Barnes.
- 3 MS BARNES: It is more difficult than
- 4 that, it's more difficult than that. You were going to try
- 5 to win their trust. When you arrived there, people start
- singing, "How will we kill NUM? We hate NUM. How will we 6
- 7 kill Zokwana? We hate Zokwana." So it's scarcely a
- 8 situation in which it's easy to gain anyone's trust.
- MR ZOKWANA: Yes, Chairperson, I agree 10 with them, that to win their trust there are two things one
- could have done. To deny all the allegations made against 11
- 12 you before you arrival, or you will say to them, I agree
- 13 with all that you have done, you are good citizens, can we
- go forward. And that would have been contrary to the basic
- tenet of our beliefs as a union. For years of being a
- union in that company it cannot happen that a person NUM 16
- 17 trusts could have been wished away. A number of incidents,
- I believe, happened that made to doubt where NUM is
- 19 standing, as informed by the statements of the witnesses I
- 20 have referred to, then the other people woke up and say we 21
  - don't like NUM, we want to kill it. The fact that union
- 22 leaders sang this song tells a lot.
- 23 MS BARNES: Sir, what you could've done
- if you'd got your facts straight is, you could've said to 24
  - the workers, look, no-one was killed by NUM on Saturday,

Page 4674

- that is inaccurate. You could've at least corrected that, 2
  - is that right?

10

17

- 3 MR ZOKWANA: Sorry, Chairperson, I will
- quote one of, an historian I read about, Joseph Goebbels,
- 5 the Minister of Propaganda in Germany, when he said, "When
- a lie is told repeatedly when no truth is told, the lie 6
- 7 becomes the truth." In this case NUM could not be on the
- 8 koppie to defuse the lies told about it, only those who
- 9 were lying have got access to those members. Hence they
  - were angry, they were against NUM, they got killed.
- 11 MS BARNES: Sir, it appears that even you 12 didn't know the truth at that stage because you hadn't
- 13 investigated it, isn't that correct?
- 14 MR ZOKWANA: The truth I know, Ms Barnes, 15 is that the strike was illegal. Carrying those arms was
- against any policy of this country. Gathering everywhere

you want to, was wrong. Killing people cannot be anybody's

- 18 right, that truth I know.
- 19 MS BARNES: Chair, I see it's just before
- 1 o'clock. I'm almost done, I just have one more section 21 to do but perhaps this would be an appropriate time.
- 22 CHAIRPERSON: I think it would be best to
- 23 deal with it after the lunch adjournment. We will resume
- 24 at 1:30 in order to make up for the fact that this was a
- late start, which we were going to do that anyway we will

Page 4675

1 adjourn at this stage till half past one.

2 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]

- 3 [13:42] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. Mr
- 4 Zokwana, you're still under oath. Ms Barnes, before you
- 5 proceed with your cross-examination, I just want to say
- 6 I've decided to alter the sequence of cross-examination. I
- 7 did indicate that Mr Mpofu would cross-examine after you.
- 8 It occurs to me in view of some of the evidence that the
- 9 witness gave in relation to his conversation with the
- 10 minister, it would be appropriate for me to call on Ms
- 11 Nkosi Thomas to cross-examine next if there's anything she
- 12 wishes to put in relation to the conversation with the
- 13 minister. Mr Mpofu would obviously appreciate being able
- 14 to cross-examine on that as well, and not have to deal with
- 15 this later. So Ms Nkosi Thomas is here. I take it she's
- 16 heard what I said. Ms Barnes?
- 17 MS BARNES: Thank you, Chair.
- 18 MS THOMAS SC: Chairperson, if I may at
- 19 this stage, I'm not sure if this is a proper moment to
- 20 address you, Chair and honourable Commissioners, about this
- 21 whole cross-examination issue. Should we do that now or
- 22 perhaps at a later stage?

1

- 23 CHAIRPERSON: As I've indicated to you,
- 24 I'm going to call on you and give you an opportunity to
- 25 cross-examine next. You don't have to avail yourself of
  - Page 4676
  - it, but if you choose to do so and put material in
- 2 relation, possibly get answers from the witness relating to
- 3 his conversation with the minister, it will then enable Mr
- 4 Mpofu to cross-examine further on that.
- 5 MS THOMAS SC: The only request that that
- 6 would have been for, Chairperson and honourable
- 7 Commissioners, to let Mr Mpofu to go in first because we're
- 8 still taking instructions on this specific issue, and our
- 9 instructions are to -
- 10 CHAIRPERSON: Well, don't tell me what
- 11 your instructions are. You're taking instructions.
- 12 MS THOMAS SC: Thank you –
- 13 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, I tried to
- 14 shorten proceedings. We'll have to do it the long way.
- 15 Anyway, Ms Barnes, please carry on.
- 16 MS BARNES: Mr Zokwana, when you
- 17 addressed the workers on the 15th of August 2012 at the
- 18 koppie, you could have from within the safety of the Nyala,
- 19 you could have said to them the following, and I'm going to
- 20 put this to you and I want you to please comment. You
- 21 could have said to them, "Look, although there's a two-year
- 22 wage agreement, that agreement can still be changed; we can
- 23 still entertain fresh demands. Go back to work. Give us a
- 24 mandate and we will negotiate for you." Isn't it true that
- 25 you could have said that?

- MR ZOKWANA: Thanks, Chairperson. As a
- union, or trade unions, we have got ways of addressing our
- members and one of those was to assure them that going back
- 4 to work was not the end of their demands, but that such
- 5 demands can only be dealt with when law and order is
- 6 retained, and when nobody will be threatened with violence.
- 7 That I did, because one of the key things, Chairperson, you
- 8 should do as a leader, is never to leave an impression that
- 9 you want a shortcut to be applauded when the truth is not
- 10 being told. You rather have people understanding what is
- 11 it about to happen. To me as a person, the issue of the
- 12 agreement of two years or three years was not an issue. As
- 13 I've said here that at national level the issue of how many
- 14 years the agreement has been signed has no bearing to the
- 5 matter in question being addressed. The fact is that those
- members were not willing at that point to listen to NUM.
- 17 Let me put it in answer [inaudible], even management was
- 18 saying we cannot negotiate with people on an illegal strike
- 30 Saying we cannot negotiate with people on an inegal strike
- 19 armed, meaning that had people agreed to disperse,
- 20 proceedings, and we agreed that NUM would be their agent,
  - we could have let the following day to go forward, provided
- 22 they give us a mandate.

21

- 23 MS BARNES: Yes, but the simple point, Mr
- 24 Zokwana, is that you didn't make it clear to the workers
  - that notwithstanding the two-year agreement, NUM could
    - Page 4678
- 1 still assist them if they gave them a mandate. Did you?
  - 2 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I did not see
  - 3 the issue of two-year agreement as a hindrance in us
  - 4 engaging, provided the environment and the atmosphere was
  - 5 perfect, and Chairperson, I made the [inaudible] in 2005,
  - 6 the same kind of agreement was signed with Lonmin. When
  - 7 members came to NUM in a decent way, Lonmin management was
  - 8 willing to listen. That agreement was changed and we were
  - $\,9\,\,$   $\,$  able to establish peace in the industry. What was wrong
  - 10 this time was the issues of violence, killing of people,
  - 11 sitting in koppies, because in the mining industry,
  - 12 Chairperson, we hold our meetings in stadiums. We don't go
  - 13 to mountains to handle such processes.
  - 14 MS BARNES: Let's look at what you did
  - 15 say on the 15th. I'd like to hand up the statement of Mr
  - 16 Simphiwe Booi. He's going to give evidence in this
  - 17 Commission. The parties are already in possession of the
  - 18 statement, if I could just, the statement could be made
  - 19 available to the Commissioners and to the witness.
  - 20 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay, what do you
  - 21 suggest we should call this? Obviously Mr Booi is going to

come and give evidence, so presumably logically it would be

- 23 the first exhibit Mr Mpofu, you turned your light on.
- 24 MR MPOFU: I'm sorry, Chairperson, to
- 25 interrupt. I just wanted to point out that this might be

```
Rustenburg
                                                        Page 4679
                                                                                                                            Page 4681
                                                                        NUM president Mr Senzeni Zokwana arrived around 6 o'clock
     an older version of that statement. There is a revised
2
    statement of Booi, which has been distributed as well. I
                                                                        and said we must go to work. We asked him what about the
3
     don't think it makes any difference to the point that -
                                                                        money we were demanding. He said if we did not want to go
4
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   Alter the exhibit, it
                                                                        to work, the police will have to do their work. He said he
5
    doesn't alter the exhibit number, so let's sort that out
                                                                        would leave us to call president "Nyanaya" AMCU, which can
    first while you're finding out from Ms Barnes whether she's
                                                                        be loosely translated as little or so-called president of
6
7
                                                                    7
     using the old or new version.
                                                                        AMCU. He was speaking from a Nyala. I did not see him,
8
            MR MPOFU:
                                                                    8
                                                                        but I recognised his voice."
                               I have found out -
9
                                                                    9
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   Ms Pillay, I imagine,
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     The copy that I've got is
    seeing, it will probably be CCC1, would you think? I'm in
                                                                        dated December 2012, although the date isn't filled in and
10
                                                                    10
     your hands.
                                                                        it's unsigned. Is this indeed the latest copy of the
11
                                                                    11
12
            MS PILLAY:
                               Chair, it would be BBB3.
                                                                    12
                                                                        statement?
                                                                    13
13
    That's the way we've done it in the past. Even though a
                                                                               MS BARNES:
                                                                                                   No, Chair, the -
                                                                    14
                                                                                                     If it isn't, you know we'd
14
    witness -
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
15
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   It would be triple?
                                                                    15
                                                                        better put the latest one in instead.
                               BBB3.
                                                                    16
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                  Yes -
16
            MS PILLAY:
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                    17
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     If it's the latest one then
17
                                   That's the next one that
18
     follows from where we are, but I thought in -
                                                                    18
                                                                        we've got it.
19
            MS PILLAY:
                               That's right.
                                                                    19
                                                                               MS BARNES:
                                                                                                  The latest one is February
20
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   If that's what you suggest,
                                                                    20
                                                                        2013, but this paragraph is -
21
    we'll do it.
                                                                   21
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                  Is the same.
                                                                    22
                                                                               MS BARNES:
22
            MS BARNES:
                                                                                                  - is identical, but the -
                                Alright, do you have the
23
                                                                   23
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     I see. No, it's okay.
    statement in front of you, Mr Zokwana?
24
                                                                    24
                                                                               MS BARNES:
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                   Yes.
                                                                                                  We will have to hand up the
25
            MS BARNES:
                                                                        more recent February 2013 statement in due course.
                                Now this is a statement by Mr
                                                        Page 4680
                                                                                                                            Page 4682
    Booi who is going to give evidence in this Commission. He
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                    1
                                                                                                     Alright.
1
    was on the koppie when you addressed the people on the 15th
2
                                                                               MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                    Chairperson, I think the, Ms
    of August 2012. You understand that?
3
                                                                        Barnes has read my own statement, and one thing as myself,
4
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Ja, I'm told that
                                                                        President - sorry, Chairperson, I would never go so low as
                                                                    5
5
    [inaudible] Mr Booi in one of those crowds.
                                                                        to describe another leader of another union because that
           MS BARNES:
6
                              I'd like you to look at what
                                                                    6
                                                                        president "Nyanaya," which you may not have pronounced
7
    Mr Booi says you said to the workers on the 15th, if you
                                                                    7
                                                                        properly, means a person you regard as a smaller than
                                                                        yourself. I wouldn't do that. NUM would not go so low as
    could go to paragraph 36 of the statement, and if you could
8
9
    please read just that paragraph into the record.
                                                                        to deal with other organisation. We have been trained to
10
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                    10
                                                                        deal with issues affecting us, than to deal with other
                                 I think if you'd read it
11
    into the record for the benefit of those in the auditorium
                                                                        unions, so that workers when they make their choice, it's
                                                                    11
12
    who will be very puzzled if the questions proceed on the
                                                                    12
                                                                        not about us ridiculing others. The statement is not only
                                                                    13
                                                                        wrong, but is a lie.
13
    basis of a paragraph that's very important, that they're
14
    ignorant about.
                                                                    14
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     In dealing with the fourth
15
           MS BARNES:
                              Perhaps the witness can read
                                                                    15
                                                                        sentence in that paragraph, what do you say about the third
    the paragraph. Just paragraph 36, please. If you could
                                                                        sentence, which I should read again. "He said if we did
16
                                                                    16
```

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119 RealTime Transcriptions Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

Perhaps if you read it. He

Alright, I'll read it into

"On the 15th of August 2012,

might be a bit grumpy about some of the things, I think you

Yes.

should read it. You can read it less grumpily than he

work."

MR ZOKWANA:

not want to go to work, 'the police will have to do their

short time I could have in talking to those workers, with

aware in videos, it was impossible for me to detail what I

was saying. What I did say was people should disarm to

allow the police to do their work. The issues they are

raising will be dealt with at relevant structures. By that

the manner that I'm sure the, this Commission has been made

Given, Chairperson, the

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

will.

the record.

read it into the record, Sir.

MS BARNES:

MR ZOKWANA:

MS BARNES:

CHAIRPERSON:

Page 4683

moment already the singing went louder and the clashing of

- arms, which was mistaken to be hands by one other leader in 2
- 3 this Commission.
- 4 MS BARNES: Mr Zokwana, I put it to you,
- 5 and this is what we're going to argue at the end of this
- 6 Commission, that you took no steps during the week of the
- 7 9th to the 16th of August to establish the facts or to
- engage in order to find a solution to the matter. Would 8
- 9 you like to comment on that?
- 10 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I have made
- 11 this statement that what created a problem for NUM was the
- 12 fact that not only the attempt to burn our office, but also
- 13 that we lost a number of leaders in the, on the mine, as
- 14 well as that our leaders have to go to hiding.
- Notwithstanding that, nonetheless we have made attempts 15
- like going to the mine, making sure that the security 16
- 17 arrangements are made, as well as making sure that we avail
- 18 ourselves on the day in question. It was limited,
- 19 Chairperson, for NUM because one you'd get cut off from the
- 20 people you are supposed to talk to, and I think that,
- 21 Chairperson, it will be clearer at the end as what cut us
- 22 off, because people we have led for many years changed
- 23 against us. It's not accidental. We're informed that not
- 24 only the songs were sung against NUM, but were labelled as
- 25 part of management, as part of the system, as refusing to
- - Page 4684
- open up negotiations, and it's clear, Chairperson, that 1
- people who believed that they have got a genuine case, 2
- 3 would look at you as being opposed to what they are looking
- 4 for. So whoever was planning these strikes, whoever was
- 5 behind its planning, made their point that NUM is
- 6 discredited. So if you are asking what NUM could have
- 7 done, what could we have done if people were killing our
- 8 leaders? What could we have done if people don't want to
- 9 listen to us? What we could have done if they were
- planning to burn our offices? Because they refused to have 10
- NUM negotiating on their behalf. You can only be able to 11
- 12 engage the employers when those you came to represent
- accept you as their leader. 13
- 14 [14:02] MS BARNES: You yourself in your
- 15 evidence, Mr Zokwana, have referred to the people on the
- koppie as "NUM in transit or un-NUM." We will argue that
- 17 the evidence shows that you were not interested in engaging
- 18 with the people on the koppie and that you were happy for
- 19 the police to come and break the strike. Would you like to
- 20 comment on that?
- 21 MR ZOKWANA: Ms Barnes yesterday said -
- 22 careful of statements we make. To come to that conclusion
- 23 that NUM was happy when the police came and did what they
- 24 did, is not only far from the truth, but is not - NUM has
- 25 got a record of - as long as the strike allows interaction

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- and we've been able to resolve strikes where members
- still regard us as their agent. But it is untrue to put a
- view that says NUM was happy to see what happened. It
- conforms, by the way, to what was made to be the case by
- 5 those you represent, in saying that NUM has called the
- 6 police to do what they did. Let me put it to saying, Ms
- Barnes, why I'm raising this response, is that if you read
- 8 page 39 of the statement, it confirms what we have been
- 9 saying that wrong insinuations were made about NUM at the
- 10 koppie, that NUM was sitting with the employer and AMCU was
- not allowed to go in. Same statement you are reading 11
- 12 confirms that these members on the koppie were told that
- 13 NUM was colluding with the employer, meeting behind doors,
- 14 refusing to allow AMCU on. I don't know what aim was that
- 15 statement meant to create in view of those workers on NUM.
- 16 MS BARNES: Thank you, Chair. I have no
- 17 further questions.
  - MR ZOKWANA: Thank you.
- 19 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Ms Barnes. Mr
- 20 Mpofu.

18

- 21 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.
- 22 Before I commence, I just want to comment on your earlier
- 23 suggestion put to Ms Nkosi Thomas, just to indicate that if
- 24 she does get instructions and she wants to do the cross
  - examination before I finish, I won't mind, at an

Page 4686

- appropriate stage. Maybe me and her we can talk, because I
  - do accept, Chair, that your suggestion -
  - 3 CHAIRPERSON: No, I don't think that's a
  - good idea. You cross-examine. When you're finished, I'll
  - 5 give her a chance, depending - she may not ask anything.

  - 6 Depending what she asks, I'll then have to give everyone an
  - 7 opportunity -
  - 8 MR MPOFU: Perfect.
  - 9 - who wishes to do so in CHAIRPERSON:
  - 10 order, as it were, to deal with the new matter.
  - 11 MR MPOFU: Yes.
  - 12 CHAIRPERSON: So I think you just finish
  - 13 your cross-examination.
  - 14 MR MPOFU: Okay, thanks, Chairperson.
  - 15 And we will then see CHAIRPERSON:
  - 16 whether she has any cross-examination.
    - MR MPOFU: At that stage, ja. Thank you,
  - 18 Chairperson. Good afternoon, Mr Zokwana.
  - 19 MR ZOKWANA: Afternoon.
  - 20 MR MPOFU: You remember the, I have to
  - start this on a very conciliatory note. I made some
  - suggestion when I was cross-examining one of the NUM guys -
    - MR ZOKWANA: Gcilitshana.
  - 24 MR MPOFU: - witness, Gcilitshana, yes,
  - about you having been shown photographs to prove that there

17

23

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 4687 Page 4689 were NUM members. Remember that? MR ZOKWANA: I'm making sure that all the 1 1 2 MR ZOKWANA: - you don't ask me, I tell you before. Ves 2 3 MR MPOFU: Yes, and I thereafter made a 3 MR MPOFU: You have been warned about 4 retraction. I think you were in the room, that since 4 that. Thank you. Thank you anyway, but the chairperson 5 you're there I think I wanted to take the apology to, 5 has warned you about trying to answer the next question, but we'll - therefore, would it be correct to say that in rather the opportunity to increase the retraction into an 6 6 7 7 apology. It was not meant to mislead. the political life of the country you hold quite a unique 8 MR ZOKWANA: 8 position, being maybe one of few people that you can count Accepted. 9 9 MR MPOFU: Okay, and perhaps before Mr with your hands, who sit in the central executive committee Semenya says anything, it also, that apology is extended to of COSATU, National executive of the ANC and the Politburo 10 10 11 of the SACP? 11 General Mpembe as well. 12 12 MR SEMENYA SC: We'll relay the message MR ZOKWANA: I wouldn't agree with that 13 to General Mpembe. 13 because in the nature of the alliance historically members 14 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Right, Mr Zokwana, 14 of the, of COSATU, the party and the ANC were sitting in now that that's behind us, I will come back to your all positions, as long as they [inaudible] of their 15 attitude, or rather the attitude that you displayed about different roles in those different organisations. 16 16 17 17 going to the mountain, but at a later stage. MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you. No, don't get 18 MR ZOKWANA: Okay. 18 me wrong, Mr Zokwana, I'm not criticising the phenomenon. I'm simply saying you are one of a few people in South 19 MR MPOFU: Now I just wanted, you know, 19 20 for the Commission just to understand that you are a very 20 Africa now, not historically, who sits in all those three 21 important witness who might give us some unique insight, Mr 21 important structures. Tip did introduce you but I don't think he did complete 22 MR ZOKWANA: 22 I will disagree with that 23 justice. You are, as we know, the president of the NUM; 23 because the president of COSATU, Sidumo Dlamini, sits in 24 24 you have been since 2000. all. 25 25 MR ZOKWANA: Ves MR MPOFU: Yes, anyone else that you can Page 4688 Page 4690 1 MR MPOFU: You also hold a very important 1 think of? position in the ANC. You are a member of the national 2 MR ZOKWANA: Majola. 2 3 executive committee, having been elected in Mangaung. 3 MR MPOFU: Anyone else? 4 Correct? Which is the ruling party. MR ZOKWANA: Oh, there are many. If I'm 5 MR 70KWANA: 5 going to count it, Chairperson, how many, maybe I must On my personal capacity as an ANC member I was elected, not for being NUM president. bring the ANC document to check who sits where and what I'm 6 6 7 saying that it is not, it's not only me. There are many 7 There's no relationship between the two. 8 8 MR MPOFU: Yes, no sorry, I'm sure you currently who are sitting in those. 9 MR MPOFU: q No, I didn't say it was you. misunderstood me. I was not linking the two. 10 MR ZOKWANA: Yes, I accept what you are 10 I said you can count them in your hands. That doesn't mean it's only you. It means it's less than five, but anyway, 11 saying. 11 12 MR MPOFU: And you also hold, what 12 let's move on. You accept that you can count them on one hand? 13 position do you hold in the South African Communist Party? 13 14 MR ZOKWANA: As a member of the South 14 MR ZOKWANA: I'm, I wouldn't like to venture into that and confirm, because I haven't done that 15 African Communist Party, Chairperson, I'm the national 15 counting. 16 chairperson of the party. 16 17 MR MPOFU: Right, so you're the 17 MR MPOFU: Okay, I have. Right, now 18 chairperson of the Politburo. 18 reason I'm asking you this is because among others, I'm sure that you hold a particular view about the relationship 19 MR ZOKWANA: I'm the chairperson of South 19 20 African Communist Party, a member of the PB. 20 between labour, capital and the State. Correct? 21 MR MPOFU: Of the PB. 21 MR ZOKWANA: And that view will be informed by the conditions applying at home. If you're 22 MR ZOKWANA: Correct. So before you go 22 on, maybe to help you, I'm also the chairperson of the 23 23 asking me about that view, if I was in another country, 24 Energy Water SITA. 24 maybe I would say yes, I do, but I must take into account 25 MR MPOFU: No, that I the conditions we work under in our own country, and apply

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

12

13

14

MR MPOFU:

Page 4691 that principles, informed by the conditions as they apply. 1 Okay, please once again, don't 2 MR MPOFU: 3 answer the next question. I only asked you a simple 4 question, whether you have a view -5 MR ZOKWANA: Yes, I do. MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you. That would 6 have sufficed. And that view, well you're a Marxist-7 8 Leninist, correct? 9 MR ZOKWANA: That is a [inaudible] that guides my way of work. 10 MR MPOFU: 11 Yes, we'll do. Now as far as 12 I know, in terms of that ideology the relationship between 13 capital and labour is inherently antagonistic. Is that 14 correct? 15 MR ZOKWANA: Lenin prescribed that such 16 conditions will never be resolved, but it further informs 17 me that the only way you can be able to minimise the extent 18 to which capital exploits is to have strong trade unions 19 that lead and engage in negotiations. 20 MR MPOFU: Okay, Mr Zokwana, once again 21 you are running ahead of me. You're guite right that actually it's Marx, ja, but Lenin does say that that 22 23 relationship is irreconcilable, correct? Agreed? 24 MR ZOKWANA: Yes.

Page 4693 in Cuba, so in every environment you will find those who 2 will differ with that view. 3 [14:22] Chairperson, my studies or my readings or my 4 training the union, I was told that trade unions should 5 remain reformists. They are not formed to change the 6 state, they are to mitigate the extent which people can be 7 oppressed by the ruling classes. They don't become an 8 instrument to change the state. They always work within 9 that system. 10 MR MPOFU: But is correct that COSATU, 11 which is a member, rather an affiliation that you belong to, believes that that narrow view of trade unions should 12 13 be extended to matters of the state? 14 MR ZOKWANA: I may not be able to agree 15 with you, counsellor Mpofu, on the basis that it depends in which context are you putting that point because COSATU 16 will not only be stuck with labour issues. If for instance 17 18 this issue of the electricity hikes through - COSATU will 19 have a view, if it's the matter of tollgates, that view is not in as far as saying we are now a fickle party whose 20 21 aim is to led. It's where it becomes the format, the form 22 comes from. 23 MR MPOFU: Okay. Okay, I will stop that 24 discussion interesting as it might be before the

Page 4692

25

concerned, Lenin says that the State is an instrument of 1 oppression of one class by another. Correct? Agreed? 2 3 MR ZOKWANA: Yes. 4 MR MPOFU: And that there's no such thing 5 as a neutral state. It either is a capitalist state, it's an instrument to oppress the working class. If it's a 6 7 social state I suppose it's an instrument to support the 8 working class, correct? 9 MR ZOKWANA: Generally yes, but such conditions can be mitigated by the role of other classes. 10 In this case strong trade unions can dent the intention of 11

And as far as the State is

unique. MR MPOFU: Thank you. In other words, in that tension the trade unions are fundamentally there to

capital and influence the State. Hence our situation is

15 intervene on the side of the working class? 17 MR ZOKWANA: That is correct.

MR MPOFU: 18 And they should never be found siding with either capital or the State against the working

19 20 class.

21 MR ZOKWANA: It's difficult to concur with you without understanding, because in any environment, 22 whatever you do there will be those who disagree with you. 23 24 As the case is, it means if we disagree with the fact that

25 the situation in China is the best in the world, nor is it

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

MR ZOKWANA: Alright.

Chairperson intervenes.

1 2 MR MPOFU: Can we accept that typically, at least it is the view of the NUM that typically the state and capital collude against the workers and that's one of 5 the reasons why the NUM was formed?

6 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, in answering 7 the question I will refer the counsellor to the stages or 8 phase in which NUM has operated. When NUM was formed in '82, we were under a racist state that was anti-workers in 10 terms of its laws, in terms of its behaviour when there are 11 strikes. Under the current regime we are in a situation 12 where we believe that the current Labour Relations Act was 13 highly influenced by COSATU. It has improved the role of 14 workers. It has given workers the right to go to a strike, 15 a right that didn't exist before. Therefore it is 16 difficult to answer the question as if the situation has 17 been the same since NUM was formed. 18

MR MPOFU: Alright, I'm just going to read you something from the NUM website and without burdening the record, I will only make it an exhibit if there is a debate about it. It's under NUM history and that's the website printed today, not historically. Okay, it says "the history of the National Union of Mineworkers is a history of class struggle. This struggle is embedded in the inherent contradictions that exist between capital

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 4694

RealTime Transcriptions

21

23

24

Page 4695

and labour. For their own survival and dignity the workers

- 2 learnt through history that unity was strength, hence the
- 3 logic of forming trade unions at the work place. This
- 4 alone has cemented the strength of coming together but more
- 5 so believe, so the belief through solidarity". I take it
- you agree with that? 6
- 7 MR ZOKWANA: I agree, Chairperson,
- because one of our founding principles of trade unions is 8
- 9 the principle of an injury to one is an injury to all. The
- ability of workers organised we have seen the framework of 10
- the law acting in a way that they complimented each other. 11
- 12 That applies in that context.
- 13 MR MPOFU: And you would agree with me
- 14 that of these three components, capital, state and labour,
- 15 the labour is invariably the weakest and most vulnerable,
- correct? 16

1

2

7

- 17 MR ZOKWANA: It depends, Chairperson, on 18 the political choice or choices labour has taken. In our
- 19 context the fact that COSATU is part of the alliance not of
- 20 the ANC an alliance, meaning that the chief components in
- government, the ANC, the party and COSATU are in alliance. 21
- 22 A number of legislations that go through, COSATU has an
- 23 input. I can't therefore regard us as the weakest. Yes,
- 24 in general in some countries I can agree with Zimbabwe, I
- 25 will say yes you know the weakest but not here.

Page 4696 MR MPOFU: Well to cut it short, I will

- suggest to you that that is definitely not correct. There
- 3 is no country in the world now as we speak where the labour
- 4 or the workers have stronger powers than the state or
- 5 capital, let alone a combination of the two.
- MR ZOKWANA: 6 That is debatable
  - Chairperson, and I agree with Mpofu, we are not here to run
- 8 a lesson of political choices. If you go to China the
- 9 secretary of the Federation of the Chinese Workers will be
- 10 occupying a very senior position in many companies. If you
- go to Cuba, trade unions sit and decide on how they will 11
- 12 distribute their productivity. To it depends what
- 13 formation and I don't think that we can agree with Mpofu on
- 14 that, because I don't think it's correct to claim that yes
- 15 in as far as the global climate and the challenge is
- 16 therefore, I would partly but not to say that workers have
- 17 no powers in all countries.
- 18 MR MPOFU: Okay, once again I will move
- 19 on because I know that you know that I did not say that
- workers have no power. I was doing a comparison between 20
- 21 three components but be that as it may, in South Africa,
- lets come to South Africa would you agree that at the 22
- present juncture labour or the workers in general are in a 23
- 24 weaker position as opposed to capital and the state?
- 25 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, again it is

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

difficult to concur with Mr Mpofu, depending on where one

- stands. In this country before a company can lay off
- 3 workers, there are processes that the law requires for them
- 4 to go through. When a worker is dismissed, you can't just
- dismiss in a worker in the morning if those workers are
- 6 organised without facing the law going forward. Yes, in
- 7 terms of the ability employers have got one power, if they
- 8 can stop investing there would be no trade unions. But our
- 9 law is such that it has got 50 valves for workers. One of
- 10 those would be the right to strike. When you apply the law
- 11 you can be able to force the employer to do certain things
- 12 as long as you are within the law. It is when you divert
- 13 the law and disregard it that you are exposed to severe
- 14 situations that NUM was avoiding in Marikana.
- 15 MR MPOFU: So your view is that the
- 16 massacre at Marikana was caused because the people did not
- 17 obey the law?

18

- MR ZOKWANA: With due respect,
- 19 Chairperson, I have never alluded to that. I never made a
- 20 statement that seeks to condone the killing of people in
- Marikana and I hope that as Mr Mpofu is putting that view, 21
- 22 he is not basing it on my statement. And I am,
- 23 Chairperson, from the level of the shop stewards we are
- 24 pleading with our members not to embark on an illegal
  - strike. NUM has been saying let us deal with these issues

Page 4698

- within the ambit of the LRA. When we say that Chairperson,
  - we are not saying that any form of force was qualified to
  - 3 be used whenever. If what Mr Mpofu is saying he wants to
    - predict that NUM therefore wants to say the police have the
  - 5
    - right to do what they did, he is wrong.
  - 6 MR MPOFU: Okay, Mr Zokwana, once again I
  - 7 don't want to waste time I'm going to move on, but you know
  - as well as I do that I am basing what I said on your
  - statement. You and I were here debating issues about Cuba
  - 10 and all sorts of places. You are the one who brought
  - Marikana into the discussion by saying that if people do 11
  - 12 things within the law, things such as those that happened
  - 13 in Marikana would not happen.
  - 14 MR ZOKWANA: In Marikana President not
  - only people were killed, which was very-very unfortunate. 15
  - 16 But people lost their work, Mr Mpofu, when the strike was
  - 17 over, over 1 000 workers could not find work after that.
  - 18 The point NUM is putting, not debating the issue of how
  - 19 many were killed and how. For that we are saying to those
  - families who are with them we feel that was not the price
  - 21 they were supposed to pay. I speak about how workers gets
  - 22 what it deserves, Chairperson, when a strike is legal.
  - 23 That the legal - from the country protects workers from
  - 24 being expelled, from being dismissed when they are in a
  - strike that is lawful it allows channels of negotiations.

15

16

19

Page 4701

Page 4702

Page 4699

- The point I'm putting, so Mr Mpofu must not come with his
- 2 own ideas to come and say NUM is saying that the police
- were right to have done what they did. I'm not saying 3 4 that.

5 MR MPOFU: Okay, once again you were the first one to mention Marikana and you were the first one to 6

7 mention the police. Don't ascribe that to me.

8 CHAIRPERSON: That's not a question, Mr

9 Mpofu. Please confine yourself to asking questions.

10 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, I'm trying to cut this short because otherwise I will have to do it by 11

a series of questions. I appreciate what you are saying, 12

Chairperson. Let's just agree on one thing, Mr Zokwana, 13 14 that it is undesirable from the point of view of workers to

15 be saying to the situation where the state and business or

capital is colluding against them. They have no chance of 16

17 success in that kind of duel, would you agree?

18 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, in answering

the question, NUM was amongst those unions that campaigned

20 for the Labour Relations Act. When the commission of

21 Professor Viaan and Riekert was formed, culminating with

22 its recommendations that recognised trade unions, NUM knew,

23 Chairperson, that there was an instrument that would

24 mitigate the scenario that Mr Mpofu is coming up with.

25 Within the ambit of the law, working within structures,

Page 4700

- workers can be able to put one pressure on employers 1
- 2 refusing to go to work within the law, putting pressure on
- 3 the employers and I don't foresee any government in this
- 4 country that would say go back to work because capital is
- 5 losing money. I know that what and only in our neighbours
- in Zimbabwe, not here. 6
- 7 [14:42] Yes, Chairperson, lastly I will agree with you,
- 8 Mr Mpofu, where there's no clearly defined Labour Relations
- 9 Act empowering workers to put pressure on employers with
- 10 the right to strike, the situation you are painting is
- 11 possible.

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

19

MR MPOFU: Well okay, I don't know what you have against the Zimbabweans, but I put it to you that that situation happens in every capitalist state, since you and I had agreed that in a capitalist state, the state is

an instrument of the ruling class. 16

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, one would dwell on our neighbouring country. Maybe I was wrong to mention Zimbabwean and so, but I know very well that the president

20 of the Zimbabwean electrical workers, who is a colleague of

21 us, as we speak he's on suspension because he took a

- 22 strike, trying to force the company to implement a wage
- agreement reached by all. But don't think, we were not 23
- 24 there, by the way, Chairperson. I withdraw that reference,
- 25 but coming to the situation at home, I repeat, Chairperson,

that our labour relations, our legal framework in dealing

- 2 with labour issues, I don't know of any company after an
- agreement is reached through bargaining, can regain, can
- 3
- 4 renege against such. That's why even this morning the
- 5 Minister of Labour has promulgated new wages for farm
- 6 workers. It shows that our labour relation framework
- 7 functions, and I think that our labour is such that it can
- 8 be able to bend the aspirations of employers. If your
- 9 answer was to say how was my experience before NUM was
- 10 formed, I will say yes, the situation you're creating is
- 11 true. If you ask now, I will say where there may be some,
- 12 there's some witness then there, but at least the law is

13 such that it gives workers the right to strike.

MR MPOFU: Okay, the question was simply whether you agree that it's undesirable for the State to collude with capital against the workers.

17 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I'm really 18

struggling to understand how to answer that question.

CHAIRPERSON: I don't understand

immediately the relevance of the question, but presumably 20

21 Mr Mpofu will explain that to us later, but all he asks you

22 is do you agree that it's undesirable for the State to

23 collude with capital against the workers, and I would have

24 thought, regard being had to the high offices you hold, you

would have no difficulty in saying it's very undesirable

that the State should collude with capital against the 2

workers.

10

11

12

13

15

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

3 MR ZOKWANA: I get that, Chairperson, and 4 the answer is no. We would not [inaudible] Mpofu approve

of where capital and -

6 MR MPOFU: The State.

7 MR ZOKWANA: - the State work in 8 collusion in denying workers their defined rights as

9 contained in the Labour Relations Act.

MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. I'm indebted to the chairperson. Do you also agree that it would be undesirable for organised labour to collude with capital against unorganised labour?

14 MR ZOKWANA: Yes.

MR MPOFU: Thank you, and then you must certainly agree that if there's a tripartite collusion with the State, capital and organised labour, that unorganised labour then doesn't stand a chance?

MR ZOKWANA: I don't agree with that, Chairperson, because in this country we do have organised labour that is under different affiliations. We have got unorganised workers. I haven't seen in a situation where these three will collude, and I don't understand how that would happen. I disagree with that.

25 MR MPOFU: Yes, no I accept that you've

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25

1

2 3

4

7

Page 4705

Page 4706

Page 4703 never seen it, but if it did happen, would you agree that 2 unorganised labour wouldn't stand a chance against that 3 alliance? 4 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I wouldn't like 5 this Commission to be made to believe that the organised labour is only those who are part of the alliance. We do 6 7 have NATO outside the alliance. We have got many other 8 federations outside the alliance. I don't understand how 9 will therefore the alliance decide to collude with, against 10 anybody. CHAIRPERSON: 11 I don't think you're understanding the question correctly. I'm not sure that I 12 understand it fully either, but let me tell you what I 13

understand about it and Mr Mpofu will then explain a bit

[inaudible]. I think by organised labour he means non-

unionised labour. In other words, if you have workers who

don't belong to a union, who are embarking upon some kind

a combination of the State, the employers and organised

labour, they would probably come second. I think that's

the point he's putting. The difficulty I've got is he uses

that. But if he's going to explain that to us, then he'll

put the question again, then -

MR ZOKWANA:

MR ZOKWANA:

MR ZOKWANA:

the word "collude" and I'm not quite sure what he means by

Ja.

of campaign, if they were then opposed, had opposed to them

you and I had agreed in that collusion, organised labour. So if you understood it the first time, I'm sure you still 3 understand it now. 4 MR ZOKWANA: I would not agree with you,

Mr Mpofu, because as I understand the trade unions there's 6 no way unions would collude with the employer that deal 7 harshly with unemployed – or sorry, unorganised workers. 8 It could have been a scenario in the past when there were

9 things like closed shop agreement, that people in a 10 particular grouping will have to belong to a union.

11 Currently people join trade unions out of their own free 12 will. As long, and I'm not having a big, a situation where

13 I can be able to put an example to the question you are 14 posing, that unions and government and employers will come together and collude that this is the manner we will deal

16 or present such that if these workers were to go on strike, 17 therefore their situation will be worse than others.

MR MPOFU: Okay, once again I'll accept, if you say you've never seen it, you've never seen it. Have you ever seen a situation where business, or capital colludes with one union against another union?

MR ZOKWANA: Thanks, Chairperson. I will say no because our Labour Relations Act is so structured such that if unions are registered, the framework of how they should function, how would they run their businesses,

Page 4704

CHAIRPERSON: And you will then understand by unorganised labour he means, I think he means workers who aren't members of -

Any union.

5 CHAIRPERSON: A union, then we may get

some -6

Thanks, Chairperson -MR MPOFU: 8 Yes, sorry. As a unionist I 9 thought that I was using the language that you are more familiar with, of organised labour and unorganised labour, 10 11 but the chairperson is quite correct; I mean non-unionised 12 workers, in normal English. The question, the issue -13 CHAIRPERSON: - said what you mean by 14 collude. I think the witness -

15 MR MPOFU: Yes, that's what I'm trying to

16

17 CHAIRPERSON: - is entitled to know what 18 that means before he answers the question when you repeated it.

19 20

MR MPOFU: Yes, I was responding to that, 21 Chairperson. Sorry, Chairperson, yes, when I said the question, I was doing both. The collusion that I'm 22 23 alluding to, Mr Zokwana, is the same collusion that you and 24 I had agreed was undesirable between capital and State.

25 Now the only thing I've done is to add thereon as to what

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

is clear and there are recourses, means there's a recourse if any deviation is done by that collusion. I haven't seen

that. I don't think it is possible.

4

MR MPOFU: Okay, I know you've never seen that as well, but I will disagree with you when you say it is not possible, and the reason for that - and I'll invite your comment - is that you, and I mean in your capacity as president of the NUM, or the NUM have repeatedly accused the employers in the mining sector of colluding with AMCU. So how can it be impossible?

MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, it doesn't include government at this stage because the question to me was saying when the three components collude against a formation, but in this case, Chairperson, I think NUM in raising those things have come up with examples as to why it believed that specifically the Impala management was

17 colluding. It has been able, because NUM offices,

18 Chairperson, were closed at the behest of AMCU. That made

19 NUM not to operate inside there, when the company was

supposed to call upon law enforcers to play their role. It 21 was only in as far as that I was saying is that here is a

22 union, it forces another union, using violence, out of its

23 space, so that even a case where AMCU will say we don't

24 want so-and-so here because he's pro NUM, that person will

be taken out, sometimes paid by the company, not being on -

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 4707

- 1 it's where collusion ends, but I thought that if you were
- 2 speaking of I want to clarify that I was responding to
- 3 your question in as far as you are saying where the
- 4 government and the labour collude with the employer, but in
- 5 this case what specific [inaudible] we say Impala has made
- 6 the point that AMCU uses unusual forms of organising. It
- 7 uses coercion. It has led our offices to be closed. It
- 8 has allowed our people to be out of the operations, and the
- 9 company has not done what they should be doing. That's
- 10 where, I mean our position as NUM is. Sorry Chairperson, I
- 11 know my rights are limited in dealing with questions in as
- 12 far as possible and being honest, but my hands are dirty.
- 13 Can you allow me to go to the bathroom to wash my hands,

14 please?

1

7

8

15 CHAIRPERSON: I am proposing to take the

tea adjournment at this point, and I was requested by both

17 of my Commissioners to do that. I wasn't listening to

18 them, but in view of the fact that you've asked as well,

19 we'll take the tea adjournment now.

20 MR ZOKWANA: Thank you.

21 [INQUIRY ADJOURNS INQUIRY RESUMES]

22 [15:18] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.

23 During the tea adjournment, by arrangement between Mr Mpofu

24 and Mr Madlanga, the chief evidence leader, we extended the

25 subpoenas of the witnesses who were subpoenaed to come here

Page 4709

or a member who does not want to agree that NUM should not

2 be the union, AMCU will say to the employer, get that

2 be the union, Aivico will say to the employer, get that

3 person transferred. That has happened, I'm sure when such

4 information will be made, I'm sure it will be led later as

5 to what had been the experience of NUM in as far the

6 scenario is concerned. Besides that, Chairperson, I can't

7 give another example of a union colluding with the

8 employer, except Impala colluding with AMCU to get rid of

9 NUM.

14

15

17

19

3

MR MPOFU: Just to save time I'll accept
that answer to mean that you are amending your statement
that you had never seen this, to say that you have seen it
only in the case of AMCU.

MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, before it is interpreted, I made a point that Counsellor Mpofu made this analysis based on three components colluding. If I may have heard him wrongly, if you referred to an employer colluding with a union, my answer is yes, I've seen one. That is Impala, the employer, AMCU, the union.

MR MPOFU: Ja. Yes, for the record, I did confine my question to only an employer and the union,

22 but we won't quibble about that. What I want to ask you is

23 in your experience as a trade unionist - let's just say,

24 confine it to the mining industry - you have never had or

seen or experienced a situation where some of the

Page 4708

yesterday. Mr Madlanga, have you got their names or has Mr

2 Mpofu got their names? I think we should put it on record

3 what happened so that -

4 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, I think you've 5 caught both of us by surprise –

6 CHAIRPERSON: Before we adjourn then

we'll do that. You're still under oath, Mr Zokwana.

Before Mr Mpofu continues with his cross-examination, I

9 want to ask you a question. I didn't understand your

10 evidence about your never having encountered a situation

11 where an employer colludes with one union against another.

12 Have you never experienced a situation where there are two

unions and one of them is a sweetheart or Uncle Tom union,and the other one isn't, and the employer then colludes

with the sweetheart or Uncle Tom union to favour it by way

16 of attempting to frustrate the [inaudible] of the other

17 union?

18

19

20 21 MR ZOKWANA: I can only come to the same example, Chairperson, to say that if the Commission will have time maybe, or do more into the situation in Impala, it may find that scenario, Chairperson, where NUM is not

22 only denied by violence to operate, but the employer

23 clearly in this case favours AMCU. It does not only lock

24 offices, it [inaudible] them. Whenever AMCU raises a

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

25 discomfort with a shop steward who operates in that area,

conservative unions for example even participated in

beatings in collusion with the employer?

MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I've always confined myself to the era under the new regime, the Labour

5 Relations Act. The era before that I've said has got all

6 those hallmarks of what you are saying, but in as far as

o those hallmarks of what you are saying, but in as far as

7 union working with the employer, so they're defined into

8 recognition agreements and how such agreements are drafted.

9 Unions can be in meetings only if they qualify in terms of

10 the number of people that they represent to be in a

11 meeting. That what defines you to be in a meeting is not

12 because of the name you carry; it's the number of employees

13 in that operation that you represent. I have not seen by a

14 union that is recognised by the employer as for the

15 agreement being denied that right. That's my answer.

16 Sorry, Chairperson, the answer is no, I haven't seen that.

17 MR MPOFU: Alright, honestly I don't know

18 to which guestion that answer is, but once again to save –

19 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, you wanted to

20 know from me if I have ever seen a situation where a union

21 is denied by the employer through collusion to be in a

22 meeting where another union is sitting, and my answer is

23 no.

24 MR MPOFU: No, that was not my question.

I said in your experience as a trade unionist, have you

9

19

Page 4711

never seen a situation where some of the conservative

unions even participate in beatings in collusion with the 2

3 employer. That was my question.

4 MR ZOKWANA: The answer is no.

5 MR MPOFU: You've never heard of this?

MR ZOKWANA: My, because you need to 6

7 understand, being in meetings with employers I said it is

defined by the Labour Relations Act in as far as how unions

are recognised in a company. You can only be in a meeting

provided that you meet the required threshold of members 10

you represent. It's not by any other definition. 11

12 MR MPOFU: Okay, Mr Zokwana, I'll move 13 on, but I'll really suggest that you listen to the question

14 before you answer it.

15 MR ZOKWANA: Apology.

MR MPOFU: 16 Thank you. Now moving on,

17 maybe before I move on, let me do this, explain to you why 18

I'm asking you these questions, which maybe I should have

done before I asked the questions. You know that I

20 represent the injured and arrested protesters? 21 MR ZOKWANA: Yes.

22 MR MPOFU: You know, or you may not know,

23 if you don't I'm telling you now that one of the issues

24 that we have said we are going to argue at the end of the

25 Commission is that the massacre was caused by what we

Page 4712

termed "toxic collusion" between primarily the State and

capital. I'm sure you are aware of that. Are you aware of 2

3 that?

1

7

15

4 MR ZOKWANA: Unfortunately, Chairperson,

5 I was not present when you presented your line, or what you

intend to put forward. I can't comment on that. I was not 6

around.

MR MPOFU: 8 And you never read about it

9 anywhere?

10 MR ZOKWANA: I can't remember that.

11 MR MPOFU: Okay, fair enough.

12 MR ZOKWANA: What I remember is only when 13 you informed this Commission, when you were going to cross-

14 examine Gcilitshana, was who you were representing. In as

far as what your closing argument, or what you intend to

prove, you didn't go there. 16

17 MR MPOFU: Okay. And you are also aware

18 that after a lot of questions were put to you, Mr Semenya

19 said that - I might not be quoting him verbatim, but

alluded to a collusion between yourselves as the union and 20

21 Lonmin. Remember that?

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

22 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, with due

respect, I understood Mr Semenya's line of questioning, 23

24 being that he wanted to establish whether the two parties

25 did enough to negotiate such that the strike could be Page 4713

averted, and our position as NUM was that it was impossible

to negotiate under those circumstances of violence where

3 there was no mandate. Chances of feed backing was

impossible.

5 MR MPOFU: In any event, our version is

6 going to be that the collusion between the State,

7 represented by SAPS, and capital, represented by Lonmin,

8 was the primary cause, or the main cause of the massacre,

9 and that the other collusion alluded to by Mr Semenya

10 between yourselves as organised labour and Lonmin was a

11 secondary cause, but that they were both causally connected

to the massacre.

12

13 MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, I don't think I

14 have to respond to the question because it's what the

counsel will present to this Commission, and I think it

16 would be on the basis of evidence to prove that. I'm sure

17 NUM has got views as to why do we think what is being

proposed is not the truth, but that will come. I'm sure

19 the Commission will call a number of witnesses who will

20 mill through the evidence, and I don't think therefore that

21 I have to answer whether I concurred what you are thinking, 22

because I mean, I didn't instruct you to represent my views 23 and you are putting forward a particular view of your own

24 client.

25

5

CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, the witness is

Page 4714

quite right. You haven't asked a question. You told him

what your case was, which he listened to with interest, and

3 now I expect you to ask questions based as it were on what

4 you put to him.

> MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, I did

preface that by saying that I was just giving him context, 6

7 so it was not intended to be a question. So I agree with

8 you, Mr Zokwana, and I apologise that I didn't frame it as

9 a question. Now you say you need evidence. I will deal

10 with you - right now let's set aside the, what I called the

11 main collusion, which does not involve you, between the

12 State and capital, for the purposes of what I'm going to

13 say to you now. You have heard the evidence that was given

here that the NUM held twice-a-day meetings with the police

15 and Lonmin regarding the strike, and other unions - sorry,

16 to be fair.

17 MR ZOKWANA: I understand those would

18 mean the -

19 MR TIP SC: Mr Chair, it must be put

accurately. Mr Gcilitshana's evidence was that on occasion

21 members of the SAPS would attend, but they were not there

regularly and the principal purpose of the debriefings was 22

23 for Lonmin security to advise the parties as to the state

24 of security around the mine.

25 MR MPOFU: That's correct. Actually you

no word "collusion." I simply said were you aware of those

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 4715 Page 4717 can assume for the purposes of this that the police were meetings, question mark, yes or no. 2 MR ZOKWANA: 2 never there. You've heard the evidence that says that the Chairperson, I would be happy if these processes would happen in the way that - if 3 Lonmin and NUM and other unions met twice a day to discuss 3 4 the strike? I misunderstood the question, it is not a sign that I -5 MR BURGER SC: Chair, may I just have 5 that is a question clarity? What my learned friend is now putting is that's 6 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, no, no -6 the factual basis for accusing Lonmin of being party to a 7 7 MR ZOKWANA: And I happen to understand toxic relationship? 8 CHAIRPERSON: You thought he was 8 9 9 MR MPOFU: No, I haven't said anything of suggesting collusion. 10 MR ZOKWANA: 10 the sort. Yes. 11 CHAIRPERSON: 11 MR BURGER SC: Then I don't know what He now assures us he's not. 12 we're debating, Chair, then I'm losing the debate. 12 He simply asks you were you aware of the fact that 13 MR MPOFU: Well, then you must listen. 13 debriefing meetings were taking place twice a day. 14 CHAIRPERSON: He's apparently going to 14 MR ZOKWANA: I was aware that some ask questions - I've been waiting for about five minutes 15 15 meetings were taking place. I was aware. You've got an Oprah Winfrey 16 for him to start asking questions. I haven't seen a 16 CHAIRPERSON: 17 question mark for the last five minutes, but he's going to 17 answer, now carry on with the next question. 18 deal with what he calls a secondary cause of the shootings, 18 MR MPOFU: Thank you. 19 which he says was the fault of the combined actions, or 19 MR ZOKWANA: But again, Chairperson, I 20 inactions, more accurately, of Lonmin and NUM. He's going 20 will not be able to say these meetings were twice a day, 21 to deal with that. The toxic collusion part only relates 21 but I know that some meetings did take place for briefing. 22 to the State and Lonmin, but he's not busy with the toxic 22 I wouldn't confirm whether twice or thrice. 23 part, he's busy with the non-toxic part of the cause. So 23 MR MPOFU: At a much higher level, were 24 let's wait for him to ask a question before you object. 24 you party to other discussions with the senior leadership 25 Carry on, Mr Mpofu. of Lonmin regarding the situation? Page 4716 Page 4718 [15:38] MR MPOFU: 1 Thank you, Chairperson. Now 1 MR ZOKWANA: - to the first question Mr 2 still dealing with the secondary cause, or the collusion Mpofu raised this with Gcilitshana. The answer is no. If 3 alluded to by Mr Semenya, I was just asking you a question 3 that refers to me as a person, no. 4 that whether you are aware of those twice-a-day meetings, 4 MR MPOFU: Yes, it refers to you as a 5 and you confirmed that Mr Gcilitshana testified about them. person. So you never had such discussions with the senior Correct? 6 6 leadership of Lonmin? 7 MR ZOKWANA: I don't think such meetings 7 MR ZOKWANA: will qualify as the theory of a collusion. What I know is 8 8 MR MPOFU: Do you know a person called Mr 9 9 that there were briefing sessions that the company would do Cyril Ramaphosa? 10 at a time necessary to brief the people on what was 10 MR ZOKWANA: He's the former general 11 happening around the mine, how many have reported to work, secretary of NUM, former SG of the ANC, a businessperson, 11 12 what is going to happen. I don't understand, I don't 12 the current deputy president of the ANC. regard that as collusion. 13 13 MR MPOFU: Mr Zokwana, do you know the 14 MR MPOFU: 14 person, yes or no? Mr Zokwana, two things. 15 Firstly, do not answer a question that I have not asked. 15 MR ZOKWANA: My answer is yes. I'm Secondly, don't allow yourself to be distracted by the 16 16 trying to tell you how I know him. 17 sledging, as we call it in cricket, between counsel. I've 17 CHAIRPERSON: I want to appeal to members asked you a simple question. Were you aware of these 18 18 of the public in the auditorium to try to restrain 19 twice-a-day meetings, yes or no? themselves, not laugh and make noises. It makes it 20 MR ZOKWANA: Meetings [inaudible] Sir. 20 difficult for us to hear the evidence. If it continues I 21 MR MPOFU: Thank you. 21 shall have to consider clearing the auditorium, which is 22 MR ZOKWANA: So but you mentioned the 22 something I don't want to do. To put it simply, please try 23 word "collusion" to keep quiet while the evidence is being given. 23 24 MR MPOFU: No, in my question there was 24 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, I beg leave to

hand out exhibit - I suspect it's BBB4.

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

|  | Page 4719   |  | Page 4721   |
|--|---|--|---|
| 1  | CHAIRPERSON: How would one describe this  | 1  | CHAIRPERSON: "Thank you, Cyril, I had a   |
| 2  | exhibit?  | 2  | planned briefing." Is that 4?   |
| 3  | MR MPOFU: A set of emails exchanged   | 3  | MR MPOFU: No, sorry, Chairman, I'm  |
| 4  | between the senior leadership of Lonmin, or among -   | 4  | wrong. Number 4 is at the bottom, it's 12:18, and that  |
| 5  | CHAIRPERSON: Among -  | 5  | would be 5 on top.  |
| 6  | MR MPOFU: Yes.  | 6  | CHAIRPERSON: That "Thank you for your   |
| 7  | CHAIRPERSON: - the senior membership,   | 7  | email. I'm currently in Cape Town?"   |
| 8  | the senior leadership –   | 8  | MR MPOFU: Yes.  |
| 9  | MR MPOFU: Leadership of Lonmin.   | 9  | CHAIRPERSON: That's number 4.   |
| 10   | CHAIRPERSON: Of Lonmin. Thank you.  | 10   | MR MPOFU: Number 4.   |
| 11   | I'll mark it accordingly.   | 11   | CHAIRPERSON: And number 5 is –  |
| 12   | MR MPOFU: Is it BBB4, Ms Pillay?  | 12   | MR MPOFU: Number 5, "Thank you, Cyril."   |
| 13   | MS PILLAY: It is BBB4, Chair.   | 13   | CHAIRPERSON: "I had a planned briefing."  |
| 14   | MR MPOFU: Thank you.  | 14   | That's 5.   |
| 15   | CHAIRPERSON: I'm not quite sure of the  | 15   | MR MPOFU: Yes.  |
| 16   | order in which these documents are stapled together.  | 16   | CHAIRPERSON: And then the next one is   |
| 17   | MR MPOFU: I've made an attempt, Chair,  | 17   | 289E –  |
| 18   | the one at the bottom of the page is number 1.  | 18   | MR MPOFU: E, which is "Many thanks" –   |
| 19   | CHAIRPERSON: Yes.   | 19   | CHAIRPERSON: No, no –   |
| 20   | MR MPOFU: And the next page is number 2,  | 20   | MR MPOFU: No, no, the –   |
| 21   | to 89B, and then if you go back to the front page it's  | 21   | CHAIRPERSON: - 3:13, "I just had a  |
| 22   | number 3 at the top.  | 22   | discussion at 2:58." So presumably the one at the foot of   |
| 23   | CHAIRPERSON: - to me slowly. The one at   | 23   | the page –  |
| 24   | the foot of the first page, that's –  | 24   | MR MPOFU: Number 6.   |
| 25   | MR MPOFU: It's number 1.  | 25   | CHAIRPERSON: - 289E is number 6, "I just  |
|  |   |  | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·   |
|  | D 4700  |  |   |
|  | Page 4720   |  | Page 4722   |
| 1  | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  | 1  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  |
| 1 2  | =   | 1 2  | 3   |
|  | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  |  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  |
| 2  | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at 00 -   | 2  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  |
| 2 3  | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  00 -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's -  | 2  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the  |
| 2<br>3<br>4  | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  00 -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's -  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  | 2<br>3<br>4  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?   |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  00 -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's -  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning -  | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6  | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 14M in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1. MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8  | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –   |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1. MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I take it we must appreciate is 3. MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3, yes.  | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8  | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1. MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I take it we must appreciate is 3. MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3, yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 -   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's -   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1. MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3. MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2.   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2.  MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the  following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's  repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we  know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know  which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1. MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I take it we must appreciate is 3. MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2. MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's number 3.   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.   |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 -  MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2.  MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's  number 3.  CHAIRPERSON: Then page, and then the   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2.  MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's  number 3.  CHAIRPERSON: Then page, and then the next one -   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.   |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17                                     | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1. MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3. MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2. MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's  number 3. CHAIRPERSON: Then page, and then the  next one - MR MPOFU: 2.   | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17                                     | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.  I don't have anything to say.  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17                                     | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2.  MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's  number 3.  CHAIRPERSON: Then page, and then the  next one - MR MPOFU: 2. CHAIRPERSON: - is 289C -  | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18                               | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.  I don't have anything to say.  MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, can you help me  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18                               | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2.  MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's  number 3.  CHAIRPERSON: Then page, and then the  next one -  MR MPOFU: 2. CHAIRPERSON: - is 289C - MR MPOFU: - fix 289C - C, that's number 4.                            | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18                               | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.  I don't have anything to say.  MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, can you help me again to, number 1 is 289A. Is it so?  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20                   | CHAIRPERSON: - the one on 15 August at  OO -  MR MPOFU: 15th August, 00:47, that's - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's number 1.  MR MPOFU: 1AM in the morning - CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I  take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: 9th, the one above it is 3,  yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU: That's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's - CHAIRPERSON: - that's 2.  MR MPOFU: "Hello Cyril," yes, that's  number 3.  CHAIRPERSON: Then page, and then the  next one -  MR MPOFU: 2. CHAIRPERSON: - is 289C - MR MPOFU: - fix 289C - C, that's number 4.                            | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20                   | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.  I don't have anything to say.  MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, can you help me again to, number 1 is 289A. Is it so?  MR MPOFU: At the bottom.  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21             | CHAIRPERSON:  ON -  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON: MR MPOFU: MR MPOFU: MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON: Then the one above that, I take it we must appreciate is 3. MR MPOFU: MR MPOFU: Then on page 2 - MR MPOFU:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  Then page, and then the next one - MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  Then page, and then the next one -  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON: There's a whole lot. There  | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21             | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.  I don't have anything to say.  MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, can you help me again to, number 1 is 289A. Is it so?  MR MPOFU: At the bottom.  MR ZOKWANA: Yes.  |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22       | CHAIRPERSON:  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  Then the one above that, I take it we must appreciate is 3.  MR MPOFU: MR MPOFU:  Then on page 2 -  MR MPOFU: That's -  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  Then on page 2 -  MR MPOFU: That's -  CHAIRPERSON:  Then on page 2 -  MR MPOFU:  "Hello Cyril," yes, that's  number 3.  CHAIRPERSON:  Then page, and then the  next one -  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  Then page, and then the  next one -  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  There's a whole lot. There  MR MPOFU: No, but I -                         | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22       | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes –  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you -  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.  I don't have anything to say.  MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, can you help me again to, number 1 is 289A. Is it so?  MR MPOFU: At the bottom.  MR ZOKWANA: Yes.  MR MPOFU: Yes, and number 3 is just the   |
| 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23 | CHAIRPERSON:  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON: MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  MR MPOFU: Then the one above that, I take it we must appreciate is 3. MR MPOFU:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  CHAIRPERSON:  Then page, and then the next one —  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  There's a whole lot. There  MR MPOFU: CHAIRPERSON:  MR MPOFU: No, but I —  There are a couple — | 2<br>3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12<br>13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23 | had a discussion," and then 7 is "Many thanks, Cyril."  MR MPOFU: "Many thanks."  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay, and then the following page, what's 8 then?  MR MPOFU: No, the 7th page, sorry, that's repetition, Chair, sorry.  CHAIRPERSON: I see, so we ignore that.  MR MPOFU: Yes —  CHAIRPERSON: Alright, okay. So now we know when you're referring to particular emails, we'll know which ones you're referring to.  MR MPOFU: Yes.  CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, you look as if you want to say something.  MR MPOFU: But can you —  MR BURGER SC: - to this witness, Chair.  I don't have anything to say.  MR ZOKWANA: Chairperson, can you help me again to, number 1 is 289A. Is it so?  MR MPOFU: At the bottom.  MR ZOKWANA: Yes.  MR MPOFU: Yes, and number 3 is just the one above it, and number 2 is on the next page. So just |

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

```
Page 4723
                                                                                                                       Page 4725
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Yes. Oh yes, it's 3.
1
                                                                      you print it out -
                                                                  1
           MR MPOFU:
                              Yes, and then number 2 is the
                                                                  2
2
                                                                             MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                    Yes.
3
    one, "Hello, Cyril."
                                                                  3
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    - there's a letter he
4
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Yes.
                                                                  4
                                                                      received, which is the first, or rather the bottom of the
5
           MR MPOFU:
                              And then on the next page at
                                                                  5
                                                                      page.
    the top, "Thank you, Cyril," is number 5.
                                                                  6
6
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 Correct.
7
                                                                  7
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Oh, yes.
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    And his reply, which in
8
           MR MPOFU:
                                                                  8
                              And the one below that, "Thank
                                                                      fact I think is on the next page -
9
    you for your email. I'm currently in Cape Town," is number
                                                                  9
                                                                             MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                    Yes, yes. No, thanks,
10
                                                                 10
                                                                      Chairperson.
11
                                                                 11
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    - that's 2, and then we
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Yes.
12
           MR MPOFU:
                              And then on the next page,
                                                                 12
                                                                      have this one.
13
    skip the next page, that's just the end of that number 4.
                                                                 13
                                                                             MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                    I get that now. Thank you.
                                                                                                    It is technically the email
14
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                 14
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
15
           MR MPOFU:
                              Then on 289E at the top, "Many
                                                                 15
                                                                      sent by Phillimore -
16
    thanks, Cyril," is number 7.
                                                                 16
                                                                             MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                    Yes.
17
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Yes.
                                                                 17
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    - but he's actually sending
18
           MR MPOFU:
                              At bottom of that, "I've just
                                                                 18
                                                                      it back because he's replying to it.
19
    had a discussion with Susan Shabangu," is number 6.
                                                                 19
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 Thank you, and I'm reading the
20
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Hold on. Oh, yes.
                                                                 20
                                                                      part that he's replying to. You see at the bottom 00:47?
21
           MR MPOFU:
                              Ja. Now sorry, maybe when you
                                                                 21
                                                                             MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                    Yes, I see that, yes, 15
22
    were giving the credentials, I stopped you maybe. So let
                                                                 22
                                                                      August.
23
                                                                 23
    me just ask you, do you also know that on top of all those
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Ja, okay. It says the
24
    things that Mr Ramaphosa is, or was at the time at least a
                                                                 24
                                                                      following, I'll read it quickly. "Dear Roger, thank you
25
    director of Lonmin?
                                                                 25
                                                                      for your briefing note. I have had some interaction with
                                                      Page 4724
                                                                                                                       Page 4726
                                                                      some of the role-players and pen hereunder some of the
1
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Yes.
                                                                      discussions I have had. 1, discussion with Minister Susan
2
            MR MPOFU:
                              And did you know that he
3
    seemed in that short space of time to have been having
                                                                      Shabangu. I called her and told her that her silence and
4
    quite a busy exchange of emails with various parties, which
                                                                  4
                                                                      inaction about what is happening at Lonmin was bad for her
5
    involve your name?
                                                                      and the government. She said she was going to issue a
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                  6
6
                                 Yes, I'm mentioned on
                                                                      statement. She was going to be in Cape Town to attend a
7
                                                                  7
                                                                      joint parliamentary session and would be back in
    paragraph 2 on 22A, yes.
                                                                  8
8
            MR MPOFU:
                              Chairperson, for the sake of
                                                                      Johannesburg later today to attend to the Lonmin matter. I
9
    the record, what I will do is when we refer to a particular
                                                                      told her that I would also be in Cape Town and suggested
    email I'll just read it out and then place the question.
                                                                 10
                                                                      that we should have a discussion and see what she needs to
10
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                 11
                                                                      do. 2, I spoke to Senzeni Zokwana, president of the NUM.
11
                                  [Inaudible]
12
            MR MPOFU:
                              Yes, for context, thank you.
                                                                 12
                                                                      He said he and Frans Baleni wanted to meet me and former
13
    This one, number 1 says, it's sent in the early hours of
                                                                 13
                                                                      NUM president James Motlatsi to discuss what they should do
    the morning, 00:47. It's sent by Mr Ramaphosa to Roger
                                                                 14
                                                                      as a union going forward. James and I will meet them on
14
15
    Phillimore, who's also part of the senior leadership of
                                                                 15
                                                                      Friday and exchange some ideas. He told me that the NUM
                                                                 16
                                                                      had held a successful meeting where some 500 to 700 workers
16
    Lonmin.
17
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Sorry, Chairperson,
                                                                 17
                                                                      had stated that they wanted to work. 3, I will be speaking
18
    according to this it is from Roger Phillimore to -
                                                                 18
                                                                      to Gwede Mantashe, the ANC secretary general, and suggest
19
            MR MPOFU:
                              No, no, it's number 1, not
                                                                 19
                                                                      that the ANC should intervene. 4, Mike Teke, the deputy
                                                                 20
                                                                      chairman of the Chamber of Mines, said that the Chamber had
20
    number 2.
21
            MR ZOKWANA:
                                 Oh, alright.
                                                                 21
                                                                      discussed the matter yesterday. There should be contact
22
            MR MPOFU:
                              Not number 3, sorry.
                                                                 22
                                                                      with the Chamber of Mines. Maybe Albert would follow this
                                                                 23
23
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  The way it works, Mr
                                                                      up. I will keep you updated on progress. Cyril."
24
    Zokwana, is obviously Mr Ramaphosa sent an email to Mr
                                                                 24
                                                                            MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                 Yes, I see that. Yes, I saw
25
    Phillimore. Mr Phillimore replied. So his reply then when
                                                                 25
                                                                      that.
```

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 4727 MR MPOFU: Yes. Thank you. Chairperson, 1 2 I see that it's about 4. What I was proposing is one of 3 two things. I don't want to deal with this in a piecemeal 4 fashion, so if the chairperson still has a bit of time I 5 can use that time to read in the other emails and then continue -6 7 CHAIRPERSON: I suggest you read in the other emails. 8 9 MR MPOFU: Yes, and then -10 CHAIRPERSON: We'll then -11 MR MPOFU: - questions tomorrow. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Members of the people in 13 the auditorium will then know what it's all about, and then tomorrow morning starting at 9:30 - and by the way, I was 14 15 going to announce at the end, I may as well announce it now that I've decided we will have a short lunch adjournment 16 tomorrow, resuming at 1:30, and the same again on Thursday. 17 18 The idea is that that way we'll make up for the hour which 19 we unfortunately lost this morning. 20 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. 21 CHAIRPERSON: So carry on as you suggest. 22 [15:58] MR MPOFU: Thanks, Chairperson, I'll read 23 fast. The next e-mail is at 09:42 on the 15th of August, 24 number 2, Mr Zokwana? 25 MR ZOKWANA: Yes, I see that.

that the police have about 800 on site. Our next challenge is sustaining this and ensuring that they remain and take appropriate action so that we can get people back to work. 4 It would be good to have some independent 5 confirmation, the police have plans to sustain a presence 6 for at least at week and numbers don't wane by the weekend. 7 If you can talk to the Minister, please could you influence 8 these things with her and encourage her to make time to 9 talk to Roger. I've gathered support from the CEOs and 10 have a planned call with COM, Chamber of Mines to brief them. Many thanks, Albert Jameson, Chief Commercial 11 12 Official Lonmin." 13 Thank you, the next one is insignificant, I'll 14 read it just for the record and then continue to read number 4. The next one is at 1:07 pm, 15th August, from Roger Philemon to Cyril Ramaphosa. "Thanks, Cyril, very much appreciated, I look forward to talking with you later 17 when you have a moment. Best wishes, Roger," and if Mr 19 Interpreter will allow me, can I move on to the next one 20 just to save time? 21 MR HANABE: Where exactly were you 22 reading from? 23 I'm reading number 3, sorry. MR MPOFU: 24 MR HANABE: On page? 25

Page 4728

2

MR MPOFU: It reads as follows, it is 1 from Mr Jameson. Albert Jameson who is also a senior leader 2 3 at Lonmin, to Mr Ramaphosa. "Hello Cyril, thank you for your help so far. Thankfully last night was relatively 4 5 peaceful as is this morning, we have had approached from 6 NUM Eastern Plat that they would like to return to work if 7 the police can offer adequate protection. Two areas of 8 concern," and he puts the first one, it is two bullets, the 9 first bullet, "The Minister was on radio today saying she 10 has been briefed that this was a wage dispute and management and unions should sit down and sort it out. Not 11 12 so, have briefed her. We are waiting to talk to her, 13 Roger, and although not too damaging, it is also not too 14 helpful. I've had two discussions with the DG and in his 15 case he has categorised this as not an industrial relation 16 issue, but a civil unrest/destabilisation/criminal issue 17 that could not be resolved without political intervention 18 and he needs the situation stabilised by the police or 19 army." 20 I think on both occasions, sorry, I must read, 21 police/army. "I think on both occasions he agreed with me and it reflected what was in our letter but now I'm not 22

sure, I have a call to him this morning." The second

bullet, "We are grateful that the police have now 800 on

site." Oh yes, thank you, Chairperson. "We are grateful

23

24

25

Page 4730 might as well deal with it. Okay, I'll now deal with number 4, number 4 and important one. It is 12:18 pm on

On page 1, okay, well, you

3 the same day, it is from Mr Ramaphosa to Albert Jameson,

4 Bernard Mokoena, Tandigai Ncube and Roger Philemon. Its

5 subject reads, "Security situation. Dear Albert, thank you

6 for your e-mail, I'm currently in Cape Town and we'll have

7 a discussion with her. I thank you for the consistent

8 manner in which you are characterising the current

MR MPOFU:

9 difficulties we are going through. The terrible events

10 that have unfolded cannot be described as a labour dispute.

11 They are plainly dastardly criminals and must be

CHAIRPERSON:

12 characterised as such. In line with this characterisation

13 there needs to be concomitant action to address this

14 situation."

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

The next page, "You are absolutely correct in insisting that the Minister and indeed all government officials need to understand that we are essentially dealing with a criminal act. I have said as much to the Minister of Safety and Security. I will trust that Minister Shabangu should have a discussion with Roger. Regards, Cyril." Alright, then I go to number 5, sent at 2:58 pm on the same day, it is from, - no, sorry, okay, it looks like we, it is 1:18 or 1:13. 1:18, anyway, it doesn't matter.

Yes.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119 RealTime Transcriptions Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

CHAIRPERSON:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

You're on 289(F)?

```
Page 4731
                                                                                                                          Page 4733
           MR MPOFU:
                              Okay, and it is from Albert
 1
                                                                    1
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                   Yes, 289(F), yes. Can you
 2
    Jameson to Ramaphosa, Mokoena, Barnard - Ncube, Tandigai
                                                                    2
                                                                        call the one at the top -
 3
     Ncube and Roger Philemon, subject, "Re security situation.
                                                                    3
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                       "Thank you, Cyril," what
 4
     Thank you, Cyril, I had a planned briefing with Bheki
                                                                    4
                                                                        should that be called?
                                                                    5
 5
     today," I'll suggest later to the commission that that's
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                   Can we call it 4(B)?
 6
    probably Mr Bheki Khumalo who is the spokesperson of the
                                                                    6
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                       4(B)?
 7
                                                                   7
     department, but putting that aside, "today and have also
                                                                                                   And then the one -
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
    carried that message over which they 100% support. He will
                                                                   8
                                                                                                       4 is 4(A)?
8
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                   9
 9
     also convey this to the Minister tomorrow morning. He
                                                                                                   The one that was 4 we call
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
10
    asked for a copy of our letter that I will e-mail him."
                                                                   10
                                                                        4(A), that will solve the problem.
                                 Without me offering to know
11
           MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                   11
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                       Alright.
     who this Bheki is, there is a Bheki Sibiya, the Chamber of
12
                                                                   12
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                   Thank you, Chair.
13
     Mines CEO, but I don't know if he is -
                                                                   13
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                       Are you going to read it in
14
           MR MPOFU:
                              Sure enough, sure enough, I
                                                                   14
                                                                        quickly before we adjourn?
     think that's a fair point, thank you, we'll have to
15
                                                                   15
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                   Yes, I might as well, the two
     establish it through somebody, thanks very much. Thank
16
                                                                   16
                                                                        are short, the question, thank you, Chair. Okay, I'll
17
     you, unfortunately I know both those Bheki's, so we'll
                                                                   17
                                                                        start with 7, it is quite a quick one. It is 3:22 pm on
18
     establish which one. The next one is number 6 -
                                                                   18
                                                                        the 15th of August, basically to the same parties and it
19
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 Are you going to give
                                                                   19
                                                                        says, "Many thanks, Cyril, that is very helpful. I have a
20
     evidence on the matter?
                                                                   20
                                                                        call into the DG, so we'll reinforce," and then the last
21
           MR MPOFU:
                              Chair, well if the chair
                                                                   21
                                                                        one, excuse me, Mr Interpreter, which is the next page,
22
    insists then there is nothing I can do. No, Chair, we'll
                                                                   22
                                                                        4(B), the one on top.
23
     establish through my attorneys, only if there is no cross-
                                                                   23
                                                                        [16:18] MR ZOKWANA:
                                                                                                         4(B) is 289(F)?
24
     examination, Chair. Number 6 -
                                                                   24
                                                                               MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                   Yes, the one on top, ignore
25
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 - your colleagues of their
                                                                   25
                                                                        the one at the bottom, it is a repetition, ja. That one is
                                                       Page 4732
                                                                                                                          Page 4734
                                                                       1:18 pm from Albert Jameson. Oh, is it the same as 5? Oh,
     right in that regard.
 1
 2
           MR MPOFU:
                              Thank you, Chair. Number 6
                                                                       well, then I was right the first time, Chairperson.
 3
     reads as follows, it is at 2:58 pm, the 15th August 2012,
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                   So this is actually 5?
 4
     from Cyril Ramaphosa to Albert Jameson, Bernard Mokoena,
                                                                   4
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                5, yes, that's correct.
 5
     Tandigai Ncube, Roger Philemon and Ian Farmer. The same
                                                                   5
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                   Because the layout is
     subject, re the security situation. "Dear all, I have just
                                                                   6
                                                                       different?
 6
 7
                                                                   7
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
     had a discussion with Susan Shabangu in Cape Town. One,
                                                                                                The layout is different, even
                                                                       on the other one, so we revert 4 to 7, in other words the
 8
     she agrees that what they are going through is not a labour
 9
     dispute, but a criminal act. She will correct her
                                                                       one that I've just read to you, Mr Zokwana, is number 7 and
10
     characterisation of what we are experiencing. Two, she is
                                                                   10
                                                                       the last one, and we reinstate 4 as 4, and you interpret.
11
     going into cabinet and will brief the President as well and
                                                                   11
                                                                       Thank you, Chairperson, very much.
12
     get the Minister of Police, Nathi Mthethwa to act in a more
                                                                   12
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                   Have you got the names of
13
     pointed way. Three, she will be in Johannesburg by 5 pm
                                                                   13
                                                                       the gentlemen -
14
     and would be able to speak to Roger. Let us keep the
                                                                   14
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Oh, yes -
                                                                   15
15
     pressure on them to act correctly."
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                   - whose subpoenas were
                                                                   16
                                                                       extended in Chambers?
16
            The next one, or before, I was just about to say,
17
     the last time but unfortunately, Chairperson, I have bad
                                                                   17
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Thank you, Chairperson, yes.
18
     news, I think that last page which I thought was a
                                                                   18
                                                                       They are Mr Fusi Mohale, Mr Mlambisa Gxokogxokwana, Mr
                                                                       Lungani Mabutyana, Sithembele Ntakana, Mr Lebogang Mokone
19
     repetition is not a repetition, so we have two more. It is
20
     just that one of the times looked the same. The one at the
                                                                   20
                                                                       and the last one is Thembinkosi Mtyho. Thank you,
21
     bottom is repetition, it is the one of 12:18 which is
                                                                   21
                                                                       Chairperson.
     number 4, but the one on top which is sought is not, so we
                                                                   22
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                   Alright, you confirm that
22
     can call that number 4(B). I'm saying, if you can call old
                                                                   23
                                                                       that is correct, Mr Mahlangu, and they have been told that
23
24
     number 4, Chair, that old number 4, we call it 4(A).
                                                                   24
                                                                       their subpoenas are extended until the 18th of February and
```

they must be here at 09:30 on that morning.

|    |                              | Page 4735                  |
|----|------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1  | MR MAHLANGU:                 | I confirm the names, thank |
| 2  | you, Mr Chairman.            |                            |
| 3  | CHAIRPERSON:                 | The commission will now    |
| 4  | adjourn until 09:30 tomorrov |                            |
| 5  | [COMMISSION ADJOU            | JRNED]                     |
| 6  | •                            |                            |
| 7  |                              |                            |
| 8  |                              |                            |
| 9  |                              |                            |
| 10 | •                            |                            |
| 11 | •                            |                            |
| 12 | •                            |                            |
| 13 |                              |                            |
| 14 |                              |                            |
| 15 |                              |                            |
| 16 |                              |                            |
| 17 |                              |                            |
| 18 |                              |                            |
| 19 | •                            |                            |
| 20 | •                            |                            |
|    | •                            |                            |
| 21 | •                            |                            |
| 22 | •                            |                            |
| 23 | •                            |                            |
| 24 |                              |                            |
| 25 | •                            |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |
|    |                              |                            |

| A   |
|---|
| <b>abetted</b> 4667:11                    |
| ability 4695:10 4697:7                    |
| <b>able</b> 4618:19 4629:7 4647:24 4648:5 |
| 4652:10,12 4657:6                         |
| 4666:20,21 4667:8                         |
| 4675:13 4678:9                            |
| 4684:11 4685:1<br>4691:17 4693:14         |
| 4697:11 4700:1                            |
| 4701:8 4705:13                            |
| 4706:17 4717:20<br>4732:14                |
| absence 4652:7                            |
| absolutely 4730:15                        |
| accept 4684:13 4686:2                     |
| 4688:10 4690:12<br>4694:2 4702:25         |
| 4705:18 4709:10                           |
| Accepted 4687:8                           |
| access 4633:2 4671:12                     |
| 4674:9<br>accidental 4683:23              |
| account 4690:24                           |
| accurate 4657:15                          |
| accurately 4714:20                        |
| 4715:20<br><b>accuse</b> 4642:10 4644:6   |
| 4645:2 4659:24                            |
| 4660:15                                   |
| accused 4655:6                            |
| 4659:19 4660:20<br>4706:8                 |
| accusing 4659:14,15                       |
| 4715:7                                    |
| achieve 4661:15                           |
| achieved 4661:14<br>act 4634:5 4654:25    |
| 4694:12 4699:20                           |
| 4700:9 4702:9                             |
| 4705:23 4710:5                            |
| 4711:8 4730:18<br>4732:9,12,15            |
| acting 4695:11                            |
| action 4628:12 4671:2                     |
| 4729:3 4730:13                            |
| actions 4715:19<br>acts 4654:25           |
| add 4631:14 4661:18                       |
| 4661:20 4704:25                           |
| address 4666:21                           |
| 4671:16,20 4672:23<br>4675:20 4730:13     |
| addressed 4676:17                         |
| 4677:15 4680:2                            |
| addressing 4677:2                         |
| adequate 4728:7<br>adjourn 4675:1 4708:6  |
| 4733:14 4735:4                            |
| ADJOURNED 4735:5                          |
| <b>adjournment</b> 4674:23 4707:16,19,23  |
| 4707:16,19,23<br>4727:16                  |
| <b>ADJOURNS</b> 4675:2                    |
|   |

| Mai   |
|---|
|   |
| 4707:21   |
| admission 4652:16                                   |
| admitted 4651:15<br>4657:1                          |
| admittedly 4657:24                                  |
| advantage 4618:15                                   |
| <b>advice</b> 4631:2                                |
| advise 4714:23                                      |
| affiliation 4693:11                                 |
| <b>affiliations</b> 4702:21                         |
| <b>Africa</b> 4689:20 4696:21 4696:22               |
| <b>African</b> 4688:13,15,20                        |
| <b>afternoon</b> 4686:18,19                         |
| agent 4677:20 4685:2                                |
| <b>agree</b> 4619:20 4637:23                        |
| 4643:11 4645:6                                      |
| 4648:20,22 4660:20<br>4667:16 4672:14,16            |
| 4672:20 4673:9,12                                   |
| 4689:12 4693:14                                     |
| 4695:6,7,13,24                                      |
| 4696:7,13,22 4699:13                                |
| 4699:17 4700:7                                      |
| 4701:15,22 4702:11<br>4702:16,19 4703:1             |
| 4705:4 4709:1 4714:7                                |
| agreed 4671:21 4672:2                               |
| 4672:9 4677:19,20                                   |
| 4691:23 4692:2                                      |
| 4700:15 4704:24                                     |
| 4705:1 4728:21                                      |
| <b>agreement</b> 4619:6<br>4676:22,22 4677:12       |
| 4677:14,25 4678:3,6                                 |
| 4678:8 4700:23                                      |
| 4701:3 4705:9                                       |
| 4710:15   |
| agreements 4710:8,8                                 |
| <b>agrees</b> 4732:8<br><b>ahead</b> 4691:21        |
| aim 4646:10 4670:16                                 |
| 4685:14 4693:21                                     |
| <b>Albert</b> 4726:22 4728:2                        |
| 4729:11 4730:3,5                                    |
| 4731:1 4732:4 4734:1                                |
| <b>alerted</b> 4649:11 <b>allegation</b> 4642:16,24 |
| 4643:1 4649:13                                      |
| 4652:19 4654:25                                     |
| 4663:22 4668:9                                      |
| allegations 4620:23                                 |
| 4630:16 4673:11                                     |
| <b>alleged</b> 4640:7 4662:12 4663:1 4665:1         |
| alleging 4645:11                                    |
| 4664:6  |
| <b>alliance</b> 4689:13                             |
| 4695:19,20,21 4703:3                                |
| 4703:6,7,8,9  |
| <b>allow</b> 4670:17 4671:25                        |
| 4682:24 4685:14                                     |

4707:13 4716:16

4729:19

4707:8

allowed 4685:11

```
allows 4684:25 4698:25
alluded 4697:19
  4712:20 4713:9
  4716:3
alluding 4704:23
alright 4616:6 4617:17
  4618:21 4621:4
  4636:23 4650:13
  4660:19 4664:20
  4679:22 4680:22
  4682:1 4694:1,18
  4710:17 4722:9
  4724:21 4730:21
  4733:11 4734:22
alter 4675:6 4679:4,5
alternatively 4662:3
ambit 4698:1 4699:25
AMCU's 4661:21
amending 4709:11
amount 4668:2
analysis 4668:3
  4709:16
anarchy 4627:3
ANC 4688:2,6 4689:10
  4689:14 4690:6
  4695:20,21 4718:11
  4718:12 4726:18,19
angry 4667:22 4674:10
announce 4727:15,15
answer 4619:16
  4620:22 4622:6,14,23
  4622:25 4623:3,4
  4625:22 4635:9,9
  4639:3 4643:18
  4648:5,14 4650:12
  4658:4 4666:6,20
  4668:4,7 4677:17
  4689:5 4691:3
  4694:16 4701:9,18
  4702:4 4709:11,18
  4710:15,16,18,22
  4711:4,14 4713:21
  4716:15 4717:17
  4718:2,15
answering 4668:1
  4669:1,2 4694:6
  4699:18
answers 4641:9
  4652:23 4676:2
  4704:18
antagonistic 4691:13
anticipate 4660:18
anti-workers 4694:9
anybody 4630:20
  4638:14 4646:8
  4703:10
anybody's 4674:17
anyone's 4673:8
anyway 4644:17
  4648:18 4674:25
  4676:15 4689:4
  4690:11 4730:23
apologise 4615:5
  4714:8
apology 4687:5,7,10
  4711:15
```

```
apparently 4715:14
appeal 4718:17
appear 4620:23
appeared 4629:11
appearing 4651:14
appears 4616:16
  4662:21 4663:21,24
  4674:11
applauded 4677:9
applies 4695:12
apply 4690:25 4691:1
  4697:10
applying 4690:22
appointed 4669:12
appreciate 4675:13
  4699:12 4720:7
appreciated 4729:17
approach 4636:19
  4666:7 4672:15
approached 4728:5
appropriate 4674:21
  4675:10 4686:1
  4729:3
approve 4702:4
area 4647:16 4708:25
areas 4728:7
aren't 4704:3
argue 4669:15,17
  4683:5 4684:16
  4711:24
argument 4668:5
  4712:15
armed 4626:14,17
  4677:19
arms 4674:15 4683:2
army 4728:19
arose 4615:3
arranged 4633:14
arrangement 4707:23
arrangements 4683:17
arrested 4711:20
arrival 4623:22
  4673:12
arrived 4622:7,22
  4671:23 4673:5
  4681:1
article 4615:13.14.24
  4616:2,15,19 4618:16
  4619:16,19 4620:3,13
  4620:23
articles 4618:5 4620:10
ascribe 4699:7
aside 4714:10 4731:7
asked 4618:12 4619:11
  4621:10 4622:24
  4623:12 4634:17,18
  4635:1 4641:6,9
  4644:6 4671:20
  4681:2 4691:3
  4707:18 4711:19
  4714:1 4716:15,18
 4731:10
asking 4627:25
  4641:12 4658:2
  4664:1 4666:8 4684:6
  4690:18,23 4699:9
```

4711:18 4715:16 4716:3 asks 4686:6 4701:21 4717:12 aspirations 4701:8 assist 4624:9 4625:6 4627:11 4671:14 4678:1 assistance 4639:14 assisted 4667:11,23 **assisting** 4631:25 4632:25 4633:1 4666:24 assume 4715:1 **assure** 4677:3 assures 4717:11 atmosphere 4678:4 attempt 4621:17 4624:6,7 4637:20 4646:2 4662:11 4670:8,24 4683:12 4719:17 attempting 4708:16 **attempts** 4683:15 attend 4714:21 4726:6 4726:8 attention 4616:8 4617:15 4618:2 4637:18 4663:4 **attitude** 4623:8 4630:10 4687:16,16 attorneys 4633:11 4731:23 **audience** 4654:8 auditorium 4618:14 4653:6 4680:11 4718:18,21 4727:13 August 4621:5,17 4623:7,16,25 4625:1 4628:19 4629:18 4630:9 4631:10 4632:7 4634:12 4635:5,16,18 4637:2 4638:4 4640:5,10 4641:23 4648:3 4649:10 4662:9 4664:11.13 4669:25 4676:17 4680:3,25 4683:7 4720:1,3 4725:22 4727:23 4729:15 4732:3 4733:18 avail 4675:25 4683:17 **available** 4630:20 4631:4 4678:19 averted 4713:1 avoid 4636:21 **avoiding** 4636:12 4697:14 aware 4620:4,8,22 4625:10 4628:14 4633:22 4636:20 4637:6,7,9,19 4644:8 4672:10 4682:22 4712:2,2,17 4716:4 4716:18,25 4717:12

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

| 4717:14,15   | best 4672:17 4674:22                                    | <b>cabinet</b> 4732:11                       | catch 4640:6                                 | <b>choose</b> 4676:1                       |
|--|---|--|--|--|
|  | 4692:25 4729:18   | call 4627:6 4628:9,10                        | categorised 4728:15                          | chose 4620:12                              |
| <u>B</u>   | <b>better</b> 4619:2 4651:19                            | 4645:24 4649:21                              | caucus 4672:1                                | chronologically                            |
| back 4621:4 4626:22                                  | 4681:15   | 4652:6 4653:15                               | caucusing 4672:2                             | 4633:15                                    |
| 4634:1 4638:11                                       | beyond 4657:6   | 4657:20 4661:25                              | caught 4708:5                                | <b>chronology</b> 4634:20                  |
| 4656:14 4666:24                                      | Bheki 4731:4,6,12,12                                    | 4662:2,4 4664:18,22                          | causally 4713:11                             | circumstances 4615:3                       |
| 4667:11,24 4672:17                                   | Bheki's 4731:17   | 4670:16 4671:4                               | cause 4713:8,8,11                            | 4713:2                                     |
| 4676:23 4677:3<br>4687:15 4700:4                     | <b>big</b> 4631:16 4705:12<br><b>bit</b> 4650:7 4680:19 | 4675:10,24 4678:21<br>4681:5 4706:20         | 4715:18,23 4716:2 <b>caused</b> 4697:16      | citizens 4673:13<br>civil 4728:16          |
| 4719:21 4725:18                                      | 4703:14 4727:4  | 4713:19 4716:17                              | 4711:25                                      | civilian 4637:12                           |
| 4726:7 4729:3  | <b>bold</b> 4616:16 4617:4                              | 4728:23 4729:10                              | CCC1 4679:10                                 | claim 4696:14                              |
| background 4637:1                                    | 4618:7 4619:20  | 4732:23,23,24 4733:2                         | cemented 4695:4                              | claimed 4626:8                             |
| 4670:14  | Bongo 4621:16 4622:3                                    | 4733:5,9,20                                  | central 4689:9                               | 4646:11                                    |
| backing 4713:3                                       | 4622:8,17,18,21   | called 4625:10 4640:12                       | <b>CEO</b> 4651:25 4731:13                   | <b>clarify</b> 4665:20 4707:2              |
| <b>backup</b> 4625:9                                 | 4629:9 4640:12  | 4655:11 4658:1                               | CEOs 4729:9                                  | clarity 4715:6                             |
| <b>bad</b> 4726:4 4732:17                            | 4646:1 4662:10  | 4685:5 4714:10                               | <b>certain</b> 4697:11                       | clashing 4683:1                            |
| <b>Baleni</b> 4726:12                                | 4664:6  | 4718:8 4726:3 4733:4                         | <b>certainly</b> 4634:7,24                   | class 4692:2,6,8,16,20                     |
| bargaining 4701:3                                    | <b>Booi</b> 4678:16,21 4679:2                           | caller 4640:24 4641:12                       | 4702:16 4720:25                              | 4694:24 4700:16                            |
| <b>Barnard</b> 4731:2                                | 4680:1,5,7  | 4642:11 4645:2,9,10                          | <b>chair</b> 4615:9,18                       | classes 4692:10 4693:7                     |
| Barnes's 4644:17                                     | <b>bottom</b> 4649:18                                   | 4645:18,19 4646:5                            | 4644:21 4652:21                              | clear 4631:17 4632:15                      |
| 4668:6<br><b>base</b> 4655:25,25                     | 4719:18 4721:4<br>4722:20 4723:18                       | 4662:16 4664:6,23<br>callers 4672:11         | 4654:17 4655:18<br>4656:20 4659:10           | 4634:1 4639:3<br>4655:22 4656:9            |
| based 4623:4 4636:14                                 | 4725:4,20 4732:21                                       | calling 4621:21                              | 4661:18 4674:19                              | 4661:4 4666:7 4671:1                       |
| 4651:12 4652:24                                      | 4733:25   | calls 4625:14 4715:18                        | 4675:17,20 4679:12                           | 4677:24 4684:1                             |
| 4654:2 4656:25                                       | branch 4622:9,19  | campaign 4703:18                             | 4681:13 4685:16                              | 4706:1                                     |
| 4709:16 4714:3                                       | 4623:21,21,23   | campaigned 4699:19                           | 4686:2 4714:19                               | clearer 4683:21                            |
| basic 4673:14  | 4630:15,19,24 4631:4                                    | can't 4627:16,21                             | 4715:5,12 4719:13,17                         | clearing 4718:21                           |
| basically 4733:18                                    | 4631:25   | 4650:4 4658:16                               | 4720:25 4722:6,16                            | clearly 4632:12 4633:2                     |
| basing 4627:17                                       | <b>branch's</b> 4630:10                                 | 4667:3 4709:6 4712:6                         | 4731:21,21,22,24                             | 4633:24 4634:22                            |
| 4697:22 4698:8                                       | break 4646:17 4670:16                                   | 4712:10                                      | 4732:2,24 4733:12,16                         | 4645:8 4654:14                             |
| <b>basis</b> 4645:2 4647:13                          | 4684:19   | capacity 4688:5 4706:7                       | chairman 4721:3                              | 4655:17 4700:8                             |
| 4647:15 4680:13                                      | <b>brief</b> 4716:10 4729:10                            | Cape 4721:7 4723:9                           | 4726:20 4735:2                               | 4708:23                                    |
| 4693:15 4713:16                                      | 4732:11   | 4726:6,9 4730:6                              | <b>challenge</b> 4696:15                     | client 4713:24                             |
| 4715:7   | <b>briefed</b> 4728:10,12                               | 4732:7                                       | 4729:1                                       | climate 4696:15                            |
| <b>bathroom</b> 4707:13<br><b>BBB2</b> 4615:18,20,21 | <b>briefing</b> 4628:15,20,22                           | <b>capital</b> 4690:20<br>4691:13,18 4692:12 | <b>Chamber</b> 4726:20,20<br>4726:22 4729:10 | <b>closed</b> 4705:9 4706:18 4707:7        |
| BBB3 4679:12,16                                      | 4629:14 4716:9<br>4717:21 4721:2,13                     | 4692:19 4694:4,25                            | 4731:12                                      | closing 4712:15                            |
| <b>BBB4</b> 4718:25 4719:12                          | 4725:25 4731:4  | 4695:14 4696:5,24                            | Chambers 4734:16                             | coercion 4707:7                            |
| 4719:13  | bring 4663:3 4690:6                                     | 4699:16 4700:4                               | chance 4616:11                               | colleague 4700:20                          |
| bearing 4677:14                                      | broadcast 4647:23                                       | 4701:16,23 4702:1,5                          | 4617:25 4658:4                               | colleagues 4731:25                         |
| beatings 4710:2 4711:2                               | brought 4635:20   | 4702:13,17 4704:24                           | 4672:17 4686:5                               | <b>collect</b> 4669:12                     |
| beg 4718:24  | 4698:10   | 4705:20 4712:2                               | 4699:16 4702:18                              | <b>collude</b> 4694:4 4701:16              |
| <b>beginning</b> 4617:2,3                            | <b>bullet</b> 4728:9,24                                 | 4713:7 4714:12                               | 4703:2                                       | 4701:23 4702:1,12,23                       |
| begins 4617:13                                       | <b>bullets</b> 4728:8                                   | capitalist 4692:5                            | <b>Chances</b> 4713:3                        | 4703:9,22 4704:14                          |
| behalf 4624:24 4625:12                               | burdening 4694:20                                       | 4700:14,15                                   | <b>change</b> 4693:5,8                       | 4705:6,15 4706:13                          |
| 4684:11  | Burger 4643:22 4644:1                                   | carbon 4655:10                               | changed 4676:22                              | 4707:4                                     |
| behaviour 4694:10                                    | 4661:18 4715:5,11                                       | careful 4684:22                              | 4678:8 4683:22                               | colludes 4705:21                           |
| behest 4660:25 4706:18                               | 4722:13,16  | carefully 4657:19                            | channels 4698:25                             | 4708:11,14                                 |
| <b>belief</b> 4655:25,25<br>4695:5                   | <b>burn</b> 4639:9 4667:5,23 4683:12 4684:10            | carnage 4624:22<br>Carol 4615:13,25          | characterisation<br>4730:12 4732:10          | <b>colluding</b> 4685:13 4699:16 4706:9,17 |
| 4695:5<br>beliefs 4673:15                            | burned 4650:24  | 4616:2 4618:4                                | characterised 4730:12                        | 4709:7,8,16,18                             |
| believe 4651:2 4653:21                               | burning 4667:2  | carried 4731:8                               | characterising 4730:12                       | collusion 4702:8,16                        |
| 4658:9 4659:6  | burnt 4651:1 4653:19                                    | carry 4676:15 4710:12                        | check 4632:13 4634:1                         | 4704:22,23 4705:1                          |
| 4673:18 4694:12                                      | 4653:20   | 4715:25 4717:17                              | 4634:20 4635:1                               | 4706:2 4707:1 4710:2                       |
| 4695:5 4703:5  | business 4615:14  | 4727:21                                      | 4646:16 4665:10,14                           | 4710:21 4711:2                             |
| <b>believed</b> 4655:23                              | 4616:3 4699:15  | <b>carrying</b> 4638:13                      | 4690:6                                       | 4712:1,20 4713:6,9                         |
| 4656:15 4684:2                                       | 4705:20   | 4674:15                                      | <b>checked</b> 4620:14                       | 4714:11 4715:21                            |
| 4706:16  | businesses 4705:25                                      | cars 4650:23,24,25                           | 4665:11                                      | 4716:2,8,13,23,25                          |
| <b>believes</b> 4631:14                              | businessperson  | 4653:18,19,19                                | checking 4639:3                              | 4717:9                                     |
| 4693:12  | 4718:11   | case 4668:20 4669:17                         | chief 4695:20 4707:24                        | COM 4729:10                                |
| Bello 4651:25  | busy 4658:20 4659:21                                    | 4674:7 4684:2 4685:4                         | 4729:11                                      | combination 4696:5                         |
| belong 4693:11                                       | 4659:22 4668:21   | 4692:11,24 4706:14                           | China 4692:25 4696:8                         | 4703:19                                    |
| 4703:17 4705:10                                      | 4715:22,23 4724:4                                       | 4706:23 4707:5                               | Chinese 4696:9                               | combined 4715:19                           |
| <b>bend</b> 4701:8<br><b>benefit</b> 4680:11         |   | 4708:23 4709:13<br>4714:2 4728:15            | <b>choice</b> 4624:20 4682:11 4695:18        | <b>come</b> 4618:15 4624:5 4651:21 4655:12 |
| <b>Bernard</b> 4730:4 4732:4                         | C 4720:19   | cases 4636:13                                | choices 4695:18 4696:8                       | 4666:3 4670:19                             |
| Dei Hai u 4/30.4 4/32.4                              | U 4/20.17   | Cases T030.13                                |  | 7000.3 40/0.17                             |
|  | •   |  | •  |  |

| 4678:22 4684:19,22  |
|---|
| 4687:15 4696:22   |
| 4699:1,2 4703:20  |
| 4705:14 4706:15   |
| 4707:25 4708:18   |
| 4713:18   |
| comes 4644:25 4693:22   |
| coming 4644:24  |
| 4668:14 4695:4  |
| 4699:24 4700:25   |
| commas 4663:10  |
| commence 4615:4,6   |
| 4685:22<br>comment 4645:4,21  |
| 4676:20 4683:9  |
| 4684:20 4685:22   |
| 4706:7 4712:6   |
| Commercial 4729:11  |
| commission 4615:2   |
| 4636:14 4647:19   |
| 4648:2,5,6,15,17,23   |
| 4661:4 4665:20  |
| 4669:5,11,11 4672:25  |
| 4675:2,2,3 4678:17  |
| 4680:1 4682:21  |
| 4683:3,6 4687:20  |
| 4699:20 4703:5  |
| 4707:22 4708:19   |
| 4711:25 4712:13<br>4713:15,19 4731:5  |
| 4713:13,19 4731:3   |
| commissioner 4625:16  |
| Commissioners   |
| 4675:20 4676:7  |
| 4678:19 4707:17   |
| <b>committee</b> 4623:21,23   |
| 4630:15,19,24 4631:4  |
| 4631:25 4688:3  |
|   |
| 4689:9  |
| 4689:9<br><b>Communist</b> 4688:13,15   |
| 4689:9<br>Communist 4688:13,15<br>4688:20   |
| 4689:9<br><b>Communist</b> 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br><b>companies</b> 4696:10  |
| 4689:9<br>Communist 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br>companies 4696:10<br>company 4622:11   |
| 4689:9<br><b>Communist</b> 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br><b>companies</b> 4696:10<br><b>company</b> 4622:11<br>4625:4 4627:1,1   |
| 4689:9<br>Communist 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br>companies 4696:10<br>company 4622:11<br>4625:4 4627:1,1<br>4639:8 4646:23  |
| 4689:9<br>Communist 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br>companies 4696:10<br>company 4622:11<br>4625:4 4627:1,1<br>4639:8 4646:23<br>4663:13 4673:16   |
| 4689:9<br>Communist 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br>companies 4696:10<br>company 4622:11<br>4625:4 4627:1,1<br>4639:8 4646:23<br>4663:13 4673:16<br>4697:2 4700:22   |
| 4689:9<br>Communist 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br>companies 4696:10<br>company 4622:11<br>4625:4 4627:1,1<br>4639:8 4646:23<br>4663:13 4673:16<br>4697:2 4700:22<br>4701:2 4706:19,25  |
| 4689:9<br>Communist 4688:13,15<br>4688:20<br>companies 4696:10<br>company 4622:11<br>4625:4 4627:1,1<br>4639:8 4646:23<br>4663:13 4673:16<br>4697:2 4700:22<br>4701:2 4706:19,25<br>4707:9 4711:9 4716:9  |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8  |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20   |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20   |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20   |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22  |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21  |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16  |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended   |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended 4627:16   |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended 4627:16 comrade 4622:8,18   |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended 4627:16 comrade 4622:8,18 4640:12   |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended 4627:16 comrade 4622:8,18 4640:12 concentrating 4659:1                        |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended 4627:16 comrade 4622:8,18 4640:12 concentrating 4659:1 concern 4624:14        |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended 4627:16 comrade 4622:8,18 4640:12 concentrating 4659:1 concern 4624:14 4728:8 |
| 4689:9 Communist 4688:13,15 4688:20 companies 4696:10 company 4622:11 4625:4 4627:1,1 4639:8 4646:23 4663:13 4673:16 4697:2 4700:22 4701:2 4706:19,25 4707:9 4711:9 4716:9 compared 4618:8 comparison 4696:20 compelled 4622:20 complete 4687:22 complimented 4695:11 components 4695:14 4695:20 4696:21 4706:13 4709:16 comprehended 4627:16 comrade 4622:8,18 4640:12 concentrating 4659:1 concern 4624:14        |

| Wai   |
|---|
| 4669.1 4603.1 4700.6                                  |
| 4668:1 4692:1 4709:6 <b>concerns</b> 4629:25          |
| conciliatory 4686:21                                  |
| <b>conclude</b> 4652:1<br>4666:4                      |
| 4000:4<br>concluded 4658:9                            |
| conclusion 4684:22                                    |
| concomitant 4730:13                                   |
| <b>concur</b> 4692:21 4697:1 <b>concurred</b> 4713:21 |
| concurs 4620:17                                       |
| condemning 4631:11                                    |
| 4632:7<br><b>conditions</b> 4690:22,25                |
| 4691:1,16 4692:10                                     |
| <b>condone</b> 4697:20                                |
| conduct 4656:8  |
| conducted 4665:8,16<br>conference 4633:24             |
| conferences 4633:23                                   |
| <b>confine</b> 4699:9 4709:21                         |
| 4709:24<br><b>confined</b> 4710:4                     |
| confirm 4690:15                                       |
| 4717:22 4734:22                                       |
| 4735:1  |
| confirmation 4729:5<br>confirmed 4637:22              |
| 4716:5  |
| confirming 4629:25                                    |
| <b>confirms</b> 4685:8,12 <b>conforms</b> 4685:4      |
| confusion 4644:16,16                                  |
| 4658:22   |
| connected 4713:11                                     |
| <b>conservative</b> 4710:1 4711:1                     |
| consider 4718:21                                      |
| consistent 4631:13                                    |
| 4634:2 4667:19<br>4730:7                              |
| consult 4628:7  |
| contact 4726:21                                       |
| <b>contained</b> 4618:4<br>4702:9                     |
| CONTD 4615:10,11                                      |
| contention 4662:16                                    |
| <b>context</b> 4650:6,11<br>4654:14 4661:20           |
| 4693:16 4695:12,19                                    |
| 4714:6 4724:12  |
| continue 4662:6 4727:6                                |
| 4729:14<br><b>continues</b> 4708:8                    |
| 4718:20   |
| contradictions 4694:25                                |
| <b>contrary</b> 4639:10<br>4673:14                    |
| control 4625:6  |
| conversation 4620:19                                  |
| 4627:20 4638:2<br>4643:12 4675:9,12                   |
| 4676:3  |
| <b>convey</b> 4731:9                                  |
| copies 4615:22  |

**copy** 4681:9,11 4731:10

| <b>correct</b> 4615:9 4617:7 |
|------------------------------|
| 4617:16 4618:6               |
| 4619:13 4621:19,20           |
| 4622:5 4623:16               |
| 4624:1 4625:2,16             |
| 4626:19 4628:19              |
| 4629:3,18,19,22              |
| 4631:2 4634:14,15            |
| 4635:6 4636:17               |
| 4641:23 4646:4,6             |
| 4647:21 4648:3               |
| 4649:12,22 4651:10           |
| 4656:18,19 4659:9,10         |
| 4662:13 4663:14,19           |
| 4664:4,9,14 4665:9           |
|                              |
| 4665:17 4666:18              |
| 4669:6,8 4670:4,5,9          |
| 4671:21 4674:13              |
| 4688:4,22 4689:6             |
| 4690:20 4691:8,14,23         |
| 4692:2,8,17 4693:10          |
| 4695:16 4696:2,14            |
| 4704:11 4714:25              |
| 4716:6 4725:6                |
| 4730:15 4732:9               |
| 4734:4,23                    |
| corrected 4674:1             |
| correctly 4642:21            |
| 4703:12 4732:15              |
| COSATU 4689:10,14            |
| 4689:23 4693:10,16           |
| 4693:18 4694:13              |
| 4695:19,21,22                |
| couldn't 4622:16             |
| 4623:11 4625:21              |
| 4629:9 4662:24               |
| 4663:4                       |
| could've 4673:24             |
| 4674:1                       |
| could've 4673:23             |
| counsel 4622:24 4631:4       |
| 4660:14,16,19                |
| 4664:16,19,21 4666:4         |
| 4713:15 4716:17              |
| counsellor 4693:15           |
| 4694:7 4709:15               |
| count 4689:8 4690:5,10       |
| 4690:12                      |
| <b>counting</b> 4690:16      |
| countries 4695:24            |
| 4696:17                      |
| <b>country</b> 4634:5        |
| 4674:16 4689:7               |
| 4690:23,25 4696:3            |
| 4697:2 4698:23               |
| 4700:4,18 4702:20            |
| <b>couple</b> 4668:10        |
| 4720:23                      |
| <b>course</b> 4668:12        |
| 4681:25                      |
| covered 4617:14              |
| create 4627:14 4685:15       |
| <b>created</b> 4683:11       |
| creating 4701:10             |

```
criminal 4730:18
  4732:9
criminals 4730:11
criticising 4689:18
cross 4633:17 4654:1
  4685:24 4712:13
  4731:23
cross-examination
  4615:11 4618:20
  4643:19 4644:3,10
 4675:5,6,21 4686:13
 4686:16 4708:8
cross-examine 4675:7
  4675:11,14,25 4676:4
  4686:4
cross-examined
  4648:25 4649:2
cross-examining
 4615:8 4686:22
crowd 4625:5
crowds 4680:5
Cuba 4693:1 4696:11
  4698:9
culminating 4699:21
current 4694:11,12
  4718:12 4730:8
currently 4690:8
  4705:11 4721:7
  4723:9 4730:6
cut 4683:19,21 4696:1
  4699:11
Cyril 4718:9 4720:13
  4721:1,12 4722:1,25
  4723:3,6,16 4726:23
 4728:3 4729:16,16
 4730:21 4731:4
 4732:4 4733:3,19
          D
Dali 4670:12
damaging 4728:13
dangerous 4636:20
dark 4671:16
```

### **dastardly** 4730:11 date 4646:19 4681:10 dated 4620:3 4681:10 dates 4645:6 4647:3 4659:13 day 4615:14 4616:3 4621:12,25 4622:1 4623:22 4624:18 4625:15 4629:24 4633:23 4634:2 4635:22 4636:10 4637:8,10 4641:25 4652:12 4656:25 4658:15 4661:7 4664:22 4665:23 4667:20 4677:21 4683:18 4715:3 4717:13,20 4730:3,22 days 4634:1,13 4655:2 4658:19 deal 4619:22 4621:21 4621:22 4626:7 4628:9 4630:5

| . age                         |
|-------------------------------|
| 4656:12 4674:23               |
|                               |
| 4675:14 4682:9,10,10          |
| 4686:10 4697:25               |
| 4705:6,15 4714:9              |
| 4715:18,21 4727:3             |
|                               |
| 4730:1,1                      |
| <b>dealing</b> 4619:15        |
| 4636:13 4642:6                |
| 4645:13,13 4646:9             |
|                               |
| 4672:20 4682:14               |
| 4701:1 4707:11                |
| 4716:2 4730:18                |
| deals 4653:25                 |
|                               |
| dealt 4633:20 4677:5          |
| 4682:25                       |
| Dear 4725:24 4730:5           |
| 4732:6                        |
|                               |
| death 4652:20                 |
| deaths 4659:16,20             |
| 4664:25 4665:1                |
| debatable 4696:6              |
|                               |
| <b>debate</b> 4644:23         |
| 4645:15 4651:14               |
| 4653:6 4694:21                |
| 4715:12                       |
|                               |
| <b>debated</b> 4631:19        |
| 4643:23                       |
| <b>debating</b> 4645:23       |
| 4698:9,18 4715:12             |
|                               |
| debriefing 4717:13            |
| debriefings 4714:22           |
| <b>December</b> 4681:10       |
| decent 4678:7                 |
|                               |
| <b>decide</b> 4626:15 4671:3  |
| 4696:11 4703:9                |
| <b>decided</b> 4675:6         |
| 4727:16                       |
|                               |
| <b>decision</b> 4666:25       |
| 4667:12                       |
| decisions 4623:20             |
| 4636:21                       |
|                               |
| <b>defined</b> 4700:8 4702:8  |
| 4710:7 4711:8                 |
| <b>defines</b> 4710:11        |
| definitely 4696:2             |
| · ·                           |
| definition 4711:11            |
| <b>defuse</b> 4674:8          |
| defusing 4665:4               |
| demanding 4671:17             |
|                               |
| 4681:3                        |
| demands 4646:22               |
| 4663:12 4676:23               |
| 4677:4,5                      |
|                               |
| <b>denied</b> 4708:22         |
| 4710:15,21                    |
| dent 4692:11                  |
| deny 4644:6 4673:11           |
|                               |
| <b>denying</b> 4702:8         |
| department 4731:7             |
| <b>depending</b> 4686:5,6     |
| 4697:1                        |
|                               |
| <b>depends</b> 4693:15        |
| 4695:17 4696:12               |
| deputy 4718:12                |
| 4726:19                       |
|                               |
| <b>describe</b> 4682:5 4719:1 |
|                               |

credentials 4723:22

cricket 4716:17

| described 4619:19                                     |
|---|
| 4626:14 4627:21                                       |
| 4730:10   |
| description 4619:18                                   |
| deserves 4698:22                                      |
| desist 4672:12  |
| <b>despite</b> 4622:2,2 <b>detail</b> 4621:25 4640:13 |
| 4664:6,15 4682:22                                     |
| detailed 4629:5 4673:1                                |
| details 4621:18 4629:8                                |
| 4635:19 4640:15,16                                    |
| 4641:22 4648:8  |
| <b>determine</b> 4626:16                              |
| developments 4652:17<br>deviation 4706:2              |
| <b>DG</b> 4728:14 4733:20                             |
| dictates 4671:3                                       |
| didn't 4615:6 4626:6                                  |
| 4627:8,17 4628:8,25                                   |
| 4629:2,8,13,14  |
| 4631:10 4632:6  |
| 4639:6,11 4640:6,14<br>4644:4 4646:7,9                |
| 4656:10 4667:9  |
| 4671:10 4674:12                                       |
| 4677:24 4690:9  |
| 4694:15 4708:9  |
| 4712:16 4713:22                                       |
| 4714:8 4720:24<br><b>differ</b> 4693:2                |
| difference 4619:17                                    |
| 4679:3  |
| differences 4654:11                                   |
| <b>different</b> 4616:1 4618:9                        |
| 4618:11 4623:18                                       |
| 4636:3 4659:7<br>4667:18 4669:1                       |
| 4689:16,16 4702:21                                    |
| 4734:6,7  |
| differential 4619:23                                  |
| difficult 4630:13,17                                  |
| 4658:8 4672:5 4673:3                                  |
| 4673:4 4692:21  |
| 4694:16 4697:1<br>4718:20                             |
| difficulties 4730:9                                   |
| difficulty 4660:3                                     |
| 4701:25 4703:21                                       |
| dignity 4695:1  |
| <b>Dikolwana</b> 4619:8                               |
| direct 4656:10,16<br>directed 4646:23                 |
| 4663:12   |
| direction 4644:24                                     |
| 4645:14   |
| directly 4626:19                                      |
| 4668:14<br><b>director</b> 4617:5                     |
| 4618:24 4723:25                                       |
| dirty 4707:12   |
| disagree 4689:22                                      |
| 4692:23,24 4702:24                                    |
| 4706:5  |
| disallow 4627:25<br>disallowing 4644:17               |
|   |

| disarm 4672:12  |
|---|
| 4682:23<br>discomfort 4708:25                           |
| <b>discovered</b> 4668:10,11 4668:15,16,23              |
| <b>discredited</b> 4684:6 <b>discuss</b> 4715:3 4726:13 |
| discussed 4726:21                                       |
| <b>discussion</b> 4644:18<br>4647:9 4657:4              |
| 4693:24 4698:11<br>4721:22 4722:1                       |
| 4723:19 4726:2,10<br>4730:7,20 4732:7                   |
| discussions 4717:24                                     |
| 4718:5 4726:2<br>4728:14                                |
| dismiss 4697:5<br>dismissed 4697:4                      |
| 4698:24<br><b>disperse</b> 4677:19                      |
| displayed 4687:16                                       |
| <b>dispute</b> 4641:21 4647:13,17 4652:11               |
| 4728:10 4730:10<br>4732:9                               |
| disputing 4641:25<br>disregard 4697:13                  |
| distracted 4716:16<br>distribute 4696:12                |
| distributed 4679:2                                      |
| <b>divert</b> 4697:12 <b>Dlamini</b> 4689:23            |
| <b>document</b> 4618:8,8<br>4621:1 4634:25              |
| 4635:8,10 4637:20<br>4638:1,7,18 4690:6                 |
| documentation   |
| 4619:25<br>documents 4621:1                             |
| 4719:16 <b>doesn't</b> 4643:16 4648:8                   |
| 4649:5 4655:16<br>4658:15 4679:5                        |
| 4690:10 4702:18<br>4706:11 4730:24                      |
| doing 4625:12 4635:2                                    |
| 4651:5 4653:25<br>4656:4 4672:3,24                      |
| 4673:1 4696:20<br>4704:22 4707:9                        |
| don 4641:23<br>don't 4620:18 4627:13                    |
| 4632:1,14 4634:20                                       |
| 4635:8 4637:15,24<br>4639:15 4642:18                    |
| 4648:21 4649:1,6<br>4655:8 4661:1,6                     |
| 4663:20 4666:3<br>4667:8 4669:12                        |
| 4673:21 4675:25   |
| 4676:10 4678:12<br>4679:3 4684:8                        |
| 4685:14 4686:3<br>4687:22 4689:2,17                     |
| 4691:2 4700:12,23                                       |

| 4701:2,19 4702:19,23<br>4703:8,11,17 4706:3<br>4706:23 4710:17<br>4711:23 4713:13,20<br>4715:11 4716:7,12,12 |
|--|
| 4713:11 4710:7,12,12<br>4716:16 4718:22<br>4722:17 4727:3<br>4729:6 4731:13                                  |
| doors 4685:13<br>doubt 4673:18<br>drafted 4710:8   |
| draw 4616:7<br>drawing 4637:18<br>4656:11  |
| drawn 4617:15 4618:2<br>4662:2<br>dream 4661:6   |
| <b>drill</b> 4618:25 4619:23 <b>drillers</b> 4619:19 <b>drive</b> 4650:10                                    |
| <b>due</b> 4615:3 4624:21<br>4669:10 4681:25<br>4697:18 4712:22  |
| <b>duel</b> 4699:17<br><b>Dunn</b> 4617:6 4618:2,24<br>4619:7  |
| dwell 4700:17  E E 4721:18   |
| L 4/21:18  |

earlier 4641:3 4643:6 4645:25 4648:14 4685:22 early 4724:13 easier 4659:17 **Eastern** 4728:6 easy 4673:8 effect 4620:12 either 4617:13 4622:8 4643:2 4644:4 4669:19 4692:5,19 4703:13 elected 4623:19 4688:3 4688:6 electrical 4700:20 electricity 4693:18 email 4721:7 4723:9 4724:10.24 4725:14 emails 4719:3 4722:10 4724:4 4727:5,8 embark 4697:24 **embarking** 4631:15 4703:17 **embedded** 4694:24 **employees** 4710:12 **employer** 4685:10,13 4697:11 4705:6 4707:4 4708:11,14,22 4709:2,8,17,19,21 4710:2,7,14,21 4711:3 employers 4684:12 4697:7 4700:1,3,9 4701:8 4703:19 4705:14 4706:9 4711:7

**encourage** 4631:16 4636:6 4729:8 ends 4655:12 4707:1 Energy 4688:24 **enforcers** 4706:20 engage 4683:8 4684:12 4691:19 engaging 4678:4 4684:17 **English** 4704:12 enormous 4668:2 **enquire** 4630:20 **ensure** 4624:14 4665:3 4671:15 4672:12 ensuring 4729:2 **entertain** 4676:23 **entitled** 4704:17 environment 4678:4 4692:22 4693:1 era 4710:4,5 especially 4620:1 essentially 4730:17 establish 4624:6 4671:7 4678:9 4683:7 4712:24 4731:16,18 4731:23 established 4631:1 4635:23,24 4663:18 **estimate** 4627:12 **evening** 4629:24 event 4713:5 events 4621:5,11 4629:6 4634:14 4651:8,12 4730:9 **everybody** 4615:23 **evidence** 4633:19 4647:19,21 4648:1,20 4649:7,8,10,11 4651:7,9 4652:7 4656:14,16,16 4657:9 4658:9 4661:9 4668:20 4675:8 4678:16,22 4680:1 4684:15.17 4707:24 4708:10 4713:16,20 4714:9,13,20 4715:2 4718:20,23 4731:20 exactly 4627:23 4654:5 4729:21 examination 4633:18 4654:2 4685:25 4731:24 **examine** 4712:14 **example** 4705:13 4708:19 4709:7 4710:1 **examples** 4706:15 **exchange** 4619:25 4724:4 4726:15 exchanged 4719:3 **excuse** 4733:21 executive 4617:5 4618:24 4688:3

empowering 4700:9

encountered 4708:10

**enable** 4676:3

executives 4651:24 4656:24 exhibit 4615:16 4634:17,18 4636:24 4639:13 4640:17,23 4646:12 4649:16 4678:23 4679:4,5 4694:20 4718:25 4719:2 exist 4694:15,25 expect 4714:3 **expelled** 4698:24 experience 4701:9 4709:5,23 4710:25 experienced 4708:12 4709:25 experiencing 4732:10 **experts** 4620:11 4621:2 **explain** 4621:10,21 4624:13 4636:25 4641:24 4701:21 4703:14,23 4711:17 explained 4622:18 explanation 4622:24 4623:9 **exploits** 4691:18 exposed 4697:13 **extended** 4687:10 4693:13 4707:24 4734:16,24 extent 4691:17 4693:6 e-mail 4727:23 4730:6 4731:10

4689:9.10

#### F facing 4697:6 fact 4621:22 4622:4 4627:2,17 4628:23 4630:14 4632:24 4640:13 4644:8 4647:8,10 4651:15 4653:9 4656:3,13,25 4657:1 4661:23 4662:17 4665:22 4668:18 4670:12 4673:21 4674:24 4677:15 4683:12 4692:24 4695:19 4707:18 4717:12 4725:8 facts 4624:6 4663:19 4668:24 4673:24 4683:7 factual 4715:7 **failure** 4662:2 fair 4618:13 4643:14 4644:15 4660:9 4712:11 4714:16 4731:15 fairly 4627:20 **fairness** 4618:16 4643:22 4650:3,8 false 4636:17 **familiar** 4704:10 **families** 4631:16

| 4698:20                              | 4722:4 4725:24                     | 4685:17 4691:16                      |   |
|--------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|
| far 4650:14 4657:22                  | <b>follows</b> 4619:7 4679:18      | Fusi 4734:18                         |   |
| 4684:24 4691:11,25                   | 4728:1 4732:3                      |                                      |   |
| 4693:20 4696:15                      | <b>font</b> 4618:10 4619:20        | G                                    |   |
| 4706:21 4707:3,12                    | <b>foot</b> 4657:16 4719:24        | <b>gain</b> 4673:8                   |   |
| 4709:5 4710:6 4711:8                 | 4721:22                            | gathered 4729:9                      |   |
| 4712:15 4720:24                      | footprints 4658:13                 | Gathering 4674:16                    |   |
| 4728:4                               | <b>force</b> 4697:11 4698:2        | Gcilitshana 4670:11                  |   |
| <b>farm</b> 4701:5                   | 4700:22                            | 4686:23,24 4712:14                   |   |
| <b>Farmer</b> 4732:5                 | <b>forces</b> 4706:22              | 4716:5 4718:2                        |   |
| <b>fashion</b> 4727:4                | <b>foresee</b> 4700:3              | Gcilitshana's 4714:20                |   |
| fast 4727:23                         | <b>forgive</b> 4669:20             | general 4638:3,10                    |   |
| fault 4715:19                        | <b>form</b> 4629:14 4634:4         | 4651:17 4669:25                      |   |
| favour 4708:15                       | 4693:21 4698:2                     | 4671:1,19 4687:11,13                 |   |
| <b>favours</b> 4708:23               | format 4693:21                     | 4695:24 4696:23                      |   |
| fears 4631:6                         | <b>formation</b> 4696:13           | 4718:10 4726:18                      |   |
| February 4615:1                      | 4706:14                            | Generally 4692:9                     |   |
| 4681:19,25 4734:24                   | <b>formed</b> 4636:15 4693:5       | gentlemen 4734:13                    |   |
| Federation 4696:9                    | 4694:5,8,17 4699:21                | genuine 4684:2                       |   |
| federations 4703:8                   | 4701:10                            | Germany 4674:5                       |   |
| <b>feed</b> 4713:3                   | <b>former</b> 4718:10,11           | <b>getting</b> 4627:24               |   |
| feel 4698:20                         | 4726:12                            | <b>give</b> 4616:10,11               |   |
| fickle 4693:20                       | <b>forming</b> 4695:3              | 4620:21 4625:22                      |   |
| <b>fighting</b> 4638:14              | <b>forms</b> 4644:9 4707:6         | 4627:9,11 4629:10                    |   |
| <b>filled</b> 4681:10                | forward 4652:13                    | 4634:19,24 4636:8                    |   |
| <b>final</b> 4619:6                  | 4655:13 4673:14                    | 4647:4 4658:5                        |   |
| <b>find</b> 4622:4 4623:7            | 4677:21 4697:6                     | 4669:13 4672:19                      |   |
| 4624:7 4629:21                       | 4712:6 4713:23                     | 4675:24 4676:23                      |   |
| 4630:3,9 4633:19                     | 4726:14 4729:17                    | 4677:22 4678:16,22                   |   |
| 4658:8 4662:24                       | <b>found</b> 4619:6 4667:14        | 4680:1 4686:5,6                      |   |
| 4665:9 4666:1,17                     | 4670:22 4679:8                     | 4687:21 4709:7                       |   |
| 4670:7 4683:8 4693:1                 | 4692:18                            | 4731:19                              |   |
| 4698:17 4708:21                      | founding 4695:8                    | given 4619:2,25                      |   |
| <b>finding</b> 4679:6                | fourth 4682:14                     | 4620:18 4622:24                      |   |
| <b>fine</b> 4617:24 4664:18          | frame 4714:8                       | 4623:3 4625:4,20                     |   |
| finish 4685:25 4686:12               | framework 4695:10                  | 4626:12,16,20 4627:1                 |   |
| <b>finished</b> 4633:18              | 4701:1,6 4705:24                   | 4628:14 4631:1                       |   |
| 4657:21 4686:4                       | Frans 4726:12                      | 4636:9,12 4639:10                    |   |
| fire 4640:1                          | free 4705:11                       | 4647:19 4649:10                      |   |
| <b>fired</b> 4641:6 4643:9           | fresh 4676:23                      | 4651:9,20 4652:13,14                 |   |
| 4664:7 4667:15                       | Friday 4620:9 4621:10              | 4660:22 4665:6                       |   |
| 4668:16                              | 4621:16 4622:6                     | 4666:22 4667:19                      |   |
| first 4618:1,12 4619:19              | 4623:18 4641:4                     | 4682:19 4694:14                      |   |
| 4621:24 4635:10                      | 4643:8,24 4644:5,13                | 4714:13 4718:23                      |   |
| 4640:8,13 4642:7,9                   | 4644:15 4646:19,19                 | gives 4701:13                        |   |
| 4642:25 4644:25                      | 4649:19 4650:17,17                 | giving 4671:25 4714:6                |   |
| 4646:15,18 4647:5                    | 4653:12,12,16                      | 4723:22                              |   |
| 4663:22 4676:7                       | 4655:21 4656:2                     | global 4696:15                       |   |
| 4678:23 4679:6                       | 4658:21 4659:3,4                   | <b>go</b> 4617:20 4621:4             |   |
| 4699:6,6 4705:2                      | 4661:12 4665:12                    | 4629:8 4632:1,13                     |   |
| 4718:1 4719:24                       | 4726:15                            | 4633:1,11,25 4638:17                 |   |
| 4725:4 4728:8,9                      | friend 4715:6                      | 4640:17,22 4642:18                   |   |
| 4734:2                               | front 4679:23 4719:21              | 4642:19 4645:14                      |   |
| Firstly 4656:1 4716:15               | frustrate 4708:16                  | 4646:10,12,20 4648:8                 |   |
| five 4655:11 4690:11                 | frustrated 4625:7                  | 4649:15 4650:5,16                    |   |
| 4715:15,17                           | 4627:2                             | 4653:5,10 4657:5                     |   |
| flow 4647:4                          | frustrations 4625:9                | 4663:6 4664:23                       |   |
| flying 4621:1                        | full 4650:11 4654:1,11             | 4666:24 4667:11,24                   | l |
| focus 4617:22                        | fully 4703:13                      | 4671:17,20 4672:1,6                  |   |
| focused 4644:20                      | function 4705:25                   | 4672:17 4673:14                      | l |
| <b>follow</b> 4618:19 4647:24        | functions 4701:7                   | 4676:7,23 4677:21                    | l |
| 4654:8 4726:22                       | fundamentally 4692:15              | 4678:12 4680:8                       | l |
| <b>following</b> 4616:17             | further 4624:22                    | 4681:2,3 4682:4,8,17                 | l |
|                                      | 4643:10 4649:6                     | 4683:14 4685:11                      |   |
| 4638:11 4641:10                      | 1650.2 1661.2 25                   | 1600.00 1601 14                      |   |
| 4657:19 4661:7,20<br>4676:19 4677:21 | 4658:3 4664:2,25<br>4669:17 4676:4 | 4688:22 4694:14<br>4695:22 4696:8,11 |   |

|                                   | Page 5                                   |
|-----------------------------------|--|
| 4697:4 4700:2,4                   | H  |
| 4705:16 4707:13                   | hadn't 4669:15                           |
| 4712:16 4719:21                   | 4674:12                                  |
| 4720:24 4730:21                   | half 4675:1                              |
| oebbels 4674:4                    | halfway 4616:15                          |
| <b>es</b> 4646:20                 | hallmarks 4710:6                         |
| ing 4623:10,13                    | HANABE 4729:21,24                        |
| 4624:6,18,23 4627:25              | hand 4615:23 4678:15                     |
| 4628:8 4632:2,22                  | 4681:24 4690:13                          |
| 4634:21 4645:15                   | 4718:25                                  |
| 4651:23 4654:8                    | handle 4678:13                           |
| 4665:3 4666:13                    | hands 4679:11 4683:2                     |
| 4667:8,23 4672:2                  | 4689:9 4690:10                           |
| 4673:4 4674:25                    | 4707:12,13                               |
| 4675:24 4676:19                   | <b>happen</b> 4670:17                    |
| 4677:3 4678:16,21                 | 4673:16 4677:11                          |
| 4680:1 4683:5,16                  | 4698:13 4702:24                          |
| 4687:17 4690:5                    | 4703:1 4716:12                           |
| 4694:18 4697:6                    | 4717:3,7                                 |
| 4698:7 4703:23<br>4711:24 4712:13 | happened 4618:3                          |
| 4711:24 4712:13<br>4713:6 4714:12 | 4622:1,4 4628:18                         |
| 4715:14,17,20                     | 4629:1,2,21 4630:1                       |
| 4716:12 4726:5,6,14               | 4636:24 4637:3,16,25                     |
| 4727:15 4730:9                    | 4641:7,9,13,23                           |
| 4731:19 4732:8,11                 | 4642:12 4643:9,23                        |
| 4733:13                           | 4644:4,10,12,15                          |
| od 4615:12 4647:25                | 4645:13 4646:4,5<br>4651:21 4652:14      |
| 4673:13 4686:4,18                 | 4653:8 4655:10                           |
| 4729:4                            | 4656:6 4659:3,8                          |
| tten 4621:18                      | 4665:9 4666:2 4668:9                     |
| vernment 4695:21                  | 4668:18,19,21 4669:7                     |
| 4700:3 4705:14                    | 4673:18 4685:3                           |
| 4706:12 4707:4                    | 4698:12 4708:3                           |
| 4726:5 4730:16                    | 4709:3                                   |
| <b>ading</b> 4619:4               | happening 4624:18                        |
| ateful 4663:3 4668:6              | 4627:3 4647:24                           |
| 4728:24,25                        | 4651:19,20 4664:22                       |
| ievances 4672:20                  | 4716:11 4726:4                           |
| ound 4638:25                      | <b>happens</b> 4700:14                   |
| oup 4621:23 4637:4                | happy 4625:22 4660:12                    |
| 4638:3                            | 4684:18,23 4685:3                        |
| ouping 4705:10<br>umpily 4680:20  | 4717:3                                   |
| umpny 4680.20<br>umpy 4680:19     | hard 4619:19                             |
| ard 4653:11                       | harm 4667:5                              |
| ards 4648:3 4649:9                | harshly 4705:7                           |
| 4649:20 4652:5,20                 | hasn't 4645:17                           |
| 4655:21,24 4657:23                | hate 4673:6,7<br>haven't 4618:15         |
| 4662:23                           | <b>naven</b> 7 4618:15<br>4632:19 4647:1 |
| ided 4661:7                       | 4690:15 4702:22                          |
| ides 4691:10                      | 4706:2 4710:16                           |
| <b>y</b> 4631:24                  | 4714:1 4715:9,16                         |
| ys 4628:23 4636:11                | hear 4636:3 4638:24                      |
| 4649:21 4650:23                   | 4639:5,7,11 4642:8                       |
| 4653:10,13,14,18                  | 4642:10 4643:1                           |
| 4657:17,18,20                     | 4644:25 4718:20                          |
| 4686:22                           | heard 4635:2,5,16                        |
| wala 4640:16,23                   | 4640:8 4641:12                           |
| 4641:2,8,11 4643:3                | 4644:18 4651:2                           |
| 4645:19,24 4650:17                | 4653:22 4663:9,14,22                     |
| 4650:22 4651:1                    | 4664:7 4665:1,11                         |
| 4653:7,12,15,17,20                | 4675:16 4709:17                          |
| wede 4726:18<br>xokogxokwana      | 4711:5 4714:13                           |
| кокодхокwana<br>4734:18           | 4715:2                                   |
| T/JH.10                           |  |

4632:3.16 4674:15

4677:18 4697:24

| held 4653:11 4655:4   |  |
|---|--|
| 4656:23,23 4658:12  |  |
| 4659:13 4669:24   | ir                                     |
| 4714:14 4726:16   | ir                                     |
| Hello 4720:13 4723:3  |  |
| 4728:3  | Iı                                     |
| help 4623:13 4688:23  |  |
| 4722:18 4728:4  |  |
| helpful 4653:4 4668:3   |  |
| 4728:14 4733:19   |  |
| hereunder 4726:1  |  |
| hesitate 4662:5   |  |
| he'd 4664:7   |  |
| he'll 4703:23   | ir                                     |
| he's 4620:17 4628:9   | ir                                     |
| 4641:12 4642:14,15  |  |
| 4646:21 4661:10,11  |  |
| 4661:13 4663:9,21   |  |
| 4678:16 4700:21   | •                                      |
| 4703:21,23 4706:24  | ir                                     |
| 4715:14,17,20,22,23   | ir                                     |
| 4717:11 4718:10<br>4725:17,18,20  | ir                                     |
| hiding 4622:9 4623:11   | 111                                    |
| 4623:24 4630:15   | ir                                     |
| 4631:6 4671:14  | ir                                     |
| 4683:14   | ir                                     |
| high 4701:24  | ir                                     |
| higher 4619:2 4717:23   | ir                                     |
| highly 4694:13  |  |
| hikes 4693:18   |  |
| hindrance 4678:3  |  |
| historian 4674:4  |  |
| historical 4651:12  |  |
| historically 4689:13,20   |  |
| 4694:22   | ı                                      |
|   |  |
| history 4661:5 4694:21  |  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2   | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12  | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7  | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24   | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20  | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br><b>home</b> 4650:11 4690:22   | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25  |  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25<br>honest 4707:12  | in                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25<br>honest 4707:12<br>honestly 4710:17  | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25<br>honest 4707:12  |  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6  | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21   | ir                                     |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3   | ir<br>ir<br>ir                         |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21   | ir<br>ir<br>ir                         |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3   | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir                   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18  | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir                   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18  | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir             |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir             |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir       |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18   | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir             |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  I Ian 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15                                   | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  I Ian 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir       |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  I Ian 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15                                   | ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir<br>ir |

| 4656:23,23 4658:12  | 4677:18 4697:24  |
|---|--|
| 4659:13 4669:24   | <b>imagine</b> 4627:9 4679:9   |
| 4714:14 4726:16   | immediately 4655:11  |
| Hello 4720:13 4723:3  | 4701:20  |
|   |  |
| 4728:3  | <b>Impala</b> 4616:16 4617:3   |
| help 4623:13 4688:23  | 4617:4,5 4618:3,23   |
| 4722:18 4728:4  | 4618:23 4632:10  |
|   |  |
| <b>helpful</b> 4653:4 4668:3  | 4651:5,12,21 4652:14   |
| 4728:14 4733:19   | 4653:24 4655:10  |
| hereunder 4726:1  | 4656:4,6,7 4658:14   |
| hesitate 4662:5   | 4706:16 4707:5   |
|   |  |
| <b>he'd</b> 4664:7  | 4708:20 4709:8,19  |
| he'll 4703:23   | implement 4700:22  |
| he's 4620:17 4628:9   | important 4633:19  |
| 4641:12 4642:14,15  | 4636:16 4666:1   |
|   |  |
| 4646:21 4661:10,11  | 4672:15 4680:13  |
| 4661:13 4663:9,21   | 4687:21 4688:1   |
| 4678:16 4700:21   | 4689:21 4730:2   |
|   |  |
| 4703:21,23 4706:24  | impossible 4682:22   |
| 4715:14,17,20,22,23   | 4706:10 4713:1,4   |
| 4717:11 4718:10   | impress 4629:7   |
| 4725:17,18,20   | impression 4647:4  |
|   |  |
| hiding 4622:9 4623:11   | 4677:8   |
| 4623:24 4630:15   | <b>improved</b> 4694:13  |
| 4631:6 4671:14  | inaccurate 4674:1  |
| 4683:14   | inaction 4726:4  |
|   |  |
| high 4701:24  | inactions 4715:20  |
| <b>higher</b> 4619:2 4717:23  | inaudible 4623:22  |
| highly 4694:13  | 4624:20 4636:11  |
| hikes 4693:18   | 4655:13 4657:7,8   |
|   |  |
| hindrance 4678:3  | 4660:17 4677:17  |
| historian 4674:4  | 4678:5 4680:5  |
| historical 4651:12  | 4689:15 4691:9   |
|   | 4702:4 4703:15   |
| historically 4689:13,20   |  |
| 4694:22   | 4707:5 4708:16,24  |
| <b>history</b> 4661:5 4694:21   | 4716:20 4724:11  |
|   |  |
|   | incident 4635:4 15 20  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2   | incident 4635:4,15,20  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12  | 4635:25 4636:5,9   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24   | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br><b>hold</b> 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br><b>home</b> 4650:11 4690:22   | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25<br>honest 4707:12  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br><b>incidents</b> 4630:1  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25<br>honest 4707:12<br>honestly 4710:17  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br><b>incidents</b> 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25<br>honest 4707:12<br>honestly 4710:17<br>honourable 4675:20  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br><b>incidents</b> 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br><b>include</b> 4706:12  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2<br>hold 4678:12 4688:1,12<br>4688:13 4689:7<br>4690:19 4701:24<br>4723:20<br>home 4650:11 4690:22<br>4700:25<br>honest 4707:12<br>honestly 4710:17  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21   | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3   | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3   | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3   | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1<br>increase 4619:23   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3   | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1<br>increase 4619:23   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1<br>increase 4619:23<br>4622:12 4625:11  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1<br>increase 4619:23<br>4622:12 4625:11<br>4629:7 4687:6   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1<br>increase 4619:23<br>4622:12 4625:11<br>4629:7 4687:6<br>increment 4619:2   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1<br>increase 4619:23<br>4622:12 4625:11<br>4629:7 4687:6   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  | 4635:25 4636:5,9<br>4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18<br>4640:25 4644:9<br>4645:1,3 4646:16<br>4661:17 4662:10<br>4665:7 4667:14<br>incidents 4630:1<br>4658:13,20 4673:17<br>include 4706:12<br>including 4630:2,4<br>4636:11 4637:14<br>incomplete 4657:25<br>incorrect 4631:1<br>increase 4619:23<br>4622:12 4625:11<br>4629:7 4687:6<br>increment 4619:2<br>indebted 4702:11   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4   | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18   | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15  | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18   | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  I Ian 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22   | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20   |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 identified 4661:23   | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20 4648:19 4670:1  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 identified 4661:23 identify 4616:11  | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20 4648:19 4670:1 4675:23  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  I Ian 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 identified 4661:23 identify 4616:11 ideology 4691:12  | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20 4648:19 4670:1 4675:23 indicates 4662:25                            |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  I Ian 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 identified 4661:23 identify 4616:11 ideology 4691:12  | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20 4648:19 4670:1 4675:23  |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 identified 4661:23 identify 4616:11 ideology 4691:12 ignorant 4680:14                        | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20 4648:19 4670:1 4675:23 indicates 4662:25 indistinct 4630:16         |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  I Ian 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 identified 4661:23 identify 4616:11 ideology 4691:12 ignorant 4680:14 ignore 4722:7 4733:24 | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20 4648:19 4670:1 4675:23 indicates 4662:25 indistinct 4630:16 4670:13 |
| 4694:23,24 4695:2 hold 4678:12 4688:1,12 4688:13 4689:7 4690:19 4701:24 4723:20 home 4650:11 4690:22 4700:25 honest 4707:12 honestly 4710:17 honourable 4675:20 4676:6 hope 4655:14 4697:21 hoping 4661:3 hospital 4640:3 hour 4727:18 hours 4724:13  Ilan 4732:5 idea 4616:10 4686:4 4727:18 ideas 4699:2 4726:15 identical 4681:22 identified 4661:23 identify 4616:11 ideology 4691:12 ignorant 4680:14                        | 4635:25 4636:5,9 4637:1,3,5,6,10,15,18 4640:25 4644:9 4645:1,3 4646:16 4661:17 4662:10 4665:7 4667:14 incidents 4630:1 4658:13,20 4673:17 include 4706:12 including 4630:2,4 4636:11 4637:14 incomplete 4657:25 incorrect 4631:1 increase 4619:23 4622:12 4625:11 4629:7 4687:6 increment 4619:2 indebted 4702:11 independent 4729:4 indicate 4675:7 4685:23 indicated 4647:20 4648:19 4670:1 4675:23 indicates 4662:25 indistinct 4630:16         |

| industry 4619:4 4678:9                               |
|--|
| 4678:11 4709:24 <b>inference</b> 4656:10,11          |
| 4656:13<br><b>Inferences</b> 4662:1                  |
| inferred 4656:5                                      |
| <b>influence</b> 4692:12<br>4729:7                   |
| <b>influenced</b> 4694:13 <b>info</b> 4637:15        |
| inform 4629:13<br>information 4619:14                |
| 4620:1 4622:3  |
| 4627:10 4628:16,17<br>4636:8 4645:4 4664:5           |
| 4664:9 4665:6,21<br>4669:12 4671:14                  |
| 4709:4   |
| informed 4624:15<br>4629:5 4634:13                   |
| 4655:4 4658:13<br>4661:25 4673:19                    |
| 4683:23 4690:22                                      |
| 4691:1 4712:13<br>informs 4691:16                    |
| ingenuity 4617:1<br>inherent 4694:25                 |
| inherently 4691:13                                   |
| initially 4653:7<br>injured 4667:16,16               |
| 4668:17 4711:20<br>injury 4695:9,9                   |
| <b>innocent</b> 4641:16                              |
| input 4695:23<br>inquiry 4647:19                     |
| 4707:21,21<br>inside 4706:19                         |
| insight 4687:21                                      |
| insignificant 4729:13<br>insinuations 4685:9         |
| insisting 4730:16<br>insists 4731:22                 |
| <b>instance</b> 4693:17                              |
| instigated 4651:3<br>4653:23 4654:13                 |
| 4656:2 4659:15<br>4662:22                            |
| <b>instruct</b> 4713:22 <b>instructions</b> 4676:8,9 |
| 4676:11,11 4685:24                                   |
| <b>instrument</b> 4692:1,6,7 4693:8 4699:23          |
| 4700:16 <b>intend</b> 4661:25 4712:6                 |
| 4712:15  |
| <b>intended</b> 4660:2,7<br>4714:7                   |
| intending 4639:9<br>4659:24                          |
| intention 4692:11<br>interact 4667:7                 |
| interacting 4657:10                                  |
| 4667:1 <b>interaction</b> 4652:15                    |
| 4655:5 4666:10<br>4684:25 4725:25                    |
| 1001.23 T/23.23                                      |

interactions 4655:8 interest 4624:12 4714:2 interested 4659:4 4684:17 interesting 4693:24 **interpret** 4618:18 4734:10 interpreted 4709:15 interpreter 4618:18 4729:19 4733:21 **interrupt** 4643:3,13 4678:25 interrupts 4653:16 **intervene** 4692:16 4726:19 **intervened** 4643:16 intervenes 4693:25 intervention 4728:17 **interview** 4629:17 4632:24 4637:22 4640:9,15,18,20 4642:9 4652:12 4660:23 4662:8 4672:9 interviews 4632:14 **introduce** 4637:20 4687:22 introducing 4615:13 invade 4621:18 4646:2 4662:11 invariably 4695:15 **inverted** 4663:10 investigated 4663:18 4667:13 4668:8,19 4674:13 investigating 4670:15 **investigation** 4665:9,17 4668:22 investigations 4664:2 investing 4697:8 **invite** 4706:6 involve 4714:11 4724:5 **involved** 4626:13 involvement 4661:21 irreconcilable 4691:23 isn't 4623:13,16 4631:2 4641:23 4646:4.6 4651:10 4656:16 4665:17 4669:7 4670:8 4674:13 4676:24 4681:10,14 4708:14 issue 4621:22 4623:12 4629:10 4630:18,21 4630:21 4631:10 4632:6 4642:5 4645:23 4646:9 4668:2 4675:21 4676:8 4677:11,12,13 4678:3 4693:18 4698:18 4704:12 4726:5 4728:16,16 issued 4620:13 4632:9 4633:5 4634:1 4663:19 4664:2

issues 4629:13 4631:19 4636:7 4678:10 4682:10.24 4693:17 4697:25 4698:9 4701:2 4711:23 it's 4615:4,13,24 4616:1,14 4617:10 4618:4,17 4619:8 4627:9 4631:24 4637:11 4638:2 4645:7,18,19 4646:18 4647:8 4651:23 4655:8,22 4656:9 4657:4,5,21 4658:18 4659:1 4662:3,5 4663:7,8 4664:18 4666:15 4668:5 4670:18 4673:4,7,8 4674:19 4681:11,17 4681:23 4682:11 4683:23 4684:1 4690:7,11,11 4691:22 4692:5,6,7,21 4701:15,22,25 4707:1 4710:12 4711:11 4713:14 4718:25 4719:21,25 4721:4 4723:1 4724:13,14,19 4727:2,13 **I'd** 4615:12 4625:13,13 4634:16 4658:5 4663:3 4668:6 4678:15 4680:6 I'll 4680:22 4686:4,6 4705:18 4706:6 4709:10 4711:12,13 4719:11 4724:10 4725:24 4727:22 4729:13 4730:1 4731:5 4733:16 I'm 4675:19,24 4676:19 4678:24 4679:10 4680:4 4682:21 4685:7 4688:8,15,19,23 4689:1,18,19 4690:4 4690:6.14.18.18 4701:17 4702:10 4703:12,22 4704:15 4704:22 4705:2,12 4709:3,4 4711:18,23 4712:2 4713:16,18 4714:12 4715:12 4718:15 4719:15 4721:3,7 4723:9 4724:6 4725:19 4728:22 4729:23 4730:6 4732:23 **I've** 4666:9 4675:6,23 4677:13 4681:9 4703:21 4704:25 4709:18 4710:3,5 4715:15 4716:17 4719:17 4723:18 4727:16 4728:14 4729:9 4734:9

4669:15

#### J ja 4680:4 4686:17 4691:22 4703:25 4709:20 4723:21 4725:23 4733:25 **James** 4726:13.14 **Jameson** 4728:2.2 4729:11 4730:3 4731:2 4732:4 4734:1 **iob** 4619:4,18 **iobs** 4619:2 Johannesburg 4726:8 4732:13 join 4705:11 joint 4726:7 Joseph 4674:4 juice 4669:21 **juncture** 4696:23 June 4615:15 4620:4 4620:22 junior 4664:19 **justice** 4687:23 K **keep** 4718:23 4726:23 4732:14 **kept** 4615:5 4634:13 key 4664:24 4677:7 **Khumalo** 4731:6 kill 4673:6,7,21 **killed** 4627:4 4628:23

4628:24 4630:1,17 4631:7 4632:16 4634:3 4635:3,14,21 4636:4,10 4637:5,6,8 4637:10,14,23,24 4638:12,21 4639:2 4640:2 4649:21 4650:23 4652:2,5 4653:14,17 4655:22 4655:24 4657:3,20,23 4658:1 4659:14 4661:1 4662:13 4663:2,23 4665:22 4666:5,8,9,16 4667:16 4668:17 4673:25 4674:10 4698:15,19 killing 4630:4 4640:7 4646:24 4648:3 4649:9 4652:3 4655:6 4658:21 4659:22.25 4660:15 4661:2 4662:23 4663:13 4664:8 4674:17 4678:10 4684:7 4697:20 killings 4665:14 kin 4631:16 kind 4656:8 4678:6 4699:17 4703:17 knew 4632:25 4634:21 4635:24 4646:4 4662:22,23,25

4699:22 knowing 4626:2 4666:5 **knowledge** 4656:10 4660:23 known 4652:16 4655:7 4657:11 4662:21 knows 4649:4 koppie 4651:16,16,18 4651:20 4657:9 4661:23 4665:25 4666:5,8,13,15 4670:2,4,19,21 4671:21,25 4672:2 4674:8 4676:18 4680:2 4684:16,18 4685:10,12 **koppies** 4678:11

L **labelled** 4683:24 **labour** 4634:4 4690:20 4691:13 4693:17 4694:12 4695:1,14,15 4695:18 4696:3,23 4699:20 4700:8 4701:1,2,5,6,7 4702:9 4702:12,13,17,18,21 4703:2,6,15,16,20 4704:2,10,10 4705:1 4705:23 4707:4 4710:4 4711:8 4713:10 4730:10 4732:8 language 4704:9 lastly 4700:7 late 4622:8,17 4629:9 4640:12 4674:25 latest 4681:11,15,17,19

4701:12 4706:20 lawful 4698:25 laws 4694:10 lay 4697:2 layout 4734:5,7 lead 4691:19 leader 4620:1 4630:6 4657:8 4666:7 4670:18 4677:8 4682:5 4683:2 4684:13 4707:24 4728:2

laugh 4718:19

law 4677:5 4695:11

4697:17 4698:12

4699:25 4700:2

4697:3,6,9,10,12,13

leaders 4622:9 4623:7 4623:19,20 4629:25 4630:2 4667:7 4670:23 4671:5,5 4672:11 4673:22 4683:13,14 4684:8 leadership 4632:24 4636:7,8 4670:3 4671:12 4717:24 4718:6 4719:4,8,9

4724:15

**leading** 4652:17 4661:6 4671:8.17.18 learned 4715:6 learnt 4695:2 leave 4677:8 4681:5 4718:24 **leaving** 4619:5 **Lebogang** 4734:19 **led** 4620:1 4659:15,20 4661:2 4683:22 4693:21 4707:7 4709:4 **left** 4626:21 4634:11 4665:2,12 **legal** 4649:11 4651:9 4668:19,23 4698:22 4698:23 4701:1 legislations 4695:22 lemon 4669:22 Lenin 4691:15,22 4692:1 **Leninist** 4691:8 lesson 4696:8 letter 4725:3 4728:22 4731:10 let's 4621:4 4636:23 4650:13 4678:14 4679:5 4690:12 4699:13 4709:23 4714:10 4715:24 level 4626:10 4677:13 4697:23 4717:23 **lie** 4674:6,6 4682:13 lies 4641:16 4642:11 4644:7 4645:20 4674:8 life 4689:7 light 4678:23 likeliness 4651:20 **limited** 4683:18 4707:11 line 4637:2 4641:9 4643:4 4650:5 4653:3 4663:8 4712:5,23 4730:12 lines 4652:24 link 4666:21 linked 4657:12 **linking** 4688:9 lips 4663:25 listen 4618:15 4657:18 4677:16 4678:8

4671:12.25 **location** 4642:4 lock 4708:23 logic 4695:3 logically 4678:22 long 4618:17 4627:6,15 4676:14 4684:25 4689:15 4697:12 4705:12 longer 4628:1,2 4630:20 **Lonmin** 4624:1,4,5 4628:18 4632:10 4634:11 4637:3 4651:21,24 4656:8,24 4661:20,22 4669:24 4678:6,7 4712:21 4713:7,10 4714:15,23 4715:3,7,20,22 4717:25 4718:6 4719:4,9,10 4723:25 4724:16 4726:4,8 4728:3 4729:12 look 4616:18 4617:25 4622:12 4630:13,18 4634:7 4636:23 4638:6 4657:5,6 4669:18 4673:25 4676:21 4678:14 4680:6 4684:3 4722:13 4729:17 looked 4618:5 4732:20 **looking** 4662:25 4684:3 looks 4730:23 loosely 4681:6 losing 4631:16 4700:5 4715:12 lost 4618:19 4622:11.13 4624:16,16 4630:22 4668:4 4683:13 4698:16 4727:19 lot 4618:14 4623:12 4668:7 4673:22 4712:18 4720:20 louder 4683:1 low 4682:4,8 LRA 4698:1 lunch 4674:23 4727:16 Lungani 4734:19 lving 4645:3 4674:9 M Mabebe 4629:25

#### Mabebe 4629:25 Mabutyana 4734:19 machine 4619:19 Madlanga 4707:24 4708:1 Madoda 4655:11 Mahlangu 4635:11 4639:20 4649:24 4734:23 4735:1 main 4713:8 4714:11 Majola 4690:2 making 4616:24 4642:1 4642:14,15 4650:9 4657:16 4683:16,17

4689:1 management 4618:25 4624:1,4,5,23 4628:21 4634:11 4653:10 4677:17 4678:7 4683:25 4706:16 4728:11 mandate 4676:24 4677:22 4678:1 4713:3 mandated 4624:24 **Mangaung** 4688:3 manner 4626:14 4682:21 4705:15 4730:8 **Mantashe** 4726:18 march 4641:4 4642:2,3 4643:7 4647:6,10 4651:3,25 4652:2,3 4652:17 4653:1,15,23 4654:13,13 4655:7,20 4655:21 4656:1 4657:3,13,21,24 4658:10,16,20 4659:4 4659:15,22 4660:24 4661:2,9 4662:17,22 marched 4640:14 4667:21,22 marchers 4640:2 4642:1 marches 4659:20 4661:5 **marching** 4621:23 4644:23 4645:12 4646:11,11 4663:1 4666:23 4668:11 Marikana 4629:24 4665:13 4697:14.16 4697:21 4698:11,13 4698:14 4699:6 mark 4715:17 4717:1 4719:11 Marx 4691:22 **Marxist** 4691:7 massacre 4697:16 4711:25 4713:8,12 material 4633:17 4676:1

material 4633:17
4676:1

Mathunjwa 4642:11
4644:12 4645:2,17,23
4646:16,18 4647:14
4647:18 4648:1,20,25
4649:2,5 4653:25
4663:7,8,15,25
4664:7 4665:2
matter 4624:12
4630:13 4647:5,6
4663:18 4668:5
4677:15 4683:8
4686:10 4693:19
4726:8,21 4730:24
4731:20
matters 4620:11

4621:3 4632:10 4693:13

mean 4625:22 4626:1

4665:24 4670:2

4684:9 4711:13

4715:13

4641:16

**LLB** 4672:9

**listened** 4714:2

**listening** 4707:17

little 4641:3 4643:6

4644:22 4681:6

lives 4622:10,13,20

4624:15 4630:22

local 4623:7 4628:21

4630:10 4631:25

4632:24 4634:12

4636:7 4667:6

murdered 4630:16

4637:13 4657:13

name 4710:12 4724:5

murders 4636:11

4646:10 4662:11

4626:13 4628:7 4665:11 4690:10 4704:11.13 4706:7 4707:10 4709:11 4713:22 4714:18 meaning 4677:19 4695:20 means 4682:7 4690:11 4692:24 4703:15,22 4704:2,2,18 4706:1 meant 4671:16 4685:15 4687:7 measure 4644:15 measures 4622:12 media 4639:17,18 meet 4623:14,15 4629:9 4631:4 4670:8 4670:24 4671:5 4711:10 4726:12,14 meeting 4624:1,3 4634:11 4652:10 4653:11 4655:5 4669:23,25 4671:4 4685:13 4710:11,11 4710:22 4711:9 4726:16 **meetings** 4678:12 4710:9 4711:7 4714:14 4716:4,7,19 4716:20 4717:1,13,15 4717:20,21 member 4688:2,6,14 4688:20 4693:11 4709:1 members 4623:21,23 4630:15,24 4651:1,17 4653:21 4666:15,16 4667:15 4670:1.3 4671:8 4674:9 4677:3 4677:16 4678:7 4685:1,12 4687:1 4689:13 4697:24 4704:3 4711:10 4714:21 4718:17 4727:12 membership 4719:7 men 4657:25 4658:21 mention 4621:24 4640:13 4666:25 4699:6,7 4700:18 mentioned 4642:9 4646:18 4647:5.7 4716:22 4724:6 message 4626:21 4687:12 4731:8 messed 4659:14 met 4651:17 4715:3 might've 4623:11 Mike 4726:19 mill 4713:20 mind 4627:10 4659:3 4660:17 4685:25 mine 4627:3 4638:11 4647:16 4664:23 4665:3 4683:13,16 4714:24 4716:11

Mines 4726:20.22 4729:10 4731:13 Mineworkers 4694:23 **minimise** 4691:17 mining 4678:11 4706:9 4709:24 minister 4626:3,18,23 4627:7,15 4628:4,14 4628:17,22,25 4629:5 4629:13 4674:5 4675:10,13 4676:3 4701:5 4726:2 4728:9 4729:7 4730:16,19,20 4731:9 4732:12 minutes 4627:14,17 4628:1 4715:15,17 mislead 4687:7 missed 4663:3 mistaken 4683:2 misunderstood 4648:13 4688:9 4717:4 **mitigate** 4693:6 4699:24 **mitigated** 4692:10 **Mlambisa** 4734:18 Mohale 4734:18 Mokoena 4730:4 4731:2 4732:4 **Mokone** 4734:19 moment 4629:17 4630:14,19 4645:15 4664:24 4666:6 4668:1 4675:19 4683:1 4729:18 Monday 4637:2 4638:3 4655:6 money 4681:3 4700:5 morning 4615:12,12 4663:25 4664:13 4665:12 4672:9 4697:5 4701:4 4720:5 4724:14 4727:14,19 4728:5,23 4731:9 4734:25 4735:4 Motlatsi 4726:13 Motlogeloa 4624:17 4625:8 4667:20 Motlogeloa's 4631:23 mountain 4651:16 4657:2 4687:17 **mountains** 4678:13 mouth 4659:2 4660:12 4665:2 move 4623:2 4661:15 4690:12 4696:18 4698:7 4711:12,17 4729:19 moving 4711:16 **Mpembe** 4638:3,10 4669:25 4671:1,19 4687:11,13 Mthethwa 4732:12

names 4670:22 4671:7 4708:1,2 4734:12 4735:1 narrow 4693:12 Nathi 4732:12 **national** 4636:7 4649:22 4652:6 4677:13 4688:2,15 4689:10 4694:23 **NATO** 4703:7 nature 4689:13 Ncube 4730:4 4731:2,3 4732:5 near 4638:22 4640:4 4670:19 necessary 4625:5 4628:15 4633:18 4662:3,5 4716:10 need 4626:17 4629:7 4633:25 4635:8 4642:3 4646:10 4711:6 4714:9 4730:17 **needed** 4671:2 needs 4616:20 4726:10 4728:18 4730:13 **negative** 4623:3,4 negotiate 4620:18 4676:24 4677:18 4712:25 4713:2 negotiating 4684:11 negotiation 4619:24 4620:2 **negotiations** 4618:3.23 4631:20 4684:1 4691:19 4698:25 neighbouring 4700:18 neighbours 4700:5 **neutral** 4692:5 never 4619:6,9,22 4620:16.25 4621:25 4624:24 4649:13 4652:2 4655:6 4657:2 4659:3 4677:8 4682:4 4691:16 4692:18 4697:19,19 4703:1 4705:19,19 4706:4 4708:10,12 4709:12 4709:24 4711:1.5 4712:8 4715:2 4718:5 nevertheless 4672:6 new 4618:8 4619:20 4679:7 4686:10 4701:5 4710:4 news 4648:8,8,17 4732:18 **night** 4630:1 4728:4 Nkosi 4675:11,15 4685:23

non 4631:25 4703:15 nonsense 4644:9 non-strikers 4667:24 non-toxic 4715:23 **non-unionised** 4704:11 non-violent 4633:3 normal 4704:12 note 4616:24 4686:21 4725:25 notwithstanding 4677:25 4683:15 no-one 4673:25 Ntakana 4734:19 **number** 4615:17 4620:10 4630:1 4631:6 4644:11 4645:8 4666:9 4667:21 4673:17 4679:5 4683:13 4695:22 4710:10,12 4713:19 4719:18,20 4719:22,25 4720:4,14 4720:19,25 4721:4,9 4721:10,11,12,24,25 4722:19,22,23 4723:2 4723:6,9,13,16,19 4724:13,19,20,22 4727:24 4729:15,23 4730:2,2,21 4731:18 4731:24 4732:2,22,23 4732:24,24 4734:9 **numbers** 4626:12 4631:14 4650:1 4729:6 NUM's 4619:8 4668:20 Nyala 4676:18 4681:7 Nyanaya 4681:5 4682:6  $\mathbf{o}$ 

oath 4615:7 4675:4 4708:7 obey 4697:17 object 4715:24 **objection** 4671:24 **obliged** 4656:21 observation 4630:6 **observe** 4627:18 **obviously** 4637:19 4648:13 4675:13 4678:21 4724:24 occasion 4714:20 occasions 4644:11 4728:20,21 **occupying** 4696:10 occurred 4621:12 4639:23 4665:7 occurrences 4632:4 occurs 4675:8 offended 4655:15 offer 4728:7 offering 4731:11 office 4621:12,23 4625:15 4626:20,21 4639:23 4640:1,25 4642:4,4 4645:1

4663:23 4667:23 4668:12.15 4683:12 officer 4626:9 officers 4622:18 offices 4621:18 4629:22 4635:4,15 4640:14 4641:5 4642:17,18 4643:8 4645:12 4646:3,8 4647:11 4649:20 4650:20 4653:11,14,16 4657:18 4662:10 4665:8 4667:2 4669:24 4671:24 4684:10 4701:24 4706:17 4707:7 4708:24 **Official** 4729:12 **officials** 4634:13 4661:19,22 4667:6 4730:17 **Oh** 4690:4 4723:1,7,20 4724:21 4728:25 4734:1,1,14 okay 4681:23 4686:14 4687:9,18 4690:17 4691:2,20 4693:23,23 4694:22 4696:18 4698:6 4699:5 4700:12 4701:14 4705:18 4706:4 4711:12 4712:11,17 4722:3,9 4725:23 4729:25 4730:1,22 4731:1 4733:16 old 4679:7 4732:23,24 older 4679:1 once 4670:15 4691:2,20 4696:18 4698:6 4699:5 4705:18 4710:18 ones 4722:11 OO2 4639:13 open 4684:1 **opened** 4640:1 operate 4706:19 4708:22 **operated** 4694:8 operates 4708:25 **operation** 4710:13 operations 4707:8 **operators** 4619:1,23 **opportunity** 4620:22 4634:25 4675:24 4686:7 4687:6 **opposed** 4684:3 4696:24 4703:18,18 oppress 4692:6 oppressed 4693:7 oppression 4692:2 **Oprah** 4717:16 order 4672:16 4674:24 4677:5 4683:8 4686:10 4719:16 organisation 4633:3

Mtyho 4734:20

murder 4630:2

4660:20

noises 4718:19

```
5th February 2013
   4660:24 4682:9
 organisations 4689:16
 organised 4653:1.15
   4654:13 4655:20
   4657:20,24 4660:24
   4661:2,9 4695:10
   4697:6 4702:12,17,20
   4703:5,15,19 4704:10
   4705:1 4713:10
 organises 4660:24
 organising 4659:20
   4707:6
 outside 4703:7,8
 o'clock 4681:1
 o'clock 4674:20
           P
 page 4616:14,15,16
   4617:1 4621:6
   4624:18 4631:23
   4634:8 4635:7 4638:6
   4638:17,22 4639:7,18
   4639:20 4640:22,23
   4643:3 4645:8
   4646:13,20,21
   4649:16,18,24 4650:2
   4650:5,7,14 4651:23
   4651:23 4652:5,25
   4657:5,16 4663:6
   4685:8 4719:18,20,21
   4719:24 4720:10,15
   4721:23 4722:4,5,23
   4723:5,12,13 4725:5
   4725:8 4729:24,25
   4730:15 4732:18
   4733:21
 pages 4616:25 4649:25
 paid 4706:25
 painting 4700:10
 paper 4620:20 4655:10
 paragraph 4616:17,17
   4617:1,3,10,11,12
   4618:1,12,22 4619:7
   4621:7,10,11 4631:23
   4631:23 4634:8
   4639:19 4663:11
   4680:8.9.13.16.16
   4681:20 4682:15
   4724:7
 paragraphs 4617:14,21
   4617:23
 parliamentary 4726:7
 part 4629:14 4648:6,22
   4655:8 4668:20
   4670:3 4683:25,25
```

| 4712:24 4714:23   |
|---|
| 4724:4 4733:18  |
| partly 4696:16  |
| party 4673:1,2 4688:4<br>4688:13,15,16,20   |
| 4689:14 4693:20   |
| 4695:21 4715:7  |
| 4717:24   |
| passage 4616:7,24   |
| 4617:9 4618:17<br>4643:14 4650:4,6,9  |
| 4653:3 4654:1,20  |
| 4655:23 4662:24   |
| 4663:2  |
| <b>Paton</b> 4615:13,25 4616:2 4618:5   |
| Paul 4617:6 4618:2,24   |
| pay 4619:4 4698:21  |
| <b>PB</b> 4688:20,21  |
| peace 4678:9  |
| peaceful 4728:5<br>pen 4726:1   |
| perfect 4678:5 4686:8   |
| <b>period</b> 4630:8 4631:9   |
| 4632:7 4635:17  |
| person 4625:12,24   |
| 4626:2,2,5 4628:13<br>4630:13 4638:20   |
| 4658:12 4659:12   |
| 4673:16 4677:11   |
| 4682:7 4706:24  |
| 4709:3 4718:3,5,8,14  |
| personal 4688:5<br>Personally 4620:25   |
| I disting 1020.23   |
| personnel 4626:7,8,10   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br><b>persuade</b> 4672:12   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br><b>persuade</b> 4672:12<br><b>persuading</b> 4672:17  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3<br>Pillay 4615:17,18,20   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3<br>Pillay 4615:17,18,20<br>4678:20 4679:9,12,16<br>4679:19 4719:12,13<br>place 4623:20 4629:17  |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3<br>Pillay 4615:17,18,20<br>4678:20 4679:9,12,16<br>4679:19 4719:12,13<br>place 4623:20 4629:17<br>4634:14 4635:4,15   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3<br>Pillay 4615:17,18,20<br>4678:20 4679:9,12,16<br>4679:19 4719:12,13<br>place 4623:20 4629:17<br>4634:14 4635:4,15<br>4638:2 4640:9 4695:3                             |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3<br>Pillay 4615:17,18,20<br>4678:20 4679:9,12,16<br>4679:19 4719:12,13<br>place 4623:20 4629:17<br>4634:14 4635:4,15<br>4638:2 4640:9 4695:3<br>4717:13,15,21            |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8 4666:23 4667:1 persuade 4672:12 persuading 4672:17 phase 4694:8 phenomenon 4689:18 Philemon 4729:16 4730:4 4731:3 4732:5 Phillimore 4724:15,18 4724:25,25 4725:15 phone 4621:17 4622:21 4625:1,14 4629:10 phoned 4625:15 4626:18 4630:24 4640:24 4644:13 photographs 4686:25 phrase 4652:25 pick 4669:22 picked 4648:7 piecemeal 4727:3 Pillay 4615:17,18,20 4678:20 4679:9,12,16 4679:19 4719:12,13 place 4623:20 4629:17 4634:14 4635:4,15 4638:2 4640:9 4695:3 4717:13,15,21 4724:10 placed 4651:19   |
| 4628:8 4637:8 4639:8<br>4666:23 4667:1<br>persuade 4672:12<br>persuading 4672:17<br>phase 4694:8<br>phenomenon 4689:18<br>Philemon 4729:16<br>4730:4 4731:3 4732:5<br>Phillimore 4724:15,18<br>4724:25,25 4725:15<br>phone 4621:17 4622:21<br>4625:1,14 4629:10<br>phoned 4625:15<br>4626:18 4630:24<br>4640:24 4644:13<br>photographs 4686:25<br>phrase 4652:25<br>pick 4669:22<br>picked 4648:7<br>piecemeal 4727:3<br>Pillay 4615:17,18,20<br>4678:20 4679:9,12,16<br>4679:19 4719:12,13<br>place 4623:20 4629:17<br>4634:14 4635:4,15<br>4638:2 4640:9 4695:3<br>4717:13,15,21<br>4724:10 |

| planned 4721:2,13                                   |
|---|
| 4729:10 4731:4<br><b>planning</b> 4657:12           |
| 4684:4,5,10   |
| <b>plans</b> 4729:5<br><b>Plat</b> 4728:6           |
| <b>play</b> 4632:25 4665:3                          |
| 4706:20<br>pleading 4697:24                         |
| please 4635:12 4643:19                              |
| 4655:18 4656:18<br>4676:15,20 4680:9,16             |
| 4691:2 4699:9                                       |
| 4707:14 4718:22<br>4729:7                           |
| <b>plus</b> 4637:12                                 |
| <b>pm</b> 4729:15 4730:2,22 4732:3,13 4733:17       |
| 4734:1  |
| <b>point</b> 4631:5 4633:5,8 4642:15,15,23 4644:7   |
| 4645:7,11 4647:12                                   |
| 4650:9,10 4651:13<br>4654:5,6,8,19                  |
| 4655:15,17,19                                       |
| 4657:15 4660:21<br>4661:15 4667:7,21                |
| 4668:6 4669:14,16,19                                |
| 4677:16,23 4678:25                                  |
| 4679:3 4684:5<br>4693:16 4698:18                    |
| 4699:1,14 4703:21                                   |
| 4707:6,16 4709:15<br>4731:15                        |
| <b>pointed</b> 4732:13                              |
| <b>police</b> 4622:12 4625:1,9 4625:11 4626:3,19,24 |
| 4629:7 4630:4 4637:4                                |
| 4637:7 4681:4<br>4682:17,24 4684:19                 |
| 4684:23 4685:6                                      |
| 4698:4 4699:2,7<br>4714:14 4715:1                   |
| 4728:7,18,24 4729:1                                 |
| 4729:5 4732:12<br>policemen 4637:5,23               |
| police/army 4728:21                                 |
| <b>policy</b> 4674:16<br><b>Politburo</b> 4688:18   |
| 4689:10   |
| <b>political</b> 4689:7<br>4695:18 4696:8           |
| 4728:17   |
| poor 4657:8<br>posing 4705:14                       |
| position 4626:16                                    |
| 4628:9 4631:12                                      |
| 4632:12,23 4641:21<br>4669:6 4688:2,13              |
| 4689:8 4696:10,24                                   |
| 4707:10 4713:1 <b>positions</b> 4689:15             |
| possession 4678:17                                  |
| <b>possibility</b> 4624:16<br>4664:1                |
|   |

```
4670:18 4700:11
  4706:3.6 4707:12
possibly 4669:21
  4676:2
power 4662:4,5
  4696:20 4697:7
powers 4696:4,17
precise 4651:16
predict 4698:4
preface 4714:6
prefers 4616:12
preoccupied 4630:3
prepare 4633:8
prepared 4634:22
  4656:14 4672:6
prescribed 4691:15
presence 4622:12
  4625:5 4629:8 4729:5
present 4623:23 4636:7
  4636:10 4644:10
  4647:20,22 4658:16
  4670:11 4696:23
  4705:16 4712:5
  4713:15
presented 4620:2
  4647:4 4665:19
  4668:20 4712:5
president 4629:11
  4635:20 4640:16
  4641:25 4645:10
  4651:3,15 4652:8,10
  4653:22 4657:1,9,10
  4660:22 4681:1,5,6
  4682:4,6 4687:23
  4688:6 4689:23
  4698:14 4700:19
 4706:8 4718:12
  4726:11,13 4732:11
press 4631:10 4632:6
  4633:23,24
pressing 4622:10
pressure 4700:1,2,9
  4732:15
presumably 4633:13
  4633:14 4644:19
  4659:1,2 4661:22
  4663:17 4665:16
  4669:17 4678:22
  4701:20 4721:22
prevail 4624:20 4672:4
prevent 4672:3
previous 4621:12,24
  4622:1 4646:2
pre-empt 4632:22
pre-emptive 4619:5
price 4698:20
primarily 4712:1
primary 4713:8
principal 4714:22
principle 4695:9
principles 4691:1
 4695:8
print 4725:1
printed 4694:22
privately 4670:8,24
pro 4706:24
```

```
probably 4650:5
  4679:10 4703:20
  4731:6
problem 4659:23
  4683:11 4733:10
proceed 4623:4
  4643:19 4644:19
  4669:3 4675:5
  4680:12
proceedings 4615:1
  4648:14 4676:14
  4677:20
process 4619:24
  4647:23 4658:9,12
  4661:4
processes 4631:19
  4678:13 4697:3
  4717:3
produce 4658:8
productivity 4696:12
Professor 4699:21
programme 4658:23
progress 4726:23
promulgated 4701:5
pronounced 4682:6
Propaganda 4674:5
proper 4675:19
properly 4682:7
property 4627:4
proposal 4618:25
  4619:12,13,22 4620:5
  4620:7,7,15,16
  4671:24
proposals 4619:25
  4620:20
proposed 4713:18
proposing 4668:25
  4707:15 4727:2
proposition 4654:11
protection 4728:7
protects 4698:23
protesters 4711:20
prove 4658:11,17
  4668:3 4686:25
  4712:16 4713:16
provided 4677:21
  4678:4 4711:10
provincial 4619:9,11
  4620:6 4625:16
public 4632:12 4718:18
published 4615:14
  4616:3
pulled 4650:25 4653:19
purpose 4714:22
purposes 4714:12
  4715:1
put 4618:25 4620:19
  4632:12 4633:5
  4635:21 4645:1
  4647:1,5,12,16
  4648:1,19 4649:5
  4650:11 4652:12
  4655:15,17 4656:3,9
  4656:22 4657:15
  4659:2 4660:14,21
  4662:10 4668:5,24
```

**plainly** 4730:11

4695:19 4703:6

4724:15 4725:20

4715:21,23,23

participate 4711:2

participated 4710:1

4652:24 4655:1

particular 4616:7,24

4669:22 4690:19

4705:10 4713:23

4722:10 4724:9

**parties** 4678:17

possible 4615:4

| •                        |                            |
|--------------------------|----------------------------|
| 4669:1,4 4672:15         | rank 4625:23 4626:1        |
| 4675:12 4676:1,20        | <b>RDO</b> 4630:10         |
| 4677:17 4681:15          | <b>RDOs</b> 4623:8 4630:25 |
| 4683:4 4685:2,6,23       | reached 4700:23            |
| 4700:1,9,13 4703:24      | 4701:3                     |
| 4705:13 4708:2           | read 4616:11,16            |
| 4712:6,18 4714:4,19      | 4617:21 4618:11,17         |
| 4718:22                  | 4618:18,21 4619:18         |
| puts 4728:8              | 4624:17 4625:7             |
| putting 4660:11          | 4632:23 4645:7             |
| 4693:16 4697:21          | 4650:6,13 4653:2,4         |
| 4698:18 4699:1           | 4654:7,21 4655:23          |
| 4700:2 4703:21           | 4667:10,21 4674:4          |
| 4713:23 4715:6           | 4680:9,10,15,17,18         |
| 4731:7                   | 4680:20,20,22 4682:3       |
| puzzled 4680:12          | 4682:16 4685:7             |
| ranca issues             | 4694:19 4712:8             |
| Q                        | 4724:10 4725:24            |
| <b>QQ2</b> 4634:17,20    | 4727:5,7,22 4728:20        |
| 4636:24                  | 4729:14,14 4733:13         |
| qualified 4698:2         | 4734:9                     |
| qualify 4650:7 4710:9    | reading 4618:16            |
| 4716:8                   | 4662:20,21 4685:11         |
| qualifying 4651:13       | 4725:19 4729:22,23         |
| questioned 4670:12       | readings 4693:3            |
| questioning 4617:19      | reads 4619:7 4728:1        |
| 4712:23                  | 4730:5 4732:3              |
| <b>questions</b> 4632:22 | ready 4617:18              |
| 4634:22 4648:5           | real 4637:15               |
| 4680:12 4685:17          | really 4616:14 4630:21     |
| 4699:9,12 4707:11        | 4637:15 4659:5             |
| 4711:18,19 4712:18       | 4666:8 4701:17             |
| 4714:3 4715:15,16        | 4711:13                    |
| 4727:11                  | reason 4619:24             |
| <b>quibble</b> 4709:22   | 4621:21 4625:10            |
| quick 4733:17            | 4627:25 4632:11            |
| quickly 4616:11          | 4638:13 4644:16            |
| 4725:24 4733:14          | 4659:18 4666:22            |
| quiet 4718:23            | 4667:4,9,9,22              |
| quite 4654:13 4689:7     | 4669:11,18 4671:11         |
| 4691:21 4703:22          | 4672:1,8 4690:18           |
| 4704:11 4714:1           | 4706:6                     |
| 4719:15 4724:4           | reasons 4639:9,10          |
| 4733:17                  | 4665:19 4666:21            |
| <b>quote</b> 4674:4      | 4672:1 4694:5              |
| <b>quoting</b> 4662:15   | recall 4621:9              |
| 4712:19                  | recalled 4633:20           |
|                          | received 4619:14           |
| R                        | 4622:3 4628:18             |
| racist 4694:9            | 4629:15 4646:21            |
| radio 4649:22 4652:6     | 4725:4                     |
| 4658:22 4664:12          | receiving 4630:14          |
| 4728:9                   | recognised 4619:3          |
| railway 4637:2           | 4681:8 4699:22             |
| raise 4624:24 4633:17    | 4710:14 4711:9             |
| raised 4622:21 4629:12   | recognition 4710:8         |
| 4630:6 4631:13           | recommendations            |
| 4670:13 4718:2           | 4699:22                    |
| rojece 4708:24           | record 4618:22 4627:0      |

```
recourse 4706:1
recourses 4706:1
reduce 4620:19
  4624:22
refer 4621:6 4640:20
  4694:7 4724:9
reference 4616:23
  4618:2 4621:11
  4639:22 4661:19
  4700:24
referred 4621:9 4636:9
  4647:8 4651:13
  4655:1 4673:20
  4684:15 4709:17
referring 4624:10
  4628:7 4631:5
  4647:10 4722:10,11
refers 4640:24 4646:16
  4718:3,4
reflected 4728:22
reformists 4693:5
reformulate 4654:21
refused 4684:10
refusing 4683:25
  4685:14 4700:2
regain 4701:3
regard 4652:25
  4654:12 4682:7
  4685:2 4695:23
  4701:24 4716:13
  4732:1
regarding 4714:15
  4717:25
regards 4619:21
  4730:21
regime 4694:11 4710:4
registered 4705:24
regularly 4714:22
reinforce 4733:20
reinstate 4734:10
rejected 4619:8 4620:6
relates 4715:21
relating 4676:2
relation 4618:23
  4661:17 4669:7
  4675:9,12 4676:2
  4701:6 4728:15
relations 4634:4
  4694:12 4699:20
  4700:8 4701:1 4702:9
  4705:23 4710:5
  4711:8
relationship 4688:7
  4690:19 4691:12,23
  4715:8
relatively 4728:4
relay 4687:12
release 4639:17
relevance 4650:10
  4701:20
relevant 4616:20
  4618:22 4624:14
  4633:16 4682:25
rely 4646:7
relying 4639:7
remain 4693:5 4729:2
```

```
remark 4636:15
                         rest 4619:3
remember 4621:13.14
                         restrain 4718:18
  4625:21 4626:1.2
  4686:20 4687:1
  4712:10,12,21
renege 4701:4
repeat 4622:7 4625:25
  4629:4 4648:12
  4651:11 4659:12
  4671:10 4700:25
repeated 4635:12
  4704:18
repeatedly 4674:6
  4706:8
repetition 4656:8
  4722:6 4732:19,19,21
  4733:25
replied 4724:25
reply 4724:25 4725:7
replying 4725:18,20
report 4626:8,25
  4646:21
reported 4619:10
  4716:11
reporter 4643:5
  4644:14
reporters 4641:4
  4643:7
reporting 4636:22
  4643:4 4663:8
reports 4629:23
  4630:14 4637:13
represent 4624:21
  4673:2 4684:12
  4685:5 4710:10,13
  4711:11,20 4713:22
representatives
  4649:11 4651:10
represented 4713:7,7
representing 4712:14
request 4639:14 4676:5
requested 4653:10
  4707:16
required 4626:11
  4711:10
requirements 4628:10
requires 4697:3
resigning 4619:2
resolve 4685:1
resolved 4691:16
  4728:17
respect 4624:21
  4654:10 4669:10
  4697:18 4712:23
respond 4620:13
  4647:6 4713:14
responded 4620:9
responding 4704:20
  4707:2
response 4620:18
```

4621:15 4626:4

4645:19 4685:7

responsible 4648:2

4652:20 4654:25

4659:25

4649:8 4651:8 4652:7

result 4635:3.15 4637:4 resume 4674:23 resumes 4615:2 4675:2 4675:3 4707:21,22 **resuming** 4727:17 retained 4677:6 retract 4652:18,19 4654:24 **retraction** 4687:4,6 return 4728:6 revert 4734:8 revised 4679:1 rid 4709:8 ridiculing 4682:12 Riekert 4699:21 **right** 4618:10 4640:19 4643:2 4674:2,18 4679:19 4687:14 4688:17 4690:17 4691:21 4694:14,15 4697:10 4698:5 4699:3 4700:10 4701:13 4710:15 4714:1,10 4732:1 4734:2 **rights** 4702:8 4707:11 **risk** 4619:1 4622:10 rock 4618:25 4619:23 Roger 4724:14,18 4725:24 4728:13 4729:9,16,18 4730:4 4730:20 4731:3 4732:5,14 role 4632:25 4665:4 4692:10 4694:13 4706:20 roles 4689:16 role-players 4726:1 room 4687:4 rounds 4635:3 route 4662:17 ruling 4688:4 4693:7 4700:16 rumour 4635:2,5,14,17 4636:4 rumours 4636:13,13,17 4636:19,22 run 4622:20 4631:7 4696:7 4705:25 running 4691:21 S **SABC** 4629:12 4663:25 SACP 4689:11 safety 4676:18 4730:19 **SAfm** 4629:16 4632:11 4640:9 4643:5 4644:14 4662:8

record 4618:22 4627:9

4680:23 4684:25

4694:20 4708:2

4709:20 4724:9

recording 4647:3

4729:14

4657:7

4648:6 4680:9,11,17

raises 4708:24

raising 4630:21

4706:15

4682:25 4685:7

Ramaphosa 4718:9

4728:3 4729:16

4723:24 4724:14,24

4730:3 4731:2 4732:4

sake 4658:14 4724:8

sang 4673:22 SAPS 4625:5 4713:7

4714:21

satisfied 4628:11

satisfy 4646:17

| <b>Saturday</b> 4629:22  |
|--|
|  |
| 4635:4,16 4638:11  |
| 4644:1,5,11 4663:2   |
| * *  |
| 4668:9 4673:25   |
| save 4668:7 4709:10  |
| 4710:18 4729:20  |
| saw 4620:25 4648:7,16  |
| 4650:24 4653:19  |
| 4726:24  |
| saying 4620:6,15,16,17   |
| 4622:17 4631:22  |
|  |
| 4632:23 4633:25  |
| 4639:5,7 4645:10,10  |
| 4646:5 4647:7,14,17  |
| 4651:13,25 4655:9  |
| 4657:6,10 4660:25  |
| 4661:1 4663:21,24  |
| 4664:7 4665:25   |
|  |
| 4666:14,16 4667:18   |
| 4670:20,21 4677:18   |
| 4682:23 4685:5,6,9   |
| 4688:11 4689:19  |
| 4690:7 4693:20   |
| 4697:25 4698:2,3,11  |
|  |
| 4698:19 4699:2,3,12  |
| 4699:15 4701:25  |
| 4706:13,21 4707:3  |
| 4710:6 4714:6 4728:9   |
| 4732:23  |
| says 4617:6 4618:24  |
| 4619:7,9 4627:14   |
|  |
| 4638:10,20 4639:25   |
| 4641:2,4 4642:17   |
| 4643:5,7 4646:19,21  |
| 4649:5 4650:22   |
| 4651:1 4653:7,8,9,20   |
| 4653:21 4660:21  |
| 4663:9 4667:4 4668:8   |
|  |
| 4680:7 4685:3  |
| 4687:10 4692:1   |
| 4694:23 4715:2,19  |
| 4722:24 4724:13  |
| 4725:23 4733:19  |
| SC 4643:22 4644:1  |
| 4652:21,23 4654:3,6  |
|  |
| 4654:10,17 4661:18   |
| 4675:18 4676:5,12  |
| 4687:12 4714:19  |
| 4715:5,11 4722:16  |
| scarcely 4673:7  |
| scenario 4656:25   |
| 4699:24 4705:8   |
|  |
| 4708:21 4709:6   |
| scene 4622:7,19 4626:8   |
| scheduled 4615:6   |
| second 4639:18,19  |
| 4658:21 4662:12  |
| 4667:5 4703:20   |
| 4728:23  |
|  |
| secondary 4713:11  |
| 1 1715·19 1716·7   |
| 4715:18 4716:2   |
| secondly 4656:2  |
|  |
| secondly 4656:2<br>4716:16   |
| secondly 4656:2<br>4716:16<br>secretary 4619:9,11                    |
| secondly 4656:2<br>4716:16<br>secretary 4619:9,11<br>4620:15 4651:17 |
| secondly 4656:2<br>4716:16<br>secretary 4619:9,11                    |

| 4726:18                                      |
|--|
| section 4670:16                              |
| 4674:20<br><b>sector</b> 4706:9              |
| security 4624:17                             |
| 4625:8 4626:9,15<br>4628:23 4631:24          |
| 4628:23 4631:24 4636:10 4638:11              |
| 4639:8 4648:3 4649:9                         |
| 4649:20,21 4652:5,20                         |
| 4653:10,13,14<br>4655:21,24 4657:17          |
| 4657:18,19,23,25                             |
| 4658:21 4662:23<br>4666:23 4667:1            |
| 4683:16 4714:23,24                           |
| 4730:5,19 4731:3                             |
| 4732:6<br><b>see</b> 4616:15,19,25           |
| 4617:17 4618:1,9                             |
| 4633:6,10 4638:15,16                         |
| 4638:22 4640:23<br>4641:7,13,14,18           |
| 4651:5,6 4663:4,10                           |
| 4669:2,18 4674:19                            |
| 4678:2 4681:7,23<br>4685:3 4686:15           |
| 4722:7 4725:20,21                            |
| 4726:10,24 4727:2,25                         |
| seeing 4679:10<br>seeks 4697:20              |
| seen 4620:4 4632:19                          |
| 4695:10 4702:22                              |
| 4703:1 4705:19,19,20<br>4706:2,4 4709:12,12  |
| 4709:18,25 4710:13                           |
| 4710:16,20 4711:1<br>4715:16                 |
| Semenya 4687:10,12                           |
| 4712:18 4713:9                               |
| 4716:3<br><b>Semenya's</b> 4712:23           |
| sending 4725:17                              |
| senior 4628:8 4631:3                         |
| 4651:24 4660:14,16<br>4661:22 4696:10        |
| 4717:24 4718:5                               |
| 4719:4,7,8 4724:15                           |
| 4728:2<br>sense 4665:16                      |
| sent 4724:13,14,24                           |
| 4725:15 4730:21                              |
| <b>sentence</b> 4618:11 4657:5,21,22 4663:11 |
| 4682:15,16                                   |
| <b>Senzeni</b> 4615:10<br>4681:1 4726:11     |
| 4081:1 4720:11<br>sequence 4675:6            |
| series 4699:12                               |
| serious 4619:13<br>seriously 4619:9          |
| 4620:8                                       |
| session 4726:7                               |
| sessions 4716:9<br>set 4661:15 4714:10       |
| 4710.2                                       |

```
setting 4669:6
severe 4697:13
SG 4718:11
Shabangu 4723:19
  4726:3 4730:20
  4732:7
shaft 4650:25 4653:20
she's 4627:24 4644:17
  4659:5,7 4660:16
  4675:15 4679:6
shootings 4715:18
shop 4623:15,19
  4624:19 4628:21
  4697:23 4705:9
  4708:25
short 4627:20,21,22
  4682:20 4696:1
  4699:11 4724:3
  4727:16 4733:16
shortcut 4677:9
shorten 4676:14
shot 4638:12,21
  4646:22 4663:11
  4666:16
shots 4667:14 4668:15
should've 4624:4,7
show 4623:17 4632:19
  4648:7
showed 4623:18
showing 4642:2
shown 4656:24 4666:9
  4667:6 4672:25
  4686.25
shows 4632:2 4633:2
  4684:17 4701:6
Sibiya 4731:12
side 4669:16 4692:16
siding 4692:19
Sidumo 4689:23
Sidwell 4619:8
sign 4717:4
signed 4677:14 4678:6
silence 4726:3
similar 4618:4
Simphiwe 4678:16
simple 4632:5 4658:19
  4677:23 4691:3
  4716:18
simply 4617:22
  4689:19 4701:14
  4716:25 4717:12
  4718:22
singing 4673:6 4683:1
sir 4620:3 4623:15
  4625:14 4630:23
  4631:21 4632:5,19
  4634:6,25 4635:24
  4638:1,24 4642:7
  4645:17,25 4646:13
  4647:12 4648:18
  4649:7 4652:4,18
  4661:8 4663:7
  4666:12 4673:23
  4674:11 4680:17
```

```
4696:11 4728:11
SITA 4688:24
site 4728:25 4729:1
Sithembele 4734:19
sits 4689:20,23 4690:6
sitting 4678:11 4685:10
  4689:14 4690:8
  4710:22
situation 4625:20
  4626:7 4627:3,16
  4629:5 4631:8 4665:4
  4666:15 4670:15,18
  4671:13 4672:3,6
  4673:8 4692:12,25
  4694:11,16 4699:15
  4700:10,14,25
  4701:10 4702:22
  4705:12,17,20
  4708:10,12,20
  4709:25 4710:20
  4711:1 4717:25
  4728:18 4730:5,14
  4731:3 4732:6
situations 4697:14
skilled 4619:1,21
skills 4625:5
skip 4723:13
sledging 4716:17
sleep 4661:6
slowly 4616:12 4719:23
smacks 4658:13
smaller 4682:7
snippets 4648:8,17
social 4692:7
solid 4656:13
solidarity 4695:5
solution 4624:7 4683:8
solve 4659:23 4733:10
somebody 4626:21
  4731:16
song 4673:22
songs 4683:24
soon 4665:11 4666:1
sooner 4671:15
sorry 4624:8 4627:13
  4633:14 4634:19
  4641:11 4643:3.13
  4648:11 4650:17
  4654:16 4660:8
  4664:16 4672:10
  4674:3 4678:24
  4682:4 4688:8 4704:8
  4704:21 4705:7
  4707:10 4710:16
  4714:15 4721:3
  4722:5,6 4723:21
  4724:17,22 4728:20
  4729:23 4730:22
sort 4650:11 4679:5
  4715:10 4728:11
sorts 4698:10
sought 4732:22
sounded 4660:1
South 4688:13,14,19
  4689:19 4696:21,22
so-and-so 4706:24
```

```
so-called 4681:6
space 4706:23 4724:3
speak 4625:19 4696:3
  4698:21 4700:21
  4732:14
speaking 4638:10
  4649:19 4663:8
  4681:7 4707:2
  4726:17
specific 4676:8 4707:5
specifically 4706:16
speed 4616:12
spend 4662:24
spending 4623:12
spent 4622:11 4668:2
spoke 4625:21,21,24
  4626:2 4628:12
  4641:3 4643:5,6
  4644:14,14 4646:1
  4647:9 4661:24
  4669:25 4726:11
spokesperson 4731:6
spot 4640:2
springboard 4668:24
stabbed 4650:24
  4653:18
stabilised 4728:18
stadium 4642:2,5,17,19
  4643:15 4645:12
  4646:8 4653:12
  4668:12
stadiums 4678:12
stage 4662:7,8,25
  4663:5,17 4664:9,10
  4666:1 4674:12
  4675:1,19,22 4686:1
  4686:17 4687:17
  4706:12
stages 4694:7
stance 4634:2
stand 4632:2 4633:3
  4647:8 4702:18
  4703:2
standing 4673:19
stands 4697:2
stapled 4719:16
start 4615:12 4617:19
  4673:5 4674:25
  4686:21 4715:16
  4733:17
started 4635:14 4669:5
starting 4727:14
state 4690:20 4691:25
  4692:1,5,5,7,12,19
  4693:6,8,13 4694:3,9
  4695:14 4696:4,24
  4699:15 4700:14,15
  4700:15 4701:15,22
  4702:1,6,7,17
  4703:19 4704:24
  4712:1 4713:6
  4714:12,23 4715:22
stated 4726:17
statement 4621:6
  4624:17 4625:7,17
  4631:11,13,24 4632:6
```

4719:3

4716:20

sit 4658:15 4689:9

| ·  |   |  |   | Page  |
|--|---|--|---|---|
| 4632:19 4633:10  | strong 4691:18 4692:11  | 4709:3,4 4712:2  | 4711:23   | thereon 4704:25   |
| 4634:8 4637:22   | stronger 4696:4   | 4713:16,18 4719:15   | tells 4673:22   | there's 4616:19   |
| 4639:18,19 4640:7  | structure 4669:13   | 4728:23 4731:14,14   | tend 4620:11  | 4633:10,16 4639:22  |
| 4651:24 4652:19  | structured 4705:23  | surely 4624:3,7  | tenet 4673:15   | 4644:23 4652:14   |
| 4656:1,15 4657:24,25   | structures 4623:18  | 4630:23 4641:20  | tension 4692:15   | 4661:16 4663:10   |
| 4658:2,17 4661:11,13   | 4628:7 4682:25  | 4665:6 4670:6  | termed 4712:1   | 4666:25 4669:19   |
| 4663:19 4664:2   | 4689:21 4699:25   | surprise 4708:5  | terms 4625:4 4626:14  | 4670:17 4675:11   |
| 4667:1,10,20,21  | struggle 4694:24,24   | surprised 4646:24  | 4637:25 4642:25   | 4676:21 4688:7  |
| 4669:6,13,15 4670:12   | struggling 4701:18  | 4663:13  | 4643:15 4691:12   | 4692:4 4700:8   |
| 4671:22 4678:15,18   | stuck 4693:17   | survival 4695:1  | 4694:10,10 4697:7   | 4701:12 4702:16   |
| 4678:18 4679:1,2,23  | <b>studies</b> 4693:3   | Susan 4723:19 4726:2   | 4710:9  | 4705:5 4706:1   |
| 4679:25 4680:8   | studio 4664:12 4665:2   | 4732:7   | terrible 4730:9   | 4720:20 4725:3  |
| 4681:12,25 4682:3,12   | studios 4663:25   | suspect 4718:25  | terribly 4668:3   | they'd 4623:24 4630:25  |
| 4683:11 4685:8,11,15   | 4665:13   | suspension 4700:21   | test 4617:1   | 4631:1 4656:3   |
| 4697:20,22 4698:9  | study 4633:15   | sustain 4729:5   | testified 4716:5  | they're 4616:25 4644:8  |
| 4709:11 4726:6   | style 4651:4 4653:23  | sustaining 4729:2  | thank 4615:21 4616:6  | 4656:4 4666:23  |
| <b>statements</b> 4632:9,13  | 4656:3  | sweetheart 4708:13,15  | 4634:6 4644:21  | 4672:24 4680:13   |
| 4633:5,14,15 4669:10   | <b>subject</b> 4644:10 4730:5   | <b>system</b> 4683:25 4693:9   | 4654:17 4656:19   | 4710:7  |
| 4673:19 4684:22  | 4731:3 4732:6   |  | 4675:17 4676:12   | they've 4653:23   |
| states 4654:14   | submission 4665:19  | T  | 4685:16,18,19,21  | 4661:23 4668:19,20  |
| stayed 4634:12   | subpoenaed 4707:25  | table 4618:25 4619:10  | 4686:17 4687:14   | thing 4618:9 4651:4   |
| step 4619:3  | subpoenas 4707:25   | 4620:8   | 4689:4,4,17 4691:6  | 4653:4,24 4656:4  |
| steps 4622:4 4623:6  | 4734:15,24  | tabled 4620:17   | 4692:14 4702:10,15  | 4662:12 4667:5  |
| 4624:14 4628:15  | subsequently 4637:19  | take 4623:20 4628:15   | 4707:20 4711:16   | 4672:11 4682:3  |
| 4629:21 4666:17  | success 4699:17   | 4632:3 4634:7,16,25  | 4716:1,21 4717:18   | 4692:4 4699:13  |
| 4683:6   | successful 4726:16  | 4635:10 4636:20,24   | 4719:10,14 4721:1,6   | 4704:25   |
| <b>steward</b> 4624:19   | sufficed 4691:7   | 4639:12 4645:14  | 4721:12 4723:6,8  | things 4620:19 4639:15  |
| 4708:25  | <b>suggest</b> 4648:24  | 4649:6 4650:4 4660:1   | 4724:12 4725:13,19  | 4655:25 4660:24   |
| stewards 4623:15,19  | 4678:21 4679:20   | 4662:18 4666:17  | 4725:24 4727:1,20   | 4662:9 4668:10  |
| 4628:21 4671:4,25  | 4696:2 4711:13  | 4675:15 4687:5   | 4728:3,25 4729:13   | 4671:2 4672:18  |
| 4697:23  | 4726:18 4727:7,21   | 4690:24 4695:5   | 4730:5,7 4731:4,15  | 4673:10 4677:7  |
| stood 4632:15  | 4731:5  | 4707:15,19 4717:21   | 4731:16 4732:2  | 4680:19 4697:11   |
| stop 4619:5 4654:11  | suggested 4624:4  | 4720:7 4729:2  | 4733:3,12,16 4734:11  | 4698:12,12 4705:9   |
| 4661:17 4664:25  | 4726:9  | taken 4624:15 4628:12  | 4734:17,20 4735:1   | 4706:15 4716:14   |
| 4672:23 4693:23  | suggesting 4666:13  | 4640:3 4671:18   | Thankfully 4728:4   | 4723:24 4727:3  |
| 4697:8   | 4717:9  | 4695:18 4706:25  | thanks 4665:18 4677:1   | 4729:8  |
| stopped 4653:3   | suggestion 4619:6   | takes 4643:10 4669:17  | 4686:14 4704:7  | <b>think</b> 4615:7 4616:21   |
| 4723:22  | 4644:13 4660:6  | talk 4664:24 4683:20   | 4705:22 4721:18   | 4618:13,16,17   |
| straight 4673:24   | 4685:23 4686:2,22   | 4686:1 4728:12   | 4722:1,2,24 4723:16   | 4619:15 4620:17   |
| strength 4695:2,4  | summarise 4664:5  | 4729:7,9   | 4725:9 4727:22  | 4623:2,9 4624:19  |
| strictly 4657:15   | <b>Sunday</b> 4634:11 4646:1  | talked 4640:24   | 4729:11,16 4731:16  | 4626:11 4627:19   |
| strike 4623:8 4630:10  | 4649:9 4655:22  | talking 4635:17 4644:9   | 4733:19   | 4628:9 4636:14,19   |
| 4632:1,3 4655:12   | 4658:22 4659:1,5,8  | 4645:9 4663:4  | that's 4615:9 4616:25   | 4637:21 4641:17   |
| 4660:21 4670:3,23  | 4659:22,25 4661:13  | 4666:12 4682:20  | 4617:16 4618:10   | 4644:7 4646:25  |
| 4671:9,18 4674:15  | 4662:24   | 4729:17  | 4627:4 4628:22  | 4647:2 4649:1 4650:3  |
| 4677:18 4684:19,25   | sung 4683:24  | talks 4618:24 4644:12  | 4633:17,19 4640:19  | 4650:4 4651:23  |
| 4694:14 4697:10,25   | support 4651:22   | Tandigai 4730:4  | 4642:17,23 4643:2,10  | 4652:7,11 4656:12   |
| 4698:16,22,25  | 4692:7 4729:9 4731:8  | 4731:2 4732:5  | 4644:7 4649:1   | 4658:25 4660:20   |
| 4700:10,22 4701:13   | supports 4656:16  | tea 4707:16,19,23  | 4650:17 4654:1  | 4661:13 4669:9  |
| 4705:16 4712:25  | <b>suppose</b> 4692:7   | team 4668:19,23  | 4657:14 4658:1  | 4670:10 4674:22   |
| 4714:15 4715:4   | supposed 4645:14  | technically 4725:14  | 4659:6 4660:7,7   | 4679:3,10 4680:10,19  |
| striker 4639:10  | 4647:11 4662:17   | Teke 4726:19   | 4664:8 4668:18,24   | 4682:2 4683:20  |
| strikers 4632:1 4637:5   | 4665:12 4669:13   | telephoned 4643:4  | 4679:13,17,19,20  | 4686:3,12 4687:4,5  |
| 4637:10 4639:2,5,9   | 4671:13 4683:20   | television 4647:23   | 4680:13 4686:3  | 4687:22 4690:1  |
| 4642:1 4646:22   | 4698:21 4706:20   | 4648:15  | 4687:15 4701:4  | 4696:13,14 4700:23  |
| 4652:15 4655:6,11  | supposing 4666:4  | tell 4616:20 4625:8,14   | 4703:20 4704:15   | 4701:7 4703:11,15,20  |
| 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1  | sure 4624:22 4627:15  | 4628:25 4641:16  | 4707:9 4710:15  | 4704:2,14 4706:3,14   |
| 4663:1 4664:24   | 1607.00 04 4600 14  | 4645:20 4648:18  | 4714:25 4715:6  | 4708:2,4 4713:13,15   |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22   | 4627:23,24 4628:14  |  | 4710.04 4700 0 4 11   | 4712.17.20 4716.7   |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15  | 4632:18 4634:22   | 4653:8 4661:21   | 4719:24 4720:3,4,11   | 4713:17,20 4716:7   |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15<br>4667:19,24 4670:16  | 4632:18 4634:22<br>4637:11 4644:16  | 4653:8 4661:21<br>4662:19 4676:10  | 4720:12,13,19 4721:9  | 4725:8 4728:20,21   |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15<br>4667:19,24 4670:16<br>4671:6,16,20 4672:12  | 4632:18 4634:22<br>4637:11 4644:16<br>4660:17 4664:23   | 4653:8 4661:21<br>4662:19 4676:10<br>4689:2 4703:13  | 4720:12,13,19 4721:9<br>4721:14 4722:5  | 4725:8 4728:20,21<br>4731:15 4732:18  |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15<br>4667:19,24 4670:16<br>4671:6,16,20 4672:12<br>strikes 4631:18   | 4632:18 4634:22<br>4637:11 4644:16<br>4660:17 4664:23<br>4670:13 4672:16,25   | 4653:8 4661:21<br>4662:19 4676:10<br>4689:2 4703:13<br>4718:16   | 4720:12,13,19 4721:9<br>4721:14 4722:5<br>4723:13 4725:11   | 4725:8 4728:20,21<br>4731:15 4732:18<br><b>thinking</b> 4713:21   |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15<br>4667:19,24 4670:16<br>4671:6,16,20 4672:12<br>strikes 4631:18<br>4632:17 4684:4   | 4632:18 4634:22<br>4637:11 4644:16<br>4660:17 4664:23<br>4670:13 4672:16,25<br>4675:19 4682:21  | 4653:8 4661:21<br>4662:19 4676:10<br>4689:2 4703:13<br>4718:16<br><b>telling</b> 4625:6 4641:12  | 4720:12,13,19 4721:9<br>4721:14 4722:5<br>4723:13 4725:11<br>4731:5,15 4734:4   | 4725:8 4728:20,21<br>4731:15 4732:18<br>thinking 4713:21<br>third 4617:1 4682:15  |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15<br>4667:19,24 4670:16<br>4671:6,16,20 4672:12<br><b>strikes</b> 4631:18<br>4632:17 4684:4<br>4685:1 4694:11                                  | 4632:18 4634:22<br>4637:11 4644:16<br>4660:17 4664:23<br>4670:13 4672:16,25<br>4675:19 4682:21<br>4683:16,17 4688:8                   | 4653:8 4661:21<br>4662:19 4676:10<br>4689:2 4703:13<br>4718:16<br><b>telling</b> 4625:6 4641:12<br>4641:18 4642:11                     | 4720:12,13,19 4721:9<br>4721:14 4722:5<br>4723:13 4725:11<br>4731:5,15 4734:4<br><b>Thembinkosi</b> 4734:20                         | 4725:8 4728:20,21<br>4731:15 4732:18<br>thinking 4713:21<br>third 4617:1 4682:15<br>Thomas 4675:11,15,18                      |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15<br>4667:19,24 4670:16<br>4671:6,16,20 4672:12<br><b>strikes</b> 4631:18<br>4632:17 4684:4<br>4685:1 4694:11<br><b>striking</b> 4637:4 4638:3 | 4632:18 4634:22<br>4637:11 4644:16<br>4660:17 4664:23<br>4670:13 4672:16,25<br>4675:19 4682:21<br>4683:16,17 4688:8<br>4689:1 4690:19 | 4653:8 4661:21<br>4662:19 4676:10<br>4689:2 4703:13<br>4718:16<br><b>telling</b> 4625:6 4641:12<br>4641:18 4642:11<br>4644:7 4645:8,19 | 4720:12,13,19 4721:9<br>4721:14 4722:5<br>4723:13 4725:11<br>4731:5,15 4734:4<br><b>Thembinkosi</b> 4734:20<br><b>theory</b> 4716:8 | 4725:8 4728:20,21<br>4731:15 4732:18<br>thinking 4713:21<br>third 4617:1 4682:15<br>Thomas 4675:11,15,18<br>4676:5,12 4685:23 |
| 4665:25 4666:10,22<br>4666:25 4667:4,7,15<br>4667:19,24 4670:16<br>4671:6,16,20 4672:12<br><b>strikes</b> 4631:18<br>4632:17 4684:4<br>4685:1 4694:11                                  | 4632:18 4634:22<br>4637:11 4644:16<br>4660:17 4664:23<br>4670:13 4672:16,25<br>4675:19 4682:21<br>4683:16,17 4688:8                   | 4653:8 4661:21<br>4662:19 4676:10<br>4689:2 4703:13<br>4718:16<br><b>telling</b> 4625:6 4641:12<br>4641:18 4642:11                     | 4720:12,13,19 4721:9<br>4721:14 4722:5<br>4723:13 4725:11<br>4731:5,15 4734:4<br><b>Thembinkosi</b> 4734:20                         | 4725:8 4728:20,21<br>4731:15 4732:18<br>thinking 4713:21<br>third 4617:1 4682:15<br>Thomas 4675:11,15,18                      |

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

4712:24 4716:14

volatile 4666:15

| 4643:14 4648:9                        |
|---------------------------------------|
|                                       |
| 4656:7 4662:22                        |
| 4669:20 4671:23                       |
| 4679:18 4701:24                       |
| 4704:9 4707:1 4717:8                  |
| 4732:18                               |
| threat 4627:4                         |
|                                       |
| threatened 4633:1                     |
| 4677:6                                |
| three 4637:5,9,11                     |
| 4668:24 4677:12                       |
| 4689:20 4695:14                       |
| 4696:21 4702:23                       |
| 4706:13 4709:16                       |
|                                       |
| 4732:13                               |
| threshold 4711:10                     |
| thrice 4717:22                        |
| <b>Thursday</b> 4727:17               |
| <b>till</b> 4617:8 4675:1             |
| time 4615:6 4619:20                   |
|                                       |
| 4620:5 4622:10,11                     |
| 4623:12 4633:16                       |
| 4634:19 4640:8,14                     |
| 4641:21 4642:8,9,25                   |
| 4642:25 4644:25                       |
| 4645:18 4646:5,15,18                  |
| 4647:5 4659:13                        |
| 4662:24 4663:22                       |
|                                       |
| 4668:2,7,22 4671:18                   |
| 4674:21 4678:10                       |
| 4682:20 4698:7                        |
| 4705:2 4708:20                        |
| 4709:10 4716:10                       |
| 4723:24 4724:3                        |
| 4727:4,5 4729:8,20                    |
| 4732:17 4734:2                        |
| times 4647:3 4732:20                  |
| <b>Tip</b> 4652:21,22,23              |
|                                       |
| 4654:3,6,10,17                        |
| 4687:22 4714:19                       |
| today 4694:22 4726:8                  |
| 4728:9 4731:5,7                       |
| <b>told</b> 4621:16 4627:1,5          |
| 4630:25 4643:17                       |
| 4645:25 4674:6,6,8                    |
| 4677:10 4680:4                        |
|                                       |
| 4685:12 4693:4                        |
| 4714:1 4726:3,9,15                    |
| 4734:23                               |
| tollgates 4693:19                     |
| <b>Tom</b> 4708:13,15                 |
| tomorrow 4727:11,14                   |
| 4727:17 4731:9                        |
| 4727:17 4751:9                        |
|                                       |
| top 4638:22 4640:23                   |
| 4650:7,14 4652:4,25                   |
| 4719:22 4720:25                       |
| 4721:5 4723:6,15,23                   |
| 4732:22 4733:2,22,24                  |
| touch 4634:12                         |
| Town 4721:7 4723:9                    |
| 4726:6,9 4730:6                       |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |
| 4732:7                                |
| toxic 4712:1 4715:8,21                |
| 4715:22                               |
| <b>trade</b> 4624:5 4677:2            |
|                                       |
|                                       |

| 4691:18 4692:11,15                                     |
|--|
| 4693:4,12 4695:3,8                                     |
| 4696:11 4697:8<br>4699:22 4705:5,11                    |
| 4709:23 4710:25  |
| <b>trained</b> 4682:9<br><b>training</b> 4626:16       |
| 4693:4   |
| <b>transcript</b> 4638:2<br>4640:19 4644:22            |
| 4646:17 4662:20,21                                     |
| 4663:7<br><b>transferred</b> 4709:3                    |
| transit 4684:16  |
| translated 4681:6                                      |
| <b>tried</b> 4623:17 4676:13 <b>tripartite</b> 4702:16 |
| <b>triple</b> 4615:19 4679:15                          |
| <b>true</b> 4636:20 4642:18<br>4647:23 4657:21         |
| 4672:23 4676:24  |
| 4701:11  |
| <b>trust</b> 4672:19,24<br>4673:5,8,10 4730:19         |
| trusted 4628:13  |
| <b>trusts</b> 4673:17<br><b>truth</b> 4636:14 4641:18  |
| 4645:9 4647:10   |
| 4653:8,9 4661:4  |
| 4665:21 4674:6,7,12<br>4674:14,18 4677:9               |
| 4684:24 4713:18  |
| <b>try</b> 4655:15,17 4664:15 4672:6,18,18,18,19       |
| 4673:4 4718:18,22                                      |
| trying 4622:11 4630:3                                  |
| 4659:5,7 4661:12<br>4666:19 4670:11                    |
| 4689:5 4699:10   |
| 4700:22 4704:15<br>4718:16                             |
| Tuesday 4640:4   |
| turn 4627:4  |
| <b>turned</b> 4621:2 4678:23 <b>TV</b> 4648:10         |
| Twala 4636:12  |
| twice 4715:3 4717:13                                   |
| 4717:20,22<br>twice-a-day 4714:14                      |
| 4716:4,19  |
| <b>two</b> 4617:14,21,23 4624:15 4626:7                |
| 4628:23 4630:4   |
| 4635:3,14,21 4636:4                                    |
| 4636:10 4637:5,7,12<br>4637:23 4638:13,21              |
| 4639:2 4649:9,21                                       |
| 4652:5,20,24 4653:14<br>4655:25 4657:18,19             |
| 4657:22 4658:19,19                                     |
| 4659:20 4662:9   |
| 4665:22 4667:15<br>4668:16,17 4672:18                  |
| 4672:19 4673:10  |
| 4677:12 4688:7,9<br>4696:5 4708:12                     |
| +070.3 4700.14   |

```
4727:3 4728:7.8.14
  4732:10.19 4733:15
two-vear 4676:21
  4677:25 4678:3
typically 4694:2,3
T-shirts 4640:1
          U
un 4650:10
unable 4631:7
Uncle 4708:13,15
undermine 4634:4
understand 4622:16
  4624:9 4631:8 4633:9
  4642:4,15,21 4650:9
  4651:19 4652:9
  4653:6 4656:1
  4659:24 4663:20
  4664:21 4665:5
  4667:3 4668:6 4680:3
  4687:20 4701:18,19
  4702:23 4703:8,13,14
  4704:2 4705:3,5
  4708:9 4711:7
  4714:17 4716:12
  4717:7 4730:17
understanding 4643:17
  4656:6 4677:10
  4692:22 4703:12
understood 4705:2
  4712:23
undesirable 4699:14
  4701:15,22,25
  4702:12 4704:24
unemployed 4705:7
unfinished 4657:6
unfolded 4730:10
unforeseeable 4615:3
unfortunate 4698:15
unfortunately 4620:12
  4627:8 4632:21
  4639:6 4640:6 4712:4
  4727:19 4731:17
  4732:17
unfounded 4631:6
union 4631:8.14.15
  4632:10 4636:18.21
  4652:8.14 4655:12
  4657:8 4673:15,16,21
  4677:2 4682:5 4693:4
  4694:23 4703:17
  4704:4,5 4705:10,21
  4705:21 4706:22,22
  4708:11,13,15,17
  4709:2,7,18,19,21
  4710:7,14,20,22
  4712:20 4726:14
unionised 4703:16
unionist 4704:8
  4709:23 4710:25
unions 4624:5,9,11,19
  4624:19,23 4625:12
  4677:2 4682:11
  4691:18 4692:11,15
  4693:4,12 4695:3,8
```

```
4699:19.22 4705:5.6
  4705:11.14.24
  4708:13 4710:1,9
  4711:2,8 4714:15
  4715:3 4728:11
unique 4687:21 4689:7
  4692:13
unity 4695:2
unnumbered 4616:25
  4617:1
unorganised 4702:13
  4702:17,22 4703:2
  4704:2,10 4705:7
unrest/destabilisatio...
  4728:16
unsatisfactory 4626:5
unsigned 4681:11
untrue 4663:24 4685:2
unusual 4707:6
un-NUM 4684:16
updated 4726:23
urgency 4665:16
  4671:14
urgent 4671:2
use 4662:5 4727:5
uses 4703:21 4707:6,7
          V
valves 4697:9
various 4724:4
venture 4690:15
verbatim 4712:19
verify 4636:8 4665:13
  4665:14,21 4667:8
version 4623:15
  4642:10,12 4645:3,22
  4667:19 4679:1,7
  4713:5
versions 4667:18
very-very 4698:15
Viaan 4699:21
videos 4673:1 4682:22
view 4620:15 4625:3
  4627:14 4642:1
  4645:22 4651:12,21
  4652:13 4655:4
  4656:12.22.23.24
  4658:12 4659:13.19
  4660:23 4667:3
  4675:8 4685:3,15
  4690:19,21,23 4691:4
  4691:7 4693:2,12,19
  4693:19 4694:3
  4697:15,21 4699:14
  4707:18 4713:23
views 4633:24 4652:13
  4713:17,22
violence 4631:11,15,18
  4632:8,15 4634:3
  4655:1 4672:13
  4677:6 4678:10
  4706:22 4708:22
  4713:2
```

vis-à-vis 4642:5

voice 4681:8

4696:11 4697:8

```
vulnerable 4695:15
          W
wage 4618:3,23
  4676:22 4700:22
wages 4701:5
wait 4715:24
waiting 4615:6 4715:15
  4728:12
walked 4670:21
walking 4642:16
wane 4729:6
want 4616:18 4617:9
  4617:20,21 4627:14
  4639:3 4650:10
  4654:5 4655:16
  4658:3 4660:13
  4661:16 4665:10,13
  4666:3 4667:9
  4673:21 4674:17
  4675:5 4676:20
  4677:9 4681:3
  4682:17 4684:8
  4685:22 4698:7
  4706:24 4707:2
  4708:9 4709:1,22
  4718:17,22 4722:14
  4727:3
wanted 4667:11
  4678:25 4687:5,19
  4710:19 4712:24
  4726:12,17
wants 4627:19 4633:10
  4656:12 4685:24
  4698:3,4
warned 4689:3,5
wash 4707:13
wasn't 4622:21
  4643:17 4645:13
  4657:21 4660:1,2
  4665:25 4707:17
waste 4698:7
watched 4648:10,14
Water 4688:24
wav 4617:13 4619:6
  4626:17 4642:17
  4643:15 4644:20
  4647:3 4660:7
  4668:12 4669:19
  4670:17 4672:19,20
  4676:14 4678:7
  4679:13 4685:4
  4691:10,17 4695:11
  4700:24 4705:6
  4708:15 4717:3
  4724:23 4727:14,18
  4732:13
ways 4617:14 4677:2
weaker 4696:24
weakest 4695:15,23,25
weapons 4638:14
wearing 4640:1
website 4633:6,11,13
```

4634:7 4694:19,22

| Wednesday 4629:18                      | won't 4618:19 4660:17                            | wrongly 4709:17   | <b>10</b> 4627:14 4628:1                          |
|--|--|---|---|
| week 4618:5 4619:18                    | 4661:17 4662:5                                   | <u> </u>  | 4641:16   |
| 4619:22 4634:18<br>4635:2,13 4683:6    | 4685:25 4709:22                                  |   | 10th 4643:24                                      |
| 4729:6                                 | <b>word</b> 4616:16 4617:4<br>4703:22 4716:23,25 | <b>Xolani</b> 4640:16<br>4662:15                          | <b>100%</b> 4731:8<br><b>11</b> 4638:18           |
| weekend 4665:7 4729:6                  | words 4646:3 4657:19                             | 4002:13   | 11 4038.18<br>11th 4621:5,22 4629:1               |
| went 4621:25 4624:21                   | 4659:2 4660:11,14                                | Y   | 4629:2,8,11,14,22                                 |
| 4632:11 4641:5                         | 4672:20 4692:14                                  | year 4616:4   | 4630:5 4635:5,16                                  |
| 4643:8,16 4647:11                      | 4703:16 4734:8                                   | years 4673:15 4677:12                                     | 4641:23 4644:1                                    |
| 4661:23 4683:1                         | work 4623:20 4633:1,2                            | 4677:12,14 4683:22  | 4669:7  |
| weren't 4623:10                        | 4666:24 4667:12,24                               | yesterday 4615:3  | <b>11:02</b> 4615:2                               |
| 4637:9,17 4659:24                      | 4672:17 4676:23                                  | 4684:21 4708:1  | <b>11:22</b> 4624:25                              |
| we'd 4681:14                           | 4677:4 4681:2,4,4                                | 4726:21   | <b>11:42</b> 4634:10                              |
| we'll 4615:23 4629:17                  | 4682:17,18,24                                    | you'd 4621:18 4628:17                                     | <b>12</b> 4621:7                                  |
| 4634:6 4644:22                         | 4690:25 4691:10                                  | 4663:14 4668:7  | <b>12th</b> 4621:5,17 4622:4                      |
| 4676:14 4679:21                        | 4693:8 4695:3                                    | 4672:20 4673:24   | 4622:8 4623:7,16,25                               |
| 4687:12 4689:6                         | 4698:16,17 4700:2,4                              | 4680:10 4683:19   | 4625:1 4628:18                                    |
| 4691:11 4707:19                        | 4702:7 4716:11                                   | you'll 4618:1 4621:9                                      | 4629:6,20 4630:9                                  |
| 4708:7 4722:10                         | 4726:17 4728:6                                   | 4669:20 4672:16   | 4631:10 4632:7                                    |
| 4727:10,18 4730:6                      | 4729:3   | you're 4615:7,7   | 4634:11 4635:17                                   |
| 4731:15,17,22                          | worker 4697:4,5                                  | 4617:18 4647:7  | 4636:2 4640:12                                    |
| 4733:20                                | workers 4637:4 4638:3                            | 4650:9 4654:8 4660:8                                      | 4645:7 4646:1 4648:3                              |
| <b>we're</b> 4634:2,3,3                | 4638:10 4640:2                                   | 4660:12 4663:4  | 4649:9 4661:24<br><b>12:02</b> 4645:5             |
| 4658:20 4659:21,22<br>4676:7 4683:5,23 | 4644:23 4657:11<br>4661:6,6 4663:9               | 4667:25 4669:2<br>4675:4 4676:11                          | <b>12:02</b> 4045:5<br><b>12:18</b> 4721:4 4730:2 |
| 4715:12                                | 4664:8 4666:22                                   | 4679:6 4686:4 4687:5                                      | 4732:21   |
| we've 4635:23,24                       | 4670:13 4671:12                                  | 4688:17 4690:22   | <b>12:22</b> 4656:21                              |
| 4661:24 4679:13                        | 4673:25 4676:17                                  | 4691:7,21 4701:10   | <b>12:42</b> 4667:17                              |
| 4681:18 4685:1                         | 4677:24 4680:7                                   | 4703:11 4708:7  | <b>13</b> 4640:22 4643:3                          |
| what's 4651:19 4656:9                  | 4682:11,20 4685:15                               | 4722:10,11 4732:25  | 4645:8 4649:16,18,24                              |
| 4722:4                                 | 4694:4,14,14 4695:1                              | you've 4617:14 4620:4                                     | 4650:2 4657:16                                    |
| whichever 4616:12                      | 4695:10 4696:4,9,16                              | 4622:24 4623:3  | 13th 4637:2 4638:4                                |
| who's 4724:15                          | 4696:20,23 4697:3,5                              | 4633:18 4650:8,11   | <b>13:42</b> 4675:3                               |
| willing 4667:4 4677:16                 | 4697:9 4698:17,21,23                             | 4651:18 4656:17   | <b>14</b> 4650:5,7,14 4652:5                      |
| 4678:8                                 | 4699:14 4700:1,9,20                              | 4661:12,14 4669:20  | 4652:25 4657:5                                    |
| win 4672:18 4673:5,10                  | 4701:6,13,16,23                                  | 4702:25 4705:19,19  | <b>14th</b> 4615:15 4616:4                        |
| <b>Winfrey</b> 4717:16                 | 4702:2,8,22 4703:16                              | 4706:4 4707:18  | 4620:4 4640:4                                     |
| wish 4615:5 4633:15                    | 4704:3,12 4705:7,16                              | 4708:4 4711:5 4715:2                                      | <b>14:02</b> 4684:14                              |
| 4654:4                                 | 4726:16  | 4717:16   | <b>14:22</b> 4693:3                               |
| wished 4673:17                         | working 4692:6,8,16                              |   | <b>14:42</b> 4700:7                               |
| wishes 4675:12 4686:9                  | 4692:19 4699:25                                  |   | <b>15</b> 4634:8 4645:8                           |
| 4729:18<br>withdraw 4643:18            | 4710:7   | Zimbabwe 4695:24  | 4720:1 4725:21                                    |
| 4655:9,13 4656:14                      | works 4724:23<br>world 4658:10 4692:25           | 4700:6<br><b>Zimbabwean</b> 4700:19                       | <b>15th</b> 4629:11,18,18,20 4630:5,9 4631:10     |
| 4658:17 4659:5,7,19                    | 4696:3   | 4700:20   | 4632:7,11 4635:18                                 |
| 4660:8,25 4661:3,12                    | worse 4705:17                                    | <b>Zimbabweans</b> 4700:13                                | 4636:2 4637:23                                    |
| 4700:24                                | wouldn't 4636:17                                 | Zimbabweans 4700.13                                       | 4640:10 4662:8                                    |
| withdrawing 4660:3,4                   | 4682:8 4689:12                                   | 0   | 4664:1,11,13 4665:15                              |
| withdrawn 4661:11                      | 4690:14 4703:2,4                                 | <b>00</b> 4720:2  | 4669:24 4676:17                                   |
| 4664:17                                | 4717:22  | <b>00:47</b> 4720:3 4724:14                               | 4678:15 4680:2,7,25                               |
| withdrew 4661:11                       | would've 4631:1                                  | 4725:20   | 4720:3 4727:23                                    |
| witness 4625:8 4641:3                  | 4634:2 4651:9                                    | <b>000</b> 4626:13,13 4698:17                             | 4729:15 4732:3                                    |
| 4643:6,23 4644:4,18                    | 4663:18 4668:15,16                               | <b>09:30</b> 4734:25 4735:4                               | 4733:18   |
| 4652:21,23 4654:22                     | 4668:23  | <b>09:42</b> 4727:23                                      | <b>15:18</b> 4707:22                              |
| 4658:4,5 4675:9                        | would've 4630:17,25                              |   | <b>15:38</b> 4716:1                               |
| 4676:2 4678:19                         | <b>wounded</b> 4640:3                            | 1   | <b>15:58</b> 4727:22                              |
| 4679:14 4680:15                        | write 4722:24                                    | <b>1</b> 4631:23 4674:20                                  | <b>16</b> 4646:13                                 |
| 4686:24 4687:21                        | writing 4619:25                                  | 4698:17 4719:18,25  | <b>16th</b> 4633:23 4683:7                        |
| 4701:12 4704:14                        | written 4620:10                                  | 4720:4 4722:19  | <b>16:18</b> 4733:23                              |
| 4713:25 4722:16                        | wrong 4643:18 4645:7                             | 4724:13,19 4726:2   | <b>17</b> 4646:21 4650:5                          |
| witnesses 4662:3                       | 4646:20 4656:18                                  | 4729:25   | 4663:7  |
| 4665:20 4673:19                        | 4662:20 4674:17                                  | 1AM 4720:5  | <b>18th</b> 4734:24                               |
| 4707:25 4713:19                        | 4678:9 4682:13                                   | <b>1:07</b> 4729:15                                       | 2   |
| witness's 4616:7<br>4617:15            | 4685:9 4689:18<br>4698:5 4700:18                 | <b>1:13</b> 4730:23                                       | <b>2</b> 4626:13 4639:20                          |
| woke 4673:20                           | 4721:4   | <b>1:18</b> 4730:23,23 4734:1 <b>1:30</b> 4674:24 4727:17 | 4719:20 4720:10,12                                |
|  |  |   |   |

4 4628:1 :24 31:8 8 :5,22 4629:1 8,11,14,22 4635:5,16 3 4644:1 5:2 4:25 4:10 :5,17 4622:4 4623:7,16,25 4628:18 20 4630:9 0 4632:7 4635:17 4640:12 4646:1 4648:3 4661:24 5:5 1:4 4730:2 6:21 57:17 22 4643:3 4649:16,18,24 4657:16 :2 4638:4 75:3 ,7,14 4652:5 5 4657:5 5:15 4616:4 4640:4 34:14 3:3 0:7 4645:8 4725:21 0:11,18,18,20 9 4631:10 11 4635:18 4637:23 0 4662:8 11,13 4665:15 4 4676:17 5 4680:2,7,25 4727:23 5 4732:3 7:22 6:1 7:22 3 :23 4683:7 3:23 1 4650:5 :24 2 4639:20

4720:17 4722:23 4723:2 4724:7.20 4725:11 4726:11 4727:24 **2:58** 4721:22 4730:22 4732:3 20 4627:14,16 4650:1 2000 4687:24 2005 4678:5 2011 4618:3,23 **2012** 4615:15 4616:5 4620:4,23 4621:5 4676:17 4680:3,25 4681:10 4732:3 **2013** 4615:1 4681:20,25 **22A** 4724:7 **25** 4650:1 289A 4722:19 289C 4720:18 289E 4721:17,25 4723:15 289(F) 4732:25 4733:1 4733:23 3 **3** 4616:14,16 4621:6 4626:13 4643:4 4719:22 4720:7,8,14 4722:22,24 4723:1 4724:22 4726:17 4729:23 3:13 4721:21 3:22 4733:17 **30** 4627:17 36 4680:8,16 **39** 4685:8 4 4634:8 4720:19,25 4721:2,4,9,10 4723:10,13 4726:19 4727:2 4729:15 4730:2,2 4732:22,24 4732:24 4733:8,9 4734:8,10,10 **4(A)** 4732:24 4733:8,10 **4(B)** 4732:23 4733:5.6 4733:22.23 5 **5** 4615:1 4667:21 4721:5.11.12.14 4723:6 4730:21 4732:13 4734:1,3,4 **50** 4697:9 500 4726:16 6 6 4681:1 4721:24,25 4723:19 4731:18,24 4732:2 7 7 4663:8 4722:1 4723:16 4733:17 4734:8,9

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 15

|  |  | Page 15 |
|--|--|---------|
| <b>7th</b> 4722:5                            |  |         |
| <b>700</b> 4726:16                           |  |         |
| 8  |  |         |
| <b>8</b> 4722:4                              |  |         |
| <b>80</b> 4651:23 <b>800</b> 4728:24 4729:1  |  |         |
| <b>82</b> 4694:9                             |  |         |
| <b>84</b> 4631:23 4639:8                     |  |         |
| <b>89B</b> 4719:21                           |  |         |
| 9  |  |         |
| <b>9</b> 4638:6 4641:9                       |  |         |
| <b>9th</b> 4683:7 4720:8 <b>9:30</b> 4727:14 |  |         |
| <b>94</b> 4624:18                            |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |
|  |  |         |