

RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON
MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 199

11 MARCH 2014

PAGES 24296 TO 24450



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg
P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037
Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335
E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za
Web Address: <http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278>



Page 24296	<p>1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 11 FEBRUARY 2014]</p> <p>2 [09:11] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.</p> <p>3 Major General, you're still under oath.</p> <p>4 GANASEN NAIDOO: Yes, still under oath,</p> <p>5 Chair.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, are you going</p> <p>7 to cross-examine next?</p> <p>8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chair, as soon</p> <p>9 as Mr Chaskalson has not obscured my view of the</p> <p>10 Commission.</p> <p>11 CHAIRPERSON: Well, as soon as his</p> <p>12 conversation is over then you can start. Alright.</p> <p>13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you very much –</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: Let's start with some</p> <p>15 housekeeping, I think. What you did was we were given in</p> <p>16 your absence by one of your agents a very interesting</p> <p>17 document headed "The deaths of victims A, B, M and O." Now</p> <p>18 according to my notes the next exhibit should be MMM46, but</p> <p>19 if that's not right, MMM47. We'll give it that, you'll</p> <p>20 describe it to us and when Ms Pillay comes we'll find out</p> <p>21 if we are correct. But it's I think MMM47. Is that</p> <p>22 correct? That's a document you want to hand in, I take it,</p> <p>23 Mr Ntsebeza?</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>25 CHAIRPERSON: So exhibit MMM47 is a</p>	Page 24298	<p>1 CHAIRPERSON: Alright, so we'll carry on</p> <p>2 in the meanwhile.</p> <p>3 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC: We</p> <p>4 will, Mr Chairman. Good morning, General.</p> <p>5 GENERAL NAIDOO: Good morning.</p> <p>6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, we'll come</p> <p>7 much, much later to exhibit MMM47, as we have now marked it</p> <p>8 to be. There is just one aspect that I want to deal with</p> <p>9 quickly and that is about the NUM and its president. You</p> <p>10 do know about the NUM. You have now become familiar that</p> <p>11 there is a union called the National Union of Mineworkers.</p> <p>12 GENERAL NAIDOO: I'm familiar, yes.</p> <p>13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You are aware that it</p> <p>14 has a president called Mr Zokwana?</p> <p>15 GENERAL NAIDOO: I'm aware of that.</p> <p>16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You're aware, yes. Now</p> <p>17 there's just one aspect about him that I would like you to</p> <p>18 assist the Commission because out of all the evidence that</p> <p>19 has been led and you have been asked about it doesn't seem</p> <p>20 to me that the aspect I'm going to explore with you has</p> <p>21 been dealt with. Mr Chairman, there is the evidence that I</p> <p>22 would like to be shown up is on T4431, day 41, T4431, lines</p> <p>23 9 to 15 up to T4432, line 16 to 18.</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: What day is this?</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It's day –</p>
Page 24297	<p>1 document described as "The deaths of victims A, B, M and</p> <p>2 O." And perhaps I should, I don't know how long it is</p> <p>3 before you are going to get into the detail of it; at a</p> <p>4 suitable stage I think we will have to give a warning to</p> <p>5 the relatives of Mr Anele Mdizeni, Mr Thabiso Johannes</p> <p>6 Thelejane, Mr Nkosinathi Xalabile, and Mr Henry Mvuyisi</p> <p>7 Pato. Do I have to give the warning now, Mr Ntsebeza, or</p> <p>8 are you going to ask some preliminary questions which -</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, not –</p> <p>10 CHAIRPERSON: - will precede the showing</p> <p>11 of these slides?</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, Mr Chairman, not</p> <p>13 now.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: So you'll give me warning</p> <p>15 in good time. I see the families haven't arrived yet.</p> <p>16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I've been told that they</p> <p>17 are on their way from their hotels and they should be here</p> <p>18 at about 10. So, but we should go ahead in the meantime.</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: Obviously it's no good</p> <p>20 issuing the warning before they come, but unless – and I</p> <p>21 see there are some gentlemen at the back who, I don't know</p> <p>22 whether they would need a warning. Are they Mr Mpfu's</p> <p>23 clients or yours, Mr Ntsebeza?</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I believe they are Mr</p> <p>25 Mpfu's clients.</p>	Page 24299	<p>1 CHAIRPERSON: 41.</p> <p>2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: - 41.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: Day 41.</p> <p>4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: So you refer to day 41 in</p> <p>6 the transcript, and what page are we going to look at?</p> <p>7 4431 is the first one.</p> <p>8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 4431.</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: Ja, thank you. So this is</p> <p>10 Mr Tip cross-examining – sorry, no, I beg your pardon, Mr</p> <p>11 Tip leading Mr Zokwana.</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: He was leading, ja. He</p> <p>13 was leading Mr Zokwana. You see that, General?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see that.</p> <p>15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, then Mr Tip – have</p> <p>16 you read that, all of it?</p> <p>17 GENERAL NAIDOO: I have.</p> <p>18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Particularly where he</p> <p>19 says, "Mr Zokwana, I'm going to turn to your description of</p> <p>20 the events of 12 August 2012 when you came onto the scene</p> <p>21 at Marikana. Before that I just want to ask you, did you</p> <p>22 in the course of the 11th of August" – you see, it's about</p> <p>23 the events of the 12th of August that I will want to ask you</p> <p>24 about. In fact I think that topic having been introduced,</p> <p>25 could we go to day 42, page T4560, lines 2 to 14.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24300</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: What lines did you say, Mr 2 Ntsebeza? Mr Ntsebeza, what lines did you say? Is this 3 the correct page? 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Lines 2 to 14. I want 5 where – 6 CHAIRPERSON: 2 to 14, those are on the 7 screen. Yes, thank you. Perhaps I should read them out. 8 Mr Semenya is cross-examining Mr Zokwana and he says, "In 9 evidence-in-chief I heard you say, and please if I'm wrong 10 just tell me, I heard you say that you spoke to General 11 Mbombo who told you that they do not have enough personnel, 12 is that correct?" Mr Zokwana said, "I said I spoke with a 13 provincial official at the offices of the SAPS and the 14 response thereof was not satisfactory that they will be 15 able to act accordingly. I didn't mention the name of any 16 person." Mr Semenya, "Okay, do you know that official?" 17 Mr Zokwana, "I am sorry, I can't remember." That's the 18 extract that's being put to you. Mr Ntsebeza, I take it 19 you want to ask him if he was the official? 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you see that? 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: I do. 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Tip had earlier 23 asked Mr Zokwana to give the Commission a brief outline of 24 the persons whom he had spoken to and he said more or less 25 what we have there, namely that he had spoken to an</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24302</p> <p>1 We've 4635 at the moment. Could we have 4635, please? 2 Sorry, could we have 4625? Yes, we've got 4635 – 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 4625 – 4 CHAIRPERSON: We need 4625. We're nearly 5 there. Yes, there we've got it. It's line 13. 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 7 CHAIRPERSON: That's the passage you're 8 putting to the witness. 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed. 10 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Barnes says, "I'd like 11 us to, I'd like you to tell us, Sir, about those phone 12 calls that you made on that day. You said that you phoned 13 the office of the Provincial Commissioner, is that 14 correct?" Mr Zokwana says, "That is in my statement, yes." 15 Ms Barnes says, "Who did you speak to?" Mr Zokwana says, 16 "Given the situation, I couldn't remember who I spoke to. 17 Whoever I spoke to did not give me an answer I was happy 18 with." Ms Barnes, "Do you know the rank of the person you 19 spoke to?" Mr Zokwana, "I repeat, I could not have – I 20 mean, and if I could remember the rank I would be maybe 21 knowing the person. The only person I remember I spoke to 22 thereafter was the Minister of the Police." Ms Barnes, 23 "You said the response was unsatisfactory. What did this 24 person say to you?" Mr Zokwana, "They didn't have enough 25 personnel to deal with the situation as two of their</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24301</p> <p>1 official in the offices of the Provincial Commissioner and 2 he was not satisfied with the response that he was given 3 and they didn't have enough manpower in the SAPS. "Then I 4 tried to get the number of the Minister's office and I was 5 able to talk to somebody in his office," and they left a 6 message on his cell. You are aware of that evidence? 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: I am seeing it now, yes. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You have seen that 9 evidence? 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: I am seeing it now, 11 Chair. 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now there was also, this 13 conversation was also featured in day 43, T4625 starting 14 from line 13 and that was a question from Ms Barnes. "I'd 15 like us to, I'd like you to tell us, Sir, about those phone 16 calls that you made on that day." This was Ms Barnes, a 17 question put to Mr Zokwana. "You said that you phoned the 18 office" – 19 CHAIRPERSON: [Microphone off, inaudible] 20 have the correct page just yet on the screen. Give us the 21 page number again, please. 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Day 43. 23 CHAIRPERSON: Page? 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 4625. 25 CHAIRPERSON: We'll, we haven't got it.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24303</p> <p>1 personnel had been to the scene, as claimed by the report 2 of the security officer." Ms Barnes, "What level of 3 personnel did you think was required?" Mr Zokwana, "Given 4 the numbers of people who were involved here, I mean 5 between 2 000 and 3 000 and how they were described in 6 manner, in terms of being armed, I thought that the 7 security had to decide that, I'm not in a position to 8 determine. My training has not given me to know if people 9 are armed this way, you need so many," and I think that's 10 the end of the passage. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, that's it, and then 12 if we also went to day 101, page 10847, where then Mr Tip 13 places on record, lines 8 to 21. 14 CHAIRPERSON: So lines 8 to 21. Is that 15 right? 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: On the 12th, ja – 17 CHAIRPERSON: "On the 12th Mr Zokwana 18 arrives because he has heard reports about the incident on 19 the morning of the 12th in which two security men were 20 killed and he comes to Lonmin because he is very, very 21 concerned. The first thing that he does is to arrange a 22 meeting with Lonmin and it's a logical and perfectly proper 23 recourse because Lonmin have the security apparatus that is 24 in place and he needs to establish whether or not there's 25 sufficient security. He is not entirely satisfied – I know</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24304</p> <p>1 that I'm repeating things I said previously, but he then 2 calls the Provincial Commissioner's office. He is not yet 3 satisfied that there has been a sufficient response on the 4 part of the police and he then telephones, on the 12th of 5 August, the Minister."</p> <p>6 Then you want me to read the next sentence? "Now 7 Mr Zokwana has given evidence and his evidence on this 8 topic has been very, very clear and it is entirely 9 unchallenged. He seeks police intervention because there 10 has been a breakdown of law and order. Then –</p> <p>11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I think that –</p> <p>12 CHAIRPERSON: - "the problem, because I 13 imagine you want to move on to other points." "I do."</p> <p>14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>15 CHAIRPERSON: So that's it, is it?</p> <p>16 That's the passage you want?</p> <p>17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, that's the passage. 18 You've seen that, General?</p> <p>19 GENERAL NAIDOO: I have.</p> <p>20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Ja, now it seems to us 21 from all of this evidence Mr Zokwana was not able to say 22 whom actually in the office of the Provincial Commissioner 23 he spoke to and General Mbombo in her testimony was asked 24 about this aspect and if you looked at day 183, page 22120, 25 she does say that it was not she to whom Mr Zokwana spoke,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24306</p> <p>1 be sufficient, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: No, that's it, "when you 3 came back from sick leave?"</p> <p>4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: And she said, "If it was on 6 a Sunday, Chairperson, we do not work on Sunday, but the 7 truth is, as you are putting to Chairperson, that if it was 8 during the week it would have been referred to the person 9 who was acting in my absence." And then I said, "Mr 10 Zokwana of course doesn't say that he spoke to the official 11 who was at the offices at the time he spoke to him; he 12 spoke to an official in the offices. So Mr Zokwana might 13 have had the telephone number of some official who – or his 14 home number or cell phone number or something and that may 15 be the answer, but of course a further point arises; if the 16 official was spoken to on a Sunday and it was a matter for 17 the Commissioner, the probability is that the call would 18 have been referred to the Acting Commissioner, not to the 19 person who was on leave, which is the witness. Is that 20 right, Provincial Commissioner?" and she says, "I 21 understand. You're quite right, Chairperson."</p> <p>22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now according to 23 these passages it would appear that the person who would 24 have been referred to by the Provincial Commissioner as 25 having been the Acting Commissioner at the time would have</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24305</p> <p>1 if we just could get there. Lines 12 to 16. Ms Lewis, "So 2 General, we can see that on the 12th August Mr Zokwana spoke 3 to someone from your offices. General, was it you to whom 4 Mr Zokwana spoke?" "No, it's not me, Mr Chairperson." You 5 see that?</p> <p>6 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see that, Chair.</p> <p>7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And then in response to 8 a question from the Chairperson, and we will find that on 9 day 183, T22121, line 15 to 22122, line 20.</p> <p>10 CHAIRPERSON: Perhaps I should read that.</p> <p>11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>12 CHAIRPERSON: I said to the Provincial 13 Commissioner Mbombo, "Now you were still on sick leave on 14 the 12th, weren't you?" She replied yes, she replied, 15 "Correct, Chairperson." I then said, "General Naidoo was 16 standing in for you, he was the Acting Provincial 17 Commissioner." She said, "That is correct, Chair." And I 18 then said, "So any phone call that was received by your 19 office, would that have been referred to" – I think that 20 should be you – "to your, the person who was acting in your 21 place, namely General Naidoo, or would this have been 22 referred to you when you came back to your office, when you 23 came back from" – no, I don't think that's the next page, 24 is it?</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No. I think that should</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24307</p> <p>1 been you. Would that be correct?</p> <p>2 GENERAL NAIDOO: I was the Acting 3 Provincial Commissioner, correct.</p> <p>4 [09:31] MR NTSEBEZA SC: Just to tie this loose 5 end would it then have been you to whom Mr Sekwano spoke to 6 on the 12th of August?</p> <p>7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, no. The only 8 person that I spoke to or received a call in connection 9 with this on the 12th of August was the Provincial 10 Commissioner. I testified to that fact as well.</p> <p>11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, General, so 12 we will have to contend with somebody having spoken to the 13 office of the Provincial Commissioner, but it was neither 14 you nor General Mbombo. Was any report to you that there 15 had been a communication or a telephone received from Mr 16 Zokwana?</p> <p>17 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, no. I only 18 became aware now during the Commission where they indicated 19 they approached the police. But at that time I had no idea 20 that –</p> <p>21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: On the 12th of August?</p> <p>22 GENERAL NAIDOO: I had no idea at that 23 time of the NUM's involvement, no.</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So are you saying that 25 you do not know that there was a communication from the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24308</p> <p>1 president of NUM on the 12th August or are you saying you 2 have not been told that there had been a communication from 3 the president of the NUM? 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: I say I was not aware of 5 any such communication. 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Is there someone at the 7 level of the leadership to whom Mr Zokwana could have 8 spoken on the 12th if he didn't speak to you ore if he 9 didn't speak, as we now know from her evidence, General 10 Mbombo? 11 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm not familiar 12 with who Mr Zokwana knows. I have never met him until the 13 meeting of the 15th when I attended a session where he was. 14 So I have never met him before. So I'm not familiar with 15 who he's aware of, but in the command structure there's a 16 local station commander, there's a cluster commander, 17 there's the Deputy Provincial Commissioner for operations. 18 So there's a whole variety of people where were there much 19 longer than me. I was, at that stage, fairly new in the 20 province. So I'm not familiar if he could spoken to them 21 or had he known them. 22 CHAIRPERSON: Let me ask you this 23 question. Assuming that I had to speak urgently to the 24 Provincial Commissioner on a Sunday, she doesn't work on a 25 Sunday well criminals unfortunately do. So assuming I had</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24310</p> <p>1 I take it, well you can't speak to her, she's on sick 2 leave. I would say all right then who's acting in her 3 place or to whom can I speak at that level, would I have 4 been given your number on the 12th of August 2012? 5 GENERAL NAIDOO: My number or the duty 6 officer at the provincial level, the general, yes. 7 CHAIRPERSON: Now who was the duty 8 officer at the provincial level on the 12th of August 2012? 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I can check, I 10 cannot specifically remember now. 11 CHAIRPERSON: It wasn't you. 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: I can't remember now. I 13 was the acting Provincial – no I can't remember. 14 CHAIRPERSON: Well if Mr Ntsebeza wants 15 to go on with this line of cross-examination I imagine it's 16 important for him to know who the duty officer at 17 provincial level was so he can ask the questions that he 18 has ready to ask. Is that correct, Mr Ntsebeza? 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman. 20 CHAIRPERSON: So can you get that 21 information please, perhaps during the tea adjournment you 22 can phone someone at your office and get the information 23 and give it to Mr Ntsebeza? 24 GENERAL NAIDOO: I will do that, Chair. 25 CHAIRPERSON: All right, thank you.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24309</p> <p>1 a serious problem and I had to take it right to the top and 2 I tried to get hold of the Provincial Commissioner and 3 presumably unless I knew her private number which wouldn't 4 be information available to me, I take it phone the office. 5 Is that right? I want to speak to the Provincial 6 Commissioner, I don't want to deal with anybody below the 7 Provincial Commissioner. It's a very serious matter. 8 Okay, so how would I get hold – what number would I be 9 expected to phone? I take it there's a telephone number in 10 the telephone directory, Provincial Commissioner, is there 11 any number indicated for after hours, emergencies or 12 anything of that kind? 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, at all our police 14 stations we have a 24 hour service and they have a list of 15 people that are available after hours. So if somebody 16 wanted to access the Provincial Commissioner or any other 17 senior officer for whatever reason they would contact – 18 they just have to contact the nearest police station. On 19 that list it would indicate who was the general on duty and 20 that person obviously would deal with the matter or access 21 the Provincial Commissioner if it was that kind of matter. 22 CHAIRPERSON: Now let's assume I want to 23 speak to the Provincial Commissioner urgently on a Sunday, 24 I phone the nearest police station and I say how do I get 25 hold of the Provincial Commissioner. They would say to me,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24311</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you very much, Mr 2 Chairman. Now, General, let's go to the events of the 13th. 3 I'm sure you have been asked extensively about the events 4 of the 13th and I will not traverse that field save only 5 insofar as in the reference both in your statement and in 6 the evidence you gave it seems that you talk about the 7 mobilisation or escalation of forces on that day. Do you 8 remember that? 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: I do remember, Chair. 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now if I could take 11 you to the reference, day 88, day 188, Mr Chairman, I'm 12 sorry. And I think it starts with line 22856, lines 1 to 13 6. 14 CHAIRPERSON: 22856 I understood Mr 15 Ntsebeza to say. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, Mr Chairman. 17 Day 188 and it starts at T22856. 18 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, I missed that, Mr 19 Ntsebeza – 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Lines 1 to 6 21 CHAIRPERSON: Lines 1 to 6. 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 23 CHAIRPERSON: And complaints – this must 24 be General Naidoo – this must be the witness speaking. 25 "Complaints from the mine management that the police were</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24312</p> <p>1 not responding and assisting in stabilising the situation 2 and we want to meet them on that because we had a large 3 deployment there." And we felt, you know, we were trying 4 to do what we could without understanding what were the 5 real issues. We could do no more." That's the passage, do 6 you remember saying that? 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, correct. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: There is another passage 9 where it starts "We had to firstly assess the situation, 10 as I indicated previously." 11 CHAIRPERSON: On the previous page, in 12 fact the passage I read to – no, no the bottom of that page 13 – the passage I read to you previously is preceded on the 14 previous page by the following which you are recorded to 15 having said. "We had to firstly assess the situation, as I 16 indicated previously, whether the situation had stabilised. 17 And secondly, as was indicated in my statement, that there 18 was continuous communication" and then it goes on in the 19 passage "And complaints from the mine management that the 20 police were not responding and assisting in stabilising the 21 situation." Is that passage you want, Mr Ntsebeza? 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes that's the one that 23 – now I'm sure I don't want extensive details about what 24 you referred to there as complaints from mine management, 25 but what I want to find out from you is whether the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24314</p> <p>1 there was a drastic escalation of resources starting from 2 Friday when there were approximately 27 police officials in 3 total to on Sunday when after my call to our national head 4 office, we had approximately 70 people. Sub sequent to 5 that our figures went to more than 400, between 400 and at 6 some stage 750 members. So that – 7 CHAIRPERSON: When was that? 8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Subsequent to – 9 CHAIRPERSON: No, subsequent but when? 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: Tuesday – 11 CHAIRPERSON: Oh Tuesday – 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: - Wednesday, Thursday, 13 yes. 14 CHAIRPERSON: How many did you actually 15 have on the Thursday, the day of the shootings? 16 GENERAL NAIDOO: I think it was 17 approximately 600 and some odd in total. 18 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I'm sorry to interrupt 19 you. One of the or perhaps a number of the people who had 20 just come, I want to welcome you. I see you arrived back 21 from your trip away. I'm pleased to see you've arrived 22 safely, but someone has either got her sound too high or 23 else she hasn't got her earphones on properly because we 24 have a disturbance of the sound track of the translation 25 which we can hear. I can still hear it, so either someone</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24313</p> <p>1 pressure from Lonmin of a nature that you decided, as you 2 explain it elsewhere, to radically mobilise or escalate the 3 deployment of forces? 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: No, I think firstly we 5 indicated in the first instance, over the weekend, I 6 testified that Lonmin had complained that there were 7 incidents occurring and they felt that there was 8 insufficient or no police presence. I contacted the public 9 order police unit and they deployed – I established that 10 yesterday, they deployed about 13 members during the day, 11 additional, to the police station and 10 members on the 12 night shift to conduct patrols and maintain a presence in 13 the area. On Monday, after the incident where three police 14 officials and three strikers were killed, obviously the 15 operation went into a different phase because now we had to 16 pursue – firstly there was direct violence against the 17 police, confrontation with the police with the strikers. 18 And secondly there was an investigation to pursue where 19 several police firearms, etcetera, especially automatic 20 firearms had been taken. There I indicated there was a 21 meeting after having heard from Lonmin as well. There was 22 a meeting and the National Commissioner indicated that we 23 should stabilise the situation and investigations must 24 proceed and perpetrators of the violence and the murders 25 have to be arrested and prosecuted. And on that basis</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24315</p> <p>1 hasn't got her earphones on or else the volume is too high 2 and it's disturbing us in hearing the witness's answer. So 3 someone could attend to that please before the cross- 4 examination continues. Thank you, well let's hope that the 5 problem's been solved. No it hasn't. I suppose I have to 6 speak so that there's interpretation and then you can 7 whether interpretation is then audible in the chamber 8 without the benefit of earphones. We'll carry on for a 9 while. I hope that things will improve. Is there anything 10 further you wish to say in answer to the question you were 11 asked, Major-General? 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair – 13 CHAIRPERSON: Before Mr Ntsebeza asks the 14 next question? 15 GENERAL NAIDOO: I've answered it, Chair. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 17 The meeting that you talk about involving the National 18 Commissioner and the Provincial Commissioner is what you 19 talk about in your statement, in paragraph 31. What has 20 now become referred to as the consolidated – 21 CHAIRPERSON: You're referring to JJJ108. 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I would assume – I'm 23 assured, Mr Chairman, you are spot on. Paragraph 31, is 24 that the meeting that you are talking about, paragraph 31 25 of the consolidated affidavit?</p>

Page 24316

1 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: "The National
 3 Commissioner and the Provincial Commissioner of Gauteng
 4 arrived at Lonmin later that evening at about 20h00 and
 5 they are given an overview, first by the SAPS and also by
 6 mine management. Thereafter after long deliberation
 7 between the National Commissioner and the Provincial
 8 Commissioner of North West in Gauteng as well as Major-
 9 General Mpembe, Annandale and myself and Brigadiers Calitz,
 10 van Zyl, Engelbrecht and Tsiloane and a few other
 11 personnel it decided that a drastic escalation of the
 12 police resources will be necessary to both stabilise the
 13 public order situation as well as facilitate the
 14 investigation of the murders and attack which had occurred
 15 on police officers." Now, of course, three mine workers
 16 have also been killed in that skirmish in relation to which
 17 you referred to two police officers who had been killed.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sure that's entirely
 19 correct, it's clear that two were killed. There's a
 20 question mark over the circumstances in which the third,
 21 the one who died from bleeding.
 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Circumstances in which he
 24 met his death, but certainly two, it doesn't affect the
 25 thrust of your question. In addition to people referred to

Page 24317

1 two strikers had also been killed.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You are aware of that,
 3 General, was the question that two mineworkers had been
 4 killed and the third there was doubt as to how you had
 5 killed him, did it feature as part of the reason for you to
 6 mobilise drastically, of course it's –
 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair –
 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: - or was it only the two
 9 police officers you were talking about?
 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think that's
 11 the understanding, that the actions of the police were not
 12 being investigated by the police, it was being investigated
 13 by IPID. Obviously with our support in terms of anything
 14 they required. So when I refer to the investigation of the
 15 actions of the police there was a couple of dockets and
 16 some dockets were handled by the police and the other
 17 dockets were handled by IPID.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, of course, the point
 19 made in your paragraph 31 is two aspects were being
 20 addressed. One was the investigation of the murders and
 21 the attack which occurred on the police officers, that was
 22 being handled by the police.
 23 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: But there was also the
 25 stabilisation of the public order situation.

Page 24318

1 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: And the fact that the
 3 public order situation had increased in danger, as it were,
 4 and increased in severity which was indicated by the fact
 5 that two of three of the strikers had also been killed. It
 6 also was a factor to be borne in mind in regard to what was
 7 required to stabilise the public order situation. Is that
 8 not correct?
 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm sure it was
 10 correct, yes.
 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: What I want to establish
 12 was whether in that meeting the discussion went as far as
 13 saying five people died today, three of them were
 14 mineworkers and two of them were police officers? In this
 15 skirmish three deaths resulted on the side of the
 16 mineworkers, was there a discussion like that or was – I
 17 hear what you're saying about the IPID, but was there a
 18 discussion about the number of people who got killed on the
 19 13th?
 20 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, definitely. It
 21 was not just the people that were killed on the 14th, it was
 22 the number of people that were killed from the weekend
 23 running up to the 14th which was part of the understanding
 24 of the public order situation that exists. So the
 25 discussion did not restrict itself just to the fact that

Page 24319

1 two police officers were killed. And we talked about the
 2 general public order situation. It started from the people
 3 that were injured, people that were killed through the
 4 weekend up to the incident which led to the confrontation
 5 between the police and the miners.
 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, I don't want to
 7 belabour this point, but your own statement doesn't talk
 8 about the mineworkers who got killed in that skirmish. It
 9 talks only about the two police officers who had been
 10 killed and that was the reason or that is the reason that
 11 you are triggered to the decision to escalate the
 12 deployment of forces. Isn't that right in paragraph 31?
 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, maybe the
 14 emphasis about the issue with police officers was the fact
 15 that there now a number of firearms that were included into
 16 the equation that was circulating and there was a concern
 17 that what this meant in terms of the escalation of
 18 violence.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, we don't seem
 20 to be understanding each other and I want to move beyond
 21 this point. I'm saying to you your own statement mentions
 22 a reason for the escalation of forces, the fact that two
 23 police officers had been killed. You may or may have also
 24 been influenced by the fact that firearms had been taken.
 25 Your statement is conspicuous by its not mentioning that in

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24320</p> <p>1 the same event in which two police officers were killed, 2 mineworkers were also killed. Was that not a basis for the 3 escalation of the forces also? 4 [09:51] GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I have already 5 indicated that the general public order situation in its 6 totality was discussed. So that did not exclude any of the 7 deaths, but maybe the reason of specifically mentioning the 8 police officers, as I said it put a different spin in terms 9 of the situation on hand and I think I testified to this 10 fact. One of the reasons that the Special Task Force was 11 brought in was to support the investigation of the 12 detectives where the expectation was that they would track 13 the firearms and go in and arrest and recover these 14 firearms as well. So under the general public order 15 situation we dealt with all the deaths that have occurred, 16 running up to the clash between the police. We did not 17 exclude any particular one. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now in that discussion 19 was the attitude that there had been an attack on the 20 police officers? 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's the way we 22 understood it, Chair. 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: On that day was it the 24 report that you got that the police officers were murdered 25 as a consequence of an attack on the police line?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24322</p> <p>1 that pertained to the miners that were killed, yes. 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Was it the tenor of the 3 report that you received, the preliminary report that you 4 received, that the police who got killed got killed in the 5 process of them defending themselves, in other words that 6 the police were acting in self-defence and unfortunately 7 these two died? 8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, from what I could 9 remember of the report indication was the SAPS contingent 10 was escorting the miners through and at some stage 11 something that has triggered an attack and they turned on 12 the police and that's when the two deaths occurred and the 13 one injury, yes. 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Well, we have now 15 objective evidence which will still be tested a lot more, 16 and I don't think you are the person who must be asked 17 questions about how that skirmish took place and how it was 18 initiated. That is a debate for another day for another 19 witness who was actually there at the time. 20 But the point I want to find out from you, is the 21 frame of mind of your generals, of you, the National 22 Commissioner, the Commissioner, Provincial Commissioner of 23 Police, at the time when you received this preliminary 24 report you used very loaded questions, I mean phrases here. 25 In paragraph 31 you say, "It was both to stabilise the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24321</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: That is how we had it, 2 Chair. 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Without investigation? 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, that was the 5 basis of the preliminary reports which we had from the 6 people on the scene. 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: That had taken place on 8 that day, is it? 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: That is correct, Chair. 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Ja, now that's why 11 again, and I'm going to ask you this for the last time; 12 that's why again I want to know whether your preliminary 13 reports did say there had been unfortunate deaths here, we 14 have five deaths today; three of the people who got killed 15 in the same event or more or less in the same event - two 16 certainly, the third one there's a doubt - in which these 17 two police officers were killed were mineworkers and there 18 had to be an explanation as to how the mineworkers had met 19 their deaths. 20 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, as I indicated, 21 there were no deaths that were excluded in the discussions 22 and we were well aware that IPID was also conducting their 23 investigation in terms of - initially they wanted to take 24 all the dockets and then eventually handed certain dockets 25 back to the police for investigation, which excluded those</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24323</p> <p>1 public order situation as well as facilitating the 2 investigation of the murders and attack which occurred on 3 the police officers." That's why I want you to let us have 4 a sense of where you were at that meeting in terms of a 5 frame of mind. Was it your conclusion that these 6 fatalities did not occur as a result of a skirmish, a fight 7 between two opposite forces, both of whom were engaged in 8 inflicting, well, injuries and/or deaths as it took place? 9 Was it your conclusion that these were not fatalities that 10 were happening as a consequence of a fight between two 11 forces? 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think I've 13 testified to my understanding as to what was narrated to us 14 by the people that attended the incident and that's what I 15 understood. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay, now, and I'm 17 asking about you having been part of that meeting. Was it 18 your view that the strikers had not been murdered by the 19 police? 20 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm aware that in 21 all the cases of the deaths a docket of murder is 22 investigated and on the basis of evidence that was placed 23 before the Director of Public Prosecution a decision is 24 made. So all the deaths at that particular scene would 25 have been treated as murders.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24324</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now you don't say of 2 course in paragraph 31 that because there were other deaths 3 which could be attributable to police, that the matter is 4 being handed over to the IPID, who are the ones who would 5 investigate any wrongdoing on the part of the police, if 6 that was so. You don't mention that there, do you? 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair no, I only 8 focussed on the issues that were directly related to the 9 resourcing of our operation, not to the operations of IPID. 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, I understand that. 11 But you seem to be saying the investigation of whether or 12 not the police had been guilty of any wrongdoing would have 13 been the responsibility of IPID. Why I'm asking these 14 question is because I want to be able to say right from the 15 start, at that meeting there was only one understanding 16 that was pervasive in that meeting and in subsequent 17 conduct of the police. Two police officers have been 18 murdered by mineworkers and that is the approach on which 19 anything that should happen should take place. What would 20 you say to that? 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, as I indicated in 22 the same paragraph I refer to the general public order 23 situation and that does not exclude any specific group or 24 grouping or role players. 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And I've made this point</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24326</p> <p>1 concern is keeping an open mind. What I want to put to you 2 is that you didn't do that because you didn't keep an open 3 mind. Yours was informed by an attitude that said the 4 police were going about their duties, they were murdered by 5 these mineworkers, and that framed the way in which you 6 approached subsequent investigations and interventions in 7 the entire saga. 8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I don't – 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you want to comment? 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: I don't agree with that 11 because that investigation team that was investigating, 12 including the attacks on the two police officials, were 13 investigating all nine murders up to date. So the task 14 team was dealing with all the investigations and the 15 support that was being rendered to them was going to be 16 supporting all the investigations that had been handed to 17 them. So I don't agree with that statement. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now who took the 19 decision to escalate forces? 20 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, as I indicated 21 that the meeting discussed what would be required to 22 stabilise the situation and one of the key requests that 23 was made from the operational people present was that the 24 numbers were not sufficient to effectively manage the 25 situation and it was on that basis that the various people</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24325</p> <p>1 and I'm moving, but insofar as murder is concerned, when 2 you talk about fatalities it's as though the other three 3 people who died in the same incident do not exist. When 4 you write that statement, you write about two people, the 5 police officers who got killed. The others do not exist. 6 Do you want to comment? 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, as I indicated, 8 my statement was on the basis of the taskings that the 9 police was dealing with. I specifically referred to the 10 attack on police officials and I've during my testimony 11 also indicated the resources that were put in place to 12 support the investigation team. I at that stage had not 13 been aware or had information with regard to what IPID was 14 doing as far as their investigation was concerned, and as a 15 result I did not specifically mention it. Other than 16 knowing that they were conducting an investigation I did 17 not have any other specific information. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, I mean if you 19 kept an open mind about what had happened there, 20 notwithstanding what had been reported to you, I want to 21 put it to you, you would have written something that 22 indicated that the police were concerned about the fact 23 that up to that point – how many people? – that there were 24 about six people who had died up to that point. Now that 25 is an attitude that we would expect from a person whose</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24327</p> <p>1 indicated that they would require specific types of support 2 and that's where the request was put to the National 3 Commissioner to assist the province with the resources 4 required. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, did you 6 understand the question? 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: I did. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you still remember 9 the question? 10 CHAIRPERSON: He wants to know who took 11 the decision to escalate. 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, at the end of the 13 day – 14 CHAIRPERSON: Now whose decision was it 15 to escalate? Was it the National Commissioner's decision, 16 Provincial Commissioner's decision? Whose decision was it? 17 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think the 18 National Commissioner was informed that, and primarily 19 possibly by the Provincial Commissioner. As I said, there 20 was a discussion about how to address the situation, with 21 the input from various people. At the end of the day it 22 can only be the Provincial Commissioner who can make that 23 request to say this is our situation and we would need 24 assistance in terms of that, and obviously the National 25 Commissioner in consultation with other provincial</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24328</p> <p>1 commissioners can respond to provide that assistance.</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: To cut it short, the way it</p> <p>3 works is this; the Provincial Commissioner said look here,</p> <p>4 we need more resources than we've got.</p> <p>5 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: And we need extra resources</p> <p>7 from outside the province.</p> <p>8 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: The National Commissioner</p> <p>10 obviously said yes, you've made out a case, so I'm</p> <p>11 satisfied that that should happen. She had the Provincial</p> <p>12 Commissioner Gauteng with her.</p> <p>13 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: He obviously took part in</p> <p>15 the discussion as well, but I would imagine the answer to</p> <p>16 Mr Ntsebeza's question whose decision was it that the</p> <p>17 forces should be escalated inter alia by the deployment of</p> <p>18 resources from outside the province, that decision was</p> <p>19 taken by the National Commissioner. That must be right.</p> <p>20 After consulting with everybody -</p> <p>21 GENERAL NAIDOO: Well, the National</p> <p>22 Commissioner would have received a request from the</p> <p>23 Provincial Commissioner and she would have agreed. So the</p> <p>24 request came from the Provincial Commissioner -</p> <p>25 CHAIRPERSON: And the agreement came from</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24330</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, I don't want to</p> <p>2 interrupt your question -</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, I think you</p> <p>4 must give him a chance to answer. The way it works, I take</p> <p>5 it, if I can just intervene, was there was a discussion,</p> <p>6 how many people do we need to stabilise the situation.</p> <p>7 We've got so many.</p> <p>8 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: That's not enough. So a</p> <p>10 number was I take it eventually worked out as to what would</p> <p>11 be required. Is that right?</p> <p>12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Yes.</p> <p>13 CHAIRPERSON: Now some of those could be</p> <p>14 brought from elsewhere in the province.</p> <p>15 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.</p> <p>16 CHAIRPERSON: So that would have been a</p> <p>17 matter for the Provincial Commissioner herself to decide.</p> <p>18 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: But insofar as she needed</p> <p>20 extra help from outside the province, that was ultimately</p> <p>21 the decision, after consultation and everything, it was a</p> <p>22 decision of the Provincial Commissioner -</p> <p>23 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: - who amongst others I take</p> <p>25 it consulted with the Provincial Commissioner Gauteng who</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24329</p> <p>1 the National Commissioner and it was her, so ultimately it</p> <p>2 was her decision.</p> <p>3 GENERAL NAIDOO: In consultation with -</p> <p>4 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, yes, her decision</p> <p>5 in consultation -</p> <p>6 GENERAL NAIDOO: The provincial</p> <p>7 commissioners of other -</p> <p>8 CHAIRPERSON: Ja, that's right. Okay.</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman,</p> <p>10 for that assistance. I don't want to be speculating when</p> <p>11 it comes for me to make some submissions at the end of the</p> <p>12 day. Do I understand you - because I would like to</p> <p>13 actually understand how that deliberations and decision-</p> <p>14 making process took place at that meeting - do I understand</p> <p>15 your evidence to be saying that the Provincial</p> <p>16 Commissioner, General Mbombo made a request for the</p> <p>17 escalation of forces?</p> <p>18 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, what I've</p> <p>19 indicated was that there was an assessment done of the</p> <p>20 situation based on the various meetings and the incidents</p> <p>21 that have occurred and how best to address the situation.</p> <p>22 In the sum of it all it was clear that there was</p> <p>23 insufficient resources to do exactly what was required to</p> <p>24 stabilise the situation.</p> <p>25 Then -</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24331</p> <p>1 was with her.</p> <p>2 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: So the answer to your</p> <p>4 question is it was partly the decision of the Provincial</p> <p>5 Commissioner insofar as the deployment of extra resources</p> <p>6 from within the province was concerned, and for the rest it</p> <p>7 was a decision ultimately of the National Commissioner</p> <p>8 insofar as it related to resources from other provinces.</p> <p>9 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct.</p> <p>10 CHAIRPERSON: Is that the answer?</p> <p>11 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.</p> <p>12 CHAIRPERSON: Alright.</p> <p>13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>14 Now insofar as the National Commissioner - just to tag on</p> <p>15 the Chairman's clarification question - so insofar as the</p> <p>16 National Commissioner was there present, is it your</p> <p>17 evidence that she approved the decision that was taken?</p> <p>18 GENERAL NAIDOO: As I indicated, she</p> <p>19 agreed to assist with the resources that were requested.</p> <p>20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: She's the head of the</p> <p>21 national police service, isn't it? Did she approve the</p> <p>22 escalation of forces at that meeting?</p> <p>23 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think it's</p> <p>24 implied that if she's agreed with the, to assist with the</p> <p>25 request then she was not in disagreement, so she would have</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24332</p> <p>1 approved.</p> <p>2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now when you say it's</p> <p>3 implied, are you saying that you are not in a position to</p> <p>4 tell the Commission that when you got out of that meeting</p> <p>5 and you went to do what you did by all of this escalation</p> <p>6 of the forces, you inferred that there had been approval</p> <p>7 either from body language or from inferences? It's a</p> <p>8 straight question. Did she approve the final decision that</p> <p>9 you took that the forces must be escalated, at that meeting</p> <p>10 of the 13th of August 2012?</p> <p>11 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm trying to</p> <p>12 remember specifically how the discussion went, but in</p> <p>13 saying that she approved, as I indicated she was in, the</p> <p>14 indication was made to the National Commissioner that the</p> <p>15 province required certain additional resources and there</p> <p>16 was also input from the Provincial Commissioner Gauteng</p> <p>17 then who indicated he's in agreement and that certain areas</p> <p>18 such as intelligence needed to be boosted up, and the</p> <p>19 National Commissioner said well – now this is my words –</p> <p>20 that as long as the resources that you're requesting is</p> <p>21 going to be sufficient to handle the situation, then I have</p> <p>22 no problem with that. I'm just trying to sum it up. I</p> <p>23 can't indicate verbatim she said "I approve" or "I</p> <p>24 disapprove." That's, hence I'm saying she didn't disagree.</p> <p>25 She actually agreed to assist with the request that the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24334</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair no, it's, it works</p> <p>2 like this; with the exception of the Provincial</p> <p>3 Commissioner Gauteng who was with us in the meeting and he</p> <p>4 could already speak to his officers and give us an</p> <p>5 indication, the other people were contacted through our</p> <p>6 National Joint Operational Centre who normally facilitates</p> <p>7 these kind of activations. So they would have, they sit at</p> <p>8 national level and –</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt you.</p> <p>10 That's what you say in paragraph 32 of your statement.</p> <p>11 There you say "The escalation of police resources was</p> <p>12 facilitated via the NATJOC structures and the contingency</p> <p>13 plan in place was extended."</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Correct, Chair.</p> <p>15 CHAIRPERSON: Now, so but were you the</p> <p>16 person who got hold of the NATJOC structures and –</p> <p>17 [10:11] GENERAL NAIDOO: No.</p> <p>18 CHAIRPERSON: - had said please arrange</p> <p>19 for extra resources to be sent? Who –</p> <p>20 GENERAL NAIDOO: That was the –</p> <p>21 CHAIRPERSON: Who physically did the job</p> <p>22 of getting the extra people there?</p> <p>23 GENERAL NAIDOO: There, the line of</p> <p>24 communication there would be Major General Mpmembe. He was</p> <p>25 the Deputy Provincial Commissioner, Operations.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24333</p> <p>1 Provincial Commissioner made.</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: So if we look at paragraph</p> <p>3 33 of your statement you say that additional resources</p> <p>4 arrived the following day.</p> <p>5 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: Some had already come, and</p> <p>7 I take it you weren't actually involved in their coming,</p> <p>8 that's the NIU and POP people who'd come already on the</p> <p>9 Sunday from Gauteng and Mpumalanga. Well, leaving them out</p> <p>10 of the picture for the moment, all the other additional</p> <p>11 resources arrived –</p> <p>12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Yes.</p> <p>13 CHAIRPERSON: - in consequence of your</p> <p>14 actions as detailed in the second sentence of paragraph 33,</p> <p>15 namely you activated the various support sections in the</p> <p>16 province to support the increased deployments, responded to</p> <p>17 any other requests for support as they were received.</p> <p>18 GENERAL NAIDOO: Correct, Chair.</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: Were you the person who</p> <p>20 actually got on the telephone and telephoned the other</p> <p>21 provincial commissioners who were asked to send in</p> <p>22 additional resources –</p> <p>23 GENERAL NAIDOO: No –</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: - to say we need so many</p> <p>25 police, send them, or how did it work?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24335</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now I think we get</p> <p>2 some indication from paragraphs 36 to 37 of your statement</p> <p>3 of the kind of drastic escalation of forces that we are</p> <p>4 talking about, and the kind of forces that were under your</p> <p>5 command in terms of that statement. You see that?</p> <p>6 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see that, Chair.</p> <p>7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Special Task</p> <p>8 Force, National Intervention Unit, Tactical Response Units,</p> <p>9 Public Order Police, K9 Units, Mounted Units, Detectives, a</p> <p>10 whole range of people who were under your command in terms</p> <p>11 of that statement, certainly in the forward holding area</p> <p>12 they would be under your command. That was a consequence</p> <p>13 of that decision which you took on the 13th. Is that right?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.</p> <p>15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Alright, now when once</p> <p>16 obviously there is an involvement, I mean the situation was</p> <p>17 serious enough with two police officers having died and I</p> <p>18 would assume, and you will tell us if my assumption is</p> <p>19 wrong, that at that meeting there would have been a view</p> <p>20 expressed as to whether this is not a matter that should</p> <p>21 also get the approval of the Minister of Police, given the</p> <p>22 scale at which you were going to escalate the deployment of</p> <p>23 forces. Am I assuming correctly or incorrectly?</p> <p>24 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, there was no</p> <p>25 discussion about the Minister at that meeting, no.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24336</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: None at all?</p> <p>2 GENERAL NAIDOO: No.</p> <p>3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now that you look back</p> <p>4 on things, wasn't it a kind of – I don't know how it works</p> <p>5 with the police. That was a huge decision that you were</p> <p>6 going to take; a member of the, I mean two members of the</p> <p>7 police service has been killed. There was now a decision</p> <p>8 to bring in those kinds of units that you mention in the</p> <p>9 paragraphs I've just referred to.</p> <p>10 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, no –</p> <p>11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 36 and 37. Isn't it a</p> <p>12 kind of thing that you should have, or you would have had</p> <p>13 to advise the Minister about?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm not sure how</p> <p>15 the relationship or interface between the Minister and the</p> <p>16 National Commissioner is, but my understanding is that the</p> <p>17 National Commissioner is operationally charged with issues</p> <p>18 related thereto, as is the Provincial Commissioner in terms</p> <p>19 of the province. So they would not require permission or</p> <p>20 any other type of indication from the Minister in terms of</p> <p>21 their day-to-day activities. Yes, I'm sure they would have</p> <p>22 to inform the Minister of the serious incidents happening</p> <p>23 from a point of view of accountability, but they are</p> <p>24 directly charged in terms of the Constitution with policing</p> <p>25 activities and they account for it.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24338</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, thank you</p> <p>2 very much for reminding me once again. I will argue that I</p> <p>3 find that very unusual. Now can you just tell the</p> <p>4 Commission very briefly how the escalation was to occur?</p> <p>5 What was the plan and what was going to be the process?</p> <p>6 For instance which units were to be deployed, where were</p> <p>7 they to be deployed from?</p> <p>8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Okay, Chair, firstly</p> <p>9 there was an acknowledgement that the situation was not</p> <p>10 purely a public order one because there had been certain</p> <p>11 escalations, as I indicated, attacks by armed groups on</p> <p>12 various places and various people. So the reference that</p> <p>13 was made to this operation was a hybrid operation where it</p> <p>14 was a combination of the use of Public Order Police</p> <p>15 personnel, as well as tactical units to support them should</p> <p>16 the need arise, and the first agreement was that we should</p> <p>17 negotiate with the strikers and try and talk them down,</p> <p>18 because as things escalated from the 13th we were first told</p> <p>19 that these people were faceless and they were unknown, to a</p> <p>20 point after the incident of the 13th we had obtained</p> <p>21 photographs and established the identity of some of these</p> <p>22 people and they were employees of the Lonmin Mine, some of</p> <p>23 them. And so the decision was made to bring in some</p> <p>24 negotiators who could facilitate this dialogue with the</p> <p>25 strikers and the negotiation group, as they were referred,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24337</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now General Mbombo who</p> <p>2 was part of that meeting, I believe she testified to the</p> <p>3 fact that on the 12th of August already the Minister had</p> <p>4 called her to enquire about the situation. Do you recall</p> <p>5 that?</p> <p>6 GENERAL NAIDOO: I've seen that</p> <p>7 testimony, yes.</p> <p>8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now I just want you</p> <p>9 to try and recall; are you saying at a meeting of the top</p> <p>10 brass of the SAPS where a decision is to escalate</p> <p>11 drastically the forces to be deployed, against the backdrop</p> <p>12 of a Provincial Commissioner who testified that the</p> <p>13 Minister of Police had called her and asked her about the</p> <p>14 situation, that in that meeting no mention at all was made</p> <p>15 of the Minister?</p> <p>16 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I can confirm as</p> <p>17 far as I was at that meeting there was no mention or</p> <p>18 indication about the Minister's involvement, as far as I</p> <p>19 know.</p> <p>20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. I find that very</p> <p>21 unusual -</p> <p>22 CHAIRPERSON: No, you mustn't make</p> <p>23 comments, Mr Ntsebeza. Just ask questions. It's not</p> <p>24 appropriate for counsel to say what they find usual or</p> <p>25 unusual. It's for us to decide at the end of the day.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24339</p> <p>1 were supported by Public Order Police personnel to, as a</p> <p>2 form of protection as it was already known that the, there</p> <p>3 were firearms in circulation and there were attacks that</p> <p>4 took place on the Monday.</p> <p>5 So the phase 1, or the step 1 that was agreed to</p> <p>6 was to engage with the miners and to try and talk them down</p> <p>7 so that we could stabilise the situation, stop the</p> <p>8 violence, and restore safety and security to the area, and</p> <p>9 that was the primary thrust of our operation.</p> <p>10 The other units were held in reserve. The</p> <p>11 Tactical Response Teams were utilised to protect the rear</p> <p>12 of the Public Order Police Unit, and the other units were</p> <p>13 pooled to the forward holding areas which were</p> <p>14 approximately a kilometre away from where the strikers had</p> <p>15 gathered on the koppie.</p> <p>16 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, Major General, for</p> <p>17 interrupting. In the hope that this may shorten</p> <p>18 proceedings may I refer you to slides 136 and following of</p> <p>19 exhibit L? This apparently represents or gives us the,</p> <p>20 amongst other things the detail of the personnel involved</p> <p>21 on the 16th, divided up in the various sections. There's</p> <p>22 the command negotiation team which appears to have</p> <p>23 consisted of Brigadier Calitz and Lieutenant Colonel</p> <p>24 McIntosh and then there was an interpreter. I think the</p> <p>25 evidence is there were other people in the Nyala as well,</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24340</p> <p>1 but anyway, that's what that says. 2 Then there's the monitoring group, there we have 3 the details of the personnel. There were POP members and 4 information officers, and the commander was Colonel Mere. 5 Then there was a neutral area Response Team, Captain Loest 6 was the commander. There were 76 TRT members. Then there 7 was a defensive measure team, Colonel Makhubela with 53 POP 8 members. Then there was the immediate reaction area 1 9 team, Lieutenant Colonel Gaffley in charge with 20 STF and 10 25 NIU members. Then there was the immediate reaction area 11 2 team, Lieutenant Colonel Modiba in charge, 74 National 12 Intervention Unit people. 13 Forward holding area 1 you were in charge and 14 then there are details of your personnel set out in slide 15 142. 16 GENERAL NAIDOO: Correct, Chair. 17 CHAIRPERSON: And then we can go on, I 18 don't have to – there are also details of the personnel and 19 whether they were POP or K9 or TRT or NIU, whatever. That 20 appears also as far as forward holding area 2 is concerned 21 in slide 144, the aerial response team slide 145, aerial 22 command post 146, and then finally the air monitoring team, 23 147. 24 So is that as far as you know a more or less 25 complete statement of the various members, the personnel</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24342</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: But was there, apart from 2 the fact that in some ways there were more people on the 3 Wednesday than on the Thursday in certain areas, was there 4 a gradual build-up or were the people listed in the slides 5 to which I've referred you more or less all there from the 6 Tuesday? 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think Tuesday 8 we were not there yet. Wednesday was our larger build-up, 9 and on Thursday we were slightly less because Gauteng had 10 to withdraw some of their personnel. But that more or less 11 describes the deployment, Chair. 12 CHAIRPERSON: And you say this build-up, 13 this escalation of forces, if one can call them that, that 14 was facilitated through the NATJOC, you told us. 15 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 16 CHAIRPERSON: Is that the sort of 17 information you wanted, Mr Ntsebeza? 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, and I 19 think the slides that you indicated in exhibit L give a 20 sense. But may I just ask, General, on that day was there 21 more or less a view of the kind of forces that needed to be 22 deployed, the ones that for instance you describe both in 23 paragraph 37 of your statement and the ones which are 24 reflected in the slides that the Chairman has kindly 25 referred us to for perspective? Now would there have been</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24341</p> <p>1 resources, if one can call them that, of the SAPS at 2 Marikana on the 16th? 3 GENERAL NAIDOO: More or less, Chair. I 4 don't know if the JOC is mentioned there, but that was 5 just – 6 CHAIRPERSON: Well, the JOC is mentioned 7 earlier. They were, that's also set out in a slide. There 8 was a bit of duplication because some of the JOC people 9 were actually listed in the section I've read, but the JOC 10 people are in an earlier slide, that's slide 67 where we 11 have General Mpembe mentioned, we have General Annandale 12 mentioned, and Brigadier Pretorius, and you are listed, 13 although you then went to forward holding area 1, and 14 Brigadier Calitz also went out into the field on the 16th, 15 and I don't think that Colonel Scott is mentioned – oh, 16 we've got the structure, no there he is, we've got the 17 structure of the JOCCOM again with a bit of duplication 18 because some of the people were involved in the other 19 lists. That's in slide 68. So that's a more or less 20 complete statement of the people who were there on the 16th. 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 22 CHAIRPERSON: Now I think other people 23 had been there on the Wednesday, some of them, and gone 24 away again. Is that correct? 25 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's right.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24343</p> <p>1 on that day, on the 13th would there have been a clear view 2 as to who needs to be deployed? 3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, on the 13th, is 4 the reference to the meeting of the 13th where the 5 escalation of resources were decided? 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 7 CHAIRPERSON: I think Mr Ntsebeza has 8 been talking to you about the meeting in the evening of the 9 13th, after the shootings and so forth on the, and killings, 10 deaths in the afternoon, the meeting when the National 11 Commissioner came with Major General Petros and so on – 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Yes. 13 CHAIRPERSON: And other people were 14 present, all listed in your statement. 15 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct. 16 CHAIRPERSON: And you then decided there 17 had to be an escalation. That escalation was then 18 implemented in the way which you've described – 19 GENERAL NAIDOO: Yes. 20 CHAIRPERSON: - and as appears from the 21 slides to which I referred you. 22 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct. 23 CHAIRPERSON: But I think the starting 24 point of Mr Ntsebeza's question, or series of questions is 25 the evening meeting on the 13th. That's right, isn't it, Mr</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24344</p> <p>1 Ntsebeza?</p> <p>2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, Mr Ntsebeza, I think</p> <p>4 you've almost exhausted the first topic I gave you</p> <p>5 permission to cross-examine on. Is it perhaps appropriate</p> <p>6 for us to take tea now and you can take stock whether</p> <p>7 there's anything left before you move on to the next point?</p> <p>8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, we –</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: Actually we'll take a</p> <p>10 comfort break now, I think, and take tea later on, but</p> <p>11 we'll take a comfort break now for 10 minutes.</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>13 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]</p> <p>14 [10:48] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.</p> <p>15 Major-General, you're still under oath.</p> <p>16 GENERAL NAIDOO: Still under oath, Chair.</p> <p>17 GENERAL NAIDOO: s.u.o.</p> <p>18 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC (CONTD.):</p> <p>19 I was just trying to wear myself into the seat, Mr</p> <p>20 Chairman, I was not intending to stand whilst I cross-</p> <p>21 examine General Naidoo. Now, General Naidoo, just to round</p> <p>22 off where we were at, I was asking whether (onhoorbaar) the</p> <p>23 13th at that meeting or as a result of that meeting that you</p> <p>24 had with the National Commissioner and the others, there</p> <p>25 was any clear view as to what kind of additional force is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24346</p> <p>1 somebody compile a list, we need so many NIU, so many STF,</p> <p>2 so many extra POP and so on?</p> <p>3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair yes, the</p> <p>4 operational people were indicating the activities that</p> <p>5 would be undertaken and the type of capacity they would</p> <p>6 require and based on that the requests were being made. In</p> <p>7 addition to what's contained in my statement I know that</p> <p>8 there were a lot of intelligence and investigative people</p> <p>9 that assisted, also came from Gauteng to assist the</p> <p>10 investigation team. So it was based on the activities that</p> <p>11 were going to be conducted that the various specialists</p> <p>12 identified what the needs would be.</p> <p>13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you know if there is</p> <p>14 any paper work that would be supportive of what was decided</p> <p>15 at that meeting?</p> <p>16 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I am not sure</p> <p>17 exactly but I'm sure that there would be something from or</p> <p>18 to the NATJOC indicating the request and I am sure we can</p> <p>19 ascertain that, yes.</p> <p>20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Well, can I just say</p> <p>21 that it would be useful if we could get any and all paper</p> <p>22 work that reflects the meeting of the 13th of August 2012</p> <p>23 and which would be reflective, or the decisions that were</p> <p>24 taken at least and the kinds of additional forces that were</p> <p>25 deployed. Now just to round off this aspect, you indicated</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24345</p> <p>1 needed to be deployed because we know now what kind of</p> <p>2 forces were subsequently deployed.</p> <p>3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, as I testified,</p> <p>4 yes, mainly the requirement was for public order policing</p> <p>5 personnel and there was the need for national intervention</p> <p>6 unit people to conduct stability operations. The specific</p> <p>7 people that I remember to support the investigation was the</p> <p>8 special task force because the idea was that there would be</p> <p>9 rapid progress with the investigations and tracking down of</p> <p>10 suspects and recovery of arms and arresting of suspects.</p> <p>11 There also was TRT units that were identified and brought</p> <p>12 in to assist and K9 for searching for weapons, explosives</p> <p>13 dogs specifically, and then obviously the support team in</p> <p>14 order to ensure that the logistics infrastructure was there</p> <p>15 to support the operation.</p> <p>16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would you say that the</p> <p>17 units that you mention in paragraph 37 of your statement</p> <p>18 were the units that already at that meeting were decided</p> <p>19 would have to be deployed?</p> <p>20 GENERAL NAIDOO: Largely, yes. I think</p> <p>21 at that stage, I don't remember specific discussion about</p> <p>22 medical emergency and fire fighters but the other units,</p> <p>23 yes.</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: I just want to get clarity.</p> <p>25 At this meeting when you were discussing these matters, did</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24347</p> <p>1 that the decision to escalate the deployment of additional</p> <p>2 forces had been informed by a view that public order police</p> <p>3 units were not sufficient or this matter had gone beyond</p> <p>4 being a public order policing matter.</p> <p>5 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, that's correct.</p> <p>6 I indicated that there was a recognition that the situation</p> <p>7 had proceeded beyond normal crowd management.</p> <p>8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, and was that</p> <p>9 informed by the fact that the police, two police officers</p> <p>10 had been killed -</p> <p>11 GENERAL NAIDOO: No, Chair.</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: - in the skirmish on</p> <p>13 that day?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: No, Chair. As I</p> <p>15 indicated that there was an overview of the incidents that</p> <p>16 took place on Saturday where various workers had been</p> <p>17 killed, various installations had been attacked, vehicles</p> <p>18 burnt –</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: Was that Saturday or</p> <p>20 Sunday? On Saturday –</p> <p>21 GENERAL NAIDOO: Some Saturday –</p> <p>22 CHAIRPERSON: - there was an attack on</p> <p>23 the NUM office. It was believed that two people had been</p> <p>24 killed. It turned out they weren't, that was a story that</p> <p>25 was spread around that wasn't true although it may well be</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24348</p> <p>1 that the people who spread the story believed it to be 2 true, so I'm not making a point. Then on the Sunday 3 morning two security guards were killed. 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct. 5 CHAIRPERSON: Sunday evening two people 6 were killed, I think at K4. 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct. 8 CHAIRPERSON: And vehicles and so on were 9 damaged, that was on the Sunday. 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct. 11 CHAIRPERSON: And then on the Monday of 12 course there was the incident that – 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, before the 14 incident between the police these on Monday morning an 15 additional body was discovered at the railway line, 16 bringing the total to approximately nine on Monday. 17 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, you talked about 18 deaths on the Saturday, that's really what I was – I don't 19 remember – 20 GENERAL NAIDOO: No. 21 CHAIRPERSON: If I'm wrong I'll be happy 22 to be corrected. My recollection was it was thought two 23 people had been killed on the Saturday. They were injured 24 and they were taken to hospital and it was believed they'd 25 been killed and I think there was a genuine belief but as</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24350</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I agree with you 2 and I have testified to that effect. Hence the request for 3 elements of the national intervention unit to come and 4 support the units on Sunday. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Perhaps if I came up 6 with the suggestion that the decision on the 13th at that 7 meeting to escalate the deployment of forces was only 8 caused by the death of the two police officers - maybe let 9 me ask it differently. Would you agree that the deaths of 10 the two police officers was an added impetus that informed 11 the decision to escalate the forces? 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, if we look at the 13 deployment from Friday, from approximately 27 members to 14 Sunday when we went to approximately 70 members and then 15 until Monday when we then further escalated from Monday, 16 beyond Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday. So yes, 17 incidents did add impetus to the escalation of the 18 resources that were deployed there. 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And is that a reason 20 that you say at that meeting you decided that this matter 21 had now gone beyond being a public order policing matter? 22 GENERAL NAIDOO: That is correct, Chair. 23 The review of the incidents, as I said, from Saturday until 24 Monday, had indicated that this situation had gone beyond 25 normal crowd management.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24349</p> <p>1 far as I know, am I correct in thinking the first actual 2 fatality was on the Sunday? 3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, that's correct. 4 What I indicated, the question was, was it only the 5 incident involving the police officials that triggered the 6 drastic escalation of resources and I, my response was that 7 the incidents starting from Saturday had indicated that 8 there was a growing trend that needed to be arrested. 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, you know from 10 the evidence that was led that on the 12th already the 11 Minister had become so concerned about what had happened up 12 to and including the 12th that he sought to establish from 13 General Mbombo what the situation was. Isn't that right? 14 GENERAL NAIDOO: From the evidence led I 15 established that, yes. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: In fact, some of the 17 people who had died up to that point had died horrible 18 deaths. One was incinerated, if some of the footage that I 19 remember is relevant. I think one of the security guards 20 at Lonmin. 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And on your proposition 23 I would assume that that would have been a basis at that 24 point on the 12th, to say this is now no longer a crowd 25 control situation. Would you agree with me?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24351</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Right. Now I want to 2 move to another topic, General, and that is – 3 CHAIRPERSON: Before you move to another 4 topic or rather before you move to the topic you have in 5 mind, let me ask this. You were, I know the request was 6 that you do it during tea-time and we haven't had tea-time 7 yet, we had the comfort break but have you been able to 8 ascertain in the meanwhile who the duty General was on the 9 12th? 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair – 11 CHAIRPERSON: Because one of Mr 12 Ntsebeza's matters that I have given him leave to cross- 13 examine on was held over until that information is 14 available. 15 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair yes, I have 16 secured the duty list for that week and I have the duty 17 General as well as the duty Brigadier. The duty General 18 was Major-General Nkomane and the duty Brigadier was 19 Brigadier Calitz and I have checked with Brigadier, General 20 Nkomane, he had not received any such call. 21 CHAIRPERSON: No such call, you mean a 22 call from Mr Zokwana? 23 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 24 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, I thought that</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24352</p> <p>1 you were being asked only to find out who was the duty 2 General on that day and not to pursue the further question 3 that I was putting to you as to whether or not he had 4 received – we'll have to accept your say-so that he says he 5 never got a call from Zokwana, but would he have been the 6 second-in-command or would he have been the one who would 7 be acting in the absence of yourself? 8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, what I indicated, 9 the duty General and the duty Brigadier are the 10 representatives of the Provincial Commissioner's office for 11 that week after-hours, in other words, should there be a 12 need. It does not exclude the Provincial Commissioner from 13 going and attending to a particular incident should she 14 receive the information from them, but what is circulated 15 to every station is a duty list for the various functions, 16 from the National Commissioner's office to the last 17 cluster. So should there be an enquiry, that there is 18 somebody from management available to first become aware 19 and also give direction in terms of a particular incident 20 or issue that may arise. 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So in our attempt to 22 resolve the Zokwana telephone conundrum of the 12th of 23 August 2012, would this General, General Nkomane, would he 24 have been the person who would have received a telephone 25 call from Zokwana on the basis that you have indicated,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24354</p> <p>1 Chairman. Now, I want to move on to the topic of 2 paramedics. I was here when Mr Chaskalson dealt with this 3 aspect and I will not re-traverse with you what he was 4 cross-examining you about the delays in getting paramedics 5 to scene 1 and you will recall that he dealt at some length 6 with you about the case of Mr Mdze. 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: I do. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And you know Mr Mdze is 9 one of the people whom I represent. I will not traverse 10 the area Mr Chaskalson dealt with except for just one 11 aspect and can we go to the evidence on – it's day 193 and 12 page 23587 starting at line 20 on that page and it goes on 13 to 23589 line 8. Now, Mr Chaskalson there is generally 14 exploring policy issues and now on 23588 – it's not mine, 15 Mr Chairman. 16 CHAIRPERSON: A cell phone went off 17 earlier and I thought I'd ignore it on the basis that 18 everybody here by this time knows that you must have your 19 cell phone turned off and if you don't, there'll be severe 20 consequences so I erred in not reminding everybody 21 concerned that that is so. Please make sure that your cell 22 phones are turned off. It's very – as you can see, it's 23 very disturbing, wastes time. That was something on the 24 computer that came through, those must also be turned off. 25 We don't want these disturbances, otherwise I shall have to</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24353</p> <p>1 after-hours on a Sunday and in the Provincial 2 Commissioner's office? 3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, on the basis of, 4 as I explained, should Mr Zokwana have approached any of 5 the contact points or whoever police, to establish I need 6 to contact the Provincial Commissioner, then he would have 7 been given that these are the duty officers that are 8 available and then obviously he is free to contact them. 9 CHAIRPERSON: Of course he might, for all 10 we know, I don't know if anyone asked him this when he gave 11 evidence, he might have had a telephone number in his diary 12 of someone to telephone, a cell number or direct – so he 13 may have had his own information to give him access and he 14 wouldn't have gone through the route you've suggested for 15 finding out who was the duty officer supposedly at the 16 other end of a telephone that afternoon, is that correct? 17 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, yes. We were 18 working on the basis that he called the Provincial 19 Commissioner's office. 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Ja, he seems to be able 21 to call people in high office, including the Minister, from 22 what he indicated. Now who did you say the Brigadier was? 23 Calitz? 24 GENERAL NAIDOO: Brigadier Calitz. 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay. Thank you, Mr</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24355</p> <p>1 take the kind of action that both I and the person I deal 2 with, will regret. 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 4 Now, Mr Chaskalson put it to you, if you read from line 1 5 but the sentence in line 2, "One can't have a situation 6 where the policy means that people die, bleeding to death 7 on the ground understood. Whatever resource issues are 8 implicated, one has to have a policy that will prevent 9 someone bleeding to death for no good reason. What's your 10 response to that?" Then you gave a long response but that 11 is my area of concern. You say, "Obviously we are – we are 12 supposed to be a service to the community so things that 13 retard the provision of service to the community needs to 14 be addressed and the public service invariably addresses 15 these things by way of policies. So I agree that we should 16 have a policy clarifying. You must remember we 17 are talking about an individual and possibly very junior 18 member who faced, who has to face these tough questions and 19 to make a decision there at ground level on his own – when 20 I say tough questions, we are on a daily basis and it is an 21 issue which is in the media continuously, facing billions 22 of rands of civil claims for issues like a person that was 23 transported in a police vehicle to go and get medical 24 assistance and the police are now being sued for 25 contributing to the death because the person was in a</p>

Page 24356

1 police vehicle." And then it goes on, "It happens." Now
 2 firstly, I just want to find out whether you were, you are
 3 satisfied that you were addressing the question. The
 4 question was at two levels. It sought to find out whether
 5 you have a policy that would almost compel a member of the
 6 service to prevent a person bleeding to death. In fact the
 7 question was framed in those kinds of words. And you'll
 8 correct me if I'm wrong, your answer seems to be saying in
 9 part that a member of the police service, specially a
 10 junior member, would be justified in not doing anything to
 11 stop the bleeding because members of the police service and
 12 the police service itself is facing billions of claims,
 13 billions of rands of civil claims. Am I capturing the
 14 essence of your response correctly?
 15 [11:08] GENERAL NAIDOO: Not entirely, Chair.
 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Talk to me.
 17 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I agree that we
 18 must make policy. I further indicate that that policy
 19 should, it should not be just a document that you put on
 20 the table saying that from today onwards police officials
 21 must attend to people when they attend. I said that that
 22 policy should be adequately resourced with training,
 23 resources, et cetera, and the issue, the legal issues that
 24 are frequently confronting police officials and which
 25 contributes to police officials being reluctant to

Page 24357

1 intervene personally should be addressed because it happens
 2 on a frequent basis that a person is badly injured or sick
 3 and is transported in a police vehicle to a medical
 4 facility and the person passes on and then the police face
 5 a civil claim. Now this generally generates a reluctance
 6 in people to do these kind of things, so our policy and our
 7 training and our resourcing to enable to do this should be
 8 in place. Quite frequently what happens is we make a
 9 policy and then we leave the young member out there to now
 10 manage this policy and these issues, the legal issues, et
 11 cetera, should be clarified to them so that they understand
 12 that on the following basis the policy has been made, these
 13 are your responsibilities, these are the dos and these are
 14 the don'ts. I also indicated that police officials are
 15 also in a difficult position and I think there was
 16 reference to the issue of the Hippocratic oath because on
 17 one side they also carry firearms and on the other side
 18 they are also expected to tend to people. There's a little
 19 bit of a conflict in terms of the codes of conduct but I
 20 think on the basis of what I said, I said it would be a
 21 thing in part of our community services to be able to
 22 extend that particular service as part of our range of
 23 services, provided it is properly dealt with and we are
 24 putting our members in a position where they can respond
 25 and handle the situation and not base it on the experiences

Page 24358

1 where the reluctance creeps in.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, the question
 3 was a very specific one to a very specific case and your
 4 response as a General in the SAPS was being solicited. Are
 5 you saying that when a person is bleeding to death the SAPS
 6 officers in the vicinity will be reluctant to stop the
 7 bleeding – and I will come to stopping the bleeding in a
 8 while – because the police service has been exposed to
 9 billions of rands of civil claims. Is that what you're
 10 saying?
 11 GENERAL NAIDOO: No, Chair. What I'm
 12 saying is when we make policy we should, in that policy,
 13 resource it sufficiently and articulate it sufficiently so
 14 that our junior personnel are empowered and feel secure in
 15 doing what they have to do. There is a reluctance, I have
 16 already indicated, for police officials to intervene in
 17 medical issues. A normal expectation is a person would see
 18 somebody injured and would want to assist. I think the
 19 level of intervention that is being expected is what is at
 20 issue here. We are asking police officials to render first
 21 aid or paramedic assistance and we must make sure that we
 22 create conditions, create the environment conducive for
 23 them to be just that.
 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, are you saying
 25 in your assessment of Mdze's situation where we know for a

Page 24359

1 long time he was there and SAPS members were in the
 2 vicinity and he literally bled to death, is your evidence
 3 that your assessment of non-action on the part of those
 4 SAPS members who were there is that they may have been
 5 disinclined to stop the bleeding because SAPS get exposed
 6 to billions of rands of civil claims when they do
 7 intervene, even when they are well-intentioned? Is that
 8 what you want the Commission to accept with regard to this
 9 specific case?
 10 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, that question has
 11 been asked four times and the answers the witness has been
 12 giving was that not entirely, the first time, he said no
 13 the second time. I don't know why we're still ploughing
 14 the same field.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, what do you
 16 say about this? You have asked the question quite a lot.
 17 Perhaps the way to do it is to ask, give the witness one
 18 more chance to explain clearly what he met by referring to
 19 the balance with reality – you see the last line on the
 20 screen? He's talking about policy decision and then he
 21 talks about there has to be a balance, policies have to
 22 have a balance with some reality. Perhaps he could just
 23 explain that shortly to us and then I think Mr Semanya's
 24 objection should be upheld and you should move on to
 25 something else.

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24360</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, maybe let 2 me put the same question now for the fifth time on Mr 3 Semenya's counting, but differently. 4 CHAIRPERSON: The way I put it, did you 5 hear the way I formulated the question? What exactly did 6 you mean by saying policies have to have a balance with 7 some reality? I understand it's a complicated question, 8 difficult for you to deal with in a short compass but just 9 if you can sketch it in a sentence or two, how the balance 10 would operate to some extent, what factors have to be taken 11 into account on either side of the balance, if one could 12 put it that way? 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, yes. I think 14 that balance with reality was outlining specifically what 15 we have now discussed several times, that it would be 16 simplistic to say yes, we'll just make a policy that says 17 that the police must attend to individuals that are injured 18 when they arrive at a particular scene. I sketched the 19 various factors that must be taken in, firstly the 20 training, the resourcing, I spoke about the legal 21 implications which we are continuously in the police being 22 told about that, you know, before you do this you must 23 remember the legal consequences of your actions and all 24 these things contribute to the attitude of the people that 25 we expect to do this job. So we need to create that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24362</p> <p>1 proceed much longer. It seems to me there are important 2 policy considerations in respect of which we have to make, 3 may well have to make – I don't say we have to, we may have 4 to make recommendations or be asked to make recommendations 5 and I wouldn't think that the recommendations would be 6 based upon your evidence one way or t'other, if you'll 7 forgive my putting it as bluntly as that, but it is an 8 important matter but I don't think prima facie that we're – 9 and I'm not being unkind to the Major-General because he's 10 got his expertise in a number of fields that we respect but 11 I don't get the impression this is one where he can really 12 make a meaningful contribution, but I'm sure that this is a 13 matter which we may well receive valuable contributions, I 14 hope in writing and not by way of oral evidence, before we 15 give our reports. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, General, I would 17 like you to appreciate that I'm putting these questions 18 because I represent people who are unsophisticated, you 19 know, these things about policy and all that. They – the 20 point of departure for whom I represent would be, there are 21 rudimentary, you don't need training, there are rudimentary 22 things that you do when you find a person bleeding. For 23 instance, in this case we know that Mr Mdze was bleeding 24 from a wound in the hand or in the arm. Now, and even in 25 standard 3 under bantu education we knew that if a person</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24361</p> <p>1 environment that's conducive and will also generate that 2 right attitude. 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Perhaps let's put policy 4 aside, General, and talk about the reality but before we do 5 that, let me just ask one question. Are you aware of any 6 case in which the SAPS has been sued because a member of 7 the SAPS was trying to stop the person from bleeding to 8 death? 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm sure we can 10 establish if there is such a case. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Are you saying, are you 12 really saying that there is a case like that? 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I am saying that 14 I can establish whether there is such an instance. 15 CHAIRPERSON: You don't know. 16 GENERAL NAIDOO: Not off the top of my 17 head. 18 CHAIRPERSON: Maybe if there is such a 19 case you can draw it to the attention of the SAPS legal 20 team or they can make their own enquiries and then bring it 21 to our attention in the argument stage, I would imagine, or 22 possibly – if it's not something that can be dealt with by 23 referring to the law reports but short little affidavits or 24 a document setting out a case of that kind but I'm 25 reluctant to allow the cross-examination on this point to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24363</p> <p>1 is bleeding it means the heart is pumping the blood and 2 therefore you must do something to stop the pumping of the 3 blood by the heart and therefore find a place between the 4 wound and the heart and tie something around there. I'm 5 sure you are aware of those sort of basic rudimentary steps 6 to try and stop bleeding, are you not, General? 7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Some, yes. 8 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, I don't want 9 to stop you but you know I think you're arguing matters now 10 with the witness which you can argue at the end of the 11 case, I would think. I don't know what he learnt, what 12 first aid he learnt in sub-B, in standard 3 or grade 5. 13 There will be a legal debate. I can foresee I think with 14 some accuracy, the end of the case in relation to this 15 particular deceased and there will be argument as to 16 whether there was a legal duty on the police to give him 17 first aid before the medics arrived, whether there was a 18 duty to get medics there on time to deal with the situation 19 before it became out of control. All these matters will 20 obviously be covered in argument but I don't know, with 21 respect, that any evidence this witness will give us on the 22 point will assist us to make recommendations or express our 23 views insofar as we're called upon to do so, on the 24 questions that will be argued. So I think it might be 25 helpful to move on to something else. I'm not</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24364</p> <p>1 unsympathetic. I understand the point you make. You're 2 appearing for unsophisticated clients who don't understand 3 concepts like policy and the kind of balancing that a court 4 has to do in deciding whether there's a legal duty but – or 5 they may not understand, I mustn't be unkind, they may well 6 understand but I'm not sure that the answers that the 7 witness will give us will assist them to understand these 8 things any better, but they will have the satisfaction, I'm 9 sure, of knowing that these points will be argued at the 10 end and material that's relevant will be put before us, 11 possibly on affidavit, to assist us to make the right 12 recommendation. They need not fear that these points will 13 be ignored merely because I'm stopping you from proceeding 14 with this line.</p> <p>15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm sure they will, Mr 16 Chairman. I did indicate to you that as much as could have 17 been dealt with, with regard to Mr Mdze, was dealt with by 18 Mr Chaskalson. Now there is exhibit MMM10 which I would 19 like to go to in respect to the consequences to other, to 20 other consequences which we want to argue resulted from the 21 delay in getting paramedics very early to scene 1. Now in 22 addition to Mr Mdze, Dr Boffard concludes that other 23 victims could have been saved if paramedics had reached the 24 scene without delay and in this regard he refers to Mr 25 Mzukisi Sompeta, S-O-M-P-E-T-A, and Mr Lendingoane or</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24366</p> <p>1 incision through the abdominal wall to get access to the 2 abdominal cavity. Now I believe that the Rustenburg 3 hospital does perform this procedure called laparotomy and 4 then the question is this, what is your reaction to what 5 Doctor Boffard says about that death being one of those 6 that could have been prevented had there been no delay in 7 the deployment of paramedics?</p> <p>8 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the witness can't 9 offer medical opinion.</p> <p>10 CHAIRPERSON: What do you say to that 11 point Mr Ntsebeza?</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: On the assumption that 13 the medical opinion expressed by Doctor Boffard is correct 14 –</p> <p>15 CHAIRPERSON: - the opinion you're asking 16 him to give, one that he is in no special position to give 17 which puts him in a stronger position than we would be in 18 forming an opinion on a point. It's a point we've had 19 often in this Commission that witnesses are asked to 20 venture opinions on matters on which they have no special 21 expertise which the Commission is as well equipped to 22 express an opinion on as the witness. Now isn't this such 23 a case? I mean for example there are problems in relation, 24 of course, to getting in time to Rustenburg, but I would 25 like to know, if this point is to be taken further, whether</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24365</p> <p>1 Ledingoane, Ledingoane. I shouldn't be bothering – well, I 2 shouldn't be involving myself about Ledingoane because –</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: If you can't – I'm sure you 4 can pronounce the name correctly, can't you, Mr Ntsebeza? 5 The trouble is the transcribers might not be able to, which 6 is why you're giving the spelling, which is –</p> <p>7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, it's a Sotho 8 name. Mr Chairman, that Mr Ledingoane is being represented 9 by the LRC so I won't deal with that. Now page 21 of 10 MMM10, if we could get to that with respect to Mr Sompeta, 11 starting at where it says, "Although the injury rendered 12 him paraplegic from a spinal cord injury, this was at low 13 level so would not have affected his breathing. His only 14 other injury from the report appears to have been a 15 laceration of kidney. Had he had earlier access to care, 16 although the ambulance personnel would not themselves have 17 been able to stop the bleeding, they would have been able 18 to manage his airway, place an IV line and transport to 19 level 2 hospital. They should have had ample time to do 20 this and his injuries under the circumstances are regarded 21 as survivable had he reached a facility earlier which was 22 capable of performing a laparotomy and stopping the 23 bleeding.</p> <p>24 [11:27] This death is therefore regarded as potentially 25 preventable death. Now I'm told that a laparotomy is an</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24367</p> <p>1 this procedure was capable of being performed at the Andrew 2 Saffy hospital because that was obviously much closer. But 3 these are all matters that this witness can't help us on 4 and the question you're asking also, I think or suspect is 5 one in which he has no special expertise on. You can 6 certainly argue the point at the end or it may be that 7 perhaps an expert can be called, but we've already got 8 Professor Boffard and I don't see any point in asking 9 this witness anything on the point.</p> <p>10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, I was not 11 seeking his medical opinion, I am simply seeking his 12 reaction as having been in charge. I mean he himself says 13 in his statement that he was in charge of emergency 14 services on the day and that included him being in charge –</p> <p>15 CHAIRPERSON: I understand what you're 16 saying, but how would his reaction assist us at the end in 17 answering the questions posed in our terms of reference? 18 Would his reaction take the matter any further one way or 19 the other? If his reaction is that he doesn't think he's 20 responsible in any way, that's his opinion, even if he says 21 thinks perhaps that he is responsible in some way, we 22 wouldn't be bound by that admission on his part would we?</p> <p>23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Except that if part of 24 your duty as I sit behind you, you are committing to find 25 the truth in the interests of restoration and justice, it</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24368</p> <p>1 might be important to get from this witness the extent to 2 which with hindsight, even if he himself was not 3 responsible for the delay because of all the reasons that 4 he gave.</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: Would his hindsight be any 6 better than our hindsight assisted by learned argument from 7 you and your colleagues? I think I'll disallow the 8 question, you must move onto the next point. It doesn't 9 mean, as I've indicated that you can't argue these points 10 at the end. I don't want your clients to think that this 11 point won't be the subject of argument before us and that 12 all meaningful evidence is that – the relevant evidence 13 won't be before us, I'm simply saying I don't think his 14 evidence would be relevant on this matter. But they 15 mustn't think, they mustn't fear that I'm stopping 16 arguments on this point at the end because I most certainly 17 won't.</p> <p>18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Well, Mr Chairman – 19 CHAIRPERSON: I've made my ruling. 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, let me just 21 record to that, I'm not asking a question there, let me 22 just record that we will argue that you knew the 23 responsibility as having been in charge of the medical 24 service is such that we will argue for him to be held 25 culpable for the deaths that occurred and that we will even</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24370</p> <p>1 that particular video came to and end, the clips that we 2 saw. The whole section of the clip – it's an ENews clip 3 isn't it? The whole section preceded by the writing on 4 screen to the effect that no signs of first aid being 5 administered. It goes right to the end of that section and 6 then what now appears on the screen is the following, in 7 the distance miners can be seen running, that's effected at 8 the end of the section that we saw.</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now we know, General, 10 that there were no paramedics at that scene because they 11 only arrived an hour after the shooting and this was, I 12 think, after the shooting. Would you agree with that?</p> <p>13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I am not sure at 14 what time the paramedics arrived at the scene. As it was 15 indicated in previous testimony Brigadier Pretorius, in her 16 supplementary statement did make supplementary arrangements 17 for additional paramedics but as to the when the paramedics 18 arrived at the scene I am unable to testify.</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: We saw video material which 20 tended to indicate when they arrived. I understand that 21 AVL evidence will be forthcoming from Lonmin which will 22 indicate, one hopes with a fair degree of accuracy, when 23 precisely the extra ambulances that Brigadier Pretorius 24 asked to be sent arrived on the scene. But at the moment 25 what we have on record is 58 minutes. That may require</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24369</p> <p>1 move for his prosecution for that the deaths that occurred. 2 He may want to react to that, but, Mr Chairman, you have 3 ruled. Now, Mr Chairman, can we go to exhibit EEE16 which 4 I believe is a video clip and you might want to give a 5 warning at this stage, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: I'm informed that we are 7 going to see in a moment a video clip which shows, 8 according to what you can see on the screen at the moment, 9 what is described as the massacre unfolding. In other 10 words we're likely to see shots being fired at people who 11 died in consequence thereof and some of whose loved ones 12 and relatives may be in the chamber. And I anticipate and 13 I think Mr Ntsebeza does also that the loved ones and 14 relatives to whom I have referred may experience extreme 15 emotional distress at seeing these video clips. So I ask 16 that they not be shown until a minute from now to give 17 anyone who wishes to leave the chamber and avoid the 18 emotional distress to which I have referred, the 19 opportunity to leave. The minute will start now. Half a 20 minute has expired, no one has showed any signs of wanting 21 to leave, so I presume we can proceed.</p> <p>22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman, 23 I believe that the clip starts at 12:15. 24 [VIDEO SHOWN] 25 CHAIRPERSON: Just put on record when</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24371</p> <p>1 some revision in the light of this extra evidence we may be 2 getting, but I think for present purposes we can work on 3 the basis of 58 minutes.</p> <p>4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, I thought it was 5 common cause that, Chair. Maybe not about the hour, but 6 there were no paramedics at that stage of this clip. There 7 is no quarrel about that, the –</p> <p>8 CHAIRPERSON: There are clearly no 9 paramedics, I would think, at the time of the clip. I'm 10 not quite sure at what time on the time line that what we 11 see on the clip happened, but certainly it would seem 12 there's no sign of any paramedic at all. Do we know, while 13 we're about it, do you we know at what time what we saw on 14 that clip took place? Mr Chaskalson normally has these 15 things at his fingertips. Can you tell us, Mr Chaskalson?</p> <p>16 MR CHASKALSON SC: Chairperson, I don't 17 know the source material for that particular clip, so I 18 can't give you an exact time. I would be able to estimate 19 that, but I can't give you –</p> <p>20 CHAIRPERSON: If Mr Ntsebeza needs it 21 he'll let us know and we can get it later, but the point, I 22 take it, he's making is there's no sign of a paramedic at 23 that stage.</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes that's the point. A 25 further point is that –</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24372</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: What I got reminded about 2 with him was it goes further than I put it. There's no 3 sign of any paramedic on the scene and there's no sign of 4 anybody else. The only other people on the scene are 5 members of the police service endeavouring to do what 6 Lieutenant-Colonel McIntosh did in the vicinity of scene 2 7 when someone was shot, giving first aid. No sign of that, 8 that's the point isn't it? 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm sure the General 10 agrees with that observation by the Chair. 11 GENERAL NAIDOO: Agreed, Chair. 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, in fact what units 13 are those, TRT units is it? 14 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: They certainly are not 16 administering first aid. You saw in that picture. 17 GENERAL NAIDOO: We've seen that, Chair. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: If anything it seems to 19 me that they just walk around amongst the dead and the 20 injured. In some cases they are dragging them and in one 21 case there's a suggestion that they're putting a boot on 22 the protestors faces. Did you see that? 23 GENERAL NAIDOO: I saw something there, 24 yes. 25 CHAIRPERSON: Something like that, ja.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24374</p> <p>1 to people who are obviously injured and dying, first aid or 2 not, the police didn't do so because there is a fear 3 generally that any intervention, even a well intentioned 4 one, to assist might lead to civil claims? 5 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm not sure 6 where the training and the capacity of these individual 7 members, so I'm not sure, in terms of their reaction or 8 their well intentioned assistance if they could have 9 rendered whether they would have thought it possible. So 10 I'm unable to make a judgment on that. 11 CHAIRPERSON: Have you come to the end of 12 this point because I'm proposing to suggest that we have 13 the tea adjournment when you've finished the point? Your 14 junior nods her head and presumably she has a good idea of 15 what you're dealing with in your cross-examination. So 16 we'll take the tea adjournment now. Let's try to resume – 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, yes Mr Chairman. 18 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] 19 [12:08] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. 20 Major General, you're still under oath. 21 GANASEN NAIDOO: Still under oath, Chair. 22 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza. 23 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC (CONTD.): 24 Thank you, Mr Chairman. Now General, what I do want to put 25 to you, especially with what we saw happened to Mr</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24373</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: I think I saw something 2 like that, Chair. 3 CHAIRPERSON: You saw something like 4 that. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It's not disputed, there 6 are other – ja at least you also say you saw something like 7 that. Now the other movements, there was a person there 8 with a blanket whose hand who was clearly moving, but there 9 is one person whom we see and he's alive at that stage and 10 that is Mr Nteneja the man in the orange jersey. Did you 11 see? The man who was attempting to sit up, shaking, 12 clearly in a lot of pain I would assume and then fell again 13 in the midst of gun wielding TRT forces. Did you see that, 14 General? 15 GENERAL NAIDOO: I saw that, Chair. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now is it your case 17 still that the way to respond to the injured and the dying 18 is to drag them around, to push boots into their faces? 19 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I don't think 20 that ever was my case. 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I didn't hear that, 22 General. 23 CHAIRPERSON: It was never his case. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Never your case. Is it 25 your case that instead of seeking to render any assistance</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24375</p> <p>1 Ntenetya, the man in the orange jersey, is not so much what 2 the TRT did; that's a debate for another day and perhaps 3 for another witness. What I am putting to you is that the 4 delay in the deployment of paramedics to that scene 5 timeously quite clearly was responsible for the fatalities 6 that took place. Would you agree with that proposition? 7 CHAIRPERSON: That's something he needs 8 medical expertise to answer and he's not a medical man. 9 We've already got the views of Professor Boffard before us, 10 but can he add any value to that? I'm not saying that the 11 answer to the question you're asking is necessarily in the 12 negative, but I'm saying that I'm not sure that he can give 13 any meaningful answer that we can rely on one way or 14 t'other. 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I take the point, Mr 16 Chairman. What perhaps I should be putting to you, at the 17 very least, is that if the paramedics were there almost 18 immediately, even in respect of those who were injured but 19 whose deaths could not be prevented for a variety of 20 reasons that Dr Boffard talks about, at least there is 21 something that would have been of value, and this is what I 22 want to debate with you, if the paramedics were deployed 23 there immediately. For instance the paramedics would have 24 been able to alleviate the pain of those who were suffering 25 from pain as a consequence of the injuries they had</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24376</p> <p>1 received. Would you agree –</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: Are you able to answer that</p> <p>3 question?</p> <p>4 GENERAL NAIDOO: I don't have any</p> <p>5 expertise in that, Chair.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: Do you have the facts? I</p> <p>7 mean did the paramedics have morphine for example with them</p> <p>8 or anything that would assist them to alleviate pain?</p> <p>9 GENERAL NAIDOO: I have no –</p> <p>10 CHAIRPERSON: To your knowledge.</p> <p>11 GENERAL NAIDOO: I have no idea, Chair.</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you know what the</p> <p>13 paramedics had?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I know that they</p> <p>15 had some equipment with them. I don't have an expertise in</p> <p>16 terms of that, so I can't precisely say what they had.</p> <p>17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: What equipment was this?</p> <p>18 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, paramedic</p> <p>19 equipment. As I said, I don't have expertise to say</p> <p>20 exactly what equipment they had.</p> <p>21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: What is paramedic</p> <p>22 equipment?</p> <p>23 GENERAL NAIDOO: They had their first aid</p> <p>24 bags.</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: First aid bags. What –</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24378</p> <p>1 professor, isn't he? Mr Chaskalson, he's a professor,</p> <p>2 isn't he?</p> <p>3 MR CHASKALSON SC: He is a professor,</p> <p>4 Chairperson.</p> <p>5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: He's not a doctor? Oh,</p> <p>6 Prof Doc. Now he tells us that the following people would</p> <p>7 not have died immediately, I think it should be on page 17</p> <p>8 of his report, and that would be in addition to Mr</p> <p>9 Ntenetya. Now if we turn to page 17 of his report he lists</p> <p>10 the people as being Michael –</p> <p>11 CHAIRPERSON: We have that on the screen</p> <p>12 now, don't we?</p> <p>13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Oh yes.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to read out all</p> <p>15 the names, as long as you can pronounce them correctly?</p> <p>16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, there's no danger of</p> <p>17 – well –</p> <p>18 CHAIRPERSON: The Xhosa ones you won't</p> <p>19 have a problem with, but –</p> <p>20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>21 CHAIRPERSON: - the Sotho ones, anyway</p> <p>22 it's important that people's names be correctly pronounced,</p> <p>23 if possible.</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, indeed, indeed.</p> <p>25 CHAIRPERSON: So the kind of dignified</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24377</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: Do you know what was in the</p> <p>2 first aid bags?</p> <p>3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Exactly.</p> <p>4 GENERAL NAIDOO: No, Chair.</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, Mr Ntsebeza,</p> <p>6 that's your question. Forgive me. You can regard it as</p> <p>7 his question. What's the answer?</p> <p>8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, my assumption is</p> <p>9 equipment that they would use to do their job.</p> <p>10 CHAIRPERSON: So you don't know. You</p> <p>11 haven't looked in the first aid bags to see what they had?</p> <p>12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Not myself, no.</p> <p>13 CHAIRPERSON: Is that correct?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Yes, Chair.</p> <p>15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'll ask just one</p> <p>16 question which does not call for medical expertise. It</p> <p>17 certainly speaks to what human beings do. Paramedics I</p> <p>18 would assume under your command would have given the</p> <p>19 people, even those who died, the opportunity to die with</p> <p>20 some measure of dignity. They would be attending to them</p> <p>21 even if they died in their hands. Don't you think so?</p> <p>22 GENERAL NAIDOO: I'm sure they would</p> <p>23 have.</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now Dr Boffard –</p> <p>25 CHAIRPERSON: I think you'll find he's a</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24379</p> <p>1 treatment that the dead are entitled to.</p> <p>2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Exactly. For instance</p> <p>3 5.8.1 I would be challenged. I have an idea what, how I</p> <p>4 pronounce it, Msenyeho, but some people call it "Go,"</p> <p>5 Msenyeho, Andries, even though it's spelt with an H. But</p> <p>6 those are the people that Dr Boffard said – Michael –</p> <p>7 CHAIRPERSON: That they were potentially</p> <p>8 survivable, I think –</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Michael Ngweyi,</p> <p>10 Bonginkosi Yona, Andries Msenyeho, Thobisile Zibambeke, and</p> <p>11 Elias Khawamare Monesa. You've seen that, General? He</p> <p>12 also on page 22 mentions Mr Jackson Lehupa. So I was just</p> <p>13 seeking to draw your attention to those as being additional</p> <p>14 to Mr Ntenetya and being people who we will argue would</p> <p>15 have died dignified deaths instead of simply being</p> <p>16 manhandled and left on the field to die. I don't know if</p> <p>17 you want to make any comment thereto.</p> <p>18 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I don't</p> <p>19 understand. If the list that was referred to was a list of</p> <p>20 preventable deaths, because when I look at the list it</p> <p>21 refers to specifically life-threatening injuries that are</p> <p>22 listed there and the indication of preventable and non-</p> <p>23 preventable are indicated further in the pages –</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, no, I think you're</p> <p>25 missing the point. There was a list of people who were</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24380</p> <p>1 regarded as potentially survivable and then in respect of 2 each of these the Professor expresses a view whether the 3 death was preventable or non-preventable, and I understand 4 Mr Ntsebeza to be dealing at the moment with those who are 5 potentially survivable, some of whom obviously are ones the 6 Professor regards as not capable of being saved, the death 7 is not capable of being prevented. There is a distinction 8 between the two because I take it that the difference is 9 this; a case where the person is regarded as potentially 10 survivable is measured at the time that the injuries were 11 inflicted. The case of whether the death is preventable 12 depends on the question of how long it would take to get 13 the person to hospital and so on. That's the distinction, 14 I think I'm correct.</p> <p>15 Mr Ntsebeza is dealing with the potentially 16 survivable cases at the moment, which include a number of 17 non-preventable ones. That's the point. Is that right, Mr 18 Ntsebeza?</p> <p>19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman. In 20 fact I've just been looking on page 17 what the Professor 21 says there. Now the further point I'm making about those 22 deaths on page 17, the names that I have called out, 23 General, is that over and above what the Doctor says, but 24 also because of what he says, the point I was seeking to 25 make is that even if they would have died eventually, which</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24382</p> <p>1 statement and your testimony. Day 188 I believe you 2 outlined your experience in policing strikes, marches, mass 3 political gatherings, T22829, line 20, to 22827, line 7.</p> <p>4 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, what page? What 5 page?</p> <p>6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It's T – 7 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's the 8 transcripts, yes.</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 22829. 10 CHAIRPERSON: 22829. That we have before 11 us on the screen.</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And lines would be from 13 20.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: What Mr Semenya at the 15 lines you read are, talking about his career, that he'd 16 been in command at times of multidisciplinary forces. Mr 17 Semenya said, "You mentioned then there your K9s, your 18 specialised police units, your POP, reaction units, 19 detectives, intelligence, emergency services, at times the 20 involvement of South African National Defence Force 21 members," and the witness replied, "That is correct. At 22 that time the capacity of the station on its own could not 23 deal with most of the issues that we were confronted with, 24 Chair. They had to be supplemented invariably by the 25 specialised units, especially the Public Order Police</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24381</p> <p>1 is the point I made just recently, they would have died 2 dignified deaths instead of being manhandled and left on 3 the field to die, and we have already dealt with that.</p> <p>4 So in response to your desire to clarify the 5 issue here is yes, (1), there's an argument about whether 6 they were preventable deaths, that's a medical point. But 7 further than that there is the added point that I make, and 8 that is I'm sure your medical personnel would have done 9 things to them that would have caused their deaths to be 10 dignified if they had been there and deployed timeously. 11 I'm sure that answers your query, General, does it?</p> <p>12 CHAIRPERSON: Before you answer, Mr 13 Semenya wants to say something.</p> <p>14 MR SEMENYA SC: The question was put and 15 answered. It's just been repeated now. The witness 16 conceded.</p> <p>17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Semenya. 18 Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: I think that's a good 20 point, you know. A question doesn't gain cogency merely 21 because it's repeated, unless it provokes a different 22 answer, but that's not likely to happen here.</p> <p>23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, I 24 apologise for that. Now I'm moving to something else, 25 General. I've been reading about your career in your</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24383</p> <p>1 units," and he goes on to deal with that. This is dealing 2 with the time when you were in KwaZulu-Natal, as I 3 understand it.</p> <p>4 GENERAL NAIDOO: Correct, Chair. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You confirm that, 6 General?</p> <p>7 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, and you testified 9 that in the pre-election period you were responsible for 10 policing conflict between various political parties.</p> <p>11 GENERAL NAIDOO: That is correct, Chair. 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Which was a 13 characteristic of the time and of the area. I think you do 14 that in 22827, lines 8 to 10. Now you were placed in 15 command of multidisciplinary forces. Is that right?</p> <p>16 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: In fact if you could 18 just go to there, because I think it's important the way 19 you put it. T22828, lines 1 to 12. There was also – ja, 20 that's the one. "There was also inter-political conflict 21 where we had groupings of the various political parties in 22 KwaZulu-Natal with a very low tolerance threshold and they 23 had a tendency firstly of attacking each other in their 24 designated areas as well as whenever meetings, rallies, 25 gatherings were held by either party it would normally be</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24384</p> <p>1 attacked by the other party and in terms of policing we had 2 to keep those people – there were also mobilisation of the 3 democratic movements when starting to hold marches and 4 rallies and mobilise people moving towards the election, 5 and we had to ensure that these were held in a safe and 6 secure condition so that it would be conducive for the 7 election.” I would say it’s a time not unlike today, given 8 the 7th of May. I see you agree, General. 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Not as drastic as – 10 CHAIRPERSON: I don’t think that the 11 parties presently in the field have the very low tolerance 12 threshold to which the witness was referring. At least I 13 certainly hope they don’t. Perhaps one of their leaders 14 can tell us. 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I will not have my 16 client testify. Now just out of there, General, what did 17 you mean by designated areas? Just as a matter of 18 interest. 19 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I was in KwaZulu- 20 Natal, the north of Durban, and there were designated areas 21 – when I say designated areas, people from particular areas 22 supporting a particular political view and quite often 23 attacking another area who they suspected to have a 24 contrary view. This was the order of the time where we had 25 to ensure that these attacks did not take place.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24386</p> <p>1 long time ago. 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: [Microphone off, 3 inaudible] that they were insignificant in terms of 4 numbers? 5 GENERAL NAIDOO: No, Chair, I would have 6 more personal knowledge of shooting incidents that I would 7 have attended myself, but overall there were various 8 incidents and that were attended by different officers, so 9 my knowledge would be limited to the breadth of what I 10 know. I would not be able to accurately report on a 11 broader scale of what the situation was. 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I would assume that 13 these operations were regarded as success. Is my 14 assumption correct insofar as the SAPS, or the SAP some 15 time before 1994, succeeded in containing the violence? 16 GENERAL NAIDOO: Not all of them, Chair. 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now are you saying there 18 is an instance you recall in which you would say the 19 operation was not a success, the police failed, SAP failed 20 to contain - 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair yes, there were 22 instances. 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: - the violence? 24 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, we must ask for 25 relevance of all this series of questions that go into 19 –</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24385</p> <p>1 [12:27] MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now would hostels also 2 have fallen under the designation, designated areas? 3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, my station area 4 was semi-rural, or peri-urban. There were fortunately no 5 hostels in my policing area. 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now this was all before 7 1994. 8 GENERAL NAIDOO: That is correct, Chair. 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I don’t know how to 10 put this question, but let me put it. Now during that 11 period, during these operations before 1994 that you had 12 experience in, during these operations did the SAPS kill a 13 lot of people in which you were involved? 14 GENERAL NAIDOO: I don’t know kill a lot 15 of people. There were some shooting incidents, so a lot, I 16 would not be able to say a lot, but as I said, I testified 17 yesterday as well, I have attended incidents where police 18 were involved in shootings. 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Are you saying that they 20 killed any people at all? 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: There were incidents 22 where police had killed people, yes. 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Can you remember how 24 many? 25 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, no, that’s very</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24387</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: I know what the topic is 2 I’ve given permission on. I can see the relevance that’s 3 being worked up to, but it’s being worked up rather slowly 4 and laboriously. Perhaps Mr Ntsebeza needn’t fear any 5 unfortunate consequences if he cuts to the chase 6 immediately. The questions you want to ask I think have 7 some relevance, but I can understand why Mr Semanya doesn’t 8 see the relevance at this stage. 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: He always enjoys 10 fighting with us. 11 CHAIRPERSON: In defence of – 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Part of it is relevant 13 to his evidence. For instance if we go to day 188, T22828, 14 line 16 to 21, for my next question, where you were asked 15 about the numbers of people which were involved in these 16 strikes that you were dealing about and you said it would 17 be anything from 2 000 to 10 000 people. You see that? 18 Starting from – 19 GENERAL NAIDOO: 2 to 300 people. 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, in response to no 21 less than Mr Semanya, I see, so that we gather some 22 clarity, “These strikes would involve what type of numbers 23 of people?” and your response was, “It would vary from 24 small” – now is that 2 300, or is it 2? Two people, and 25 then 300?</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24388</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think he said 2 from 2 to 300 people. 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: To larger, 5, 10 000 4 people. Now 5 is 5 000 people – 5 CHAIRPERSON: The comma between the 2 and 6 the 300, it should be to, and equally the comma between the 7 5 and the 10 000 – 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 9 CHAIRPERSON: - in line 18 should also be 10 to. So the passage should read, the question was “These 11 strikes would involve what type of numbers of people?” 12 Answer, “It would vary from small, 2 to 300 people related 13 to taxi violence and taxi conflict, to larger, 5, 10 000 14 people with the mobilisation of communities for various 15 issues that were raised at the time running up to the first 16 democratic elections in South Africa.” That was the answer 17 he gave. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And then you were asked, 19 which follows immediately thereafter, whether the people 20 were armed, and I think your answer was that they were 21 normally carrying firearms and a lot of traditional weapons 22 such as assegais, kieries, etcetera. Is that right? 23 GENERAL NAIDOO: That’s correct, Chair. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And you were asked 25 whether the strikes often resulted in fatalities, and your</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24390</p> <p>1 it was in the context of management of these huge – because 2 that was generally the flow of the questions. You were 3 being asked, I assume, whether there were attacks on the 4 police in the context of those strikes and marches. Did 5 you understand that to have been the context in which you 6 were being asked about whether there were attacks on the 7 police? 8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair no, I understood 9 that during my service where the experience was being 10 tested, do I, were there any attacks on the police, hence I 11 indicated that the police were killed whilst on duty and 12 even whilst at home at their residences. 13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I do not see the 14 question to have been framed in a way that suggested that 15 you were being asked for a general view as to whether the 16 police were killed either on duty or in their place of 17 work. I think the debate that was being introduced – 18 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, no, no, not at 19 their place of work. If you look at the answer, line 13 on 20 this page, what he says, or lines 12 and 13, he says, 21 “There were numerous attacks on police where policemen were 22 killed whilst on duty, as well as whilst at home at their 23 residences.” In other words he wasn’t talking about their 24 being attacked at their place of work. He was actually 25 talking amongst other things about their being attacked</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24389</p> <p>1 response in line 6 to 9 of 22829 is that there were a 2 number of instances where you had to intervene where there 3 were fatalities between the groups fighting, where the SAP 4 had to separate and there were fatalities as a result. Now 5 these fatalities, were those fatalities inflicted by group 6 upon group, or was it, were you making reference to 7 fatalities by police on the group or groups? 8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, normally it was 9 groups upon groups. For example a group trying to move 10 towards a rally venue would be attacked. We had attacks on 11 mass meetings where devices like hand grenades were thrown 12 at one of the rallies as well and people were injured, I’m 13 not sure, killed as well. There were other instances where 14 the police and the SANDF had to go in and separate groups 15 that were fighting. So it’s a variety of scenarios that 16 we’re talking about. 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now maybe before I ask 18 the next question, I need to be clear about what your 19 answer was about fatalities. When you give that response 20 in line 6 to 9, T22829, when you talk about fatalities was 21 it fatalities – I understand you now to be saying it would 22 have been fatalities by group upon group. 23 GENERAL NAIDOO: Normally, yes. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: In fact you were asked 25 whether there were attacks on the police and I assume that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24391</p> <p>1 while they were at home, and so he was dealing generally it 2 would seem from that answer with attacks on the police in 3 general and not just at gatherings and – 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, that’s 5 what I’m trying to probe. General, in the light of the 6 build-up to that part of the question that was put to you 7 by my learned friend Mr Semenya I would have thought that, 8 and I’ll ask it in any event, I would have thought that, 9 you know, the enquiry was whether there were any fatalities 10 on the side of the police that were as a result of their 11 trying to keep these warring factions apart. In other 12 words you have got 3 000, 10 000 people on strike or on a 13 march, you are the police, you are supposed to keep law and 14 order, maintain law and order, and in that context were 15 there any attacks on the police? Now I’m putting the 16 question to you. 17 GENERAL NAIDOO: Ja. Chair, I’m sure, 18 but I can’t remember specifically about attacks on the 19 police, but I do remember at some stage that there were 20 shots fired at police, etcetera. As to injury and 21 fatalities, I can’t remember specifically related to the 22 marches, but I know at various times there were shots fired 23 at police during some of these interventions, yes. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: But you can’t say there 25 were any fatalities?</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24392</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: I can't specifically – 2 I've attended to many scenes where police officials were 3 injured or killed, so I can't specifically remember it in 4 the scenario that it's being set, no. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now of course the 6 number that had been banded about relative to what 7 happened in Marikana is 3 000 to 4 000. You are aware of 8 that? 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: I'm aware of that, 10 Chair. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It is not as high as in 12 your experience you've had to deal with 10 000 protesters 13 and/or strikers. It's three times less than the number you 14 have had to contain and deal with in that period. Do you 15 agree? 16 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I am not sure 17 when you say contain and deal with, because I gave 18 instances of operations where we had large mass gatherings. 19 It's not necessarily that we had to contain them. We had 20 to work out how they would conduct their activities, and 21 obviously ensure that the incidents that I referred to, or 22 the scenario that I referred to in terms of attacks, 23 etcetera, were prevented as much as possible. So it's not 24 necessarily true that all these crowds were hostile 25 directly to the police. They may not have wanted to, were</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24394</p> <p>1 get that question. 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: The people you dealt 3 with in the strike, marches, demonstrations that you 4 testified about when you were being led by Mr Semenya, in 5 terms of your evidence they normally carried firearms. 6 GENERAL NAIDOO: Some of them, yes. 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: In addition they also 8 carried traditional weapons, including assegais. That was 9 your testimony. 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And was it also your 12 testimony that attacks on the police and attempts to kill 13 the police were numerous? 14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think I 15 outlined the scenario on which I made that comment. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now when you say 17 they normally carried firearms, are you able to indicate to 18 the Commission proportion? Was it so that – I just want to 19 get a sense, in a crowd of 5 000 for instance how many 20 would have been carrying firearms. 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I don't think I'm 22 in a position to give an estimate of that. What I can say 23 is that whenever trouble broke out or a skirmish then there 24 would be a lot of exchange of gunfire, which led me to make 25 the statement that they normally would carry firearms</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24393</p> <p>1 not friendly to the police but they did not necessarily all 2 overtly take action against the police. There were 3 marches, permission was applied. We had structures that 4 were dealing with these things. There were instances, yes, 5 where illegal marches and illegal attacks were taking place 6 by one group on the other, but we can't say all these 7 gatherings that we policed were all unfriendly, 8 uncooperative members of the community. 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I mean there are various 10 ways in which you can characterise, you know, what happened 11 up to and including the 16th of August 2012, but we won't 12 enter into that debate. I'm just talking about size and 13 scale. You have mentioned that you used to deal as the 14 police with protesters, strikers, demonstrators, marchers, 15 of numbers up to 5 000, 10 000. That is in terms of your 16 testimony. 17 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And I'm simply saying it 19 is clear that the numbers that you have had to deal with in 20 the past just in terms of size and scale were obviously 21 larger than the numbers that you contended with in August 22 2012. Now one observation I make is that the people you 23 contended with normally carried firearms. Correct? In the 24 period that you're talking about. 25 GENERAL NAIDOO: Sorry, Chair, I didn't</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24395</p> <p>1 because whenever there was a clash between groups, 2 etcetera, or an incident during some of these, then 3 shooting would break out between the different groups, 4 indicating to me that they were carrying firearms. So to 5 indicate in proportion, it will be very difficult for me to 6 say that. 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Are you able to tell the 8 Commission what kind of firearms these groupings would be 9 having? Rifles? Pistols? A combination of all? 10 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I know that there 11 were some cases where we did recover rifles, but generally 12 I think it was the smaller calibre weapons that were easily 13 concealable. 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: AK47s? R5? R1s? 15 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, there were 16 instances of incidents where the AK47 was used, but as I'm 17 not generalising I'm saying that they all carried such 18 types of firearms. 19 [12:47] It depends on the different scenarios, the 20 different attacks, but yes AK47s were being used as well as 21 smaller pistols, handguns, etcetera. As well as, Chair, 22 homemade firearms were also popularly in use at that stage. 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So in August 2012 just 24 talking about you against that kind of experience, that was 25 not an unprecedented event I would argue.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24396</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, post '94 we 2 worked within a different context, a different framework 3 and policing was definitely working in terms of different 4 procedure. So it was definitely not expected to be 5 experienced in the new democratic South Africa. 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would you say it was 7 unprecedented in terms of a level of violence that was 8 involved, the 2012 event? 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, we have since the 10 new democracy handled various protests in the South African 11 Police Service and the majority of them, especially issues 12 around strikes and those related even to service delivery, 13 we did not, to my knowledge, because my involvement post 14 '94 in the operations was been limited to – be limited. To 15 my knowledge I did not expect to see that level of violence 16 and I do not know of a scenario where that level of 17 violence occurs in a modern, democratic South Africa. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I just want to be sure, 19 General, that I understand what you are saying. Are you 20 saying post 1994 and in the democracy those kinds of 21 warring factions came to an end just because we were now in 22 a democratic dispensation? Or, which I would propose to 23 you, ways of dealing with those kinds of demonstrations 24 were more inclined to encourage protest but within certain 25 boundaries?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24398</p> <p>1 exercise those rights. There was no need for them to 2 exercise it with dangerous weapons or to the injury or to 3 the harm of others. It's guaranteed that they can protest, 4 I agree with the council. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, Doctor, you will 6 correct me if I'm wrong, you are not seriously – you are a 7 Doctor of Public Administration. 8 CHAIRPERSON: That's why I didn't stop 9 you, he has a doctorate, he doesn't mind - by his proper 10 academic title from time to time. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, yes. Let's remain 12 with the time and tested, General. General, you are not 13 seriously suggesting that because 1994 we had this 14 constitutional dispensation rights based society that 15 rivalry of the major that existed between these political 16 parties immediately disappeared and that there was no need 17 for preparing for those kinds of conflicts that arose still 18 to 1994. I don't understand you to be suggesting that. 19 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm not. What 20 I'm suggesting is the dispensation that existed prior to 21 '94 and that of post '94 were different and obviously the 22 expectation in terms of what we would experience was 23 different. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Then let's call things 25 by their names. Before 1994 which is what we were</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24397</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, yes. As I 2 indicated in my testimony, that political intolerance that 3 we experienced prior to 1994 was now contained and should 4 not exist because of the existence of the constitutional 5 framework that we have in the country where people were 6 endowed with certain rights and certain things which they 7 could do which previously the could not do. So for an 8 example, if these protestors, striking miners had not 9 engaged in that level of violence and a practical example, 10 two weeks after the incident the delegation came to the 11 SAPS led by Bishop Seoka, I met the delegation and they 12 indicated but there's a ban on meetings. And I indicated 13 there is no ban on meetings because there was a perception 14 that there is a general ban on meetings in the Marikana 15 area. There was no ban on meetings. I then explained to 16 them that you know that we have a gathering, it was a 17 Sunday and they wanted to have this meeting on a Monday. I 18 got the relevant people on the Sunday to assist them to 19 complete the relevant documentation, submit it to the 20 responsible person at the municipality, task people on 21 Monday to assist them in finalising and agreeing with the 22 municipality that they would have their meeting. So it's a 23 different dispensation and the outcomes, it is not 24 necessary to use violence to achieve the outcomes. There's 25 certain rights that they have and they just need to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24399</p> <p>1 exploring there were these factopms, rival political 2 parties that were sometimes at each other's throats. Now 3 you are not suggesting that post 1994 that did not happen. 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, no I'm not 5 suggesting that it did not happen. I was referring to the 6 dispensation in place responding to what my expectation was 7 in terms of the levels of violence. People could exercise 8 their rights without needing to resort to those levels of 9 violence we've experienced prior to 1994. 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now - 11 GENERAL NAIDOO: And, Chair – 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: - and where, sorry - 13 CHAIRPERSON: He just wanted to add 14 something. 15 GENERAL NAIDOO: And obviously would 16 expect the police to protect them in exercising that right. 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, I was – I'm 18 proposing to take – 19 CHAIRPERSON: I thought you were dealing 20 with topic 3 on your application, that's why I've given you 21 the opportunity to ask the questions you were going to ask 22 because you haven't actually got to the point that is the 23 culmination of topic 3 of your application. Wouldn't you 24 like to deal with that shortly or at least see whether the 25 witness can help us in respect of that before we take the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24400</p> <p>1 adjournment? Or do you want me to ask the question?</p> <p>2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, can we deal</p> <p>3 with that after lunch?</p> <p>4 CHAIRPERSON: All right we'll take the</p> <p>5 lunch adjournment now, but I expect you to deal crisply</p> <p>6 with that issue when we resume what I hope will quarter to</p> <p>7 two.</p> <p>8 MR NTSEBEZA C: It may be one minute or.</p> <p>9 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUME]</p> <p>10 [13:54] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.</p> <p>11 Major General, you're still under oath.</p> <p>12 GANASEN NAIDOO: Thank you, Chair.</p> <p>13 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, you may</p> <p>14 address the Commission sitting down, if you wish.</p> <p>15 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC (CONTD.):</p> <p>16 Thank you, Mr Chairman. Now General, I want us to take a</p> <p>17 look at an affidavit by Professor Monique Marks, which is</p> <p>18 exhibit JJJ200, who gives an account of POP operations that</p> <p>19 were conducted in the Glebelands Hostel in KZN.</p> <p>20 CHAIRPERSON: Can we have it on the</p> <p>21 screen?</p> <p>22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, if we</p> <p>23 could.</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: It's exhibit JJJ200.</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now this is way after</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24402</p> <p>1 says, "Between November 1997 and July 1998 there were</p> <p>2 approximately 50 murders committed in the hostel area, and</p> <p>3 by July 1999 it was known as the hostel of death." That's</p> <p>4 paragraph 7.</p> <p>5 "Sections of the Durban POP unit were deployed to</p> <p>6 the hostel and stationed there on a full-time basis."</p> <p>7 Paragraph 7, and then paragraph 12, which is what seems to</p> <p>8 be her conclusion of her study, or is it paragraph 11? She</p> <p>9 says, "The POP was successful in containing the violence</p> <p>10 and not a single person was killed by the police."</p> <p>11 Now are you familiar personally with the</p> <p>12 Glebelands Hostel in KZN? I'm just asking from the point</p> <p>13 of view that you spent quite some time –</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair no, I am not</p> <p>15 familiar with the hostel, although I have heard about it.</p> <p>16 As I indicated my, the policing area where I was deployed,</p> <p>17 policing areas that I was deployed in did not have any</p> <p>18 hostels as well.</p> <p>19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So are you saying you</p> <p>20 don't know of their existence, or you heard about</p> <p>21 Glebelands?</p> <p>22 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I indicated I've</p> <p>23 heard about Glebelands, but I don't have specific knowledge</p> <p>24 of it, yes.</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would that extend to</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24401</p> <p>1 1994 and she writes about the POP response to violence</p> <p>2 between the ANC and the IFP. Now if you looked at</p> <p>3 paragraph 6 for instance, because I'm seeing the kinds of</p> <p>4 similarities that I think are in this affidavit with the</p> <p>5 scene that you portrayed relevant to the pre-1994 period</p> <p>6 during which you were – you see there in paragraph 6 she</p> <p>7 says, "There were approximately 15 000 residents in the</p> <p>8 Glebelands Hostel, the majority of whom were armed." You</p> <p>9 see that?</p> <p>10 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair.</p> <p>11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And she says there just</p> <p>12 like the kind of situation we were talking about, she also</p> <p>13 says those people would be armed with a combination of</p> <p>14 traditional weapons and firearms. You see that, also in</p> <p>15 paragraph 6?</p> <p>16 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see that, Chair.</p> <p>17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: She says, "The ANC and</p> <p>18 the IFP were housed in separate sections of the hostel.</p> <p>19 They used to confront each other in combative style in the</p> <p>20 central area of the hostel, which was situated between the</p> <p>21 areas in which they were housed." It's still in paragraph</p> <p>22 6.</p> <p>23 She says, "Assassinations occurred in more</p> <p>24 private places in the hostel as part of this political</p> <p>25 rivalry." Paragraph 6 still, and then paragraph 7 she</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24403</p> <p>1 your not knowing about what Professor Marks talks about as</p> <p>2 being instances of violence between the ANC and the IFP at</p> <p>3 that hostel?</p> <p>4 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think I</p> <p>5 probably heard it, heard about it in the context of the</p> <p>6 violence there, but –</p> <p>7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Ja.</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And I'm sure as a person</p> <p>10 who has been in charge of this crowd control measures in</p> <p>11 the areas you testified about, not in the peri-urban areas</p> <p>12 as you said, you would have been aware, I take it, of the</p> <p>13 POP operations conducted in that hostel?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair no, the period</p> <p>15 that's under question I was no longer in KwaZulu-Natal.</p> <p>16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, I noticed. I think</p> <p>17 you were in Gauteng already, or some –</p> <p>18 GENERAL NAIDOO: I was in Pretoria, yes.</p> <p>19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Pretoria, yes. But what</p> <p>20 I want to be asking is whether as a senior police officer</p> <p>21 already at that stage you were not aware of POP operations</p> <p>22 in Glebelands Hostel because it seems to me it was quite a</p> <p>23 remarkable success story on the evidence of Professor</p> <p>24 Marks.</p> <p>25 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair no, not</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24404</p> <p>1 specifically. As I indicated, my only knowledge I gleaned 2 possibly from the media in terms of the violence in that 3 area, but operationally no. In '96 I went into a different 4 facet and I was not directly involved with the issues 5 related to Public Order Policing.</p> <p>6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I don't understand you 7 to be disputing her research and her report of the outcome 8 of her research.</p> <p>9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I have no grounds 10 to dispute that.</p> <p>11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, you see I think 12 what I want to suggest to you, and we can have a debate 13 about it, is that it seems to me that if her evidence of 14 what happened as contained in this affidavit is true, then 15 it is arguable that the confrontation of the SAPS on the 16 16th of August, or even in the days leading up to that date 17 in 2012, and the manner of dealing with huge crowds was not 18 unprecedented. Would you agree?</p> <p>19 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I will not agree 20 with that primarily because I think the two scenarios are 21 different in the sense that the hostel would be a contained 22 environment and would be much easier to manage in terms of 23 what's contained in the affidavit, as opposed to the 24 situation at Marikana which was not really a contained 25 environment. Those less-than-lethal resources that were</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24406</p> <p>1 arguable that there is a difference of the nature that you 2 talk about between the situation in 2012 and the situation 3 that you were confronted with, that Professor Marks is 4 talking about. For one thing, we know from General Mpmembe 5 in a conversation he had with Zokwana on the 15th of August 6 that he had indicated that the best way to disarm people is 7 not to confront them in the circumstances in which this 8 happened, but to go to where they sleep and disarm them 9 there. So there was the, and we know, unless you 10 contradict me on this, that in September of that same year, 11 2012, there was a successful operation by the police where 12 people were surrounded, the mineworkers were surrounded in 13 the informal area and a large quantity of arms were 14 retrieved. So it can't be that the situation was 15 different. You could have done exactly the same on the 16th 16 or days after that.</p> <p>17 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, when I said that 18 the scenarios are not identical I would like to point to 19 the following. Firstly, at that stage - and I'm not sure 20 if it was already testified to by other witnesses - the 21 Intelligence could not give us sufficient information to 22 articulate those arrests of people with arms, etcetera. 23 That was one problem; we could not locate where people, 24 individuals who were suspected of being in possession of 25 arms or having committed certain crimes were actually</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24405</p> <p>1 utilised would be more effective in a confined and 2 contained environment than as we've seen in the broader 3 open setting that we had at Marikana. So I don't think we 4 could draw, with the exception of the other issues about 5 people who's violent, etcetera, specifically in terms of 6 the action of the police and the resources they used, I 7 think it's two different scenarios.</p> <p>8 CHAIRPERSON: Now this phrase 9 "information-specific operations" which is used in the 10 penultimate line of paragraph 11, it's a bit vague but it 11 sounds to me like cordon and search operations, obtaining 12 weapons from people in the hostel based upon information as 13 to where the weapons were concealed in the hostel. That's 14 just a guess, but it's probably right, isn't it?</p> <p>15 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, probably, but the 16 specific reference to the POP information and planning 17 component, every Public Order Police unit has an 18 information component who liaises with the, with people 19 externally to gather information, including in the 20 Intelligence, they do liaise with Intelligence, organisers 21 of marches, etcetera. So they ensure that the unit is 22 resourced with information and intelligence to facilitate 23 planning.</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General, I disagree with 25 you, but as I say it's arguable. For instance it is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24407</p> <p>1 sleeping.</p> <p>2 Secondly, in the, Professor Marks's affidavit she 3 specifically refers to certain equipment which we are not 4 in use at this stage in the police. Case in point, the, 5 she indicated 37mm stopper guns that can fire rubber and 6 gas. That has stopped, is not in use by the SAPS. Shotgun 7 with pellets, we don't use that as part of our crowd 8 management.</p> <p>9 So when I indicate that the case studies are not 10 identical, the circumstances are not identical, as well as 11 I refer to the geographical situation, or the layout where 12 they're operating. I did nowhere suggest that a cordon and 13 search is not effective or could be successful.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: The thing with the 15 information of course, one of the criticisms that one sees 16 in some of the reports of the police action is that the 17 criticism is that the information wasn't, the intelligence 18 wasn't good enough. I haven't heard Brigadier Engelbrecht 19 on that, but my understanding from his affidavit is he 20 doesn't agree and he explains what exactly his section did 21 by way of providing intelligence and information.</p> <p>22 But on the subject of intelligence leading to a 23 cordon and search, Mr Zokwana was asked in your presence, I 24 think, by General Mpmembe on the Wednesday night for 25 information to be obtained so that a proper cordon and</p>

Page 24408

1 search could be done.

2 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's right.

3 CHAIRPERSON: Before, and he said they'd

4 do that provided their involvement was kept a secret. Time

5 was not then allowed for that information to be obtained

6 because of the decision which is in fact being made at the

7 same time virtually as you people were talking to Mr

8 Zokwana, being made at Midrand that the following morning

9 before the NUM people had time to come back with the

10 information, that the operation would be launched. That is

11 a fact that can't be avoided. Is that correct?

12 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.

13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So General, the argument

14 will be that the situations are not different. If anything

15 the situation in Glebelands it seems to me as reported by

16 Professor Marks was far more serious in terms of the

17 numbers that were involved and the firearms and the weapons

18 that were involved, but it's remarkable that the POP no

19 less were able to contain that to the degree that she says

20 they were, without killing a single person. Don't you

21 agree?

22 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, as I indicated, I

23 had my reservations, especially in comparison of a hostel

24 to the scenario that we had at Marikana. As I indicated,

25 I'm not sure whether it was testified already, but in terms

Page 24409

1 of the intelligence that we were trying to obtain to

2 conduct certain raids to recover certain firearms and

3 arrest certain suspects, it was clear that those people

4 were not at hostels, they were in other areas and should

5 that information have been readily available and confirmed

6 I'm sure that our actions would have included that sooner

7 rather than later.

8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. As I say I mean we

9 could argue until the cows come home about this one, but

10 let's simply say I'm aware insofar as you responded and say

11 there are certain equipment that is no longer in use and

12 therefore the police didn't use them, we know that the

13 police used far more lethal, you know, equipment, R1s and

14 R5s and R4s, and hence the fatalities. But the point that

15 I'm making here is that the argument will be that the

16 difference between how the operation was handled at

17 Glebelands Hostel and how the police handled the operation

18 in Marikana is the manner in which it appears that the

19 police were determined that on the 16th, come what may,

20 there should be a dispersal and a disarming of the

21 mineworkers, not even wait for them to be in their homes.

22 Would you disagree with that assessment?

23 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think it's

24 clear that there was a decision taken and that decision was

25 being executed when the unfortunate incident occurred.

Page 24410

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You will agree with me

2 that it didn't have to be executed on the 16th?

3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair –

4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No-one has been able to

5 show me and those whom I represent why it had to happen on

6 that day.

7 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm sure that the

8 person who took the decision had answered to that and

9 explained in terms of that decision.

10 [14:14] I did not take that decision.

11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: But you were part of it,

12 what can you –

13 CHAIRPERSON: You say he was part of it,

14 I'm not sure that that can be put without him being the

15 opportunity to comment. What do you say to the proposition

16 put to you by Mr Ntsebeza? You said the decision was taken

17 by, we know who it was taken by, it was taken by the

18 Provincial Commissioner. We know the matter was discussed

19 for up to an hour at the Management Forum, we know from her

20 evidence that no one there disagreed with her and they in

21 fact agreed with it by saying they were prepared to make

22 resources available. So that whatever the technical

23 position is and the factual position, those at the

24 Management Forum who took part in the – who attended that

25 part of the meeting approved. But what do you say to the

Page 24411

1 proposition that's now being put to you by counsel that you

2 were also part to that decision?

3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, in terms of the

4 hierarchy, when a decision that is made in that fashion

5 it's my job to implement the decision. So it was not a

6 case of whether I took part or not as it was indicated. I

7 was not at the discussion when this was done at 1:30, but

8 we received the instruction that a decision had been taken

9 and we proceeded with the implementation.

10 CHAIRPERSON: The evidence is given as

11 1:30, according to the minutes, at the very beginning of

12 the meeting, right near the beginning of the meeting the

13 Provincial Commissioner announced her decision. And when

14 the meeting was over Major-General Annandale insisted that

15 Brigadier Pretorius record that in the occurrence book and

16 stood over her while she made the relevant notes. So the

17 fact that you weren't at the meeting at 1:30 doesn't carry

18 it any further because no decision, as far as I can see,

19 was taken by the people at the meeting. It was conveyed to

20 them by the Provincial Commissioner and we were told by the

21 counsel for the police service that the decision had been

22 taken the previous night, Wednesday night at Midrand. And

23 so that's relevant in regard to the suggestion that you

24 were part of it.

25 GENERAL NAIDOO: And it's clear that I

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24412</p> <p>1 was not party to any of those discussions or decisions, 2 Chair.</p> <p>3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Can I just ask this 4 question then we'll get onto the next one. But there's a 5 seasoned senior police officer, Provincial Commissioner and 6 all of that, the decision has been taken by those who are 7 superior to you. But did it occur to you that the decision 8 taken and the manner of its execution might be disastrous? 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, one always hopes 10 that whatever one is doing, especially in the policing 11 environment it does not result in consequences such as what 12 has occurred on this particular day. Every day that a 13 police official goes out to attend to or deal with a 14 particular matter – so the instruction was no obviously 15 unlawful and we were not party to the finer details of the 16 discussion at 1:30. We were given a briefing in terms of 17 what the decision entailed and now it was going to be 18 executed. Risk yes, there's always this risk that 19 something could go wrong especially in the light of the 20 violence that we have seen. And from the briefing that we 21 had been given the indication was what steps will be taken 22 to minimise the risk for the police in terms of putting a 23 protective barbed wire etcetera. Learning from the lessons 24 of the few days before, so other than the fact that it was 25 not obviously an unlawful instruction, there was, at that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24414</p> <p>1 hadn't been done and he was dissatisfied about it. 2 Apparently it's a matter you didn't know about until it was 3 raised here. But that would be an indication would it not, 4 maybe, no I withdraw the maybe, that's something that has 5 to be investigated. Whether part of what happened, 6 particularly on the Sunday morning, could have been 7 prevented if the intelligence which has been obtained and 8 had been communicated by Brigadier Engelbrecht to General 9 Mpmembe had in fact been taken into account. And visible 10 policing operations had been launched, I take it you'll 11 agree with that that's something that's got to be looked 12 at. Would you agree with that? 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, you actually 14 asked me yesterday to follow up on that in terms of the 15 visible policing and last night I did follow up with public 16 order policing. And the indication was they deployed 13 17 members from public order police during the day and 10 18 members during the night since we asked them to beef up the 19 policing. So in addition to the police station's normal 20 deployment, there was also these additional public order 21 police people that were deployed to the area to do the 22 visible policing. The patrols and the monitoring. I last 23 night called just to find out what the deployment was as 24 you requested, Chair. 25 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, anyway General</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24413</p> <p>1 stage, not much other than to comply with the instruction 2 that we had.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: Although you were a member 4 of the JOCCOM you were not given the opportunity to take 5 part in the 1:30 meeting. 6 GENERAL NAIDOO: Correct, Chair. 7 CHAIRPERSON: The responsibility for not 8 inviting you to the meeting is not yours. 9 GENERAL NAIDOO: No. 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now can I just move onto 11 another topic? 12 CHAIRPERSON: Another topic, can I ask a 13 question relating to the marked affidavit before you move 14 on? 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chair. 16 CHAIRPERSON: The sentence I referred you 17 to talked about information to specific operations and they 18 appear to have assisted substantially in solving the 19 problem in the way it was. Now this point's been touched 20 on already, but do you remember I asked you, I think it was 21 yesterday, about what Brigadier Engelbrecht said? It was 22 put to you by counsel that he said based on the information 23 he had, intelligence had received, he suggested that 24 visible policing operations be mounted already on the 25 Sunday. And later General Mpmembe admitted to him that it</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24415</p> <p>1 Mpmembe appears, according to Brigadier Engelbrecht not to 2 have been satisfied with what was actually done, but that's 3 a matter that you obviously can go into. 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I have no idea, 5 but I can follow that. 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I would like to get to a 7 topic where the whole point is to be able to narrow the 8 area of establishing who caused the death of those I 9 represent. And I would like JJJ29.223 taken at 16:56 to be 10 put up. 11 CHAIRPERSON: I didn't catch that. What 12 would you like, this is what you'd like put on the screen. 13 JJJ? 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: JJJ29 and then point 15 223. I'm giving it as I'm told. It seems to be a Ramanala 16 photograph. 17 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I don't think you 18 asked me to give a warning. Take that picture of the 19 screen please. A moment ago we saw a picture which I'd 20 hoped some people here wouldn't have to see. I'm told 21 we're going to see a number of pictures from now on of some 22 of the people who were killed on the 16th of August. And 23 those people who are present in the chamber today who are 24 loved ones or relatives of those who were killed on the 25 16th, I must tell you that what we're going to see may well</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24416</p> <p>1 cause you severe emotional distress. And you may wish to</p> <p>2 have the opportunity to leave the chamber so as not to have</p> <p>3 to suffer by seeing these pictures. So the pictures are</p> <p>4 please not to be put on the screen until 60 seconds from</p> <p>5 now. Mr Ntsebeza, should I mention specifically the</p> <p>6 relatives of victims A, B and O?</p> <p>7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No we are not there yet,</p> <p>8 Chair.</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: We're not there yet.</p> <p>10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>11 CHAIRPERSON: So is the warning I've</p> <p>12 given adequate?</p> <p>13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Well, ja.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: Unless you want to add to</p> <p>15 it, you can.</p> <p>16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No I think it was</p> <p>17 properly given –</p> <p>18 CHAIRPERSON: You can add to it in Xhosa</p> <p>19 if you wish.</p> <p>20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No I think we will be</p> <p>21 fine, Mr Chairman. Now if we can [African language]. I've</p> <p>22 just indicated to them, Chair, that I do not consider that</p> <p>23 there will be pictures of dead bodies other than that we</p> <p>24 will try to show people who do not appear to be police</p> <p>25 officers that were around on the scene.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24418</p> <p>1 the police service, Chair.</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: Do you know who they are?</p> <p>3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, at some stage we</p> <p>4 did ascertain yes, they were security guards that escorted</p> <p>5 the additional medics from the disaster management centre.</p> <p>6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And the man on the left</p> <p>7 seems to be carrying a shotgun, holding it with his right</p> <p>8 hand is it?</p> <p>9 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.</p> <p>10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now then there is</p> <p>11 JJJ27.9472. Warrant Officer Barnard's photograph. Can you</p> <p>12 zoom in on that photograph? Mr Chair, because we want to</p> <p>13 see the man in the earlier photograph there, a khaki shirt,</p> <p>14 khaki hat. There he is. There is a man bending over and</p> <p>15 he is, well I don't know what he's doing in that –</p> <p>16 CHAIRPERSON: The gentleman bending over</p> <p>17 may well be a paramedic and behind him is the gentleman in</p> <p>18 the khaki hat.</p> <p>19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes standing behind the</p> <p>20 man is a paramedic, but what I want to draw your attention</p> <p>21 to, General, is not the person in front of him. It's that</p> <p>22 he's now – it's clearer that he's carrying a shotgun. Do</p> <p>23 you see where his hand is, the right hand and the left hand</p> <p>24 it seems to be – the resolution in the photo to your left</p> <p>25 in the smaller screen –</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24417</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: Well I think the time that</p> <p>2 I gave has elapsed and no one has showed any sign of</p> <p>3 wanting to move, so I think we can now proceed.</p> <p>4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I don't have a pointer,</p> <p>5 but the person in the middle who seems to wearing a khaki</p> <p>6 hat – I'm being resourced here, Mr Chairman. Do you see</p> <p>7 the person with the khaki hat?</p> <p>8 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see, Chair.</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. He is not a member</p> <p>10 of the SAPS is he?</p> <p>11 GENERAL NAIDOO: No he's not, Chair.</p> <p>12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And he's carrying a</p> <p>13 weapon.</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair.</p> <p>15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now another picture</p> <p>16 would be JJJ29.265 taken at 17:11. JJJ29.265. It also</p> <p>17 seems to be Ramanala's photograph. Those two gentlemen –</p> <p>18 CHAIRPERSON: Well there are more than</p> <p>19 two people in the picture, but on the left-hand side of the</p> <p>20 picture are two gentlemen with blue jeans and dark blue</p> <p>21 shirts with some red band on the top of their arms and</p> <p>22 firearms. Are those the gentlemen you're referring to? Do</p> <p>23 you recognise them, General, do you know who they are. Are</p> <p>24 they members of the police service?</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: They're not members of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24419</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, it's clear he's</p> <p>2 carrying a firearm.</p> <p>3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now the Chairman</p> <p>4 did ask you just a while ago whether you knew who these</p> <p>5 people were and it appears that you said they were from a</p> <p>6 security company. Do you know which company it was that</p> <p>7 they were from?</p> <p>8 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm not sure. It</p> <p>9 could be Lonmin because they had arranged the ambulances as</p> <p>10 well because the additional ambulance and the paramedics</p> <p>11 that came later they were escorted in by the security</p> <p>12 company that's there.</p> <p>13 CHAIRPERSON: Mr van As, if these people</p> <p>14 are – the ones we've seen, the ones we're looking at, at</p> <p>15 the moment, if they are either employees of Lonmin or were</p> <p>16 contracted to Lonmin on the day, would you please make</p> <p>17 enquiries from your client as to whether they were</p> <p>18 employees of Lonmin or alternatively were contracted to</p> <p>19 Lonmin. And their identities please.</p> <p>20 MR VAN AS: Mr Chairman, I can confirm</p> <p>21 that they were employees of Lonmin. The gentleman in the</p> <p>22 brown hat normally works at the precious metal refinery. I</p> <p>23 understand which is out on the East Rand and that's the</p> <p>24 reason he isn't dressed the same as the remaining Lonmin</p> <p>25 personnel. I'm in the process of trying to find out what</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24420</p> <p>1 his name is and I'll revert to the Commission.</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: And the others we've seen?</p> <p>3 MR VAN AS: The others, if we can go back</p> <p>4 I can give you their names, Mr Chairman, those I have.</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: Well let's go back now and</p> <p>6 get them. I'm sure the witness won't mind interrupting his</p> <p>7 evidence. I think it would be helpful for the operator if</p> <p>8 you give the details again so that we can find the pictures</p> <p>9 without – that's it yes. That's 265 isn't it? There's two</p> <p>10 gentlemen there you see, Mr van As.</p> <p>11 MR VAN AS: Chairman, the gentleman with</p> <p>12 the blue rubber gloves on - the shorter gentleman with the</p> <p>13 blue rubber gloves with the shotgun in his right hand, his</p> <p>14 name is Dewald Louw. And the other gentleman with his</p> <p>15 hands on his hips, his name is Martin Opperman.</p> <p>16 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The other</p> <p>17 picture showed us the gentleman with the khaki hat, is that</p> <p>18 right. Are there any other people whose photographs you</p> <p>19 want us to see so that Mr van As can tell us if they are</p> <p>20 Lonmin people and if so what their names are?</p> <p>21 [14:34] MR NTSEBEZA SC: On the present enquiry,</p> <p>22 Mr Chairman, I think those are the only people whose</p> <p>23 attention I wanted to draw the General's attention to.</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: Well, you now have the</p> <p>25 information that you were seeking, not from the General but</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24422</p> <p>1 deploying to forward holding area 1 that medics had been</p> <p>2 arranged, so before that I was not part, or I did not know</p> <p>3 of any discussion regarding the deployment of police,</p> <p>4 assets from Lonmin, no.</p> <p>5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So your awareness of the</p> <p>6 – I don't want to call them security guards – those</p> <p>7 personnel from Lonmin was at the time that they came to the</p> <p>8 forward holding area, or am I making a mistake?</p> <p>9 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'm not sure</p> <p>10 what's the question.</p> <p>11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: When did you become</p> <p>12 aware of the fact that there were other people who were</p> <p>13 armed with shotguns?</p> <p>14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, on site at Lonmin</p> <p>15 the security guards, or the security officers are clearly</p> <p>16 visible, guarding various assets of Lonmin. So on a daily</p> <p>17 basis we had seen the security officials protecting the</p> <p>18 assets of Lonmin. They were even manning certain</p> <p>19 intersections with access to certain installations. So we</p> <p>20 had seen guards, armed guards throughout our time at Lonmin</p> <p>21 because they were there on duty.</p> <p>22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And their duty was to?</p> <p>23 GENERAL NAIDOO: As I indicated, they</p> <p>24 primarily seemed to be involved in asset protection.</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Asset protection?</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24421</p> <p>1 from Mr van As.</p> <p>2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr –</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: And you'll get the</p> <p>4 information in respect of the khaki-hatted gentlemen when</p> <p>5 that information comes to hand.</p> <p>6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>7 That's the beauty about commissions.</p> <p>8 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr van As.</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now did you know at the</p> <p>10 time who those people were, or have you since made</p> <p>11 enquiries?</p> <p>12 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I think at that</p> <p>13 time it was clear who they were because each one of them</p> <p>14 was, one or two of them were escorting a paramedic when</p> <p>15 they came in to the scene. So it was clear that they were</p> <p>16 security guards escorting the paramedics.</p> <p>17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It would certainly not</p> <p>18 be some – or put it this way, let me just ask this. Was</p> <p>19 there a contemplation in your meeting of the 13th when you</p> <p>20 were deciding to drastically deploy additional forces, that</p> <p>21 some of those forces would be people from Lonmin?</p> <p>22 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair no, that meeting</p> <p>23 dealt with the issue of policing, police resources that</p> <p>24 were required, that will be required. I have testified</p> <p>25 already that I only discovered on the 14th when we were</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24423</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Protection of key assets</p> <p>2 of Lonmin.</p> <p>3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: But at that crime scene</p> <p>4 what was their –</p> <p>5 GENERAL NAIDOO: I already indicated,</p> <p>6 Chair, that at this scene they escorted these additional</p> <p>7 medics that came from the disaster management centre. It</p> <p>8 was already testified previously that the medics feared for</p> <p>9 their safety at all times and required an escort from us</p> <p>10 the police as well, so at the stage when they came, the</p> <p>11 additional medics came, they came directly from their,</p> <p>12 wherever their station was, under escort from the security</p> <p>13 guards.</p> <p>14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Is that what you were</p> <p>15 referring to when you responded to a question from my</p> <p>16 learned friend Mr Semanya on day 189 - I just want to round</p> <p>17 off this – day 189, T22955, line 6 to 23.</p> <p>18 CHAIRPERSON: [Microphone off,</p> <p>19 inaudible].</p> <p>20 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair –</p> <p>21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Semanya was put, I</p> <p>22 don't know whether it's up already.</p> <p>23 CHAIRPERSON: Remind me what's the page</p> <p>24 you want?</p> <p>25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: The page is 22955.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24424</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: We've got 22985 at the 2 moment. We've now got – 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Lines 6 to 23 - 4 CHAIRPERSON: - 22955, what line? 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Line 6 to 23, exactly 6 that – 7 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya says, "Just as 8 if I interrupted here, General, there were visuals shown of 9 security at the scene who were not members of the South 10 African Police Service," to which the witness said, "That's 11 correct, Chair." Mr Semenya, "Were you able to know who 12 those were?" The witness, "Chair, as I indicated initially 13 I had a small number of medical personnel that were with 14 the SAPS to respond to the need for medical assistance. 15 Obviously with the escalation and the tragic incident there 16 was a number of people that were injured and killed and the 17 requirement for medical assistance escalated very 18 drastically, so the company that was contracted to provide 19 the medical assistance mobilised and brought in a large 20 number of support staff, medical support staff, and they 21 were brought in, escorted by security that was employed by 22 Lonmin." That's the passage to which you refer, Mr 23 Ntsebeza? 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, that's 25 exactly the passage. Now General, are you still confirming</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24426</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: So we won't have got to – 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: - topic that I will deal 3 with. 4 CHAIRPERSON: We won't have got there 5 yet. So when we resume after the comfort break everybody's 6 interested can be here and then we'll give a warning when 7 you finished the penultimate topic, before you go on to the 8 ultimate topic, so that those who don't want to be exposed 9 to emotional distress will be able to leave. That's the 10 position? 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: That's the position. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well it's been 13 suggested to me we should take the tea adjournment now, so 14 we'll do it until roughly 3 o'clock. Some of us will 15 absorb liquid and others won't. We'll adjourn. 16 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] 17 [15:07] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. 18 Major General, you're still under oath. 19 GANASEN NAIDOO: Still under oath, Chair. 20 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza. 21 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC (CONTD.): 22 Thank you, Mr Chairman. Mr Chairman, there's a reference I 23 want, it's day 189. We are just sorting ourselves as to 24 what the page is. It's 22982. It starts at line 16. 25 Maybe let's go up a bit. Maybe let's start at 22979,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24425</p> <p>1 that to be your answer as to the presence of the people 2 whose photographs we're looking at? 3 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, that's what I've 4 indicated, that the security guards that came in with the 5 medics are some of those we're seeing in the pictures, yes. 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, I'm going 7 to move to a penultimate theme and I've been drinking a lot 8 of liquid and I don't know if we could not – 9 CHAIRPERSON: Are you asking for a 10 comfort break? 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: If we could, just a 10- 12 minute break. 13 CHAIRPERSON: And then after the comfort 14 break are you going to deal with matters in respect of 15 which it might be sensible to give a warning before we take 16 the comfort break? 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, Mr Chairman. 18 I'll be dealing with – ja, there will be. 19 CHAIRPERSON: There will. Alright, we're 20 going to take a comfort break now for 10 minutes. When we 21 resume we are going to be shown some video clips and stills 22 of, stills really of people who were killed at scene 2. Is 23 that correct, Mr Ntsebeza? 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Chair, in this 25 penultimate it's a very short, short –</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24427</p> <p>1 starting from line 14. Yes, because it introduces 23, line 2 23 there introduces exhibit MMM3. You have exhibit MMM3? 3 GENERAL NAIDOO: I do. 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And you have – this is 5 an expert that was introduced when that evidence was being 6 led by my learned friend and it seems settled that it's an 7 expert, it's an excerpt from a book by Mr Peter Alexander 8 and the title of the book is "A View from the Mountain and 9 a Case to Answer." You remember that that is the book you 10 have been referred to, the excerpt from that book. Is that 11 correct? 12 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's correct, Chair. 13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now on page 114, 14 which is the same page that my colleague had referred you 15 to, can we go to MMM3? Now that we have identified what 16 we're looking for, can we go to page 114 thereof? 17 CHAIRPERSON: We've only got four pages 18 from the book, you see, so which of the – and the book has 19 obviously got far more than four pages, so which of the 20 four pages which are part of the exhibit do you want to 21 refer the witness to? 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It's 114 bottom, up to – 23 CHAIRPERSON: Let's just go to 24 [microphone off, inaudible] 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 114 –</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24428</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: [Microphone off, 2 inaudible]. 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Exactly. Go down – 4 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, that's part of the 5 fourth page of the exhibit – 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: There you are. There 7 you are. Like I said – 8 CHAIRPERSON: So what you are reading is 9 an anonymous mineworker – 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 11 CHAIRPERSON: Now I indicated we tried to 12 ascertain the identity of these mineworkers from Professor 13 Alexander so that if necessary they could give evidence so 14 that their accounts could be tested, but he indicated he 15 couldn't give the names to us. The anonymous mineworker 16 says the following. "Like I said, everyone was running to 17 safety. I did not really see if people ran this direction 18 or not. It was when I was on those rocks that I noticed 19 that some had run in to the nearby houses, but I couldn't 20 see them very well because I was already hiding," and then 21 there are three dots. "I was arrested because I was hiding 22 – no, no, no, hiding. You were shot at if you put up your 23 hands." The interviewer, who I think is one of the co- 24 authors of the book, or co-editors of the book, says, "So 25 you did not put up your hands?" And the mineworker, this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24430</p> <p>1 shot at koppie 3 whilst trying to surrender. 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 3 CHAIRPERSON: So "shot" doesn't 4 necessarily mean shot and killed – 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, no, no, that's why I 6 think the General has made a point that is a case in point 7 that he was not killed. That's why he's able to tell the 8 story. But we are ad idem, I take it, General, that this 9 witness seeks to say that people, there were people at 10 scene 2 who were shot at even as they were putting up their 11 hands in a sign of surrender. Would you agree with that 12 now? 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: That's what he alleges, 14 Chair. 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now I want to 16 direct you to some other evidence which seems to support 17 the assertion, or we'll argue it does. Now if we went to 18 day 50, T5442, lines 2 to 10, and day 50, T5676, lines 22 – 19 CHAIRPERSON: What's the passage that you 20 wish to refer to? 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay, let's take one at 22 a time. 23 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, alright, well what 24 passage do you want to refer to? 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Line 2 to 10 on –</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24429</p> <p>1 is mineworker number 5, he says, "I did not put up my 2 hands," and this is the passage the witness referred to 3 when he gave evidence-in-chief, "I was taken by a gentleman 4 who was of Indian ancestry. He held me and when I tried to 5 stand up I was hit with guns and he stopped them. He 6 stopped them and that was how my life was spared," and that 7 was the passage he then explained in his evidence-in-chief. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I don't know if you 9 will agree with me. It seems to me that this person to 10 which you were referred by my colleague, the sum total of 11 it is that there were people who were killed at scene 2 12 while they were trying to surrender. Would you agree with 13 that assessment of what he's saying? 14 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I don't agree 15 with the assessment that people were killed. He had a 16 perception yes, that if he puts his hands up he'll be shot, 17 but in the case as it clearly indicates this was not so for 18 him. 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Ja, so he was not 20 killed. Right, can we put it to you – 21 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, Mr Ntsebeza, the 22 topic which I gave you permission to cross-examine deals 23 with the suggestion that protesters were shot at. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, yes. 25 CHAIRPERSON: Was actually shot, it's</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24431</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: Lines 2 to 10 – 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: On 5442 – 3 CHAIRPERSON: Alright, Mr Mpofu is 4 leading Mr Phatsha and Mr Mpofu says, "And can you also now 5 tell the Commission in your own words what you observed in 6 respect of people who were being shot, as you state in your 7 statement, while coming out of their hiding places in the 8 rocks?" Mr Phatsha says, "What happened is at the time 9 people were raising their hands and asking forgiveness, 10 they were being shot at." That's the passage you rely on? 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, Mr Chairman. 12 You see what Mr Phatsha says, General? 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: Yes, I'm reading. 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And if we went to same 15 day 50, T5442 – no, no – 16 CHAIRPERSON: 5442, what line? 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, no, that's – 18 CHAIRPERSON: That's the same witness. 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, we have dealt with 20 that – 21 CHAIRPERSON: That's the passage we've 22 just looked at. It doesn't help to look at it twice. 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman – 24 CHAIRPERSON: If it's good the first time 25 it's good. It doesn't get better by being repeated. I</p>

Page 24432

1 mean carbon copies don't –
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Point is taken, Mr
 3 Chairman. I was actually wanting to refer to T5676, lines
 4 22 to 24.
 5 CHAIRPERSON: It sounds like a different
 6 day. It sounds like a different day.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, it – well, that's
 8 the reference I was given as leader.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Well, we haven't got – is
 10 it 5676? That will be the next day, is it? Look at the
 11 next day.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, 5676,
 13 line 22 to 24.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: There we have it. Lines 22
 15 to 24, now this is Mr Phatsha speaking again and he says,
 16 "I then could run and reach the small koppie." Now this is
 17 the passage you're relying on. "That is where the real
 18 shooting took place" –
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: - "and where people died.
 21 People were raising their hands. Even if their hands were
 22 risen they were shot at. Because of the pain I was
 23 feeling, loss of blood, I could feel blood was running out
 24 of my system," and so on. So I've gone on beyond the
 25 passage that you rely on. The point you rely on is the

Page 24433

1 passage that "Even if their hands," I take it, it means
 2 were raised, "they were shot at."
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You see that, General?
 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see that, Chair.
 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now there are also
 6 quite a fair amount of IPD statements. Now what is it
 7 called? It's I-P-I-D, is it?
 8 CHAIRPERSON: We normally say IPID. Are
 9 these exhibits or do we have to mark them?
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: They are new exhibits,
 11 I'm told.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: They will be, the first one
 13 – well, I suppose we make them all MMM48. How many are
 14 there? Three? So we'll mark them MMM – has the witness
 15 seen them already? 48.1, 48.2, and 48.3. IPID, the first
 16 one is the IPID statement of whom?
 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Nkosikhona –
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Please spell.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mjuba. N-K-O-S-I-K-H-O-
 20 N-A, surname –
 21 CHAIRPERSON: N-A or –
 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: N-A, surname M-J-U-B-A,
 23 A76.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: M-J-U?
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: B-A.

Page 24434

1 CHAIRPERSON: B-A, okay. So that's 48.1,
 2 right. 48.2 is the IPID statement of whom?
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It would be the IPID
 4 statement of Zwelimangele, I'll spell that, Mr Chair, Z-W-
 5 E-L-I-M-A-N-G-E-L-E, Mvakalelwa, M-V-A-K-A-L-E –
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, M-V?
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: M-V-A-K-A-L-E-L-W-A,
 8 Mvakalelwa.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. That's 48.2,
 10 and the third one?
 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It would be the
 12 statement of Moeketsi, M-O-E –
 13 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I see it's on the
 14 screen, it's already been given to the operator. Makhala,
 15 is it?
 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Makhala, yes,
 17 CHAIRPERSON: Mahala, Magala.
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Magala.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: M-A-K-H-A, K-H-E –
 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm told it's Makhala.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Is that right? The
 22 transcriber is going to battle with that. Have you read
 23 these three statements, Major General?
 24 GENERAL NAIDOO: Yes, Chair, I got them.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: You got them, alright.

Page 24435

1 Alright, I don't think we've got them but we won't take
 2 that point now, as long as we get it by the end of the day.
 3 Carry on with your cross-examination.
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now in paragraph 5 of –
 5 CHAIRPERSON: The first one, this is
 6 48.1 –
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mjuba's statement –
 8 CHAIRPERSON: MMM48 point – hang on.
 9 Yes, 48.1, MMM48.1, that's the statement of Mr Mjuba, is
 10 it? Oh, just Mjuba, it's no E.
 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It's Mjuba.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: It's M-J-U-B-A.
 13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: "Some mineworkers hid
 16 themselves with trees and some under the rocks. Police
 17 officers started shooting at the mineworkers with long and
 18 short firearms. Some mineworkers put their hands on air to
 19 show that they aren't fighting or attacking the police
 20 officers, but they were shot." You see that?
 21 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see it.
 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now if we went to
 23 Mvakalelwa's statement, paragraph 3, "We ran to different
 24 directions. By this time we were surrounded by police
 25 officials. The police stopped to shoot at us and I stopped

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24436</p> <p>1 running and raised my hands. Some of the miners also 2 raised their hands, but they were shot dead in front of 3 me." You see that? 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: I see that, Chair. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now Moeketsi's statement 6 we need to add a paragraph there. We'll just have to count 7 because right at the top, Mr Chairman, a point I must go to 8 where it starts, "I saw," "I saw another guy raising his 9 hands as a sign of surrender, but he was shot and died in 10 front of me. I then ran, arrived at a certain rock where I 11 hid myself. I was then arrested in that rock after we had 12 surrendered." You see that, General? 13 GENERAL NAIDOO: I saw that, Chair. 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now there's another 15 we'll want to also refer – 16 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, before you carry 17 on, Mr Ntsebeza, Mr Semenya has turned his light on. 18 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, whereas these 19 statements are given exhibit numbers, we must place on 20 record – 21 CHAIRPERSON: I've given them exhibit 22 numbers. 23 MR SEMENYA SC: That's what I'm saying, 24 Chair. 25 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24438</p> <p>1 being true if the people who made these statements aren't 2 submitted, don't submit themselves to cross-examination. I 3 don't exclude it. As I've indicated, the rules in relation 4 to commissions are different from those in trials, but 5 obviously you can't assume in advance that that will 6 happen, and specifically where there's been a challenge 7 which has not been responded to certain consequences may 8 follow. 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 10 We didn't – 11 [15:27] CHAIRPERSON: That doesn't affect your 12 cross-examination. I mean you can't interrupt the cross- 13 examination and call the witnesses; you've got to carry on 14 with the cross-examination – 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman – 16 CHAIRPERSON: - and the witness must do 17 as best he can to deal with what you put to him. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman. We 19 have been down this path before and I don't understand the 20 interjection from my learned friend to be an objection to – 21 CHAIRPERSON: Well, we won't waste time 22 now. Perhaps he can explain it to you after we adjourn, 23 but carry on in the meantime. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 25 Now what Mr Semenya says is also true of the following that</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24437</p> <p>1 MR SEMENYA SC: I'm saying whereas – 2 CHAIRPERSON: Whereas, I see. I see. I 3 thought you said unless. Whereas. 4 MR SEMENYA SC: Whereas they are given 5 exhibit numbers, we do not accept them as evidentiary 6 material except beyond stating that they are what they are. 7 If anybody wants to rely on the correctness of the contents 8 of the statements, we want those witnesses there so that 9 their version can be tested. 10 CHAIRPERSON: You hear what Mr Semenya 11 has said. 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, I've heard, Mr 13 Chair. 14 CHAIRPERSON: Of course a commission 15 isn't bound by the strict Rules of Evidence, so a 16 commission can take evidential material of any kind and 17 even use it to prove the truth of what's said, but where 18 there is a specific challenge of the kind that we've just 19 heard it may well be that it would be a wise course for 20 those who wish to rely on the statements made by these 21 people in these affidavits to submit them for cross- 22 examination. 23 But anyway, that's a matter which you and those 24 assisting you must consider. I obviously can't tell you in 25 advance that we will necessarily accept these statements as</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24439</p> <p>1 I want to put to you. There are also post mortem injuries 2 which I want to put to you on the basis of which we'll 3 argue later on that they are supportive – 4 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, Mr Ntsebeza, I'm 5 not quite sure I understand you. When you say post mortem 6 injuries, do you mean that literally? Do you mean these 7 are injuries sustained on the corpse after the person 8 concerned was dead, which is the true meaning of a post 9 mortem injury, or do you mean injuries which have been 10 recorded by the pathologist during the post mortem 11 examination? There's a difference between the two. 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, there is a 13 difference. It's in this I think I'm guilty of trying to 14 short-circuit and in the process say things which are 15 correctly being pointed out by Mr Chairman to not – what 16 I'm talking about here is there have been post mortems and 17 those post mortems have recorded certain findings which 18 again on the tentative basis that they will be found to be 19 unassailable in argument reflect injuries which we will 20 argue support the assertion that some of the mineworkers 21 were shot in their hands when it can be argued they were 22 raising their hands in surrender. You do understand that, 23 General, do you? 24 GENERAL NAIDOO: I hear that. 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now Chair, let me just</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24440</p> <p>1 get my bearings about whether these are exhibits. I'm told 2 it's exhibit A – 3 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, exhibit A is the post 4 mortem reports in respect of the 34 people who died on the 5 16th of August. So provided you give us the number, or the 6 sub-number as it were in exhibit A, it will be in order. 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm told [microphone 8 off, inaudible] that would be Gadlela [microphone off, 9 inaudible] - 10 CHAIRPERSON: Never mind the number. 11 There you are, now we've got it in front of us. We've got, 12 it's A2 actually. There are a number of, in fact it will 13 be more than 34 because this includes people who died 14 before the 16th as well. So give us the exhibits to which 15 you are specifically referring, give us A2, item, give us 16 the number. And while you're looking for the numbers, 17 Major General, have you got all exhibit A2, all the post 18 mortems? 19 GENERAL NAIDOO: I have them, Chair. 20 CHAIRPERSON: Good. Well, you're ahead 21 of us. Do you know which ones – was your attention 22 specifically directed to a number, or were you just told to 23 look through the whole file and see what you could find? 24 GENERAL NAIDOO: Chair, I'd received one, 25 two, three, four, I've received six post mortem reports.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24442</p> <p>1 GENERAL NAIDOO: Six, Sir. Six, Chair. 2 CHAIRPERSON: What was the first one you 3 were referred to? 4 GENERAL NAIDOO: It's, it seems to have a 5 A578, I don't know if that's – 6 CHAIRPERSON: 578. Was that all you were 7 told? You weren't given the item number? So if they'll 8 show us more of the supplementary index – 578 is a page. 9 MS LEWIS: Chair, sorry, the name of the 10 first deceased person is Gadlela. The DR number is 576. 11 So if we just scroll down – 12 CHAIRPERSON: Let's scroll down, Mr 13 Operator, until we get 576. Can we see the next page, 14 please? The supplementary index, that's what we were 15 looking at. We're now being shown a post mortem – well, an 16 affidavit by a warrant officer who is involved in the 17 ballistics department. That's not what we want. We want 18 the second page of the supplementary index of the post 19 mortem reports. It does look as if we may have to take a 20 short adjournment. We'll adjourn for a very short time, at 21 least I hope it will be a very short time, and once all 22 this information has been obtained and collated we can 23 proceed. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 25 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24441</p> <p>1 CHAIRPERSON: Alright, are these the ones 2 that he, the ones he was given, are they the ones you're 3 going to refer us to? So perhaps if you can't find the 4 numbers he can give them to us. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm relying on – the 6 General seems to be ahead of everybody, including my 7 juniors. 8 MS LEWIS: Chair, are we looking for the 9 DR number or for the number on the – 10 CHAIRPERSON: On the – now there you're 11 asking me a question to which I may not be able to give an 12 accurate answer, but we were given a supplementary index 13 that was shown on the screen. There it is, and it lists 14 the various post mortem reports which are part of exhibit 15 A2. 16 MS LEWIS: Chair, could we – 17 CHAIRPERSON: There are item numbers and 18 then there are, you'll see there are DR numbers. Now if 19 you've got that document, if you know what the DR number is 20 you can find the item number very easily, it may take you a 21 minute of two. If you want a short adjournment in order to 22 sort of sort this out, I'll give it to you, but if the 23 witness knows the ones you're referring to that is short- 24 circuiting – were you referred to, how many were you 25 referred to?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24443</p> <p>1 [15:45] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. I 2 see Mr Mpofu's not back yet. Major-General, you're still 3 under oath. Mr Ntsebeza proceed with your cross- 4 examination. I gather the problem has now been sorted out. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes I'm told, Mr 6 Chairman. I'm told if we went by the numbers exhibit A 7 pages 263 to 294 will take us – 8 CHAIRPERSON: It's exhibit A2 isn't it? 9 Exhibit A2 – just A. Okay then what page? 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 263. 11 CHAIRPERSON: All right, let's look at 12 that please? 13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And that is Mr Gablela, 14 G-A-B-L-E-L-A. If we view paragraph 4.5 – 15 CHAIRPERSON: I take it it's paragraph 16 4.5 that you want us to look at. 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, yes Mr Chair. 18 CHAIRPERSON: Which reads "Tangential 19 gunshot wound, tangential through the lateral aspect of the 20 left-hand index finger is present." 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you see that, 22 General? I mean just to re-orientate ourselves we are 23 looking for evidence objective or otherwise that shows 24 consistency with what the unidentified mineworker in 25 exhibit MMM –</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24444</p> <p>1 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair, if Mr Ntsebeza 2 wants to give that evidence I would really welcome it. 3 There's nothing to infer that a tangential gunshot wound is 4 of a – 5 CHAIRPERSON: You can - for argument, Mr 6 Semenya. 7 MR SEMENYA SC: Not for this witness to 8 answer. Then I must make an objection. 9 CHAIRPERSON: Oh I see, yes. It's a 10 medical question I suppose, but the objection taken, Mr 11 Ntsebeza is that this witness is only going to be able to 12 conjecture when this is put to him. By the way how many 13 other wounds were there, gunshot wounds? Can we see 14 further on this page please? A fifth wound lists to this 15 tangential gunshot wound, now can we see higher up on the 16 page? And on the previous page please. Oh I see there 17 appear then to have been two wounds, two gunshot wounds. 18 The first is the one dealt with in paragraph 4.3 and 4.4. 19 4.3 giving the entrance, post lateral aspect of the right 20 thorax which is the chest, yes. And then 4.4 is the exit 21 wound of the same gunshot. And then there's this 22 tangential gunshot wound at 4.5. And you know, that's what 23 you put to the witness. Mr Semenya says we can't ask the 24 witness to conjecture whether that's a sign or 25 corroboration of the allegation that this deceased was shot</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24446</p> <p>1 small circular laceration of the palm of the left hand? 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 3 CHAIRPERSON: Yes and you'll ask us in 4 due course to infer from that evidence that it's 5 corroboration for the suggestion that some of the people 6 were shot while they were surrendering. 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Paragraph 5, A2, IMG is 8 the entrance wound and the exit wound would be 5 A3, the 9 suggestion seems to be that it went into his palm on the 10 palm of his hand and exited on the side of side of the left 11 thumb. And all I'm saying we would argue that it's 12 objective evidence that shows that he had his hand held up. 13 The last of the hand wounds would be on Van Wyk Sagalala - 14 Sagalala. Turn now to 721. 15 CHAIRPERSON: This is page 702 of the 16 exhibit. This is the body – well you'd better pronounce 17 it, I can pronounce his middle name, but I can't – 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: We are in the same boat, 19 Mr Chairman, take solace in that. I must not try. I'm 20 told it's Modisaotsile Sagalala. 21 CHAIRPERSON: You could have mentioned 22 the middle name so people could understand what I was 23 talking about. His name is Modisaotsile Van Wyk Sagalala, 24 is that correct? 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm just slightly better</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24445</p> <p>1 at while he was surrendering. The witness may not be able 2 to conjecture because we're in as good a position to 3 conjecture as he is, but it's presumable a fact on which 4 you can rely at the end of the case when you argue. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: That's exactly the 6 point, it's just so that once we heard the witness was 7 having medical emergencies, medical services we should 8 point out what we would be arguing on the basis of. I 9 accept what Mr Semenya is saying about evidence having to 10 be led as to whether in fact this particular person was 11 raising his hand when the tangential wound was inflicted on 12 his left index finger. The next body would be Mr Henry 13 Mvuyisi Pato about which we deal in our – it would be on 14 pages 295 to 322, paragraph 5, A2, IMG, 0087 to 0088. 15 CHAIRPERSON: Now he is, of course, he is 16 described as victim M in exhibit MMM47, but you're busy 17 here with a different aspect of evidence relating to him. 18 Is that correct? 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes DR577. 20 CHAIRPERSON: You referred us to page, 21 well to DR577 which is part of exhibit A2. 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. 23 CHAIRPERSON: And we're looking at page 3 24 of the post-mortem relating to Mr Pato and there's an 25 injury there, which is the one you relay on, the A2, the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 24447</p> <p>1 than you, Mr Chairman, but you know you are on your way 2 there. 3 CHAIRPERSON: Let's have a look at what 4 they say about his hand or injuries he had on his hand 5 because that's the point you want to make isn't it? 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Paragraph 14, 4[G] 7 not 14. 8 CHAIRPERSON: 4[G] is described as shot 9 4, a fourth gunshot related wound and was present to the 10 under side of the left wrist. It was only identifiable by 11 the disturbance of the fabric of the sleeve of the jersey. 12 The wound consisted out of, they don't need to out, the 13 wound consisted of a horizontal "cigar shape" superficial 14 abrasion of 20 millimetres by 10 millimetres. This was 15 classified as a "grazing" shot. The direction in which the 16 projectile travelled was not determinable. That's the 17 passage you rely on isn't it? 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I think that's the 19 passage, Mr Chairman. Mr Chairman the next topic is my 20 last topic, but I would like to spend quite some time with 21 the General on it. 22 CHAIRPERSON: On my watch it's about four 23 minutes to four and it seems unlikely that you'll be able 24 to deal with this topic. It's the one covered by exhibit 25 MMM47. So I take it you're asking for an adjournment until</p>

Page 24448	Page 24450
<p>1 tomorrow morning.</p> <p>2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I am, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: At 9 o'clock</p> <p>4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I am.</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: And we will start the day</p> <p>6 with your ultimate point which is covered by exhibit MMM47.</p> <p>7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: There will be no other.</p> <p>8 CHAIRPERSON: That would be victims A, B,</p> <p>9 M and O, that's to say Mr Anele Mdizeni, Mr Mdizeni is it?</p> <p>10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Mdizeni.</p> <p>11 CHAIRPERSON: Then there's a Mr Thabiso</p> <p>12 Johannes Thelejane, then there's Mr Nkosinati Xalabile and</p> <p>13 then there's Mr Pato to whom we have already, Mr Henry</p> <p>14 Mvuyisi Pato.</p> <p>15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, there will</p> <p>16 be a correction made, we probably could make it now because</p> <p>17 Simato actually should be Nkosiyabo, N-K-O-S-I and then Y-</p> <p>18 A-B-O, Nkosiyabo. We will replace the pages of</p> <p>19 presentation tomorrow.</p> <p>20 CHAIRPERSON: We're talking about victim</p> <p>21 O now and how do you spell his first name?</p> <p>22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Nkosiyabo, N-K-O-S-I -</p> <p>23 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.</p> <p>24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And then Y-A-B-O.</p> <p>25 CHAIRPERSON: Y-A-B-O?</p>	<p>1 9 o'clock.</p> <p>2 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED]</p> <p>3 .</p> <p>4 .</p> <p>5 .</p> <p>6 .</p> <p>7 .</p> <p>8 .</p> <p>9 .</p> <p>10 .</p> <p>11 .</p> <p>12 .</p> <p>13 .</p> <p>14 .</p> <p>15 .</p> <p>16 .</p> <p>17 .</p> <p>18 .</p> <p>19 .</p> <p>20 .</p> <p>21 .</p> <p>22 .</p> <p>23 .</p> <p>24 .</p> <p>25 .</p>
Page 24449	
<p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: So the Nati is wrong and it</p> <p>3 should be Nkosiyabo.</p> <p>4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Nkosiyabo, yes.</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: Xalabile?</p> <p>6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman</p> <p>7 CHAIRPERSON: All right we've made that</p> <p>8 correction so we can proceed tomorrow with the –</p> <p>9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 9 o'clock.</p> <p>10 CHAIRPERSON: At 9 o'clock referring to</p> <p>11 him by his correct name. We'll take the adjournment now</p> <p>12 till 9 o'clock tomorrow morning.</p> <p>13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: And do we know, perhaps I</p> <p>15 should mention this now. Looking ahead, as far as I know</p> <p>16 there are two cross-examiners after you, Mr Ntsebeza, the</p> <p>17 one is Mr Mpofu who for some reason is not here this</p> <p>18 afternoon and the other is Mr Brickhill, I think from</p> <p>19 Cal's. Sorry the NRC. I trust they will both be here</p> <p>20 tomorrow because – but anyway if there's a problem I don't</p> <p>21 think we'll be prepared to just adjourn for the convenience</p> <p>22 of counsel who choose to come when they want to come. I'm</p> <p>23 not saying that by way of reflection on anybody, I'm just</p> <p>24 indicating that that kind of attitude is not going to be</p> <p>25 tolerated tomorrow. We will adjourn until tomorrow morning</p>	

<p style="text-align: center;">A</p> <p>abdominal 24366:1,2 able 24300:15 24301:5 24304:21 24324:14 24351:7 24353:20 24357:21 24365:5,17 24365:17 24371:18 24375:24 24376:2 24385:16 24386:10 24394:17 24395:7 24408:19 24410:4 24415:7 24424:11 24426:9 24430:7 24441:11 24444:11 24445:1 24447:23 abrasion 24447:14 absence 24296:16 24306:9 24352:7 absorb 24426:15 academic 24398:10 accept 24352:4 24359:8 24437:5,25 24445:9 access 24309:16,20 24353:13 24365:15 24366:1 24422:19 account 24336:25 24360:11 24400:18 24414:9 accountability 24336:23 accounts 24428:14 accuracy 24363:14 24370:22 accurate 24441:12 accurately 24386:10 achieve 24397:24 acknowledgement 24338:9 act 24300:15 acting 24305:16,20 24306:9,18,25 24307:2 24310:2,13 24322:6 24352:7 action 24355:1 24393:2 24405:6 24407:16 actions 24317:11,15 24333:14 24360:23 24409:6 activated 24333:15 activations 24334:7 activities 24336:21,25 24346:4,10 24392:20 actual 24349:1 ad 24430:8 add 24350:17 24375:10 24399:13 24416:14 24416:18 24436:6 added 24350:10 24381:7 addition 24316:25 24346:7 24364:22 24378:8 24394:7 24414:19 additional 24313:11 24332:15 24333:3,10</p>	<p>24333:22 24344:25 24346:24 24347:1 24348:15 24370:17 24379:13 24414:20 24418:5 24419:10 24421:20 24423:6,11 address 24327:20 24329:21 24400:14 addressed 24317:20 24355:14 24357:1 addresses 24355:14 addressing 24356:3 adequate 24416:12 adequately 24356:22 adjourn 24426:15 24438:22 24442:20 24449:21,25 ADJOURNED 24450:2 adjournment 24310:21 24374:13,16 24400:1 24400:5 24426:13 24441:21 24442:20 24447:25 24449:11 ADJOURNS 24344:13 24374:18 24400:9 24426:16 24442:25 administered 24370:5 administering 24372:16 Administration 24398:7 admission 24367:22 admitted 24413:25 advance 24437:25 24438:5 advise 24336:13 aerial 24340:21,21 affect 24316:24 24438:11 affidavit 24315:25 24364:11 24400:17 24401:4 24404:14,23 24407:2,19 24413:13 24442:16 affidavits 24361:23 24437:21 Africa 24388:16 24396:5,17 African 24382:20 24396:10 24416:21 24424:10 afternoon 24343:10 24353:16 24449:18 after-hours 24352:11 24353:1 agents 24296:16 ago 24386:1 24415:19 24419:4 agree 24326:10,17 24349:25 24350:1,9 24355:15 24356:17 24370:12 24375:6 24376:1 24384:8 24392:15 24398:4 24404:18,19 24407:20 24408:21</p>	<p>24410:1 24414:11,12 24429:9,12,14 24430:11 agreed 24328:23 24331:19,24 24332:25 24339:5 24372:11 24410:21 agreeing 24397:21 agreement 24328:25 24332:17 24338:16 agrees 24372:10 ahead 24297:18 24440:20 24441:6 24449:15 aid 24358:21 24363:12 24363:17 24370:4 24372:7,16 24374:1 24376:23,25 24377:2 24377:11 air 24340:22 24435:18 airway 24365:18 AK47 24395:16 AK47s 24395:14,20 Alexander 24427:7 24428:13 alia 24328:17 alive 24373:9 allegation 24444:25 alleges 24430:13 alleviate 24375:24 24376:8 allow 24361:25 allowed 24408:5 alright 24296:12 24298:1 24331:12 24335:15 24425:19 24426:12 24430:23 24431:3 24434:25 24435:1 24441:1 alternatively 24419:18 ambulance 24365:16 24419:10 ambulances 24370:23 24419:9 amount 24433:6 ample 24365:19 ANC 24401:2,17 24403:2 ancestry 24429:4 Andrew 24367:1 Andries 24379:5,10 and/or 24323:8 24392:13 Anele 24297:5 24448:9 Annandale 24316:9 24341:11 24411:14 announced 24411:13 anonymous 24428:9,15 answer 24302:17 24306:15 24315:2,10 24328:15 24330:4 24331:3,10 24356:8 24375:8,11,13 24376:2 24377:7 24381:12,22 24388:12,16,20</p>	<p>24389:19 24390:19 24391:2 24425:1 24427:9 24441:12 24444:8 answered 24315:15 24381:15 24410:8 answering 24367:17 answers 24359:11 24364:6 24381:11 anticipate 24369:12 anybody 24309:6 24372:4 24437:7 24449:23 anyway 24340:1 24378:21 24414:25 24437:23 24449:20 apart 24342:1 24391:11 apologise 24381:24 apparatus 24303:23 apparently 24339:19 24414:2 appear 24306:23 24413:18 24416:24 24444:17 appearing 24364:2 appears 24339:22 24340:20 24343:20 24365:14 24370:6 24409:18 24415:1 24419:5 application 24399:20 24399:23 applied 24393:3 appreciate 24362:17 approach 24324:18 approached 24307:19 24326:6 24353:4 appropriate 24337:24 24344:5 approval 24332:6 24335:21 approve 24331:21 24332:8,23 approved 24331:17 24332:1,13 24410:25 approximately 24314:2 24314:4,17 24339:14 24348:16 24350:13 24350:14 24401:7 24402:2 area 24313:13 24335:11 24339:8 24340:5,8,10,13,20 24341:13 24354:10 24355:11 24383:13 24384:23 24385:3,5 24397:15 24401:20 24402:2,16 24404:3 24406:13 24414:21 24415:8 24422:1,8 areas 24332:17 24339:13 24342:3 24383:24 24384:17 24384:20,21,21 24385:2 24401:21</p>	<p>24402:17 24403:11 24403:11 24409:4 aren't 24435:19 24438:1 arguable 24404:15 24405:25 24406:1 argue 24338:2 24363:10 24364:20 24367:6 24368:9,22 24368:24 24379:14 24395:25 24409:9 24430:17 24439:3,20 24445:4 24446:11 argued 24363:24 24364:9 24439:21 arguing 24363:9 24445:8 argument 24361:21 24363:15,20 24368:6 24368:11 24381:5 24408:13 24409:15 24439:19 24444:5 arguments 24368:16 arises 24306:15 arm 24362:24 armed 24303:6,9 24338:11 24388:20 24401:8,13 24422:13 24422:20 arms 24345:10 24406:13,22,25 24417:21 arose 24398:17 arrange 24303:21 24334:18 arranged 24419:9 24422:2 arrangements 24370:16 arrest 24320:13 24409:3 arrested 24313:25 24349:8 24428:21 24436:11 arresting 24345:10 arrests 24406:22 arrive 24360:18 arrived 24297:15 24314:20,21 24316:4 24333:4,11 24363:17 24370:11,14,18,20,24 24436:10 arrives 24303:18 articulate 24358:13 24406:22 ascertain 24346:19 24351:8 24418:4 24428:12 aside 24361:4 asked 24298:19 24300:23 24304:23 24311:3 24315:11 24322:16 24333:21 24337:13 24352:1 24353:10 24359:11 24359:16 24362:4</p>
---	---	---	--	---

24366:19 24370:24 24387:14 24388:18 24388:24 24389:24 24390:3,6,15 24407:23 24413:20 24414:14,18 24415:18 asking 24323:17 24324:13 24344:22 24358:20 24366:15 24367:4,8 24368:21 24375:11 24402:12 24403:20 24425:9 24431:9 24441:11 24447:25 asks 24315:13 aspect 24298:8,17,20 24304:24 24346:25 24354:3,11 24443:19 24444:19 24445:17 aspects 24317:19 Assassinations 24401:23 assegais 24388:22 24394:8 assertion 24430:17 24439:20 assess 24312:9,15 assessment 24329:19 24358:25 24359:3 24409:22 24429:13 24429:15 asset 24422:24,25 assets 24422:4,16,18 24423:1 assist 24298:18 24327:3 24331:19,24 24332:25 24345:12 24346:9 24358:18 24363:22 24364:7,11 24367:16 24374:4 24376:8 24397:18,21 assistance 24327:24 24328:1 24329:10 24355:24 24358:21 24373:25 24374:8 24424:14,17,19 assisted 24346:9 24368:6 24413:18 assisting 24312:1,20 24437:24 assume 24309:22 24315:22 24335:18 24349:23 24373:12 24377:18 24386:12 24389:25 24390:3 24438:5 assuming 24308:23,25 24335:23 assumption 24335:18 24366:12 24377:8 24386:14 assured 24315:23 attack 24316:14 24317:21 24320:19 24320:25 24322:11	24323:2 24325:10 24347:22 attacked 24347:17 24384:1 24389:10 24390:24,25 attacking 24383:23 24384:23 24435:19 attacks 24326:12 24338:11 24339:3 24384:25 24389:10 24389:25 24390:3,6 24390:10,21 24391:2 24391:15,18 24392:22 24393:5 24394:12 24395:20 attempt 24352:21 attempting 24373:11 attempts 24394:12 attend 24315:3 24356:21,21 24360:17 24412:13 attended 24308:13 24323:14 24385:17 24386:7,8 24392:2 24410:24 attending 24352:13 24377:20 attention 24361:19,21 24379:13 24418:20 24420:23,23 24440:21 attitude 24320:19 24325:25 24326:3 24360:24 24361:2 24449:24 attributable 24324:3 audible 24315:7 August 24299:20,22,23 24304:5 24305:2 24307:6,9,21 24308:1 24310:4,8 24332:10 24337:3 24346:22 24352:23 24393:11 24393:21 24395:23 24404:16 24406:5 24415:22 24440:5 authors 24428:24 automatic 24313:19 available 24309:4,15 24351:14 24352:18 24353:8 24409:5 24410:22 AVL 24370:21 avoid 24369:17 avoided 24408:11 aware 24298:13,15,16 24301:6 24307:18 24308:4,15 24317:2 24321:22 24323:20 24325:13 24352:18 24361:5 24363:5 24392:7,9 24403:12 24403:21 24409:10 24422:12 awareness 24422:5 A-B-O 24448:18	A2 24440:12,15,17 24441:15 24443:8,9 24445:14,21,25 24446:7 A3 24446:8 A578 24442:5 A76 24433:23 <hr/> B <hr/> B 24296:17 24297:1 24416:6 24448:8 back 24297:21 24305:22,23 24306:3 24314:20 24321:25 24336:3 24408:9 24420:3,5 24443:2 backdrop 24337:11 badly 24357:2 bags 24376:24,25 24377:2,11 balance 24359:19,21,22 24360:6,9,11,14 balancing 24364:3 ballistics 24442:17 ban 24397:12,13,14,15 band 24417:21 banded 24392:6 bantu 24362:25 barbed 24412:23 Barnard's 24418:11 Barnes 24301:14,16 24302:10,15,18,22 24303:2 base 24357:25 based 24329:20 24346:6,10 24362:6 24398:14 24405:12 24413:22 basic 24363:5 basis 24313:25 24320:2 24321:5 24323:22 24325:8 24326:25 24349:23 24352:25 24353:3,18 24354:17 24355:20 24357:2,12 24357:20 24371:3 24402:6 24422:17 24439:2,18 24445:8 battle 24434:22 bearings 24440:1 beauty 24421:7 beef 24414:18 beg 24299:10 beginning 24411:11,12 beings 24377:17 belabour 24319:7 belief 24348:25 believe 24297:24 24337:2 24366:2 24369:4,23 24382:1 believed 24347:23 24348:1,24 bending 24418:14,16 benefit 24315:8 best 24329:21 24406:6 24438:17	better 24364:8 24368:6 24431:25 24446:16 24446:25 beyond 24319:20 24347:3,7 24350:16 24350:21,24 24432:24 24437:6 billions 24355:21 24356:12,13 24358:9 24359:6 Bishop 24397:11 bit 24341:8,17 24357:19 24405:10 24426:25 blanket 24373:8 bled 24359:2 bleeding 24316:21 24355:6,9 24356:6,11 24358:5,7,7 24359:5 24361:7 24362:22,23 24363:1,6 24365:17 24365:23 blood 24363:1,3 24432:23,23 blue 24417:20,20 24420:12,13 bluntly 24362:7 boat 24446:18 bodies 24416:23 body 24332:7 24348:15 24445:12 24446:16 Boffard 24364:22 24366:5,13 24367:8 24375:9,20 24377:24 24379:6 Bonginkosi 24379:10 book 24411:15 24427:7 24427:8,9,10,18,18 24428:24,24 boosted 24332:18 boot 24372:21 boots 24373:18 borne 24318:6 bothering 24365:1 bottom 24312:12 24427:22 bound 24367:22 24437:15 boundaries 24396:25 brass 24337:10 breadth 24386:9 break 24344:10,11 24351:7 24395:3 24425:10,12,14,16,20 24426:5 breakdown 24304:10 breathing 24365:13 Brickhill 24449:18 brief 24300:23 briefing 24412:16,20 24338:4 Brigadier 24339:23 24341:12,14 24351:17,18,19,19 24352:9 24353:22,24 24370:15,23	24407:18 24411:15 24413:21 24414:8 24415:1 Brigadiers 24316:9 bring 24336:8 24338:23 24361:20 bringing 24348:16 broader 24386:11 24405:2 broke 24394:23 brought 24320:11 24330:14 24345:11 24424:19,21 brown 24419:22 build-up 24342:4,8,12 24391:6 burnt 24347:18 busy 24445:16 B-A 24433:25 24434:1 <hr/> C <hr/> C 24400:8 calibre 24395:12 Calitz 24316:9 24339:23 24341:14 24351:19 24353:23 24353:24 call 24305:18 24306:17 24307:8 24314:3 24341:1 24342:13 24351:20,21,22 24352:5,25 24353:21 24377:16 24379:4 24398:24 24422:6 24438:13 called 24298:11,14 24337:4,13 24353:18 24363:23 24366:3 24367:7 24380:22 24414:23 24433:7 calls 24301:16 24302:12 24304:2 Cal's 24449:19 can't 24300:17 24332:23 24376:16 24391:18,21,24 24392:1,3 24393:6 24406:14 24408:11 24437:24 24438:5,12 24441:3 capable 24365:22 24367:1 24380:6,7 capacity 24346:5 24374:6 24382:22 Captain 24340:5 capturing 24356:13 carbon 24432:1 care 24365:15 career 24381:25 24382:15 carried 24393:23 24394:5,8,17 24395:17 carry 24298:1 24315:8 24357:17 24394:25 24411:17 24435:3
--	---	--	---	---

<p>24436:16 24438:13 24438:23 carrying 24388:21 24394:20 24395:4 24417:12 24418:7,22 24419:2 case 24328:10 24354:6 24358:3 24359:9 24361:6,10,12,19,24 24362:23 24363:11 24363:14 24366:23 24372:21 24373:16 24373:20,23,24,25 24380:9,11 24407:4,9 24411:6 24427:9 24429:17 24430:6 24445:4 cases 24323:21 24372:20 24380:16 24395:11 catch 24415:11 cause 24371:5 24416:1 caused 24350:8 24381:9 24415:8 cavity 24366:2 cell 24301:6 24306:14 24353:12 24354:16 24354:19,21 central 24401:20 centre 24334:6 24418:5 24423:7 certain 24321:24 24332:15,17 24338:10 24342:3 24396:24 24397:6,6 24397:25 24406:25 24407:3 24409:2,2,3 24409:11 24422:18 24422:19 24436:10 24438:7 24439:17 certainly 24316:24 24321:16 24335:11 24367:6 24368:16 24371:11 24372:15 24377:17 24384:13 24421:17 cetera 24356:23 24357:11 Chairman's 24331:15 challenge 24437:18 24438:6 challenged 24379:3 chamber 24315:7 24369:12,17 24415:23 24416:2 chance 24330:4 24359:18 characterise 24393:10 characteristic 24383:13 charge 24340:9,11,13 24367:12,13,14 24368:23 24403:10 charged 24336:17,24 chase 24387:5 Chaskalson 24296:9</p>	<p>24354:2,10,13 24355:4 24364:18 24371:14,15,16 24378:1,3 check 24310:9 checked 24351:19 chest 24444:20 choose 24449:22 cigar 24447:13 circuiting 24441:24 circular 24446:1 circulated 24352:14 circulating 24319:16 circulation 24339:3 circumstances 24316:20,23 24365:20 24406:7 24407:10 civil 24355:22 24356:13 24357:5 24358:9 24359:6 24374:4 claim 24357:5 claimed 24303:1 claims 24355:22 24356:12,13 24358:9 24359:6 24374:4 clarification 24331:15 clarified 24357:11 clarify 24381:4 clarifying 24355:16 clarity 24345:24 24387:22 clash 24320:16 24395:1 classified 24447:15 clear 24304:8 24316:19 24329:22 24343:1 24344:25 24389:18 24393:19 24409:3,24 24411:25 24419:1 24421:13,15 clearer 24418:22 clearly 24359:18 24371:8 24373:8,12 24375:5 24422:15 24429:17 client 24384:16 24419:17 clients 24297:23,25 24364:2 24368:10 clip 24369:4,7,23 24370:2,2 24371:6,9 24371:11,14,17 clips 24369:15 24370:1 24425:21 closer 24367:2 cluster 24308:16 24352:17 codes 24357:19 cogency 24381:20 collated 24442:22 colleague 24427:14 24429:10 colleagues 24368:7 Colonel 24339:23 24340:4,7,9,11</p>	<p>24341:15 combative 24401:19 combination 24338:14 24395:9 24401:13 come 24297:20 24298:6 24314:20 24333:6,8 24350:3 24358:7 24374:11 24408:9 24409:9,19 24449:22 24449:22 comes 24296:20 24303:20 24329:11 24421:5 comfort 24344:10,11 24351:7 24425:10,13 24425:16,20 24426:5 coming 24333:7 24431:7 comma 24388:5,6 command 24308:15 24335:5,10,12 24339:22 24340:22 24377:18 24382:16 24383:15 commander 24308:16 24308:16 24340:4,6 comment 24325:6 24326:9 24379:17 24394:15 24410:15 comments 24337:23 commission 24296:2,10 24298:18 24300:23 24307:18 24332:4 24338:4 24344:13,13 24344:14 24359:8 24366:19,21 24374:18,18,19 24394:18 24395:8 24400:9,9,10,14 24420:1 24426:16,16 24426:17 24431:5 24437:14,16 24442:25,25 24443:1 24450:2 Commissioner 24301:1 24302:13 24304:22 24305:13,17 24306:17,18,20,24,25 24307:3,10,13 24308:17,24 24309:2 24309:6,7,10,16,21 24309:23,25 24313:22 24315:18 24315:18 24316:3,3,7 24316:8 24322:22,22 24322:22 24327:3,18 24327:19,22,25 24328:3,9,12,19,22 24328:23,24 24329:1 24329:16 24330:17 24330:22,25 24331:5 24331:7,14,16 24332:14,16,19 24333:1 24334:3,25 24336:16,17,18 24337:12 24343:11</p>	<p>24344:24 24352:12 24353:6 24410:18 24411:13,20 24412:5 commissioners 24328:1 24329:7 24333:21 Commissioner's 24304:2 24327:15,16 24352:10,16 24353:2 24353:19 commissions 24421:7 24438:4 committed 24402:2 24406:25 committing 24367:24 common 24371:5 communicated 24414:8 communication 24307:15,25 24308:2 24308:5 24312:18 24334:24 communities 24388:14 community 24355:12 24355:13 24357:21 24393:8 company 24419:6,6,12 24424:18 comparison 24408:23 compass 24360:8 compel 24356:5 compile 24346:1 complained 24313:6 complaints 24311:23 24311:25 24312:19 24312:24 complete 24340:25 24341:20 24397:19 complicated 24360:7 comply 24413:1 component 24405:17 24405:18 computer 24354:24 concealable 24395:13 concealed 24405:13 conceded 24381:16 concepts 24364:3 concern 24319:16 24326:1 24355:11 concerned 24303:21 24325:1,14,22 24331:6 24340:20 24349:11 24354:21 24439:8 concludes 24364:22 conclusion 24323:5,9 24402:8 condition 24384:6 conditions 24358:22 conducive 24358:22 24361:1 24384:6 conduct 24313:12 24324:17 24345:6 24357:19 24392:20 24409:2 conducted 24346:11 24400:19 24403:13 conducting 24321:22</p>	<p>24325:16 confined 24405:1 confirm 24337:16 24383:5 24419:20 confirmed 24409:5 confirming 24424:25 conflict 24357:19 24383:10,20 24388:13 conflicts 24398:17 confront 24401:19 24406:7 confrontation 24313:17 24319:4 24404:15 confronted 24382:23 24406:3 confronting 24356:24 conjecture 24444:12,24 24445:2,3 connection 24307:8 consequence 24320:25 24323:10 24333:13 24335:12 24369:11 24375:25 consequences 24354:20 24360:23 24364:19 24364:20 24387:5 24412:11 24438:7 consider 24416:22 24437:24 considerations 24362:2 consisted 24339:23 24447:12,13 consistency 24443:24 consolidated 24315:20 24315:25 conspicuous 24319:25 Constitution 24336:24 constitutional 24397:4 24398:14 consultation 24327:25 24329:3,5 24330:21 consulted 24330:25 consulting 24328:20 contact 24309:17,18 24353:5,6,8 contacted 24313:8 24334:5 contain 24386:20 24392:14,17,19 24408:19 contained 24346:7 24397:3 24404:14,21 24404:23,24 24405:2 containing 24386:15 24402:9 CONTD 24344:18 24374:23 24400:15 24426:21 contemplation 24421:19 contend 24307:12 contended 24393:21,23 contents 24437:7 context 24390:1,4,5</p>
---	--	---	--	---

<p>24391:14 24396:2 24403:5 contingency 24334:12 contingent 24322:9 continues 24315:4 continuous 24312:18 continuously 24355:21 24360:21 contracted 24419:16 24419:18 24424:18 contradict 24406:10 contrary 24384:24 contribute 24360:24 contributes 24356:25 contributing 24355:25 contribution 24362:12 contributions 24362:13 control 24349:25 24363:19 24403:10 conundrum 24352:22 convenience 24449:21 conversation 24296:12 24301:13 24406:5 conveyed 24411:19 copies 24432:1 cord 24365:12 cordon 24405:11 24407:12,23,25 corpse 24439:7 corrected 24348:22 correction 24448:16 24449:8 correctly 24335:23 24356:14 24365:4 24378:15,22 24439:15 correctness 24437:7 corroboration 24444:25 24446:5 couldn't 24302:16 24428:15,19 council 24398:4 counsel 24337:24 24411:1,21 24413:22 24449:22 count 24436:6 counting 24360:3 country 24397:5 couple 24317:15 course 24299:22 24306:10,15 24316:15 24317:6,18 24324:2 24348:12 24353:9 24366:24 24392:5 24407:15 24437:14,19 24445:15 24446:4 court 24364:3 covered 24363:20 24447:24 24448:6 cows 24409:9 co-editors 24428:24 create 24358:22,22 24360:25 creeps 24358:1 crime 24423:3</p>	<p>crimes 24406:25 criminals 24308:25 crisply 24400:5 criticism 24407:17 criticisms 24407:15 cross 24315:3 24344:20 24351:12 24437:21 24438:12 24443:3 cross-examination 24298:3 24310:15 24344:18 24361:25 24374:15,23 24400:15 24426:21 24435:3 24438:2,12 24438:14 cross-examine 24296:7 24344:5 24429:22 cross-examiners 24449:16 cross-examining 24299:10 24300:8 24354:4 crowd 24347:7 24349:24 24350:25 24394:19 24403:10 24407:7 crowds 24392:24 24404:17 culmination 24399:23 culpable 24368:25 cut 24328:2 cuts 24387:5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">D</p> <p>daily 24355:20 24422:16 damaged 24348:9 danger 24318:3 24378:16 dangerous 24398:2 dark 24417:20 date 24326:13 24404:16 day 24298:22,24,25 24299:3,5,25 24301:13,16,22 24302:12 24303:12 24304:24 24305:9 24311:7,11,11,17 24313:10 24314:15 24320:23 24321:8 24322:18 24327:13 24327:21 24329:12 24333:4 24337:25 24342:20 24343:1 24347:13 24352:2 24354:11 24367:14 24375:2 24382:1 24387:13 24410:6 24412:12,12 24414:17 24419:16 24423:16,17 24426:23 24430:18 24430:18 24431:15 24432:6,6,10,11 24435:2 24448:5</p>	<p>days 24404:16 24406:16 24412:24 day-to-day 24336:21 dead 24372:19 24379:1 24416:23 24436:2 24439:8 deal 24298:8 24302:25 24309:6,20 24355:1 24360:8 24363:18 24365:9 24382:23 24383:1 24392:12,14 24392:17 24393:13 24393:19 24399:24 24400:2,5 24412:13 24425:14 24426:2 24438:17 24445:13 24447:24 dealing 24325:9 24326:14 24374:15 24380:4,15 24383:1 24387:16 24391:1 24393:4 24396:23 24399:19 24404:17 24425:18 deals 24429:22 dealt 24298:21 24320:15 24354:2,5 24354:10 24357:23 24361:22 24364:17 24364:17 24381:3 24394:2 24421:23 24431:19 24444:18 death 24316:24 24350:8 24355:6,9,25 24356:6 24358:5 24359:2 24361:8 24365:24,25 24366:5 24380:3,6,11 24402:3 24415:8 deaths 24296:17 24297:1 24318:15 24320:7,15 24321:13 24321:14,19,21 24322:12 24323:8,21 24323:24 24324:2 24343:10 24348:18 24349:18 24350:9 24368:25 24369:1 24375:19 24379:15 24379:20 24380:22 24381:2,6,9 debate 24322:18 24363:13 24375:2,22 24390:17 24393:12 24404:12 deceased 24363:15 24442:10 24444:25 decide 24303:7 24330:17 24337:25 decided 24313:1 24316:11 24343:5,16 24345:18 24346:14 24350:20 deciding 24364:4 24421:20 decision 24319:11</p>	<p>24323:23 24326:19 24327:11,14,15,16,16 24328:16,18 24329:2 24329:4,13 24330:21 24330:22 24331:4,7 24331:17 24332:8 24335:13 24336:5,7 24337:10 24338:23 24347:1 24350:6,11 24355:19 24359:20 24408:6 24409:24,24 24410:8,9,10,16 24411:2,4,5,8,13,18 24411:21 24412:6,7 24412:17 decisions 24346:23 24412:1 defence 24382:20 24387:11 defending 24322:5 defensive 24340:7 definitely 24318:20 24396:3,4 degree 24370:22 24408:19 delay 24364:21,24 24366:6 24368:3 24375:4 delays 24354:4 delegation 24397:10,11 deliberation 24316:6 deliberations 24329:13 delivery 24396:12 democracy 24396:10 24396:20 democratic 24384:3 24388:16 24396:5,17 24396:22 demonstrations 24394:3 24396:23 demonstrators 24393:14 department 24442:17 departure 24362:20 depends 24380:12 24395:19 deploy 24421:20 deployed 24313:9,10 24337:11 24338:6,7 24342:22 24343:2 24345:1,2,19 24346:25 24350:18 24375:22 24381:10 24402:5,16,17 24414:16,21 deploying 24422:1 deployment 24312:3 24313:3 24319:12 24328:17 24331:5 24335:22 24342:11 24347:1 24350:7,13 24366:7 24375:4 24414:20,23 24422:3 deployments 24333:16 Deputy 24308:17 24334:25</p>	<p>describe 24296:20 24342:22 described 24297:1 24303:5 24343:18 24369:9 24445:16 24447:8 describes 24342:11 description 24299:19 designated 24383:24 24384:17,20,21 24385:2 designation 24385:2 desire 24381:4 detail 24297:3 24339:20 detailed 24333:14 details 24312:23 24340:3,14,18 24412:15 24420:8 detectives 24320:12 24335:9 24382:19 determinable 24447:16 determine 24303:8 determined 24409:19 devices 24389:11 Dewald 24420:14 dialogue 24338:24 diary 24353:11 didn't 24300:15 24301:3 24302:24 24326:2,2 24332:24 24393:25 24409:12 24410:2 24438:10 die 24355:6 24377:19 24379:16 24381:3 died 24316:21 24318:13 24322:7 24325:3,24 24335:17 24349:17,17 24369:11 24377:19 24377:21 24378:7 24379:15 24380:25 24381:1 24432:20 24436:9 24440:4,13 difference 24380:8 24406:1 24409:16 24439:11,13 different 24313:15 24320:8 24381:21 24386:8 24395:3,19 24395:20 24396:2,2,3 24397:23 24398:21 24398:23 24404:3,21 24405:7 24406:15 24408:14 24432:5,6 24435:23 24438:4 24445:17 differently 24350:9 24360:3 difficult 24357:15 24360:8 24395:5 dignified 24378:25 24379:15 24381:2,10 dignity 24377:20 direct 24313:16 24353:12 24430:16</p>
---	--	--	---	--

<p>directed 24440:22 direction 24352:19 24428:17 24447:15 directions 24435:24 directly 24324:8 24336:24 24392:25 24404:4 24423:11 Director 24323:23 directory 24309:10 disagree 24332:24 24405:24 24409:22 disagreed 24410:20 disagreement 24331:25 disallow 24368:7 disappeared 24398:16 disapprove 24332:24 disarm 24406:6,8 disarming 24409:20 disaster 24418:5 24423:7 disastrous 24412:8 discovered 24348:15 24421:25 discussed 24320:6 24326:21 24360:15 24410:18 discussing 24345:25 discussion 24318:12,16 24318:18,25 24320:18 24327:20 24328:15 24330:5 24332:12 24335:25 24345:21 24411:7 24412:16 24422:3 discussions 24321:21 24412:1 disinclined 24359:5 dispensation 24396:22 24397:23 24398:14 24398:20 24399:6 dispersal 24409:20 dispute 24404:10 disputed 24373:5 disputing 24404:7 dissatisfied 24414:1 distance 24370:7 distinction 24380:7,13 distress 24369:15,18 24416:1 24426:9 disturbance 24314:24 24447:11 disturbances 24354:25 disturbing 24315:2 24354:23 divided 24339:21 Doc 24378:6 docket 24323:21 dockets 24317:15,16,17 24321:24,24 doctor 24366:5,13 24378:5 24380:23 24398:5,7 doctorate 24398:9 document 24296:17,22 24297:1 24356:19 24361:24 24441:19</p>	<p>documentation 24397:19 doesn't 24298:19 24306:10 24381:20 24387:7 24407:20 24430:3 24431:22,25 24438:11 dogs 24345:13 doing 24325:14 24356:10 24358:15 24412:10 24418:15 don't 24297:2,21 24305:23 24322:16 24324:1,6 24326:8,10 24326:17 24329:10 24330:1 24336:4 24340:18 24341:4,15 24345:21 24348:18 24353:10 24354:19 24354:25 24359:13 24361:15 24362:3,8 24362:11,21 24363:8 24363:11,20 24364:2 24376:4,15,19 24377:10,21 24378:12 24379:16 24379:18 24384:10 24384:13 24385:9,14 24394:21 24402:20 24402:23 24404:6 24405:3 24407:7 24408:20 24422:6 24423:22 24425:8 24426:8 24429:8,14 24432:1 24435:1 24438:2,3,19 24442:5 don'ts 24357:14 dos 24357:13 dots 24428:21 doubt 24317:4 24321:16 Dr 24364:22 24375:20 24377:24 24379:6 24441:9,18,19 24442:10 drag 24373:18 dragging 24372:20 drastic 24314:1 24316:11 24335:3 24349:6 24384:9 drastically 24317:6 24337:11 24421:20 24424:18 draw 24361:19 24379:13 24405:4 24418:20 24420:23 dressed 24419:24 drinking 24425:7 DR577 24445:19,21 due 24446:4 duplication 24341:8,17 Durban 24384:20 24402:5 duties 24326:4 duty 24309:19 24310:5 24310:7,16 24351:8</p>	<p>24351:16,16,17,17,18 24352:1,9,9,15 24353:7,15 24363:16 24363:18 24364:4 24367:24 24390:11 24390:16,22 24422:21,22 dying 24373:17 24374:1</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <p>E 24435:10 earlier 24300:22 24341:7,10 24354:17 24365:15,21 24418:13 early 24364:21 earphones 24314:23 24315:1,8 easier 24404:22 easily 24395:12 24441:20 East 24419:23 education 24362:25 EEE16 24369:3 effect 24350:2 24370:4 effected 24370:7 effective 24405:1 24407:13 effectively 24326:24 either 24314:22,25 24332:7 24360:11 24383:25 24390:16 24419:15 elapsed 24417:2 election 24384:4,7 elections 24388:16 elements 24350:3 Elias 24379:11 emergencies 24309:11 24445:7 emergency 24345:22 24367:13 24382:19 emotional 24369:15,18 24416:1 24426:9 emphasis 24319:14 employed 24424:21 employees 24338:22 24419:15,18,21 empowered 24358:14 enable 24357:7 encourage 24396:24 endeavouring 24372:5 endowed 24397:6 ENews 24370:2 engage 24339:6 engaged 24323:7 24397:9 Engelbrecht 24316:10 24407:18 24413:21 24414:8 24415:1 enjoys 24387:9 enquire 24337:4 enquiries 24361:20 24419:17 24421:11 enquiry 24352:17</p>	<p>24391:9 24420:21 ensure 24345:14 24384:5,25 24392:21 24405:21 entailed 24412:17 enter 24393:12 entire 24326:7 entirely 24303:25 24304:8 24316:18 24356:15 24359:12 entitled 24379:1 entrance 24444:19 24446:8 environment 24358:22 24361:1 24404:22,25 24405:2 24412:11 equally 24388:6 equation 24319:16 equipment 24376:15 24376:17,19,20,22 24377:9 24407:3 24409:11,13 equipped 24366:21 erred 24354:20 escalate 24313:2 24319:11 24326:19 24327:11,15 24335:22 24337:10 24347:1 24350:7,11 escalated 24328:17 24332:9 24338:18 24350:15 24424:17 escalation 24311:7 24314:1 24316:11 24319:17,22 24320:3 24329:17 24331:22 24332:5 24334:11 24335:3 24338:4 24342:13 24343:5,17 24343:17 24349:6 24350:17 24424:15 escalations 24338:11 escort 24423:9,12 escorted 24418:4 24419:11 24423:6 24424:21 escorting 24322:10 24421:14,16 especially 24313:19 24374:25 24382:25 24396:11 24408:23 24412:10,19 essence 24356:14 establish 24303:24 24318:11 24349:12 24353:5 24361:10,14 established 24313:9 24338:21 24349:15 establishing 24415:8 estimate 24371:18 24394:22 et 24356:23 24357:10 etcetera 24313:19 24388:22 24391:20 24392:23 24395:2,21 24405:5,21 24406:22</p>	<p>24412:23 evening 24316:4 24343:8,25 24348:5 event 24320:1 24321:15,15 24391:8 24395:25 24396:8 events 24299:20,23 24311:2,3 eventually 24321:24 24330:10 24380:25 everybody 24328:20 24354:18,20 24441:6 everybody's 24426:5 evidence 24298:18,21 24301:6,9 24304:7,7 24304:21 24308:9 24311:6 24322:15 24323:22 24329:15 24331:17 24339:25 24349:10,14 24353:11 24354:11 24359:2 24362:6,14 24363:21 24368:12 24368:12,14 24370:21 24371:1 24387:13 24394:5 24403:23 24404:13 24410:20 24411:10 24420:7 24427:5 24428:13 24430:16 24437:15 24443:23 24444:2 24445:9,17 24446:4,12 evidence-in-chief 24300:9 24429:3,7 evidential 24437:16 evidentiary 24437:5 exact 24371:18 exactly 24329:23 24346:17 24360:5 24376:20 24377:3 24379:2 24406:15 24407:20 24424:5,25 24428:3 24445:5 examination 24315:4 24437:22 24438:13 24439:11 24443:4 examine 24344:21 24351:13 example 24366:23 24376:7 24389:9 24397:8,9 exception 24334:2 24405:4 excerpt 24427:7,10 exchange 24394:24 exclude 24320:6,17 24324:23 24352:12 24438:3 excluded 24321:21,25 executed 24409:25 24410:2 24412:18 execution 24412:8 exercise 24398:1,2 24399:7 exercising 24399:16</p>
---	--	---	---	--

<p>exhausted 24344:4 exhibit 24296:18,25 24298:7 24339:19 24342:19 24364:18 24369:3 24400:18,24 24427:2,2,20 24428:5 24436:19,21 24437:5 24440:2,3,6,17 24441:14 24443:6,8,9 24443:25 24445:16 24445:21 24446:16 24447:24 24448:6 exhibits 24433:9,10 24440:1,14 exist 24325:3,5 24397:4 existed 24398:15,20 existence 24397:4 24402:20 exists 24318:24 exit 24444:20 24446:8 exited 24446:10 expect 24325:25 24360:25 24396:15 24399:16 24400:5 expectation 24320:12 24358:17 24398:22 24399:6 expected 24309:9 24357:18 24358:19 24396:4 experience 24369:14 24382:2 24385:12 24390:9 24392:12 24395:24 24398:22 experienced 24396:5 24397:3 24399:9 experiences 24357:25 expert 24367:7 24427:5 24427:7 expertise 24362:10 24366:21 24367:5 24375:8 24376:5,15 24376:19 24377:16 expired 24369:20 explain 24313:2 24359:18,23 24438:22 explained 24353:4 24397:15 24410:9 24429:7 explains 24407:20 explanation 24321:18 explore 24298:20 exploring 24354:14 24399:1 explosives 24345:12 exposed 24358:8 24359:5 24426:8 express 24363:22 24366:22 expressed 24335:20 24366:13 expresses 24380:2 extend 24357:22 24402:25 extended 24334:13</p>	<p>extensive 24312:23 extensively 24311:3 extent 24360:10 24368:1 externally 24405:19 extra 24328:6 24330:20 24331:5 24334:19,22 24346:2 24370:23 24371:1 extract 24300:18 extreme 24369:14 E-L-I-M-A-N-G-E-L... 24434:5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <hr/> <p>fabric 24447:11 face 24355:18 24357:4 faced 24355:18 faceless 24338:19 faces 24372:22 24373:18 facet 24404:4 facie 24362:8 facilitate 24316:13 24338:24 24405:22 facilitated 24334:12 24342:14 facilitates 24334:6 facilitating 24323:1 facility 24357:4 24365:21 facing 24355:21 24356:12 fact 24299:24 24307:10 24312:12 24318:2,4 24318:25 24319:14 24319:22,24 24320:10 24325:22 24337:3 24342:2 24347:9 24349:16 24356:6 24372:12 24380:20 24383:17 24389:24 24408:6,11 24410:21 24411:17 24412:24 24414:9 24422:12 24440:12 24445:3,10 factions 24391:11 24396:21 factopms 24399:1 factor 24318:6 factors 24360:10,19 facts 24376:6 factual 24410:23 failed 24386:19,19 fair 24370:22 24433:6 fairly 24308:19 fallen 24385:2 familiar 24298:10,12 24308:11,14,20 24402:11,15 families 24297:15 far 24318:12 24325:14 24337:17,18 24340:20,24 24349:1 24408:16 24409:13</p>	<p>24411:18 24427:19 24449:15 fashion 24411:4 fatalities 24323:6,9 24325:2 24375:5 24388:25 24389:3,4,5 24389:5,7,19,20,21 24389:22 24391:9,21 24391:25 24409:14 fatality 24349:2 fear 24364:12 24368:15 24374:2 24387:4 feared 24423:8 feature 24317:5 featured 24301:13 FEBRUARY 24296:1 feel 24358:14 24432:23 feeling 24432:23 fell 24373:12 felt 24312:3 24313:7 field 24311:4 24341:14 24359:14 24379:16 24381:3 24384:11 fields 24362:10 fifth 24360:2 24444:14 fight 24323:6,10 fighters 24345:22 fighting 24387:10 24389:3,15 24435:19 figures 24314:5 file 24440:23 final 24332:8 finalising 24397:21 finally 24340:22 find 24296:20 24305:8 24312:25 24322:20 24337:20,24 24338:3 24352:1 24356:2,4 24362:22 24363:3 24367:24 24377:25 24414:23 24419:25 24420:8 24440:23 24441:3,20 finding 24353:15 findings 24439:17 fine 24416:21 finer 24412:15 finger 24443:20 24445:12 fingertips 24371:15 finished 24374:13 24426:7 fire 24345:22 24407:5 firearm 24419:2 firearms 24313:19,20 24319:15,24 24320:13,14 24339:3 24357:17 24388:21 24393:23 24394:5,17 24394:20,25 24395:4 24395:8,18,22 24401:14 24408:17 24409:2 24417:22 24435:18 fired 24369:10 24391:20,22</p>	<p>first 24299:7 24303:21 24313:5 24316:5 24338:16,18 24344:4 24349:1 24352:18 24358:20 24359:12 24363:12,17 24370:4 24372:7,16 24374:1 24376:23,25 24377:2 24377:11 24388:15 24431:24 24433:12 24433:15 24435:5 24442:2,10 24444:18 24448:21 firstly 24312:9,15 24313:4,16 24338:8 24356:2 24360:19 24383:23 24406:19 five 24318:13 24321:14 flow 24390:2 focussed 24324:8 follow 24414:14,15 24415:5 24438:8 following 24312:14 24333:4 24339:18 24357:12 24370:6 24378:6 24406:19 24408:8 24428:16 24438:25 follows 24388:19 footage 24349:18 force 24320:10 24335:8 24344:25 24345:8 24382:20 forces 24311:7 24313:3 24319:12,22 24320:3 24323:7,11 24326:19 24328:17 24329:17 24331:22 24332:6,9 24335:3,4,23 24337:11 24342:13 24342:21 24345:2 24346:24 24347:2 24350:7,11 24373:13 24382:16 24383:15 24421:20,21 foresee 24363:13 forgive 24362:7 24377:6 forgiveness 24431:9 form 24339:2 forming 24366:18 formulated 24360:5 forth 24343:9 forthcoming 24370:21 fortunately 24385:4 Forum 24410:19,24 forward 24335:11 24339:13 24340:13 24340:20 24341:13 24422:1,8 found 24439:18 four 24359:11 24427:17,19,20 24440:25 24447:22 24447:23 fourth 24428:5 24447:9</p>	<p>frame 24322:21 24323:5 framed 24326:5 24356:7 24390:14 framework 24396:2 24397:5 free 24353:8 frequent 24357:2 frequently 24356:24 24357:8 Friday 24314:2 24350:13 friend 24391:7 24423:16 24427:6 24438:20 friendly 24393:1 front 24418:21 24436:2 24436:10 24440:11 full-time 24402:6 functions 24352:15 further 24306:15 24315:10 24350:15 24352:2 24356:18 24366:25 24367:18 24371:25 24372:2 24379:23 24380:21 24381:7 24411:18 24444:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <hr/> <p>Gablela 24443:13 Gadlela 24440:8 24442:10 Gaffley 24340:9 gain 24381:20 GANASEN 24296:4 24374:21 24400:12 24426:19 gas 24407:6 gather 24387:21 24405:19 24443:4 gathered 24339:15 gathering 24397:16 gatherings 24382:3 24383:25 24391:3 24392:18 24393:7 Gauteng 24316:3,8 24328:12 24330:25 24332:16 24333:9 24334:3 24342:9 24346:9 24403:17 generalising 24395:17 generally 24354:13 24357:5 24374:3 24390:2 24391:1 24395:11 generals 24322:21 General's 24420:23 generate 24361:1 generates 24357:5 gentleman 24418:16,17 24419:21 24420:11 24420:12,14,17 24429:3 gentlemen 24297:21 24417:17,20,22</p>
--	---	---	--	--

<p>24420:10 24421:4 genuine 24348:25 geographical 24407:11 getting 24334:22 24354:4 24364:21 24366:24 24371:2 give 24296:19 24297:4 24297:7,14 24300:23 24301:20 24302:17 24310:23 24330:4 24334:4 24342:19 24352:19 24353:13 24359:17 24362:15 24363:16,21 24364:7 24366:16,16 24369:4 24369:16 24371:18 24371:19 24375:12 24389:19 24394:22 24406:21 24415:18 24420:4,8 24425:15 24426:6 24428:13,15 24440:5,14,15,15 24441:4,11,22 24444:2 given 24296:15 24301:2 24302:16 24303:3,8 24304:7 24310:4 24316:5 24335:21 24351:12 24353:7 24377:18 24384:7 24387:2 24399:20 24411:10 24412:16,21 24413:4 24416:12,17 24432:8 24434:14 24436:19 24436:21 24437:4 24441:2,12 24442:7 gives 24339:19 24400:18 giving 24359:12 24365:6 24372:7 24415:15 24444:19 gleaned 24404:1 Glebelands 24400:19 24401:8 24402:12,21 24402:23 24403:22 24408:15 24409:17 gloves 24420:12,13 go 24297:18 24299:25 24310:15 24311:2 24320:13 24340:17 24354:11 24355:23 24364:19 24369:3 24379:4 24383:18 24386:25 24387:13 24389:14 24406:8 24412:19 24415:3 24420:3,5 24426:7,25 24427:15,16,23 24428:3 24436:7 goes 24312:18 24354:12 24356:1 24370:5 24372:2 24383:1 24412:13 going 24296:6 24297:3 24297:8 24298:20</p>	<p>24299:6,19 24321:11 24326:4,15 24332:21 24335:22 24336:6 24338:5 24346:11 24352:13 24369:7 24399:21 24412:17 24415:21,25 24425:6 24425:14,20,21 24434:22 24441:3 24444:11 24449:24 good 24297:15,19 24298:4,5 24355:9 24374:14 24381:19 24407:18 24431:24 24431:25 24440:20 24445:2 grade 24363:12 gradual 24342:4 grazing 24447:15 grenades 24389:11 ground 24355:7,19 grounds 24404:9 group 24324:23 24338:25 24340:2 24389:5,6,7,9,22,22 24393:6 grouping 24324:24 groupings 24383:21 24395:8 groups 24338:11 24389:3,7,9,14 24395:1,3 growing 24349:8 guaranteed 24398:3 guarding 24422:16 guards 24348:3 24349:19 24418:4 24421:16 24422:6,15 24422:20,20 24423:13 24425:4 guess 24405:14 guilty 24324:12 24439:13 gun 24373:13 gunfire 24394:24 guns 24407:5 24429:5 gunshot 24443:19 24444:3,13,15,17,21 24444:22 24447:9 guy 24436:8 G-A-B-L-E-L-A 24443:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <hr/> <p>H 24379:5 Half 24369:19 hand 24296:22 24320:9 24362:24 24373:8 24389:11 24418:8,23 24418:23,23 24420:13 24421:5 24445:11 24446:1,10 24446:12,13 24447:4 24447:4 handed 24321:24 24324:4 24326:16</p>	<p>handguns 24395:21 handle 24332:21 24357:25 handled 24317:16,17 24317:22 24396:10 24409:16,17 hands 24377:21 24420:15 24428:23 24428:25 24429:2,16 24430:11 24431:9 24432:21,21 24433:1 24435:18 24436:1,2,9 24439:21,22 hang 24435:8 happen 24324:19 24328:11 24381:22 24399:3,5 24410:5 24438:6 happened 24325:19 24349:11 24371:11 24374:25 24392:7 24393:10 24404:14 24406:8 24414:5 24431:8 happening 24323:10 24336:22 happens 24356:1 24357:1,8 happy 24302:17 24348:21 harm 24398:3 hat 24417:6,7 24418:14 24418:18 24419:22 24420:17 haven't 24297:15 24301:25 24377:11 24407:18 24432:9 head 24314:3 24331:20 24361:17 24374:14 headed 24296:17 hear 24314:25,25 24318:17 24360:5 24373:21 24437:10 24439:24 heard 24300:9,10 24303:18 24313:21 24402:15,20,23 24403:5,5 24407:18 24437:12,19 24445:6 hearing 24315:2 heart 24363:1,3,4 held 24339:10 24351:13 24368:24 24383:25 24384:5 24429:4 24446:12 help 24330:20 24367:3 24399:25 24431:22 helpful 24363:25 24420:7 Henry 24297:6 24445:12 24448:13 he'd 24382:15 he'll 24429:16 he's 24332:17 24359:20 24362:9 24375:8 24377:25 24378:1,5</p>	<p>24429:13 24430:7 he'll 24371:21 hid 24435:15 24436:11 hiding 24428:20,21,22 24431:7 hierarchy 24411:4 high 24314:22 24315:1 24353:21 24392:11 higher 24444:15 hindsight 24368:2,5,6 Hippocratic 24357:16 hips 24420:15 hit 24429:5 hold 24309:2,8,25 24334:16 24384:3 holding 24335:11 24339:13 24340:13 24340:20 24341:13 24418:7 24422:1,8 home 24306:14 24390:12,22 24391:1 24409:9 homemade 24395:22 homes 24409:21 hope 24315:4,9 24339:17 24362:14 24384:13 24400:6 24442:21 hoped 24415:20 hopes 24370:22 24412:9 horizontal 24447:13 horrible 24349:17 hospital 24348:24 24365:19 24366:3 24367:2 24380:13 hostel 24400:19 24401:8,18,20,24 24402:2,3,6,12,15 24403:3,13,22 24404:21 24405:12 24405:13 24408:23 24409:17 hostels 24385:1,5 24402:18 24409:4 hostile 24392:24 hotels 24297:17 hour 24309:14 24370:11 24371:5 24410:19 hours 24309:11,15 housed 24401:18,21 housekeeping 24296:15 houses 24428:19 huge 24336:5 24390:1 24404:17 human 24377:17 hybrid 24338:13</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <hr/> <p>idea 24307:19,22 24345:8 24374:14 24376:11 24379:3 24415:4 idem 24430:8 identical 24406:18</p>	<p>24407:10,10 identifiable 24447:10 identified 24345:11 24346:12 24427:15 identities 24419:19 identity 24338:21 24428:12 IFP 24401:2,18 24403:2 ignore 24354:17 ignored 24364:13 illegal 24393:5,5 imagine 24304:13 24310:15 24328:15 24361:21 IMG 24445:14 24446:7 immediate 24340:8,10 immediately 24375:18 24375:23 24378:7 24387:6 24388:19 24398:16 impetus 24350:10,17 implement 24411:5 implementation 24411:9 implemented 24343:18 implicated 24355:8 implications 24360:21 implied 24331:24 24332:3 important 24310:16 24362:1,8 24368:1 24378:22 24383:18 impression 24362:11 improve 24315:9 inaudible 24301:19 24386:3 24423:19 24427:24 24428:2 24440:8,9 incident 24303:18 24313:13 24319:4 24323:14 24325:3 24338:20 24348:12 24348:14 24349:5 24352:13,19 24395:2 24397:10 24409:25 24424:15 incidents 24313:7 24329:20 24336:22 24347:15 24349:7 24350:17,23 24385:15,17,21 24386:6,8 24392:21 24395:16 incinerated 24349:18 incision 24366:1 inclined 24396:24 include 24380:16 included 24319:15 24367:14 24409:6 includes 24440:13 including 24426:12 24349:12 24353:21 24393:11 24394:8 24405:19 24441:6 incorrectly 24335:23</p>
--	---	--	---	---

<p>increased 24318:3,4 24333:16</p> <p>index 24441:12 24442:8,14,18 24443:20 24445:12</p> <p>Indian 24429:4</p> <p>indicate 24309:19 24332:23 24356:18 24364:16 24370:20 24370:22 24394:17 24395:5 24407:9</p> <p>indicated 24307:18 24309:11 24312:10 24312:16,17 24313:5 24313:20,22 24318:4 24320:5 24321:20 24324:21 24325:7,11 24325:22 24326:20 24327:1 24329:19 24331:18 24332:13 24332:17 24338:11 24342:19 24346:25 24347:6,15 24349:4,7 24350:24 24352:8,25 24353:22 24357:14 24358:16 24368:9 24370:15 24379:23 24390:11 24397:2,12 24397:12 24402:16 24402:22 24404:1 24406:6 24407:5 24408:22,24 24411:6 24416:22 24422:23 24423:5 24424:12 24425:4 24428:11,14 24438:3</p> <p>indicates 24429:17</p> <p>indicating 24346:4,18 24395:4 24449:24</p> <p>indication 24322:9 24332:14 24334:5 24335:2 24336:20 24337:18 24379:22 24412:21 24414:3,16</p> <p>individual 24355:17 24374:6</p> <p>individuals 24360:17 24406:24</p> <p>infer 24444:3 24446:4</p> <p>inferences 24332:7</p> <p>inferred 24332:6</p> <p>inflicted 24380:11 24389:5 24445:11</p> <p>inflicting 24323:8</p> <p>influenced 24319:24</p> <p>inform 24336:22</p> <p>informal 24406:13</p> <p>information 24309:4 24310:21,22 24325:13,17 24340:4 24342:17 24351:13 24352:14 24353:13 24405:12,16,18,19,22 24406:21 24407:15 24407:17,21,25 24408:5,10 24409:5</p>	<p>24413:17,22 24420:25 24421:4,5 24442:22</p> <p>information-specific 24405:9</p> <p>informed 24326:3 24327:18 24347:2,9 24350:10 24369:6</p> <p>infrastructure 24345:14</p> <p>initially 24321:23 24424:12</p> <p>initiated 24322:18</p> <p>injured 24319:3 24348:23 24357:2 24358:18 24360:17 24372:20 24373:17 24374:1 24375:18 24389:12 24392:3 24424:16</p> <p>injuries 24323:8 24365:20 24375:25 24379:21 24380:10 24439:1,6,7,9,19 24447:4</p> <p>injury 24322:13 24365:11,12,14 24391:20 24398:2 24439:9 24445:25</p> <p>input 24327:21 24332:16</p> <p>insignificant 24386:3</p> <p>insisted 24411:14</p> <p>insofar 24311:5 24325:1 24330:19 24331:5,8,14,15 24363:23 24386:14 24409:10</p> <p>installations 24347:17 24422:19</p> <p>instance 24313:5 24338:6 24342:22 24361:14 24362:23 24375:23 24379:2 24386:18 24387:13 24394:19 24401:3 24405:25</p> <p>instances 24386:22 24389:2,13 24392:18 24393:4 24395:16 24403:2</p> <p>instruction 24411:8 24412:14,25 24413:1</p> <p>insufficient 24313:8 24329:23</p> <p>intelligence 24332:18 24346:8 24382:19 24405:20,20,22 24406:21 24407:17 24407:21,22 24409:1 24413:23 24414:7</p> <p>intending 24344:20</p> <p>intentioned 24374:3,8</p> <p>inter 24328:17</p> <p>interest 24384:18</p> <p>interested 24426:6</p>	<p>interesting 24296:16</p> <p>interests 24367:25</p> <p>interface 24336:15</p> <p>interjection 24438:20</p> <p>interpretation 24315:6 24315:7</p> <p>interpreter 24339:24</p> <p>interrupt 24314:18 24330:2 24334:9 24438:12</p> <p>interrupted 24424:8</p> <p>interrupting 24339:17 24420:6</p> <p>intersections 24422:19</p> <p>intervene 24330:5 24357:1 24358:16 24359:7 24389:2</p> <p>intervention 24304:9 24335:8 24340:12 24345:5 24350:3 24358:19 24374:3</p> <p>interventions 24326:6 24391:23</p> <p>interviewer 24428:23</p> <p>inter-political 24383:20</p> <p>intolerance 24397:2</p> <p>introduced 24299:24 24390:17 24427:5</p> <p>introduces 24427:1,2</p> <p>invariably 24355:14 24382:24</p> <p>investigate 24324:5</p> <p>investigated 24317:12 24317:12 24323:22 24414:5</p> <p>investigating 24326:11 24326:13</p> <p>investigation 24313:18 24316:14 24317:14 24317:20 24320:11 24321:3,23,25 24323:2 24324:11 24325:12,14,16 24326:11 24345:7 24346:10</p> <p>investigations 24313:23 24326:6,14 24326:16 24345:9</p> <p>investigative 24346:8</p> <p>inviting 24413:8</p> <p>involve 24387:22 24388:11</p> <p>involved 24303:4 24333:7 24339:20 24341:18 24385:13 24385:18 24387:15 24396:8 24404:4 24408:17,18 24422:24 24442:16</p> <p>involvement 24307:23 24335:16 24337:18 24382:20 24396:13 24408:4</p> <p>involving 24315:17 24349:5 24365:2</p>	<p>IPD 24433:6</p> <p>IPID 24317:13,17 24318:17 24321:22 24324:4,9,13 24325:13 24433:8,15 24433:16 24434:2,3</p> <p>isn't 24331:21 24336:11 24343:25 24378:1,2 24405:14 24437:15</p> <p>issue 24319:14 24352:20 24355:21 24356:23 24357:16 24358:20 24381:5 24400:6 24421:23</p> <p>issues 24312:5 24324:8 24336:17 24354:14 24355:7,22 24356:23 24357:10,10 24358:17 24382:23 24388:15 24396:11 24404:4 24405:4</p> <p>issuing 24297:20</p> <p>item 24440:15 24441:17,20 24442:7</p> <p>it's 24296:21 24297:19 24298:25 24299:22 24302:5 24303:22 24305:4 24325:2 24331:23 24332:2,7 24334:1 24337:23,25 24354:11,14,22,22 24360:7 24361:22 24365:7 24378:22 24379:5 24381:15,21 24382:6 24383:18 24384:7 24387:3 24389:15 24392:4,13 24392:19,23 24400:24 24401:21 24405:7,10,14,25 24408:18 24409:23 24423:22 24425:25 24426:12,23,24 24427:6,7,22 24429:25 24431:24 24431:25 24433:7 24434:13,14,20 24435:10,11,12 24439:13 24440:2,12 24442:4</p> <p>IV 24365:18</p> <p>I'd 24301:14,15 24302:10,11 24440:24</p> <p>I'll 24377:15 24391:8 24425:18 24434:4 24441:22</p> <p>I'm 24298:12,15,20 24299:19 24300:9 24303:7 24304:1 24321:11 24323:16 24323:20 24324:13 24325:1 24328:10 24332:11,22,24 24336:14,21</p>	<p>24375:10,12,12 24377:5,22 24380:14 24380:21 24381:8,11 24381:24 24389:12 24391:5,15,17 24392:9 24393:12,18 24394:21 24395:16 24395:17 24401:3 24402:12 24403:9 24406:19 24408:25 24409:6,10,15 24410:7 24422:9 24425:6 24429:21 24431:13 24433:11 24434:20 24436:16 24436:23 24437:1 24439:4,4,13,16 24440:1,7 24441:5</p> <p>I've 24297:16 24323:12 24324:25 24325:10 24329:18 24336:9 24337:6 24341:9 24342:5 24380:20 24381:25 24387:2 24392:2 24402:22 24425:3,7 24432:24 24436:21 24437:12 24438:3 24440:25</p> <p>I-P-I-D 24433:7</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">J</p> <p>ja 24299:9,12 24303:16 24304:20 24321:10 24329:8 24353:20 24372:25 24373:6 24383:19 24391:17 24403:8 24416:13 24425:18 24429:19</p> <p>Jackson 24379:12</p> <p>jeans 24417:20</p> <p>jersey 24373:10 24375:1 24447:11</p> <p>JJJ 24415:13</p> <p>JJJ108 24315:21</p> <p>JJJ200 24400:18,24</p> <p>JJJ27.9472 24418:11</p> <p>JJJ29 24415:14</p> <p>JJJ29.223 24415:9</p> <p>JJJ29.265 24417:16,16</p> <p>job 24334:21 24360:25 24377:9 24411:5</p> <p>JOC 24341:4,6,8,9</p> <p>JOCCOM 24341:17 24413:4</p> <p>Johannes 24297:5 24448:12</p> <p>Joint 24334:6</p> <p>judgment 24374:10</p> <p>July 24402:1,3</p> <p>junior 24355:17 24356:10 24358:14 24374:14</p> <p>juniors 24441:7</p> <p>justice 24367:25</p> <p>justified 24356:10</p>
--	---	---	---	--

<p>K</p> <p>keep 24326:2 24384:2 24391:11,13</p> <p>keeping 24326:1</p> <p>kept 24325:19 24408:4</p> <p>key 24326:22 24423:1</p> <p>khaki 24417:5,7 24418:13,14,18 24420:17</p> <p>khaki-hatted 24421:4</p> <p>Khawamare 24379:11</p> <p>kidney 24365:15</p> <p>kieries 24388:22</p> <p>kill 24385:12,14 24394:12</p> <p>killed 24303:20 24313:14 24316:16 24316:17,19 24317:1 24317:4,5 24318:5,18 24318:21,22 24319:1 24319:3,8,10,23 24320:1,2 24321:14 24321:17 24322:1,4,4 24325:5 24336:7 24347:10,17,24 24348:3,6,23,25 24385:20,22 24389:13 24390:11 24390:16,22 24392:3 24402:10 24415:22 24415:24 24424:16 24425:22 24429:11 24429:15,20 24430:4 24430:7</p> <p>killing 24408:20</p> <p>killings 24343:9</p> <p>kilometre 24339:14</p> <p>kind 24309:12,21 24334:7 24335:3,4 24336:4,12 24342:21 24344:25 24345:1 24355:1 24357:6 24361:24 24364:3 24378:25 24395:8,24 24401:12 24437:16 24437:18 24449:24</p> <p>kindly 24342:24</p> <p>kinds 24336:8 24346:24 24356:7 24396:20,23 24398:17 24401:3</p> <p>knew 24309:3 24362:25 24368:22 24419:4</p> <p>knowing 24302:21 24325:16 24364:9 24403:1</p> <p>knowledge 24376:10 24386:6,9 24396:13 24396:15 24402:23 24404:1</p> <p>known 24308:21 24339:2 24402:3</p> <p>knows 24308:12 24354:18 24441:23</p>	<p>koppie 24339:15 24430:1 24432:16</p> <p>KwaZulu 24384:19</p> <p>KwaZulu-Natal 24383:2,22 24403:15</p> <p>KZN 24400:19 24402:12</p> <p>K-H-E 24434:19</p> <p>K4 24348:6</p> <p>K9 24335:9 24340:19 24345:12</p> <p>K9s 24382:17</p> <hr/> <p>L</p> <p>L 24339:19 24342:19</p> <p>laboriously 24387:4</p> <p>laceration 24365:15 24446:1</p> <p>language 24332:7 24416:21</p> <p>laparotomy 24365:22 24365:25 24366:3</p> <p>large 24312:2 24392:18 24406:13 24424:19</p> <p>Largely 24345:20</p> <p>larger 24342:8 24388:3 24388:13 24393:21</p> <p>lateral 24443:19 24444:19</p> <p>launched 24408:10 24414:10</p> <p>law 24304:10 24361:23 24391:13,14</p> <p>layout 24407:11</p> <p>lead 24374:4</p> <p>leader 24432:8</p> <p>leaders 24384:13</p> <p>leadership 24308:7</p> <p>leading 24299:11,12,13 24404:16 24407:22 24431:4</p> <p>learned 24368:6 24391:7 24423:16 24427:6 24438:20</p> <p>Learning 24412:23</p> <p>learnt 24363:11,12</p> <p>leave 24305:13 24306:3 24306:19 24310:2 24351:12 24357:9 24369:17,19,21 24416:2 24426:9</p> <p>leaving 24333:9</p> <p>led 24298:19 24319:4 24349:10,14 24394:4 24394:24 24397:11 24427:6 24445:10</p> <p>Ledingoane 24365:1,1 24365:2,8</p> <p>left 24301:5 24344:7 24379:16 24381:2 24418:6,23,24 24445:12 24446:1,10 24447:10</p> <p>left-hand 24417:19 24443:20</p> <p>legal 24356:23</p>	<p>24357:10 24360:20 24360:23 24361:19 24363:13,16 24364:4</p> <p>Lehupa 24379:12</p> <p>Lendingoane 24364:25</p> <p>length 24354:5</p> <p>lessons 24412:23</p> <p>less-than-lethal 24404:25</p> <p>lethal 24409:13</p> <p>let's 24296:14 24361:3 24409:10 24426:25 24426:25 24427:23 24430:21 24442:12</p> <p>let's 24309:22 24311:2 24315:4 24374:16 24398:11,24 24420:5 24443:11 24447:3</p> <p>level 24303:2 24308:7 24310:3,6,8,17 24334:8 24355:19 24358:19 24365:13 24365:19 24396:7,15 24396:16 24397:9</p> <p>levels 24356:4 24399:7 24399:8</p> <p>Lewis 24305:1 24441:8 24441:16 24442:9</p> <p>liaise 24405:20</p> <p>liaises 24405:18</p> <p>Lieutenant 24339:23 24340:9,11</p> <p>Lieutenant-Colonel 24372:6</p> <p>life 24429:6</p> <p>life-threatening 24379:21</p> <p>light 24371:1 24391:5 24412:19 24436:17</p> <p>limited 24386:9 24396:14,14</p> <p>line 24298:23 24301:14 24302:5 24305:9,9 24310:15 24311:12 24320:25 24334:23 24348:15 24354:12 24354:13 24355:4,5 24359:19 24364:14 24365:18 24371:10 24382:3,3 24387:14 24388:9 24389:1,20 24390:19 24405:10 24423:17 24424:4,5 24426:24 24427:1,1 24430:25 24431:16 24432:13</p> <p>lines 24298:22 24299:25 24300:1,2,4 24303:13,14 24305:1 24311:12,20,21 24382:12,15 24383:14,19 24390:20 24424:3 24430:18,18 24431:1 24432:3,14</p> <p>liquid 24425:8</p>	<p>24426:15</p> <p>list 24309:14,19 24346:1 24351:16 24352:15 24379:19 24379:19,20,25</p> <p>listed 24341:9,12 24342:4 24343:14 24379:22</p> <p>lists 24341:19 24378:9 24441:13 24444:14</p> <p>literally 24359:2 24439:6</p> <p>little 24357:18 24361:23</p> <p>loaded 24322:24</p> <p>local 24308:16</p> <p>locate 24406:23</p> <p>Loest 24340:5</p> <p>logical 24303:22</p> <p>logistics 24345:14</p> <p>long 24297:2 24316:6 24332:20 24355:10 24359:1 24378:15 24380:12 24386:1 24435:2,17</p> <p>longer 24308:19 24349:24 24362:1 24403:15 24409:11</p> <p>Lonmin 24303:20,22 24303:23 24313:1,6 24313:21 24316:4 24338:22 24349:20 24370:21 24419:9,15 24419:16,18,19,21,24 24420:20 24421:21 24422:4,7,14,16,18 24422:20 24423:2 24424:22</p> <p>look 24299:6 24328:3 24333:2 24336:3 24350:12 24379:20 24390:19 24400:17 24431:22 24432:10 24440:23 24442:19 24443:11,16 24447:3</p> <p>looked 24304:24 24377:11 24401:2 24414:11 24431:22</p> <p>looking 24380:20 24419:14 24425:2 24427:16 24440:16 24441:8 24442:15 24443:23 24445:23 24449:15</p> <p>loose 24307:4</p> <p>loss 24432:23</p> <p>lot 24322:15 24346:8 24359:16 24373:12 24385:13,14,15,16 24388:21 24394:24 24425:7</p> <p>Louw 24420:14</p> <p>loved 24369:11,13 24415:24</p> <p>low 24365:12 24383:22 24384:11</p>	<p>LRC 24365:9</p> <p>lunch 24400:3,5</p> <hr/> <p>M</p> <p>M 24296:17 24297:1 24445:16 24448:9</p> <p>Magala 24434:17,18</p> <p>Mahala 24434:17</p> <p>maintain 24313:12 24391:14</p> <p>major 24296:3 24316:8 24334:24 24339:16 24343:11 24374:20 24398:15 24400:11 24426:18 24434:23 24440:17</p> <p>majority 24396:11 24401:8</p> <p>Major-General 24315:11 24344:15 24351:18 24362:9 24411:14 24443:2</p> <p>Makhala 24434:14,16 24434:20</p> <p>Makhubela 24340:7</p> <p>making 24329:14 24348:2 24371:22 24380:21 24389:6 24409:15 24422:8</p> <p>man 24373:10,11 24375:1,8 24418:6,13 24418:14,20</p> <p>manage 24326:24 24357:10 24365:18 24404:22</p> <p>management 24311:25 24312:19,24 24316:6 24347:7 24350:25 24352:18 24390:1 24407:8 24410:19,24 24418:5 24423:7</p> <p>manhandled 24379:16 24381:2</p> <p>manner 24303:6 24404:17 24409:18 24412:8</p> <p>manning 24422:18</p> <p>manpower 24301:3</p> <p>march 24391:13</p> <p>marchers 24393:14</p> <p>marches 24382:2 24384:3 24390:4 24391:22 24393:3,5 24394:3 24405:21</p> <p>Marikana 24299:21 24341:2 24392:7 24397:14 24404:24 24405:3 24408:24 24409:18</p> <p>mark 24316:20 24433:9,14</p> <p>marked 24298:7 24413:13</p> <p>Marks 24400:17 24403:1,24 24406:3 24408:16</p>
---	---	---	--	--

<p>Marks's 24407:2 Martin 24420:15 mass 24382:2 24389:11 24392:18 massacre 24369:9 material 24364:10 24370:19 24371:17 24437:6,16 matter 24306:16 24309:7,20,21 24324:3 24330:17 24335:20 24347:3,4 24350:20,21 24362:8 24362:13 24367:18 24368:14 24384:17 24410:18 24412:14 24414:2 24415:3 24437:23 matters 24345:25 24351:12 24363:9,19 24366:20 24367:3 24425:14 Mbombo 24300:11 24304:23 24305:13 24307:14 24308:10 24329:16 24337:1 24349:13 McIntosh 24339:24 24372:6 Mdizeni 24297:5 24448:9,9,10 Mdze 24354:6,8 24362:23 24364:17 24364:22 Mdze's 24358:25 mean 24302:20 24303:4 24322:24 24325:18 24335:16 24336:6 24351:21 24360:6 24366:23 24367:12 24368:9 24376:7 24384:17 24393:9 24409:8 24430:4 24432:1 24438:12 24439:6,6,9 24443:22 meaning 24439:8 meaningful 24362:12 24368:12 24375:13 means 24355:6 24363:1 24433:1 meant 24319:17 measure 24340:7 24377:20 measured 24380:10 measures 24403:10 media 24355:21 24404:2 medical 24345:22 24355:23 24357:3 24358:17 24366:9,13 24367:11 24368:23 24375:8,8 24377:16 24381:6,8 24424:13 24424:14,17,19,20 24444:10 24445:7,7</p>	<p>medics 24363:17,18 24418:5 24422:1 24423:7,8,11 24425:5 meet 24312:2 meeting 24303:22 24308:13 24313:21 24313:22 24315:17 24315:24 24318:12 24323:4,17 24324:15 24324:16 24326:21 24329:14 24331:22 24332:4,9 24334:3 24335:19,25 24337:2 24337:9,14,17 24343:4,8,10,25 24344:23,23 24345:18,25 24346:15,22 24350:7 24350:20 24397:17 24397:22 24410:25 24411:12,12,14,17,19 24413:5,8 24421:19 24421:22 meetings 24329:20 24383:24 24389:11 24397:12,13,14,15 member 24336:6 24355:18 24356:5,9 24356:10 24357:9 24361:6 24413:3 24417:9 members 24313:10,11 24314:6 24336:6 24340:3,6,8,10,25 24350:13,14 24356:11 24357:24 24359:1,4 24372:5 24374:7 24382:21 24393:8 24414:17,18 24417:24,25 24424:9 men 24303:19 mention 24300:15 24324:6 24325:15 24336:8 24337:14,17 24345:17 24416:5 24449:15 mentioned 24341:4,6 24341:11,12,15 24382:17 24393:13 24446:21 mentioning 24319:25 24320:7 mentions 24319:21 24379:12 Mere 24340:4 merely 24364:13 24381:20 message 24301:6 met 24308:12,14 24316:24 24321:18 24359:18 24397:11 metal 24419:22 Michael 24378:10 24379:6,9 microphone 24301:19 24386:2 24423:18</p>	<p>24427:24 24428:1 24440:7,8 middle 24417:5 24446:17,22 Midrand 24408:8 24411:22 midst 24373:13 millimetres 24447:14 24447:14 mind 24318:6 24322:21 24323:5 24325:19 24326:1,3 24351:5 24398:9 24420:6 24440:10 mine 24311:25 24312:19,24 24316:6 24316:15 24338:22 24354:14 miners 24319:5 24322:1,10 24339:6 24370:7 24397:8 24436:1 mineworker 24428:9 24428:15,25 24429:1 24443:24 mineworkers 24298:11 24317:3 24318:14,16 24319:8 24320:2 24321:17,18 24324:18 24326:5 24406:12 24409:21 24428:12 24435:15 24435:17,18 24439:20 minimise 24412:22 Minister 24302:22 24304:5 24335:21,25 24336:13,15,20,22 24337:3,13,15 24349:11 24353:21 Minister's 24301:4 24337:18 minute 24369:16,19,20 24400:8 24425:12 24441:21 minutes 24344:11 24370:25 24371:3 24411:11 24425:20 24447:23 missed 24311:18 missing 24379:25 mistake 24422:8 Mjuba 24433:19 24435:10,11 Mjubae 24435:9 Mjuba's 24435:7 MMM 24433:14 24443:25 MMM10 24364:18 24365:10 MMM3 24427:2,2,15 MMM46 24296:18 MMM47 24296:19,21 24296:25 24298:7 24445:16 24447:25 24448:6</p>	<p>MMM48 24433:13 24435:8 MMM48.1 24435:9 mobilisation 24311:7 24384:2 24388:14 mobilise 24313:2 24317:6 24384:4 mobilised 24424:19 modern 24396:17 Modiba 24340:11 Modisaotsile 24446:20 24446:23 Moeketsi 24434:12 Moeketsi's 24436:5 moment 24302:1 24333:10 24369:7,8 24370:24 24380:4,16 24415:19 24419:15 24424:2 Monday 24313:13 24339:4 24348:11,14 24348:16 24350:15 24350:15,16,24 24397:17,21 Monesa 24379:11 Monique 24400:17 monitoring 24340:2,22 24414:22 morning 24298:4,5 24303:19 24348:3,14 24408:8 24414:6 24448:1 24449:12,25 morphine 24376:7 mortem 24439:1,5,9,10 24440:4,25 24441:14 24442:15,19 mortems 24439:16,17 24440:18 Mountain 24427:8 mounted 24335:9 24413:24 move 24304:13 24319:20 24344:7 24351:2,3,4 24354:1 24359:24 24363:25 24368:8 24369:1 24389:9 24413:10,13 24417:3 24425:7 movements 24373:7 24384:3 moving 24325:1 24373:8 24381:24 24384:4 Mpembe 24316:9 24334:24 24341:11 24406:4 24407:24 24413:25 24414:9 24415:1 Mpofu 24431:3,4 24449:17 Mpofu's 24297:22,25 Mpofu's 24443:2 Mpumalanga 24333:9 Msenyeho 24379:4,5 24379:10 multidisciplinary</p>	<p>24382:16 24383:15 municipality 24397:20 24397:22 murder 24323:21 24325:1 murdered 24320:24 24323:18 24324:18 24326:4 murders 24313:24 24316:14 24317:20 24323:2,25 24326:13 24402:2 mustn't 24337:22 24364:5 mustn't 24368:15,15 Mvakalelwa 24434:5,8 Mvakalelwa's 24435:23 Mvuyisi 24297:6 24445:13 24448:14 Mzukisi 24364:25 M-A-K-H-A 24434:19 M-J-U 24433:24 M-J-U-B-A 24433:22 24435:12 M-O-E 24434:12 M-V 24434:6 M-V-A-K-A-L-E 24434:5 M-V-A-K-A-L-E-L-... 24434:7</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">N</p> <p>name 24300:15 24365:4,8 24420:1,14 24420:15 24442:9 24446:17,22,23 24448:21 24449:11 names 24378:15,22 24380:22 24398:25 24420:4,20 24428:15 narrated 24323:13 narrow 24415:7 Natal 24384:20 Nati 24449:2 national 24298:11 24313:22 24314:3 24315:17 24316:2,7 24322:21 24327:2,15 24327:18,24 24328:9 24328:19,21 24329:1 24331:7,14,16,21 24332:14,19 24334:6 24334:8 24335:8 24336:16,17 24340:11 24343:10 24344:24 24345:5 24350:3 24352:16 24382:20 NATJOC 24334:12,16 24342:14 24346:18 nature 24313:1 24406:1 near 24411:12 nearby 24428:19 nearest 24309:18,24</p>
--	---	--	---	--

<p>nearly 24302:4 necessarily 24375:11 24392:19,24 24393:1 24430:4 24437:25 necessary 24316:12 24397:24 24428:13 need 24297:22 24302:4 24303:9 24327:23 24328:4,6 24330:6 24333:24 24338:16 24345:5 24346:1 24352:12 24353:5 24360:25 24362:21 24364:12 24389:18 24397:25 24398:1,16 24424:14 24436:6 24447:12 needed 24330:19 24332:18 24342:21 24345:1 24349:8 needing 24399:8 needn't 24387:4 needs 24303:24 24343:2 24346:12 24355:13 24371:20 24375:7 negative 24375:12 negotiate 24338:17 negotiation 24338:25 24339:22 negotiators 24338:24 neither 24307:13 neutral 24340:5 never 24308:12,14 24352:5 24373:23,24 24440:10 new 24308:19 24396:5 24396:10 24433:10 Ngweyi 24379:9 night 24313:12 24407:24 24411:22 24411:22 24414:15 24414:18,23 nine 24326:13 24348:16 NIU 24333:8 24340:10 24340:19 24346:1 Nkomane 24351:18,20 24352:23 Nkosikhona 24433:17 Nkosinathi 24297:6 Nkosinathi 24448:12 Nkosiyabo 24448:17,18 24448:22 24449:3,4 nods 24374:14 non 24379:22 non-action 24359:3 non-preventable 24380:3,17 normal 24347:7 24350:25 24358:17 24414:19 normally 24334:6 24371:14 24383:25 24388:21 24389:8,23 24393:23 24394:5,17</p>	<p>24394:25 24419:22 24433:8 north 24316:8 24384:20 notes 24296:18 24411:16 noticed 24403:16 24428:18 notwithstanding 24325:20 November 24402:1 No-one 24410:4 NRC 24449:19 Nteneja 24373:10 Ntenetya 24375:1 24378:9 24379:14 Ntsebeza's 24328:16 24343:24 24351:12 NUM 24298:9,10 24308:1,3 24347:23 24408:9 number 24301:4,21 24306:13,14,14 24309:3,8,9,11 24310:4,5 24314:19 24318:18,22 24319:15 24330:10 24353:11,12 24362:10 24380:16 24389:2 24392:6,13 24415:21 24424:13 24424:16,20 24429:1 24440:5,10,12,16,22 24441:9,9,19,20 24442:7,10 numbers 24303:4 24326:24 24386:4 24387:15,22 24388:11 24393:15 24393:19,21 24408:17 24436:19 24436:22 24437:5 24440:16 24441:4,17 24441:18 24443:6 numerous 24390:21 24394:13 NUM's 24307:23 Nyala 24339:25 N-A 24433:20,21,22 N-K-O-S-I 24448:17 24448:22 N-K-O-S-I-K-H-O 24433:19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">O</p> <p>O 24296:17 24297:2 24416:6 24448:9,21 oath 24296:3,4 24344:15,16 24357:16 24374:20 24374:21 24400:11 24426:18,19 24443:3 objection 24359:24 24438:20 24444:8,10 objective 24322:15 24443:23 24446:12</p>	<p>obscured 24296:9 observation 24372:10 24393:22 observed 24431:5 obtain 24409:1 obtained 24338:20 24407:25 24408:5 24414:7 24442:22 obtaining 24405:11 obviously 24297:19 24309:20 24313:14 24317:13 24327:24 24328:10,14 24335:16 24345:13 24353:8 24355:11 24363:20 24367:2 24374:1 24380:5 24392:21 24393:20 24398:21 24399:15 24412:14,25 24415:3 24424:15 24427:19 24437:24 24438:5 occur 24323:6 24338:4 24412:7 occurred 24316:14 24317:21 24320:15 24322:12 24323:2 24329:21 24368:25 24369:1 24401:23 24409:25 24412:12 occurrence 24411:15 occurring 24313:7 occurs 24396:17 odd 24314:17 offer 24366:9 office 24301:4,5,18 24302:13 24304:2,22 24305:19,22 24307:13 24309:4 24310:22 24314:4 24347:23 24352:10 24352:16 24353:2,19 24353:21 officer 24303:2 24309:17 24310:6,8 24310:16 24353:15 24403:20 24412:5 24418:11 24442:16 officers 24316:15,17 24317:9,21 24318:14 24319:1,9,14,23 24320:1,8,20,24 24321:17 24323:3 24324:17 24325:5 24334:4 24335:17 24340:4 24347:9 24350:8,10 24353:7 24358:6 24386:8 24416:25 24422:15 24435:17,20 offices 24300:13 24301:1 24305:3 24306:11,12 official 24300:13,16,19 24301:1 24306:10,12 24306:13,16</p>	<p>24412:13 officials 24313:14 24314:2 24325:10 24326:12 24349:5 24356:20,24,25 24357:14 24358:16 24358:20 24392:2 24422:17 24435:25 oh 24314:11 24341:15 24378:5,13 24435:10 24444:9,16 okay 24300:16 24309:8 24323:16 24329:8 24338:8 24353:25 24430:21 24434:1 24435:14 24443:9 once 24335:15 24338:2 24442:21 24445:6 ones 24324:4 24342:22 24342:23 24369:11 24369:13 24378:18 24378:21 24380:5,17 24415:24 24419:14 24419:14 24440:21 24441:1,2,2,23 onhoorbaar 24344:22 onwards 24356:20 open 24325:19 24326:1 24326:2 24405:3 operate 24360:10 operating 24407:12 operation 24313:15 24324:9 24338:13,13 24339:9 24345:15 24386:19 24406:11 24408:10 24409:16 24409:17 operational 24326:23 24334:6 24346:4 operationally 24336:17 24404:3 operations 24308:17 24324:9 24334:25 24345:6 24385:11,12 24386:13 24392:18 24396:14 24400:18 24403:13,21 24405:9 24405:11 24413:17 24413:24 24414:10 operator 24420:7 24434:14 24442:13 opinion 24366:9,13,15 24366:18,22 24367:11,20 opinions 24366:20 Opperman 24420:15 opportunity 24369:19 24377:19 24399:21 24410:15 24413:4 24416:2 opposed 24404:23 opposite 24323:7 oral 24362:14 orange 24373:10 24375:1 order 24304:10</p>	<p>24313:9 24316:13 24317:25 24318:3,7 24318:24 24319:2 24320:5,14 24323:1 24324:22 24335:9 24338:10,14 24339:1 24339:12 24345:4,14 24347:2,4 24350:21 24382:25 24384:24 24391:14,14 24404:5 24405:17 24414:16 24414:17,20 24440:6 24441:21 ore 24308:8 organisers 24405:20 other's 24399:2 outcome 24404:7 outcomes 24397:23,24 outline 24300:23 outlined 24382:2 24394:15 outlining 24360:14 outside 24328:7,18 24330:20 overall 24386:7 overtly 24393:2 overview 24316:5 24347:15 o'clock 24426:14 o'clock 24448:3 24449:9,10,12 24450:1</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <p>page 24299:6,25 24300:3 24301:20,21 24301:23 24303:12 24304:24 24305:23 24312:11,12,14 24354:12,12 24365:9 24378:7,9 24379:12 24380:20,22 24382:4 24382:5 24390:20 24423:23,25 24426:24 24427:13 24427:14,16 24428:5 24442:8,13,18 24443:9 24444:14,16 24444:16 24445:20 24445:23 24446:15 pages 24379:23 24427:17,19,20 24443:7 24445:14 24448:18 pain 24373:12 24375:24,25 24376:8 24432:22 palm 24446:1,9,10 paper 24346:14,21 paragraph 24315:19 24315:23,24 24317:19 24319:12 24322:25 24324:2,22 24333:2,14 24334:10 24342:23 24345:17 24401:3,6,15,21,25</p>
---	--	--	--	--

<p>24401:25 24402:4,7,7 24402:8 24405:10 24435:4,23 24436:6 24443:14,15 24444:18 24445:14 24446:7 24447:6 paragraphs 24335:2 24336:9 paramedic 24358:21 24371:12,22 24372:3 24376:18,21 24418:17,20 24421:14 paramedics 24354:2,4 24364:21,23 24366:7 24370:10,14,17,17 24371:6,9 24375:4,17 24375:22,23 24376:7 24376:13 24377:17 24419:10 24421:16 paraplegic 24365:12 pardon 24299:10 part 24304:4 24317:5 24318:23 24323:17 24324:5 24328:14 24337:2 24356:9 24357:21,22 24359:3 24367:22,23 24387:12 24391:6 24401:24 24407:7 24410:11,13,24,25 24411:2,6,24 24413:5 24414:5 24422:2 24427:20 24428:4 24441:14 24445:21 particular 24320:17 24323:24 24352:13 24352:19 24357:22 24360:18 24363:15 24370:1 24371:17 24384:21,22 24412:12,14 24445:10 particularly 24299:18 24414:6 parties 24383:10,21 24384:11 24398:16 24399:2 partly 24331:4 party 24383:25 24384:1 24412:1,15 passage 24302:7 24303:10 24304:16 24304:17 24312:5,8 24312:12,13,19,21 24388:10 24424:22 24424:25 24429:2,7 24430:19,24 24431:10,21 24432:17,25 24433:1 24447:17,19 passages 24306:23 passes 24357:4 path 24438:19 pathologist 24439:10 Pato 24297:7 24445:13</p>	<p>24445:24 24448:13 24448:14 patrols 24313:12 24414:22 pellets 24407:7 penultimate 24405:10 24425:7,25 24426:7 people's 24378:22 perception 24397:13 24429:16 perfectly 24303:22 perform 24366:3 performed 24367:1 performing 24365:22 period 24383:9 24385:11 24392:14 24393:24 24401:5 24403:14 peri-urban 24385:4 24403:11 permission 24336:19 24344:5 24387:2 24393:3 24429:22 perpetrators 24313:24 person 24300:16 24302:18,21,21,24 24305:20 24306:8,19 24306:23 24307:8 24309:20 24322:16 24325:25 24333:19 24334:16 24352:24 24355:1,22,25 24356:6 24357:2,4 24358:5,17 24361:7 24362:22,25 24373:7 24373:9 24380:9,13 24397:20 24402:10 24403:9 24408:20 24410:8 24417:5,7 24418:21 24429:9 24439:7 24442:10 24445:10 personal 24386:6 personally 24357:1 24402:11 personnel 24300:11 24302:25 24303:1,3 24316:11 24338:15 24339:1,20 24340:3 24340:14,18,25 24342:10 24345:5 24358:14 24365:16 24381:8 24419:25 24422:7 24424:13 persons 24300:24 perspective 24342:25 pertained 24322:1 pervasive 24324:16 Peter 24427:7 Petros 24343:11 phase 24313:15 24339:5 Phatsha 24431:4,8,12 24432:15 phone 24301:15 24302:11 24305:18</p>	<p>24306:14 24309:4,9 24309:24 24310:22 24354:16,19 phoned 24301:17 24302:12 phones 24354:22 photo 24418:24 photograph 24415:16 24417:17 24418:11 24418:12,13 photographs 24338:21 24420:18 24425:2 phrase 24405:8 phrases 24322:24 physically 24334:21 picture 24333:10 24372:16 24415:18 24415:19 24417:15 24417:19,20 24420:17 pictures 24415:21 24416:3,3,23 24420:8 24425:5 Pillay 24296:20 pistols 24395:9,21 place 24303:24 24305:21 24310:3 24321:7 24322:17 24323:8 24324:19 24325:11 24329:14 24334:13 24339:4 24347:16 24357:8 24363:3 24365:18 24371:14 24375:6 24384:25 24390:16 24390:19,24 24393:5 24399:6 24432:18 24436:19 placed 24323:22 24383:14 places 24303:13 24338:12 24401:24 24431:7 plan 24334:13 24338:5 planning 24405:16,23 players 24324:24 please 24300:9 24301:21 24302:1 24310:21 24315:3 24334:18 24354:21 24415:19 24416:4 24419:16,19 24433:18 24442:14 24443:12 24444:14 24444:16 pleased 24314:21 ploughing 24359:13 point 24306:15 24317:18 24319:7,21 24322:20 24324:25 24325:23,24 24336:23 24338:20 24343:24 24344:7 24348:2 24349:17,24 24361:25 24362:20 24363:22 24364:1</p>	<p>24366:11,18,18,25 24367:6,8,9 24368:8 24368:11,16 24371:21,24,25 24372:8 24374:12,13 24375:15 24379:25 24380:17,21,24 24381:1,6,7,20 24399:22 24402:12 24406:18 24407:4 24409:14 24415:7,14 24430:6,6 24432:2,25 24435:2,8 24436:7 24445:6,8 24447:5 24448:6 pointed 24439:15 pointer 24417:4 points 24304:13 24353:5 24364:9,12 24368:9 point's 24413:19 policed 24393:7 policemen 24390:21 policies 24355:15 24359:21 24360:6 policing 24336:24 24345:4 24347:4 24350:21 24382:2 24383:10 24384:1 24385:5 24396:3 24402:16,17 24404:5 24412:10 24413:24 24414:10,15,16,19,22 24421:23 policy 24354:14 24355:6,8,16 24356:5 24356:18,18,22 24357:6,9,10,12 24358:12,12 24359:20 24360:16 24361:3 24362:2,19 24364:3 political 24382:3 24383:10,21 24384:22 24397:2 24398:15 24399:1 24401:24 pooled 24339:13 POP 24333:8 24340:3,7 24340:19 24346:2 24382:18 24400:18 24401:1 24402:5,9 24403:13,21 24405:16 24408:18 popularly 24395:22 portrayed 24401:5 posed 24367:17 position 24303:7 24332:3 24357:15,24 24366:16,17 24394:22 24410:23 24410:23 24426:10 24426:11 24445:2 possession 24406:24 possible 24374:9 24378:23 24392:23</p>	<p>possibly 24327:19 24355:17 24361:22 24364:11 24404:2 post 24340:22 24396:1 24396:13,20 24398:21 24399:3 24439:1,5,8,10,16,17 24440:3,17,25 24441:14 24442:15 24442:18 24444:19 post-mortem 24445:24 potentially 24365:24 24379:7 24380:1,5,9 24380:15 practical 24397:9 precede 24297:10 preceded 24312:13 24370:3 precious 24419:22 precisely 24370:23 24376:16 preliminary 24297:8 24321:5,12 24322:3 24322:23 prepared 24410:21 24449:21 preparing 24398:17 presence 24313:8,12 24407:23 24425:1 present 24326:23 24331:16 24343:14 24371:2 24415:23 24420:21 24443:20 24447:9 presentation 24448:19 presently 24384:11 president 24298:9,14 24308:1,3 pressure 24313:1 presumable 24445:3 presumably 24309:3 24374:14 presume 24369:21 Pretoria 24403:18,19 Pretorius 24341:12 24370:15,23 24411:15 prevent 24355:8 24356:6 preventable 24365:25 24379:20,22,23 24380:3,11 24381:6 prevented 24366:6 24375:19 24380:7 24392:23 24414:7 previous 24312:11,14 24370:15 24411:22 24444:16 previously 24304:1 24312:10,13,16 24397:7 24423:8 pre-election 24383:9 pre-1994 24401:5 prima 24362:8 primarily 24327:18 24404:20 24422:24</p>
--	---	--	--	--

<p>primary 24339:9 prior 24397:3 24398:20 24399:9 private 24309:3 24401:24 probability 24306:17 probably 24403:5 24405:14,15 24448:16 probe 24391:5 problem 24304:12 24309:1 24332:22 24378:19 24406:23 24413:19 24443:4 24449:20 problems 24366:23 problem's 24315:5 procedure 24366:3 24367:1 24396:4 proceed 24313:24 24362:1 24369:21 24417:3 24442:23 24443:3 24449:8 proceeded 24347:7 24411:9 proceeding 24364:13 proceedings 24296:1 24339:18 process 24322:5 24329:14 24338:5 24419:25 24439:14 Prof 24378:6 professor 24367:8 24375:9 24378:1,1,3 24380:2,6,20 24400:17 24403:1,23 24406:3 24407:2 24408:16 24428:12 progress 24345:9 projectile 24447:16 pronounce 24365:4 24378:15 24379:4 24446:16,17 pronounced 24378:22 proper 24303:22 24398:9 24407:25 properly 24314:23 24357:23 24416:17 proportion 24394:18 24395:5 propose 24396:22 proposing 24374:12 24399:18 proposition 24349:22 24375:6 24410:15 24411:1 prosecuted 24313:25 prosecution 24323:23 24369:1 protect 24339:11 24399:16 protecting 24422:17 protection 24339:2 24422:24,25 24423:1 protective 24412:23 protest 24396:24</p>	<p>24398:3 protesters 24392:12 24393:14 24429:23 protestors 24372:22 24397:8 protests 24396:10 prove 24437:17 provide 24328:1 24424:18 provided 24357:23 24408:4 24440:5 providing 24407:21 province 24308:20 24327:3 24328:7,18 24330:14,20 24331:6 24332:15 24333:16 24336:19 provinces 24331:8 provincial 24300:13 24301:1 24302:13 24304:2,22 24305:12 24305:16 24306:20 24306:24 24307:3,9 24307:13 24308:17 24308:24 24309:2,5,7 24309:10,16,21,23,25 24310:6,8,13,17 24315:18 24316:3,7 24322:22 24327:16 24327:19,22,25 24328:3,11,23,24 24329:6,15 24330:17 24330:22,25 24331:4 24332:16 24333:1,21 24334:2,25 24336:18 24337:12 24352:10 24352:12 24353:1,6 24353:18 24410:18 24411:13,20 24412:5 provision 24355:13 provokes 24381:21 public 24313:8 24316:13 24317:25 24318:3,7,24 24319:2 24320:5,14 24323:1 24323:23 24324:22 24335:9 24338:10,14 24339:1,12 24345:4 24347:2,4 24350:21 24355:14 24382:25 24398:7 24404:5 24405:17 24414:15 24414:17,20 pumping 24363:1,2 purely 24338:10 purposes 24371:2 pursue 24313:16,18 24352:2 push 24373:18 put 24300:18 24301:17 24320:8 24325:11,21 24326:1 24327:2 24355:4 24356:19 24360:2,4,12 24361:3 24364:10 24369:25 24372:2 24374:24</p>	<p>24381:14 24383:19 24385:10,10 24391:6 24410:14,16 24411:1 24413:22 24415:10 24415:12 24416:4 24421:18 24423:21 24428:22,25 24429:1 24429:20 24435:18 24438:17 24439:1,2 24444:12,23 puts 24366:17 24429:16 putting 24302:8 24306:7 24352:3 24357:24 24362:7,17 24372:21 24375:3,16 24391:15 24412:22 24430:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Q</p> <p>quantity 24406:13 quarrel 24371:7 quarter 24400:6 query 24381:11 question 24301:14,17 24305:8 24308:23 24315:10,14 24316:20,25 24317:3 24324:14 24327:6,9 24328:16 24330:2 24331:4,15 24332:8 24343:24 24349:4 24352:2 24356:3,4,7 24358:2 24359:10,16 24360:2,5,7 24361:5 24366:4 24367:4 24368:8,21 24375:11 24376:3 24377:6,7,16 24380:12 24381:14 24381:20 24385:10 24387:14 24388:10 24389:18 24390:14 24391:6,16 24394:1 24400:1 24403:15 24412:4 24413:13 24422:10 24423:15 24441:11 24444:10 questions 24297:8 24310:17 24322:17 24322:24 24337:23 24343:24 24355:18 24355:20 24362:17 24363:24 24367:17 24386:25 24387:6 24390:2 24399:21 quickly 24298:9 quite 24306:21 24357:8 24359:16 24371:10 24375:5 24384:22 24402:13 24403:22 24433:6 24439:5 24447:20</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <p>radically 24313:2 raids 24409:2</p>	<p>railway 24348:15 raised 24388:15 24414:3 24433:2 24436:1,2 raising 24431:9 24432:21 24436:8 24439:22 24445:11 rallies 24383:24 24384:4 24389:12 rally 24389:10 Ramanala 24415:15 Ramanala's 24417:17 ran 24428:17 24435:23 24436:10 Rand 24419:23 rands 24355:22 24356:13 24358:9 24359:6 range 24335:10 24357:22 rank 24302:18,20 rapid 24345:9 reach 24432:16 reached 24364:23 24365:21 react 24369:2 reaction 24340:8,10 24366:4 24367:12,16 24367:18,19 24374:7 24382:18 read 24299:16 24300:7 24304:6 24305:10 24312:12,13 24341:9 24355:4 24378:14 24382:15 24388:10 24434:22 readily 24409:5 reading 24381:25 24428:8 24431:13 reads 24443:18 ready 24310:18 real 24312:5 24432:17 reality 24359:19,22 24360:7,14 24361:4 really 24348:18 24361:12 24362:11 24404:24 24425:22 24428:17 24444:2 rear 24339:11 reason 24309:17 24317:5 24319:10,10 24319:22 24320:7 24350:19 24355:9 24419:24 24449:17 reasons 24320:10 24368:3 24375:20 recall 24337:4,9 24354:5 24386:18 receive 24352:14 24362:13 received 24305:18 24307:8,15 24322:3,4 24322:23 24328:22 24333:17 24351:20 24352:4,24 24376:1 24411:8 24413:23</p>	<p>24440:24,25 recognise 24417:23 recognition 24347:6 recollection 24348:22 recommendation 24364:12 recommendations 24362:4,4,5 24363:22 record 24303:13 24368:21,22 24369:25 24370:25 24411:15 24436:20 recorded 24312:14 24439:10,17 recourse 24303:23 recover 24320:13 24395:11 24409:2 recovery 24345:10 red 24417:21 refer 24299:5 24317:14 24324:22 24339:18 24407:11 24424:22 24427:21 24430:20 24430:24 24432:3 24436:15 24441:3 reference 24311:5,11 24338:12 24343:4 24357:16 24367:17 24389:6 24405:16 24426:22 24432:8 referred 24305:19,22 24306:8,18,24 24312:24 24315:20 24316:17,25 24325:9 24336:9 24338:25 24342:5,25 24343:21 24369:14,18 24379:19 24392:21 24392:22 24413:16 24427:10,14 24429:2 24429:10 24441:24 24441:25 24442:3 24445:20 referring 24315:21 24359:18 24361:23 24384:12 24399:5 24417:22 24423:15 24440:15 24441:23 24449:10 refers 24364:24 24379:21 24407:3 refinery 24419:22 reflect 24439:19 reflected 24342:24 reflection 24449:23 reflective 24346:23 reflects 24346:22 regard 24318:6 24325:13 24359:8 24364:17,24 24377:6 24411:23 regarded 24365:20,24 24380:1,9 24386:13 regarding 24422:3 regards 24380:6 regret 24355:2</p>
--	--	---	---	--

<p>related 24324:8 24331:8 24336:18 24388:12 24391:21 24396:12 24404:5 24447:9</p> <p>relating 24413:13 24445:17,24</p> <p>relation 24316:16 24363:14 24366:23 24438:3</p> <p>relationship 24336:15</p> <p>relative 24392:6</p> <p>relatives 24297:5 24369:12,14 24415:24 24416:6</p> <p>relay 24445:25</p> <p>relevance 24386:25 24387:2,7,8</p> <p>relevant 24349:19 24364:10 24368:12 24368:14 24387:12 24397:18,19 24401:5 24411:16,23</p> <p>reluctance 24357:5 24358:1,15</p> <p>reluctant 24356:25 24358:6 24361:25</p> <p>rely 24375:13 24431:10 24432:25,25 24437:7 24437:20 24445:4 24447:17</p> <p>relying 24432:17 24441:5</p> <p>remain 24398:11</p> <p>remaining 24419:24</p> <p>remarkable 24403:23 24408:18</p> <p>remember 24300:17 24302:16,20,21 24310:10,12,13 24311:8,9 24312:6 24322:9 24327:8 24332:12 24345:7,21 24348:19 24349:19 24355:16 24360:23 24385:23 24391:18 24391:19,21 24392:3 24413:20 24427:9</p> <p>Remind 24423:23</p> <p>reminded 24372:1</p> <p>reminding 24338:2 24354:20</p> <p>render 24358:20 24373:25</p> <p>rendered 24326:15 24365:11 24374:9</p> <p>repeat 24302:19</p> <p>repeated 24381:15,21 24431:25</p> <p>repeating 24304:1</p> <p>replace 24448:18</p> <p>replied 24305:14,14 24382:21</p> <p>report 24303:1 24307:14 24320:24 24322:3,3,9,24</p>	<p>24365:14 24378:8,9 24386:10 24404:7</p> <p>reported 24325:20 24408:15</p> <p>reports 24303:18 24321:5,13 24361:23 24362:15 24407:16 24440:4,25 24441:14 24442:19</p> <p>represent 24354:9 24362:18,20 24410:5 24415:9</p> <p>representatives 24352:10</p> <p>represented 24365:8</p> <p>represents 24339:19</p> <p>request 24327:2,23 24328:22,24 24329:16 24331:25 24332:25 24346:18 24350:2 24351:5</p> <p>requested 24331:19 24414:24</p> <p>requesting 24332:20</p> <p>requests 24326:22 24333:17 24346:6</p> <p>require 24327:1 24336:19 24346:6 24370:25</p> <p>required 24303:3 24317:14 24318:7 24326:21 24327:4 24329:23 24330:11 24332:15 24421:24 24421:24 24423:9</p> <p>requirement 24345:4 24424:17</p> <p>research 24404:7,8</p> <p>reservations 24408:23</p> <p>reserve 24339:10</p> <p>residences 24390:12,23</p> <p>residents 24401:7</p> <p>resolution 24418:24</p> <p>resolve 24352:22</p> <p>resort 24399:8</p> <p>resource 24355:7 24358:13</p> <p>resourced 24356:22 24405:22 24417:6</p> <p>resources 24314:1 24316:12 24325:11 24327:3 24328:4,6,18 24329:23 24331:5,8 24331:19 24332:15 24332:20 24333:3,11 24333:22 24334:11 24334:19 24341:1 24343:5 24349:6 24350:18 24356:23 24404:25 24405:6 24410:22 24421:23</p> <p>resourcing 24324:9 24357:7 24360:20</p> <p>respect 24362:2,10 24363:21 24364:19 24365:10 24375:18</p>	<p>24380:1 24399:25 24421:4 24425:14 24431:6 24440:4</p> <p>respond 24328:1 24357:24 24373:17 24424:14</p> <p>responded 24333:16 24409:10 24423:15 24438:7</p> <p>responding 24312:1,20 24399:6</p> <p>response 24300:14 24301:2 24302:23 24304:3 24305:7 24335:8 24339:11 24340:5,21 24349:6 24355:10,10 24356:14 24358:4 24381:4 24387:20,23 24389:1,19 24401:1</p> <p>responsibilities 24357:13</p> <p>responsibility 24324:13 24368:23 24413:7</p> <p>responsible 24367:20 24367:21 24368:3 24375:5 24383:9 24397:20</p> <p>rest 24331:6</p> <p>restoration 24367:25</p> <p>restore 24339:8</p> <p>restrict 24318:25</p> <p>result 24323:6 24325:15 24344:23 24389:4 24391:10 24412:11</p> <p>resulted 24318:15 24364:20 24388:25</p> <p>resume 24374:16 24400:6,9 24425:21 24426:5</p> <p>resumes 24296:2 24344:13,14 24374:18,19 24400:10 24426:16 24426:17 24442:25 24443:1</p> <p>retard 24355:13</p> <p>retrieved 24406:14</p> <p>revert 24420:1</p> <p>review 24350:23</p> <p>revision 24371:1</p> <p>re-orientate 24443:22</p> <p>re-traverse 24354:3</p> <p>rifles 24395:9,11</p> <p>right 24296:19 24303:15 24306:20 24306:21 24309:1,5 24310:2,25 24319:12 24324:14 24328:19 24329:8 24330:11 24335:13 24341:25 24343:25 24349:13 24351:1 24361:2 24364:11 24370:5 24380:17 24383:15</p>	<p>24388:22 24399:16 24400:4 24405:14 24408:2 24411:12 24418:7,23 24420:13 24420:18 24429:20 24434:2,21 24436:7 24443:11 24444:19 24449:7</p> <p>rights 24397:6,25 24398:1,14 24399:8</p> <p>risen 24432:22</p> <p>risk 24412:18,18,22</p> <p>rival 24399:1</p> <p>rivalry 24398:15 24401:25</p> <p>rock 24436:10,11</p> <p>rocks 24428:18 24431:8 24435:16</p> <p>role 24324:24</p> <p>roughly 24426:14</p> <p>round 24344:21 24346:25 24423:16</p> <p>route 24353:14</p> <p>rubber 24407:5 24420:12,13</p> <p>rudimentary 24362:21 24362:21 24363:5</p> <p>ruled 24369:3</p> <p>rules 24437:15 24438:3</p> <p>ruling 24368:19</p> <p>run 24428:19 24432:16 24320:16 24370:7 24388:15 24428:16 24432:23 24436:1</p> <p>Rustenburg 24366:2 24366:24</p> <p>R1s 24395:14 24409:13</p> <p>R4s 24409:14</p> <p>R5 24395:14</p> <p>R5s 24409:14</p>	<p>24303:25 24304:3 24328:11 24356:3 24415:2</p> <p>Saturday 24347:16,19 24347:20,21 24348:18,23 24349:7 24350:23</p> <p>save 24311:4</p> <p>saved 24364:23 24380:6</p> <p>saw 24370:2,8,19 24371:13 24372:16 24372:23 24373:1,3,6 24373:15 24374:25 24415:19 24436:8,8 24436:13</p> <p>saying 24307:24 24308:1 24312:6 24318:13,17 24319:21 24324:11 24329:15 24332:3,13 24332:24 24337:9 24356:8,20 24358:5 24358:10,12,24 24360:6 24361:11,12 24361:13 24367:16 24368:13 24375:10 24375:12 24385:19 24386:17 24389:21 24393:18 24395:17 24396:19,20 24402:19 24410:21 24429:13 24436:23 24437:1 24445:9 24446:11 24449:23</p> <p>says 24299:19 24300:8 24302:10,14,15,15 24306:20 24340:1 24352:4 24360:16 24365:11 24366:5 24367:12,20 24380:21,23,24 24390:20,20 24401:7 24401:11,13,17,23 24402:1,9 24408:19 24424:7 24428:16,24 24429:1 24431:4,8,12 24432:15 24438:25 24444:23</p> <p>say-so 24352:4</p> <p>scale 24335:22 24386:11 24393:13 24393:20</p> <p>scenario 24392:4,22 24394:15 24396:16 24408:24</p> <p>scenarios 24389:15 24395:19 24404:20 24405:7 24406:18</p> <p>scene 24299:20 24303:1 24321:6 24323:24 24354:5 24360:18 24364:21 24364:24 24370:10 24370:14,18,24 24372:3,4,6 24375:4</p>
S				
<p>safe 24384:5</p> <p>safely 24314:22</p> <p>safety 24339:8 24423:9 24428:17</p> <p>Saffy 24367:2</p> <p>saga 24326:7</p> <p>Sagalala 24446:13,14 24446:20,23</p> <p>SANDF 24389:14</p> <p>SAP 24386:14,19 24389:3</p> <p>SAPS 24300:13 24301:3 24316:5 24322:9 24337:10 24341:1 24358:4,5 24359:1,4,5 24361:6 24361:7,19 24385:12 24386:14 24397:11 24404:15 24407:6 24417:10 24424:14</p> <p>satisfaction 24364:8</p> <p>satisfactory 24300:14</p> <p>satisfied 24301:2</p>				

<p>24401:5 24416:25 24421:15 24423:3,6 24424:9 24425:12 24429:11 24430:10 scenes 24392:2 Scott 24341:15 screen 24300:7 24301:20 24359:20 24369:8 24370:4,6 24378:11 24382:11 24400:21 24415:12 24415:19 24416:4 24418:25 24434:14 24441:13 scroll 24442:11,12 search 24405:11 24407:13,23 24408:1 searching 24345:12 seasoned 24412:5 seat 24344:19 second 24333:14 24359:13 24442:18 secondly 24312:17 24313:18 24407:2 seconds 24416:4 second-in-command 24352:6 secret 24408:4 section 24341:9 24370:2,3,5,8 24407:20 sections 24333:15 24339:21 24401:18 24402:5 secure 24358:14 24384:6 secured 24351:16 security 24303:2,7,19 24303:23,25 24339:8 24348:3 24349:19 24418:4 24419:6,11 24421:16 24422:6,15 24422:15,17 24423:12 24424:9,21 24425:4 see 24297:15,21 24299:13,14,22 24300:20 24305:2,5,6 24314:20,21 24335:5 24335:6 24337:20 24354:22 24358:17 24359:19 24369:7,8 24369:10 24371:11 24372:22 24373:9,11 24373:13 24377:11 24384:8 24387:2,8,17 24387:21 24390:13 24396:15 24399:24 24401:6,9,14,16 24404:11 24411:18 24415:20,21,25 24417:6,8 24418:13 24418:23 24420:10 24420:19 24427:18 24428:17,20 24431:12 24433:3,4</p>	<p>24434:13 24435:20 24435:21 24436:3,4 24436:12 24437:2,2 24440:23 24441:18 24442:13 24443:2,21 24444:9,13,15,16 seeing 24301:7,10 24369:15 24401:3 24416:3 24425:5 seeking 24367:11,11 24373:25 24379:13 24380:24 24420:25 seeks 24304:9 24430:9 seen 24301:8 24304:18 24337:6 24370:7 24372:17 24379:11 24405:2 24412:20 24419:14 24420:2 24422:17,20 24433:15 sees 24407:15 Sekwano 24307:5 self-defence 24322:6 Semenya 24300:8,16 24359:10 24366:8 24381:13,14,17 24382:14,17 24386:24 24387:7,21 24391:7 24394:4 24423:16,21 24424:7 24424:11 24436:17 24436:18,23 24437:1 24437:4,10 24438:25 24444:1,6,7,23 24445:9 Semenya's 24359:23 24360:3 semi-rural 24385:4 send 24333:21,25 senior 24309:17 24403:20 24412:5 sense 24323:4 24342:20 24394:19 24404:21 sensible 24425:15 sent 24334:19 24370:24 sentence 24304:6 24333:14 24355:5 24360:9 24413:16 Seoka 24397:11 separate 24389:4,14 24401:18 September 24406:10 sequent 24314:4 series 24343:24 24386:25 serious 24309:1,7 24335:17 24336:22 24408:16 seriously 24398:6,13 service 24309:14 24331:21 24336:7 24355:12,13,14 24356:6,9,11,12 24357:22 24358:8 24368:24 24372:5 24390:9 24396:11,12</p>	<p>24411:21 24417:24 24418:1 24424:10 services 24357:21,23 24367:14 24382:19 24445:7 session 24308:13 set 24340:14 24341:7 24392:4 setting 24361:24 24405:3 settled 24427:6 severe 24354:19 24416:1 severity 24318:4 shaking 24373:11 shape 24447:13 she's 24331:20,24 shift 24313:12 shirt 24418:13 shirts 24417:21 shoot 24435:25 shooting 24370:11,12 24385:15 24386:6 24395:3 24432:18 24435:17 shootings 24314:15 24343:9 24385:18 short 24328:2 24360:8 24361:23 24425:25 24425:25 24435:18 24441:21,23 24442:20,20,21 shorten 24339:17 shorter 24420:12 shortly 24359:23 24399:24 short-circuit 24439:14 shot 24372:7 24428:22 24429:16,23,25 24430:1,3,4,10 24431:6,10 24432:22 24433:2 24435:20 24436:2,9 24439:21 24444:25 24446:6 24447:8,15 shotgun 24407:6 24418:7,22 24420:13 shotguns 24422:13 shots 24369:10 24391:20,22 shouldn't 24365:1,2 show 24410:5 24416:24 24435:19 24442:8 showed 24369:20 24417:2 24420:17 showing 24297:10 shown 24298:22 24369:16,24 24424:8 24425:21 24441:13 24442:15 shows 24369:7 24443:23 24446:12 sick 24305:13 24306:3 24310:1 24357:2 side 24318:15 24357:17 24357:17 24360:11</p>	<p>24391:10 24417:19 24446:10,10 24447:10 sign 24371:12,22 24372:3,3,7 24417:2 24430:11 24436:9 24444:24 signs 24369:20 24370:4 Simato 24448:17 similarities 24401:4 simplistic 24360:16 simply 24367:11 24368:13 24379:15 24393:18 24409:10 single 24402:10 24408:20 Sir 24301:15 24302:11 24442:1 sit 24334:7 24367:24 24373:11 site 24422:14 sitting 24400:14 situated 24401:20 situation 24302:16,25 24312:1,9,15,16,21 24313:23 24316:13 24317:25 24318:3,7 24318:24 24319:2 24320:5,9,15 24323:1 24324:23 24326:22 24326:25 24327:20 24327:23 24329:20 24329:21,24 24330:6 24332:21 24335:16 24337:4,14 24338:9 24339:7 24347:6 24349:13,25 24350:24 24355:5 24357:25 24358:25 24363:18 24386:11 24401:12 24404:24 24406:2,2,14 24407:11 24408:15 situations 24408:14 six 24325:24 24440:25 24442:1,1 size 24393:12,20 sketch 24360:9 sketched 24360:18 skirmish 24316:16 24318:15 24319:8 24322:17 24323:6 24347:12 24394:23 sleep 24406:8 sleeping 24407:1 sleeve 24447:11 slide 24340:14,21,21 24341:7,10,10,19 slides 24297:11 24339:18 24342:4,19 24342:24 24343:21 slightly 24342:9 24446:25 slowly 24387:3 small 24387:24 24388:12 24424:13</p>	<p>24432:16 24446:1 smaller 24395:12,21 24418:25 society 24398:14 solace 24446:19 solicited 24358:4 solved 24315:5 solving 24413:18 somebody 24301:5 24307:12 24309:15 24346:1 24352:18 24358:18 Sompeta 24364:25 24365:10 soon 24296:8,11 sooner 24409:6 sorry 24299:10 24300:17 24302:2 24311:12,18 24314:18 24334:9 24339:16 24377:5 24382:4 24393:25 24399:12 24428:4 24429:21 24434:6 24436:16 24439:4 24442:9 24449:19 sort 24342:16 24363:5 24441:22,22 sorted 24443:4 sorting 24426:23 Sotho 24365:7 24378:21 sought 24349:12 24356:4 sound 24314:22,24 sounds 24405:11 24432:5,6 source 24371:17 South 24382:20 24388:16 24396:5,10 24396:17 24424:9 spared 24429:6 speak 24302:15 24308:8,9,23 24309:5 24309:23 24310:1,3 24315:6 24334:4 speaking 24311:24 24432:15 speaks 24377:17 special 24320:10 24335:7 24345:8 24366:16,20 24367:5 specialised 24382:18 24382:25 specialists 24346:11 specially 24356:9 specific 24324:23 24325:17 24327:1 24345:6,21 24358:3,3 24359:9 24402:23 24405:16 24413:17 24437:18 specifically 24310:10 24320:7 24325:9,15 24332:12 24345:13 24360:14 24379:21</p>
--	--	---	---	---

24391:18,21 24392:1 24392:3 24404:1 24405:5 24407:3 24416:5 24438:6 24440:15,22 speculating 24329:10 spell 24433:18 24434:4 24448:21 spelling 24365:6 spelt 24379:5 spend 24447:20 spent 24402:13 spin 24320:8 spinal 24365:12 spoke 24300:10,12 24302:16,17,19,21 24304:23,25 24305:2 24305:4 24306:10,11 24306:12 24307:5,8 24360:20 spoken 24300:24,25 24306:16 24307:12 24308:8,20 spot 24315:23 spread 24347:25 24348:1 stabilisation 24317:25 stabilise 24313:23 24316:12 24318:7 24322:25 24326:22 24329:24 24330:6 24339:7 stabilised 24312:16 stabilising 24312:1,20 stability 24345:6 staff 24424:20,20 stage 24297:4 24308:19 24314:6 24322:10 24325:12 24345:21 24361:21 24369:5 24371:6,23 24373:9 24387:8 24391:19 24395:22 24403:21 24406:19 24407:4 24413:1 24418:3 24423:10 stand 24344:20 24429:5 standard 24362:25 24363:12 standing 24305:16 24418:19 start 24296:12,14 24324:15 24369:19 24426:25 24448:5 started 24319:2 24435:17 starting 24301:13 24314:1 24343:23 24349:7 24354:12 24365:11 24384:3 24387:18 24427:1 starts 24311:12,17 24312:9 24369:23 24426:24 24436:8 state 24431:6	statement 24302:14 24311:5 24312:17 24315:19 24319:7,21 24319:25 24325:4,8 24326:17 24333:3 24334:10 24335:2,5 24335:11 24340:25 24341:20 24342:23 24343:14 24345:17 24346:7 24367:13 24370:16 24382:1 24394:25 24431:7 24433:16 24434:2,4 24434:12 24435:7,9 24435:23 24436:5 statements 24433:6 24434:23 24436:19 24437:8,20,25 24438:1 stating 24437:6 station 24308:16 24309:18,24 24313:11 24352:15 24382:22 24385:3 24423:12 stationed 24402:6 stations 24309:14 station's 24414:19 step 24339:5 steps 24363:5 24412:21 STF 24340:9 24346:1 stills 24425:21,22 stock 24344:6 stood 24411:16 stop 24339:7 24356:11 24358:6 24359:5 24361:7 24363:2,6,9 24365:17 24398:8 stopped 24407:6 24429:5,6 24435:25 24435:25 stopper 24407:5 stopping 24358:7 24364:13 24365:22 24368:15 story 24347:24 24348:1 24403:23 24430:8 straight 24332:8 strict 24437:15 strike 24391:12 24394:3 strikers 24313:14,17 24317:1 24318:5 24323:18 24338:17 24338:25 24339:14 24392:13 24393:14 strikes 24382:2 24387:16,22 24388:11,25 24390:4 24396:12 striking 24397:8 stronger 24366:17 structure 24308:15 24341:16,17 structures 24334:12,16 24393:3	studies 24407:9 study 24402:8 style 24401:19 Sub 24314:4 subject 24368:11 24407:22 submissions 24329:11 submit 24397:19 24437:21 24438:2 submitted 24438:2 subsequent 24314:8,9 24324:16 24326:6 subsequently 24345:2 substantially 24413:18 sub-B 24363:12 sub-number 24440:6 succeeded 24386:15 success 24386:13,19 24403:23 successful 24402:9 24406:11 24407:13 sued 24355:24 24361:6 suffer 24416:3 suffering 24375:24 sufficient 24303:25 24304:3 24306:1 24326:24 24332:21 24347:3 24406:21 sufficiently 24358:13 24358:13 suggest 24374:12 24404:12 24407:12 suggested 24353:14 24390:14 24413:23 24426:13 suggesting 24398:13,18 24398:20 24399:3,5 suggestion 24350:6 24372:21 24411:23 24429:23 24446:5,9 suitable 24297:4 sum 24329:22 24332:22 24429:10 Sunday 24306:6,6,16 24308:24,25 24309:23 24314:3 24333:9 24347:20 24348:2,5,9 24349:2 24350:4,14 24353:1 24397:17,18 24413:25 24414:6 superficial 24447:13 superior 24412:7 supplementary 24370:16,16 24441:12 24442:8,14 24442:18 supplemented 24382:24 support 24317:13 24320:11 24325:12 24326:15 24327:1 24333:15,16,17 24338:15 24345:7,13 24345:15 24350:4 24424:20,20	24430:16 24439:20 supported 24339:1 supporting 24326:16 24384:22 supportive 24346:14 24439:3 suppose 24315:5 24433:13 24444:10 supposed 24355:12 24391:13 supposedly 24353:15 sure 24311:3 24312:23 24316:18 24318:9 24336:14,21 24346:16,17,18 24354:21 24358:21 24361:9 24362:12 24363:5 24364:6,9,15 24365:3 24370:13 24371:10 24372:9 24374:5,7 24375:12 24377:22 24381:8,11 24389:13 24391:17 24392:16 24396:18 24403:9 24406:19 24408:25 24409:6 24410:7,14 24419:8 24420:6 24422:9 24439:5 surname 24433:20,22 surrender 24429:12 24430:1,11 24436:9 24439:22 surrendered 24436:12 surrendering 24445:1 24446:6 surrounded 24406:12 24406:12 24435:24 survivable 24365:21 24379:8 24380:1,5,10 24380:16 suspect 24367:4 suspected 24384:23 24406:24 suspects 24345:10,10 24409:3 sustained 24439:7 system 24432:24 S-O-M-P-E-T-A 24364:25 s.u.o 24344:17	24374:16 24375:15 24380:8,12 24384:25 24393:2 24399:18,25 24400:4,16 24403:12 24410:10 24413:4 24414:10 24415:18 24425:15,20 24426:13 24430:8,21 24433:1 24435:1 24437:16 24441:20 24442:19 24443:7,15 24446:19 24447:25 24449:11 taken 24313:20 24319:24 24321:7 24328:19 24331:17 24346:24 24348:24 24360:10,19 24366:25 24409:24 24410:16,17,17 24411:8,19,22 24412:6,8,21 24414:9 24415:9 24417:16 24429:3 24432:2 24444:10 taker 24367:18 talk 24301:5 24311:6 24315:17,19 24319:7 24325:2 24338:17 24339:6 24356:16 24361:4 24389:20 24406:2 talked 24319:1 24348:17 24413:17 talking 24315:24 24317:9 24335:4 24343:8 24355:17 24359:20 24382:15 24389:16 24390:23 24390:25 24393:12 24393:24 24395:24 24401:12 24406:4 24408:7 24439:16 24446:23 24448:20 talks 24319:9 24359:21 24375:20 24403:1 tangential 24443:18,19 24444:3,15,22 24445:11 task 24320:10 24326:13 24335:7 24345:8 24397:20 taskings 24325:8 taxi 24388:13,13 tea 24310:21 24344:6 24344:10 24374:13 24374:16 24426:13 team 24325:12 24326:11,14 24339:22 24340:5,7,9 24340:11,21,22 24345:13 24346:10 24361:20 Teams 24339:11 tea-time 24351:6,6 technical 24410:22
			T	
			T 24382:6 table 24356:20 tactical 24335:8 24338:15 24339:11 tag 24331:14 take 24296:22 24300:18 24309:1,4,9 24310:1 24311:10 24321:23 24324:19 24330:4,10,24 24333:7 24336:6 24344:6,6,9,10,11 24355:1 24371:22	

<p>telephone 24306:13 24307:15 24309:9,10 24333:20 24352:22 24352:24 24353:11 24353:12,16 telephoned 24333:20 telephones 24304:4 tell 24300:10 24301:15 24302:11 24332:4 24335:18 24338:3 24371:15 24384:14 24395:7 24415:25 24420:19 24430:7 24431:5 24437:24 tells 24378:6 tend 24357:18 tended 24370:20 tendency 24383:23 tenor 24322:2 tentative 24439:18 terms 24303:6 24317:13 24319:17 24320:8 24321:23 24323:4 24327:24 24335:5,10 24336:18 24336:20,24 24352:19 24357:19 24367:17 24374:7 24376:16 24384:1 24386:3 24392:22 24393:15,20 24394:5 24396:3,7 24398:22 24399:7 24404:2,22 24405:5 24408:16,25 24410:9 24411:3 24412:16,22 24414:14 tested 24322:15 24390:10 24398:12 24428:14 24437:9 testified 24307:10 24313:6 24320:9 24323:13 24337:2,12 24345:3 24350:2 24383:8 24385:16 24394:4 24403:11 24406:20 24408:25 24421:24 24423:8 testify 24370:18 24384:16 testimony 24304:23 24325:10 24337:7 24370:15 24382:1 24393:16 24394:9,12 24397:2 Thabiso 24297:5 24448:11 thank 24296:13 24299:9 24300:7 24307:11 24310:25 24311:1 24315:4,16 24329:9 24331:13 24338:1 24344:12 24351:24 24353:25 24355:3 24369:22 24374:24 24381:17</p>	<p>24381:18 24400:12 24400:16 24414:25 24420:16 24421:8 24426:22 24434:9 24438:9,24 24442:24 24449:13 Thelejane 24297:6 24448:12 theme 24425:7 thereof 24300:14 24369:11 24427:16 thereto 24336:18 24379:17 there'll 24354:19 there's 24298:17 24303:24 24321:16 24339:21 24340:2 24344:7 24357:18 24364:4 24378:16 24381:5 24426:22 24436:14 24438:6 24439:11 they'd 24348:24 24408:3 they'll 24442:7 they're 24407:12 thing 24303:21 24336:12 24357:21 24406:4 24407:14 things 24304:1 24315:9 24336:4 24338:18 24339:20 24355:12 24355:15 24357:6 24360:24 24362:19 24362:22 24364:8 24371:15 24381:9 24390:25 24393:4 24397:6 24398:24 24439:14 thinking 24349:1 thinks 24367:21 third 24316:20 24317:4 24321:16 24434:10 Thobisile 24379:10 thorax 24444:20 thought 24303:6 24348:22 24351:25 24354:17 24371:4 24374:9 24391:7,8 24399:19 24437:3 three 24313:13,14 24316:15 24318:5,13 24318:15 24321:14 24325:2 24392:13 24428:21 24433:14 24434:23 24440:25 threshold 24383:22 24384:12 throats 24399:2 thrown 24389:11 thrust 24316:25 24339:9 thumb 24446:11 Thursday 24314:12,15 24342:3,9 24350:16 tie 24307:4 24363:4</p>	<p>till 24449:12 time 24297:15 24306:11,25 24307:19,23 24321:11 24322:19 24322:23 24354:18 24354:23 24359:1,12 24359:13 24360:2 24363:18 24365:19 24366:24 24370:14 24371:9,10,10,13,18 24380:10 24382:22 24383:2,13 24384:7 24384:24 24386:1,15 24388:15 24398:10 24398:10,12 24402:13 24408:4,7,9 24417:1 24421:10,13 24422:7,20 24430:22 24431:8,24 24435:24 24438:21 24442:20 24442:21 24447:20 timeously 24375:5 24381:10 times 24359:11 24360:15 24382:16 24382:19 24391:22 24392:13 24423:9 Tip 24299:10,11,15 24300:22 24303:12 title 24398:10 24427:8 today 24318:13 24321:14 24356:20 24384:7 24415:23 told 24297:16 24300:11 24308:2 24338:18 24342:14 24360:22 24365:25 24411:20 24415:15,20 24433:11 24434:20 24440:1,7,22 24442:7 24443:5,6 24446:20 tolerance 24383:22 24384:11 tolerated 24449:25 tomorrow 24448:1,19 24449:8,12,20,25,25 top 24309:1 24337:9 24361:16 24417:21 24436:7 topic 24299:24 24304:8 24344:4 24351:2,4,4 24354:1 24387:1 24399:20,23 24413:11,12 24415:7 24426:2,7,8 24429:22 24447:19,20,24 total 24314:3,17 24348:16 24429:10 totality 24320:6 touched 24413:19 tough 24355:18,20 track 24314:24 24320:12 tracking 24345:9 traditional 24388:21</p>	<p>24394:8 24401:14 tragic 24424:15 training 24303:8 24356:22 24357:7 24360:20 24362:21 24374:6 transcriber 24434:22 transcribers 24365:5 transcript 24299:6 transcripts 24382:8 translation 24314:24 transport 24365:18 transported 24355:23 24357:3 travelled 24447:16 traverse 24311:4 24354:9 treated 24323:25 treatment 24379:1 trees 24435:16 trend 24349:8 trials 24438:4 tried 24301:4 24309:2 24428:11 24429:4 triggered 24319:11 24322:11 24349:5 trip 24314:21 trouble 24365:5 24394:23 TRT 24340:6,19 24345:11 24372:13 24373:13 24375:2 true 24347:25 24348:2 24392:24 24404:14 24438:1,25 24439:8 trust 24449:19 truth 24306:7 24367:25 24437:17 try 24337:9 24338:17 24339:6 24363:6 24374:16 24416:24 24446:19 trying 24312:3 24332:11,22 24344:19 24361:7 24389:9 24391:5,11 24409:1 24419:25 24429:12 24430:1 24439:13 Tsiloane 24316:10 Tuesday 24314:10,11 24342:6,7 24350:16 turn 24299:19 24378:9 24446:14 turned 24322:11 24347:24 24354:19 24354:22,24 24436:17 twice 24431:22 two 24302:25 24303:19 24316:17,19,24 24317:1,3,8,19 24318:5,14 24319:1,9 24319:22 24320:1 24321:15,17 24322:7 24322:12 24323:7,10</p>	<p>24324:17 24325:4 24326:12 24335:17 24336:6 24347:9,23 24348:3,5,22 24350:8 24350:10 24356:4 24360:9 24380:8 24387:24 24397:10 24400:7 24404:20 24405:7 24417:17,19 24417:20 24420:9 24421:14 24439:11 24440:25 24441:21 24444:17,17 24449:16 type 24336:20 24346:5 24387:22 24388:11 types 24327:1 24395:18 24375:14 T22121 24305:9 T22828 24383:19 24387:13 T22829 24382:3 24389:20 T22856 24311:17 T22955 24423:17 T4431 24298:22,22 T4432 24298:23 T4560 24299:25 T4625 24301:13 T5442 24430:18 24431:15 T5676 24430:18 24432:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">U</p> <p>ultimate 24426:8 24448:6 ultimately 24329:1 24330:20 24331:7 unable 24370:18 24374:10 unassailable 24439:19 unchallenged 24304:9 uncooperative 24393:8 understand 24306:21 24324:10 24327:6 24329:12,13,14 24357:11 24360:7 24364:1,2,5,6,7 24367:15 24370:20 24379:19 24380:3 24383:3 24387:7 24389:21 24390:5 24396:19 24398:18 24404:6 24419:23 24438:19 24439:5,22 24446:22 understanding 24312:4 24317:11 24318:23 24319:20 24323:13 24324:15 24336:16 24407:19 understood 24311:14 24320:22 24323:15 24355:7 24390:8</p>
--	---	---	--	---

<p>undertaken 24346:5 unfolding 24369:9 unfortunate 24321:13 24387:5 24409:25 unfortunately 24308:25 24322:6 unfriendly 24393:7 unidentified 24443:24 union 24298:11,11 unit 24313:9 24335:8 24339:12 24340:12 24345:6 24350:3 24402:5 24405:17,21 units 24335:8,9,9 24336:8 24338:6,15 24339:10,12 24345:11,17,18,22 24347:3 24350:4 24372:12,13 24382:18,18,25 24383:1 unkind 24362:9 24364:5 unknown 24338:19 unlawful 24412:15,25 unprecedented 24395:25 24396:7 24404:18 unsatisfactory 24302:23 unsophisticated 24362:18 24364:2 unsympathetic 24364:1 unusual 24337:21,25 24338:3 upheld 24359:24 urgently 24308:23 24309:23 use 24338:14 24377:9 24395:22 24397:24 24407:4,6,7 24409:11 24409:12 24437:17 useful 24346:21 usual 24337:24 utilised 24339:11 24405:1</p>	<p>24393:9 24396:10 24422:16 24441:14 vary 24387:23 24388:12 vehicle 24355:23 24356:1 24357:3 vehicles 24347:17 24348:8 venture 24366:20 venue 24389:10 verbatim 24332:23 version 24437:9 vicinity 24358:6 24359:2 24372:6 victim 24445:16 24448:20 victims 24296:17 24297:1 24364:23 24416:6 24448:8 video 24369:4,7,15,24 24370:1,19 24425:21 view 24296:9 24323:18 24335:19 24336:23 24342:21 24343:1 24344:25 24347:2 24380:2 24384:22,24 24390:15 24402:13 24427:8 24443:14 views 24363:23 24375:9 violence 24313:16,24 24319:18 24339:8 24386:15,23 24388:13 24396:7,15 24396:17 24397:9,24 24399:7,9 24401:1 24402:9 24403:2,6 24404:2 24412:20 violent 24405:5 virtually 24408:7 visible 24413:24 24414:9,15,22 24422:16 visuals 24424:8 volume 24315:1</p>	<p>24396:21 wasn't 24336:4 24347:25 24390:23 24407:17,18 wasn't 24310:11 waste 24438:21 wastes 24354:23 watch 24447:22 way 24297:17 24303:9 24320:21 24326:5 24328:2 24330:4 24343:18 24355:15 24359:17 24360:4,5 24360:12 24362:6,14 24367:18,20,21 24373:17 24375:13 24383:18 24390:14 24400:25 24406:6 24407:21 24413:19 24421:18 24444:12 24447:1 24449:23 ways 24342:2 24393:10 24396:23 weapon 24417:13 weapons 24345:12 24388:21 24394:8 24395:12 24398:2 24401:14 24405:12 24405:13 24408:17 wear 24344:19 wearing 24417:5 Wednesday 24314:12 24341:23 24342:3,8 24350:16 24407:24 24411:22 week 24306:8 24351:16 24352:11 weekend 24313:5 24318:22 24319:4 weeks 24397:10 welcome 24314:20 24444:2 well-intentioned 24359:7 went 24303:12 24313:15 24314:5 24318:12 24332:5,12 24341:13,14 24350:14 24354:16 24404:3 24430:17 24431:14 24435:22 24443:6 24446:9 weren't 24305:14 24333:7 24442:7 weren't 24347:24 24411:17 West 24316:8 we'll 24296:19,20 24298:1,6 24301:25 24344:9,11 24352:4 24360:16 24426:6,14 24426:15 24430:17 24433:14 24436:6,15 24439:2 24442:20 we're 24302:4 24359:13 24362:8</p>	<p>24363:23 24389:16 24425:2,5,19 24427:16 24442:15 we've 24302:1,2,5 24328:4 24330:7 24341:16,16 24375:9 24405:2 24424:1,2 24427:17 24431:21 24435:1 24437:18 24440:11,11 we'll 24315:8 24374:16 24400:4 24412:4 24449:11,21 we're 24369:10 24371:13 24415:21 24415:25 24416:9 24419:14 24445:2,23 24448:20 we've 24366:18 24367:7 24372:17 24399:9 24419:14 24420:2 24449:7 what's 24346:7 24355:9 24377:7 24404:23 24422:10 24423:23 24430:19 24437:17 whilst 24344:20 24390:11,12,22,22 24430:1 who'd 24333:8 who's 24405:5 wielding 24373:13 wire 24412:23 wise 24437:19 wish 24315:10 24400:14 24416:1,19 24430:20 24437:20 wishes 24369:17 withdraw 24342:10 24414:4 witness 24302:8 24306:19 24311:24 24322:19 24359:11 24359:17 24363:10 24363:21 24364:7 24366:8,22 24367:3,9 24368:1 24375:3 24381:15 24382:21 24384:12 24399:25 24420:6 24424:10,12 24427:21 24429:2 24430:9 24431:18 24433:14 24438:16 24441:23 24444:7,11 24444:23,24 24445:1 24445:6 witnesses 24366:19 24406:20 24437:8 24438:13 witness's 24315:2 won't 24378:18 24393:11 24426:1,4 24426:15 24435:1 24438:21 words 24322:5</p>	<p>24332:19 24352:11 24356:7 24369:10 24390:23 24391:12 24431:5 work 24306:6 24308:24 24333:25 24346:14 24346:22 24371:2 24390:17,19,24 24392:20 worked 24330:10 24387:3,3 24396:2 workers 24316:15 24347:16 working 24353:18 24396:3 works 24328:3 24330:4 24334:1 24336:4 24419:22 wouldn't 24353:14 24362:5 wouldn't 24309:3 24367:22 24399:23 24415:20 wound 24362:24 24363:4 24443:19 24444:3,14,15,21,22 24445:11 24446:8,8 24447:9,12,13 wounds 24444:13,13,17 24444:17 24446:13 wrist 24447:10 write 24325:4,4 writes 24401:1 writing 24362:14 24370:3 written 24325:21 wrong 24300:9 24335:19 24348:21 24356:8 24398:6 24412:19 24449:2 wrongdoing 24324:5 24324:12 Wyk 24446:13,23</p>
X				
<p>Xalabile 24297:6 24448:12 24449:5 Xhosa 24378:18 24416:18</p>				
Y				
<p>Y 24448:17 year 24406:10 yesterday 24313:10 24385:17 24413:21 24414:14 Yona 24379:10 young 24357:9 you'll 24296:19 24297:14 24356:7 24362:6 24377:25 24421:3 24441:18 you're 24296:3 24298:16 24302:7 24306:21 24332:20 24344:15 24358:9</p>				

<p>24363:9 24364:1 24365:6 24374:20 24375:11 24379:24 24393:24 24400:11 24426:18 24432:17 24440:16,20 24441:2 24441:10,23 you've 24304:18 24328:10 24343:18 24344:4 24353:14 24379:11 24392:12 24438:13 24441:19 Y-A-B-O 24448:24,25</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Z</p> <p>Zimbabwe 24379:10 Zokwana 24298:14 24299:11,13,19 24300:8,12,17,23 24301:17 24302:14 24302:15,19,24 24303:3,17 24304:7 24304:21,25 24305:2 24305:4 24306:10,12 24307:16 24308:7,12 24351:22 24352:5,22 24352:25 24353:4 24406:5 24407:23 24408:8 zoom 24418:12 Zwelimangele 24434:4 Zyl 24316:10 Z-W 24434:4</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">0</p> <p>000 24303:5,5 24387:17 24387:17 24388:3,4,7 24388:13 24391:12 24391:12 24392:7,7 24392:12 24393:15 24393:15 24394:19 24401:7 0087 24445:14 0088 24445:14 09:11 24296:2 09:31 24307:4 09:51 24320:4</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <p>1 24311:12,20,21 24339:5,5 24340:8,13 24341:13 24354:5 24355:4 24364:21 24381:5 24383:19 24422:1 1:30 24411:7,11,17 24412:16 24413:5 10 24297:18 24313:11 24344:11 24383:14 24387:17 24388:3,7 24388:13 24391:12 24392:12 24393:15 24414:17 24425:11 24425:20 24430:18 24430:25 24431:1 24447:14</p>	<p>10:11 24334:17 10:48 24344:14 101 24303:12 10847 24303:12 11 24296:1 24402:8 24405:10 11th 24299:22 11:08 24356:15 11:27 24365:24 114 24427:13,16,22,25 12 24299:20 24305:1 24383:19 24390:20 24402:7 12th 24299:23 24303:16,17,19 24304:4 24305:2,14 24307:6,9,21 24308:1 24308:8 24310:4,8 24337:3 24349:10,12 24349:24 24351:9 24352:22 12:08 24374:19 12:15 24369:23 12:27 24385:1 12:47 24395:19 13 24301:14 24302:5 24313:10 24390:19 24390:20 24414:16 13th 24311:2,4 24318:19 24332:10 24335:13 24338:18 24338:20 24343:1,3,4 24343:9,25 24344:23 24346:22 24350:6 24421:19 13:54 24400:10 136 24339:18 14 24299:25 24300:4,6 24427:1 24447:6,7 14th 24318:21,23 24421:25 14:14 24410:10 14:34 24420:21 142 24340:15 144 24340:21 145 24340:21 146 24340:22 147 24340:23 15 24298:23 24305:9 24401:7 15th 24308:13 24406:5 15:07 24426:17 15:27 24438:11 15:45 24443:1 16 24298:23 24305:1 24387:14 24426:24 16th 24339:21 24341:2 24341:14,20 24393:11 24404:16 24406:15 24409:19 24410:2 24415:22,25 24440:5,14 16:56 24415:9 17 24378:7,9 24380:20 24380:22 17:11 24417:16</p>	<p>18 24298:23 24388:9 183 24304:24 24305:9 188 24311:11,17 24382:1 24387:13 189 24423:16,17 24426:23 19 24386:25 193 24354:11 1994 24385:7,11 24386:15 24396:20 24397:3 24398:13,18 24398:25 24399:3,9 24401:1 1997 24402:1 1998 24402:1 1999 24402:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>2 24299:25 24300:4,6 24303:5 24340:11,20 24355:5 24365:19 24372:6 24387:17,19 24387:24,24 24388:2 24388:5,12 24425:22 24429:11 24430:10 24430:18,25 24431:1 20 24305:9 24340:9 24354:12 24382:3,13 24447:14 20h00 24316:4 2012 24299:20 24310:4 24310:8 24332:10 24346:22 24352:23 24393:11,22 24395:23 24396:8 24404:17 24406:2,11 2014 24296:1 21 24303:13,14 24365:9 24387:14 22 24379:12 24430:18 24432:4,13,14 22120 24304:24 22122 24305:9 223 24415:15 22827 24382:3 24383:14 22829 24382:9,10 24389:1 22856 24311:12,14 22955 24423:25 24424:4 22979 24426:25 22982 24426:24 22985 24424:1 23 24423:17 24424:3,5 24427:1,2 23587 24354:12 23588 24354:14 23589 24354:13 24 24309:14 24432:4,13 24432:15 25 24340:10 263 24443:7,10 265 24420:9 27 24314:2 24350:13 294 24443:7</p>	<p>295 24445:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <p>3 24303:5 24362:25 24363:12 24391:12 24392:7 24399:20,23 24426:14 24430:1 24435:23 24445:23 300 24387:19,24,25 24388:2,6,12 31 24315:19,23,24 24317:19 24319:12 24322:25 24324:2 32 24334:10 322 24445:14 33 24333:3,14 34 24440:4,13 36 24335:2 24336:11 37 24335:2 24336:11 24342:23 24345:17 37mm 24407:5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <p>4 24392:7 24447:9 4.3 24444:18,19 4.4 24444:18,20 4.5 24443:14,16 24444:22 4[G 24447:6,8 400 24314:5,5 41 24298:22 24299:1,2 24299:3,5 42 24299:25 43 24301:13,22 4431 24299:7,8 4625 24301:24 24302:2 24302:3,4 4635 24302:1,1,2 48.1 24433:15 24434:1 24435:6,9 48.2 24433:15 24434:2 24434:9 48.3 24433:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <p>5 24363:12 24388:3,4,4 24388:7,13 24393:15 24394:19 24429:1 24435:4 24445:14 24446:7,8 5.8.1 24379:3 50 24402:2 24430:18,18 24431:15 53 24340:7 5442 24431:2,16 5676 24432:10,12 576 24442:10,13 578 24442:6,8 58 24370:25 24371:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <p>6 24311:13,20,21 24389:1,20 24401:3,6 24401:15,22,25 24423:17 24424:3,5 60 24416:4</p>	<p>600 24314:17 67 24341:10 68 24341:19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <p>7 24382:3 24401:25 24402:4,7 7th 24384:8 70 24314:4 24350:14 702 24446:15 721 24446:14 74 24340:11 750 24314:6 76 24340:6</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <p>8 24303:13,14 24354:13 24383:14 88 24311:11</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <p>9 24298:23 24389:1,20 24448:3 24449:9,10 24449:12 24450:1 94 24396:1,14 24398:21 24398:21 96 24404:3</p>
---	--	---	---	---