

Page 1618

1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 19 NOVEMBER 2012]
 2 [10:16] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. We
 3 were due to start at half past nine, but I am informed that
 4 there was a misunderstanding and a number of those who are
 5 appearing were under the impression we were going to start
 6 at 10 o'clock. That explains why we didn't start before
 7 10, and thereafter there've discussions with the evidence
 8 leaders in relation to the programme for the week, which
 9 has also taken up time. I am sorry if any members of the –
 10 we apologise to any members of the public who were in the
 11 auditorium waiting from half past nine. We don't intend to
 12 be as unpunctual as we do this morning. Yes, Mr Madlanga?
 13 We still have the Brigadier here. Yes, Brigadier, you are
 14 still under the oath that you took last week. I must
 15 remind you of that. Mr Tip, you were cross-examining as
 16 far as I remember.
 17 MR TIP SC: That is correct, Mr
 18 Arbitrator.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: Do you have any further
 20 cross-examination?
 21 MR TIP SC: I do have some further cross-
 22 examination.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed.
 24 MR TIP SC: Thank you. Brigadier, I have
 25 some questions for you which are largely going to go around

Page 1619

1 the topic of the training and the equipment that you deal
 2 with in your training section, particularly in relation to
 3 crowd management and the operation of the functions of the
 4 public order policing unit. Before I do that, I just have
 5 a few preliminary questions to clarify just what your
 6 position is. I take it that you are in the national office
 7 in respect of training of various units.
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, I am
 9 co-ordinating courses for tactical units, so my function is
 10 to arrange that the course that they place, that the
 11 material is available, and the trainers are available, that
 12 the facilities is available. I am not a subject expert on
 13 all the courses that I presented, or that I alluded that
 14 people are trained in.
 15 MR TIP SC: Would I be correct to think
 16 that there is an important interface between training and
 17 the operations divisions of the police service?
 18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The process that is
 19 followed when a need is identified for training is that
 20 such a need by the operational units would be raised with
 21 our curriculum development and research fraternity, and
 22 they would do the research and compile the training modules
 23 which is then presented to the forth and back process
 24 between operational people and the curriculum developers.
 25 MR TIP SC: Would it therefore be so that

Page 1620

1 the overview that you presented to us in exhibit Q reflects
 2 the current state of the approach to training, the use of
 3 equipment in conjunction with operations?
 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct.
 5 MR TIP SC: I want to touch very briefly
 6 on an aspect of the basic training programme that you have
 7 dealt with, and it might be useful for us to have reference
 8 to slide number 18, of your presentation. Do you have it,
 9 Brigadier?
 10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I do.
 11 MR TIP SC: You will see there that you
 12 deal with the basic training that is offered to all
 13 candidate policemen, is that correct?
 14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 15 MR TIP SC: And there in slide 18, you
 16 say you say that "crowd management is presented
 17 theoretically in the programme, and that it is presented at
 18 this level only in respect of first responders in crowd
 19 management, before specialised trained members arrive."
 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 21 MR TIP SC: I take it that that implies
 22 that the basic training at this level is of a very
 23 elementary sort.
 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct. This
 25 is for the police officer on patrol that comes around a

Page 1621

1 spontaneous crowd forming, how to report that, and know the
 2 legislation, when it's transgressed or not.
 3 MR TIP SC: The reference to specialised
 4 trained members, would that be a reference to public order
 5 policing? I am going to call them POP.
 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, that is a
 7 reference to public order police members or other units
 8 that can assist with the crowd situation.
 9 MR TIP SC: Other units might assist but
 10 the specialist training is given only to POP.
 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 12 MR TIP SC: And just to be sure that we
 13 are clear, a unit such as the STS, which you describe as an
 14 elite technical assault unit, that would not be concerned
 15 with crowd management training, is that right?
 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Not on a day to – no,
 17 they aren't concerned with crowd management training.
 18 MR TIP SC: And broadly that will be true
 19 also of the TST and the NIU?
 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 21 MR TIP SC: Brigadier, it's clear from
 22 your presentation that the police service is very concerned
 23 to avoid loss of life and serious injury in crowd
 24 management circumstances.
 25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

Page 1622

1 MR TIP SC: And we have heard, presumably
 2 in pursuance of that objective, that POP members carry only
 3 non-lethal equipment.
 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct,
 5 Public Order Policemen is issued with shotguns for crowd
 6 management, but I believe that they would carry side arms
 7 for personal protection in other cases.
 8 MR TIP SC: You deal –
 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I can just say, sorry,
 10 I can just say we focus on the shotgun during the training,
 11 not as such the pistols, so I cannot definitely say that
 12 POP members would be carrying a pistol or not, but I assume
 13 that they would because it's going to a scene not
 14 necessarily encountering crowd management situation, they
 15 need to be armed.
 16 MR TIP SC: Well, I am sure, Brigadier,
 17 that we will clarify the position with other witnesses in
 18 respect of side arms, but a side arm would not be carried
 19 by a POP member in order to be used for crowd management
 20 purposes. Is that fair?
 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If a crowd management
 22 situation turns around into a violent situation, I don't
 23 think that the shotgun with rubber, would be sufficient,
 24 and I believe that is the reason why police officers are
 25 issued with side arms to protect themselves. As I said

Page 1623

1 again, the course focuses on non-lethal methods of dealing
 2 with crowd management.
 3 MR TIP SC: And the shotgun is issued
 4 only for the discharge of rubber bullets, or as we now know
 5 rubber balls.
 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 7 MR TIP SC: Yes. I am going to return to
 8 that shortly, but I wanted firstly just to take you to
 9 slide 23, where you describe the mandate that is given to
 10 public order policing.
 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 12 MR TIP SC: And you describe in essence,
 13 that it is there to do, to deal with crowd management and
 14 crowd unrest situations, and then there's a phrase that
 15 goes as follows, "where classic policing strategies are not
 16 equipped to deal with a situation," I wonder if you could
 17 just clarify for us what that phrase entails, "classic
 18 policing strategies?"
 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That would be the
 20 people that we spoke about in the basic police training,
 21 that they've only a basic understanding of crowd
 22 management. They would get to a scene, maybe inform the
 23 person on the scene that this is an illegal gathering, and
 24 they could not deal with it, and that is classical policing
 25 that we are referring to and that is when the specialists,

Page 1624

1 which is POP, is called in to deal with the situation.
 2 MR TIP SC: Crowd management and crowd
 3 unrest situations permit of course of a wide variety of
 4 circumstances that a POP unit might confront.
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 6 MR TIP SC: One of those might be where
 7 there's a large crowd of angry people, perhaps some
 8 carrying some form of weapons, but who are determined to
 9 move towards an objective somewhere, that the police do not
 10 wish them to reach.
 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It can be –
 12 MR TIP SC: Sorry, I was just waiting for
 13 the interpreter. Now, I will add to that, it would then be
 14 up to essentially the POP unit on the scene to stop them
 15 from moving towards that place.
 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Well, Sir, if I can
 17 understand, you say the police do not want them to go to a
 18 specific place because of a certain reason that they might
 19 cause harm or damage or so forth. Yes, then it would be
 20 public order police to channel them to a certain area, or
 21 to avoid them from reaching that place or to disperse the
 22 crowd and using other methods to protect that target, if I
 23 can call it that.
 24 MR TIP SC: It's in that context that I
 25 want to turn to look with you at certain features of the

Page 1625

1 equipment which POP members carry with them. And to assist
 2 you, the purpose of those questions will really be to test
 3 whether a POP unit would have the capacity it stop a crowd
 4 of that description. Brigadier, you deal with equipment in
 5 respect of – at slide 27, if I can ask you to turn to that.
 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 7 MR TIP SC: You have it already?
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 9 MR TIP SC: I notice that in the schedule
 10 of equipment that is set out there, there is no reference
 11 to barbed wire.
 12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 13 The equipment referred to here is for the personal issue of
 14 the members. It also doesn't refer to the water canon,
 15 which is a separate course for training those operators.
 16 MR TIP SC: Well, how integral to the
 17 operations and functions of the POP is an item such as
 18 barbed wire, the deployment of barbed wire?
 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Well, Sir, as much as
 20 I would like to help, at this stage, I think we are getting
 21 into techniques, but I believe that the techniques were
 22 asked to a specialist. My experience is that the barbed
 23 wire is used by crowd management for channelising crowds
 24 into certain areas, or cordoning off. But that's to the
 25 extent that I can comment on the actual use of it, and I

Page 1626

1 think we should refer that to the specialist, if you don't
2 mind.

3 MR TIP SC: I gather from that answer,
4 Brigadier, that you are not in a position to tell us about
5 the particulars of the training that is given to POP
6 members in respect of the use of barbed wire, where and
7 when it should be used, how far away it should be used,
8 questions of that sort.

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct,
10 because it will coincide with certain tactics that is used.

11 MR TIP SC: Well, let us turn our
12 attention to the double bore rubber rounds. Now Brigadier,
13 you'll correct me if I've misunderstood the position, but
14 we have reference in this Commissioner to a circular from
15 the divisional commissioner operations in December last
16 year, 2011, declaring that with immediate effect rubber
17 bullets of the kind that have previously been used were no
18 longer to be used under any circumstances. Are you
19 familiar with that?

20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I can recall there was
21 a circular in that regard, yes.

22 MR TIP SC: And was that given effect to,
23 within training?

24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: In training the
25 curriculum was not adjusted and we continued training them

Page 1627

1 with that, when it comes to operationalising because that
2 circular came from operational division, where it was
3 halted but from a training perspective the curriculum was
4 not changed at that stage.

5 MR TIP SC: So POP trainees continue to
6 use rubber bullets of the kind I've described, we are
7 talking about the same thing, a fairly large, fairly heavy
8 cylindrical bullet, is that correct?

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No rubber ball is two
10 balls about the size -

11 MR TIP SC: Yes, no.

12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: But you talk about the
13 40 millimetre rubber.

14 MR TIP SC: I am talking about the rubber
15 bullet that was dealt with in that circular in December
16 2011, the fairly large cylindrical bullet.

17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If you call it by name
18 -

19 CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, is that correct,
20 as I understand it there are rubber bullets which are as Mr
21 Tip described, there are also rubber balls. Now the
22 question is, whether that circular in December last year
23 which forbade the future use of rubber bullets, applied also
24 to rubber balls or is only applicable to bullets as Mr Tip
25 described? I think that's the question that we must deal

Page 1628

1 with first, before you carry on.

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Chairperson, we refer
3 to it as 40 millimetre, because that's the only non-lethal
4 rubber than you can get, and 12 gauge. 12 gauge has two
5 balls in it. 40 millimetre is a cylindrical type of
6 rubber, and if you can just clarify which one you are
7 referring to, and I cannot recall what stood in that
8 specific circular, but if you refer to rubber bullets, the
9 police talk about 12 gauge there, rubber balls in a bullet,
10 been shot from a shot gun. And if I can recall, they
11 referred to a 12-gauge 2-ball rubber.

12 [10:37] MR TIP SC: From a training perspective,
13 what is the view of your section and you personally on the
14 effectiveness of a rubber round of that kind in stopping an
15 angry advancing crowd of people?

16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: You ask me for my
17 opinion on the use of 12-gauge rubber ammunition and I
18 believe that these, it falls in the escalation of force
19 that you are using and that it's my opinion that it does
20 have a place in the armament of police officers when it
21 comes to dealing with crowds.

22 MR TIP SC: Brigadier, perhaps I can
23 shorten these questions, which I'd be glad to do if I can,
24 by just repeating to you a portion of an opening submission
25 made by my learned friend Mr Semanya on behalf of SAPS in

Page 1629

1 these proceedings, and he said the following. This was as
2 part of a description of what happened at Marikana. I
3 haven't lost sight of the fact that you were not at
4 Marikana, but that's not really the thrust of why I'm going
5 to read this to you, and the following was said. "The
6 protesters defied this and attempted on three occasions to
7 breach the Police barbed wire. Teargas, stun grenades,
8 water canons and rubber bullets were used to try and stop
9 them from breaching the Police line. This did not deter
10 them. They had protected themselves from rubber bullets by
11 wearing numerous layers of clothing and covering themselves
12 with a blanket. Chair and members of the Commission, you
13 will hear evidence about the ineffectiveness of police
14 issue rubber bullets in such circumstances," and that is
15 the end of what learned counsel had to say on that topic at
16 that stage, and it's with regard to statements of that kind
17 and also perhaps what we have seen on video material here
18 that I'm raising this question for you again from the
19 perspective of what members are trained to do and what they
20 are equipped with in order to achieve their duties. I'm
21 going to ask you to comment on that, but again to assist
22 you, I'm going to add the following, that the real thrust
23 of these questions is the following. If there is a
24 situation where there is an angry advancing crowd and the
25 POP is not able to bring them to a stop, then what is the

Page 1630

1 next step? And the concern there is of course the
2 possibility that the next step is the use of live
3 ammunition.

4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Firstly I have to say,
5 the use of sharp ammunition would be a last resort in any
6 case for any police officer to defend himself or the life
7 of others. The next level would be to continue with those
8 non-lethal methods that Police are issued with because as I
9 said earlier, in basic training already we start with the
10 right of life and where people are taught according to
11 article 49 of the Criminal Procedure Act and the use of
12 force, and if a police officer would use sharp ammunition,
13 that would be the last resort.

14 In peaceful demonstrations that turn violent, in
15 numerous cases it is found that these tactics of using non-
16 lethal is very effective; using rubber bullets, water
17 canons and teargas to disperse crowds, that I've seen. If
18 a protest turns so violent that those things become
19 obsolete, that they do not work anymore, then one has to
20 ask the question what is the next level, and that's your
21 question, and I doubt whether a police officer will shoot
22 to disperse a crowd with live ammunition, and I would think
23 that it is his decision to defend his life when he uses
24 sharp ammunition.

25 MR TIP SC: Brigadier, I don't propose to

Page 1631

1 pursue this at any length, but I do want to repeat the
2 question and to make clear precisely what the focus of it
3 is. We're looking at a situation where there is a
4 sensitive – let me be concrete about it. Suppose that
5 there is a procession of dignitaries moving along a street
6 a block away and that there is a crowd of protesters who
7 are very opposed to those particular dignitaries and who
8 would like to get close enough to at least interfere with
9 the procession and to make their views known. The crowd is
10 determined to get there and there is a unit of POP who are
11 a block away and who are there to prevent them from getting
12 there. As set out in the passage from our learned friend
13 Mr Semenya, teargas, water canons, rubber bullets, stun
14 grenades were used; it didn't deter that group, and let us
15 say it doesn't deter the hypothetical group I'm putting to
16 you. It is with respect not an answer to say well they
17 will continue to use that equipment because they have tried
18 it and it has failed and the crowd is about to overrun
19 them. Does it mean that the POP unit in those
20 circumstances couldn't contain the crowd, couldn't stop
21 them?

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: When you say overrun
23 the police officers, I assume that that goes hand in hand
24 with violent attack on those police officers that's
25 standing on the line, because that's the only –

Page 1632

1 MR TIP SC: Forgive me for interrupting
2 you. That's not a premise. When I say overrun, it means
3 that they pass them. They get through and they're on their
4 way to the procession.

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Well Sir, I don't know
6 how to answer you because that is tactics that police
7 officers would be utilising, the POP. But I assume that
8 they would use all efforts necessary to stop them from
9 breaching the line that they are protecting, and further
10 than that I cannot say exactly what the POP member would do
11 in that situation.

12 MR TIP SC: Chair, that concludes our
13 questions.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Tip. Mr
15 Bruinders, do you have questions for the witness?

16 MR BRUINDERS SC: Thank you. Brigadier,
17 you said that the POP is trained in aspects of the
18 Regulation of Gatherings Act.

19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct.

20 MR BRUINDERS SC: Which aspects of that
21 act are they trained in?

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Well Sir, I do not
23 have the content with me. I do not have knowledge of the
24 content itself. The content of the curriculum is not, I
25 cannot comment on that because I do not have specific

Page 1633

1 knowledge of it.

2 MR BRUINDERS SC: Then it's clear from
3 the evidence that you've just given that you agree that the
4 focus of the training of the POP is public order policing.

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It is public order
6 policing and crowd management, yes, as per slide 24 where
7 it says, "Responsibility of Public Order Police is to
8 perform crowd management, combating public violence,
9 stabilising of serious and violent crime incidents, and
10 giving specialised operational support and giving
11 specialised assistance."

12 MR BRUINDERS SC: What you've just read
13 out is the focus of the training of POP members.

14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.

15 MR BRUINDERS SC: That's not the focus of
16 the training of the NIU, STF and TRT?

17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, that is not the
18 focus of the, of those units that you mentioned.

19 MR BRUINDERS SC: As I understand it, you
20 yourself don't know what training the POP members underwent
21 who were on duty on the 16th of August.

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

23 MR BRUINDERS SC: And you don't know
24 whether these members had previously carried out public
25 order policing, crowd management, the kind of things you

Page 1634

1 describe in slide 24?
 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 3 MR BRUINDERS SC: You don't know whether
 4 those POP members had previously carried out a public order
 5 policing exercise involving thousands of workers engaged in
 6 an unlawful strike, many of them armed?
 7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I don't know.
 8 MR BRUINDERS SC: What you can say is
 9 that you'd expect because of the focus of their training,
 10 Public Order Policing to be responsibility for and to carry
 11 out the policing exercise in managing the situation I just
 12 described?
 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 14 MR BRUINDERS SC: And as I also
 15 understand your evidence, you don't know what the plan was
 16 for managing and policing the situation on the koppie at
 17 Wonderkop.
 18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, no, I was not
 19 aware of that.
 20 MR BRUINDERS SC: Are POP members trained
 21 about how to respond when things don't go according to
 22 plan?
 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If I'm correct you're
 24 asking, they've got a plan, they're executing it and it
 25 doesn't go to, according to the plan, if they know what to

Page 1635

1 do next, and I would say that is when they regroup and take
 2 another decision, implement a new tactical plan.
 3 MR BRUINDERS SC: And that's what they're
 4 trained to do –
 5 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, Brigadier, that
 6 wasn't an answer to the question. The question was, are
 7 POP members trained how to respond when things don't go
 8 according to plan?
 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Chairperson, I cannot
 10 comment on that. I cannot recall that I read it out here
 11 from the presentation, and that, if I can say, that would
 12 be a tactical decision, a command decision by the members
 13 on the ground how to respond next.
 14 MR BRUINDERS SC: When you said that if
 15 things don't go according to plan you expect the POP to
 16 regroup and formulate a new plan, did you mean to say that
 17 that is what they are trained to do?
 18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir, I cannot comment
 19 on that unfortunately because I do not see it in the
 20 slides, and as I earlier said, this slides was prepared by
 21 a team of members and I would prefer if that question can
 22 be directed to a specialist in the POP environment. I do
 23 not see it in the slides, which means there's no specific
 24 subject to that.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: To whom must Mr Bruinders

Page 1636

1 then direct those questions? Who is the person who gave
 2 you the information which you incorporated in your
 3 presentation, who will be able to deal with the points that
 4 Mr Bruinders is now raising with you?
 5 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, if I may be of
 6 assistance. It is Colonel Scott who will deal with those
 7 issues.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Semeya.
 9 [10:57] MR BRUINDERS SC: Thank you, Chair.
 10 Brigadier, when you said that when things don't go
 11 according to plan you expect the POP to regroup and
 12 reformulate their plan, do you mean to say that that would
 13 be a commonsensical response of a unit in that situation?
 14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I agree with what
 15 you are saying.
 16 MR BRUINDERS SC: Would recruiting and
 17 reformulating the plan, would that be, as far as you are
 18 concerned as a trainer, would that be a standard way of
 19 best dealing with a situation that doesn't go according to
 20 plan?
 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Well, Sir, not as a
 22 trainer of public or the police, but as a coordinator of
 23 it, those decisions get taken on the ground, it is not a
 24 sit down and discuss it again, that's what I would expect,
 25 but where the commanders would take lead and say, let's

Page 1637

1 employ this tactic or do this or that, that's what I as a
 2 police officer think that they should be doing.
 3 MR BRUINDERS SC: Do you think that, - or
 4 sorry, can I rephrase that, as a coordinator would you say
 5 that that standard that you expect would be reasonable to
 6 expect from the commanders in charge of a situation that
 7 doesn't go according to plan?
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 9 MR BRUINDERS SC: Thank you, Chair, I
 10 have no further questions.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bruinders.
 12 Mr Bizos?
 13 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR BIZOS SC: Oh,
 14 thank you, Mr Chair. You joined the police force in 85.
 15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes
 16 Sir.
 17 MR BIZOS SC: Who had nine years
 18 experience as a police officer when fundamental
 19 constitutional changes took place in South Africa?
 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, Sir.
 21 MR BIZOS SC: What was your rank in 94?
 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I think I was a
 23 lieutenant, I am not sure.
 24 MR BIZOS SC: But already an officer?
 25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I think so, yes, 94.

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1638</p> <p>1 MR BIZOS SC: Now it has been suggested 2 quite seriously that the police force was militarised 3 during your nine years of experience as a police officer, 4 would you agree with that assertion? 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: So you're referring 6 between 85 and 94 then? 7 MR BIZOS SC: Well, let's confine it to 8 the period where you wore that kaki uniform, was it the 9 kaki uniform? 10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir, I've only worn 11 blue in my whole life, I've never been part of units that 12 were kaki or the camouflage, but I believe that is the 13 period that you are referring to, yes. 14 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, was it or was it not a 15 militarised unit or force, a militarised force? 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir – 17 MR BIZOS SC: It was being accused of it, 18 it has been accepted but I want your view, did you consider 19 it a militarised force? 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I did not consider 21 it a militarised force – 22 MR BIZOS SC: So the people who say so 23 are wrong? 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir, you've asked for 25 my opinion and that's what my opinion is.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1640</p> <p>1 Sharpeville? 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I know about that, yes 3 Sir. 4 MR BIZOS SC: 76? 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes. 6 MR BIZOS SC: Eastern Province, the so 7 called Transkei independent state and in Mr Khotso's 8 republic, Ciskei? 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I know about 10 that. 11 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, and particularly even 12 in the 90s in Natal, in the Vaal Triangle, and it earned 13 the disrespect of the people of South Africa as a military 14 force who indiscriminately killed innocent people. Are you 15 aware of it? 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I was aware of those 17 notions, yes. 18 MR BIZOS SC: In 1994 and the fundamental 19 constitutional changes and the democratic elections, did 20 you become aware that there was a revulsion of this 21 reputation of the police forces, a militarised force, did 22 you become aware of it that there was this revulsion? 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I became aware of 24 it. 25 MR BIZOS SC: And are you aware that the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1639</p> <p>1 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, if I were to put to 2 you that the reason why it was referred to as a militarised 3 force is because it believed in shooting first and asking 4 questions later. It may be a simplification but was that 5 the common man's vision? 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir again, in my 7 experience I did not experience that because I was not 8 involved with that and I cannot speak for the common man, 9 as you refer to. 10 MR BIZOS SC: Are you not a common man? 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I am on the side of 12 the police now, if you say, because you're referring to me 13 as a police officer. 14 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, police officers do not 15 shut their ears or distance their brains from the common 16 feeling of the people in the country or should they? 17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I cannot speak for 18 other police officers, except myself. 19 MR BIZOS SC: Are you aware that before 20 94, during the apartheid regime there were numerous 21 massacres of people who gathered, being shot dead, are you 22 aware of that? 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I am aware of 24 that. 25 MR BIZOS SC: From the time of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1641</p> <p>1 then Commissioner of Police, General Fivaz, the Minister of 2 Police, Mr Mufamadi and the president himself, Mr Mandela, 3 called for fundamental change to the mindset of the police 4 force soon after the 1994 elections? Did you become aware 5 of it? 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I became aware of 7 it. 8 MR BIZOS SC: Are you aware that a 9 special committee of South Africa and UN and European Union 10 experts were called together in order to help in the 11 transformation of the South African Police? 12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I was not aware of 13 that. 14 MR BIZOS SC: Would you dispute that 15 there was a very serious attempt to re-educate each and 16 every policeman and I would assume even you to change your 17 mind about the responsibility for the sanctity of the life 18 of all the citizens of the country – 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I don't – 20 MR BIZOS SC: It did not reach you? 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I am not disputing 22 it, I do not know that there was a special commission. 23 MR BIZOS SC: But did that sort of 24 training of the mind change come through to you as an 25 individual, as a young officer?</p>

Page 1642

1 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I cannot say I will
 2 recall specific courses, but yes, there was a general
 3 change in the approach of policing and I was also part of
 4 that, yes.

5 MR BIZOS SC: What was the attempt to
 6 achieve what, that all this trouble was taken for the
 7 period of four years, from 1994 until the end of that
 8 decade to transform the police force, what did you learn,
 9 what were you told, how should you behave vis-a-vis the
 10 ordinary people of South Africa?

11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I cannot recall
 12 specific training interventions that I attended but I know
 13 about the Human Rights courses, the Batho Pele principles,
 14 so there was, yes, there was an approach change in the
 15 police.

16 MR BIZOS SC: Did it affect your mindset
 17 in relation to the safety of all the people in South
 18 Africa?

19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, it definitely
 20 did.

21 MR BIZOS SC: Do you - had you received
 22 promotion to almost the highest rank in the police force?

23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, can you just
 24 repeat the question, I didn't get that?

25 MR BIZOS SC: You accepted that and it is

Page 1643

1 probably one of the reasons why you achieved the prominence
 2 that you have in the police force.

3 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct and
 4 that's why I am a proud police officer today.

5 MR BIZOS SC: During that period can you
 6 name one similar event of what happened in the past or what
 7 happened in Marikana on the 16th of August this year, were
 8 there any massacres during that period?

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The period 94 to 98, -

10 MR BIZOS SC: Yes -

11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - not that I can
 12 recall, Sir.

13 MR BIZOS SC: Not that you can recall.
 14 Does the spirit of 1994 to 1998 still prevail in the police
 15 force that you are now serving?

16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, according to me,
 17 yes.

18 MR BIZOS SC: Yes? Sir, has anyone in
 19 the police force or in any political, high political office
 20 questioned the wisdom of the attitude of that period?

21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Not that I know of.

22 MR BIZOS SC: Not that you know of, let
 23 me remind you. Do you remember the name Steve Tshwete, the
 24 Minister of Safety and Security?

25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I do.

Page 1644

1 MR BIZOS SC: Did he in June 1999,
 2 shortly after his appointment in the speech to the police
 3 in Soweto say, "We are going to deal with criminals as a
 4 bulldog deals with a bull," do you remember that?

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I have never heard
 6 those words before, but if you read it I suppose that the
 7 Minister -

8 MR BIZOS SC: I beg your pardon?

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I have not heard those
 10 words before but if you read it I suppose -

11 MR BIZOS SC: You take them from me or
 12 from good authority that -

13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes -

14 MR BIZOS SC: - he said that?

15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

16 MR BIZOS SC: Was that consistent with
 17 the spirit of 1994 to 1998?

18 CHAIRPERSON: Can we cut this short, I am
 19 not quite sure where you're going with this cross-
 20 examination of this witness? Obviously the points you're
 21 making may well have force as argument to advance later on,
 22 but is it necessary to get the views of this brigadier who
 23 wasn't even involved in the events of the 16th of August on
 24 this topic? If you want to ask someone, perhaps you should
 25 ask this to Ms Nkosi Thomas' client when he comes into the

Page 1645

1 witness box.

2 MR BIZOS SC: No, no -

3 CHAIRPERSON: If he does.

4 MR BIZOS SC: Mr Chairman, it is not the
 5 only quotation that I have, the purpose of the cross-
 6 examination is that you can rise to the rank of a brigadier
 7 without taking notice what is happening in the country and
 8 what is being said by whom in relation to -

9 CHAIRPERSON: Very well, Mr Bizos,
 10 proceed with the cross-examination. Mr Bizos, I see, I am
 11 sorry to interrupt you, I see it is now quarter past
 12 eleven, when it is appropriate for us to take the tea
 13 adjournment will you let me know?

14 MR BIZOS SC: I can do it now, Mr
 15 Chairman, I am going to the next quotation.

16 CHAIRPERSON: Well, make your quotation
 17 then.

18 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON: Then we can take the tea
 20 adjournment.

21 MR BIZOS SC: When Mr Charles Nqakula, N-
 22 Q-A-K-U-L-A, took over in April 2002, did you hear that he
 23 said anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed
 24 by police officers?

25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I can recall

Page 1646

1 that.

2 MR BIZOS SC: Do you think that it is in

3 accordance with the law that you have yourself told us

4 about, proportionality, is that an appeal to the statement

5 to police to use proportional force, the pointing of a

6 firearm, the pointing of a firearm must lead to the death

7 of the person that pointed it?

8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I believe the time it

9 was said was when there were huge police killings where

10 police officers were killed and maybe that sparked the

11 minister to say something like that.

12 MR BIZOS SC: Is that –

13 [11:17] BRIG BREYTENBACH: We teach, sorry, can I

14 continue, sorry Sir. We teach the police officer the law,

15 but the person eventually taking the decision to shoot or

16 not is that individual, that police officer standing there,

17 and if his life is threatened then he should take the

18 necessary action to protect himself or the people that he

19 is standing with.

20 MR BIZOS SC: He can seek to protect

21 himself by possibly being quicker on the draw, wound the

22 person in the leg but not kill him?

23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: You're asking whether,

24 if he is faster and then wounding the person instead of

25 killing him?

Page 1647

1 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, isn't that an

2 expectation of what the judges said in various cases?

3 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Well, I cannot comment

4 on specific incidences, but if a person's life is

5 threatened, that member have to take the decision, is his

6 life threatened, must he use proportional force and not

7 necessarily shooting somebody in the toe would stop him

8 from shooting back at you, and I think that is, I cannot be

9 able to comment on that unless I am in the situation

10 myself.

11 MR BIZOS SC: Do you think that it is

12 right –

13 CHAIRPERSON: May I please ask, what the

14 witness thinks about what's right or wrong when a gun is

15 pointed is a matter for him. I am not sure whether his

16 views on the point will assist us to answer the questions

17 we're called upon to answer?

18 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON: If you can show a

20 connection between the questions you're asking and the

21 questions we're asked to answer, please proceed, but

22 speaking for myself, please prima facie to say I have

23 difficulty.

24 MR BIZOS SC: Mr Chairman, we intend

25 showing that alternative actions could have been taken at

Page 1648

1 Marikana on the 16th on a proper understanding of what the

2 courts have said, what the legislation says and what the

3 constitution says –

4 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I understand that –

5 MR BIZOS SC: - and I must put to this

6 witness –

7 CHAIRPERSON: That's not, with respect,

8 directly relevant to the question you've asked the witness.

9 Now what I am putting to you, if the witness' opinion on

10 the point you've asked doesn't really help us to answer the

11 question as to whether the police acted correctly, whether

12 they could have acted differently and prevented the

13 massacre, these are matters we have to decide.

14 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON: And obviously you're going

16 to deal with it and we will equally listen to everything

17 that your witnesses have to say on the points.

18 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON: But my only question is

20 whether it is necessary or helpful to ask these questions

21 to this witness? Is that the only point in debate between

22 us at the moment?

23 MR BIZOS SC: Well, it may be a

24 convenient stage for an adjournment.

25 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]

Page 1649

1 [11:42] MR BUDLENDER SC: The commission will

2 resume.

3 CHAIRPERSON: You're still under oath,

4 Brigadier.

5 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, and before we

6 commence, may I ask that the dispensation with regard to

7 jackets be continued, it is very, unpleasantly hot in here?

8 CHAIRPERSON: When you were absent, Mr

9 Budlender, the point arose with Mr Mpfu and he made the

10 point that until the dispensation is revoked it stands,

11 this is why it was not necessary for me to expressly extend

12 it earlier this morning.

13 MR BUDLENDER SC: I understand it was

14 indefinite, thank you, Chair.

15 CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, you're still

16 under oath, you don't have to keep your jacket on if you

17 don't want to, allow Mr Bizos has his jacket on, so perhaps

18 you can continue your debate both appropriately clad.

19 MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, there is an

20 aspect of your evidence that I cannot understand or accept,

21 the answer given to my learned friend on my left, Mr Tip,

22 that you really don't know the content of the training of

23 any particular branch. How do you coordinate them if you

24 don't know what their training is, what their mindset is,

25 what their capabilities are? Is your function as, how did

Page 1650

1 you describe yourself?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: A training

3 coordinator.

4 MR BIZOS SC: A coordinator, how do you

5 coordinate something that you are so ignorant about?

6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir, with all due

7 respect, there is hundreds of courses in the police of

8 which I cannot recall all the curriculums. My function is

9 to identify the need or the need is identified for a

10 specific training area, the need is then passed down to our

11 division, we draw up a yearly training programme in which

12 we then address that need. The courses that are utilised

13 to train the people is identified and then we make it

14 happen and we would put the facility, the members that are

15 nominated, the funding, coordinating the necessary trainers

16 to be present at the intervention so that they can present

17 that training. I am not ignorant to it, if a matter is

18 raised during a training intervention I would then

19 facilitate that the research department look into that

20 specific aspect if I can't address it myself, but as I from

21 the beginning said, I am not a trainer in all these

22 aspects. I am not the task force, a special task force

23 trainer, I am not the public or the police trainer, I

24 merely facilitate that those trainings take place and when

25 I was asked to come and give evidence it was to give a

Page 1651

1 broad outline of the curriculums so that the committee can

2 understand the subjects that are taught to the trainees.

3 MR BIZOS SC: I can understand what you

4 say but the issue of when to shoot to kill must be and

5 ought to be a very important question in the minds of

6 everyone in the police force, would you agree with that?

7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I do.

8 MR BIZOS SC: You as a rookie must have

9 asked yourself when am I entitled to kill a fellow human

10 whatever wrong he/she may have done, did you ask yourself

11 that question?

12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, Sir, I was taught

13 that in my basic police training.

14 MR BIZOS SC: Do you share the view of

15 General Cele, "who are they to call us brutal, those who

16 sit with their books in air conditioned offices," you see

17 Mr Chairman, I am very sensitive to this issue of air

18 conditioning, "while our officers have to go out there and

19 respond to violent activities such as heists, armed

20 robberies and hijackings?" Do you know that General Cele

21 said that?

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I am aware that

23 he said that.

24 MR BIZOS SC: And did you ask yourself or

25 did any of your subordinates ask you, Brigadier, what is

Page 1652

1 this Mr Commissioner Cele saying, how can you compare

2 heists, armed robberies and hijackings? We in the popular

3 office, POPS, we want to know what do we do in a situation

4 in which there are 3 000 people, some of them as the

5 minority are armed, they are hungry, they are thirsty, they

6 are disappointed because they haven't got any wages for the

7 last six weeks or so and they misbehave, how do we deal

8 with it? Do we shoot indiscriminately and possibly kill

9 someone who hasn't committed any crime other than possibly

10 to attend an unlawful gathering? Aren't those questions

11 discussed with your fellow officers, the people under you,

12 were they not discussed, are they not discussed, what

13 answers do you give them?

14 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, I think the

15 interpreter who –

16 MR BIZOS SC: Sorry –

17 CHAIRPERSON: - is very good in

18 interpreting long questions, but I think you've gone rather

19 far down the line of long questions, I think you should

20 give him a chance to catch up.

21 MR BIZOS SC: I'll try.

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I can recall when

23 General Cele said that and I did not take it as shoot first

24 and ask questions later, because I have respect for life.

25 When I was asked this question by fellow police officers,

Page 1653

1 can we just now shoot indiscriminately, I replied by saying

2 the law still stands, irrespective of what the General

3 said. The way I interpreted General Cele's statement was

4 to defend yourself, be vigilant, defend yourself and not

5 become statistics as part of the policemen that are killed

6 on a daily basis and that has been my standpoint from day

7 one that I joined the police service, they have to act

8 within the law.

9 MR BIZOS SC: Have you said this as part

10 of the training process that we have to make that

11 distinction?

12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I am not a guest

13 speaker but whenever I have interactions with trainees,

14 whether I visit the course or whether it were functions

15 that I had closed off for them, that would be my point of

16 view if I was asked this and that is the point of view that

17 I always take with trainees. The curriculum wasn't changed

18 to take out the law after General Cele said that, the

19 curriculum remained the same with the Criminal Procedure

20 Act in place.

21 MR BIZOS SC: You decided to put Exhibit

22 Q together, did you?

23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It was a group effort,

24 yes Sir.

25 MR BIZOS SC: But you headed it. I would

Page 1654

1 like to draw –

2 CHAIRPERSON: You nodded your head, but

3 he didn't say yes, so –

4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, sorry.

5 MR BIZOS SC: For the purposes of the

6 record, the vision of SAPS is to ensure quality, education,

7 training and development, ETD, in support of creating a

8 safe and secure environment for all people in the Republic

9 of South Africa. You chose to put that in the forefront of

10 the document that you drew?

11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I did, Sir.

12 MR BIZOS SC: Because you believe in it?

13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I believe in

14 that.

15 MR BIZOS SC: Have you seen the plan of

16 Colonel Scott?

17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I have not seen

18 his plan.

19 MR BIZOS SC: You were not asked which

20 units that you have trained or you are responsible for

21 training, ought to participate in what was happening on the

22 koppie?

23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I was not asked

24 who participated there.

25 MR BIZOS SC: If you were asked whether

Page 1655

1 people with experience in arresting or killing hijackers or

2 terrorists or bank robbers or ATM robbers, what would your

3 advice to him have been having regard to your knowledge of

4 the training of these people?

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, can you

6 rephrase the question, I missed the first part of it?

7 MR BIZOS SC: If he had asked you or if

8 he had told you, if he had asked you, I intend using people

9 who have special experience to put an end to heists, bank

10 robberies, committed by small groups with very

11 sophisticated weapons, that he intended to use persons of

12 that background with that education as to how to

13 distinguish between life and death and their reactions,

14 what would you have advised him?

15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If anybody would have

16 asked me if I would use the special task force or NAU or

17 TRT for a crowd management situation I would ask, why is it

18 necessary to use them and if it is not a crowd management

19 situation and maybe a violent crime scene, then that can be

20 justifiable.

21 MR BIZOS SC: Justifiable, yes, and if he

22 were to give you the facts honestly, that there were 3 000

23 people mixed, some, very few are armed with firearms, a few

24 with sharp instruments, axes, pangas, spears, many of them

25 with sticks and a very substantial number of them not

Page 1656

1 bearing any arms, but at worse they may be guilty of

2 attending an unlawful gathering, what role if any, did

3 these people, would those people, expert at killing others

4 have served, how could they distinguish between the

5 "innocent" striker and those who had deadly weapons?

6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Those people that you

7 refer to as being trained to kill, I suppose you refer to

8 the task force and these highly other trained units. As I

9 indicated in the earlier slides, they all have the same

10 basic police training. I cannot comment on the way that

11 the operational commander thought that day, why he would

12 bring them in, I cannot comment on that. If I have all the

13 facts in front of me, stating that there are people that

14 are armed, remember we said earlier that the public or

15 police only have now rubber and pistols, going up against

16 armed police officers, if it was me I would also bring in

17 specialised people that can deal with such situations, but

18 again I can't answer on behalf of the operational

19 commander, what I can say is that the special task force

20 and the NIU and the TRT have a wide skill set that can be

21 applied in many circumstances, and I suppose it is better

22 to come prepared for any eventuality and that might be the

23 reason that they were deployed there.

24 MR BIZOS SC: Was the person who was

25 unarmed and there in order to try and get a better wage a

Page 1657

1 criminal, he was entitled to live or die?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I don't want to

3 comment on that –

4 MR BIZOS SC: Why –

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - because an unarmed

6 person is not necessarily not a dangerous person.

7 MR BIZOS SC: If he is unarmed what harm,

8 immediate harm does he, can he possibly cause on a police

9 officer armed with an R5?

10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir, what I've seen

11 previously is policemen bleeding that were thrown with

12 stones, I've seen policemen that were hacked to death. I

13 cannot comment on that question. I believe the situation

14 is much more complicated than as you put it, an unarmed

15 person, referring to only one while you earlier said that

16 there were over the 3 000 people. I do not want to comment

17 on that, Sir.

18 [12:02] MR BIZOS SC: I want to put it straight

19 to you that we are going to argue that your attitude is

20 that of Pontius Pilate who washed his hands and was not

21 prepared to pass judgment on what you may have done or

22 advised.

23 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not going to allow him

24 to answer that question. Pontius Pilate was the governor

25 of Judea, responsible for what was happening. This witness

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1658</p> <p>1 was not in any position, in control of what's happening. 2 He wasn't even on the scene. So the analogy with Pontius 3 Pilate is irrelevant and inapplicable, and I'm not going to 4 allow him to answer the question. 5 MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, the present 6 Minister produced a document on the 29th of August, 2011, 7 which is the Minister Nathi Mthethwa. Are you aware of it? 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir, you didn't give 9 the name of the document. I do not – 10 MR BIZOS SC: I'll read it out. "Policy 11 and guidelines – Policing of Public Protests, Gatherings 12 and Major Events." Are you aware of this document? 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I'm aware of it. 14 MR BIZOS SC: Did you study it? 15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I can recall reading 16 the document. I cannot recall the exact content of it. 17 MR BIZOS SC: The purpose of doing 18 exhibit Q is to inform the Commissioner of the high 19 principles which the Police adhere to in the protection of 20 all the people of South Africa. Now did you deliberately 21 leave it out of consideration of the document that you 22 prepared, exhibit Q, or was unintentional? 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It was not left out 24 deliberately or intentionally. If it, the content of that 25 would have filtered through the curriculum development</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1660</p> <p>1 the tragedy that we are – you will agree that I was not 2 alone in considering the relevance, the pre-apartheid 3 history, because the Minister appears to have taken it into 4 consideration what ought to be happening in the Police 5 Force. Would you agree with that? 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, Sir. 7 MR BIZOS SC: Would you agree that there 8 are various recommendations – 9 CHAIRPERSON: Just to be fair, have you 10 got a spare copy to put before the witness, because he says 11 he read it but as I understood him to say, he can't 12 remember all the details. 13 MR BIZOS SC: Unhappily we actually only 14 came across it last night, Mr Chairman, and we only – 15 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay is standing up, 16 advancing towards the witness. I suspect she's coming to 17 your aid. 18 MR BIZOS SC: We are fortunate in having 19 Ms Pillay in running the exhibits in particular. 20 CHAIRPERSON: - page you're on and where 21 he will find the passage you're going to put to him. 22 MR BIZOS SC: On page 7 where SAPS 23 Standing Order No. 262 on Crowd Management, and the 24 National Municipal Policing Standard for Crowd Management. 25 Standing Order No. 262 in a clear and coherent manner</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1659</p> <p>1 process and would have been in the, or is in the training 2 curriculum of POP. So it is not specifically referred to. 3 MR BIZOS SC: Mr Chairman, this is a 4 document which was in the documents disclosed. 5 CHAIRPERSON: I'm aware of that. 6 MR BIZOS SC: I don't know whether we 7 should put it in as an exhibit at this stage. 8 CHAIRPERSON: Well, if all the documents 9 disclosed aren't exhibits, then I hope they never will be 10 because there are thousands of them, but it sounds from 11 what you said and what I remember of the document, to be a 12 most material document and I suggest you should put it in. 13 I think R, Ms Pillay is the expert on this. R is the next 14 exhibit letter. Is that correct? 15 MS PILLAY: That's so, Chairperson, it's 16 R. 17 MR BIZOS SC: What was it? Exhibit? 18 MS PILLAY: R. 19 MR BIZOS SC: Exhibit R. The name is 20 Policy and Guidelines – Policing of Public Protests, 21 Gatherings and Major Events. Now – 22 CHAIRPERSON: You did mention a date – 23 MR BIZOS SC: The end of August – I'll 24 give you the precise date, Mr Chairman. It was the 29th of 25 August, 2011. 11 and a half months before the advent of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1661</p> <p>1 states that the use of force must be avoided at all costs 2 and members deployed for the operation must display the 3 highest degree of tolerance. The use of force and 4 dispersal of crowds must comply with the requirements of 5 9(1) and (2) of the SAPS Act. The Standing Order further 6 puts in place the procedures to be followed by the Police 7 if negotiations fail in a public gathering which exposes 8 the lives of people and property to danger. At the same 9 time the Standing Order also prescribes the requirements 10 which are to be followed by the Police if the use of force 11 becomes unavoidable, and then I want to turn to the last 12 paragraph on page 8. "During public protest marches, the 13 right to life of protesters, the Police, and the general 14 public, may be at stake. The right to life, sometimes 15 described as the supreme human right, constitutes an 16 international law that is central in the recognition of the 17 rights enshrined in international human rights treaties." 18 You're aware of that? 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I'm aware of 20 that. 21 MR BIZOS SC: Do you subscribe to that 22 principle? 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I do, yes. 24 MR BIZOS SC: What steps, if any, did you 25 take that every police officer you as the teacher, as the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1662</p> <p>1 coordinator, as the brigadier, did you take that this is 2 repeated over and over again to anyone that has anything to 3 do with the use of force over a crowd? 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: These things what you 5 just read is in, is part of the crowd management course. 6 Standing Order 262 is there; all these acts that you are 7 referring to, and that is what is taught during crowd 8 management. 9 MR BIZOS SC: I want to turn to page 9 10 and read out the passage. "Therefore key questions raised 11 in addressing the implications of the Police use of force 12 in handling public protests are," mark the next 13 subparagraph carefully, please. "Is the current training 14 of SAPS still relevant and appropriate, theoretical and 15 practical, and do they have proper equipped training 16 centres?" That's a matter that should be of great concern 17 to you, Brigadier. 18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, I didn't get 19 the question. Are you asking whether it's a concern for 20 me? 21 MR BIZOS SC: I've read you the passage. 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes. 23 MR BIZOS SC: The question is still to 24 come. What steps, if any, in the last 11 and a half months 25 did you take to ensure that SAPS training is still</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1664</p> <p>1 office. 2 MR BIZOS SC: Next bullet point on page 3 9, "Is training done within the context and understanding 4 of the Gatherings Act?" Did you do that? 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, it is done in 6 that regard. 7 MR BIZOS SC: Please tell us what report 8 you made to whom in answer to the Minister's query. 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I did not make any 10 report. 11 MR BIZOS SC: If you didn't make a 12 report, what steps did you take? 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: As I explained 14 earlier, Sir, the curriculum was influenced by this 15 document. The curriculum is handed to me and I ensure that 16 it gets presented. Further to that I did not write a 17 report to the Minister to answer the specific questions. 18 MR BIZOS SC: The Minister of Police, to 19 his credit – sorry, you have an objection? 20 MR SEMENYA SC: It's not an objection, 21 Chair, but to say for the record, there will be evidence 22 coming, explaining why we have these things as drafts 23 because they arise exactly as a response to the policy 24 position taken in the document Mr Bizos is dealing with. 25 MR BIZOS SC: We look forward to that</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1663</p> <p>1 relevant, and if you had taken any steps before the 16th of 2 August, what were the steps, and if you didn't take any 3 steps, why not? If you did take steps, what were they – 4 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, I'm sorry to 5 interrupt you. You're asking about five questions all in a 6 row. It's all bundled up together. May I suggest you take 7 them singly? 8 MR BIZOS SC: I'll try my best, thank 9 you. Did this particular paragraph come to your notice? 10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sir, I can say yes. I 11 know that the curriculum developers is, reviewed the 12 process – 13 MR BIZOS SC: No, you. Let's speak about 14 you. What steps did you take – 15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I implement the 16 training programme that is provided to me. 17 MR BIZOS SC: Tell us what you did. If 18 you went to the trainers, what did you tell them they must 19 do in future, which the Minister was concerned about 20 apparently, because he put it a memorandum that these are 21 the things that have to be done. What did you do? 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I did not drive to the 23 trainers to speak to them directly. The training 24 programmes that were implemented were intensified; more 25 training programmes were presented and coordinated by my</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1665</p> <p>1 evidence. Brigadier – 2 MR TOKOTA SC: - if I may ask Mr Semanya, 3 is this debate and details about that and all that with 4 this witness taking us anywhere? 5 MR SEMENYA SC: I was trying to say to 6 truncate that line, it may very well be that when General 7 Annandale comes, speaking on the consequences of this 8 ministerial policy, my learned colleague may very well find 9 that a useful witness to test that aspect. 10 MR BIZOS SC: I will, thank you for that. 11 Who is the head of training in the Police? 12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The divisional 13 commissioner for training is Lieutenant-General Mbekela. 14 MR BIZOS SC: Did he ask you to report 15 what you had to say in answer to the Minister's query? 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, she did not ask 17 me, that I can recall. 18 MR BIZOS SC: If you are the coordinator 19 of training, would you have expected your superior to ask 20 you what your view was in answer to the Minister's query? 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I could have made a 22 contribution, but I believe there's other specialists in 23 that operational environment that maybe can give a better 24 input, and maybe they – 25 MR BIZOS SC: Who is that?</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1666</p> <p>1 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The other specialists?</p> <p>2 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.</p> <p>3 BRIG BREYTENBACH: We can start with the</p> <p>4 Operational Response Services' Head.</p> <p>5 MR BIZOS SC: Who is it?</p> <p>6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Lieutenant-General</p> <p>7 Mawela is the Head of Operational Response Services.</p> <p>8 MR BIZOS SC: And the final query by the</p> <p>9 Minister is, "Does the SAPS training manuals support,"</p> <p>10 leave aside the grammar, "the SAPS training manual support,</p> <p>11 the background of the public or the policing, were you</p> <p>12 asked about, to put it in relation to that?</p> <p>13 [12:22] BRIG BREYTENBACH: Not that I can recall.</p> <p>14 MR BIZOS SC: Can you think of any</p> <p>15 possible reason why the coordinator of training wouldn't be</p> <p>16 asked what his view was to these important questions posed</p> <p>17 by the minister?</p> <p>18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I cannot.</p> <p>19 MR BIZOS SC: The minister says in the</p> <p>20 middle of page 10, "The international perspective on the</p> <p>21 broader aspects of police training in crowd control and</p> <p>22 management for all police personnel at all levels highlight</p> <p>23 that the training should include a review and reinforcement</p> <p>24 of applicable laws, state statutes and departmental</p> <p>25 policies, a review of civil rights, issues inherent in mass</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1668</p> <p>1 Operational Responses, General Mawela's management might.</p> <p>2 MR BIZOS SC: Did either of them ask you</p> <p>3 for your view on the query or the requirement of the</p> <p>4 minister?</p> <p>5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, they did not.</p> <p>6 MR BIZOS SC: Any reason for them to</p> <p>7 avoid the coordinator of training?</p> <p>8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I cannot say why they</p> <p>9 did not do that, Sir.</p> <p>10 MR BIZOS SC: On page 13, paragraph 9,</p> <p>11 "In order to give impetus and ensure compliance with the</p> <p>12 bill of rights the constitution, national legislation and</p> <p>13 international standards, the SAPS, must," underline, not by</p> <p>14 me, by the person who drew this, "must urgently review its</p> <p>15 current dispensation and operational approach to the</p> <p>16 policing of public protests and riots." Did you read that?</p> <p>17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I read it now, yes.</p> <p>18 MR BIZOS SC: Then, 11 and a half months</p> <p>19 ago, did you read it?</p> <p>20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I suppose if it was in</p> <p>21 this document I did read it, but again as I said earlier, I</p> <p>22 was not consulted on this document to give input into any</p> <p>23 further curriculum development or the operationalisation of</p> <p>24 the public order police.</p> <p>25 MR BIZOS SC: This is an urgent call by</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1667</p> <p>1 demonstration events, a uniform understanding of the rules</p> <p>2 of engagement, the use of force policies and mass arrest</p> <p>3 procedures, a clear instruction on the lead of self</p> <p>4 control, team work and adherence to command," underline</p> <p>5 that, "adherence to command, stated expectations for highly</p> <p>6 disciplined behaviour, self control and restrain and a</p> <p>7 strong statement that any officer's failure to comply could</p> <p>8 result not only in failed police statistics but also in</p> <p>9 employee discipline." Did you take any steps to review any</p> <p>10 of the matters referred to by the minister?</p> <p>11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I did not.</p> <p>12 MR BIZOS SC: Would you know of anyone of</p> <p>13 similar or higher or lower rank to you who may have done</p> <p>14 so?</p> <p>15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Curriculum</p> <p>16 Development, division HRD might and also –</p> <p>17 MR BIZOS SC: Who is that?</p> <p>18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Curriculum</p> <p>19 Development, the section Curriculum Development.</p> <p>20 MR BIZOS SC: Who is in charge of that?</p> <p>21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: General Van Eyk.</p> <p>22 MR BIZOS SC: Did he approach you –</p> <p>23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: And also –</p> <p>24 MR BIZOS SC: Sorry, sorry.</p> <p>25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, Sir, also</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1669</p> <p>1 the minister about a serious problem that we've had in the</p> <p>2 last 12 months in our country, Brigadier. He considered it</p> <p>3 sufficiently important to underline the word "must", the</p> <p>4 head of the teaching department, so to speak or the</p> <p>5 coordinator ignores it, why?</p> <p>6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I was not tasked with</p> <p>7 these inputs directly, the task team would have come, it</p> <p>8 would have been from the national commissioner down the</p> <p>9 channels, via the divisional commissioners.</p> <p>10 MR BIZOS SC: In paragraph 14 are other</p> <p>11 matters, what happens elsewhere, the subheading, "It is</p> <p>12 thus imperative that the SAPS must," again underlined,</p> <p>13 "urgently align itself with the following issues as crucial</p> <p>14 areas for intervention and redress." Sorry, page 14 and</p> <p>15 not paragraph 14, I am sorry, and then he gives some</p> <p>16 history which we are familiar with. "In terms of SAPS act</p> <p>17 the national commissioner is obliged to establish a</p> <p>18 national public or a policing unit and maintain the same,"</p> <p>19 and he quotes Section 17 in brackets. "Such unit was</p> <p>20 indeed established during 1996. During 2002 the POPS unit</p> <p>21 was subject to the SAPS restructuring and aligned to</p> <p>22 function the policing area levels as the area crime</p> <p>23 combating units. As the latter name suggest the functions</p> <p>24 also change to include crime combating. Unfortunately this</p> <p>25 relegated the crowd management function into a secondary</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1670</p> <p>1 function. During the subsequent restructuring process in 2 2006 the policing areas were disestablished and policing 3 resources released to supplement much needed capacity at 4 station level. Again the ACCUS was affected and the name 5 was changed to Crime Combating Units," CCU. 6 Then on page 15, the second paragraph, "It is 7 indeed the 2006 restructuring of the ACCU the area crime 8 commanding unit provoked serious criticism since it was 9 indicative that specifically from this period a remarkable 10 increase incurred in the number of service delivery 11 protests. However the reasons advanced for the 12 transformation of the initial POP unit and the subsequent 13 rationalisation of the ACCU was firstly, that the functions 14 of the unit could not be justified since they did not have 15 much duties to perform and thus not value for money. In 16 line with the PFMA," what does that stand for, I don't 17 know, perhaps you can tell us? 18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It stands for Public 19 Financial Management Act. 20 MR BIZOS SC: Oh. "Secondly, that the 21 skills and experience of members of the POP unit were 22 deemed necessary in creating capacity to boost police 23 station crimes, combating initiatives." Is that a correct 24 statement? 25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I believe that the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1672</p> <p>1 statement which we would be getting, and (b), would be 2 giving evidence. Now I wonder whether, I hesitate to say 3 this because it may sound as I am criticising you, but I 4 wonder whether the time of the commission couldn't be 5 better used asking this witness questions of another kind. 6 I am not suggesting the questions you're asking are 7 irrelevant, but I suggest they may be better asked to 8 people better able to answer them. 9 MR BIZOS SC: It is important as the next 10 paragraph will show, that I read out the second last 11 paragraph on page 15, I may just read it because the 12 relevance of what I am asking I think may become clearer. 13 "Technically it is thus argued that the POPS unit does not 14 exist anymore as "specialised [dedicated] public order 15 policing function as envisaged in the SAPS Act unit Section 16 17 of the SAPS Act, is amended accordingly. The POP unit 17 must be re-established, maintained and capacitated to 18 execute those functions, the Act confers upon it, due to 19 changes, demands and an increase in public protests and 20 demonstrations, especially incidents with a violent nature 21 since 2006, the need for a specialised public order 22 policing unit becomes more and more justified. This notion 23 is strengthened by the constant negative public scrutiny of 24 current policing methods and approached applied during such 25 protests and gatherings, which in some incidents had</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1671</p> <p>1 operational response service would be better to answer this 2 question, because they are the ones dealing with this 3 operationalising on a daily basis. 4 MR BIZOS SC: The second last – 5 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, the interpreter 6 is still busy – 7 MR BIZOS SC: Sorry – 8 CHAIRPERSON: - and then I want to put 9 something to you when he is finished. 10 MR BIZOS SC: Sorry. 11 MR MAHLANGU: I am, thank you, Sir. 12 MR BIZOS SC: Are you finished, thank 13 you. 14 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, if a point made 15 by the witness is not correct, I have difficulty in 16 understanding how he can help us – 17 MR BIZOS SC: Yes – 18 CHAIRPERSON: - in relation to the points 19 you're putting – 20 MR BIZOS SC: Sorry – 21 CHAIRPERSON: - and I am not sure whether 22 you're attacking the policy adopted by the police. Ms 23 Nkosi Thomas said it wasn't clear whether that would be the 24 line taken, but she said if there were challenges to the 25 policy then her clients would, (a), be preparing a</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1673</p> <p>1 already resulted in unnecessary casualties and fatalities." 2 CHAIRPERSON: I assume that this witness 3 can answer in relation to that long quotation. 4 MR BIZOS SC: Did you personally take any 5 steps to restore the authority and experience of the public 6 policing? 7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, because it is not 8 my responsibility. 9 MR BIZOS SC: Whose responsibility - 10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: And I cannot answer on 11 behalf of General Mawela. 12 MR BIZOS SC: General? 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I cannot answer on 14 behalf of General Mawela who is responsible for the 15 establishment of this. 16 MR BIZOS SC: As a coordinator of 17 training didn't you think that you should draw to their 18 attention that if nothing has been done in 11 and a half 19 months, something ought to have been done sometime along 20 the way? 21 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I am sorry, I don't 22 understand the question, I understood the evidence to be or 23 rather the presentation that we heard to be, that this 24 particular unit was there on the 16th of August. If that's 25 correct, it was re-established in which case, I don't</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1674</p> <p>1 understand the relevance of the question. The person, Mr 2 Semenya can tell us whether the assumption I put to you is 3 correct, because if it is wrong then obviously you can 4 carry on.</p> <p>5 MR SEMENYA SC: The unit is in place, 6 Chair.</p> <p>7 MR BIZOS SC: I am sorry, I didn't hear 8 my learned friend?</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: He says the unit is in 10 place. You asked him, was it important to re-establish the 11 unit and the answer is, it was re-established, that's why 12 it was in place on the 16th of August at Wonderkop.</p> <p>13 [12:42] MR BIZOS SC: May I just bury the 14 question, your Lordship is right, yes. Do you know when 15 steps were taken to re-establish the unit and by whom?</p> <p>16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I do not have the 17 date for that, but they are established –</p> <p>18 MR BIZOS SC: Did it happen at all? If I 19 understand the passage correctly, technically it is thus 20 argued that it does not exist anymore, it is not stated as 21 a fact, the way I understand the passage is that it was 22 ineffective and it is still ineffective, am I wrong in 23 that?</p> <p>24 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair, what the 25 document says is that there was a point at which a</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1676</p> <p>1 position 11 months ago?</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: I think you meant 14 and a 3 half months, Mr Bizos.</p> <p>4 MR BIZOS SC: I beg your pardon?</p> <p>5 CHAIRPERSON: Do you mean 14 and a half 6 months ago? This document was produced in late August of 7 last year, so isn't that 14 and a half months –</p> <p>8 MR BIZOS SC: Oh yes, before, - sorry, 11 9 and a half months before the events that we are discussing, 10 thank you, Mr Chairman. Did it lack content on the 16th of 11 –</p> <p>12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Well, according to the 13 minister it did lack content.</p> <p>14 MR BIZOS SC: Do you know if any steps 15 were taken to put it right?</p> <p>16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, there is a 17 project on revising the training and introducing refresher 18 training or refresher training has already been presented.</p> <p>19 MR BIZOS SC: When did that happen?</p> <p>20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It is in this 21 financial year, I cannot give the exact date from the top 22 of my head.</p> <p>23 MR BIZOS SC: Before or after the 16th of 24 August?</p> <p>25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I do not want to lie</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1675</p> <p>1 particular unit got conflated rendering public order 2 policing secondary and the minister's policy says, no, it 3 has to be brought back as a specialised unit and we know it 4 was, because it was on the scene at Marikana.</p> <p>5 MR BIZOS SC: I will leave it at that, Mr 6 Chairman.</p> <p>7 CHAIRPERSON: It is a sensible decision, 8 would you like to move on to another aspect before, we'll 9 take the adjournment at one o'clock –</p> <p>10 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, I am coming to another 11 heading about –</p> <p>12 CHAIRPERSON: You've got a quarter of an 13 hour to deal with other matters, until we take the lunch 14 adjournment.</p> <p>15 MR BIZOS SC: I don't think I can finish 16 in a quarter of an hour if we intend taking –</p> <p>17 CHAIRPERSON: Use the quarter of an hour 18 that we have and then if you haven't finished by then you 19 can resume after the lunch adjournment.</p> <p>20 MR BIZOS SC: There is a heading on page 21 16 of the minister's document, training of members attached 22 to public order policing unit. "Comparative research," and 23 then a reference is given, "has shown that the current 24 level of training to SAPS members in crowd management and 25 control public order policing lacks content." Was that the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1677</p> <p>1 but I am sure that it was, if I can recall correctly, 2 before the 16th.</p> <p>3 MR BIZOS SC: So listen to the next 4 sentence on page 16, "Basic and refresher training for 5 police and others involved in law enforcement should 6 include courses not only on human and constitutional 7 rights, but also scientific techniques and other best 8 practices for the professional discharge of their functions 9 within the public protest environment." Did that happen as 10 far as you know?</p> <p>11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: As far as I know, yes.</p> <p>12 MR BIZOS SC: Before the 16th of August or 13 after?</p> <p>14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If I can recall before 15 the 16th of August.</p> <p>16 MR BIZOS SC: Because if I suggest to you 17 that it does not appear to have helped anywhere, in any 18 way, what would your answer be?</p> <p>19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I would say that is a 20 matter of opinion, Sir, with due respect.</p> <p>21 MR BIZOS SC: Well, we know the facts, 22 over 45 people were killed or 45 thereabout, and about 90 23 were seriously injured and the country has been thrown into 24 turmoil as a result of the police actions. What is your 25 opinion?</p>

Page 1678

1 MR SEMENYA SC: I haven't been in that
 2 world of turmoil, Chair speaking for myself.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: It sounds like a debating
 4 point, Mr Bizos, frankly which you can deal with argument
 5 obviously.
 6 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: I am not sure whether
 8 anything the witness may have to say and I intend no
 9 disrespect to him but I am not sure that anything he can
 10 say to us on the point will actually help us significantly
 11 one way or the other.
 12 MR BIZOS SC: Well, if we record that it
 13 did not affect him in any way, did it affect your life in
 14 any way as a brigadier in the police force, of what
 15 happened?
 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: You're asking if the
 17 events of the 16th of August affected my life?
 18 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.
 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I think it affected
 20 those that saw it, I saw it on television and it impacts on
 21 my work. I was not attacked or experienced any protest
 22 personally.
 23 MR BIZOS SC: "Policing is often regarded
 24 as a function required in highly discretionary activity
 25 since there is no single standard prescription in doing

Page 1679

1 policing during a public protest. Thus the police officer,
 2 especially unsupervised would be perpetually called upon to
 3 make decisions and take appropriate action."
 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, I didn't get
 5 the question?
 6 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, do you read that
 7 another way of saying that individual policeman must not
 8 shoot to kill unless they are ordered by a commander? Do
 9 you know the word, there must be a command and not an
 10 individual discretion to kill –
 11 MR SEMENYA SC: Objection, Chair, there
 12 is nothing in the police service that says people must
 13 shoot and kill on command, not even in law.
 14 MR BIZOS SC: - prove that to be wrong.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: I am not sure, with respect
 16 to you, the time of the commission is being as gainfully
 17 employed now as it might be if another line would have been
 18 followed, but in any event whatever the document says,
 19 presumably a policeman is still, even if there isn't a
 20 commander to do so, would be entitled to protect himself,
 21 to defend his own life and I take it defend the lives of
 22 this colleagues in terms of the common law rules applicable
 23 to private defence. One of the question is of course
 24 whether the requisites for the successful invocation of the
 25 justification of private defence exists in this case, but I

Page 1680

1 am not sure if this witness is able to help us to answer
 2 that question which we will have to answer, and we will
 3 obviously be helped by your submissions and those of your
 4 colleagues based on the evidence we're going to hear.
 5 MR BIZOS SC: I think the wording of the
 6 question which I think that is based on authority, Mr
 7 Chairman, a policeman on his own or in a small group may
 8 exercise his discretion as to when to shoot to kill. In
 9 large gatherings in which criminal activity may be indulged
 10 in by one or two persons does not entitle the policemen to
 11 shoot at random other people who have done nothing
 12 substantially wrong. Please accept that as a proposition
 13 of law.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: What's the question you're
 15 asking the witness, if the proposition of the law is
 16 correct then you don't expect the witness to say whether he
 17 agrees or disagrees, so what do you ask him based upon that
 18 proposition that you've stated to him? There must be
 19 question mark at the end of your question.
 20 MR BIZOS SC: There must be a question
 21 mark. Have the police being told that if you are faced
 22 with a crowd you are not to indiscriminately shoot into the
 23 crowd without an order from a superior officer?
 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: With or without
 25 command every member –

Page 1681

1 MR BIZOS SC: With or without, - no, no,
 2 no, -
 3 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, no –
 4 MR BIZOS SC: - individually you don't
 5 expect a person to give you a command and that's why it is
 6 called private defence. The question that I am putting to
 7 you, that in our law a police officer is not entitled to
 8 shoot into a crowd indiscriminately just because he
 9 believes that there may be somebody there that has got a
 10 firearm and may discharge it against the policeman, himself
 11 or his fellow policemen next to him. There has to be a
 12 command in a situation where innocent people may be mingled
 13 up by those people that may be misbehaving.
 14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: As I was saying, with
 15 or without a command a member pulling the trigger is the
 16 one responsible for the shot. There is something like an
 17 illegal command and I agree with the statement that one
 18 should not fire into a crowd indiscriminately with or
 19 without a command.
 20 MR BIZOS SC: Oh, I see. Yes, yes, is
 21 what you've said, that nobody has the right to
 22 indiscriminately shoot into a crowd taught to policemen or
 23 whatever group there may be in?
 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, and that applies
 25 from basic training onwards.

Page 1682

1 MR BIZOS SC: Let me, with regard to page
 2 18 –
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, is this perhaps
 4 an appropriate stage for us to take the adjournment?
 5 MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: And can we look at page 18
 7 after we've taken the adjournment?
 8 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, thank you, Mr
 9 Chairman.
 10 CHAIRPERSON: Very well, the commission
 11 will adjourn for lunch.
 12 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
 13 [14:04] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. Mr
 14 Bizos, you were busy cross-examining. Brigadier, I must
 15 remind you you're still under oath.
 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, Sir.
 17 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos turn your machine
 18 on, nobody can hear you.
 19 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, please turn to page 18
 20 of Exhibit R, Command and Control. "The success of
 21 effective response by the SAPS to any public protest
 22 situation is dependant on a strong line of command and
 23 control. It has been proved that command and control has
 24 different meanings to different people. Within the context
 25 of policing of public protests, command and control simply

Page 1683

1 means that certain people must know that they have
 2 different roles to play. Ordinary members in the platoon
 3 are to execute, getting instructions from the platoon
 4 leader. The platoon leader is guided by the operational
 5 commander, who is normally situated some blocks away in a
 6 mobile or permanent command centre. This can create
 7 serious repercussions in cases where communication is lost
 8 and the platoon is left on its own." Do you agree with
 9 that statement?
 10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I believe that it
 11 would be for operational people to make a determination.
 12 Effective control can be on scene, or it can be removed.
 13 The distance, also, is relevant. I think that if it is a
 14 kilometre away and there's good radio communication, yes.
 15 If there's not, then that makes a difference, but there
 16 should be good communication between whichever, close or
 17 far they are.
 18 MR BIZOS SC: Lower ranks must be able to
 19 communicate with higher ranks and vice versa?
 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.
 21 MR BIZOS SC: In any situation such as
 22 that which we are investigating as having happened on the
 23 16th of August, it appears to be common cause that the radio
 24 communication was not working properly. I want you to
 25 assume that, you may not know. What effect would it have

Page 1684

1 on the command and control situation if that was the case?
 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Commands could not be
 3 relayed to people.
 4 MR BIZOS SC: Would that have disastrous
 5 consequences of certain people taking it upon themselves
 6 when to shoot to kill?
 7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I think that's only
 8 applicable if a command was given to shoot to kill, which,
 9 as I clearly explained earlier, that whenever such a
 10 command was given, or supposed to be given, the member –
 11 the individual at the end of the day takes their own, the
 12 final decision on that. So it would be speculative to say
 13 it would have catastrophic impact.
 14 MR BIZOS SC: If it was known that the
 15 command system was not operating properly, might
 16 individuals who would not ordinarily have the right to
 17 decide whether to use lethal force or not, might have taken
 18 a decision when they shouldn't?
 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It's a possibility,
 20 yes.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: It's not simply that, is
 22 it, Brigadier? Because it's not only the decision to fire,
 23 but also if you have a – using a rifle which you can fire a
 24 large number of bullets automatically, one after the other
 25 in very short period of time, the decision as to when to

Page 1685

1 desist is also important and an officer might be in a
 2 better position than the individual marksman to tell him to
 3 cease fire. Now if the radios weren't working properly and
 4 the decision to cease fire was not properly conveyed,
 5 couldn't that have serious consequences?
 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, it would,
 7 Chairperson.
 8 MR BIZOS SC: On page 22 of the Exhibit
 9 R, the last paragraph, "On the other hand coercive and
 10 deadly force involves force which a law enforcement officer
 11 uses for the purpose of causing, or which the officer knows
 12 to create a substantial risk of causing death or serious
 13 bodily harm. Examples include purposely firing a firearm
 14 in the direction of another person or a vehicle, building
 15 or structure in which there are people. This kind of force
 16 normally occurs as a measure of last resort, which the –
 17 sorry, and is very, and in very few cases. Very often the
 18 indiscriminate application of deadly force by police in
 19 many developed countries such as the US and Canada evoke
 20 public protests on the police's use of force, which return
 21 results in public discourse on police policy reviews,
 22 however it cannot be argued with certainty that the
 23 frequency of this indiscriminate use of deadly force seem
 24 to be more in one country compared with the other
 25 countries. It is largely a rare phenomenon and should be

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1686</p> <p>1 understood within the broader context of violence in 2 particular locality and country.” 3 And it goes on, on page 23, “In order to ensure 4 compliance with the Constitution and organisations under 5 the international instruments, the current operational 6 strategies and/or policies guiding the use of force by the 7 SAPS during public protest must be subject to urgent review 8 to reduce the use of force to a minimum. This view must 9 ensure strict measures and guidelines are adopted and 10 implemented to reduce the risk of casualties and fatalities 11 associated with the use of firearms during public 12 protests.” You read that? 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I read it, yes. 14 MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that – well, 15 can you tell us whether any urgent notice was taken on this 16 aspect of the matter, and was a decision to discharge a 17 firearm, should it be on orders of the commanders? “Any 18 decision or instruction to discharge firearm must be 19 subject to review and investigation, which does not 20 preclude disciplinary and criminal sanctions in cases 21 resulting in casualties or fatalities caused by the use of 22 such firearms.” Would you regard this as a stern warning 23 by the Minister? 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I would, Sir. 25 MR BIZOS SC: Did you attend any meeting</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1688</p> <p>1 what is wrong right? Why didn't you take any initiative? 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I did not take 3 initiative, because I was not instructed to attend or draft 4 such a report. 5 MR BIZOS SC: I don't want to have a 6 semantic argument with you, but taken initiative means that 7 you don't expect to be commanded to do something which is 8 obviously part of your duty to better the situation in 9 relation to loss of life at the hands of the police. 10 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, we have registered 11 the objection to say it is it is incorrect to proceed on 12 proposition that there was no action taken on this policy. 13 There was, and in fact POP got established and drafts that 14 we have been using are a response and a direct response to 15 the policy position that the minister has formulated. 16 MR BIZOS SC: Did you think that you're 17 required to be asked, and you did not think that you should 18 take any initiative? 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes. 20 MR BIZOS SC: Why, why did you want to 21 distance yourself – 22 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, I don't think 23 it's appropriate to use the language – to use that he 24 wanted to distance himself. I understand the substance of 25 your questioning, but I don't think that expression is</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1687</p> <p>1 of the senior police officers at head office or elsewhere 2 in order to put into effect, as a matter of urgency, what 3 the minister was suggested. 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I did not attend 5 any such – 6 MR BIZOS SC: Did you think that it did 7 not apply to you to take initiative in order to perform the 8 minister's will? 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: As I earlier said, 10 such instruction would have through the command structures 11 to me, if I was to engage and head such a process. I know 12 that the individual ORS under General Mawela, there is a 13 process of working on a continuum of force. 14 MR BIZOS SC: You were in an important 15 position directing or coordinating the training. Was this 16 not a matter for urgent attention of officers of your rank 17 – all of you? 18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It was, but it was not 19 directed to me. 20 MR BIZOS SC: You were not part of the 21 whole? 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I don't understand the 23 whole. 24 MR BIZOS SC: As an individual didn't you 25 feel that here is a call on senior police officers to put</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1689</p> <p>1 appropriate in the circumstances. Maybe you must 2 reformulate the question. 3 MR BIZOS SC: Ja. 4 CHAIRPERSON: But while you're thinking 5 about how to reformulate the question, let me ask him a 6 question. It was suggested to you, you should have taken 7 the initiative in respect of something which was, you say 8 was really directed to other people in other sections of 9 police. How does the police force work as far people 10 taking the initiative about matters that relate to other 11 divisions apart from that in which they, themselves, are 12 placed? 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Chairperson, normally 14 instructions come to say head this task team for us or do 15 this or that, from a higher authority – from the National 16 Commissioner's office, who at the end of the day is 17 ultimately responsible for all of this. I was not aware of 18 such instruction. There was a process at General Mawela's 19 office dealing with a continuum of force. For me to impose 20 myself in certain areas is inappropriate and it's not the 21 way that we function in the police service. If I received 22 such an instruction from whoever, it would have been done. 23 Chairperson, this is not necessarily a training 24 matter, but it can also be dealt with as an operational 25 matter. There's operational and the standard operational</p>

Page 1690

1 procedures for public order can deal with that matter.
 2 MR BIZOS SC: How other than that the
 3 leader of the training programme, could this urgent matter
 4 be taken forward?
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The operational units
 6 and the division responsible for that, together with
 7 curriculum development would have attended to that, if the
 8 operational responder did not a SOP in that regard.
 9 MR BIZOS SC: The sentence adds, "Each
 10 member has certain responsibilities and should be held
 11 responsible for decisions taken by them." Your decision
 12 not to become involved, are you happy with it that you did
 13 not become involved?
 14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, I couldn't hear
 15 both sides.
 16 MR MAHLANGU: I'm sorry.
 17 MR BIZOS SC: I read this, "It therefore
 18 stands to deduct from the command and control of this
 19 hierarchy that each member has certain responsibilities and
 20 should be held responsible for decisions taken by them."
 21 You took a decision to ignore the concerns of the minister.
 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It's not a matter that
 23 I ignored it, there was already something done, as I said,
 24 by ORS.
 25 MR BIZOS SC: I want, finally, to ask you

Page 1691

1 this -
 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: What finally was the
 3 decision?
 4 MR BIZOS SC: No, no, I'm going to the
 5 last topic. We have read your documents. The ones drawn
 6 by you, the ones drawn by Lieutenant-Colonel Scott and
 7 other reports, on the question of whether human life can be
 8 taken away from people in situations in which the police
 9 are involved, we can hardly ever find the word "kill" used,
 10 instead what is said will go to the phase of tactical force
 11 or strategic option. What's the other one? Or a different
 12 strategy. Are those all euphemisms used by the police to
 13 mean to kill?
 14 [14:24] BRIG BREYTENBACH: No it is not.
 15 MR BIZOS SC: Well we've looked up in the
 16 dictionaries, the common thing is that they are military
 17 solutions or military terms. Do you agree with the
 18 dictionaries or you disagree?
 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I'm not – I'm not
 20 familiar with the languages. I mean or I'm familiar with
 21 the language but I'm not specialist in that. It's
 22 terminology used by the police to indicate that something
 23 else need to be done, it is not referring to killing per
 24 se.
 25 MR BIZOS SC: I'm going to put to you

Page 1692

1 that they are convenient euphemisms which to avoid you and
 2 your colleagues communicating with each other and avoiding
 3 the use of the word kill deliberately.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, is this witness
 5 able to give us an answers that will help us to resolve the
 6 questions that we have to decide. Whether it's euphemism
 7 is a matter we as competent to decide – we hope as
 8 commissioners is competent to decide as anybody else.
 9 Isn't it a matter for argument more properly to be
 10 addressed to us at the end of the evidence rather than to
 11 ask this witness his opinion. And he says it isn't a
 12 euphemism, we may disagree. So does it really help?
 13 MR BIZOS SC: I will accept your ruling.
 14 I thought that it would be – if there is an explanation for
 15 the use of those three words over a 100 times in all the
 16 documents that they have used, avoiding to use the word
 17 kill –
 18 CHAIRPERSON: The brigadier didn't draft
 19 the documents. Maybe if the some senior official – senior
 20 officer general somebody gives evidence and we've been told
 21 by Mr Nkosi Thomas it's possible that the Minister himself
 22 may come give evidence if matters of policy are an issue
 23 and I'm not clear from you yet as to whether you've raised
 24 questions of policy will necessitate it for the minister to
 25 come, but isn't the minister or some or other senior

Page 1693

1 general, who was responsible for drafting these documents,
 2 a better person to ask the question of, rather than the
 3 Brigadier who saw it for the first time after it was
 4 produced?
 5 MR BIZOS SC: The Brigadier has avoided
 6 the use of the word in his report, but I will take it no
 7 further, Mr Chairman. I think that I've made the point
 8 that I wanted to make. Thank you.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, Mr Ntsebeza.
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.
 11 With your leave, Mr Chairman, if Mr Mpofo could go ahead
 12 and ask before I do.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: Are you surrendering your
 14 right to cross-examine to him?
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No –
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Or you wish him merely to
 17 defer your cross-examination –
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm just deferring my
 19 cross-examination to when he has done so.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofo, are you happy to
 21 take up the cross-examination at this stage? Take over the
 22 baton at this point?
 23 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR MPOFU: I'm
 24 happy, Chairperson. Brigadier, did you attend the 9 day
 25 conference in preparation for the commission in

Page 1694

1 Potchefstroom?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I did not.

3 MR MPOFU: Were you aware of the 9 day
4 conference?

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: As I earlier said, no
6 I was not aware of that?

7 MR MPOFU: I'm sorry. Okay. Let me
8 start with the level of the risk. You do agree that one of
9 the things that needs to be done in an operation of the
10 kind in question here is the assessment of the level of the
11 risk. Agreed?

12 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofo, this witness is
13 not called as an expert on public order policing policy.

14 MR MPOFU: But at the time –

15 CHAIRPERSON: He's here just to explain
16 what the training was. I have no doubt you will get ample
17 opportunity to ask questions of that kind of witnesses such
18 as Colonel Scott. So I don't propose to allow you to
19 follow this line of cross-examination with this witness.

20 MR MPOFU: Okay. Thank you, Chair. You
21 testified that the POP is the primary unit to be used in
22 crowd management, correct?

23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

24 MR MPOFU: And is it correct that in all
25 levels of crowd management, POP should be operationally in

Page 1695

1 charge?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I do not – I cannot
3 recall the standing order or the national instruction per
4 se. I would prefer if that can be directed to operational
5 specialist.

6 MR MPOFU: And do you know – are you
7 aware of the policy that only non-lethal force should be
8 used in crowd management?

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: In the crowd
10 management curriculum, as it is outlined in this document,
11 Exhibit Q, it gives all the non-lethal options and also the
12 use of force. Deadly force I believe is one of the topics
13 that is covered in the training manual.

14 MR MPOFU: And in fact POP being the
15 primary unit for crowd management, according to your
16 evidence, apart from the side pistols that they might use
17 for self protection, they're not issued with lethal weapons
18 such as R5s, correct?

19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is my
20 understanding, yes.

21 MR MPOFU: And the side pistols that you
22 referred to, that is just standard issue to any policeman
23 for self protection, correct?

24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct. The
25 side arm is a standard issue. I cannot say whether members

Page 1696

1 were issued with it or not, or whether they issued – I
2 suppose they are issued with it.

3 MR MPOFU: Ja. Yes, no, what I'm getting
4 at is that even if they were, let's assume that they were
5 issued with side pistols, that would be for the purposes of
6 standard issue and not for crowd management.

7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

8 MR MPOFU: Ja. And in fact, if I
9 understood your evidence correctly, you distinguish between
10 the situations that we read about, for example of policemen
11 being robbed and having their firearms confiscated and all
12 that, the individual attacks on policeman. Those are
13 different matters to this issue of crowd control, correct?

14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I'm not sure I
15 understand the question, but maybe – what I said was that
16 policeman have side arms to protect themselves.

17 MR MPOFU: Ja. No, sorry –

18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Even an office worker
19 for that matter can have a firearm.

20 MR MPOFU: Sure. Now correct me if I'm
21 wrong, I understood you to be saying the instructions such
22 as shoot to kill and all those things, they relate to the
23 individual attacks on police rather than crowd management.

24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I believe General Cele
25 said that in that period where there was a huge number of

Page 1697

1 police killings, I don't know his motivation, but that's
2 what I gather from –

3 MR MPOFU: Yes.

4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - from that.

5 MR MPOFU: Yes and you understood it to
6 be dealing with those situations rather than crowd
7 management?

8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct.

9 MR MPOFU: And but what we are dealing
10 with here is the issue of crowd management, do you
11 understand that?

12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, Sir.

13 MR MPOFU: And would you agree with me,
14 these are from your own assessment or from what you saw on
15 television or your understanding of this situation that on
16 the 16th the situation that we are dealing with there was
17 not a matter of individual policemen decisions but it was a
18 group decision.

19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I saw on the
20 television, they acted in a group –

21 MR MPOFU: Ja.

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - but as I earlier
23 also said, it's the individual that is discharging the
24 firearm –

25 MR MPOFU: No, of course.

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1698</p> <p>1 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - it's his finger 2 pulling the trigger. 3 MR MPOFU: Ja, no, I understand, 4 Brigadier. I mean obviously each individual pulled a 5 trigger, but what you and I seem to be agreeing upon is 6 that there was a group action. 7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes. 8 MR MPOFU: And you'll also agree that if 9 we are dealing with a group action, normally that would 10 mean responding to an order. 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes and a group can 12 act on it's own also if they don't have a command and they 13 find in situation, individuals in the group can take 14 decisions. 15 MR MPOFU: No, of course. I mean 16 theoretically that's also possible but I'm saying that – 17 and you can correct me if I'm wrong again – it would be 18 highly unlikely that 20 or 30 people all of – suddenly take 19 the same individual decision. It's more consistent with a 20 group decision. 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: What I can recall from 22 the training manuals, I cannot recall that there's 23 something specifically to that. 24 MR MPOFU: Well there is and I don't know 25 if you have the sub-documents, on page 409 - anyway I'll</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1700</p> <p>1 that – and you have to accept this for now, you did say 2 earlier you were not familiar with that part of the 3 standing orders, but I can assure you that it is there. If 4 we accept that POP should be in overall command, whether we 5 are talking about level 1, level 2, level 3 risk, would it 6 be then fair to say that the – whatever the level of this 7 particular instance would be, that the TRT had not role to 8 play or were not needed? 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: In Exhibit Q, on slide 10 number 5, I explained the overlapping responsibilities 11 where TRT can assist POP and vice versa and NIU can assist 12 POP. That slide, that's where I tried to explain how the 13 overlapping responsibilities is there. So if the POP or 14 whoever was in control found it necessary for them to 15 assist on that level then I think we have to take that 16 also. Did I answer your questions? 17 MR MPOFU: Ja, slightly. Okay, even if I 18 were to accept that answer, the POP would still be in 19 overall operational command, correct? 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I take it as you 21 quoted it from the standing order because I don't see it, 22 then that assumption can be made. 23 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Okay, I'll leave 24 that for now. You were a policeman for about 10 years in 25 the apartheid era, correct? In other words before 1994.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1699</p> <p>1 read it to you so long, you can just believe what I'm going 2 to say. Standing order 262, "force may only be used on the 3 command or instruction of the CJOC or operational commander 4 if appointed." Sorry. Are we together? 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: My pages - but I'm 6 trying to get there. 7 MR MPOFU: Okay, sorry. I've just read 8 the first sentence of 5. 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Okay, yes. 10 MR MPOFU: Okay. "Force may only be used 11 on the command or instruction of the CJOC, and that's the 12 Chief of the Joint Operations Centre, or operational 13 commander if appointed." And then the next question – the 14 next sentence, sorry. "Members may never act individually 15 without receiving a command from their commander." Are you 16 familiar with that standing order? 17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, it's as it is in 18 the standing order, yes. 19 MR MPOFU: Yes. And if we are told 20 together that we are dealing here with a group action, more 21 likely, then the person who would give such an order would 22 be the operational commander, correct? 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If you read it in 24 context of this, I think that would be a fair assumption. 25 MR MPOFU: Thanks. In – if we accept</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 1701</p> <p>1 Sorry, I don't mean it negatively. 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I was before 3 1994. 4 MR MPOFU: Yes. 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: 9 years. 6 MR MPOFU: And this was – you became a 7 policeman in 1985, at the height of the violence that was 8 engulfing the country, correct? 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes. 10 MR MPOFU: There was a notorious unit 11 called the Instability Unit which units does it correspond 12 to in this new terminology, TRT, POP and so on. 13 [14:44] BRIG BREYTENBACH: It is internal 14 stability what – 15 MR MPOFU: Ja, internal stability unit, 16 it is correct, ja. 17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, and I don't know, 18 I don't think there is a direct mirror image of that unit. 19 MR MPOFU: Ja. 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Many changes took 21 place in the police and functions were purified, I think a 22 combination of TRT, POP, maybe NIU, certain of those 23 functions can definitely be drawn back in a certain sense, 24 but I think in the new age that we are operating in now, it 25 was more purified, so there are specific units doing</p>

Page 1702

1 specific events.

2 MR MPOFU: Yes, okay, but the cluster of

3 units that you mentioned will be the closest to those

4 functions of the IFU, correct?

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.

6 MR MPOFU: Are you aware that there is,

7 if I am not putting it too strongly, a prohibition of the

8 use of the NIU in crowd management situations?

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I am not aware of

10 that.

11 MR SEMENYA SC: And, Chair, neither are

12 we aware, if Mr Mpofo can point us to any stated

13 prohibition in law?

14 CHAIRPERSON: - to confine yourself to

15 law there may be some internal instructions or standing

16 orders or something.

17 MR MPOFU: Yes –

18 CHAIRPERSON: - but what you're saying

19 is, you expect something which forms the basis of what was

20 put, that seems an appropriate point to raise.

21 MR MPOFU: Well, -

22 CHAIRPERSON: What's your response to it?

23 MR MPOFU: My response is to what I am

24 just about to do, which is to do exactly that, Mr Chairman,

25 but you would agree before we do that, that –

Page 1703

1 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, I think it is

2 appropriate for you to respond first and then put the

3 question because the –

4 MR MPOFU: Well, I –

5 CHAIRPERSON: The crux of the objection

6 is, it is not a fair question unless you can back up the

7 assertion you make.

8 MR MPOFU: Ja –

9 CHAIRPERSON: So back up your assertion

10 and then proceed with the question.

11 MR MPOFU: Chair, I can give you a 1 000%

12 guarantee that I will do that, but can I just put one more

13 question before? There was, if I can rephrase it like

14 this, there was evidence by Warrant Officer Thamae that

15 what they were told in the morning was that this operation

16 really would come to this, the people would surrender their

17 arms, they would disburse and the Warrant Officer Thamae's

18 of this world would record the scene. You can just take it

19 from me, I know you were not here, but that was the

20 evidence, if it wasn't there would have been an objection

21 by now. Are we together, Brigadier?

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

23 MR MPOFU: Yes, and between that and

24 whatever else happened the assessment that this was a, what

25 one would call a day to day crowd management situation or

Page 1704

1 operation, it will be correct, wouldn't it?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I can draw only

3 conclusions to what I saw on television and that is that it

4 started out as a demonstration and ended on something else.

5 MR MPOFU: Yes.

6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: So please, I do not, I

7 cannot comment on that.

8 MR MPOFU: You can't categorise it?

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No.

10 MR MPOFU: Okay, can we now go to, it

11 looks like it is important that we go to slide 71.

12 CHAIRPERSON: Before slide 71, what about

13 your 1 000% guarantee, don't you think time has come for

14 you to comply with that?

15 MR MPOFU: Mr Chairperson, it is now 2

16 000%, because I am actually taking him to slide 71 just

17 before you ask me. Can we go to slide 71, Exhibit 2,

18 sorry. Are you there?

19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I am.

20 MR MPOFU: Okay, can you read out the

21 last part, the purpose?

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: "The purpose of the

23 NIU is to render a specialised operational support function

24 focussed on plans, intelligence driven and targeted

25 deployments to address specific incidents of crime and

Page 1705

1 public violence and not day to day crowd management

2 operations."

3 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Brigadier.

4 MR SEMENYA SC: Then, Chair, the

5 proposition should have been to the witness that they also

6 offer operational support function.

7 MR MPOFU: No, Chair, I am sorry, the

8 proposition was very simple that they are not to be used in

9 crowd management operations, in day to day crowd management

10 operations. I don't think -

11 CHAIRPERSON: - guarantee –

12 MR MPOFU: Oh, thank you –

13 CHAIRPERSON: - comprise to the assertion

14 that there was a prohibition of some kind relating to the

15 involvement of the NIU and I don't exactly see that inside

16 71. As far as I can see there is, so far there is no

17 percentage at all of the implementation of a guarantee and

18 you may have something else, but I don't see it in 71.

19 MR MPOFU: Chair, I'll leave it for

20 argument, for me the word "not" cannot be anything but a

21 prohibition, but we will leave that for argument. If you

22 say –

23 CHAIRPERSON: No, sorry, are you

24 asserting that what happened on the 16th of August was a day

25 to day crowd management operation?

Page 1706

1 MR MPOFU: Well, that's a different
 2 question, Chair, all I was –
 3 CHAIRPERSON: I know it is a different
 4 question, I am asking you the question.
 5 MR MPOFU: Ja.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: And what's your answer to
 7 the question?
 8 MR MPOFU: Yes, the answer is, yes, but
 9 that's not –
 10 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, you say –
 11 MR MPOFU: That's a matter for argument –
 12 CHAIRPERSON: What happened on the 16th of
 13 August was a day to day crowd management operation?
 14 MR MPOFU: Well, it even less than that,
 15 according to Thamae it was simply just a –
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Well, according to Thamae
 17 that is what it was going to be early in the morning, but
 18 the question is, has it ultimately turned out –
 19 MR MPOFU: Thamae –
 20 CHAIRPERSON: - of a day to day crowd
 21 management operation.
 22 MR MPOFU: Yes, that is the part that is
 23 for argument, all I was saying, all I am asking the witness
 24 is that there is a prohibition which to me at least is
 25 indicated by the word "not." Whether that prohibition then

Page 1707

1 applied to this situation or that situation, that's not for
 2 the witness, that's a matter for argument and whether one,
 3 whatever Thamae said or whatever actually happened amounts
 4 to day to day crowd management operation, that is a matter
 5 for argument. I can't canvas that with the witness.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, are you aware of
 7 any prohibition such as this put to you by Mr Mpofo?
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I read it only as it
 9 stands here, Chairperson, where it says, "They are deployed
 10 through intelligence driven and targeted deployment to
 11 address specific incidents of crime and public violence and
 12 not day to day crowd management operations."
 13 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Brigadier.
 14 MR MPOFU: Anyway while we're now on this
 15 point, do you accept that crowd management includes
 16 situations of unrest and violence?
 17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It is difficult for me
 18 to answer, because I am not familiar with the definitions
 19 per se.
 20 MR MPOFU: Okay.
 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 22 MR MPOFU: Yes, I'll take you to the
 23 definitions, can you go to page 436 of that same document
 24 that Ms [inaudible] gave you, or did she take it back?
 25 CHAIRPERSON: Would you be kind enough to

Page 1708

1 find page 436 on the hard drive and then it give back to
 2 the brigadier when you found it, if you don't mind?
 3 SPEAKER: Chair, I am just having one
 4 small problem –
 5 MR MPOFU: We do have the hard copy which
 6 could be used.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: It is a small problem, but
 8 if you address the small problem then you can find it.
 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Thank you very much,
 10 I've got it, thank you.
 11 MR MPOFU: Have you got it, okay. Can
 12 you look at paragraph 2(E) and can you read that out?
 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: "Crowd management
 14 means the policing of assemblies, demonstrations and all
 15 gatherings as defined in the act whether recreational,
 16 peaceful or of an unrest nature."
 17 MR MPOFU: Do you now accept that the
 18 notion of crowd management is not confined to peaceful
 19 demonstrations, but also those that involve unrest?
 20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 21 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Are you aware that
 22 there was some concern about use of force in the upper
 23 body?
 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I only know of that
 25 because of news reports on television.

Page 1709

1 MR MPOFU: Are you aware that the police
 2 themselves, the senior police made this distinction between
 3 injuring people in the upper body or not?
 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I was not aware of
 5 such a statement.
 6 MR MPOFU: Can you go to page 397, 397 of
 7 that document?
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 9 MR MPOFU: That is a letter by Lieutenant
 10 General Mawela, the senior person you referred to who is
 11 one of your superiors, correct?
 12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.
 13 MR MPOFU: Can you read paragraph 3 of
 14 that circular?
 15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: "In a few of these
 16 incidents negative publicity resulting in both the print
 17 and visual media raising questions regarding the use of
 18 rubber rounds in crowd management situations, especially
 19 where participants are injured in the upper body."
 20 MR MPOFU: Would you now then accept that
 21 the issue of, which part of the body the force was applied
 22 on was an issue as far as your superiors are concerned?
 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, when you asked
 24 the question I thought you referred to specifically the 16th
 25 of August here.

Page 1710

1 MR MPOFU: Okay.

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's why I said,

3 only what I saw on television.

4 MR MPOFU: Yes.

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: And I know of this

6 letter.

7 MR MPOFU: You were aware of this?

8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

9 MR MPOFU: Okay, no sorry, maybe the

10 question was not clear. Now that you've been reminded

11 would you agree that the implication of this is that the

12 shooting of people in the upper body should be a last

13 resort?

14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The way I understood

15 this letter and I cannot recall exactly what the stand was

16 because of the use of rubber or a two ball rubber where

17 people were shot in the upper body and then direct shot to

18 upper body. The instruction and training is to shoot and

19 bounce the rounds off the ground and I think this is what

20 the author intended to say, that there should not be

21 shooting directly to through the upper body.

22 MR MPOFU: Okay, thanks, well Brigadier,

23 to me the opposite of upper body is the lower body, not the

24 ground.

25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

Page 1711

1 MR MPOFU: Would you agree?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It is the opposite,

3 yes.

4 MR MPOFU: Just to go back to the issue

5 of the order as in the command, do you understand what I am

6 saying?

7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

8 MR MPOFU: Ja, just help me with this, I

9 asked you questions about the possible giving of an order

10 at the beginning of the shooting, do you remember we dealt

11 with that?

12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.

13 MR MPOFU: Ja, now let's go to the end of

14 the shooting, if somebody says, cease fire, that could be

15 construed as an order to stop, correct?

16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

17 MR MPOFU: And in fact one of the

18 standing orders, I don't know which one now, I'll find it I

19 have to, says that the use of force even if it happens,

20 must be stopped as soon as the danger is no longer there,

21 words to that effect.

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: You are correct.

23 MR MPOFU: Am I correct?

24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

25 MR MPOFU: Yes, in fact as it happened it

Page 1712

1 is in the same letter of Lieutenant General Mawela on the

2 following page, 398, page 398. "The use of force must

3 always be reasonable in the circumstances and force must be

4 discontinued once the objective has been achieved." There

5 is another reference, but that would capture what we are

6 discussing now, correct?

7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Correct, correct.

8 MR MPOFU: And it can also be assumed

9 that if somebody says, cease fire, it means that they

10 perceive that the danger is no longer there, correct?

11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I would make that,

12 yes, one can say that.

13 MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you.

14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I think that is a fair

15 assumption.

16 MR MPOFU: And any shooting that happens

17 after that would not be in line with this directive,

18 correct?

19 [15:04] BRIG BREYTENBACH: At that specific point

20 where there is imminent danger –

21 MR MPOFU: Yes.

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It would be also a

23 fair assumption, yes.

24 MR MPOFU: Thank you. And if it can be

25 shown, and once again I'm not asking you to accept that

Page 1713

1 what I'm saying is correct, but if it can be shown that

2 there was further shooting after order of ceasefire, then

3 it's at least possible that that further shooting was

4 unwarranted?

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: As you say, we have to

6 accept what you are saying there -

7 CHAIRPERSON: I think there on the video

8 there were a couple of cases where you could here someone

9 saying cease fire and you can hear a shot thereafter.

10 Whether of course that shot any target is something which

11 we don't know the answer, but certainly there do appear to

12 be shots fired after ceasefire was said, whether the person

13 who fired the shot heard what was said, of course is

14 another matter also, but I think we can accept it as a

15 fact, based on the video, that there were shots fired after

16 the order to cease fire was given.

17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct,

18 Chairperson. What I saw on the television and rightfully,

19 as you said, it can be, whether did those people that were

20 still shooting hear the ceasefire command or not.

21 MR MPOFU: Well, are the police trained

22 to listen to the orders of their commanders, and are those

23 orders given in a particular way, in a loud way so that

24 most people should be able to hear them?

25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, it

Page 1714

1 should be given in a loud way so that most people should
2 hear it.

3 MR MPOFU: Thank you very much. Sorry,
4 Chair, finally – sorry, Chairperson, if I can just have one
5 second? If you go to page 426 – 426, Chairperson, this is
6 what is called the Use of Force Directive, Public Order
7 Police. That's the name of the document, just to give you
8 the context, Brigadier. And I just want your comment on
9 2.3, which says, "To accomplish the following ideals for
10 crowd management situations," and we've already defined
11 what crowd management situations mean. 2.3.1, "No loss of
12 life." Are you aware of that?

13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

14 MR MPOFU: 2.3.3, "No injuries." Are you
15 aware of that?

16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, as it says, to
17 the following ideals no loss of life and damage to
18 property.

19 MR MPOFU: Ja, that's what I - and
20 2.3.4, "All citizens must be satisfied with the conduct of
21 the SAPS." Are you aware of that?

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, 2.2.?

23 MR KUPER SC: 2.3.4, sorry.

24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: 2.3.4. Yes, I see it
25 here.

Page 1715

1 MR MPOFU: And the last one, 2.3.5, "All
2 citizens present at the gathering to feel safe and secure,"
3 are you also aware of that?

4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.

5 MR MPOFU: And you're also aware that the
6 TRT is meant to play, what is called a holding role until
7 the NIU or FTF/STF arrive?

8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: They would stabilise
9 the situation unless an immediate tactical solution present
10 itself, and basically stabilise and wait for specialists to
11 arrive, if they cannot deal with the situation.

12 MR MPOFU: Yes.

13 MR KUPER SC: And that they also required
14 to react only – or rather let's, sorry, let me not add
15 words to it, - react if necessary if a tactical solution
16 cannot be delayed, and we now know what a tactical solution
17 means, it means killing people.

18 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Objection, Chair.

19 MR MPOFU: Okay, I –

20 CHAIRPERSON: I didn't know we knew that.
21 I didn't know that, Mr Mpofo, I didn't know –

22 MR MPOFU: Well, it was the, this was –
23 okay, Mr Bizos, at least used what you call euphemisms,
24 the, okay –

25 CHAIRPERSON: I think reformulate the

Page 1716

1 question in a way that it does away the objection and then
2 we can carry on.

3 MR MPOFU: Yes, in fairness, okay.
4 Whatever a tactical solutions means, but these people are
5 only to react if necessary and if a tactical solution
6 cannot be delayed, is that correct?

7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

8 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, I have
9 nothing further, and I would like to thank my learned
10 friend, Mr Ntsebeza. Mr Chairperson, the reason why there
11 was this swop was because I need to be excused, with your
12 permission, Chairperson.

13 CHAIRPERSON: You are excused, Mr Mpofo.

14 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

15 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, having waived
16 or deferred your right, are you now in a position to
17 exercise it.

18 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Yes, Mr Chairman. We
19 adhere – I have the disadvantage of having had to follow
20 evidence from transcripts.

21 CHAIRPERSON: Oh.

22 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC SC:
23 And, Mr Chairman, please you will forgive me if I stray,
24 but I know you will make sure that I keep within the range.
25 I just want to find exactly where your place is in the

Page 1717

1 training environment in the SAPS?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Where I, myself, is
3 based, the station?

4 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Yes.

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I'm situated in
6 Pretoria under the head office of training, Division HRD,
7 Human Resource Development, under the component In-service
8 Police Development.

9 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Now I've heard you
10 being referred to variously as a trainer or a training
11 coordinator. Are you a training coordinator?

12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

13 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: What does that entail
14 actually?

15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: What it entails is
16 that the needs of the South African Police Service is
17 extracted. Then a need assessment is done and it
18 determined that the certain training intervention needs to
19 take place. Then that training interventions is placed on
20 a national training provision plan for the next financial
21 year. We plan yearly for that. Then all the courses that
22 falls – which is assigned to me to coordinate, for that
23 purpose I need to ensure that nominations are done
24 properly, that facilities is available, that trainers is
25 available, and that the program is presented and that it

Page 1718

1 afterwards be captured and financial responsibilities
 2 related to that.
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: I understand from
 4 that answer that you are not necessarily doing the training
 5 yourself?
 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: And you will correct
 8 me if I'm wrong, you are also not responsible for drawing
 9 the curriculum, or the curriculums of the various training
 10 – of the various units which should be trained,
 11 particularly for whatever?
 12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct. The
 13 component Research and Development in the same division as
 14 I'm working, they're responsible for drawing that
 15 curriculum.
 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: So where, for
 17 instance, you have the NIU, the National Intervention Unit,
 18 which I see you start to deal with from slide 70, you
 19 wouldn't be the person who is in charge of training that
 20 unit?
 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Physically, on the
 22 range, physically, on the centre?
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Yes.
 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I would not be the
 25 one physically presenting it.

Page 1719

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: There would be
 2 somebody who is the head of training National Intervention
 3 Unit personnel?
 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Their training is
 5 conducted currently under division ORS. They coordinate,
 6 or they see to it that it get implemented, that the
 7 coordination is done. They are the ones presenting the
 8 training itself.
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Yes, you must please
 10 appreciate that I'm trying to find which questions I can
 11 ask from you usefully –
 12 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sure.
 13 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: - fruitfully, so that
 14 I should know that I shouldn't put questions to you when
 15 they are actually appropriately put to somebody else.
 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I understand.
 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: I understand that
 18 all, you were part of a team that put together Exhibit 2?
 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct.
 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: There were others who
 21 were involved in putting together exhibit?
 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: So if the Commission
 24 wanted to know the person who is in charge of training the
 25 people who are in the National Intervention Unit, it would

Page 1720

1 look to somebody else?
 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: And the Special
 4 Taskforce?
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: [Inaudible].
 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: And the TRT, Tactical
 7 Response Teams, Units?
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The same applies to
 9 them.
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: And the Dog Unit?
 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The Dog Unit falls
 12 within our responsibility, not mine, specifically, but one
 13 of my fellow colleagues.
 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Now when you say our,
 15 who is us?
 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Apology, Division
 17 Training, Division Human Resource Development.
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: The division, Human
 19 Resources Training. And is there somebody who is in charge
 20 of training the POP, the Public Order Police?
 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, there is somebody
 22 in charge of that also.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Now, I think that's
 24 helpful, because it gives me a sense of what is involved.
 25 Now, I have seen – I don't know if you have Exhibit 2. Do

Page 1721

1 you have Exhibit 2?
 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I do.
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Yes. Exhibit L, do
 4 you have also Exhibit L?
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No.
 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: You don't have
 7 Exhibit L, okay. Exhibit L, I believe was the police
 8 presentation.
 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Is it this one?
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: It's, on the outside
 11 it says Mine Unrest at Lonmin Marikana history and build
 12 up.
 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The interpreter got
 14 one here.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Oh yes, a very useful
 16 man, the interpreter. Now from what I've seen in 211, or
 17 slide 211, which speaks munitions expended at scene 1. Now
 18 I now you, from what I've read from your transcript, the
 19 transcript of your testimony, you were not present on the
 20 16th of August, did I get that right?
 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.
 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Yes. If it is only
 23 on the basis of ammunitions that were expended at scene 1,
 24 would it be correct that two units, the POP and TRT,
 25 appeared to have been involved in discharging ammunition in

Page 1722

1 scene 1, from what is represented there?
 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: And if we go to slide
 4 257 of that document, on the evidence thereof it does
 5 appear that virtually – that the NIU was involved, the
 6 Canine was involved - the Dog Unit, the TRT was involved
 7 and POP were involved?
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct.
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: And since you were
 10 not involved on the day, you wouldn't know what the
 11 rationale would have been for an involvement of all those
 12 units? It wouldn't be a question to put to you?
 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That would be correct.
 14 The best person to answer would be the operational
 15 commander.
 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Now, in the training
 17 of all these units, and since you are the coordinator, I
 18 want to proceed on the basis that you are keen to know
 19 whether what is in the curricula, is in fact implemented.
 20 It would be – I wouldn't put it higher than saying you
 21 would have a keen interest to see that it is implemented.
 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Are there ever any
 24 sessions at which you become involved, for instance, where
 25 evaluation of scenes that have been involved in public

Page 1723

1 violence are assessed?
 2 [15:24] BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I have not been
 3 involved in any such assessment.
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: I know you have
 5 indicated that you were not involved in the 9 day gathering
 6 at Potchefstroom, I'm not referring to that specific
 7 incident.
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Ja, no others also, I
 9 was not –
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: Other than the theory
 11 that we all have been able to see that comes out of these
 12 documents, it's public standing order so and so, you should
 13 not do this, you should do this – you have never been in a
 14 situation where you have yourself been involved, even in a
 15 post-mortem assessment of the efficacy of this training
 16 matters.
 17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I have not, but my
 18 colleagues at Research and Development in our division,
 19 whose function it is, they performed that function.
 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC SC: For instance, I would've
 21 wanted to ask you what is involved in the practical
 22 training of those who would be involved in crowd control.
 23 Now would you be useful in giving us an answer with regard
 24 to that?
 25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: As much as I want to

Page 1724

1 assist, I would be basically touching on topics and I think
 2 best would be to ask the trainer specialist that can be
 3 called for that purposes –
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - because they know
 6 the tactics, the terminology, everything by heart.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I ask because I don't
 8 want you to leave that witness stand and then realise after
 9 we've left that I should've put certain questions to you.
 10 Do you understand that, Brigadier?
 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I understand, Sir.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: For instance, I – a
 13 figure has been bandied about which represents the number
 14 of people who were on that koppie in the 16th, it's been 3
 15 000 people. Now I would want to know what those who get
 16 trained in crowd control, what are they actually taught to
 17 do when they deal with 3 000 people? Let's say for
 18 instance people who are unarmed, do you have any sense
 19 about what it is practically that they are supposed to do
 20 when – and the operation for instance, as is the operation
 21 in this case, disperse and – let's say it was just
 22 dispersed. Now what practically are the people trained?
 23 How do they handle that situation?
 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If I can refer to the
 25 slides, it is somewhere here where the tactical options is

Page 1725

1 presented – I'm not sure, I can just find it here quickly.
 2 Slide 29 –
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - where it says the
 5 defensive options and the offensive options, other than
 6 what it stands there, I would believe it would be injustice
 7 for me to try and explain to you the details of each of
 8 these techniques.
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: And those are the
 11 techniques that is used in crowd management.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And you wouldn't know
 13 what kind of risk analysis those who would go into that
 14 kind of crowd control situation, what they do?
 15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I don't want to
 16 comment on that.
 17 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, I'm proposing
 18 to sit to half past four because we lost time this morning.
 19 So therefore, in fairness to everybody, I'm prepared to
 20 take a tea adjournment. When it's convenient for you,
 21 please tell me and we can adjourn for tea.
 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, Chairman, when once
 23 you say that you either say the tea adjournment is now or
 24 we'll come after tea. There are just a couple of questions
 25 that I would've liked to have explore. Maybe let's take

Page 1726

1 the tea adjournment now, Chairman.
 2 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
 3 [15:48] CHAIRPERSON: The commission resumes.
 4 You are still under oath, Brigadier.
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, Chairperson.
 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman,
 7 just a couple of question, Brigadier. I've looked at
 8 Exhibit Q. There doesn't seem to be any reference to the
 9 existence of risk assessment manual. In other words
 10 something that as part of training people who are going to
 11 do crowd control, they will be told these are the ABCs when
 12 – you know that kind of – do you have a risk assessment
 13 manual?
 14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, not that I can
 15 recall, no.
 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now you have been asked
 17 a number of questions on what appears in the SAPS Bundle 1,
 18 on pages 397 to 401 and beyond. The first one is the
 19 letter that seems to have gone to all provincial
 20 commissioners, all provincial heads, operational response
 21 MECs on the 20th of December 2012.
 22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: 2011 or 2012?
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: 2011, well I mean we
 24 arrived at it – thank you, Brigadier. You recall this
 25 letter?

Page 1727

1 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I do, yes.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, in your capacity as
 3 a training coordinator, does this kind of letter come to
 4 you and if it does, for what purpose it would come to you?
 5 In other words, I am just trying to see where in the scheme
 6 of things, you would fit with what that letter seems to
 7 convey.
 8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If I think a better
 9 way to explain is, it mentions specifically the stopping,
 10 to use the rubber rounds, for instance. Our curriculum
 11 personnel would then amend the curriculum. But that very
 12 same letter was recalled in 2012, early this year.
 13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: So, yes, if a letter
 15 like that come, it will influence the curriculum because
 16 the operational side said that they experienced a problem,
 17 the curriculum would changed and then it would be passed
 18 down to us for implementation.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So you get to know about
 20 it in your capacity as a coordinator of training because
 21 the curriculum developers would have to take the contents
 22 of that letter into account, is that right?
 23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.
 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And then an inquiry as
 25 to whether that was put into operation would have to be

Page 1728

1 more to the people who are the divisional heads of the
 2 units that get trained by you. Would you agree with that?
 3 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Whether they implement
 4 this instruction specifically –
 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: - yes.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: That will be also the
 8 case with respect to the letter also attaining a form of a
 9 circular on that same document which purports to be a
 10 letter from the National Commissioner, re public order
 11 police, use of force during crowd management, 20th July
 12 2012. You are familiar with that letter?
 13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I don't have it in
 14 front of me, but I think it's the one that we talk about
 15 the drawing, the previous one.
 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I would think so. I
 17 don't know whether your copy is legible but most of the
 18 copies were –
 19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I know about this
 20 letter, yes.
 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. In other words, as
 22 late as the 20th of July 2012, this letter was circulated to
 23 all provincial commissioners, all divisional commissioners,
 24 all provincial heads, all deputy national commissioners,
 25 chief of staff, ministry of police, secretary of police,

Page 1729

1 secretariat police. You can confirm that?
 2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes.
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And you can see in fact
 4 it agrees with what you have just testified. It says it is
 5 this evenly numbered letter, I mean the evenly numbered
 6 letter dated 20th December 2012 which is the one that I
 7 talked to, has reference and is hereby withdrawn and is
 8 replaced by this instruction.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, I take this
 10 has got to be an exhibit. So seeing you're referring to
 11 it, is it Exhibit S? Thank you.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. In the police
 13 bundle it is referred to as item 37, what is it –
 14 CHAIRPERSON: No, but the whole police
 15 bundle isn't going to be handed in as an exhibit before the
 16 commission, because otherwise you can image how many
 17 exhibits we would have. Only those will be referred to in
 18 evidence will get exhibit numbers. And so this is a letter
 19 from the National Commissioner to provincial commissioners
 20 and others dated 20 July 2012. So it is – it was in
 21 operation for something like 25, 26, 27 days – or had been
 22 in operation in 26 days when the events which form subject
 23 of this –
 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: - commission took place.

Page 1730

1 Well the culminating events which formed the subject of
2 this commission took place.
3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Chairman.
4 Now what exhibit number are we giving it? S?
5 CHAIRPERSON: S.
6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Exhibit S, alright.
7 Now, Brigadier, you indicate that you are aware of this
8 letter.
9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct, yes.
10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And as the Chair has
11 indicated, it seems to have been circulated a few weeks
12 before the events that form now the subject matter of this
13 commission because it was sent in July – towards the end of
14 July of 2012. Do you agree.
15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I agree.
16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now when did you
17 personally become aware of this letter?
18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It must've been around
19 the time of the circulation. It do take a few days to go
20 through circulation. I cannot recall specific dates, but
21 obviously after – between 20 July and August.
22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now when a letter of
23 this nature crosses your table in your capacity, do you do
24 anything about it or what do you do? Because it seems to
25 be giving some indications as to what must be done.

Page 1731

1 BRIG BREYTENBACH: If a letter of this
2 nature come across my table, influencing directly the
3 training, I would interact with the curriculum developers
4 and ask them whether they are aware of this because they
5 need to adjust the curriculum accordingly.
6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Would you also
7 interact with the trainers in the divisions – in the
8 various divisions?
9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Not necessarily
10 because this letter is distributed and the training people
11 that's presenting it would also get a copy of this. So one
12 would expect them to take it down to the trainers. But
13 this also speaks directly to the – Sorry, Chair.
14 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry to intervene, but
15 I want to ask you a question. In view the fact that this
16 letter was only issued just over two weeks prior to the
17 events of the 16th of August, had any training, any relevant
18 training taken place between the issuing of this letter and
19 the events on the 16th of August?
20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Chairperson, that was
21 what I was about to say. The curriculum has not been
22 changed. So if there was a course ongoing at that stage, I
23 cannot recall dates and so on, they would continue with the
24 curriculum but this is then operationalised to say that you
25 cannot utilise this or the different levels of force

Page 1732

1 operationally. So the curriculum would have, if there was
2 a course at that stage, continue the way they had it but
3 members would've been made aware that there's going to be
4 operationally something else than what they are currently
5 busy with. Circulars of this nature is also circulated
6 around the whole police service. So operational units, POP
7 units would've received this through normal correspondence
8 to take notice of it.
9 CHAIRPERSON: Do we have the evenly
10 numbered letter of the 20th of December 2011? I take it, it
11 hasn't been handed in as an exhibit yet, has it?
12 MS PILLAY: It doesn't have an exhibit
13 number, but it's part of the police bundle.
14 CHAIRPERSON: It's part of the police
15 bundle – the relevant point that may have to be considered
16 is what changes were introduced by this letter of the 20th
17 of July 2012. I don't know whether the witness can help us
18 and if he can't then obviously we'll raise it with a later
19 witness. But I notice that this letter refers, for
20 example, to the minimum force and it refers to the need for
21 review every time a minimal force is used. Now does that
22 mean that the letter of the 20th of December 2011 didn't
23 require minimum force should be used, or is this something
24 that we can only clear up when we have a witness who has
25 direct knowledge of the earlier letter? I'm afraid I

Page 1733

1 wasn't clear to whom I was addressing. Addressed to the
2 witness primarily, but possibly the evidence leaders could
3 help us and that or possibly even Mr Ntsebeza. I don't
4 know. Anyway I've asked the question. It's directed –
5 it's aimed at three particular people. If any of you can
6 answer, I'll be grateful.
7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Mr Chair, from our
8 side, as I said earlier, it was passed on to the curriculum
9 developers and they were working on the process in amending
10 the curriculum and also operational units would have
11 received both letters via the correspondence channels to
12 use as operational guidelines immediately.
13 CHAIRPERSON: It seems to me I should
14 actually have directed the question to Mr Semenya because
15 if he knows the answer immediately it will save a lot of
16 time. The question is, are the differences between the
17 letter of 20 December 2011, which has not yet been handed
18 as an exhibit and this Exhibit S, which was dated the 20th
19 of July 2012, are there any significant differences. Was
20 it necessary to issue this new letter and to withdraw and
21 replace the earlier instruction? I know it's not directly
22 relevant to what the witness says but it may actually save
23 a lot of time if we know the answer to that, either now or
24 first thing tomorrow morning.
25 MR SEMENYA: May I give an answer first

Page 1734

1 thing or may I have an answer given first thing tomorrow
 2 morning?
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly, Mr Semenya. Mr
 4 Ntsebeza, I'm sorry I interrupted you, but please proceed.
 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, not at all, Mr
 6 Chairman. Just as a follow-up on what the chairman has
 7 put, it appears to me that one of the issues that are
 8 addresses – that is addressed in both letters is the use of
 9 rubber rounds and shotguns. In paragraph 5 of the letter
 10 of the 20th of December 2011, which is on page 297 of SAPS
 11 Bundle 1, the letter, the circular – 20th December circular
 12 says the use of rubber rounds and shotguns must be stopped
 13 with immediate effect and then it goes on – do you have it
 14 in front of you, Brigadier? [Inaudible] matters to manage
 15 crowds must be implemented, negotiations is still the first
 16 resort. A gradual response such as the use of
 17 pyrotechnics, water cannon and limited launcher must then
 18 be used. The purpose of offensive actions must be to de-
 19 escalate conflict with a minimum level of force to
 20 accomplish the goal. The degree of force must be
 21 proportional to the seriousness of the situation and the
 22 threat posed in terms of situational appropriateness. The
 23 use of force must always be reasonable in the circumstances
 24 and force must be discontinued once the objective has been
 25 achieved. Do you see that?

Page 1735

1 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I see that, yes.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I would like you to
 3 then, please make a comment as to whether Exhibit F, the
 4 August letter, addresses differently the question of
 5 shotgun and the rubber rounds in paragraph 3? Do you have
 6 paragraph 3?
 7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, I do – paragraph
 8 3?
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Paragraph 3, it will be
 10 3.1, 3.2, 3.3 –
 11 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, Sir.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Ja, if you could read
 13 that into the record just so that we are all following and
 14 then make a comment whether it alters in any significant
 15 way what the circular of the 20th of December 2011 says with
 16 regard to shotguns and with regards to rubber rounds.
 17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Paragraph 3 – only the
 18 Beretta or Mustard 12 bore shotgun and shotgun 12 bore
 19 double ball rounds, M9A1 must be used by trained POP
 20 members and dedicated in the use thereof, rubber rounds
 21 should be used from a distance of 20 meters and more from
 22 the crowd. POP members issued with the shotgun, may never
 23 act individually but only on the command of the section
 24 leader, platoon commander or operational commander.
 25 [16:08] The rubber rounds must be skip fired on targets

Page 1736

1 to target at the legs of the crowds. POP operational
 2 commanders must ensure as video footage is taken to the
 3 crowd – taken of the crowd throughout the phases of
 4 including during the use of minimum force. A record keeper
 5 must also record everything on operational diary. The
 6 member who gives the command for action must not take part
 7 in the action. Disciplinary or criminal and or criminal
 8 steps will be taken against members who act beyond the
 9 command or use force that was necessary as per command.
 10 Every time minimum force is used, a review of the action
 11 taken must always be done by an officer holding the rank of
 12 captain and above who was not part of the action and was
 13 also not on the scene. As mentioned in paragraph 11.4(c)
 14 of Standing Order General 262, rubber rounds may only be
 15 used to discharge a crowd in extreme circumstances should
 16 other less forceful methods prove ineffective. This means
 17 that the use of rubber rounds is only as a last resort. A
 18 national instructional policy will be distributed as soon
 19 as it is finalised.
 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I don't know whether
 21 it would be a fair conclusion to make that it seems in
 22 terms of this circular of August 2012, emphasis seems to be
 23 placed –
 24 CHAIRPERSON: No, Mr Ntsebeza, it's July.
 25 You said August, it's July.

Page 1737

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: July, thank you,
 2 Chairman. Now how do you interpret now and how did you
 3 interpret then when you first became aware of this letter?
 4 3.6 of Exhibit S.
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The first letter of
 6 December said no rubber rounds should be used during crowd
 7 management and then that was basically revoked by the
 8 letter of July where it said then when it can be used and
 9 under which conditions it can be used. That is the main
 10 difference that I see between the two letters and the
 11 purpose of the second letter.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. But whether it not
 13 in the training units, this was something that was taken
 14 into account, you wouldn't know because you are not in the
 15 units –
 16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I would not be
 17 able to say with accuracy.
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. By the way, who is
 19 in charge of curriculum development in the NIU? Do you
 20 know?
 21 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, the curriculum
 22 development under Division HRD would be General van Eck.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General?
 24 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Van Eyk.
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Is van Eyk, E-C-K or A-

Page 1738

1 U-I-J-E-K?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: J-K.

3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: U-I-J-K?

4 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Van Eck, ja.

5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Eck. U-I-J-K? General

6 van Yk. And who – do you know who –

7 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Sorry, it's Y-K.

8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay. Van Yk. Y-K.

9 Now how do you spell van Yk?

10 MR MPOFU: Van Yk is spelt, V-A-N Y-K.

11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: V-A-N Y-K.

12 MR MPOFU: V-A-N alone and then –

13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: E-Y-K.

14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Y-K?

15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: E-Y-K. But I know

16 him, I can pass a message on to the general.

17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Is it E-Y-K or E-Y-C-K?

18 E-Y-K?

19 BRIG BREYTENBACH: E-Y-K.

20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Alright. Now he's in

21 charge of curriculum development.

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And who would be in

24 charge of the practical training of people trained in the

25 NIU that would be there in the field to say this is what

Page 1739

1 you do?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I cannot give you a

3 specific name because the recent reshuffling in that

4 division. I do not know exact name or the person that's in

5 charge of that. It was recently, but it can be – it falls

6 under General Mawela, under his component.

7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would you know who would

8 have been in charge of the practical training of the NIU at

9 the time of the events that we are talking about?

10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I think it would be

11 best if we can refer to Brigadier Silwane at National

12 Intervention Unit.

13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you and the

14 special task force, who would be in charge of curriculum

15 development there?

16 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Again, it's General

17 Eyk.

18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: General Van Eyk. And

19 training?

20 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That would be

21 Brigadier Fritz, whoever is responsible for the different

22 phases would report under his command.

23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Curriculum development

24 for TRT units?

25 BRIG BREYTENBACH: General van Eyk.

Page 1740

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Curriculum development?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct.

3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And then the training of

4 those units?

5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: The training would be

6 – I think they have a colonel at this stage otherwise it

7 falls directly under the command of General Annandale. I

8 just want to reiterate that the changes in their division,

9 in Division ROS, I'm not certain of certain of these posts

10 so if there's a wrong a person at the wrong position -

11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, you won't be

12 crucified.

13 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Thank you very much,

14 Sir.

15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: In the dog unit, the K9

16 unit, who would be – that would be under you, would it be?

17 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, not under myself,

18 Sir. Under curriculum development is General van Eyk once

19 again and the training itself presented at the K9 Academy

20 under Brigadier Vuma.

21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Brigadier Vuma, okay.

22 MR MAHLANGU: Colonel Vuma?

23 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Brigadier.

24 MR MAHLANGU: Brigadier.

25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman,

Page 1741

1 no further questions.

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Thank you.

3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Brigadier.

4 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Ramapela do

5 you wish to ask any questions?

6 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR RAMAPELA:

7 Chairperson, I'm sure I'll ask just one or two. Brigadier

8 you are one of the leaders in this human resource

9 development division and I see that in slide number 2, you

10 say that your mission is to ensure quality education,

11 training and development in support of creating a safe and

12 secure environment for all people of South Africa. Is this

13 correct?

14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct.

15 MR RAMAPELA: And will I also be correct

16 if I say that taking instructions runs through all forms of

17 training?

18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Yes, where's the

19 speaker? I can't see the speaker.

20 MR RAMAPELA: You must just listen.

21 Taking instructions runs through all forms of training?

22 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That is correct, yes.

23 MR RAMAPELA: And it is for this reason

24 that it was not even necessary for you to put it as one of

25 the outcomes in your outcomes under, I think it's slide 9

Page 1742

1 and 10?

2 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Can you just indicate

3 which bullet at or which point at slide 9 or 10 please.

4 MR RAMAPELA: No, I say that it is so

5 obvious that is one of the things that have to be trained –

6 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That's correct.

7 MR RAMAPELA: - to the extent that it was

8 not necessary for you to put it in that slide?

9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Absolutely. Sorry, I

10 misunderstood. Yes.

11 MR RAMAPELA: And that if the people that

12 you have trained failed to take simple instruction, then it

13 means that there's a serious weakness. There would be a

14 serious weakness in the training.

15 BRIG BREYTENBACH: There would be a

16 serious weakness in the operations and that not following

17 instructions amount to misconduct, yes.

18 MR RAMAPELA: Now, Brigadier, there is a

19 contingency plan that was sort of drafted on the 10th of

20 August of 2012 and I have actually requested that the

21 contingency plan, Chairperson, if – Chairperson, I have

22 requested that the contingency plan be copied. I have

23 copies of the contingency plan and I would like the General

24 to have one of the copies and the chairperson as well.

25 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, have we got copies?

Page 1743

1 Do you want to give it to the Brigadier? You're promoting

2 him for the afternoon.

3 BRIG BREYTENBACH: Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Have you given

5 one to the witness? When you talked about giving one to

6 the General, did you mean the witness? Brigadier, have you

7 got one?

8 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I don't,

9 Chairperson.

10 CHAIRPERSON: The most important person -

11 MR RAMAPELA: I thought there will be

12 someone who assist me with –

13 CHAIRPERSON: It sounds like you've been

14 given one.

15 MR RAMAPELA: I am at the back and I

16 don't even have anyone assisting me with documents,

17 Chairperson.

18 CHAIRPERSON: We have great sympathy for

19 you in your plight, but carry on with your cross-

20 examination. Ms Pillay, we have to give this a number too.

21 T?

22 MS PILLAY: I think it's U. T is the

23 letter dated – well it's the letter dated the 20th of

24 December. You said that we may have to give it an exhibit

25 number –

Page 1744

1 CHAIRPERSON: I see, we haven't got it

2 yet, but in anticipation you're reserving the letter T for

3 it. That's fair enough.

4 MS PILLAY: That's because it follows S.

5 CHAIRPERSON: And we'll get that first

6 thing in the morning, I take it.

7 MS PILLAY: Alright, so should we –

8 CHAIRPERSON: And this one then will be

9 U?

10 MS PILLAY: This will be U then.

11 CHAIRPERSON: Okay, thank you.

12 MR RAMAPELA: Thank you, Chairperson.

13 General – Brigadier, sorry. Brigadier this document that I

14 have given you relates to a contingency plan on what was

15 supposed to happen from the 10th of August. Now let me give

16 you an indication of one of the reasons for the contingency

17 plan. It was because on Friday 2012-08-10 plus minus 7 000

18 employees of the affiliated unions had embarked on an

19 unprotected strike. And then one of the instructions that

20 was given is on page 2 of this under Mission. The Deputy

21 Provincial Commissioner of the North West province has

22 instructed that public order and crime prevention be

23 maintained in the area of Marikana along the route to

24 Eastern Platinum Mine and Western Platinum Mine before,

25 during and after the strike. Marikana crime prevention and

Page 1745

1 Rustenburg POP will be deployed. Now the question that I

2 ask you is –

3 MR MAHLANGU: Mr Chairman, a long

4 statement has been made here and I do not have any document

5 which to refer to. It's very difficult for me to unless Mr

6 Ramapela can repeat what he's been saying please.

7 MR RAMAPELA: Okay. I say one of the

8 missions of the contingency plan of the 10th of August 2012

9 was the following and I will read - The Deputy Provincial

10 Commissioner of the North West province has instructed that

11 public order and crime prevention be maintained in the area

12 of Marikana along the route to Eastern Platinum Mine and

13 Western Platinum Mine before, during and after the strike.

14 Marikana crime prevention and Rustenburg POP will be

15 deployed. Now if the officers did not carry out this

16 instruction it would mean that we can assume that there

17 would be a weakness in the training.

18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: It's not necessarily

19 that there's a weakness in the training of the people who

20 do not follow instructions. It can be of members own will.

21 Instructions – members are taught from entry into the

22 police service to follow instructions. But we are training

23 robots to follow instructions blindly. Members have a

24 certainly level of discretion when it comes to following

25 instructions especially when it comes to the following of

Page 1746

1 illegal instructions or when operating unsupervised.
 2 [16:28] MR RAMAPELA: Okay. Let us go to number
 3 3 of this concept plan which then gives the concept in
 4 focus. Under 3.2 it says operation orders. POP will
 5 parade at the base and Marikana –
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Gumbi, I'm sorry to
 7 interrupt you. Are you going to go through the whole of
 8 this? So sorry, Mr Ramapele, forgive me. You're Mr
 9 Ramapele. Are you going to go through the whole of this
 10 document?
 11 MR RAMAPELA: No.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: The whole of the portion
 13 that you're now reading, para 3?
 14 MR RAMAPELA: No, Chairperson, I'm going
 15 to highlight some of the issues that –
 16 CHAIRPERSON: The only reason I ask you
 17 it's now half past 4, I said I would carry on until half
 18 past 4. It sounds to me if you're only going to take 5
 19 minutes, then we carry on, but if you're going to take a
 20 bit longer, I suggest you resume this cross-examination
 21 tomorrow morning.
 22 MR RAMAPELA: Chair, let me try 5
 23 minutes. If I go beyond 5 minutes –
 24 CHAIRPERSON: Alright. That's fair
 25 enough.

Page 1747

1 MR RAMAPELA: - then it could be tomorrow
 2 morning. Now let me go specifically to 3.2.3. It says all
 3 incidents must be reported to JOC. Hourly reports on the
 4 situation must be reported at JOC as from deployment
 5 thereafter hourly until duties are concluded. If these
 6 reports were not – this order was not executed, can we say
 7 that there is something fundamentally weak with the
 8 training?
 9 BRIG BREYTENBACH: No, I would not say
 10 that. This is operational document and operational
 11 environment is fluent and the situation can change on an
 12 hourly or minute base. This is – my experience from the
 13 operational environment is this is the ideal that members
 14 should strive towards. There might be reasons that they
 15 have to deviate from this and those instructions would be
 16 then given to deviate from it. You cannot blame all
 17 disregard for instructions on training. There's numerous
 18 factors to take into consideration. The member itself, the
 19 circumstances he find himself in and whatever transpires
 20 from that circumstances that he finds himself in.
 21 MR RAMAPELA: Thank you, Brigadier. I go
 22 to 3.2.4 in deviations. It says all personnel will fall
 23 under the command of the overall commander. No deviation
 24 from duty will be allowed without authority from JOC. If
 25 the police – sorry. So if the police officer trained

Page 1748

1 deviates without following this order, there will be
 2 something fundamentally wrong with their concept of what
 3 their duties should be to ensure safety of persons. Would
 4 you agree with me?
 5 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I would rather say
 6 there'd be something wrong with their conduct.
 7 MR RAMAPELA: The last question. If and
 8 this is now the force levels we're talking about. We're
 9 talking about 7 crime prevention officers, 3 crime
 10 intelligence officers and 14 public order policing. If all
 11 of these people did not follow the instructions or the
 12 orders, then there's something fundamentally wrong with
 13 execution of orders of the police. Do you agree with me?
 14 BRIG BREYTENBACH: In a sense I would say
 15 yes because it can be that the members were ill disciplined
 16 and did not follow orders or that the situation did not
 17 allow them to follow that specific order and that they had
 18 to take their own decision or initiative. But your general
 19 statement that orders should be followed is something that
 20 we -
 21 MR GUMBI: Chair, the difficulty with
 22 this hypothetical questions, I don't know whether it is
 23 alleged some instructions are not followed and by who or
 24 it's just a matter of what?
 25 CHAIRPERSON: He's the putting the

Page 1749

1 question on the basis that if what he says is right, how
 2 does the brigadier comment. The Brigadier's busy
 3 commenting. He is nearly finished with his comment.
 4 Obviously we'll get more detail at a later stage as to
 5 whether all the instructions were disobeyed or only some of
 6 them were, but it would probably much quicker for the
 7 purposes of finishing this part of the cross-examination
 8 this afternoon, is to let him finish his answer when we're
 9 told it's the last question.
 10 BRIG BREYTENBACH: I hope I've answered
 11 you sufficiently, Sir.
 12 MR RAMAPELA: Yes. You answered
 13 sufficiently and then the last question. If we don't have
 14 hourly reports on this concept plan that can be brought
 15 before this commission, then you'd agree with me that there
 16 was a problem with the implementation of this plan and it
 17 is as good as the paper it's written on?
 18 BRIG BREYTENBACH: That would be
 19 operational matters and not as much a training matter if
 20 the hourly reports were not done as they were planned to be
 21 done.
 22 MR RAMAPELA: Thank you, Chairperson.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Ramapele.
 24 I'm sorry that I confused you with your colleague, Mr
 25 Gumbi, a few moments ago, but –

1 MR RAMAPELA: Okay.
2 CHAIRPERSON: - thank you very much for
3 your questions. Mr Gumbi, I take it, if you have any
4 questions you'll be happy to ask them tomorrow?
5 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson. I'm going
6 to take instruction to that effect.
7 CHAIRPERSON: The commission will adjourn
8 and resume tomorrow at 09:30.
9 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED]
10 .
11 .
12 .
13 .
14 .
15 .
16 .
17 .
18 .
19 .
20 .
21 .
22 .
23 .
24 .
25 .

A				
ABCs 1726:11	adjournment 1645:13 1645:20 1648:24 1675:9,14,19 1682:4 1682:7 1725:20,23 1726:1	ammunition 1628:17 1630:3,5,12,22,24 1721:25	1642:3,14 1667:22 1668:15	1650:22 1666:21
able 1629:25 1636:3 1647:9 1672:8 1680:1 1683:18 1692:5 1713:24 1723:11 1737:17	ADJOURNS 1648:25 1682:12 1726:2	ammunitions 1721:23	approached 1672:24	assault 1621:14
absent 1649:8	adjust 1731:5	amount 1742:17	appropriate 1645:12 1662:14 1679:3 1682:4 1688:23 1689:1 1702:20 1703:2	assemblies 1708:14
Absolutely 1742:9	adjusted 1626:25	amounts 1707:3	appropriately 1649:18 1719:15	asserting 1705:24
Academy 1740:19	adopted 1671:22 1686:9	ample 1694:16	appropriateness 1734:22	assertion 1638:4 1703:7,9 1705:13
accept 1649:20 1680:12 1692:13 1699:25 1700:1,4,18 1707:15 1708:17 1709:20 1712:25 1713:6,14	advance 1644:21	analysis 1658:2	April 1645:22	assessed 1723:1
accepted 1638:18 1642:25	advanced 1670:11	and/or 1686:6	Arbitrator 1618:18	assessment 1694:10 1697:14 1703:24 1717:17 1723:3,15 1726:9,12
accomplish 1714:9 1734:20	advancing 1628:15 1629:24 1660:16	angry 1624:7 1628:15 1629:24	area 1624:20 1650:10 1669:22,22 1670:7 1744:23 1745:11	assigned 1717:22
account 1727:22 1737:14	advent 1659:25	Annandale 1665:7 1740:7	aren't 1621:17 1652:10 1659:9	assist 1621:8,9 1625:1 1629:21 1647:16 1700:11,11,15 1724:1 1743:12
ACCU 1670:7,13	advice 1655:3	answer 1626:3 1631:16 1632:6 1635:6 1647:16,17,21 1648:10 1649:21 1656:18 1657:24 1658:4 1664:8,17 1665:15,20 1671:1 1672:8 1673:3,10,13 1674:11 1677:18 1680:1,2 1700:16,18 1706:6,8 1707:18 1713:11 1718:4 1722:14 1723:23 1733:6,15,23,25 1734:1 1749:8	armament 1628:20	assistance 1633:11 1636:6
accuracy 1737:17	advised 1655:14 1657:22	answered 1749:10,12	armed 1622:15 1634:6 1651:19 1652:2,5 1655:23 1656:14,16 1657:9	assisting 1743:16
ACCUS 1670:4	affect 1642:16 1678:13 1678:13	answers 1652:13 1692:5	argument 1644:21 1678:4 1688:6 1692:9 1705:20,21 1706:11 1706:23 1707:2,5	associated 1686:11
accused 1638:17	affiliated 1744:18	anticipation 1744:2	arm 1622:18 1695:25	assume 1622:12 1631:23 1632:7 1641:16 1673:2 1683:25 1696:4 1745:16
achieve 1629:20 1642:6	afraid 1732:25	anybody 1655:15 1692:8	armament 1628:20	assumed 1712:8
achieved 1643:1 1712:4 1734:25	Africa 1637:19 1640:13 1641:9 1642:10,18 1654:9 1658:20 1741:12	anymore 1630:19 1672:14 1674:20	armed 1622:15 1634:6 1651:19 1652:2,5 1655:23 1656:14,16 1657:9	assumption 1674:2 1699:24 1700:22 1712:15,23
act 1630:11 1632:18,21 1653:7,20 1661:5 1664:4 1669:16 1670:19 1672:15,16 1672:18 1698:12 1699:14 1708:15 1735:23 1736:8	African 1641:11 1717:16	anyway 1698:25 1707:14 1733:4	arms 1622:6,18,25 1656:1 1696:16 1703:17	assure 1700:3
acted 1648:11,12 1697:20	afternoon 1743:2 1749:8	apart 1689:11 1695:16	arose 1649:9	ATM 1655:2
action 1646:18 1679:3 1688:12 1698:6,9 1699:20 1736:6,7,10 1736:12	ago 1668:19 1676:1,6 1749:25	apartheid 1639:20 1700:25	arrange 1619:10	attached 1675:21
actions 1647:25 1677:24 1734:18	agree 1633:3 1636:14 1638:4 1651:6 1660:1 1660:5,7 1681:17 1683:8 1686:14 1691:17 1694:8 1697:13 1698:8 1702:25 1710:11 1711:1 1728:2 1730:14,15 1748:4,13 1749:15	apologise 1618:10	arrest 1667:2	attack 1631:24
activities 1651:19	Agreed 1694:11	Apology 1720:16	arresting 1655:1 1715:11	attacked 1678:21
activity 1678:24 1680:9	agreeing 1698:5	apparently 1663:20	arrive 1620:19 1715:7 1715:11	attacking 1671:22
acts 1662:6	agrees 1680:17 1729:4	appeal 1646:4	arrived 1726:24	attacks 1696:12,23
actual 1625:25	ahead 1693:11	appear 1677:17 1713:11 1722:5	article 1630:11	attaining 1728:8
add 1624:13 1629:22 1715:14	aid 1660:17	appeared 1721:25	aside 1666:10	attempt 1641:15 1642:5
address 1650:12,20 1704:25 1707:11 1708:8	aimed 1733:5	appearing 1618:5	asked 1625:22 1638:24 1647:21 1648:8,10 1650:25 1651:9 1652:25 1653:16 1654:19,23,25 1655:7 1655:8,16 1666:12,16 1672:7 1674:10 1688:17 1709:23 1711:9 1726:16 1733:4	attempted 1629:6 1642:5
addressed 1692:10 1733:1 1734:8	air 1651:16,17	appears 1660:3 1683:23 1726:17 1734:7	asking 1634:24 1639:3 1646:23 1647:20 1662:19 1663:5 1672:5,6,12 1678:16 1680:15 1706:4,23 1712:25	attend 1652:10 1686:25 1687:4 1688:3 1693:24
addresses 1734:8 1735:4	align 1669:13	applicable 1627:24 1666:24 1679:22 1684:8	asked 1625:22 1638:24 1647:21 1648:8,10 1650:25 1651:9 1652:25 1653:16 1654:19,23,25 1655:7 1655:8,16 1666:12,16 1672:7 1674:10 1688:17 1709:23 1711:9 1726:16 1733:4	attended 1642:12 1690:7
addressing 1662:11 1733:1	aligned 1669:21	application 1685:18	aspect 1620:6 1649:20 1650:20 1665:9 1675:8 1686:16	attending 1656:2
adds 1690:9	alleged 1748:23	applied 1627:23 1656:21 1672:24 1707:1 1709:21	aspects 1632:17,20	attention 1626:12 1673:18 1687:16
adhere 1658:19 1716:19	allow 1649:17 1657:23 1658:4 1694:18 1748:17	applies 1681:24 1720:8		attitude 1643:20 1657:19
adherence 1667:4,5	allowed 1747:24	apply 1687:7		auditorium 1618:11
adjourn 1682:11 1725:21 1750:7	alluded 1619:13	appointed 1699:4,13		August 1633:21 1643:7 1644:23 1658:6 1659:23,25 1663:2 1673:24 1674:12 1676:6,24 1677:12,15 1678:17 1683:23 1705:24 1706:13 1709:25 1721:20 1730:21 1731:17,19 1735:4 1736:22,25 1742:20 1744:15 1745:8
ADJOURNED 1750:9	alright 1730:6 1738:20 1744:7 1746:24	appointment 1644:2		authority 1710:20 1673:5 1680:6
	alternative 1647:25	appreciate 1719:10		
	alters 1735:14	approach 1620:2		
	amend 1727:11			
	amended 1672:16			
	amending 1733:9			

<p>1689:15 1747:24 automatically 1684:24 available 1619:11,11 1619:12 1717:24,25 avoid 1621:23 1624:21 1668:7 1692:1 avoided 1661:1 1693:5 avoiding 1692:2,16 aware 1634:19 1639:19 1639:22,23 1640:15 1640:16,20,22,23,25 1641:4,6,8,12 1651:22 1658:7,12,13 1659:5 1661:18,19 1689:17 1694:3,6 1695:7 1702:6,9,12 1707:6 1708:21 1709:1,4 1710:7 1714:12,15,21 1715:3 1715:5 1730:7,17 1731:4 1732:3 1737:3 axes 1655:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <hr/> <p>b 1672:1 back 1619:23 1647:8 1675:3 1701:23 1703:6,9 1707:24 1708:1 1711:4 1743:15 background 1655:12 1666:11 ball 1627:9 1710:16 1735:19 balls 1623:5 1627:10,21 1627:24 1628:5,9 bandied 1724:13 bank 1655:2,9 barbed 1625:11,18,18 1625:22 1626:6 1629:7 base 1746:5 1747:12 based 1680:4,6,17 1713:15 1717:3 basic 1620:6,12,22 1623:20,21 1630:9 1651:13 1656:10 1677:4 1681:25 basically 1715:10 1724:1 1737:7 basis 1653:6 1671:3 1702:19 1721:23 1722:18 1749:1 Batho 1642:13 baton 1693:22 bearing 1656:1 beg 1644:8 1676:4 beginning 1650:21 1711:10 behalf 1628:25 1656:18 1673:11,14 behave 1642:9 behaviour 1667:6 believe 1622:6,24 1625:21 1628:18 1638:12 1646:8</p>	<p>1654:12,13 1657:13 1665:22 1670:25 1683:10 1695:12 1696:24 1699:1 1721:7 1725:6 believed 1639:3 believes 1681:9 Beretta 1735:18 best 1636:19 1663:8 1677:7 1722:14 1724:2 1739:11 better 1656:21,25 1665:23 1671:1 1672:5,7,8 1685:2 1688:8 1693:2 1727:8 beyond 1726:18 1736:8 1746:23 bill 1668:12 bit 1746:20 blame 1747:16 blanket 1629:12 bleeding 1657:11 blindly 1745:23 block 1631:6,11 blocks 1683:5 blue 1638:11 bodily 1685:13 body 1708:23 1709:3 1709:19,21 1710:12 1710:17,18,21,23,23 books 1651:16 boost 1670:22 bore 1626:12 1735:18 1735:18 bounce 1710:19 box 1645:1 brackets 1669:19 brains 1639:15 branch 1649:23 breach 1629:7 breaching 1629:9 1632:9 briefly 1620:5 brigadier 1618:13,13 1618:24 1620:9 1621:21 1622:16 1625:4 1626:4,12 1627:19 1628:22 1630:25 1632:16 1635:5 1636:10 1644:22 1645:6 1649:4,15,19 1651:25 1658:5 1662:1,17 1665:1 1669:2 1678:14 1682:14 1684:22 1692:18 1693:3,5,24 1698:4 1703:21 1705:3 1707:6,13 1708:2 1710:22 1714:8 1724:10 1726:4,7,24 1730:7 1734:14 1739:11,21 1740:20 1740:21,23,24 1741:3 1741:7 1742:18 1743:1,6 1744:13,13</p>	<p>1747:21 1749:2 Brigadier's 1749:2 bring 1629:25 1656:12 1656:16 broad 1651:1 broader 1666:21 1686:1 broadly 1621:18 brought 1675:3 1749:14 Bruinders 1632:15,16 1632:20 1633:2,12,15 1633:19,23 1634:3,8 1634:14,20 1635:3,14 1635:25 1636:4,9,16 1637:3,9,11 brutal 1651:15 Budlender 1649:1,5,9 1649:13 build 1721:11 building 1685:14 bull 1644:4 bulldog 1644:4 bullet 1627:8,15,16 1628:9 1664:2 1742:3 bullets 1623:4 1626:17 1627:6,20,23,24 1628:8 1629:8,10,14 1630:16 1631:13 1684:24 bundle 1726:17 1729:13,15 1732:13 1732:15 1734:11 bundled 1663:6 bury 1674:13 busy 1671:6 1682:14 1732:5 1749:2</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">C</p> <hr/> <p>call 1621:5 1624:23 1627:17 1651:15 1668:25 1687:25 1703:25 1715:23 called 1624:1 1640:7 1641:3,10 1647:17 1679:2 1681:6 1694:13 1701:11 1714:6 1715:6 1724:3 camouflage 1638:12 Canada 1685:19 candidate 1620:13 Canine 1722:6 cannon 1734:17 canon 1625:14 canons 1629:8 1630:17 1631:13 canvas 1707:5 can't 1650:20 1656:18 1660:11 1704:8 1707:5 capabilities 1649:25 capacitated 1672:17 capacity 1625:3 1670:3 1670:22 1727:2,20 1730:23 captain 1736:12</p>	<p>capture 1712:5 captured 1718:1 carefully 1662:13 carried 1622:18 1633:24 1634:4 carry 1622:2,6 1625:1 1628:1 1634:10 1674:4 1716:2 1743:19 1745:15 1746:17,19 carrying 1622:12 1624:8 case 1630:6 1673:25 1679:25 1684:1 1724:21 1728:8 cases 1622:7 1630:15 1647:2 1683:7 1685:17 1686:20 1713:8 casualties 1673:1 1686:10,21 catastrophic 1684:13 catch 1652:20 categorise 1704:8 cause 1624:19 1657:8 1683:23 caused 1686:21 causing 1685:11,12 CCU 1670:5 cease 1685:3,4 1711:14 1712:9 1713:9,16 ceasefire 1713:2,12,20 Cele 1651:15,20 1652:1 1652:23 1653:18 1696:24 Cele's 1653:3 central 1661:16 centre 1683:6 1699:12 1718:22 centres 1662:16 certain 1624:18,20,25 1625:24 1626:10 1683:1 1684:5 1689:20 1690:10,19 1701:22,23 1717:18 1724:9 1740:9,9 certainly 1713:11 1734:3 1745:24 certainty 1685:22 Chair 1629:12 1632:12 1636:5,9 1637:9,14 1649:5,14 1664:21 1674:6,24 1678:2 1679:11 1688:10 1694:20 1702:11 1703:11 1705:4,7,19 1706:2 1708:3 1714:4 1715:18 1730:10 1731:13 1733:7 1746:22 1748:21 chairman 1645:4,15 1647:24 1651:17 1659:3,24 1660:14 1675:6 1676:10 1680:7 1682:5,9 1693:7,10,11 1702:24</p>	<p>1716:18,23 1725:22 1726:1,6 1730:3 1734:6,6 1737:2 1740:25 1745:3 challenges 1671:24 challenge 1652:20 change 1641:3,16,24 1642:3,14 1669:24 1747:11 changed 1627:4 1653:17 1670:5 1727:17 1731:22 changes 1637:19 1640:19 1672:19 1701:20 1732:16 1740:8 channel 1624:20 channelising 1625:23 channels 1669:9 1733:11 charge 1637:6 1667:20 1695:1 1718:19 1719:24 1720:19,22 1737:19 1738:21,24 1739:5,8,14 Charles 1645:21 chief 1699:12 1728:25 chose 1654:9 circular 1626:14,21 1627:2,15,22 1628:8 1709:14 1728:9 1734:11,11 1735:15 1736:22 Circulars 1732:5 circulated 1728:22 1730:11 1732:5 circulation 1730:19,20 circumstances 1621:24 1624:4 1626:18 1629:14 1631:20 1656:21 1689:1 1712:3 1734:23 1736:15 1747:19,20 Ciskei 1640:8 citizens 1641:18 1714:20 1715:2 civil 1666:25 CJOC 1699:3,11 clad 1649:18 clarify 1619:5 1622:17 1623:17 1628:6 classic 1623:15,17 classical 1623:24 clear 1621:13,21 1631:2 1633:2 1660:25 1667:3 1671:23 1692:23 1710:10 1732:24 1733:1 clearer 1672:12 clearly 1684:9 client 1644:25 clients 1671:25 close 1631:8 1683:16 closed 1653:15 closest 1702:3</p>
---	---	--	---	--

<p>clothing 1629:11 cluster 1702:2 coercive 1685:9 coherent 1660:25 coincide 1626:10 colleague 1665:8 1749:24 colleagues 1679:22 1680:4 1692:2 1720:13 1723:18 colonel 1636:6 1654:16 1694:18 1740:6,22 combating 1633:8 1669:23,24 1670:5,23 combination 1701:22 come 1641:24 1650:25 1656:22 1662:24 1663:9 1669:7 1689:14 1692:22,25 1703:16 1704:13 1725:24 1727:3,4,15 1731:2 comes 1620:25 1627:1 1628:21 1644:25 1665:7 1723:11 1745:24,25 coming 1660:16 1664:22 1675:10 command 1635:12 1667:4,5 1679:9,13 1680:25 1681:5,12,15 1681:17,19 1682:20 1682:22,23,25 1683:6 1684:1,8,10,15 1687:10 1690:18 1698:12 1699:3,11,15 1700:4,19 1711:5 1713:20 1735:23 1736:6,9,9 1739:22 1740:7 1747:23 commanded 1688:7 commander 1656:11 1656:19 1679:8,20 1683:5 1699:3,13,15 1699:22 1722:15 1735:24,24 1747:23 commanders 1636:25 1637:6 1686:17 1713:22 1736:2 commanding 1670:8 Commands 1684:2 commence 1649:6 comment 1625:25 1629:21 1632:25 1635:10,18 1647:3,9 1656:10,12 1657:3,13 1657:16 1704:7 1714:8 1725:16 1735:3,14 1749:2,3 commenting 1749:3 commission 1618:2 1629:12 1641:22 1648:25,25 1649:1 1672:4 1679:16 1682:10,12,12,13 1693:25 1719:23</p>	<p>1726:2,2,3 1729:16 1729:25 1730:2,13 1749:15 1750:7,9 commissioner 1626:14 1626:15 1641:1 1652:1 1658:18 1665:13 1669:8,17 1728:10 1729:19 1744:21 1745:10 commissioners 1669:9 1692:8 1726:20 1728:23,23,24 1729:19 Commissioner's 1689:16 committed 1652:9 1655:10 committee 1641:9 1651:1 common 1639:5,8,10 1639:15 1679:22 1683:23 1691:16 commonsensical 1636:13 communicate 1683:19 communicating 1692:2 communication 1683:7 1683:14,16,24 Comparative 1675:22 compare 1652:1 compared 1685:24 competent 1692:7,8 compile 1619:22 compliance 1668:11 1686:4 complicated 1657:14 comply 1661:4 1667:7 1704:14 component 1717:7 1718:13 1739:6 comprise 1705:13 concept 1746:3,3 1748:2 1749:14 concern 1630:1 1662:16,19 1708:22 concerned 1621:14,17 1621:22 1636:18 1663:19 1709:22 concerns 1690:21 concluded 1747:5 concludes 1632:12 conclusion 1736:21 conclusions 1704:3 concrete 1631:4 conditioned 1651:16 conditioning 1651:18 conditions 1737:9 conduct 1714:20 1748:6 conducted 1719:5 conference 1693:25 1694:4 confers 1672:18 confine 1638:7 1702:14 confined 1708:18 confirm 1729:1</p>	<p>confiscated 1696:11 conflated 1675:1 conflict 1734:19 confront 1624:4 confused 1749:24 conjunction 1620:3 connection 1647:20 consequences 1665:7 1684:5 1685:5 consider 1638:18,20 consideration 1658:21 1660:4 1747:18 considered 1669:2 1732:15 considering 1660:2 consistent 1644:16 1698:19 constant 1672:23 constitutes 1661:15 constitution 1648:3 1668:12 1686:4 constitutional 1637:19 1640:19 1677:6 construed 1711:15 consulted 1668:22 contain 1631:20 content 1632:23,24,24 1649:22 1658:16,24 1675:25 1676:10,13 contents 1727:21 context 1624:24 1664:3 1682:24 1686:1 1699:24 1714:8 contingency 1742:19 1742:21,22,23 1744:14,16 1745:8 continue 1627:5 1630:7 1631:17 1646:14 1649:18 1731:23 1732:2 continued 1626:25 1649:7 continuum 1687:13 1689:19 contribution 1665:22 control 1658:1 1666:21 1667:4,6 1675:25 1682:20,23,23,25 1683:12 1684:1 1690:18 1696:13 1700:14 1723:22 1724:16 1725:14 1726:11 convenient 1648:24 1692:1 1725:20 convey 1727:7 conveyed 1685:4 coordinate 1649:23 1650:5 1717:22 1719:5 coordinated 1663:25 coordinating 1650:15 1687:15 coordination 1719:7 coordinator 1636:22 1637:4 1650:3,4</p>	<p>1662:1 1665:18 1666:15 1668:7 1669:5 1673:16 1717:11,11 1722:17 1727:3,20 copied 1742:22 copies 1728:18 1742:23 1742:24,25 copy 1660:10 1708:5 1728:17 1731:11 cordoning 1625:24 correctly 1648:11 1674:19 1677:1 1696:9 correspond 1701:11 correspondence 1732:7 1733:11 costs 1661:1 couldn't 1631:20,20 1672:4 1685:5 1690:14 counsel 1629:15 countries 1685:19,25 country 1639:16 1641:18 1645:7 1669:2 1677:23 1685:24 1686:2 1701:8 couple 1713:8 1725:24 1726:7 course 1619:10 1623:1 1624:3 1625:15 1630:1 1653:14 1662:5 1679:23 1697:25 1698:15 1713:10,13 1731:22 1732:2 courses 1619:9,13 1642:2,13 1650:7,12 1677:6 1717:21 courts 1648:2 covered 1695:13 covering 1629:11 co-ordinating 1619:9 create 1683:6 1685:12 creating 1654:7 1670:22 1741:11 credit 1664:19 crime 1633:9 1652:9 1655:19 1669:22,24 1670:5,7 1704:25 1707:11 1744:22,25 1745:11,14 1748:9,9 crimes 1670:23 criminal 1630:11 1653:19 1657:1 1680:9 1686:20 1736:7,7 criminals 1644:3 criticising 1672:3 criticism 1670:8 cross 1618:21 1644:19 1645:5 1743:19 crosses 1730:23 cross-examination 1618:20 1637:13</p>	<p>1645:10 1693:17,19 1693:21,23 1694:19 1716:22 1741:6 1746:20 1749:7 cross-examine 1693:14 cross-examining 1618:15 1682:14 crowds 1625:23 1628:21 1630:17 1661:4 1734:15 1736:1 crucial 1669:13 crucified 1740:12 crux 1703:5 culminating 1730:1 current 1620:2 1662:13 1668:15 1672:24 1675:23 1686:5 currently 1719:5 1732:4 curricula 1722:19 curriculum 1619:21,24 1626:25 1627:3 1632:24 1653:17,19 1658:25 1659:2 1663:11 1664:14,15 1667:15,18,19 1668:23 1690:7 1695:10 1718:9,15 1727:10,11,15,17,21 1731:3,5,21,24 1732:1 1733:8,10 1737:19,21 1738:21 1739:14,23 1740:1,18 curriculum 1650:8 1651:1 1718:9 cut 1644:18 cylindrical 1627:8,16 1628:5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">D</p> <p>daily 1653:6 1671:3 damage 1624:19 1714:17 danger 1661:8 1711:20 1712:10,20 dangerous 1657:6 date 1659:22,24 1674:17 1676:21 dated 1729:6,20 1733:18 1743:23,23 dates 1730:20 1731:23 day 1621:16 1653:6 1656:11 1684:11 1689:16 1693:24 1694:3 1703:25,25 1705:1,1,9,9,24,25 1706:13,13,20,20 1707:4,4,12,12 1722:10 1723:5 days 1729:21,22 1730:19 de 1734:18 dead 1639:21 deadly 1656:5 1685:10 1685:18,23 1695:12</p>
--	---	--	--	---

<p>deal 1619:1 1620:12 1622:8 1623:13,16,24 1624:1 1625:4 1627:25 1636:3,6 1644:3 1648:16 1652:7 1656:17 1675:13 1678:4 1690:1 1715:11 1718:18 1724:17</p> <p>dealing 1623:1 1628:21 1636:19 1664:24 1671:2 1689:19 1697:6,9,16 1698:9 1699:20</p> <p>deals 1644:4</p> <p>dealt 1620:7 1627:15 1689:24 1711:10</p> <p>death 1646:6 1655:13 1657:12 1685:12</p> <p>debate 1648:21 1649:18 1665:3</p> <p>debating 1678:3</p> <p>decade 1642:8</p> <p>December 1626:15 1627:15,22 1726:21 1729:6 1732:10,22 1733:17 1734:10,11 1735:15 1737:6 1743:24</p> <p>decide 1648:13 1684:17 1692:6,7,8</p> <p>decided 1653:21</p> <p>decision 1630:23 1635:2,12,12 1646:15 1647:5 1675:7 1684:12,18,22,25 1685:4 1686:16,18 1690:11,21 1691:3 1697:18 1698:19,20 1748:18</p> <p>decisions 1636:23 1679:3 1690:11,20 1697:17 1698:14</p> <p>declaring 1626:16</p> <p>dedicated 1672:14 1735:20</p> <p>deduct 1690:18</p> <p>deemed 1670:22</p> <p>defence 1679:23,25 1681:6</p> <p>defend 1630:6,23 1653:4,4 1679:21,21</p> <p>defensive 1725:5</p> <p>defer 1693:17</p> <p>deferred 1716:16</p> <p>deferring 1693:18</p> <p>defied 1629:6</p> <p>defined 1708:15 1714:10</p> <p>definitely 1622:11 1642:19 1701:23</p> <p>definitions 1707:18,23</p> <p>degree 1661:3 1734:20</p> <p>delayed 1715:16 1716:6</p> <p>deliberately 1658:20</p>	<p>1658:24 1692:3</p> <p>delivery 1670:10</p> <p>demands 1672:19</p> <p>democratic 1640:19</p> <p>demonstration 1667:1 1704:4</p> <p>demonstrations 1630:14 1672:20 1708:14,19</p> <p>department 1650:19 1669:4</p> <p>departmental 1666:24</p> <p>dependant 1682:22</p> <p>deployed 1656:23 1661:2 1707:9 1745:1 1745:15</p> <p>deployment 1625:18 1707:10 1747:4</p> <p>deployments 1704:25</p> <p>deputy 1728:24 1744:20 1745:9</p> <p>describe 1621:13 1623:9,12 1634:1 1650:1</p> <p>described 1627:6,21,25 1634:12 1661:15</p> <p>description 1625:4 1629:2</p> <p>desist 1685:1</p> <p>detail 1749:4</p> <p>details 1660:12 1665:3 1725:7</p> <p>deter 1629:9 1631:14 1631:15</p> <p>determination 1683:11</p> <p>determined 1624:8 1631:10 1717:18</p> <p>developed 1685:19</p> <p>developers 1619:24 1663:11 1727:21 1731:3 1733:9</p> <p>development 1619:21 1654:7 1658:25 1667:16,19,19 1668:23 1690:7 1717:7,8 1718:13 1720:17 1723:18 1737:19,22 1738:21 1739:15,23 1740:1,18 1741:9,11</p> <p>deviate 1747:15,16</p> <p>deviates 1748:1</p> <p>deviation 1747:23</p> <p>deviations 1747:22</p> <p>diary 1736:5</p> <p>dictionaries 1691:16,18</p> <p>didn't 1618:6 1631:14 1642:24 1654:3 1658:8 1662:18 1663:2 1664:11 1673:17 1674:7 1679:4 1687:24 1688:1 1715:20,21,21</p> <p>die 1657:1</p> <p>difference 1683:15 1737:10</p>	<p>differences 1733:16,19</p> <p>different 1682:24,24 1683:2 1691:11 1696:13 1706:1,3 1731:25 1739:21</p> <p>differently 1648:12 1735:4</p> <p>difficult 1707:17 1745:5</p> <p>difficulty 1647:23 1671:15 1748:21</p> <p>dignitaries 1631:5,7</p> <p>direct 1636:1 1688:14 1701:18 1710:17 1732:25</p> <p>directed 1635:22 1687:19 1689:8 1695:4 1733:4,14</p> <p>directing 1687:15</p> <p>direction 1685:14</p> <p>directive 1712:17 1714:6</p> <p>directly 1648:8 1663:23 1669:7 1710:21 1731:2,13 1733:21 1740:7</p> <p>disadvantage 1716:19</p> <p>disagree 1691:18 1692:12</p> <p>disagrees 1680:17</p> <p>disappointed 1652:6</p> <p>disastrous 1684:4</p> <p>disburse 1703:17</p> <p>discharge 1623:4 1677:8 1681:10 1686:16,18 1736:15</p> <p>discharging 1697:23 1721:25</p> <p>disciplinary 1686:20 1736:7</p> <p>discipline 1667:9</p> <p>disciplined 1667:6 1748:15</p> <p>disclosed 1659:4,9</p> <p>discontinued 1712:4 1734:24</p> <p>discourse 1685:21</p> <p>discretion 1679:10 1680:8 1745:24</p> <p>discretionary 1678:24</p> <p>discuss 1636:24</p> <p>discussed 1652:11,12 1652:12</p> <p>discussing 1676:9 1712:6</p> <p>discussions 1618:7</p> <p>disestablished 1670:2</p> <p>disobeyed 1749:5</p> <p>dispensation 1649:6,10 1668:15</p> <p>dispersal 1661:4</p> <p>disperse 1624:21 1630:17,22 1724:21</p> <p>dispersed 1724:22</p> <p>display 1661:2</p> <p>dispute 1641:14</p>	<p>disputing 1641:21</p> <p>disregard 1747:17</p> <p>disrespect 1640:13 1678:9</p> <p>distance 1639:15 1683:13 1688:21,24 1735:21</p> <p>distinction 1653:11 1709:2</p> <p>distinguish 1655:13 1656:4 1696:9</p> <p>distributed 1731:10 1736:18</p> <p>division 1627:2 1650:11 1667:16 1690:6 1717:6 1718:13 1719:5 1720:16,17,18 1723:18 1737:22 1739:4 1740:8,9 1741:9</p> <p>divisional 1626:15 1665:12 1669:9 1728:1,23</p> <p>divisions 1619:17 1689:11 1731:7,8</p> <p>document 1654:10 1658:6,9,12,16,21 1659:4,11,12 1664:15 1664:24 1668:21,22 1674:25 1675:21 1676:6 1679:18 1695:10 1707:23 1709:7 1714:7 1722:4 1728:9 1744:13 1745:4 1746:10 1747:10</p> <p>documents 1659:4,8 1691:5 1692:16,19 1693:1 1723:12 1743:16</p> <p>doesn't 1625:14 1631:15 1634:25 1636:19 1637:7 1648:10 1726:8 1732:12</p> <p>dog 1720:10,11 1722:6 1740:15</p> <p>doing 1637:2 1658:17 1678:25 1701:25 1718:4</p> <p>don't 1618:11 1622:22 1626:1 1630:25 1632:5 1633:20,23 1634:3,7,15,21 1635:7,15 1636:10 1641:19 1649:16,17 1649:22,24 1657:2 1659:6 1670:16 1673:21,25 1675:15 1680:16 1681:4 1687:22 1688:5,7,22 1688:25 1694:18 1697:1 1698:12,24 1700:21 1701:1,17,18 1704:13 1705:10,15</p>	<p>1705:18 1708:2 1711:18 1713:11 1720:25 1721:6 1724:7 1725:15 1728:13,17 1732:17 1733:3 1736:20 1743:8,16 1748:22 1749:13</p> <p>double 1626:12 1735:19</p> <p>doubt 1630:21 1694:16</p> <p>draft 1688:3 1692:18</p> <p>drafted 1742:19</p> <p>drafting 1693:1</p> <p>drafts 1664:22 1688:13</p> <p>draw 1646:21 1650:11 1654:1 1673:17 1704:2</p> <p>drawing 1718:8,14 1728:15</p> <p>drawn 1691:5,6 1701:23</p> <p>drew 1654:10 1668:14</p> <p>drive 1663:22 1708:1</p> <p>driven 1704:24 1707:10</p> <p>due 1618:3 1650:6 1672:18 1677:20</p> <p>duties 1629:20 1670:15 1747:5 1748:3</p> <p>duty 1633:21 1688:8 1747:24</p>
E				
			<p>earlier 1630:9 1635:20 1649:12 1656:9,14 1657:15 1664:14 1668:21 1684:9 1687:9 1694:5 1697:22 1700:2 1732:25 1733:8,21</p> <p>early 1706:17 1727:12</p> <p>earned 1640:12</p> <p>ears 1639:15</p> <p>Eastern 1640:6 1744:24 1745:12</p> <p>Eck 1737:22 1738:4,5</p> <p>education 1654:6 1655:12 1741:10</p> <p>effect 1626:16,22 1683:25 1687:2 1711:21 1734:13 1750:6</p> <p>effective 1630:16 1682:21 1683:12</p> <p>effectiveness 1628:14</p> <p>efficacy 1723:15</p> <p>effort 1653:23</p> <p>efforts 1632:8</p> <p>either 1668:2 1725:23 1733:23</p> <p>elections 1640:19 1641:4</p> <p>elementary 1620:23</p> <p>eleven 1645:12</p> <p>elite 1621:14</p>	

<p>embarked 1744:18 emphasis 1736:22 employ 1637:1 employed 1679:17 employee 1667:9 employees 1744:18 encountering 1622:14 ended 1704:4 enforcement 1677:5 1685:10 engage 1687:11 engaged 1634:5 engagement 1667:2 engulfing 1701:8 enshrined 1661:17 ensure 1654:6 1662:25 1664:15 1668:11 1686:3,9 1717:23 1736:2 1741:10 1748:3 entail 1717:13 entails 1623:17 1717:15 entitle 1680:10 entitled 1651:9 1657:1 1679:20 1681:7 entry 1745:21 environment 1635:22 1654:8 1665:23 1677:9 1717:1 1741:12 1747:11,13 envisaged 1672:15 equally 1648:16 equipment 1619:1 1620:3 1622:3 1625:1 1625:4,10,13 1631:17 equipped 1623:16 1629:20 1662:15 era 1700:25 escalate 1734:19 escalation 1628:18 especially 1672:20 1679:2 1709:18 1745:25 essence 1623:12 essentially 1624:14 establish 1669:17 established 1669:20 1674:17 1688:13 establishment 1673:15 ETD 1654:7 euphemism 1692:6,12 euphemisms 1691:12 1692:1 1715:23 European 1641:9 evaluation 1722:25 evenly 1729:5,5 1732:9 event 1643:6 1679:18 events 1644:23 1658:12 1659:21 1667:1 1676:9 1678:17 1702:1 1729:22 1730:1,12 1731:17,19 1739:9 eventuality 1656:22 eventually 1646:15</p>	<p>everybody 1725:19 evidence 1618:7 1629:13 1633:3 1634:15 1649:20 1650:25 1664:21 1665:1 1672:2 1673:22 1680:4 1692:10,20,22 1695:16 1696:9 1703:14,20 1716:20 1722:4 1729:18 1733:2 evoke 1685:19 exact 1658:16 1676:21 1739:4 exactly 1632:10 1664:23 1702:24 1705:15 1710:15 1716:25 examination 1618:22 1644:20 1645:6 1743:20 example 1696:10 1732:20 Examples 1685:13 excused 1716:11,13 execute 1672:18 1683:3 executed 1747:6 executing 1634:24 execution 1748:13 exercise 1634:5,11 1680:8 1716:17 exhibit 1620:1 1653:21 1658:18,22 1659:7,14 1659:17,19 1682:20 1685:8 1695:11 1700:9 1704:17 1719:18,21 1720:25 1721:1,3,4,7,7 1726:8 1729:10,11,15,18 1730:4,6 1732:11,12 1733:18,18 1735:3 1737:4 1743:24 exhibits 1659:9 1660:19 1729:17 exist 1672:14 1674:20 existence 1726:9 exists 1679:25 expect 1634:9 1635:15 1636:11,24 1637:5,6 1680:16 1681:5 1688:7 1702:19 1731:12 expectation 1647:2 expectations 1667:5 expected 1665:19 expended 1721:17,23 experience 1625:22 1637:18 1638:3 1639:7,7 1655:1,9 1670:21 1673:5 1747:12 experienced 1678:21 1727:16 expert 1619:12 1656:3 1659:13 1694:13</p>	<p>experts 1641:10 explain 1694:15 1700:12 1725:7 1727:9 explained 1664:13 1684:9 1700:10 explaining 1664:22 explains 1618:6 explanation 1692:14 explore 1725:25 exposes 1661:7 expression 1688:25 expressly 1649:11 extend 1649:11 extent 1625:25 1742:7 extracted 1717:17 extreme 1736:15 Eyk 1667:21 1737:24 1737:25 1739:17,18 1739:25 1740:18 E-C-K 1737:25 E-Y-C-K 1738:17 E-Y-K 1738:13,15,17 1738:18,19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <hr/> <p>F 1735:3 faced 1680:21 facie 1647:22 facilitate 1650:19,24 facilities 1619:12 1717:24 facility 1650:14 fact 1629:3 1674:21 1688:13 1695:14 1696:8 1711:17,25 1713:15 1722:19 1729:3 1731:15 factors 1747:18 facts 1655:22 1656:13 1677:21 fail 1661:7 failed 1631:18 1667:8 1742:12 failure 1667:7 fair 1622:20 1660:9 1699:24 1700:6 1703:6 1712:14,23 1736:21 1744:3 1746:24 fairly 1627:7,7,16 fairness 1716:3 1725:19 fall 1747:22 falls 1628:18 1717:22 1720:11 1739:5 1740:7 familiar 1626:19 1669:16 1691:20,20 1699:16 1700:2 1707:18 1728:12 far 1618:16 1626:7 1636:17 1652:19 1677:10,11 1683:17 1689:9 1705:16,16 1709:22</p>	<p>faster 1646:24 fatalities 1673:1 1686:10,21 features 1624:25 feel 1687:25 1715:2 feeling 1639:16 fellow 1651:9 1652:11 1652:25 1681:11 1720:13 field 1738:25 figure 1724:13 filtered 1658:25 final 1666:8 1684:12 finalised 1736:19 finally 1690:25 1691:2 1714:4 financial 1670:19 1676:21 1717:20 1718:1 find 1660:21 1665:8 1691:9 1698:13 1708:1,8 1711:18 1716:25 1719:10 1725:1 1747:19 finds 1747:20 finger 1698:1 finish 1675:15 1749:8 finished 1671:9,12 1675:18 1749:3 finishing 1749:7 fire 1681:18 1684:22,23 1685:3,4 1711:14 1712:9 1713:9,16 firearm 1645:23 1646:6,6 1681:10 1685:13 1686:17,18 1696:19 1697:24 firearms 1655:23 1686:11,22 1696:11 fired 1713:12,13,15 1735:25 firing 1685:13 first 1620:18 1628:1 1639:3 1652:23 1655:6 1693:3 1699:8 1703:2 1726:18 1733:24,25 1734:1,15 1737:3,5 1744:5 firstly 1623:8 1630:4 1670:13 fit 1727:6 Fivaz 1641:1 five 1663:5 fluent 1747:11 focus 1622:10 1631:2 1633:4,13,15,18 1634:9 1746:4 focuses 1623:1 focussed 1704:24 follow 1694:19 1716:19 1745:20,22,23 1748:11,16,17 followed 1619:19 1661:6,10 1679:18 1748:19,23 following 1629:1,5,22</p>	<p>1629:23 1669:13 1712:2 1714:9,17 1735:13 1742:16 1745:9,24,25 1748:1 follows 1623:15 1744:4 follow-up 1734:6 footage 1736:2 forbad 1627:23 force 1628:18 1630:12 1637:14 1638:2,15,15 1638:19,21 1639:3 1640:14,21 1641:4 1642:8,22 1643:2,15 1643:19 1644:21 1646:5 1647:6 1650:22,22 1651:6 1655:16 1656:8,19 1660:5 1661:1,3,10 1662:3,11 1667:2 1678:14 1684:17 1685:10,10,15,18,20 1685:23 1686:6,8 1687:13 1689:9,19 1691:10 1695:7,12,12 1699:2,10 1708:22 1709:21 1711:19 1712:2,3 1714:6 1728:11 1731:25 1732:20,21,23 1734:19,20,23,24 1736:4,9,10 1739:14 1748:8 forceful 1736:16 forces 1640:21 forefront 1654:9 forgive 1632:1 1716:23 1746:8 form 1624:8 1728:8 1729:22 1730:12 formed 1730:1 forming 1621:1 forms 1702:19 1741:16 1741:21 formulate 1635:16 formulated 1688:15 forth 1619:23 1624:19 fortunate 1660:18 forward 1664:25 1690:4 found 1630:15 1700:14 1708:2 four 1642:7 1725:18 frankly 1678:4 fraternity 1619:21 frequency 1685:23 Friday 1744:17 friend 1628:25 1631:12 1649:21 1674:8 1716:10 Fritz 1739:21 front 1656:13 1728:14 1734:14 fruitfully 1719:13 FTE/STF 1715:7 function 1619:9 1649:25 1650:8</p>
---	--	---	---	---

<p>1669:22,25 1670:1 1672:15 1678:24 1689:21 1704:23 1705:6 1723:19,19 functions 1619:3 1625:17 1653:14 1669:23 1670:13 1672:18 1677:8 1701:21,23 1702:4 fundamental 1637:18 1640:18 1641:3 fundamentally 1747:7 1748:2,12 funding 1650:15 further 1618:19,21 1632:9 1637:10 1661:5 1664:16 1668:23 1693:7 1713:2,3 1716:9 1741:1 future 1627:23 1663:19</p>	<p>1734:1 1743:4,14 1744:14,20 1747:16 gives 1669:15 1692:20 1695:11 1720:24 1736:6 1746:3 giving 1633:10,10 1672:2 1711:9 1723:23 1730:4,25 1743:5 glad 1628:23 go 1618:25 1624:17 1634:21,25 1635:7,15 1636:10,19 1637:7 1651:18 1691:10 1693:11 1704:10,11 1704:17 1707:23 1709:6 1711:4,13 1714:5 1722:3 1725:13 1730:19 1746:2,7,9,23 1747:2 1747:21 goal 1734:20 goes 1623:15 1631:23 1686:3 1734:13 going 1618:5,25 1621:5 1622:13 1623:7 1629:4,21,22 1644:3 1644:19 1645:15 1648:15 1656:15 1657:19,23 1658:3 1660:21 1680:4 1691:4,25 1699:1 1706:17 1726:10 1729:15 1732:3 1746:7,9,14,18,19 1750:5 good 1644:12 1652:17 1683:14,16 1749:17 governor 1657:24 gradual 1734:16 grammar 1666:10 grateful 1733:6 great 1662:16 1743:18 grenades 1629:7 1631:14 ground 1635:13 1636:23 1710:19,24 group 1631:14,15 1653:23 1680:7 1681:23 1697:18,20 1698:6,9,11,13,20 1699:20 groups 1655:10 guarantee 1703:12 1704:13 1705:11,17 guest 1653:12 guided 1683:4 guidelines 1658:11 1659:20 1686:9 1733:12 guiding 1686:6 guilty 1656:1 Gumbi 1746:6 1748:21 1749:25 1750:3,5 gun 1628:10 1647:14</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <p>hacked 1657:12 half 1618:3,11 1659:25 1662:24 1668:18 1673:18 1676:3,5,7,9 1725:18 1746:17,17 halted 1627:3 hand 1631:23,23 1685:9 handed 1664:15 1729:15 1732:11 1733:17 handle 1724:23 handling 1662:12 hands 1657:20 1688:9 happen 1650:14 1674:18 1676:19 1677:9 1744:15 happened 1629:2 1643:6,7 1678:15 1683:22 1703:24 1705:24 1706:12 1707:3 1711:25 happening 1645:7 1654:21 1657:25 1658:1 1660:4 happens 1669:11 1711:19 1712:16 happy 1690:12 1693:20 1693:24 1750:4 hard 1708:1,5 harm 1624:19 1657:7,8 1685:13 hasn't 1652:9 1732:11 haven't 1629:3 1652:6 1675:18 1678:1 1744:1 head 1654:2 1665:11 1666:4,7 1669:4 1676:22 1687:1,11 1689:14 1717:6 1719:2 headed 1653:25 heading 1675:11,20 heads 1726:20 1728:1 1728:24 hear 1629:13 1645:22 1674:7 1680:4 1682:18 1690:14 1713:9,20,24 1714:2 heard 1622:1 1644:5,9 1673:23 1713:13 1717:9 heart 1724:6 heavy 1627:7 height 1701:7 heists 1651:19 1652:2 1655:9 held 1690:10,20 help 1625:20 1641:10 1648:10 1671:16 1678:10 1680:1 1692:5,12 1711:8 1732:17 1733:3 helped 1677:17 1680:3</p>	<p>helpful 1648:20 1720:24 hesitate 1672:2 he/she 1651:10 hierarchy 1690:19 high 1643:19 1658:18 higher 1667:13 1683:19 1689:15 1722:20 highest 1642:22 1661:3 highlight 1666:22 1746:15 highly 1656:8 1667:5 1678:24 1698:18 hijackers 1655:1 hijackings 1651:20 1652:2 history 1660:3 1669:16 1721:11 holding 1715:6 1736:11 honestly 1655:22 hope 1659:9 1692:7 1749:10 hot 1649:7 hour 1675:13,16,17 hourly 1747:3,5,12 1749:14,20 HRD 1667:16 1717:6 1737:22 huge 1646:9 1696:25 human 1642:13 1651:9 1661:15,17 1677:6 1691:7 1717:7 1720:17,18 1741:8 hundreds 1650:7 hungry 1652:5 hypothetical 1631:15 1748:22</p>	<p>implementation 1705:17 1727:18 1749:16 implemented 1663:24 1686:10 1719:6 1722:19,21 1734:15 implication 1710:11 implications 1662:11 implies 1620:21 important 1619:16 1651:5 1666:16 1669:3 1672:9 1674:10 1685:1 1687:14 1704:11 1743:10 impose 1689:19 impression 1618:5 inapplicable 1658:3 inappropriate 1689:20 inaudible 1707:24 1720:5 1734:14 incidences 1647:4 incident 1723:7 incidents 1633:9 1672:20,25 1704:25 1707:11 1709:16 1747:3 include 1666:23 1669:24 1677:6 1685:13 includes 1707:15 including 1736:4 incorporated 1636:2 incorrect 1688:11 increase 1670:10 1672:19 incurred 1670:10 indefinite 1649:14 independent 1640:7 indicate 1691:22 1730:7 1742:2 indicated 1656:9 1706:25 1723:5 1730:11 indication 1744:16 indications 1730:25 indicative 1670:9 indiscriminate 1685:18 1685:23 indiscriminately 1640:14 1652:8 1653:1 1680:22 1681:8,18,22 individual 1641:25 1646:16 1679:7,10 1684:11 1685:2 1687:12,24 1696:12 1696:23 1697:17,23 1698:4,19 individually 1681:4 1699:14 1735:23 individuals 1684:16 1698:13 indulged 1680:9 ineffective 1674:22,22 1736:16</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <p>gainfully 1679:16 gather 1626:3 1697:2 gathered 1639:21 gathering 1623:23 1652:10 1656:2 1661:7 1715:2 1723:5 gatherings 1632:18 1658:11 1659:21 1664:4 1672:25 1680:9 1708:15 gauge 1628:4,4,9 general 1641:1 1642:2 1651:15,20 1652:23 1653:2,3,18 1661:13 1665:6 1667:21 1668:1 1673:11,12,14 1687:12 1689:18 1692:20 1693:1 1696:24 1709:10 1712:1 1736:14 1737:22,23 1738:5,16 1739:6,16,18,25 1740:7,18 1742:23 1743:6 1744:13 1748:18 getting 1625:20 1631:11 1672:1 1683:3 1696:3 give 1650:25,25 1652:13,20 1655:22 1658:8 1659:24 1665:23 1668:11,22 1676:21 1681:5 1692:5,22 1699:21 1703:11 1708:1 1714:7 1733:25 1739:2 1743:1,20,24 1744:15 given 1621:10 1623:9 1626:5,22 1633:3 1649:21 1675:23 1684:8,10,10 1713:16 1713:23 1714:1</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">G</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <p>ideal 1747:13 ideals 1714:9,17 identified 1619:19 1650:9,13 identify 1650:9 IFU 1702:4 ignorant 1650:5,17 ignore 1690:21 ignored 1690:23 ignores 1669:5 ill 1748:15 illegal 1623:23 1681:17 1746:1 image 1701:18 1729:16 immediate 1626:16 1657:8 1715:9 1734:13 immediately 1733:12 1733:15 imminent 1712:20 impact 1684:13 impacts 1678:20 imperative 1669:12 impetus 1668:11 implement 1635:2 1663:15 1728:3</p>		

ineffectiveness 1629:13	1702:15	1690:22 1713:3	killings 1646:9 1697:1	1685:10 1702:13,15
influence 1727:15	international 1661:16	1721:10	kilometre 1683:14	laws 1666:24
influenced 1664:14	1661:17 1666:20	I'd 1628:23	kind 1626:17 1627:6	layers 1629:11
influencing 1731:2	1668:13 1686:5	I'll 1652:21 1658:10	1628:14 1629:16	lead 1636:25 1646:6
inform 1623:22	interpret 1737:2,3	1659:23 1663:8	1633:25 1672:5	1667:3
1658:18	interpreted 1653:3	1700:23 1705:19	1685:15 1694:10,17	leader 1683:4,4 1690:3
information 1636:2	interpreter 1624:13	1707:22 1711:18	1705:14 1707:25	1735:24
informed 1618:3	1652:15 1671:5	I'm 1629:4,18,20,22	1725:13,14 1726:12	leaders 1618:8 1733:2
inherent 1666:25	1721:13,16	1631:15 1634:23	1727:3	1741:8
initial 1670:12	interpreting 1652:18	1657:23 1658:3,13	knew 1715:20	learn 1642:8
initiative 1687:7	interrupt 1645:11	1659:5 1661:19	know 1621:1 1623:4	learned 1628:25
1688:1,3,6,18 1689:7	1663:5 1746:7	1663:4 1690:16	1632:5 1633:20,23	1629:15 1631:12
1689:10 1748:18	interrupted 1734:4	1691:4 1712:25	1634:3,7,15,25	1649:21 1665:8
initiatives 1670:23	interrupting 1632:1	1713:1 1717:5 1718:8	1640:2,9 1641:22	1674:8 1716:9
injured 1677:23	intervene 1731:14	1718:14 1719:10	1642:12 1643:21,22	leave 1658:21 1666:10
1709:19	intervention 1650:16	I've 1630:17 1638:10	1645:13 1649:22,24	1675:5 1693:11
injuries 1714:14	1650:18 1669:14	1638:11 1657:10,12	1651:20 1652:3	1700:23 1705:19,21
injuring 1709:3	1717:18 1718:17	1662:21 1708:10	1659:6 1663:11	1724:8
injury 1621:23	1719:2,25 1739:12	1717:9 1721:16,18	1667:12 1670:17	left 1649:21 1658:23
injustice 1725:6	interventions 1642:12		1674:14 1675:3	1683:8 1724:9
innocent 1640:14	1717:19	J	1676:14 1677:10,11	leg 1646:22
1656:5 1681:12	introduced 1732:16	ja 1689:3 1696:3,8,17	1677:21 1679:9	legible 1728:17
input 1665:24 1668:22	introducing 1676:17	1697:21 1698:3	1683:1,25 1687:11	legislation 1621:2
inputs 1669:7	investigating 1683:22	1700:17 1701:15,16	1695:6 1697:1	1648:2 1668:12
inquiry 1727:24	investigation 1686:19	1701:19 1703:8	1698:24 1701:17	legs 1736:1
inside 1705:15	invocation 1679:24	1706:5 1711:8,13	1703:19 1706:3	length 1631:1
Instability 1701:11	involve 1708:19	1714:19 1723:8	1708:24 1710:5	lethal 1630:16 1684:17
instance 1700:7	involved 1639:8	1735:12 1738:4	1711:18 1713:11	1695:17
1718:17 1722:24	1644:23 1677:5	jacket 1649:16,17	1715:16,20,21,21	letter 1659:14 1709:9
1723:20 1724:12,18	1690:12,13 1691:9	jackets 1649:7	1716:24 1719:14,24	1710:6,15 1712:1
1724:20 1727:10	1719:21 1720:24	JOC 1747:3,4,24	1720:25 1722:10,18	1726:19,25 1727:3,6
instructed 1688:3	1721:25 1722:5,6,6,7	joined 1637:14 1653:7	1723:4 1724:5,15	1727:12,14,22 1728:8
1744:22 1745:10	1722:10,24,25 1723:3	Joint 1699:12	1725:12 1726:12	1728:10,12,20,22
instruction 1667:3	1723:5,14,21,22	Judea 1657:25	1727:19 1728:17,19	1729:5,6,18 1730:8
1686:18 1687:10	involvement 1705:15	judges 1647:2	1732:17 1733:4,21,23	1730:17,22 1731:1,10
1689:18,22 1695:3	1722:11	judgment 1657:21	1736:20 1737:14,20	1731:16,18 1732:10
1699:3,11 1710:18	involves 1685:10	July 1728:11,22	1738:6,15 1739:4,7	1732:16,19,22,25
1728:4 1729:8	involving 1634:5	1729:20 1730:13,14	1748:22	1733:17,20 1734:9,11
1733:21 1742:12	In-service 1717:7	1730:21 1732:17	knowledge 1632:23	1735:4 1737:3,5,8,11
1745:16 1750:6	irrelevant 1658:3	1733:19 1736:24,25	1633:1 1655:3	1743:23,23 1744:2
instructional 1736:18	1672:7	1737:1,8	1732:25	letters 1733:11 1734:8
instructions 1683:3	irrespective 1653:2	June 1644:1	known 1631:9 1684:14	1737:10
1689:14 1696:21	isn't 1647:1 1676:7	justifiable 1655:20,21	knows 1685:11 1733:15	let's 1636:25 1638:7
1702:15 1741:16,21	1679:19 1692:11,25	justification 1679:25	koppie 1634:16	1663:13 1711:13
1742:17 1744:19	1729:15	justified 1670:14	1654:22 1724:14	1715:14
1745:20,21,22,23,25	issue 1625:13 1629:14	1672:22	KUPER 1714:23	let's 1696:4 1724:17,21
1746:1 1747:15,17	1651:4,17 1692:22	J-K 1738:2	1715:13	1725:25
1748:11,23 1749:5	1695:2,25 1696:6,13		K9 1740:15,19	level 1620:18,22 1630:7
instruments 1655:24	1697:10 1709:21,22	K		1630:20 1670:4
1686:5	1711:4 1733:20	kaki 1638:8,9,12	L	1675:24 1694:8,10
integral 1625:16	issued 1622:5,25	keen 1722:18,21	L 1721:3,4,7,7	1700:5,5,5,6,15
intelligence 1704:24	1623:3 1630:8	keep 1649:16 1716:24	lack 1676:10,13	1734:19 1745:24
1707:10 1748:10	1695:17 1696:1,1,2,5	keeper 1736:4	lacks 1675:25	levels 1666:22 1669:22
intend 1618:11 1647:24	1731:16 1735:22	key 1662:10	language 1688:23	1694:25 1731:25
1655:8 1675:16	issues 1636:7 1666:25	Khotso's 1640:7	1691:21	1748:8
1678:8	1669:13 1734:7	kill 1646:22 1651:4,9	languages 1691:20	lie 1676:25
intended 1655:11	1746:15	1652:8 1656:7 1679:8	large 1624:7 1627:7,16	lieutenant 1637:23
1710:20	issuing 1731:18	1679:10,13 1680:8	1680:9 1684:24	1709:9 1712:1
intensified 1663:24	item 1625:17 1729:13	1684:6,8 1691:9,13	largely 1618:25	Lieutenant-Colonel
intentionally 1658:24	it's 1621:2,21 1622:13	1692:3,17 1696:22	1685:25	1691:6
interact 1731:3,7	1624:24 1628:19	killed 1640:14 1645:23	late 1676:6 1728:22	Lieutenant-General
interactions 1653:13	1629:16 1633:2	1646:10 1653:5	launcher 1734:17	1665:13 1666:6
interest 1722:21	1659:15 1662:19	1677:22	law 1646:3,14 1653:2,8	life 1621:23 1630:6,10
interface 1619:16	1663:6 1664:20	killing 1646:25 1655:1	1653:18 1661:16	1630:23 1638:11
interfere 1631:8	1684:19,21,22	1656:3 1691:23	1677:5 1679:13,22	1641:17 1646:17
internal 1701:13,15	1688:23 1689:20	1715:17	1680:13,15 1681:7	1647:4,6 1652:24

1655:13 1661:13,14 1678:13,17 1679:21 1688:9 1691:7 1714:12,17 liked 1725:25 limited 1734:17 line 1629:9 1631:25 1632:9 1652:19 1665:6 1670:16 1671:24 1679:17 1682:22 1694:19 1712:17 listen 1648:16 1677:3 1713:22 1741:20 live 1630:2,22 1657:1 lives 1661:8 1679:21 locality 1686:2 long 1652:18,19 1673:3 1699:1 1745:3 longer 1626:18 1711:20 1712:10 1746:20 Lonmin 1721:11 look 1624:25 1650:19 1664:25 1682:6 1708:12 1720:1 looked 1691:15 1726:7 looking 1631:3 looks 1704:11 Lordship 1674:14 loss 1621:23 1688:9 1714:11,17 lost 1629:3 1683:7 1725:18 lot 1733:15,23 loud 1713:23 1714:1 lower 1667:13 1683:18 1710:23 lunch 1675:13,19 1682:11	1695:8,10,15 1696:6 1696:23 1697:7,10 1702:8 1703:25 1705:1,9,9,25 1706:13,21 1707:4,12 1707:15 1708:13,18 1709:18 1714:10,11 1725:11 1728:11 1737:7 managing 1634:11,16 mandate 1623:9 Mandela 1641:2 manner 1660:25 manual 1666:10 1695:13 1726:9,13 manuals 1666:9 1698:22 man's 1639:5 marches 1661:12 Marikana 1629:2,4 1643:7 1648:1 1675:4 1721:11 1744:23,25 1745:12,14 1746:5 mark 1662:12 1680:19 1680:21 marksman 1685:2 mass 1666:25 1667:2 massacre 1648:13 massacres 1639:21 1643:8 material 1619:11 1629:17 1659:12 matter 1647:15 1650:17 1662:16 1677:20 1686:16 1687:2,16 1689:24,25 1690:1,3,22 1692:7,9 1696:19 1697:17 1706:11 1707:2,4 1713:14 1730:12 1748:24 1749:19 matters 1648:13 1667:10 1669:11 1675:13 1689:10 1692:22 1696:13 1723:16 1734:14 1749:19 Mawela 1666:7 1673:11,14 1687:12 1709:10 1712:1 1739:6 Mawela's 1668:1 1689:18 Mbekela 1665:13 mean 1631:19 1635:16 1676:5 1691:13,20 1698:4,10,15 1701:1 1714:11 1726:23 1729:5 1732:22 1743:6 1745:16 meanings 1682:24 means 1632:2 1635:23 1683:1 1688:6 1708:14 1712:9 1715:17,17 1716:4 1736:16 1742:13	meant 1676:2 1715:6 measure 1685:16 measures 1686:9 MECs 1726:21 media 1709:17 meeting 1686:25 member 1622:19 1632:10 1647:5 1680:25 1681:15 1684:10 1690:10,19 1736:6 1747:18 members 1618:9,10 1620:19 1621:4,7 1622:2,12 1625:1,14 1626:6 1629:12,19 1633:13,20,24 1634:4 1634:20 1635:7,12,21 1650:14 1661:2 1670:21 1675:21,24 1683:2 1695:25 1699:14 1732:3 1735:20,22 1736:8 1745:20,21,23 1747:13 1748:15 memorandum 1663:20 mention 1659:22 mentioned 1633:18 1702:3 1736:13 mentions 1727:9 merely 1650:24 1693:16 message 1738:16 meters 1735:21 methods 1623:1 1624:22 1630:8 1672:24 1736:16 middle 1666:20 militarised 1638:2,15 1638:15,19,21 1639:2 1640:21 military 1640:13 1691:16,17 millimetre 1627:13 1628:3,5 mind 1626:2 1641:17 1641:24 1708:2 minds 1651:5 mindset 1641:3 1642:16 1649:24 mine 1720:12 1721:11 1744:24,24 1745:12 1745:13 mingled 1681:12 minimal 1732:21 minimum 1686:8 1732:20,23 1734:19 1736:4,10 minister 1641:1 1643:24 1644:7 1646:11 1658:6,7 1660:3 1663:19 1664:17,18 1666:9,17 1666:19 1667:10 1668:4 1669:1 1676:13 1686:23 1687:3 1688:15	1690:21 1692:21,24 1692:25 ministerial 1665:8 minister's 1664:8 1665:15,20 1675:2,21 1687:8 ministry 1728:25 minority 1652:5 minus 1744:17 minute 1747:12 minutes 1746:19,23,23 mirror 1701:18 misbehave 1652:7 misbehaving 1681:13 misconduct 1742:17 missed 1655:6 mission 1741:10 1744:20 misunderstanding 1618:4 misunderstood 1626:13 1742:10 mixed 1655:23 mobile 1683:6 modules 1619:22 moment 1648:22 moments 1749:25 money 1670:15 months 1659:25 1662:24 1668:18 1669:2 1673:19 1676:1,3,6,7,9 morning 1618:12 1649:12 1703:15 1706:17 1725:18 1733:24 1734:2 1744:6 1746:21 1747:2 motivation 1697:1 move 1624:9 1675:8 moving 1624:15 1631:5 Mthethwa 1658:7 Mufamadi 1641:2 Municipal 1660:24 munitions 1721:17 Mustard 1735:18 must've 1730:18 M9A1 1735:19	nature 1672:20 1708:16 1730:23 1731:2 1732:5 NAU 1655:16 nearly 1749:3 necessarily 1622:14 1647:7 1657:6 1689:23 1718:4 1731:9 1745:18 necessary 1632:8 1644:22 1646:18 1648:20 1649:11 1650:15 1655:18 1670:22 1700:14 1715:15 1716:5 1733:20 1736:9 1741:24 1742:8 need 1619:19,20 1622:15 1650:9,9,10 1650:12 1672:21 1691:23 1716:11 1717:17,23 1731:5 1732:20 needed 1670:3 1700:8 needs 1694:9 1717:16 1717:18 negative 1672:23 1709:16 negatively 1701:1 negotiations 1661:7 1734:15 neither 1702:11 never 1638:11 1644:5 1659:9 1699:14 1723:13 1735:22 new 1635:2,16 1701:12 1701:24 1733:20 news 1708:25 night 1660:14 nine 1618:3,11 1637:17 1638:3 NIU 1621:19 1633:16 1656:20 1700:11 1701:22 1702:8 1704:23 1705:15 1715:7 1718:17 1722:5 1737:19 1738:25 1739:8 Nkosi 1644:25 1671:23 1692:21 nodded 1654:2 nominated 1650:15 nominations 1717:23 non 1630:15 non-lethal 1622:3 1623:1 1628:3 1630:8 1695:7,11 normal 1732:7 normally 1683:5 1685:16 1689:13 1698:9 North 1744:21 1745:10 notice 1625:9 1645:7 1663:9 1686:15 1732:8,19	
<hr/> M <hr/> machine 1682:17 Madlanga 1618:12 MAHLANGU 1671:11 1690:16 1740:22,24 1745:3 main 1737:9 maintain 1669:18 maintained 1672:17 1744:23 1745:11 Major 1658:12 1659:21 making 1644:21 man 1636:12 1639:8,10 1721:16 manage 1734:14 management 1619:3 1620:16,19 1621:15 1621:17,24 1622:6,14 1622:19,21 1623:2,13 1623:22 1624:2 1625:23 1633:6,8,25 1655:17,18 1660:23 1660:24 1662:5,8 1666:22 1668:1 1669:25 1670:19 1675:24 1694:22,25	Mawela's 1668:1 1689:18 Mbekela 1665:13 mean 1631:19 1635:16 1676:5 1691:13,20 1698:4,10,15 1701:1 1714:11 1726:23 1729:5 1732:22 1743:6 1745:16 meanings 1682:24 means 1632:2 1635:23 1683:1 1688:6 1708:14 1712:9 1715:17,17 1716:4 1736:16 1742:13	meant 1676:2 1715:6 measure 1685:16 measures 1686:9 MECs 1726:21 media 1709:17 meeting 1686:25 member 1622:19 1632:10 1647:5 1680:25 1681:15 1684:10 1690:10,19 1736:6 1747:18 members 1618:9,10 1620:19 1621:4,7 1622:2,12 1625:1,14 1626:6 1629:12,19 1633:13,20,24 1634:4 1634:20 1635:7,12,21 1650:14 1661:2 1670:21 1675:21,24 1683:2 1695:25 1699:14 1732:3 1735:20,22 1736:8 1745:20,21,23 1747:13 1748:15 memorandum 1663:20 mention 1659:22 mentioned 1633:18 1702:3 1736:13 mentions 1727:9 merely 1650:24 1693:16 message 1738:16 meters 1735:21 methods 1623:1 1624:22 1630:8 1672:24 1736:16 middle 1666:20 militarised 1638:2,15 1638:15,19,21 1639:2 1640:21 military 1640:13 1691:16,17 millimetre 1627:13 1628:3,5 mind 1626:2 1641:17 1641:24 1708:2 minds 1651:5 mindset 1641:3 1642:16 1649:24 mine 1720:12 1721:11 1744:24,24 1745:12 1745:13 mingled 1681:12 minimal 1732:21 minimum 1686:8 1732:20,23 1734:19 1736:4,10 minister 1641:1 1643:24 1644:7 1646:11 1658:6,7 1660:3 1663:19 1664:17,18 1666:9,17 1666:19 1667:10 1668:4 1669:1 1676:13 1686:23 1687:3 1688:15	1690:21 1692:21,24 1692:25 ministerial 1665:8 minister's 1664:8 1665:15,20 1675:2,21 1687:8 ministry 1728:25 minority 1652:5 minus 1744:17 minute 1747:12 minutes 1746:19,23,23 mirror 1701:18 misbehave 1652:7 misbehaving 1681:13 misconduct 1742:17 missed 1655:6 mission 1741:10 1744:20 misunderstanding 1618:4 misunderstood 1626:13 1742:10 mixed 1655:23 mobile 1683:6 modules 1619:22 moment 1648:22 moments 1749:25 money 1670:15 months 1659:25 1662:24 1668:18 1669:2 1673:19 1676:1,3,6,7,9 morning 1618:12 1649:12 1703:15 1706:17 1725:18 1733:24 1734:2 1744:6 1746:21 1747:2 motivation 1697:1 move 1624:9 1675:8 moving 1624:15 1631:5 Mthethwa 1658:7 Mufamadi 1641:2 Municipal 1660:24 munitions 1721:17 Mustard 1735:18 must've 1730:18 M9A1 1735:19	<hr/> N <hr/> N 1645:21 name 1627:17 1643:6 1643:23 1658:9 1659:19 1669:23 1670:4 1714:7 1739:3 1739:4 Natal 1640:12 Nathi 1658:7 national 1619:6 1660:24 1668:12 1669:8,17,18 1689:15 1695:3 1717:20 1718:17 1719:2,25 1728:10,24 1729:19 1736:18 1739:11	nature 1672:20 1708:16 1730:23 1731:2 1732:5 NAU 1655:16 nearly 1749:3 necessarily 1622:14 1647:7 1657:6 1689:23 1718:4 1731:9 1745:18 necessary 1632:8 1644:22 1646:18 1648:20 1649:11 1650:15 1655:18 1670:22 1700:14 1715:15 1716:5 1733:20 1736:9 1741:24 1742:8 need 1619:19,20 1622:15 1650:9,9,10 1650:12 1672:21 1691:23 1716:11 1717:17,23 1731:5 1732:20 needed 1670:3 1700:8 needs 1694:9 1717:16 1717:18 negative 1672:23 1709:16 negatively 1701:1 negotiations 1661:7 1734:15 neither 1702:11 never 1638:11 1644:5 1659:9 1699:14 1723:13 1735:22 new 1635:2,16 1701:12 1701:24 1733:20 news 1708:25 night 1660:14 nine 1618:3,11 1637:17 1638:3 NIU 1621:19 1633:16 1656:20 1700:11 1701:22 1702:8 1704:23 1705:15 1715:7 1718:17 1722:5 1737:19 1738:25 1739:8 Nkosi 1644:25 1671:23 1692:21 nodded 1654:2 nominated 1650:15 nominations 1717:23 non 1630:15 non-lethal 1622:3 1623:1 1628:3 1630:8 1695:7,11 normal 1732:7 normally 1683:5 1685:16 1689:13 1698:9 North 1744:21 1745:10 notice 1625:9 1645:7 1663:9 1686:15 1732:8,19

<p>notion 1672:22 1708:18 notions 1640:17 notorious 1701:10 NOVEMBER 1618:1 Nqakula 1645:21 number 1618:4 1620:8 1655:25 1670:10 1684:24 1696:25 1700:10 1724:13 1726:17 1730:4 1732:13 1741:9 1743:20,25 1746:2 numbered 1729:5,5 1732:10 numbers 1729:18 numerous 1629:11 1630:15 1639:20 1747:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">O</p> <p>oath 1618:14 1649:3,16 1682:15 1726:4 objection 1664:19,20 1679:11 1688:11 1703:5,20 1715:18 1716:1 objective 1622:2 1624:9 1712:4 1734:24 obliged 1669:17 obsolete 1630:19 obvious 1742:5 obviously 1644:20 1648:15 1674:3 1678:5 1680:3 1688:8 1698:4 1730:21 1732:18 1749:4 occasions 1629:6 occurs 1685:16 offensive 1725:5 1734:18 offer 1705:6 offered 1620:12 office 1619:6 1643:19 1652:3 1664:1 1687:1 1689:16,19 1696:18 1717:6 officer 1620:25 1630:6 1630:12,21 1637:2,18 1637:24 1638:3 1639:13 1641:25 1643:4 1646:14,16 1657:9 1661:25 1679:1 1680:23 1681:7 1685:1,10,11 1692:20 1703:14,17 1736:11 1747:25 officers 1622:24 1628:20 1631:23,24 1632:7 1639:14,18 1645:24 1646:10 1651:18 1652:11,25 1656:16 1687:1,16,25 1745:15 1748:9,10 officer's 1667:7 offices 1651:16</p>	<p>official 1692:19 Oh 1637:13 1670:20 1676:8 1681:20 1705:12 1716:21 1721:15 okay 1694:7,20 1699:7 1699:9,10 1700:17,23 1702:2 1704:10,20 1707:20 1708:11 1710:1,9,22 1715:19 1715:23,24 1716:3 1721:7 1738:8 1740:21 1744:11 1745:7 1746:2 1750:1 once 1712:4,25 1725:22 1734:24 1740:18 ones 1671:2 1691:5,6 1719:7 ongoing 1731:22 onwards 1681:25 opening 1628:24 operating 1684:15 1701:24 1746:1 operation 1619:3 1661:2 1694:9 1703:15 1704:1 1705:25 1706:13,21 1707:4 1724:20,20 1727:25 1729:21,22 1746:4 operational 1619:20,24 1627:2 1633:10 1656:11,18 1665:23 1666:4,7 1668:1,15 1671:1 1683:4,11 1686:5 1689:24,25,25 1690:5,8 1695:4 1699:3,12,22 1700:19 1704:23 1705:6 1722:14 1726:20 1727:16 1732:6 1733:10,12 1735:24 1736:1,5 1747:10,10 1747:13 1749:19 operationalisation 1668:23 operationalised 1731:24 operationalising 1627:1 1671:3 operationally 1694:25 1732:1,4 operations 1619:17 1620:3 1625:17 1626:15 1699:12 1705:2,9,10 1707:12 1742:16 operators 1625:15 opinion 1628:17,19 1638:25,25 1648:9 1677:20,25 1692:11 opportunity 1694:17 opposed 1631:7 opposite 1710:23 1711:2 option 1691:11</p>	<p>options 1695:11 1724:25 1725:5,5 order 1619:4 1621:4,7 1622:5,19 1623:10 1624:20 1629:20 1633:4,5,7,25 1634:4 1634:10 1641:10 1656:25 1660:23,25 1661:5,9 1662:6 1668:11,24 1672:14 1672:21 1675:1,22,25 1680:23 1686:3 1687:2,7 1690:1 1694:13 1695:3 1698:10 1699:2,16,18 1699:21 1700:21 1711:5,9,15 1713:2 1713:16 1714:6 1720:20 1723:12 1728:10 1736:14 1744:22 1745:11 1747:6 1748:1,10,17 ordered 1679:8 orders 1686:17 1700:3 1702:16 1711:18 1713:22,23 1746:4 1748:12,13,16,19 ordinarily 1684:16 ordinary 1642:10 1683:2 organisations 1686:4 ORS 1687:12 1690:24 1719:5 ought 1651:5 1654:21 1660:4 1673:19 outcomes 1741:25,25 outline 1651:1 outlined 1695:10 outside 1721:10 overall 1700:4,19 1747:23 overlapping 1700:10 1700:13 overrun 1631:18,22 1632:2 overview 1620:1 o'clock 1618:6 1675:9</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <p>page 1660:20,22 1661:12 1662:9 1664:2 1666:20 1668:10 1669:14 1670:6 1672:11 1675:20 1677:4 1682:1,6,19 1685:8 1686:3 1698:25 1707:23 1708:1 1709:6 1712:2,2 1714:5 1734:10 1744:20 pages 1699:5 1726:18 pangas 1655:24 paper 1749:17 para 1746:13 parade 1746:5</p>	<p>paragraph 1661:12 1663:9 1668:10 1669:10,15 1670:6 1672:10,11 1685:9 1708:12 1709:13 1734:9 1735:5,6,7,9 1735:17 1736:13 pardon 1644:8 1676:4 part 1629:2 1638:11 1642:3 1653:5,9 1655:6 1662:5 1687:20 1688:8 1700:2 1704:21 1706:22 1709:21 1719:18 1726:10 1732:13,14 1736:6,12 1749:7 participants 1709:19 participate 1654:21 participated 1654:24 particular 1631:7 1649:23 1660:19 1663:9 1673:24 1675:1 1686:2 1700:7 1713:23 1733:5 particularly 1619:2 1640:11 1718:11 particulars 1626:5 pass 1632:3 1657:21 1738:16 passage 1631:12 1660:21 1662:10,21 1674:19,21 passed 1650:10 1727:17 1733:8 patrol 1620:25 peaceful 1630:14 1708:16,18 Pele 1642:13 people 1619:14,24 1623:20 1624:7 1628:15 1630:10 1638:22 1639:16,21 1640:13,14 1642:10 1642:17 1646:18 1650:13 1652:4,11 1654:8 1655:1,4,8,23 1656:3,3,6,13,17 1657:16 1658:20 1661:8 1672:8 1677:22 1679:12 1680:11 1681:12,13 1682:24 1683:1,11 1684:3,5 1685:15 1689:8,9 1691:8 1698:18 1703:16 1709:3 1710:12,17 1713:19,24 1714:1 1715:17 1716:4 1719:25 1724:14,15 1724:17,18,22 1726:10 1728:1 1731:10 1733:5 1738:24 1741:12 1742:11 1745:19 1748:11</p>	<p>perceive 1712:10 percentage 1705:17 perform 1633:8 1670:15 1687:7 performed 1723:19 period 1638:8,13 1642:7 1643:5,8,9,20 1670:9 1684:25 1696:25 permanent 1683:6 permission 1716:12 permit 1624:3 perpetually 1679:2 person 1623:23 1636:1 1646:7,15,22,24 1656:24 1657:6,6,15 1668:14 1674:1 1681:5 1685:14 1693:2 1699:21 1709:10 1713:12 1718:19 1719:24 1722:14 1739:4 1740:10 1743:10 personal 1622:7 1625:13 personally 1628:13 1673:4 1678:22 1730:17 personnel 1666:22 1719:3 1727:11 1747:22 persons 1655:11 1680:10 1748:3 person's 1647:4 perspective 1627:3 1628:12 1629:19 1666:20 PFMA 1670:16 phase 1691:10 phases 1736:3 1739:22 phenomenon 1685:25 phrase 1623:14,17 physically 1718:21,22 1718:25 Pilate 1657:20,24 1658:3 Pillay 1659:13,15,18 1660:15,19 1732:12 1743:20,22 1744:4,7 1744:10 pistol 1622:12 pistols 1622:11 1656:15 1695:16,21 1696:5 place 1619:10 1624:15 1624:18,21 1628:20 1637:19 1650:24 1653:20 1661:6 1674:5,10,12 1701:21 1716:25 1717:19 1729:25 1730:2 1731:18 placed 1689:12 1717:19 1736:23 plan 1634:15,22,24,25 1635:2,8,15,16 1636:11,12,17,20</p>
---	--	---	--	--

1637:7 1654:15,18 1717:20,21 1742:19 1742:21,22,23 1744:14,17 1745:8 1746:3 1749:14,16 planned 1749:20 plans 1704:24 Platinum 1744:24,24 1745:12,13 platoon 1683:2,3,4,8 1735:24 play 1683:2 1700:8 1715:6 please 1618:23 1647:13 1647:21,22 1662:13 1664:7 1680:12 1682:19 1704:6 1716:23 1719:9 1725:21 1734:4 1735:3 1742:3 1745:6 plight 1743:19 plus 1744:17 point 1647:16 1648:10 1648:21 1649:9,10 1653:15,16 1664:2 1671:14 1674:25 1678:4,10 1693:7,22 1702:12,20 1707:15 1712:19 1732:15 1742:3 pointed 1646:7 1647:15 pointing 1646:5,6 points 1636:3 1644:20 1645:23 1648:17 1671:18 policeman 1641:16 1679:7,19 1680:7 1681:10 1695:22 1696:12,16 1700:24 1701:7 policemen 1620:13 1622:5 1653:5 1657:11,12 1680:10 1681:11,22 1696:10 1697:17 police's 1685:20 policies 1666:25 1667:2 1686:6 policing 1619:4 1621:5 1623:10,15,18,24 1633:4,6,25 1634:5 1634:10,11,16 1642:3 1658:11 1659:20 1660:24 1666:11 1668:16 1669:18,22 1670:2,2 1672:15,22 1672:24 1673:6 1675:2,22,25 1678:23 1679:1 1682:25 1694:13 1708:14 1748:10 policy 1658:10 1659:20 1664:23 1665:8 1671:22,25 1675:2 1685:21 1688:12,15 1692:22,24 1694:13	1695:7 1736:18 political 1643:19,19 Pontius 1657:20,24 1658:2 POP 1621:5,10 1622:2 1622:12,19 1624:1,4 1624:14 1625:1,3,17 1626:5 1627:5 1629:25 1631:10,19 1632:7,10,17 1633:4 1633:13,20 1634:4,20 1635:7,15,22 1636:11 1659:2 1670:12,21 1672:16 1688:13 1694:21,25 1695:14 1700:4,11,12,13,18 1701:12,22 1720:20 1721:24 1722:7 1732:6 1735:19,22 1736:1 1745:1,14 1746:4 POPS 1652:3 1669:20 1672:13 popular 1652:2 portion 1628:24 1746:12 posed 1666:16 1734:22 position 1619:6 1622:17 1626:4,13 1658:1 1664:24 1676:1 1685:2 1687:15 1688:15 1716:16 1740:10 possibility 1630:2 1684:19 possible 1666:15 1692:21 1698:16 1711:9 1713:3 possibly 1646:21 1652:8,9 1657:8 1733:2,3 posts 1740:9 post-mortem 1723:15 Potchefstroom 1694:1 1723:6 practical 1662:15 1723:21 1738:24 1739:8 practically 1724:19,22 practices 1677:8 precise 1659:24 precisely 1631:2 preclude 1686:20 prefer 1635:21 1695:4 preliminary 1619:5 premise 1632:2 preparation 1693:25 prepared 1635:20 1656:22 1657:21 1658:22 1725:19 preparing 1671:25 prescribes 1661:9 prescription 1678:25 present 1650:16,16 1658:5 1715:2,9 1721:19	presentation 1620:8 1621:22 1635:11 1636:3 1673:23 1721:8 presented 1619:13,23 1620:1,16,17 1663:25 1664:16 1676:18 1717:25 1725:1 1740:19 presenting 1718:25 1719:7 1731:11 president 1641:2 presumably 1622:1 1679:19 Pretoria 1717:6 prevail 1643:14 prevent 1631:11 prevented 1648:12 prevention 1744:22,25 1745:11,14 1748:9 previous 1728:15 previously 1626:17 1633:24 1634:4 1657:11 pre-apartheid 1660:2 prima 1647:22 primarily 1733:2 primary 1694:21 1695:15 principle 1661:22 principles 1642:13 1658:19 print 1709:16 prior 1731:16 private 1679:23,25 1681:6 probably 1643:1 1749:6 problem 1669:1 1708:4 1708:7,8 1727:16 1749:16 Procedure 1630:11 1653:19 procedures 1661:6 1667:3 1690:1 proceed 1618:23 1645:10 1647:21 1688:11 1703:10 1722:18 1734:4 proceedings 1618:1 1629:1 process 1619:18,23 1653:10 1659:1 1663:12 1670:1 1687:11,13 1689:18 1733:9 procession 1631:5,9 1632:4 produced 1658:6 1676:6 1693:4 professional 1677:8 program 1717:25 programme 1618:8 1620:6,17 1650:11 1663:16 1690:3 programmes 1663:24	1663:25 prohibition 1702:7,13 1705:14,21 1706:24 1706:25 1707:7 project 1676:17 prominence 1643:1 promoting 1743:1 promotion 1642:22 proper 1648:1 1662:15 properly 1683:24 1684:15 1685:3,4 1692:9 1717:24 property 1661:8 1714:18 proportional 1646:5 1647:6 1734:21 proportionality 1646:4 propose 1630:25 1694:18 proposing 1725:17 proposition 1680:12,15 1680:18 1688:12 1705:5,8 protect 1622:25 1624:22 1646:18,20 1679:20 1696:16 protected 1629:10 protecting 1632:9 protection 1622:7 1658:19 1695:17,23 protest 1630:18 1661:12 1677:9 1678:21 1679:1 1682:21 1686:7 protesters 1629:6 1631:6 1661:13 protests 1658:11 1659:20 1662:12 1668:16 1670:11 1672:19,25 1682:25 1685:20 1686:12 proud 1643:4 prove 1679:14 1736:16 proved 1682:23 provided 1663:16 province 1640:6 1744:21 1745:10 provincial 1726:19,20 1728:23,24 1729:19 1744:21 1745:9 provision 1717:20 provoked 1670:8 public 1618:10 1619:4 1621:4,7 1622:5 1623:10 1624:20 1633:4,5,7,8,24 1634:4,10 1636:22 1650:23 1656:14 1658:11 1659:20 1661:7,12,14 1662:12 1666:11 1668:16,24 1669:18 1670:18 1672:14,19,21,23 1673:5 1675:1,22,25 1677:9 1679:1 1682:21,25 1685:20	1685:21 1686:7,11 1690:1 1694:13 1705:1 1707:11 1714:6 1720:20 1722:25 1723:12 1728:10 1744:22 1745:11 1748:10 publicity 1709:16 pulled 1698:4 pulling 1681:15 1698:2 purified 1701:21,25 purports 1728:9 purpose 1625:2 1645:5 1658:17 1685:11 1704:21,22 1717:23 1727:4 1734:18 1737:11 purposely 1685:13 purposes 1622:20 1654:5 1696:5 1724:3 1749:7 pursuance 1622:2 pursue 1631:1 put 1639:1 1648:5 1650:14 1653:21 1654:9 1655:9 1657:14,18 1659:7,12 1660:10,21 1663:20 1666:12 1671:8 1674:2 1676:15 1687:2,25 1691:25 1702:20 1703:2,12 1707:7 1719:14,15,18 1722:12,20 1724:9 1727:25 1734:7 1741:24 1742:8 puts 1661:6 putting 1631:15 1648:9 1671:19 1681:6 1702:7 1719:21 1748:25 pyrotechnics 1734:17
Q				
				quality 1654:6 1741:10 quarter 1645:11 1675:12,16,17 query 1664:8 1665:15 1665:20 1666:8 1668:3 question 1627:22,25 1629:18 1630:20,21 1631:2 1635:6,6,21 1642:24 1648:8,11,19 1651:5,11 1652:25 1655:6 1657:13,24 1658:4 1662:19,23 1671:2 1673:22 1674:1,14 1679:5,23 1680:2,6,14,19,19,20 1681:6 1689:2,5,6 1691:7 1693:2 1694:10 1696:15 1699:13 1703:3,6,10 1703:13 1706:2,4,4,7 1706:18 1709:24

1710:10 1716:1 1722:12 1726:7 1731:15 1733:4,14,16 1735:4 1745:1 1748:7 1749:1,9,13 questioned 1643:20 questioning 1688:25 questions 1618:25 1619:5 1625:2 1626:8 1628:23 1629:23 1632:13,15 1636:1 1637:10 1639:4 1647:16,20,21 1648:20 1652:10,18 1652:19,24 1662:10 1663:5 1664:17 1666:16 1672:5,6 1692:6,24 1694:17 1700:16 1709:17 1711:9 1719:10,14 1724:9 1725:24 1726:17 1741:1,5 1748:22 1750:3,4 quicker 1646:21 1749:6 quickly 1725:1 quite 1638:2 1644:19 quotation 1645:5,15,16 1673:3 quoted 1700:21 quotes 1669:19 Q-A-K-U-L-A 1645:22	read 1629:5 1633:12 1635:10 1644:6,10 1658:10 1660:11 1662:5,10,21 1668:16 1668:17,19,21 1672:10,11 1679:6 1686:12,13 1690:17 1691:5 1696:10 1699:1,7,23 1704:20 1707:8 1708:12 1709:13 1721:18 1735:12 1745:9 reading 1658:15 1746:13 real 1629:22 realise 1724:8 really 1625:2 1629:4 1648:10 1649:22 1689:8 1692:12 1703:16 reason 1622:24 1624:18 1639:2 1656:23 1666:15 1668:6 1716:10 1741:23 1746:16 reasonable 1637:5 1712:3 1734:23 reasons 1643:1 1670:11 1744:16 1747:14 recall 1626:20 1628:7 1628:10 1635:10 1642:2,11 1643:12,13 1645:25 1650:8 1652:22 1658:15,16 1665:17 1666:13 1677:1,14 1695:3 1698:21,22 1710:15 1726:15,24 1730:20 1731:23 recalled 1727:12 received 1642:21 1689:21 1732:7 1733:11 receiving 1699:15 recognition 1661:16 recommendations 1660:8 record 1654:6 1664:21 1678:12 1703:18 1735:13 1736:4,5 recreational 1708:15 recruiting 1636:16 redress 1669:14 reduce 1686:8,10 refer 1625:14 1626:1 1628:2,8 1639:9 1656:7,7 1724:24 1739:11 1745:5 reference 1620:7 1621:3,4,7 1625:10 1626:14 1675:23 1712:5 1726:8 1729:7 referred 1625:13 1628:11 1639:2 1659:2 1667:10 1695:22 1709:10,24	1717:10 1729:13,17 referring 1623:25 1628:7 1638:5,13 1639:12 1657:15 1662:7 1691:23 1723:6 1729:10 refers 1732:19,20 reflects 1620:1 reformulate 1636:12 1689:2,5 1715:25 reformulating 1636:17 refresher 1676:17,18 1677:4 regard 1626:21 1629:16 1649:6 1655:3 1664:6 1682:1 1686:22 1690:8 1723:23 1735:16 regarded 1678:23 regarding 1709:17 regards 1735:16 regime 1639:20 registered 1688:10 regroup 1635:1,16 1636:11 Regulation 1632:18 reinforcement 1666:23 reiterate 1740:8 relate 1689:10 1696:22 related 1718:2 relates 1744:14 relating 1705:14 relation 1618:8 1619:2 1642:17 1645:8 1666:12 1671:18 1673:3 1688:9 relayed 1684:3 released 1670:3 relegated 1669:25 relevance 1660:2 1672:12 1674:1 relevant 1648:8 1662:14 1663:1 1683:13 1731:17 1732:15 1733:22 remained 1653:19 remarkable 1670:9 remember 1618:16 1643:23 1644:4 1656:14 1659:11 1660:12 1711:10 remind 1618:15 1643:23 1682:15 reminded 1710:10 removed 1683:12 render 1704:23 rendering 1675:1 repeat 1631:1 1642:24 1745:6 repeated 1662:2 repeating 1628:24 repercussions 1683:7 rephrase 1637:4 1655:6 1703:13 replace 1733:21 replaced 1729:8	replied 1653:1 report 1621:1 1664:7 1664:10,12,17 1665:14 1688:4 1693:6 1739:22 reported 1747:3,4 reports 1691:7 1708:25 1747:3,6 1749:14,20 represented 1722:1 represents 1724:13 republic 1640:8 1654:8 reputation 1640:21 requested 1742:20,22 require 1732:23 required 1678:24 1688:17 1715:13 requirement 1668:3 requirements 1661:4,9 requisites 1679:24 research 1619:21,22 1650:19 1675:22 1718:13 1723:18 reserving 1744:2 reshuffling 1739:3 resolve 1692:5 resort 1630:5,13 1685:16 1710:13 1734:16 1736:17 resource 1717:7 1720:17 1741:8 resources 1670:3 1720:19 respect 1619:7 1620:18 1622:18 1625:5 1626:6 1631:16 1648:7 1650:7 1652:24 1677:20 1679:15 1689:7 1728:8 respond 1634:21 1635:7,13 1651:19 1703:2 responder 1690:8 responders 1620:18 responding 1698:10 response 1636:13 1664:23 1666:4,7 1671:1 1682:21 1688:14,14 1702:22 1702:23 1720:7 1726:20 1734:16 Responses 1668:1 responsibilities 1690:10,19 1700:10 1700:13 1718:1 responsibility 1633:7 1634:10 1641:17 1673:8,9 1720:12 responsible 1654:20 1657:25 1673:14 1681:16 1689:17 1690:6,11,20 1693:1 1718:8,14 1739:21 restore 1673:5 restrain 1667:6 restructuring 1669:21	1670:1,7 result 1667:8 1677:24 resulted 1673:1 resulting 1686:21 1709:16 results 1685:21 resume 1649:2 1675:19 1746:20 1750:8 resumes 1618:2 1648:25 1682:12,13 1726:2,3 return 1623:7 1685:20 review 1666:23,25 1667:9 1668:14 1686:7,19 1732:21 1736:10 reviewed 1663:11 reviews 1685:21 revising 1676:17 revoked 1649:10 1737:7 revulsion 1640:20,22 re-educate 1641:15 re-establish 1674:10,15 re-established 1672:17 1673:25 1674:11 rifle 1684:23 right 1621:15 1630:10 1647:12,14 1661:13 1661:14,15 1674:14 1676:15 1681:21 1684:16 1688:1 1693:14 1716:16 1721:20 1727:22 1749:1 rightfully 1713:18 rights 1642:13 1661:17 1661:17 1666:25 1668:12 1677:7 riots 1668:16 rise 1645:6 risk 1685:12 1686:10 1694:8,11 1700:5 1725:13 1726:9,12 robbed 1696:11 robberies 1651:20 1652:2 1655:10 robbers 1655:2,2 robots 1745:23 role 1656:2 1700:7 1715:6 roles 1683:2 rookie 1651:8 ROS 1740:9 round 1628:14 rounds 1626:12 1709:18 1710:19 1727:10 1734:9,12 1735:5,16,19,20,25 1736:14,17 1737:6 route 1744:23 1745:12 row 1663:6 rubber 1622:23 1623:4 1623:5 1626:12,16 1627:6,9,13,14,20,21 1627:23,24 1628:4,6
R				
R 1659:13,13,16,18,19 1682:20 1685:9 radio 1683:14,23 radios 1685:3 raise 1702:20 1732:18 raised 1619:20 1650:18 1662:10 1692:23 raising 1629:18 1636:4 1709:17 Ramapela 1741:4,6,15 1741:20,23 1742:4,7 1742:11,18 1743:11 1743:15 1744:12 1745:6,7 1746:2,11 1746:14,22 1747:1,21 1748:7 1749:12,22,23 1750:1 Ramapele 1746:8,9 random 1680:11 range 1716:24 1718:22 rank 1637:21 1642:22 1645:6 1667:13 1687:16 1736:11 ranks 1683:18,19 rare 1685:25 rationalise 1722:11 rationalisation 1670:13 reach 1624:10 1641:20 reaching 1624:21 react 1715:14,15 1716:5 reactions 1655:13				

1628:8,9,11,14,17 1629:8,10,14 1630:16 1631:13 1656:15 1709:18 1710:16,16 1727:10 1734:9,12 1735:5,16,20,25 1736:14,17 1737:6 rules 1667:1 1679:22 ruling 1692:13 running 1660:19 runs 1741:16,21 Rustenburg 1745:1,14 R5 1657:9 R5s 1695:18	scientific 1677:7 Scott 1636:6 1654:16 1691:6 1694:18 scrutiny 1672:23 se 1691:24 1695:4 1707:19 second 1670:6 1671:4 1672:10 1714:5 1737:11 secondary 1669:25 1675:2 Secondly 1670:20 secretariat 1729:1 secretary 1728:25 section 1619:2 1628:13 1667:19 1669:19 1672:15 1735:23 sections 1689:8 secure 1654:8 1715:2 1741:12 Security 1643:24 see 1620:11 1635:19,23 1645:10,11 1651:16 1681:20 1700:21 1705:15,16,18 1714:24 1718:18 1719:6 1722:21 1723:11 1727:5 1729:3 1734:25 1735:1 1737:10 1741:9,19 1744:1 seeing 1729:10 seek 1646:20 seen 1629:17 1630:17 1654:15,17 1657:10 1657:12 1720:25 1721:16 self 1667:3,6 1695:17 1695:23 semantic 1688:6 Semenya 1628:25 1631:13 1636:5,8 1664:20 1665:2,5 1674:2,5,24 1678:1 1679:11 1688:10 1702:11 1705:4 1733:14,25 1734:3 senior 1687:1,25 1692:19,19,25 1709:2 1709:10 sense 1701:23 1720:24 1724:18 1748:14 sensible 1675:7 sensitive 1631:4 1651:17 sent 1730:13 sentence 1677:4 1690:9 1699:8,14 separate 1625:15 serious 1621:23 1633:9 1641:15 1669:1 1670:8 1683:7 1685:5 1685:12 1742:13,14 1742:16 seriously 1638:2 1677:23	seriousness 1734:21 served 1656:4 service 1619:17 1621:22 1653:7 1670:10 1671:1 1679:12 1689:21 1717:16 1732:6 1745:22 Services 1666:4,7 serving 1643:15 sessions 1722:24 set 1625:10 1631:12 1656:20 share 1651:14 sharp 1630:5,12,24 1655:24 Sharpeville 1640:1 she's 1660:16 shoot 1630:21 1646:15 1651:4 1652:8,23 1653:1 1679:8,13 1680:8,11,22 1681:8 1681:22 1684:6,8 1696:22 1710:18 shooting 1639:3 1647:7 1647:8 1710:12,21 1711:10,14 1712:16 1713:2,3,20 short 1644:18 1684:25 shorten 1628:23 shortly 1623:8 1644:2 shot 1628:10,10 1639:21 1681:16 1710:17,17 1713:9,10 1713:13 shotgun 1622:10,23 1623:3 1735:5,18,18 1735:22 shotguns 1622:5 1734:9,12 1735:16 shots 1713:12,15 shouldn't 1684:18 1719:14 should've 1724:9 show 1647:19 1672:10 showing 1647:25 shown 1675:23 1712:25 1713:1 shut 1639:15 side 1622:6,18,18,25 1639:11 1695:16,21 1695:25 1696:5,16 1727:16 1733:8 sides 1690:15 sight 1629:3 significant 1733:19 1735:14 significantly 1678:10 Silwane 1739:11 similar 1643:6 1667:13 simple 1705:8 1742:12 simplification 1639:4 simply 1682:25 1684:21 1706:15 single 1678:25 singly 1663:7	Sir 1624:16 1625:19 1632:5,22 1635:18 1636:21 1637:16,20 1638:10,16,24 1639:6 1640:3 1643:12,18 1646:14 1650:6 1651:12 1653:24 1654:11 1657:10,17 1658:8 1660:6 1663:10 1664:14 1667:25 1668:9 1671:11 1677:20 1682:16 1686:24 1697:12 1724:11 1735:11 1740:14,18 1749:11 sit 1636:24 1651:16 1725:18 situated 1683:5 1717:5 situation 1621:8 1622:14,22,22 1623:16 1624:1 1629:24 1631:3 1632:11 1634:11,16 1636:13,19 1637:6 1647:9 1652:3 1655:17,19 1657:13 1681:12 1682:22 1683:21 1684:1 1688:8 1697:15,16 1698:13 1703:25 1707:1,1 1715:9,11 1723:14 1724:23 1725:14 1734:21 1747:4,11 1748:16 situational 1734:22 situations 1623:14 1624:3 1656:17 1691:8 1696:10 1697:6 1702:8 1707:16 1709:18 1714:10,11 six 1652:7 size 1627:10 skill 1656:20 skills 1670:21 skip 1735:25 slide 1620:8,15 1623:9 1625:5 1633:6 1634:1 1700:9,12 1704:11,12 1704:16,17 1718:18 1721:17 1722:3 1725:2 1741:9,25 1742:3,8 slides 1635:20,20,23 1656:9 1724:25 slightly 1700:17 small 1655:10 1680:7 1708:4,7,8 solution 1715:9,15,16 1716:5 solutions 1691:17 1716:4 somebody 1647:7 1681:9 1692:20 1711:14 1712:9	1719:2,15 1720:1,19 1720:21 soon 1641:4 1711:20 1736:18 SOP 1690:8 sophisticated 1655:11 sorry 1618:9 1622:9 1624:12 1635:5 1637:4 1642:23 1645:11 1646:13,14 1652:16 1654:4 1655:5 1662:18 1663:4 1664:19 1667:24,24,25 1669:14,15 1671:7,10 1671:20 1673:21 1674:7 1676:8 1679:4 1685:17 1690:14,16 1694:7 1696:17 1699:4,7,14 1701:1 1704:18 1705:7,23 1706:10 1709:23 1710:9 1714:3,4,22 1714:23 1715:14 1731:13,14 1734:4 1738:7 1742:9,25 1744:13 1746:6,8 1747:25 1749:24 sort 1620:23 1626:8 1641:23 1742:19 sound 1672:3 sounds 1659:10 1678:3 1743:13 1746:18 South 1637:19 1640:13 1641:9,11 1642:10,17 1654:9 1658:20 1717:16 1741:12 Soweto 1644:3 spare 1660:10 sparked 1646:10 speak 1639:8,17 1663:13,23 1669:4 speaker 1653:13 1708:3 1741:19,19 speaking 1647:22 1665:7 1678:2 speaks 1721:17 1731:13 spears 1655:24 special 1641:9,22 1650:22 1655:9,16 1656:19 1720:3 1739:14 specialised 1620:19 1621:3 1633:10,11 1656:17 1672:14,21 1675:3 1704:23 specialist 1621:10 1625:22 1626:1 1635:22 1691:21 1695:5 1724:2 specialists 1623:25 1665:22 1666:1 1715:10 specific 1624:18 1628:8 1632:25 1635:23
S				
S 1729:11 1730:4,5,6 1733:18 1737:4 1744:4 safe 1654:8 1715:2 1741:11 safety 1642:17 1643:24 1748:3 sanctions 1686:20 sanctity 1641:17 SAPS 1628:25 1654:6 1660:22 1661:5 1662:14,25 1666:9,10 1668:13 1669:12,16 1669:21 1672:15,16 1675:24 1682:21 1686:7 1714:21 1717:1 1726:17 1734:10 satisfied 1714:20 save 1733:15,22 saw 1678:20,20 1693:3 1697:14,19 1704:3 1710:3 1713:18 saying 1636:15 1652:1 1653:1 1679:7 1681:14 1696:21 1698:16 1702:18 1706:23 1711:6 1713:1,6,9 1722:20 1745:6 says 1633:7 1648:2,3 1660:10 1666:19 1674:9,25 1675:2 1679:12,18 1692:11 1707:9 1711:14,19 1712:9 1714:9,16 1721:11 1725:4 1729:4 1733:22 1734:12 1735:15 1746:4 1747:2,22 1749:1 scene 1622:13 1623:22 1623:23 1624:14 1655:19 1658:2 1675:4 1683:12 1703:18 1721:17,23 1722:1 1736:13 scenes 1722:25 schedule 1625:9 scheme 1727:5				

<p>1642:2,12 1647:4 1650:10,20 1664:17 1701:25 1702:1 1704:25 1707:11 1712:19 1723:6 1730:20 1739:3 1748:17 specifically 1659:2 1670:9 1698:23 1709:24 1720:12 1727:9 1728:4 1747:2 speculative 1684:12 speech 1644:2 spell 1738:9 spelt 1738:10 spirit 1643:14 1644:17 spoke 1623:20 spontaneous 1621:1 stabilise 1715:8,10 stabilising 1633:9 stability 1701:14,15 staff 1728:25 stage 1625:20 1627:4 1629:16 1648:24 1659:7 1682:4 1693:21 1731:22 1732:2 1740:6 1749:4 stake 1661:14 stand 1670:16 1710:15 1724:8 standard 1636:18 1637:5 1660:24 1678:25 1689:25 1695:22,25 1696:6 standards 1668:13 standing 1631:25 1646:16,19 1660:15 1660:23,25 1661:5,9 1662:6 1695:3 1699:2 1699:16,18 1700:3,21 1702:15 1711:18 1723:12 1736:14 standpoint 1653:6 stands 1649:10 1653:2 1670:18 1690:18 1707:9 1725:6 start 1618:3,5,6 1630:9 1666:3 1694:8 1718:18 started 1704:4 state 1620:2 1640:7 1666:24 stated 1667:5 1674:20 1680:18 1702:12 statement 1646:4 1653:3 1667:7 1670:24 1672:1 1681:17 1683:9 1709:5 1745:4 1748:19 statements 1629:16 states 1661:1 stating 1656:13 station 1670:4,23 1717:3 statistics 1653:5 1667:8</p>	<p>statutes 1666:24 step 1630:1,2 steps 1661:24 1662:24 1663:1,2,3,3,14 1664:12 1667:9 1673:5 1674:15 1676:14 1736:8 stern 1686:22 Steve 1643:23 STF 1633:16 sticks 1655:25 stones 1657:12 stood 1628:7 stop 1624:14 1625:3 1629:8,25 1631:20 1632:8 1647:7 1711:15 stopped 1711:20 1734:12 stopping 1628:14 1727:9 straight 1657:18 strategic 1691:11 strategies 1623:15,18 1686:6 strategy 1691:12 stray 1716:23 street 1631:5 strengthened 1672:23 strict 1686:9 strike 1634:6 1744:19 1744:25 1745:13 striker 1656:5 strive 1747:14 strong 1667:7 1682:22 strongly 1702:7 structure 1685:15 structures 1687:10 STS 1621:13 study 1658:14 stun 1629:7 1631:13 subheading 1669:11 subject 1619:12 1635:24 1669:21 1686:7,19 1729:22 1730:1,12 subjects 1651:2 submission 1628:24 submissions 1680:3 subordinates 1651:25 subparagraph 1662:13 subscribe 1661:21 subsequent 1670:1,12 substance 1688:24 substantial 1655:25 1685:12 substantially 1680:12 sub-documents 1698:25 success 1682:20 successful 1679:24 suddenly 1698:18 sufficient 1622:23 sufficiently 1669:3 1749:11,13 suggest 1659:12 1663:6</p>	<p>1669:23 1672:7 1677:16 1746:20 suggested 1638:1 1687:3 1689:6 suggesting 1672:6 superior 1665:19 1680:23 superiors 1709:11,22 supplement 1670:3 support 1633:10 1654:7 1666:9,10 1704:23 1705:6 1741:11 suppose 1631:4 1644:6 1644:10 1656:7,21 1668:20 1696:2 supposed 1684:10 1724:19 1744:15 supreme 1661:15 sure 1621:12 1622:16 1637:23 1644:19 1647:15 1671:21 1677:1 1678:7,9 1679:15 1680:1 1696:14,20 1716:24 1719:12 1725:1 1741:7 surrender 1703:16 surrendering 1693:13 suspect 1660:16 swop 1716:11 sympathy 1743:18 system 1684:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">T</p> <p>T 1743:21,22 1744:2 table 1730:23 1731:2 tactic 1637:1 tactical 1619:9 1635:2 1635:12 1691:10 1715:9,15,16 1716:4 1716:5 1720:6 1724:25 tactics 1626:10 1630:15 1632:6 1724:6 take 1619:6 1620:21 1623:8 1635:1 1636:25 1644:11 1645:12,19 1646:17 1647:5 1650:24 1652:23 1653:17,18 1661:25 1662:1,25 1663:2,3,6,14 1664:12 1667:9 1673:4 1675:9,13 1679:3,21 1682:4 1687:7 1688:1,2,18 1693:6,21,21 1698:13 1698:18 1700:15,20 1703:18 1707:22,24 1717:19 1725:20,25 1727:21 1729:9 1730:19 1731:12 1732:8,10 1736:6 1742:12 1744:6 1746:18,19 1747:18</p>	<p>1748:18 1750:3,6 taken 1618:9 1636:23 1642:6 1647:25 1660:3 1663:1 1664:24 1671:24 1674:15 1676:15 1682:7 1684:17 1686:15 1688:6,12 1689:6 1690:4,11,20 1691:8 1731:18 1736:2,3,8,11 1737:13 takes 1684:11 talk 1627:12 1628:9 1728:14 talked 1729:7 1743:5 talking 1627:7,14 1700:5 1739:9 1748:8 1748:9 target 1624:22 1713:10 1736:1 targeted 1704:24 1707:10 targets 1735:25 task 1650:22,22 1655:16 1656:8,19 1669:7 1689:14 1739:14 tasked 1669:6 Taskforce 1720:4 taught 1630:10 1651:2 1651:12 1662:7 1681:22 1724:16 1745:21 tea 1645:12,19 1725:20 1725:21,23,24 1726:1 teach 1646:13,14 teacher 1661:25 teaching 1669:4 team 1635:21 1667:4 1669:7 1689:14 1719:18 Teams 1720:7 teargas 1629:7 1630:17 1631:13 technical 1621:14 technically 1672:13 1674:19 techniques 1625:21,21 1677:7 1725:8,11 television 1678:20 1697:15,20 1704:3 1708:25 1710:3 1713:18 tell 1626:4 1663:17,18 1664:7 1670:17 1674:2 1685:2 1686:15 1725:21 1701:12 1724:6 terminology 1691:22 terms 1669:16 1679:22 1691:17 1734:22 1736:22 terrorists 1655:2 test 1625:2 1665:9 testified 1694:21</p>	<p>1729:4 testimony 1721:19 Thamae 1703:14 1706:15,16,19 1707:3 Thamae's 1703:17 thank 1618:24 1632:14 1632:16 1636:8,9 1637:9,11,14 1649:14 1663:8 1665:10 1671:11,12 1676:10 1682:5,8 1693:8,10 1694:20 1700:23 1705:3,12 1707:13 1708:9,10,21 1712:13 1712:24 1714:3 1716:8,9,14 1726:6 1726:24 1729:11 1730:3 1737:1 1739:13 1740:13,25 1741:2,4 1743:3,4 1744:11,12 1747:21 1749:22,23 1750:2 thanks 1699:25 1710:22 that's 1625:24 1629:4 1630:20 1631:24,25 1632:2,19 1633:14,15 1635:3 1636:24 1637:1 1638:25 1643:3,4 1648:7 1659:15 1662:16 1673:24 1674:11 1681:5 1683:20 1684:7 1702:5 1706:1 1706:9,11 1707:1,2 1709:12 1710:2 1711:12 1714:7,19 1719:19,22 1720:23 1721:21 1722:8,22 theoretical 1662:14 theoretically 1620:17 1698:16 theory 1723:10 thereabout 1677:22 thereof 1722:4 1735:20 there's 1623:14 1624:7 1635:23 1665:22 1683:14,15 1689:25 there've 1618:7 they're 1632:3 1634:24 1635:3 1718:14 they've 1623:21 1634:24 thing 1627:7 1691:16 1733:24 1734:1,1 1744:6 things 1630:18 1633:25 1634:21 1635:7,15 1636:10 1662:4 1663:21 1664:22 1694:9 1696:22 1727:6 1742:5 think 1619:15 1622:23 1625:20 1626:1 1627:25 1630:22 1637:2,3,22,25</p>
---	---	---	---	--

<p>1646:2 1647:8,11 1652:14,18,19 1659:13 1666:14 1672:12 1673:17 1675:15 1676:2 1678:19 1680:5,6 1683:13 1684:7 1687:6 1688:16,17,22 1688:25 1693:7 1699:24 1700:15 1701:18,21,24 1703:1 1704:13 1705:10 1710:19 1712:14 1713:7,14 1715:25 1720:23 1724:1 1727:8 1728:14,16 1739:10 1740:6 1741:25 1743:22 thinking 1689:4 thinks 1647:14 thirsty 1652:5 Thomas 1644:25 1671:23 1692:21 thought 1656:11 1692:14 1709:24 1743:11 thousands 1634:5 1659:10 threat 1734:22 threatened 1646:17 1647:5,6 three 1629:6 1692:15 1733:5 thrown 1657:11 1677:23 thrust 1629:4,22 time 1618:9 1639:25 1646:8 1661:9 1672:4 1679:16 1684:25 1693:3 1694:14 1704:13 1725:18 1730:19 1732:21 1733:16,23 1736:10 1739:9 times 1692:15 Tip 1618:15,17,21,24 1619:15,25 1620:5,11 1620:15,21 1621:3,9 1621:12,18,21 1622:1 1622:8,16 1623:3,7 1623:12 1624:2,6,12 1624:24 1625:7,9,16 1626:3,11,22 1627:5 1627:11,14,21,24 1628:12,22 1630:25 1632:1,12,14 1649:21 today 1643:4 toe 1647:7 TOKOTA 1665:2 told 1642:9 1646:3 1655:8 1680:21 1692:20 1699:19 1703:15 1726:11 1749:9 tolerance 1661:3 tomorrow 1733:24</p>	<p>1734:1 1746:21 1747:1 1750:4,8 top 1676:21 topic 1619:1 1629:15 1644:24 1691:5 topics 1695:12 1724:1 touch 1620:5 touching 1724:1 tragedy 1660:1 train 1650:13 trained 1619:14 1620:19 1621:4 1629:19 1632:17,21 1634:20 1635:4,7,17 1654:20 1656:7,8 1713:21 1718:10 1724:16,22 1728:2 1735:19 1738:24 1742:5,12 1747:25 trainees 1627:5 1651:2 1653:13,17 trainer 1636:18,22 1650:21,23,23 1717:10 1724:2 trainers 1619:11 1650:15 1663:18,23 1717:24 1731:7,12 trainings 1650:24 transcript 1721:18,19 transcripts 1716:20 transform 1642:8 transformation 1641:11 1670:12 transgressed 1621:2 Transkei 1640:7 transpires 1747:19 treaties 1661:17 Triangle 1640:12 tried 1631:17 1700:12 trigger 1681:15 1698:2 1698:5 trouble 1642:6 TRT 1633:16 1655:17 1656:20 1700:7,11 1701:12,22 1715:6 1720:6 1721:24 1722:6 1739:24 true 1621:18 truncate 1665:6 try 1629:8 1652:21 1656:25 1663:8 1725:7 1746:22 trying 1665:5 1699:6 1719:10 1727:5 Tshwete 1643:23 TST 1621:19 turmoil 1677:24 1678:2 turn 1624:25 1625:5 1626:11 1630:14 1661:11 1662:9 1682:17,19 turned 1706:18 turns 1622:22 1630:18 two 1627:9 1628:4 1680:10 1710:16 1721:24 1731:16</p>	<p>1737:10 1741:7 type 1628:5 <hr/>U U 1743:22 1744:9,10 ultimately 1689:17 1706:18 UN 1641:9 unarmed 1656:25 1657:5,7,14 1724:18 unavoidable 1661:11 underline 1667:4 1668:13 1669:3 underlined 1669:12 understand 1624:17 1627:20 1633:19 1634:15 1648:4 1649:13,20 1651:2,3 1673:22 1674:1,19,21 1687:22 1688:24 1696:15 1697:11 1698:3 1711:5 1718:3 1719:16,17 1724:10 1724:11 understanding 1623:21 1648:1 1664:3 1667:1 1671:16 1695:20 1697:15 understood 1660:11 1673:22 1686:1 1696:9,21 1697:5 1710:14 underwent 1633:20 unfortunately 1635:19 1669:24 Unhappily 1660:13 uniform 1638:8,9 1667:1 unintentional 1658:22 Union 1641:9 unions 1744:18 unit 1619:4 1621:13,14 1624:4,14 1625:3 1631:10,19 1636:13 1638:15 1669:18,19 1669:20 1670:8,12,14 1670:21 1672:13,15 1672:16,22 1673:24 1674:5,9,11,15 1675:1,3,22 1694:21 1695:15 1701:10,11 1701:15,18 1718:17 1718:20 1719:3,25 1720:10,11 1722:6 1739:12 1740:15,16 units 1619:7,9,20 1621:7,9 1633:18 1638:11 1654:20 1656:8 1669:23 1670:5 1690:5 1701:11,25 1702:3 1718:10 1720:7 1721:24 1722:12,17 1728:2 1732:6,7 1733:10 1737:13,15 1739:24 1740:4</p>	<p>unlawful 1634:6 1652:10 1656:2 unnecessary 1673:1 unpleasantly 1649:7 unprotected 1744:19 unpunctual 1618:12 unrest 1623:14 1624:3 1707:16 1708:16,19 1721:11 unsupervised 1679:2 1746:1 unwarranted 1713:4 upper 1708:22 1709:3 1709:19 1710:12,17 1710:18,21,23 urgency 1687:2 urgent 1668:25 1686:7 1686:15 1687:16 1690:3 urgently 1668:14 1669:13 use 1620:2 1625:25 1626:6 1627:6,23 1628:17 1630:2,5,11 1630:12 1631:17 1632:8 1646:5 1647:6 1655:11,16,18 1661:1 1661:3,10 1662:3,11 1667:2 1675:17 1684:17 1685:20,23 1686:6,8,11,21 1688:23,23 1692:3,15 1692:16 1693:6 1695:12,16 1702:8 1708:22 1709:17 1710:16 1711:19 1712:2 1714:6 1727:10 1728:11 1733:12 1734:8,12,16 1734:23 1735:20 1736:4,9,17 useful 1620:7 1665:9 1721:15 1723:23 usefully 1719:11 uses 1630:23 1685:11 utilise 1731:25 utilised 1650:12 utilising 1632:7 U-I-J-E-K 1738:1 U-I-J-K 1738:3,5 <hr/>V Vaal 1640:12 value 1670:15 van 1667:21 1737:22 1737:24,25 1738:4,6 1738:8,9,10 1739:18 1739:25 1740:18 variety 1624:3 various 1619:7 1647:2 1660:8 1718:9,10 1731:8 variously 1717:10 vehicle 1685:14 versa 1683:19 1700:11 vice 1683:19 1700:11</p>	<p>video 1629:17 1713:7 1713:15 1736:2 view 1628:13 1638:18 1651:14 1653:16,16 1665:20 1666:16 1668:3 1686:8 1731:15 views 1631:9 1644:22 1647:16 vigilant 1653:4 violence 1633:8 1686:1 1701:7 1705:1 1707:11,16 1723:1 violent 1622:22 1630:14,18 1631:24 1633:9 1651:19 1655:19 1672:20 virtually 1722:5 vision 1639:5 1654:6 visit 1653:14 visual 1709:17 vis-a-vis 1642:9 Vuma 1740:20,21,22 V-A-N 1738:10,11,12 <hr/>W wage 1656:25 wages 1652:6 wait 1715:10 waiting 1618:11 1624:12 waived 1716:15 want 1620:5 1624:17 1624:25 1631:1 1638:18 1644:24 1649:17 1652:3 1657:2,16,18 1661:11 1662:9 1671:8 1676:25 1683:24 1688:5,20 1690:25 1714:8 1716:25 1722:18 1723:25 1724:8,15 1725:15 1731:15 1740:8 1743:1 wanted 1623:8 1688:24 1693:8 1719:24 1723:21 warning 1686:22 Warrant 1703:14,17 washed 1657:20 wasn't 1635:6 1644:23 1653:17 1658:2 1671:23 1703:20 1733:1 water 1625:14 1629:8 1630:16 1631:13 1734:17 way 1632:4 1636:18 1653:3 1656:10 1673:20 1674:21 1677:18 1678:11,13 1678:14 1679:7 1689:21 1710:14 1713:23,23 1714:1 1716:1 1727:9 1732:2</p>
--	--	--	---	--

<p>1735:15 1737:18 weak 1747:7 weakness 1742:13,14 1742:16 1745:17,19 weapons 1624:8 1655:11 1656:5 1695:17 wearing 1629:11 week 1618:8,14 weeks 1652:7 1730:11 1731:16 went 1663:18 weren't 1685:3 West 1744:21 1745:10 Western 1744:24 1745:13 we'll 1675:8 we're 1631:3 1647:17 1647:21 1680:4 1707:14 we've 1669:1 1682:7 1692:20 1714:10 we'll 1725:24 1732:18 1744:5 1749:4 we're 1748:8,8 1749:8 we've 1691:15 1724:9 what's 1647:14 1658:1 1680:14 1702:22 1706:6 whichever 1683:16 wide 1624:3 1656:20 wire 1625:11,18,18,23 1626:6 1629:7 wisdom 1643:20 wish 1624:10 1693:16 1741:5 withdraw 1733:20 withdrawn 1729:7 witness 1632:15 1644:20 1645:1 1647:14 1648:6,8,9 1648:21 1657:25 1660:10,16 1665:4,9 1671:15 1672:5 1673:2 1678:8 1680:1 1680:15,16 1692:4,11 1694:12,19 1705:5 1706:23 1707:2,5 1724:8 1732:17,19,24 1733:2,22 1743:5,6 witnesses 1622:17 1648:17 1694:17 wonder 1623:16 1672:2 1672:4 Wonderkop 1634:17 1674:12 word 1669:3 1679:9 1691:9 1692:3,16 1693:6 1705:20 1706:25 wording 1680:5 words 1644:6,10 1692:15 1700:25 1711:21 1715:15 1726:9 1727:5 1728:21</p>	<p>wore 1638:8 work 1630:19 1667:4 1678:21 1689:9 worker 1696:18 workers 1634:5 working 1683:24 1685:3 1687:13 1718:14 1733:9 world 1678:2 1703:18 worn 1638:10 worse 1656:1 wouldn't 1666:15 1704:1 1718:19 1722:10,12,20 1725:12 wouldn't 1737:14 would've 1723:20 1725:25 1732:3,7 wound 1646:21 wounding 1646:24 write 1664:16 written 1749:17 wrong 1638:23 1647:14 1651:10 1674:3,22 1679:14 1680:12 1688:1 1696:21 1698:17 1718:8 1740:10,10 1748:2,6 1748:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Y</p> <hr/> <p>year 1626:16 1627:22 1643:7 1676:7,21 1717:21 1727:12 yearly 1650:11 1717:21 years 1637:17 1638:3 1642:7 1700:24 1701:5 Yk 1738:6,8,9,10 young 1641:25 you'd 1634:9 you're 1634:23 1638:5 1639:12 1644:19,20 1646:23 1647:20 1648:15 1649:3,15 1660:20,21 1661:18 1663:5 1671:19,22 1672:6 1678:16 1680:14 1682:15 1688:16 1689:4 1702:18 1715:5 you've 1633:3,12 1638:24 1648:8,10 1652:18 1675:12 1680:18 1681:21 1692:23 1710:10 1743:13 Y-K 1738:7,8,10,11,14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">0</p> <hr/> <p>000 1652:4 1655:22 1657:16 1724:15,17 1744:17 000% 1703:11 1704:13 1704:16 09:30 1750:8</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 1700:5 1703:11 1704:13 1721:17,23 1722:1 1726:17 1734:11 10 1618:6,7 1666:20 1700:24 1742:1,3 10th 1742:19 1744:15 1745:8 10:16 1618:2 10:37 1628:12 10:57 1636:9 100 1692:15 11 1659:25 1662:24 1668:18 1673:18 1676:1,8 11.4(c) 1736:13 11:17 1646:13 11:42 1649:1 12 1628:4,4,9 1669:2 1735:18,18 12-gauge 1628:17 12-guage 1628:11 12:02 1657:18 12:22 1666:13 12:42 1674:13 13 1668:10 14 1669:10,14,15 1676:2,5,7 1748:10 14:04 1682:13 14:24 1691:14 14:44 1701:13 15 1670:6 1672:11 15:04 1712:19 15:24 1723:2 15:48 1726:3 16 1675:21 1677:4 16th 1633:21 1643:7 1644:23 1648:1 1663:1 1673:24 1674:12 1676:10,23 1677:2,12,15 1678:17 1683:23 1697:16 1705:24 1706:12 1709:24 1721:20 1724:14 1731:17,19 16:08 1735:25 16:28 1746:2 17 1669:19 1672:16 18 1620:8,15 1682:2,6 1682:19 19 1618:1 1985 1701:7 1994 1640:18 1641:4 1642:7 1643:14 1644:17 1700:25 1701:3 1996 1669:20 1998 1643:14 1644:17 1999 1644:1</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <hr/> <p>2 1661:5 1700:5 1704:15,17 1719:18 1720:25 1721:1</p>	<p>1741:9 1744:20 2(E) 1708:12 2-ball 1628:11 2.2 1714:22 2.3 1714:9 2.3.1 1714:11 2.3.3 1714:14 2.3.4 1714:20,23,24 2.3.5 1715:1 20 1698:18 1729:20 1730:21 1733:17 1735:21 20th 1726:21 1728:11 1728:22 1729:6 1732:10,16,22 1733:18 1734:10,11 1735:15 1743:23 2002 1645:22 1669:20 2006 1670:2,7 1672:21 2011 1626:16 1627:16 1658:6 1659:25 1726:22,23 1732:10 1732:22 1733:17 1734:10 1735:15 2012 1618:1 1726:21,22 1727:12 1728:12,22 1729:6,20 1730:14 1732:17 1733:19 1736:22 1742:20 1745:8 2012-08-10 1744:17 211 1721:16,17 22 1685:8 23 1623:9 1686:3 24 1633:6 1634:1 25 1729:21 257 1722:4 26 1729:21,22 262 1660:23,25 1662:6 1699:2 1736:14 27 1625:5 1729:21 29 1725:2 29th 1658:6 1659:24 297 1734:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <hr/> <p>3 1652:4 1655:22 1657:16 1700:5 1709:13 1724:14,17 1735:5,6,8,9,17 1746:3,13 1748:9 3.1 1735:10 3.2 1735:10 1746:4 3.2.3 1747:2 3.2.4 1747:22 3.3 1735:10 3.6 1737:4 30 1698:18 37 1729:13 397 1709:6,6 1726:18 398 1712:2,2</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <hr/> <p>4 1746:17,18 40 1627:13 1628:3,5 401 1726:18</p>	<p>409 1698:25 426 1714:5,5 436 1707:23 1708:1 45 1677:22,22 49 1630:11</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <hr/> <p>5 1699:8 1700:10 1734:9 1746:18,22,23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <hr/> <p>7 1660:22 1744:17 1748:9 70 1718:18 71 1704:11,12,16,17 1705:16,18 76 1640:4</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <hr/> <p>8 1661:12 85 1637:14 1638:6</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <hr/> <p>9 1662:9 1664:3 1668:10 1693:24 1694:3 1701:5 1723:5 1741:25 1742:3 9(1) 1661:5 90 1677:22 90s 1640:12 94 1637:21,25 1638:6 1639:20 1643:9 98 1643:9</p>
---	---	---	---	---